

# University of Wollongong - Research Online

## Thesis Collection

Title: Silence speaks volumes - the deaf experience of mental health, culture and communication

Author: Otilia Rodrigues

Year: 2007

Repository DOI:

### Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.**

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

2007

## Silence speaks volumes - the deaf experience of mental health, culture and communication

Otilia Rodrigues  
*University of Wollongong*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

### University of Wollongong

#### Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

---

### Recommended Citation

Rodrigues, Otilia , Silence speaks volumes - the deaf experience of mental health, culture and communication, PhD thesis, School of Psychology, University of Wollongong, 2007. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/24>

## **NOTE**

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

## **UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

### **COPYRIGHT WARNING**

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**SILENCE SPEAKS VOLUMES – THE DEAF  
EXPERIENCE OF MENTAL HEALTH, CULTURE  
AND COMMUNICATION**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the  
Requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

From

University of Wollongong

By

OTILIA RODRIGUES

BA Psychology & Sociology

MA Psychology (Forensic)

School of Psychology

2007

## CERTIFICATION

I, Otilia Rodrigues, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in other the School of Psychology, University of Wollongong, is in every respect my own work unless otherwise specified by referencing or acknowledgement. This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Otilia Rodrigues

July 2007

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>List of Tables</b>	vi
<b>List of Case Vignettes</b>	vii
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	ix
<b>Preface</b>	x
<b>Abstract</b>	xiv
<b>Part One: History, diagnosis and communication</b>	1
<b>Introduction</b>	2
<b>Chapter 1: An historical view of deafness and the problems of definition</b>	14
1.1 Problem associated with deafness	15
1.2 Effects in Australia	23
1.3 Issues of understanding and responsibility	24
1.4 Current facilities and services	26
1.5 Difficulties with definitions of deafness	31
1.6 The medical view	34
1.7 The problems of education	40
1.8 A linguistic view	45
1.9 A cultural view	49

<b>Chapter 2: Current problems with communication, mental health, testing and diagnosis</b>	<b>55</b>
2.1 Communication and health professionals	53
2.2 The role of language	56
2.3 Problems of mental health diagnosis in a deaf population	59
2.4 Case study from the researcher's files, illustrating the far-reaching consequences of misdiagnosis	62
2.5 Deaf patients in Psychiatry and Mental Health Settings	64
2.6 The problem with current practice	64
<b>Chapter 3: The problems with current practice</b>	<b>67</b>
3.1 Rationale	68
3.2 Participants	68
3.3 Methodology	68
3.4 Results	69
3.5 Participant demographics	69
3.4.2 Case vignettes – examples of diagnostic complexities and problems	71
3.4.3 The Key Issues, identified from case vignettes	85
3.5 Discussion	86
3.5.1 The need for appropriate psychometric assessment tools	88
<b>Chapter 4: Development of the MMPI-2 for use with Deaf people</b>	<b>89</b>
4.1 Rationale	90
4.1.1 Aims and hypotheses of the study	91
4.2 Using the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI-2) with Deaf adults	91

4.2.1	Background to the MMPI-2	91
4.2.2	Procedure for the development of the Auslan interactive CD-ROM	93
4.2.2.1	Selecting an interpreter	94
4.2.2.2	Producing the interactive CD-ROM	95
4.3	Study 2 – Trialling the MMPI-2 interactive CD-ROM	97
4.2.3	Method	97
4.2.3.1	Participants	97
4.2.2.2	Materials	98
4.2.2.3	Rationale for selection of subscales and data analysis	99
4.2.3.4	Procedure	102
4.3	Results	103
4.3.1	Demographic data	103
4.3.2	Satisfaction Survey Responses	105
4.3.2	Comparison of overall response rates for Pencil and Paper and Auslan interactive CD-ROM MMPI-2 versions	106
4.3.3	Comparison of scores and response rates between the MMPI-2 pencil and paper subscales and Auslan interactive CD-ROM versions	108
4.4	Discussion	110
4.4.1	Demographic and administration factors	111
4.4.2	Preference and satisfaction factors	116
4.4.3	Subscale factors	117
4.4.4	Concluding remarks	120
	<b>Part Two: Culture, identity and communication</b>	121
	<b>Chapter 5: The language and culture of Deafness</b>	122

5.1	A sign of the times	123
5.2	Deaf culture, identity and community	132
5.3	Family and Deaf identity	141
<b>Chapter 6: Giving a theoretical voice to Deafness</b>		150
6.1	Finding a theoretical framework for Deafness	151
6.1.1	Limitations of traditional approaches	151
6.1.2	What kind of theory would work?	152
6.1.3	Personal Construct Theory as a framework with necessary theoretical features for understanding Deafness	156
6.1.3.1	The basis of Kelly's Personal Construct Theory (PCT)	157
6.1.3.2	The usefulness of Personal Construct Theory	158
6.1.3.3	The usefulness of constructs	160
6.1.3.4	Identifying the problems using the Personal Construct Psychology (PCP) framework	161
6.1.3.5	Resolving the conflicting perspectives	162
6.1.3.7	Conclusion	164
<b>Chapter 7: Exploring Deaf and hearing constructs using methodology from Personal Construct Theory</b>		166
7.1	Study 3 - Using Personal Construct Theory Methodology	167
7.1.1	Identifying attitudes to Deafness	167
7.3	Rationale for the current study	169
7.3.1	Method	170
7.3.2	Participants	170
7.3.3	Procedure	171
7.3.4	Results	172

7.5	Discussion	178
7.6	Conclusion	182
<b>Chapter 8: Conclusion</b>		184
8.1	Early attitudes set the scene	186
8.2	Beginning a better path to diagnosis and treatment	187
8.3	Understanding the reality of the Deaf world	188
8.4	Limitations and difficulties	190
8.5	Future directions	192
8.6	Future practical recommendations arising from the experience of completing this thesis	194
<b>References</b>		196
<b>Appendices</b>		207

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Diagnostic Statistical Manual (DSM –IV) Criteria at time of discharge	69
Table 2	Breakdown of information gathered	70
Table 3	Demographic data	103
Table 4	Participant satisfaction survey responses	105
Table 5	Response rate for all participants	106
Table 6	Paranoia subscales (6) – Males	108
Table 7	Paranoia subscale (6) females	108
Table 8	Schizophrenia subscales (8) – females	109
Table 9	Schizophrenia subscales (8) males	109
Table 10	Social introversion subscales (0) females	110
Table 11	Social introversion subscales (0) males	110
Table 12	General themes that emerged from deaf interviews	172
Table 13	General themes that emerged from hearing professional interviews	174
Table 14	General themes that emerged from hearing interviews	176

# LIST OF CASE VIGNETTES

Case K1	Deafness second to rubella adjustment disorder depressive episode	71
Case A2	Chronic Schizophrenia	71
Case S3	Chronic Schizophrenia, congenital deafness second to rubella	72
Case G4	Depression – suicidal poisoning by benzodiazepine	72
Case K5	Major depression with melancholia/congenital deafness	72
Case Y6	Congenital deafness (second to rubella), puerperal psychosis, hypothyroidism, chronic schizophrenia, alcohol dependence (in remission) and epilepsy	73
Case D7	Congenital deafness and schizophrenia	74
Case F8	Parkinson's NIDDM, schizophrenia, blindness and deafness (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	76
Case J9	Deaf blind, emotional lability and revision shunt (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	76
Case F10	Paranoia disorder with anxiety symptoms, left Bell's Palsy, congenital deafness and hypochondrias (dual admission with differing diagnosis)	76
Case B11	Chronic dysthymia, alcohol abuse, bipolar affective disorder, suicidal (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	77
Case A12	Congenital deafness, hypomanic phase of MDP with mixed features and alcohol intake (dual admission with differing diagnosis)	78
Case C13	Adjustment disorder with depressed mood, Choreoathetosis? Huntington's Chorea, suicidal thoughts. Principal Choreathetosis, secondary tetrabenazine withdrawal acute stressor disagreement with sister (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	78

Case - C14	Adjustment disorder with depressed mood ,Not specified Choreoathetosis ?Huntington's Chorea, Suicidal thoughts. Principal Choreoathetosis, Secondary Tetrabenazine withdrawal Acute stressor disagreement with sister	79
Case S15	Profound congenital deafness, schizophrenia – paranoid type, antisocial personality disorder, poly-substance abuse and social isolation (partially deafness related)	81
Case S16	Congenital deafness, antisocial traits and cerebral palsy	82
Case P17	Hypoxia 2 degrees fume inhalation, asthma and profound deafness (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	82
Case A18	Congenital deafness/schizophrenia	83
Case D19	Acute exacerbation of chronic schizophrenia/congenital deafness (second to meningitis at age 5) (multiple admissions & diagnosis)	84
Case E20	Prelingual deafness, depression suicide attempt	85
Case A	33 year old Deaf man	153

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people whose support and assistance have been invaluable. Special thanks are due to my Deaf friends, participants and members of the Deaf community - I thank you all for your time, insight and especially for the privilege of allowing me into your world; without you there would be no thesis. My connection with you, the Deaf community has been a significant part of my professional life and continues to be.

To my supervisors, Nadia Crittenden and Peter Caputi, and the administrative staff in the School of Psychology and wider university community, I express my sincere gratitude for all your support and encouragement. To Rodney Davis especially, Angus Beath, James Blyth, Peter Bonzer, Robert Adam, and the staff at Royal Prince Alfred Audio Visual Department, thank you for your assistance and expertise.

To my friends and colleagues here and overseas who share this unique interest in Deafness, I extend a special thanks to you all for your motivation, inspiration and passion. To the late Barbara Brauer and also Allan Sussman, pioneers in this field, I thank you for saying “never give up on this thesis”. Thanks also to Associate Professor O’Sullivan, whose initial input started me on my way.

To my mother, Beatriz, extended family and friends I would like to extend my deep appreciation for your support during these years. To my dear friend Desley Hennessy, I thank you for listening, being a sounding board for many ideas and assisting me with technology.

Last, but by no means least, special thanks to my wonderful family, especially my husband John, for persisting and believing in me. My daughters, Kerrie and her husband Marcio, our dearest granddaughter Charlize, and our latest addition to our family our grandson, Tyreese, Kylie and her fiancé, Adam, have all in their own unique way been an inspiration and strength. I thank you all for your patience, love and understanding throughout this journey. You have also made it possible.

*This thesis is dedicated to my dad, Jose Gabriel Fernandes, 1931 – 2001.*

## **PREFACE**

During the write up of this thesis an incident took place which pinpointed the heart of this thesis. A very distressed patient contacted the researcher in her capacity of therapist following a sexual assault. She had been wandering the streets helplessly in an attempt to return to the refuge which was her temporary home. The background of this person was very difficult and included enduring a horrendous child sexual assault, being used as a sex slave, raped multiple times throughout her life with no counselling and finally being referred to the current therapist who is fluent in Auslan. The distress call directly to the therapist came in the early hours of the morning (1-00am) via sms which was the only form of contact the person could manage.

Following the proper procedure the therapist called the police, informing them of the call (during which the client had threatened suicide) and requesting that they go to the premises while the therapist remained in contact with the client. The client messaged that she had taken the overdose and at this stage the police had not yet attended. When the therapist contacted the police again at 2.30 am the response by the constable was “but we can’t communicate with her, isn’t she profoundly deaf? Do you know anyone who can communicate with her”? The officer contacted the refuge and then the client herself contacted the mobile number for the refuge. The worker on call contacted the ambulance and she was taken to the hospital by ambulance without the police ever attending.

The following day the therapist contacted the client again to ascertain what had happened not knowing at this stage that the police had not attended the refuge and had left it to the refuge worker to see that she would be taken to hospital. The therapist then contacted the police department and requested to speak to someone regarding the

incident which took place. Not unexpectedly, there was no events number (a number that is assigned after a call comes in regarding an incident). The officer who took the call during the crisis had not recorded any details of what had occurred. During the conversation the therapist was then transferred to the supervisor on duty who then assigned an officer and also went personally to the hospital to get the facts from the client.

In the afternoon when the therapist had finished her usual clinic hours, she proceeded to visit the client in hospital. Tired and frustrated, the client was still in casualty (emergency) and had not yet been admitted into the psychiatric facility. She was pacing the floor, moving continuously in and out of the rooms. At this stage she informed the therapist that the police had been to take a statement but she had not yet been seen by the psychiatrist on duty.

The therapist consulted with the psychiatrist on duty and relayed the message that she had feared for this client's life should she be allowed to go home. The client was depressed and there were other mitigating circumstances that would have been detrimental to her welfare had she been discharged. She was admitted into the psychiatric facility. The following day one of the nursing staff telephoned the therapist stating "we have a lady in here - would you like to speak to her"? This call did not take into account that the client was deaf and therefore could not speak on the phone, and the nurse referred to the ward name only, and not the patient's name. Furthermore, this client had had a similar experience six weeks prior when she was taken to hospital but was not admitted. The same therapist had been verbally abused by the hospital social worker at that time stating that the patient was not suicidal (even though she had taken an overdose on the weekend and was claiming that she would take her life. She had had nowhere to go after having been evicted from a women's

housing facility. It had also been recognized by other residents that this client had been victimized by some residents). The social worker claimed the client had been assessed by the mental health team twice! This raises the question as to who made this assessment and the qualification of the person, given that we do not have any mental health professionals within the area who could have adequately communicated and evaluated her state of mind.

As this case had not been handled appropriately, the client was once again evicted from another refuge because she had overdosed and no housing was organized before her release from hospital. The end result of this case was that the client ended up in intensive care fighting for her life.

The therapist was requested to go out to the hospital to visit the client as the staff were experiencing difficulty communicating with her and did not know what steps to take. The therapist contacted the hospital to ascertain why the client had been discharged in the first place given that she had a history of suicide attempts, ostracised from the Deaf community and had no social supports within the wider community. The nurse on duty stated (in a defensive tone) that the client knew very well that she was not to go back to the refuge as she had been evicted because of the overdosing behaviour and this had been relayed via a “Braille” interpreter. The therapist questioned this with the nurse and reaffirmed that the client was deaf and not blind. The nurse proceeded to state emphatically that “yes, she had a Braille interpreter”. The therapist stated once again, the client is DEAF! The nurse stated “Well, that’s what it says on the notes!

While the client was in intensive care, the therapist was asked once again to visit the client as the medical staff were having great difficulty communicating and then was greeted by the medical staff with what appeared to be contempt, being asked why she

had come to see the client, given that the client was non-communicative. They had taken the client's glasses from her. Unable to see, no one in intensive care could communicate with her at all and no one had Auslan skills. Frustrated, distressed, exhausted and struggling for air the client appeared relieved when she saw the therapist and signed for her glasses. However, the use of medical equipment made this impossible. The nurse on duty said to the therapist that they were not allowed to administer pain killers to the client directly, that she had to do it herself intravenously via the connected drip. The nurse had instructed the client (in the therapist's hearing) to "listen for the click" (!)

Prior to leaving, the therapist attempted to provide the nurse with some simple signs which may have assisted her to communicate with the client but there was very little response from the nurse, to the point that she did not engage or look at what was being signed, repeated one of the signs (the sign for "bad") but that was all.

This incident highlights all the issues this thesis raises – health, mental, communication, language, education, culture – and the plight of our Deaf population. It is hoped that this research will contribute to the changes that so much need to be made.

# **ABSTRACT**

This thesis sets out to explore the world of deafness and to identify the major issues that beset deaf people. The experience of deaf people is largely unknown by the hearing world, partly because of the unimaginable nature of the reality of deafness (unlike blindness which, to some extent at least, can be easily simulated, though blindness from birth cannot), partly because deafness is not immediately visible and partly because the communication issues are so complex. The thesis begins with an historical view of deafness to provide a rationale for the way in which deaf people are understood and treated today and then moves on to identify the most serious and far-reaching issues that affect the lives of this population. Health and mental health, language, education, communication and cultural issues are explored in depth and their importance compared. Cultural issues emerge as a special complexity as Deaf\* communities have strong difficulties in being recognised as a culture as opposed to a disabled minority. To overcome this, a paradigm shift is needed whereby Deaf people can be viewed as both a separate culture and a normal population within a wellness model. A theoretical framework, Personal Construct Theory, is proposed as a theoretical approach that will validate Deaf experience and also provide an explanation of the hearing world's interpretation of Deafness. It is proposed that this framework provides both a bridge for more effective communication and useful clinical perspectives, thereby providing the context for the paradigm shift that is needed.

Three studies are presented. Study 1 establishes the extent of the problems associated with diagnosis of health and mental health problems; Study 2 presents an initial strategy to combat diagnostic issues by translating a widely used diagnostic mental

health test into Auslan (Australian Sign Language) using a CD-ROM format and trialling the test with a pilot group; Study 3 presents an exploration of the ways in which Deaf and hearing people interpret themselves and one another using the Personal Construct Theory framework. The thesis concludes with a discussion of the ways in which this research contributes to the paradigm shift that will change the perception of deafness and the social conditions related to this population.

\*"D" Deaf is used to refer to the culture of deaf people; "d" deaf is used to refer to the physiological (audiological) condition of deafness. This usage continues throughout the thesis.