

University of Wollongong - Research Online

Thesis Collection

Title: Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Author: Deborah J Bunker-Murray

Year: 2004

Repository DOI:

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

2004

Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Bunker-Murray, Deborah J, Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management, PhD thesis, School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, 2004. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844>

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection

University of Wollongong

Year 2004

Management of open information
technology and systems (ITS)
architectures in the Australian federal
government: development of a
perspectival model for information
systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray
University of Wollongong

Bunker-Murray, Deborah J, Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management, PhD thesis, School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, 2004. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844>

This paper is posted at Research Online.
<http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844>

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**MANAGEMENT OF OPEN INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND SYSTEMS
(ITS) ARCHITECTURES IN THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT**

Development of a Perspectival Model for Information Systems Management.

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree**

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

From

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

VOLUME I

by

DEBORAH J. BUNKER-MURRAY, BA 1980, MCom (Hons) 1991, UNSW

SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND INFORMATION SYSTEMS

2004

CERTIFICATION

I, Deborah J. Bunker-Murray, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray

22 June 2004

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A PhD can often be a long and lonely journey. On this journey, however, you can meet many wise, interesting and helpful people. I would like to thank all of my family, friends and colleagues for their words (and actions) of advice, encouragement and support.

Thanks must also go to DMR Group Australia Pty. Ltd. for their funding of this research as well as access to their expertise and industry contacts.

Special thanks go to Graham Winley, who supervised the early stages of this thesis and to Helen Hasan who gave me critical advice and supervision at the end of the thesis process.

Finally a very heartfelt thankyou, to my partner Bill Murray, whose unshakable confidence and support for what I was doing, kept me moving forward.

For Bill...

*...and also for Eric (my father), Jim, Peg, Len and Rosemary who I will see once more at
the end of a greater journey.*

ABSTRACT

This thesis looks at the limitations of current ITS management objective (normative) theory and develops a new Perspectival ITS Management Model so as to supplement this theory and overcome some of its limitations. The proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model is an approach to reconciliation/integration of object/subject from a phenomenological viewpoint. The development of the Perspectival ITS Management Model has been heavily influenced by the work of John Haynes (2001a).

In order to investigate the applicability of the Perspectival ITS Management Model a constructionist epistemological stance is taken in the thesis, which describes an overview of current objective ITS management theory, that is analysed and focussed through a normative ITS Management Model (developed by the candidate in the early stages of the thesis). The thesis goes on to develop the objective theoretical view of the management of open systems architectures and uses this to investigate the subjective case study accounts of the management of open systems architectures from 1993–1996 in the Australian federal government. These cases are used to highlight how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can be utilised to enhance, extend and transform our understanding of ITS Management in ways that the current body of theory does not.

A postscript has also been developed to illustrate how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can also be applied to the ITS management landscape (whole-of-government ITS outsourcing) of the Australian federal government (1996 – 2001) after the initial open systems case study period (1993-1996).

INDEX WORDS: ITS Management, ITS Architecture, Perspectival Thinking, Phenomenology, Australian federal government.

PUBLICATIONS RELATING TO THIS THESIS

- Bunker, D.J. & Winley, G.K. (1993) "Position statement: management of open systems architectures", IFIP, Conference on Diffusion, Transfer and Implementation of Information Technology, Champion, Pennsylvania, October 10-13.
- Fowler, P. (Scribe & Ed), Bihari, T., Bunker, D., Chung, W., Damsgaard, J., Glasson, B., Lien, L. (Facilitator), McOwen, P., Montealegre, R., Radic, Z. & Varner, M. (1993) "Working session 1: Critical issues in first to third world transfer of software and information technology", IFIP, Conference on Diffusion, Transfer and Implementation of Information Technology, Champion, Pennsylvania, October 10-13.
- Bunker, D.J. (1994) "Research in progress: management of open systems architectures - a case study", Australian Unix and Open Systems User Group, Annual Conference, Melbourne, September 6-9: 145-155.
- Bunker, D.J. (1995) "Management of open systems architectures - an Australian government perspective", Australian Unix and Open Systems User Group, Annual Conference, Sydney, September 19-21: 10-15.
- Bunker, D.J. & Winley, G.K. (1995) "Management of Open Architectures" Association for Information Systems Proceedings of the First Americas Conference on Information Systems August 25-27 1995 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania USA: 378-380.
- Bunker, D.J. & Dean, R.G.. (1996) "Toward an Information Systems Paradigmatic Framework", Association for Information Systems Proceedings of the Americas Conference on Information Systems, Phoenix, Arizona, August: 596-598.
- Bunker, D.J., Larsen, T. & Vlissidis, P. (1997) "Technology transfer: does the context of the creation of IS technology inhibit its transfer? An international perspective", IFIP TC8 WG8.6 International Working Conference on Diffusion, Adoption and Implementation of Information Technology, 25th-27th June, 1997, Ambleside, Cumbria, UK: 375-376.
- Bunker, D.J. & Dean, R.G. (1998) "Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) As Tools: the Cultural Context of Tool Creation and Use and Its Effect on the Technology Transfer Process", the electronic journal Philosophical and Conceptual Foundations of Information Systems, <http://www.cba.uh.edu/~parks/fis/bunker.htm>
- Bunker, D.J. (1998) "Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) As Tools: Cultural Bias and the Implications for International Technology Transfer (ITT) ?" Proceedings of the Association of Information Systems Conference, Baltimore, August: 818-820.
- Bunker, D.J. (1998) "A Philosophy of Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) as Tools: Tool Development Context, Associated Skills and the Global Technology Transfer (GTT) Process" in MIS-shaped or misshaped ? Emerging issues in the new global arena. Proceedings of IFIP WG8.7 Working Conference, Helsinki, Finland: 199-214.
- Bunker, D.J. (2000) "Comments on the "information" concept in FRISCO compared to empirical studies of information in decision making", ISCO-4 (IFIP8.1) Proceedings, Information Systems Concepts: An integrated discipline emerging, Lorentz Center, Leiden, The Netherlands, 20-22 September: 295-297.
- Bunker, D.J. (2000) "Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) System Tools: The Context of their Creation and Use Within the Technology Transfer Process" in Proceedings of the Americas Conference on Information Systems AMCIS 2000, (ed H.Michael Chung) August 10-13, Long Beach California: 1533-1536.
- Bunker, D.J. (2001) "A Philosophy of Information Technology and Systems (IT & S) as Tools: Tool Development Context, Associated Skills and the Global Technical Transfer (GTT) Process", Information Systems Frontiers 3:2: 185-197.
- Bunker, D.J., Wilson, D. & Elliot, S. (eds) (2002) The Adoption and Diffusion of IT in an Environment of Critical Change Proceedings of IFIP WC8.6, Sydney, Australia, August 1-3.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 1

CHAPTER 1 - THESIS OVERVIEW, RESEARCH PROBLEM AND QUESTIONS	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Current Management Context and Research Questions	2
1.3 The Research Problem (chapter 1)	9
1.4 Literature Review: An Objective ITS Management Model (chapter 2)	10
1.5 Research Design for Data Collection and Analysis (chapter 3)	11
1.6 Background to the Objective Theory of the Management of Open ITS Architectures as it Applies to the Australian Federal Government (chapter 4)	12
1.7 Data Analysis: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Management of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective (chapter 5)	13
1.8 Discussion and Conclusion (chapter 6)	14
1.9 POSTSCRIPT: Australian Federal Government Management of ITS (Outsourcing 1996-2001) (chapter 7)	14
1.10 Summary of Research Findings, Contributions, Limitations and Opportunities (chapter 8)	15
CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW: An Objective ITS Management Model	16
Chapter Overview	16
2.1 Introduction	18
2.2 Literature Discussion Using the ITS Management Model (figure 2.1) as a Framework	24
2.2.1 Derivation of an Organisation's General Business Requirements	25
2.2.2 Derivation of an Organisation's ITS Business Unit Requirements	32
2.2.3 ITS Architecture and Infrastructure Requirements	35
2.2.4 The User Requirements of ITS	42
2.2.5 The Organisational Context (Boundary) and Its Effect on ITS Management	45
2.2.6 The External Environment to the Organisation and Its Effect on ITS Requirements	54
2.2.7 ITS Planning Cycles in a Typical Organisation	56
2.3 The Objective ITS Management Model and Its Relationship to the Galliers and Sutherland (1991) Revised Stages of Growth Model	74
2.4 Conclusion and Areas of Inquiry	95

CHAPTER 3 - RESEARCH DESIGN FOR DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS	105
Chapter Overview	105
3.1 Research Framework	107
3.2 Epistemology	109
3.3 Research Investigation and Resulting Research Problem, Question and Approaches	113
3.4 Research Methods - Including Steps for Data Collection and Analysis	118
3.5 Research Instrument	123
3.6 Justification of the Research Sites	125
3.7 Research Stages	127
3.8 Reconciliation of Object and Subject	129
3.9 Challenging Methodological Issues	140
3.10 Conclusions	142
CHAPTER 4 - BACKGROUND TO THE OBJECTIVE THEORY OF MANAGEMENT OF OPEN ITS ARCHITECTURES AS IT APPLIES TO THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT	144
Chapter Overview	144
4.1 Introduction	144
4.2 Objective Theory of Open ITS Architectures	145
4.3 Objective Theory of the Management of Open Systems Architectures - Galliers & Sutherland (1991) Revised Stages of Growth Model	152
4.4 Australian Federal Government Policy on Management of Open ITS Architectures	166
4.5 Australian Federal Government Use of Open Systems Architectures	169
4.6 Conclusions	171

CHAPTER 5 - DATA ANALYSIS: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective	173
Chapter Overview	173
5.1 Introduction	174
5.2 Organisational Contextual Factors - Mutual Contingency of Skills and Tools	178
5.2.1 Case Organisation Contextual Interpretation	181
5.2.2 Case Organisation Interpretation - Obvious Contextual Factors Influencing Management of Open Systems Architectures	183
5.2.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Emerging Contextual Factors Influencing the Management of Open Systems Architectures	185
5.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Subjective Case Account Data (Explanation Sketches)	187
5.3.1 Case Organisation 1	189
5.3.2 Case Organisation 2	192
5.3.3 Case Organisation 3	196
5.3.4 Case Organisation 4	198
5.3.5 Case Organisation 5	203
5.3.6 Case Organisation 6	206
5.4 Discussion	209
5.5 Limitations of Objective Views of Open Systems Architecture Management - (Tool Based Model of the IS Discipline)	213
5.6 Conclusions	217
CHAPTER 6 - DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION	218
Chapter Overview	218
6.1 Research Problem, Questions and Approach	219
6.2 Reconciliation of Object and Subject	221
6.3 Proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model	225
6.4 Conclusions	239
CHAPTER 7 - POSTSCRIPT: Australian Federal Government Management of ITS Architectures (Outsourcing 1996 - 2001)	243
Chapter Overview	243
7.1 Introduction	243
7.2 Objective Theory of Outsourcing ITS Architectures	244

7.3 Objective Theory of Outsourcing ITS Architectures - Australian Federal Government Policy (1996 - 2001)	252
7.4 Outsourcing Findings - Subjective Accounts of Outsourcing ITS Architectures - Australian Federal Government	255
7.5 Conclusions	262
CHAPTER 8 - SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS, CONTRIBUTIONS, LIMITATIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES	268
8.1 Introduction	268
8.2 Summary of Research Findings	268
8.3 Research Contributions	270
8.4 Research Limitations	272
8.5 Future Research Opportunities	273
BIBLIOGRAPHY	275
APPENDIX A - CASE ORGANISATION SURVEY INSTRUMENT	VOLUME 2
APPENDIX B - CASE ORGANISATION CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION	VOLUME 2
APPENDIX C – CASE ORGANISATION RESPONDENT CHARACTERISTICS TABLES	SUBJECTIVE VOLUME 2
APPENDIX D – CASE ORGANISATION INDIVIDUAL ACCOUNTS	SUBJECTIVE VOLUME 2
APPENDIX E – FORMAL STANDARDS GROUPS & DEFINITIONS	VOLUME 2

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Figure 2.1 – ITS Management Model (modified from Bunker 1994) – pg 152	17
Table 2.1 – Basic Tasks at Different Levels of MIS Planning – from Goa & Oppelland (1994) – pg 287	32
Figure 2.2 – The Elements of IT Infrastructure – from Weill et al. (1996) – pg 6	38
Table 2.2 – Key Issues of EUC (N=74) – from McLean et al. (1993) – pg 86	43
Table 2.3 – Possible Stakeholders in MIS Planning within an Organisation - from Goa & Oppelland (1994) - 288	57
Figure 2.3 – The New Age – from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79	63
Figure 2.4 – Managing the New Age - from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79	63
Table 2.4 – Five Approaches Summarised – from Earl (1993) – pg 12	66
Figure 2.5 – A Contingency Framework for Choosing an Appropriate SISP Approach Based on Stakeholder Motivations (amended from Galliers 1987f p 344) – from Galliers (1991) – pg 63	67
Table 2.5 – A revised “stages of growth” model – (Sutherland & Galliers, 1989, p23 reproduced in Galliers, 1991, pp 61-62)	69
Figure 2.6 – Research Model – from Prekumar & King (1994) – pg 81	71
Exhibit 2.1 – A Model of IS Leadership Roles – from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 15	77
Exhibit 2.2 – Four Forms of IS Partnering - from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 16	78
Figure 2.7 – Four ‘Faces’, or Tasks, of the Emerging IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 6	84
Figure 2.8 – Nine Capabilities for the IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 7	85
Table 2.6 – Research Agenda – from Clark (1994) – pg 49	92
Table 2.7 – The predictions for the next decade – from Benjamin & Blunt (1994) –pg 55	93
Figure 2.9 – Putting the business back into IT – from Earl (1992) – pg 79	94
Figure 2.10 – IS Complexity Framework – Hackney et al. (2000) – pg 16	98
Figure 3.1 – Research Framework for Data Collection and Analysis	108
Figure 3.2 – Steps for Data Collection and Analysis	118
Table 4.1 Open Systems Architecture (OSA) revised “stages of growth” model – adapted from Sutherland & Galliers (1989) – pg 23	146
Table 4.2 – Strategy Objective Characteristics	154

Table 4.3 – Structure Objective Characteristics	155
Table 4.4 – Systems Objective Characteristics	157
Table 4.5 – Staff Objective Characteristics	159
Table 4.6 – Style Objective Characteristics	160
Table 4.7 – Skills Objective Characteristics	162
Table 4.8 – Superordinate Goals Objective Characteristics	164
Table 4.9 – Personal Computing Operating Systems Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites)	169
Table 4.10 – Mainframe Operating Systems Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites)	170
Table 4.11 – Databases Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites)	171
Table 5.1 Case Organisation Characteristics	183
Table 5.2 Factors Affecting Level of Agreement with Objective Literature NOW - by Organisation Number	188
Table 5.3 Factors Affecting Level of Agreement with Objective Literature FUTURE - by Organisation Number	188
Figure 5.1 The Disciplinary Model – adapted from Bunker & Dean (1997) – pg 4	214
Figure 5.2 – The Effect of Time With Regard to Object/Subject Reconciliation/Integration	216
Figure 6.1 – The McKinsey 7s Framework – originally proposed by Pascale & Athos (1981) (source Waterman et al. 1980 – pg 7 from Plant 2000 – pg 72)	223
Table 6.1 – Obvious and Emerging Contextual Factors – Organisation 1	229
Figure 6.2 – Perspectival ITS Management Model (Integration/Reconciliation of the Subject -Object)	233
Table 7.1 – Comparison of a sample of LAs and PSOs via the 4 conceptual frameworks – from Hancox & Hackney (2000) – pg 232	248
Table 7.2 – Objective Considerations for the Outsourcing of ITS (based on ACS 1997, Seddon 2001, Hancox & Hackney 2000, Kern & Willcocks 2000)	251
Table 7.3 – Differences Between Outsourcing Objective and Subjective Views	264