

University of Wollongong - Research Online

Thesis Collection

Title: Being an educated woman: a phenomenological exploration

Author: Vinathe Sharma-Brymer

Year: 2007

Repository DOI:

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

2007

Being an educated woman: a phenomenological exploration

Vinathe Sharma-Brymer
University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Sharma-Brymer, Vinathe, Being an educated woman: a phenomenological exploration, PhD thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 2007. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/668>

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Being an educated woman: A phenomenological exploration

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

From

University of Wollongong

By

Vinathe Sharma-Brymer

B.A., P.G. Dip Env. Planning, M.A. (psych), M.Ed. (Hons)

Faculty of Education 2007

Thesis Certification

I, Vinathe Sharma-Brymer, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfillment of the requirements of the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. This document has not been submitted for qualifications at another institution.

Vinathe Sharma-Brymer

March 26, 2007

Abstract

This study explores ten Indian women's experience of 'being an educated woman.' These ten women have a bachelor's degree and hail from Bangalore city in India. The social phenomenon of being an educated person is a positive notion in postcolonial, Indian society. Girls' and women's education is regarded as important for their family and for the nation's progress. Academic research on asking educated women what do they think of themselves as being educated is hardly evident.

The value of this thesis lies in its explorative phenomenological framework used to document the participants' narratives of their experience. It also highlights the researcher's lived experience, using insider/outsider perspective. Applying a broad interpretive phenomenological approach this study provides an alternative framework of reflection, interpretation and analysis of the space in their lived experience. It also draws from educational theory, human development models and feminist research for a richer understanding of women, education and development area.

Data sources of this study include in-depth interviews, academic and non-academic literature and stories. The stages of interpreting the data included immediate reflections following the interviews, identification from the transcripts of thematic layers, and three layers of interpretation. In this three-stage process the participants' texts were analysed in depth through active listening, repeated reading of the transcripts, researcher's bracketed reflections, and layers of thematic interpretation – to illuminate the complexity of 'going back to the things themselves.'

Layers of interpretation revealed a 'torn-between' experience, an experience of tensions, conflict and contradiction both in the public and private spheres of life. It was an interplay on the continuum of an educated woman becoming a 'confident ideal' as well as living as a 'social ideal.' The contradiction illuminated a site of desire and threat related to change and action.

Through the analysis of this experience the thesis builds a theoretical construct to describe the space that can be created in educated women's lives, one which they are required to negotiate constantly. This construct is the Actionable Space (AS), which locates educated women's lived experience in the 'third space' between awareness of self-efficacy and awareness of social conformity leading to their tensions and conflicts. This critical space creates hope and the beginnings of a new direction in understanding the experience of being an educated woman. This research provides the personal practical and collective knowledge of the experience for the public. It is essential that teachers' training workshops, and parent and community education incorporates this knowledge to initiate a positive change in girls' and women's education. It needs to be included in all situations where female agency is discussed.

Acknowledgements

Many people, memories and many events have accompanied me during this research project. My heartfelt *thank you* to all those who have been with me.

To my father for his encouragement and my sisters for their invaluable support.

To all my friends in India and Australia for their interest in my research.

I have used a few photographs in the thesis to provide a suitable background. The individuals in the photographs are not related to the thesis in any way. Nevertheless, I thank these anonymous individuals who permitted me to photograph them. *Thank you* also to Dr. Eric Brymer, Asare and Aralu organisations for permitting me to use photograph/s from their collection.

To the Division of Communications and Education, and International Student Centre at University of Canberra where I started my doctoral degree studies.

To the Faculty of Education and Office of Research at University of Wollongong where I continued my studies.

My sincere thanks to Professors Victoria Foster and Alison Elliott for their supervision in the first two years of my candidature at University of Canberra.

My special thanks to Dr. Coralie McCormack, Dr. Eric Brymer and Dr. Lenore Armour for reading parts of the thesis and providing insightful critical comments. I appreciate their willingness, their precious time and attention to my writing.

Two individuals – Dr. Christine Fox and Associate Professor Barbara Pamphilon – have engaged themselves in my research and provided a high level of support while supervising my project. A *very big thank you* to them. Chris has had an additional and special role of witnessing the turning points and tensions involved in my journey. As always, she shared my concerns besides being insightful of my needs, strengths and limitations. I wish to acknowledge her expertise in my research area.

Can I ever express, in words, how thankful I am to my Eric, little boy Surya and the little little one still in my womb? They have been very patient! Eric and our two children have been a part of this thesis – with my reading, listening, discussions, conferences, writing, typing and reflecting. Eric, Surya and the little one – thank you for sharing my life.

Finally, a heartfelt **THANK YOU** to Kanaka, Ganga, Vinoda, Mani, Rani, Kavitha, Shubha, Nirmala and Deepa. Without these nine women, this project would not have continued. This work is dedicated to them.

Table of Contents

Abstract	vii
Acknowledgements	ix
Table of Contents	ix
Prologue: I am an Indian, educated woman	xv
I. Being an educated woman: Asking new questions	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background to the concept of female education in India	2
1.2.1 <i>'A learned woman is the eyes of her family': A reflection</i>	5
1.3 Significance of this research	11
1.3.1 <i>Significance of using interpretive phenomenology</i>	15
1.4 Discussing Indian women's agency	17
1.5 Agency? The question of power and identity	22
1.6 Agency and change: Significance of asking new questions	25
1.7 Conclusion	31
II. 'Education brings progress': Exploring contextual issues of girls' and women's education in India	37
2.1 Introduction	37
2.2 Reflecting on education for change and action: An insider perspective	37
2.3 Learning within internalised expectations, aiming for critical transformation	41
2.3.1 <i>Critical transformation and schooling</i>	42
2.4 Multiple understandings of female education in India: A discussion	47
2.4.1 <i>Girls' and women's education in India: A brief historical timeline</i>	48
2.4.2 <i>Historical accounts of past centuries</i>	51
2.4.3 <i>Women and education during the colonial era</i>	51
2.5 Education for girls and women: Social expectations vs internalised empowerment	54
2.6 Post-independence and the status of women	58
2.7 Conclusion	61

III. Interrogating girls' and women's education: Significance of lived experiences	67
3.1 Introduction	67
3.2 Narrating the deaths of two women	68
3.2.1 <i>Raising questions around the two women's deaths</i>	70
3.3 Education for enhancing human capabilities and human freedoms	71
3.4 Exploring the contexts of difference: The neglect of lived experiences	75
3.5 Women, education and participation in postcolonial societies	83
3.6 Education building women's citizenship: Debating the ideal	89
3.7 Studying women's lives: The lens of insider/outsider perspective	95
3.8 Conclusion	100
IV. Setting the Stage: Using interpretive phenomenology	105
4.1 Introduction	105
4.2 The philosophical foundations of phenomenology	106
4.3 Phenomenology, language and experience	107
4.4 Hermeneutic phenomenology and women's experiences	109
4.5 Application of interpretive phenomenology	114
4.5.1 <i>The question: What is the experience of being an educated Indian woman?</i>	117
4.5.2 <i>Selecting participants</i>	118
4.5.3 <i>The curtain-raisers: The ten women participants</i>	122
4.6 Conducting the interviews: Recording, listening, identifying insights	124
4.6.1 <i>Transcribing the tapes</i>	126
4.6.2 <i>Reflecting on transcript texts</i>	127
4.6.3 <i>Initial themes</i>	128
4.7 Writing 'being educated' experience texts	131
4.7.1 <i>Evocations</i>	133
4.7.2 <i>Textual tones</i>	134
4.7.3 <i>Interpreting and writing the text</i>	134
4.7.4 <i>The phenomenological theme</i>	135
4.8 Conclusion	136
V. Experiences of being educated	141

5.1 Introducing the experiences	141
Kanaka: <i>We women construct our worlds within four walls ...</i>	144
Ganga: <i>Education has been useful. It gave me peace of mind.</i>	162
Vinoda: <i>Whatever is the destiny that will happen, I keep myself light-hearted.</i>	178
Mani: <i>I don't know what exactly I learnt or got from education.</i>	195
Kavitha: <i>I was not confident even after a degree. I lacked experience.</i>	215
Rani: <i>A woman's failure in life comes only if she is not married ...</i>	233
Shubha: <i>Education is my base to progress my thoughts and thinking.</i>	252
Nirmala: <i>Education is linked to my job, job to a good husband, then good life.</i>	277
Deepa: <i>I feel happy ... wherever I go, I can manage things confidently.</i>	297
Vinathe: <i>Education has provided certain directions in my life.</i>	314
5.2 Conclusion	324
 VI. Being an educated woman: Torn between 'confident ideal' and 'social/traditional ideal'	 329
6.1 Introduction	329
6.2 Describing the confident ideal	330
6.2.1 <i>Confidence related to formal subject knowledge</i>	332
6.2.2 <i>Confidence related to abilities (being able to do)</i>	334
6.2.3 <i>Confidence linked to financial independence</i>	335
6.2.4 <i>Confidence related to status and respect</i>	337
6.2.5 <i>Tensions related to being a Confident Ideal</i>	338
6.3 Living the social/traditional ideal	339
6.3.1 <i>Expressive-mantic locations of the social ideal</i>	344
6.4 Negotiating the 'confident' and 'social' ideals: A 'torn-between' experience	349
6.4.1 <i>Torn between personal purpose and social expectations</i>	351
6.4.2 <i>Torn between rhetoric and reality</i>	355
6.4.3 <i>Torn between conformity and resistance</i>	358
6.4.4 <i>Torn between insider/outsider experience: Choosing to be different</i>	361
6.4.5 <i>Torn between learning and unlearning</i>	363
6.5 Imagining the future ideal: A site of contradiction	364
6.6 Conclusion	366

VII. Being an educated woman and ‘Actionable Space’	371
7.1 Introduction	371
7.2 Locating the experience: Background	372
7.3 Phenomenological interpretation: van Manen’s concepts	374
Lived Time	374
Lived Body	375
Lived Other	376
Lived Space	376
7.4 Phenomenology of Lived Space as ‘Actionable Space’	378
7.4.1 <i>Actionable Space: Interpretive meaning and definition</i>	378
7.4.2 <i>Actionable Space as the construct</i>	379
7.4.3 <i>The directional flow of Actionable Space</i>	380
7.4.4 <i>Enabling possibilities of Actionable Space</i>	383
7.5 Theme of Actionable Space	384
<i>This is our place</i>	384
7.6 Conclusion	386
Postscript	389
References	393

Glossary

Appendix A:	Martha Nussbaum’s ten human capabilities
Appendix B:	Consent and Release Forms
Appendix C:	An example of thematic development
Appendix D:	An example of thematic development

All photographic plates from the Vinathe Sharma-Brymer/ Eric Brymer collection