

University of Wollongong - Research Online

Thesis Collection

Title: Educating bodies to be good citizens: the politics and practices of physical education in Australia and France

Author: Lyndal Groom

Year: 2006

Repository DOI:

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

2006

Educating bodies to be good citizens: the politics and practices of physical education in Australia and France

Lyndal Groom
University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Groom, Lyndal, Educating bodies to be good citizens: the politics and practices of physical education in Australia and France, PhD thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 2006.
<http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/658>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**Educating bodies to be good citizens:
The politics and practices of physical
education in Australia and France**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

**Lyndal Groom, Bachelor of Arts (Hons)
Faculty of Education**

2006

CERTIFICATION

I, Lyndal R. Groom, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Lyndal R. Groom
18 September 2006

Table of Contents

	Page no.
Introduction	1
<i>Habitus</i> and body practices	1
Questions and framework	3
Research context	5
A model of embodied citizenship	6
Educating citizens	8
Curriculum as politics	10
Why compare France and Australia?	12
Globalisation: Cultural imperialism or osmosis?	14
Nature of the research	16
Chapter Outline	18
Autobiographical note	19
 Part I Theoretical frames	 21
Overview	22
 Chapter 1 Embodying citizens	 24
Theories of citizenship: Belonging and exclusion	26
Civic virtues	27
Sedimentary layers of citizenship	29
The modern citizen incarnate	31
Layers of liberalism	33
<i>Homo economicus</i> and the gendered citizen	35
Institutionalising good citizens	39
Performing the embodied citizen: Commemoration and inscription	42
The heroic citizen: A nation embodied	44
National pride and cultural prestige	46
The warrior-citizen	48
The face of a nation	49
<i>Aux grands hommes la patrie reconnaissante</i>	53
<i>Avec vous, nous avons rêvé</i>	55
Reinvigorating the nation and integrating good citizens	57
Governing embodied citizens	58

Chapter 2	The healthy citizen	60
	Why a healthy citizen?	61
	Public health: For whom to achieve what?	62
	Techniques for governing and disciplining bodies	64
	Public health as an ever-expanding network	66
	Judging the moral values of the embodied citizen	70
	Normalising lifestyles: A commodification of <i>habitus</i> ?	73
	Making choices	75
	But who is at-risk of what?	76
	Health systems in Australia and France	78
	Current standings on the obesity scales	80
	'Obesity – Everyone's problem' and 'Can you catch the fat bug?'	81
	The food solution: How many serves?	84
	The cultural solution	86
	The sport solution: Move your body!	87
	The moral solution: Be a better parent	89
	'Everything is good for you'	91
	Schools can do it all	92
Chapter 3	Schooling the embodied citizen	94
	Why educate citizens?	95
	Good citizen, 'at-risk' citizen	96
	Different bodies for different purposes	97
	Establishing formal education: Free, compulsory and secular	102
	Exponential growth, revolution and reaction	107
	Beyond the 1980s and the commodification of education	109
	<i>Education pour tous</i> – Education for all	111
	Educating bodies in schools: PE in France and Australia	112
	<i>Être fort pour être utile</i>	115
	The sportification of physical education	120
	Modernising nations	122
	The politics of empowerment: A divergence of cultures	123
	Crises of physical education, empowerment of teachers	127

Part II	Microcosms	130
	Overview	131
	Research strategies: Comparative education	131
	Research strategies: Ethnographic intent	132
	Research strategies: Social constructionist perspective	133
	Stages of data gathering	135
	Interview themes	136
	Technical limitations	137
	Schools and students	138
	Onwards to action	141
Chapter 4	Curriculum, crises and competencies	143
	Physical education in the new millennium – The French case	145
	EPS curriculum for collège	145
	EPS curriculum for lycée	147
	Types of activities for EPS	149
	Methods and assessment in EPS	150
	School sport in France	151
	Teacher training in France	153
	Physical education in NSW	154
	PDHPE at NSW high schools	158
	School sport in NSW	161
	Teacher training in NSW	162
	The comparative language of syllabus <i>Aims</i>	164
	Meanings of syllabus objectives	170
	The problematic place of sport	172
	Developing the syllabuses – the politics of dis/em/powerment	174
	Transforming content / resisting change	178
Chapter 5	Physical education in practice: Forming good citizens through sport	182
	Stereotypes and interview themes	183
	Who are the teachers?	185
	The attractions of being a physical education teacher	186
	Some meanings of sport for physical educators	189
	Desirable sporting behaviours for social citizenry	190
	Making something of yourself through sport	193

Teachers as role models for good citizens	195
Ideal students: A reflection of the good citizen	197
Teachers enjoying physical education	200
Students enjoying physical education	202
Differential values of sport	204
Students' participation in physical activity: Questions of status	207
Co-education in physical education: Gendering the ideal student	210
Gender paradoxes and cultural differences	215
Chapter 6 Physical education in practice: Forms of resistance	220
Teachers and syllabus changes	221
Sporting resistances or resisting sports	224
Problems of sport and teachers' resistance	225
Do physical educators teach or coach?	226
The politics of French after-school sports	230
Changing environment for school sport in NSW	233
Potential ruptures: Students' resistance to physical education	235
The marketing of physical education	236
Consuming physical education	238
Resistance to inculcation: Games and other acts of deviance	242
'We plant the seeds basically': Teaching physical education for lifelong participation	247
Becoming healthy citizens	250
Different schools, different students, a differential syllabus?	252
Conclusion Merging the macro and the micro	258
Frames of embodied citizenship	259
Ascribing medical and moral virtues for good citizens	261
Mesh-works of physical education	263
What do you see by comparison?	267
Imagine testing physical education: The PISA Project	271
Globalising shared futures for physical education	273
Bibliography	276

Appendices	307
Appendix 1	Australians of the Year, 1960-2004 308
Appendix 2	People interred at the Panthéon 310
Appendix 3	International health statistics for Australia and France 315
Appendix 4	Selection of Australian newspaper articles on obesity 316
Appendix 5	Outline of French and Australian school systems 320
Appendix 6	How to become a physical education teacher in France 321
	How to become a physical education teacher in Australia 322
Appendix 7	Physical activity questionnaire (English version) 323
	Physical activity questionnaire (French version) 328
Appendix 8	Interview codes and descriptors of interviewees 332
Appendix 9	Sample of class observations 333

List of tables and figures

Table 1.1:	Evolutionary characteristics of Western citizenship	30
Figure 1.1:	The 'good' citizen matrix	41
Table 2.1:	Contrasts and similarities between the 'old' and 'new' public health	68
Table 2.2:	Recent government responses to cure obesity	88
Figure 3.1:	Participation in Year 12 in Australia and the Baccalauréat in France	108
Table 3.1	Chronological overview of PE in Australia and France	114
Table A	Summary of school sites	139
Table B	School survey populations	140
Table 4.1	Summary of secondary school hours for physical education	147
Table 4.2	PDHPE selected Stage 5 Outcomes by strand	160
Table 4.3	Aims of physical education in France and NSW	166
Figure 4.1	Former NSW PDHPE Syllabus <i>Aims</i>	169
Table 4.4	Objectives for physical education in France and NSW	171
Figure 4.2	Proposed competencies for the Y2000 French syllabus	175
Table 5.1	Reasons for becoming a physical education teacher	187
Table 5.2	Teacher descriptions of 'ideal PE students'	199
Table 5.3	Teachers on enjoying physical education	201
Figure 5.1	Student enjoyment of physical education	203
Table 5.4	Most popular physical activities undertaken by students outside of school hours, by gender and school	208
Table 5.5	Teachers preferences regarding co-education classes	212

List of tables and figures (cont.)

Table 6.1	Teacher thoughts on current syllabuses	223
Figure 6.1	'What do you mean you're not dressed for PE?'	236
Figure 6.2	Student opinions on the purposes of EPS	241
Table 6.2	The impact of physical education for the longer term	248
Figure 7.1:	Conceptual dimensions of physical education	264

Acronyms

ABC	Australian Broadcasting Commission
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACHPER	Australian Council for Health, Physical Education & Recreation
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
ARC	Australian Research Council
AS	Association Sportive
BO	Bulletin Officiel
BoS	Board of Studies New South Wales
CAPEPS	Certificat d'Aptitude au Professorat d'Education Physique et Sportive
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation
DAA	Dietitians Association of Australia
ENA	Ecole Nationale d'Administration
EPS	Education Physique et Sportive (Physical and Sport Education)
HPE	Health and Physical Education
INPES	Institut national de prévention et d'éducation pour la santé
INSEE	Institut national de la statistique et des études économiques
IUFM	Institut universitaire de formation de maîtres (University institute for teacher training)
KLA	Key Learning Area
NESB	Non-English Speaking Background
NSW	New South Wales
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PDHPE	Personal Development, Health & Physical Education
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
RSL	Returned Services League
SES	Socio-Economic Status
SNEP	Syndicat National de l'Education Physique et Sportive (National EPS Union)
SNES	Syndicat National de l'Enseignement Secondaire (National Secondary Teachers' Union)
STAPS	Sciences et techniques des activités physiques et sportives
TAFE	Technical and Further Education
UFR	Unité de formation et de recherche (Research and training unit)
UNSS	Union Nationale de Sports Scolaires
WHO	World Health Organisation
ZEP	Zone d'éducation prioritaire

Abstract

This thesis is a cross-cultural comparative analysis of the physical education taught in secondary schools in France and Australia. My study begins with an analysis of embodied citizenship. Embodied citizenship comprises both explicit and implicit forms of *habitus* as structured through government institutions and regulations, for example, the legal requirements of citizenship as well as the informal social constructs of citizenship such as belonging. While the formal rules of citizenship have been amended over the centuries to provide greater equality (for example between men and women), tacit and unspoken rules and beliefs and the marketplace maintain forms of exclusionary behaviour for citizens. This includes state instituted practices such as public commemorations, national and local celebrations and award ceremonies, particularly those related to the remembrance war and the founding of nation-states.

The second half of this study takes this theoretical framework to examine the politics and practices of physical education in schools. Physical education is an example of a state-instituted practice designed to help develop 'good' citizens, obedient and efficient. In order to do this, a Foucauldian network of expertise and skills has emerged to 'regulate' the discipline of physical education and draws upon intercalated discourses of health, morality, sport, and physical activity. While the politics of physical education, in the shape of the school curriculum, espouse a doctrine of equality of citizens, the practices incorporate forms of differentiated embodied citizenship that continue to privilege and reward particular hegemonic characteristics.

The value of cross-cultural analysis emerges with the comparison of political positioning of the French and NSW syllabi. As the later stages of my research shows, policy is one thing and classroom practices are often another. The personal engagement of teachers with discourses of physical culture is a major influence for implementing syllabi.

Acknowledgements

For John, Rebecca and Laurent. I promise not to do another one.
To everyone I've met along the way, thanks for being part of it all.