

University of Wollongong - Research Online

Thesis Collection

Title: An ergonomic analysis of vacuum cleaning tasks using observational risk assessment tools

Author: Alison Bell

Year: 2008

Repository DOI:

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

2008

An ergonomic analysis of vacuum cleaning tasks using observational risk assessment tools

Alison Bell

University of Wollongong, abell@uow.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Bell, Alison, An ergonomic analysis of vacuum cleaning tasks using observational risk assessment tools, MSc-Res thesis, School of Health Sciences, University of Wollongong, 2008. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/>
126

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

An Ergonomic Analysis of Vacuum Cleaning Tasks Using Observational Risk Assessment Tools

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of

Master of Science (Research)

from

University of Wollongong

by

Alison Bell

B. App. Sc. (O.T.)

Grad. Dip. Safety Sc.

Grad. Cert. Health Sc. (Education)

School of Health Sciences

2008

Certification

I, Alison Bell, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Master of Science (Research), in the School of Health Sciences, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution. Copies of the original data analysed within this thesis are held by the School of Health Sciences, University of Wollongong.

Alison Bell

11 June 2008

Dedication

I would like to dedicate this thesis to my husband, Robert Edgar, and my children, Elizabeth and Callum, who have shown extraordinary patience, understanding and resilience through my perpetual quest for further study. Without their support, this thesis would never have been written. I would also like to dedicate this thesis to the memory of my mother, who always told me to do my best, and passed away before this thesis could be completed.

Acknowledgments

I would like to acknowledge WorkCover NSW, the cleaning companies and cleaning workers who participated in this study. I would also like to express my gratitude and thanks to a number of people who have helped me through the thesis process:

- Professor Julie Steele, my Supervisor and academic mentor, for her encouragement, guidance and advice;
- Dr Katrina Simpson, my Co-Supervisor, for her guidance and support;
- Dr Bridget Munro for her encouragement and words of wisdom;
- Dr Pam Davies for her knowledge of statistics and willingness to share it;
and
- Ms Fiona Weigall, my colleague and friend, for her technical skills and analytical mind.

Abstract

This research thesis examined the risk of upper limb musculoskeletal disorders for cleaning workers while performing vacuum cleaning tasks in the normal course of their employment. The cleaning workers in this study were from three sectors of the workforce – government schools, hospitality and commercial office space. The vacuum cleaning tasks were divided into those performed with a back pack style vacuum cleaning machine and those using a canister/barrel machine. Three observational risk assessment tools were selected to measure the risk of these tasks to cleaning workers. The selected tools were the Manual Tasks Risk Assessment Tool (ManTRA) version 2.0; the Quick Exposure Check (QEC) (Li & Buckle, 1998); and the Rapid Upper Limb Assessment tool (RULA) (McAtamney & Corlett, 1993).

Results of this thesis study demonstrated that vacuum cleaning is a risk to the musculoskeletal health of cleaning workers, with some variation between the tool ratings, reflecting the specificity and/or sensitivity of each tool. Differences were found between the three cleaning sectors in terms of overall risk posed by vacuum cleaning tasks. The sector with the greatest risk was found to be the government school cleaners, followed by the hospitality and then commercial office space cleaning sectors.

The ‘risk experience’ difference between the sectors cannot be attributed only to vacuum cleaner characteristics, but also, the environment and length of shift worked by the cleaning staff. Further research is required to determine the difference in risk exposure between the two types of vacuum cleaner (back pack and canister).

Table of Contents

	Page
Certification	i
Dedication	ii
Acknowledgments	iii
Abstract	iv
Table of Contents	v
List of Tables	ix
List of Figures	xi

Chapter 1: The Problem

1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Statement of the Problem	3
1.3	Significance of the Study	4
1.4	Hypotheses	4
1.5	Limitations and Delimitations	5
	1.5.1 Limitations	5
	1.5.2 Delimitations	6

Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1	Introduction	7
2.2	Work-Related Upper Limb Musculoskeletal Disorders	7
	2.2.1 Definition	7
	2.2.2 Prevalence of Work-Related Musculoskeletal Disorders	8

	Page
2.3 Risk Factors for Work-Related Upper Limb Musculoskeletal Disorders	9
2.3.1 Physical Risk Factors	9
2.3.2 Psychosocial Risk Factors	10
2.3.3 Individual Risk Factors	12
2.4 Cleaning Industry and Cleaning Sectors	18
2.5 Vacuum Cleaning Tasks and Musculoskeletal Risk.....	22
2.5.1 Types of Vacuum Cleaners	22
2.5.2 Vacuum Cleaning and Injury Risk.....	25
2.6 Observational Ergonomic Risk Assessment Tools.....	28
2.6.1 Manual Tasks Risk Assessment Tool (ManTRA version 2).....	30
2.6.2 Quick Exposure Check (QEC)	31
2.6.3 Rapid Upper Limb Assessment (RULA)	33
2.7 Legislative Background.....	34
2.8 Summary.....	37

Chapter 3: Methods

3.1 Subjects.....	39
3.2 Vacuuming Task.....	42
3.3 Data Collection	43
3.4 Risk Assessment Tools	45
3.4.1 Manual Tasks Risk Assessment Tool (ManTRA Version 2).....	46
3.4.2 Quick Exposure Check (QEC)	46
3.4.3 Rapid Upper Limb Assessment (RULA)	47

	Page
3.5 Data Analysis.....	47
3.5.1 Reliability Testing.....	47
3.5.2 Data Management	48
3.5.3 Statistical Analysis	49

Chapter 4: Results and Discussion

4.1 Introduction	51
4.2 Vacuum Cleaning Tasks and Upper Limb Musculoskeletal Risk	51
4.2.1 Manual Tasks Risk Analysis.....	51
4.2.2 Quick Exposure Check.....	53
4.2.3 Rapid Upper Limb Assessment.....	54
4.2.4 Summary of Findings for All Tools	55
4.3 Risk Rating of Vacuuming Tasks between the Three Cleaning Sectors	55
4.3.1 Individual Tools and Three Cleaning Sectors	56
4.3.2 Ranking of Sector Risk	58
4.3.3 Summary	61
4.4 Risk Rating of Vacuuming Tasks: Back Pack and Canister Vacuum Cleaners	62
4.5 Exploring Vacuum Cleaner Type and Sector	65
4.5.1 Case Study 1: Subject 9	66
4.5.2 Case Study 2: Subject 1.....	68
4.5.3 Case Study 3: Subject 3.....	68
4.5.4 Case Study 4: Subject 5.....	72
4.6 Summary of Findings for all Tools and Types of Vacuum Cleaners	72
4.7 Summary of Results and Discussion	75

Chapter 5: Summary and Conclusions

5.1	Summary.....	77
5.1.1	Physical Risk Factors	78
5.1.2	Individual Risk Factors	79
5.1.3	Work Environment.....	79
5.1.4	Equipment	80
5.2	Conclusions	81
5.3	Recommendations for Future Research.....	82

References	83
-------------------------	----

Appendices

A1	ManTRA.....	91
A2	QEC	93
A3	RULA	97

List of Tables

Table	Page
2.1 Summary of risk factors for work-related upper limb musculoskeletal disorders.....	17
2.2 Examples of NSW workers' compensation insurance premium 04/05	20
2.3 Summary of risk factors considered in the Code of Practice for Manual Handling ([2005]:1990), Risk Identification	35
2.4 Summary of risk factors considered in the Code for the Prevention of Occupational Overuse Syndrome, ([2013]:1994), Risk Identification.....	36
2.5 Summary of risk factors considered in the Code for the Prevention of Occupational Overuse Syndrome, ([2013]:1994), Risk Assessment	36
3.1 Distribution of subjects and vacuum cleaner types across the cleaning sectors	40
3.2 Mean and standard deviation in age (years) of the subjects (n = 24) across the three cleaning sectors.....	41
3.3 Typical shift times for subjects across the three cleaning sectors: government schools, hospitality and commercial office	44
3.4 Intra-observer reliability testing of observational musculoskeletal risk assessment tools: ManTRA, QEC and RULA.....	48
4.1 Mean and standard deviation ManTRA scores obtained for each component of the risk assessment tool for all subjects.....	52

Table	Page
4.2 Mean and standard deviation QEC moderate risk scores obtained for each component of the risk assessment tool for all subjects.....	54
4.3 Significant main effects of cleaning sector on the tool risk scores	56
4.4 Significant test items, means and risk scores between the three cleaning sectors	57
4.5 Significant test item differences between the three cleaning sectors	58
4.6 Ranking of the cleaning sectors, according to the significant test items as per Tables 4.4 and 4.5. Three ticks indicates the cleaning sector with the highest risk scores, two ticks indicates the next highest score and one tick indicates the least highest score	62
4.7 Significant test items, means and risk scores between vacuum cleaner types.....	63

List of Figures

Figure	Page
2.1 Interaction between psychosocial load, physical load and individual factors and symptoms and signs of shoulder, arm or wrist injury	11
2.2 Example of an upright vacuum cleaning machine.....	23
2.3 Example of a canister vacuum cleaning machine.....	24
2.4 Examples of a back pack vacuum cleaning machine.....	25
3.1 Distribution of gender across the three cleaning sectors	41
4.1 Box Plot of scores for ManTRA lower limb cumulative risk between back pack and canister vacuum cleaners	64
4.2 Box plot of scores for ManTRA neck cumulative risk between back pack and canister vacuum cleaners.....	65
4.3 Box plot of scores for ManTRA back cumulative risk. Subject 9's (Case Study 1) data is indicated to highlight the worker's higher risk score	67
4.4 Box plot of scores for ManTRA wrist/hand cumulative risk scores Subject 9 (Case Study 1) and Subject 1 (Case Study 2) data are plotted individually to highlight the different risk scores for back pack and canister cleaners respectively	67
4.5 Box plot of ManTRA wrist/hand exertion risk scores. Note the lower scores of Subject 1 (Case Study 2), a government schools cleaner, and Subject 3 (Case Study 3) a hospitality cleaner	69

Figure	Page
4.6 Box plot of QEC back scores. Note the lower score for Subject 3 (Case Study 3)	70
4.7 Box plot of QEC neck scores. Note Subject 3 (Case Study 3).....	70
4.8 Box plot of QEC wrist/hand scores between vacuum cleaners. Note Subject 3 (Case Study 3).....	71
4.9 Box plot of QEC shoulder/arm scores between the vacuum cleaners. Note Subject 3 (Case Study 3), scoring below the mean, and Subject 5 (Case Study 4) scoring above the mean.....	71