

University of Wollongong - Research Online

Thesis Collection

Title: Schismatic mind : controversies over the cause of the symptoms of schizophrenia

Author: Richard Gosden

Year: 2000

Repository DOI:

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

2000

Schismatic mind : controversies over the cause of the symptoms of schizophrenia

Richard Gosden
University of Wollongong, gosden@uow.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Gosden, Richard, Schismatic mind : controversies over the cause of the symptoms of schizophrenia, PhD thesis, Science, Technology and Society Program, University of Wollongong, 2000. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/455>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**SCHISMATIC MIND: CONTROVERSIES OVER THE
CAUSE OF THE SYMPTOMS OF SCHIZOPHRENIA**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

RICHARD GOSDEN, BA Honours (First Class)

Science, Technology and Society Program

2000

Certification

I hereby declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted for a degree to any other university or institution.

Richard Gosden

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Brian Martin and Glenn Mitchell, my supervisors from the Science, Technology and Society Program at the University of Wollongong, for their guidance and many suggestions during the preparation of this thesis. I would also like to thank Sharon Beder for her willingness to discuss ideas, read drafts and offer advice and constant encouragement. I am also greatly in debt to many members of the Support Coalition, World Network of (Ex-)Users and Survivors of Psychiatry, and MadNation email discussion groups. My research has benefited immeasurably from the privilege of interacting on a daily basis with these extraordinary international networks of psychiatric survivors. In this regard I want to particularly thank the coordinators of these organisations — David Oaks, Sylvia Caras and Vicki Fox Wieselthier — for their tireless work in bringing these vibrant electronic communities into existence. I would also like to thank Chris Bowker, for sharing her experience as a human rights advocate in the mental health field, and Heather Nolan, for her wonderfully descriptive letters and poignant arguments against the injustice of psychiatric coercion.

Abstract

Doubts about the real nature of schizophrenia are long-standing. There are no laboratory tests to confirm diagnoses and it is not certain whether there is consistency in the diagnostic process. Various models have been developed to explain the cause of the symptoms. The dominant explanatory model is based on medical assumptions that the symptoms are pathological and are caused by an illness of the mind or brain. The medical model embraces a wide variety of psychological and biological theories of aetiology but there is no scientific/medical consensus and all the evidence supporting medical theories is equivocal. This apparent confusion gives rise to questions concerning the validity of a medical interpretation. Alternative, non-medical models explain the cause of the symptoms as being either a mystical/spiritual emergency (mystical model) or as social alienation (myth-of-mental-illness model).

When a comparative analysis of the medical, mystical and myth-mental-illness models is undertaken in the light of interest group theory it is apparent that competing interest groups are promoting different explanatory models to achieve political ends. A key determinant of this political struggle involves the selection and emphasis of conflicting human rights imperatives. Human rights are central to the issue of schizophrenia because people who display the symptoms tend to be socially disruptive and, as a result, are frequently hospitalised involuntarily and forcibly treated with drugs that are mentally and physically debilitating.

Contents

1. Introduction	1
Objectives of the Thesis	1
Methodology and Underlying Theoretical Perspective of the Thesis	2
A Brief Description of Schizophrenia	7
Schizophrenia Controversies	9
Expanding the Diagnostic Net	11
The DSM Diagnostic System.....	12
Growth of the Mental Health Industry	15
Social Control, Youth and Unemployment	16
2. Interest Groups and Human Rights.....	24
Interest Group Theory	24
Human Rights and Activism.....	31
Background to Human Rights.....	32
Human Rights, Science and Technology.....	34
Human Rights and Psychiatry.....	37
Soviet Psychiatry.....	38
UN Principles on Mental Illness	39
The Burdekin Inquiry	41
Conclusion	45
3. The Medical Model: Schizophrenic Symptoms as Pathology.....	47
Introduction.....	47
Regression Theories	51
Current Diagnostic Criteria.....	53
ICD-10 Diagnostic Criteria for Schizophrenia	56
DSM IV Diagnostic Criteria for Schizophrenia.....	59
Origins of descriptive psychopathology for Schizophrenia.....	64
Kraepelin and Bleuler.....	68
Conclusion	72
4. The Psychiatric Dichotomy and the Proliferation of Models	74
Biochemical Hypotheses — and Associated Drug Treatments	76
Atypical Neuroleptics.....	79
Other Biochemical Theories	83
Uncertainties in Schizophrenia Research	85
Brain Imaging	86

Scanning For Causes	88
Infection Theories	90
Nutrition.....	92
Genetic Theories	94
Theories of an Environmental/Experiential Aetiology	99
Developmental Theories.....	101
Family Environment.....	102
Double Bind Theory.....	105
Family Stress.....	108
Social Stress.....	111
Conclusion	112
5: Medical Model: Interest Groups and Human Rights Imperatives	114
Interest Groups.....	114
Campaign to Extend Involuntary Treatment in NSW	121
Human Rights Imperatives	127
Right to Treatment	128
Informed Consent.....	132
Conclusion	135
6. The Mystical Model: Schizophrenic Symptoms as a Natural	
Extension of Consciousness	136
Introduction.....	136
Background to the Mystical Tradition.....	139
Dealing With the Knowledge of Mortality.....	142
Attaining Mystical Experience	144
Mysticism and Psychiatry.....	148
Anti-Psychiatry, Laing and the Mystical Model.....	151
Jung	156
John Weir Perry — a Jungian	160
Mythological Heroes and Schizophrenia.....	166
Summary of the Mystical Model	169
7. Mystical Model: Interest Groups and Human Rights Imperatives	172
Interest Groups.....	172
Human Rights Imperatives	177
The Spirit of Article 18.....	179
The Technical Requirements of Article 18.....	180
Involuntary Treatment Provisions in New South Wales (NSW), Australia.....	183
Incarceration of Alleged Schizophrenics.....	185

Hypothetical Mental Patient	188
Neuroleptic Treatment.....	190
Human Rights Report on Freedom of Religion and Belief	194
Conclusion	197
8. The Myth-Of-Mental-Illness Model: Schizophrenic Symptoms as Manufactured Artefacts	198
Introduction.....	198
Sub-Type 1: Schizophrenic-as-Cultural-Outsider.....	203
Negative Symptoms	209
Outsider Case Studies.....	214
Sub-type 2: Schizophrenic-as-Scapegoat	217
Sub-Type 3: Schizophrenia-as-Role-Play	224
Conclusion	233
9. Myth-of-Mental-Illness Model: Interest Groups and Human Rights Imperatives.....	236
Interest Groups.....	236
Human Rights Imperatives	239
Background to the Insanity Plea	240
Relevant Human Rights.....	245
Torture and Cruel Treatment	248
Neuroleptics, the M-M-I Model and Human Rights.....	255
Treatment or Torture	259
Conclusion	263
10. Early Psychosis: Preventive Medicine, Scientific Assault on Mystical Tendencies, or an Extension of Social Control?	265
Introduction.....	265
Early Psychosis as Preventive Medicine	266
Early Psychosis Programmes.....	268
Case Study — The EPPIC Programme	275
Critical Analysis of Early Psychosis	287
Drug Company Influence	295
Conclusion	302
Conclusion.....	308
Bibliography	320

Publications in Support of the Thesis

Richard Gosden, 'Pre-Psychotic Treatment for Schizophrenia: Preventive Medicine, Social Control, or Drug Marketing Strategy?', Ethical Human Sciences and Services, Vol. 1, No. 2, Summer 1999, pp. 165-177.

Richard Gosden, 'Coercive Psychiatry, Human Rights and Public Participation', in Brian Martin (ed.), Technology and Public Participation, Science and Technology Studies, University of Wollongong, 1999, pp. 143-168.

Richard Gosden, 'Early Psychosis', Correspondence Column, British Journal of Psychiatry, Vol. 174, May 1999, p. 461.

Richard Gosden, 'Amendments to the NSW Mental Health Act', The Whistle, August, 1997, p. 12.

Richard Gosden, 'Shrinking the Dole Queue', Arena Magazine, No. 29, June-July 1997, pp. 39-41.

Richard Gosden, 'The Medicalisation of Deviance', Social Alternatives, Vol. 16, No. 2, April, 1997, pp. 58-60.

Richard Gosden, 'Neuroleptics and the Freedom of Thought: How Involuntary Psychiatric Treatment Violates Basic Human Rights', Monitors: Journal of Human Rights and Technology, University of Texas, Vol. 1, No. 1, February, 1997, Available URL, <http://www.cwrl.utexas.edu/~monitors/1/index.html>

David Dingelstad, Richard Gosden, Brian Martin and Nickolas Vakas, 'The Social Construction of Drug Debates', Social Science and Medicine, Vol. 43, No. 12, 1996, pp. 1829-1838.

Richard Gosden, 'STS Whipping Posts Enclose the Discipline', Technoscience, Vol. 8, No. 3, Fall 1995, pp. 14-16.