

# University of Wollongong - Research Online

## Thesis Collection

Title: Power, control and empowerment in alcohol and other drug treatment

Author: Janette Curtis

Year: 2002

Repository DOI:

### Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.**

Research Online is the open access repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

2002

## Power, control and empowerment in alcohol and other drug treatment

Janette Curtis

*University of Wollongong*, [jcurtis@uow.edu.au](mailto:jcurtis@uow.edu.au)

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

### University of Wollongong

#### Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

---

### Recommended Citation

Curtis, Janette, Power, control and empowerment in alcohol and other drug treatment, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, Department of Nursing, University of Wollongong, 2002. <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/1616>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

## **NOTE**

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

## **UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

### **COPYRIGHT WARNING**

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**POWER, CONTROL AND EMPOWERMENT  
IN ALCOHOL AND OTHER DRUG  
TREATMENT**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the  
requirement for the award of the degree

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

**From**

**UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

**By**

**JANETTE CURTIS, B.A., Dip. PH.**

**Department of Nursing 2002**

## **DECLARATION**

I, Janette Curtis, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Department of Nursing, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Janette Curtis

2002

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This thesis is dedicated to my father, John Curtis, who died on September 12, 2001.

Many people contributed to this thesis in different ways. First, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Lindsey Harrison, for her patience, encouragement, advice and direction. Not only did she guide me on my research journey, she also gave something of herself, and in doing so allowed a friendship to develop. Without her direction I would never have completed this task. I would also like to thank Dr. Patrick Crooks for his initial encouragement to undertake PhD studies and his ongoing support and interest in what was happening. I want to acknowledge and thank the participants in this study who were kind enough to share their experiences and without whom this thesis would never have eventuated. To Debbi Tohill who typed the transcripts, to Magda Heaslip for her technical support, and to my colleagues and friends who supported me through the highs and lows of my journey, thank you. Finally, I want to acknowledge a debt of gratitude to my family who believed that I could achieve my goal and never stopped encouraging me. In particular, I want to acknowledge the support, patience and love of my husband, Bill Millward. Without him I could not have reached my goal.

## ABSTRACT

The concept of empowerment has been used extensively over the last decade in an attempt to improve clinical practice, to minimise power imbalances and to offer better care to consumers. Working collaboratively is seen as a cornerstone of empowerment and it is generally assumed that health professionals strive to achieve this in their clinical practice. This research investigates these issues within the context of alcohol and other drug (AOD) treatment.

The study that is presented in this thesis was carried out in a variety of AOD treatment facilities including an in-patient detoxification unit, an AOD outpatients' clinic, a methadone maintenance clinic, a residential detoxification and rehabilitation unit using a twelve-step treatment model and a residential unit using cognitive behavioural therapy. The non-probability sample consisted of fifty-seven staff and consumers who were interviewed in depth using a semi-structured interview format. Data were analysed using a modified grounded theory approach. The findings, which are summarized below, were further analysed using the 'frames of power' developed by Michel Foucault.

Although clinicians use the rhetoric of empowerment to explain how treatment is implemented, it is a contradictory discourse and it is compliance that they describe, not empowerment. Institutional arrangements assist in ensuring that empowerment does not happen. The major value underpinning practice is not empowerment but control. Clinical practice is concerned with who has control, who wants control and how control is maintained. Clinicians are afraid of losing power and employ discursive practices which serve to maintain their position and reinforce their notion of 'truth'. The real

purpose of treatment accepted by both clinicians and consumers is to make people ‘normal’.

Women in AOD treatment face more difficulties in accessing treatment than do men. The dominant 12-step abstinence philosophy was designed *for men by men*, and the organisational structure of many treatment facilities is geared more towards the needs *of men*.

AOD clinicians feel disempowered by the attitudes of other health professionals; by the attitudes of their own multi-disciplinary team; by the attitudes of clinicians from disciplines other than their own; and by the volatile and political nature of AOD policy and treatment. These are factors in the ways in which they disempower consumers.

By exploring the notion of discourse and discursive practices, the link between power and knowledge assists in explaining why the ‘taken for granted’ practices’ in AOD treatment occur and are perpetuated. The process by which consumers and clinicians are subjugated exposes the dominance of the medico-scientific disciplines and the dominant discourses that operate in AOD treatment. Foucault’s metaphor of the panopticon is important in understanding issues of discipline, surveillance and the subsequent use of the gaze. Self-surveillance, the birth of the clinic and the production of docile bodies allow yet another way of viewing and understanding AOD treatment. Finally, the power of compliance, which is the unspoken goal of AOD treatment, can be clearly identified using a Foucauldian analysis.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION..... I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... II

ABSTRACT..... III

TABLE OF CONTENTS..... V

LIST OF TABLES ..... XI

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION..... 1

INTRODUCTION ..... 1

AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF RESEARCH..... 3

SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY ..... 4

BACKGROUND TO STUDY ..... 4

METHODOLOGY, THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH METHOD ..... 8

1. Power/knowledge relations are not fixed: ..... 11

2. Meaning is not stable: ..... 12

3. The official discourse is not the real [only] discourse: ..... 12

4. Theory is practice: ..... 12

5. Truth is not the goal of science: ..... 13

RESEARCH OVERVIEW ..... 14

STRUCTURE OF THESIS ..... 16

CHAPTER TWO ALCOHOL AND OTHER DRUGS ..... 18

INTRODUCTION ..... 18

ALCOHOL ..... 20

Excessive alcohol use: history and perspectives ..... 23

OPIOIDS ..... 24

Opioid use: history and perspectives ..... 26

TREATMENT MODELS AND PERSPECTIVES .....	27
GRAND THEORIES.....	28
<i>Moral perspective (The user as sinner)</i> .....	28
<i>Disease perspective (The sick person)</i> .....	30
<i>Social perspective (The social victim)</i> .....	33
<i>Criticism of grand theories</i> .....	35
PSYCHOLOGICAL THEORIES.....	36
<i>Behavioural theories of AOD dependence</i> .....	36
<i>Criticism of behavioural theories of AOD use</i> .....	37
<i>Emotional regulation and AOD use</i> .....	37
<i>Criticism of psychoanalytic approaches to AOD use</i> .....	38
SOCIAL CONTEXT OF DRUG USE.....	38
HARM REDUCTION/MINIMISATION APPROACHES .....	40
OPPOSING APPROACHES TO AOD TREATMENT .....	41
CONCLUSION.....	42
<b>CHAPTER THREE POWER AND EMPOWERMENT .....</b>	<b>43</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	43
EMPOWERMENT .....	45
MICHEL FOUCAULT.....	51
<i>Discourse</i> .....	58
<i>Surveillance</i> .....	62
<i>Criticism of Foucault</i> .....	63
AMELIE OKSENBERG RORTY.....	67
THOMAS E. WARTENBERG.....	68
E. R. WOLFE.....	69
ANTHONY GIDDENS .....	69
STEVEN LUKES .....	72
ALVIN TOFFLER .....	75
THEORIES OF POWER APPLIED TO THE HEALTH SETTING.....	78
CONCLUSION.....	80

<b>CHAPTER FOUR METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>82</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	82
ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS AND ENTRY ISSUES .....	85
PREPARATORY INTERVIEWING .....	86
PROCESS OF OBTAINING SAMPLE .....	86
DATA COLLECTION .....	88
<i>In-depth Interviewing</i> .....	88
<i>Advantages of using semi-structured interviews</i> .....	89
<i>Sampling Procedures</i> .....	90
DESCRIPTION OF CLINICIANS AND TREATMENT AGENCIES.....	92
AGENCY ORGANISATION .....	94
<i>Methadone Clinic</i> .....	94
<i>Detoxification Unit</i> .....	94
<i>AOD Outpatient Services</i> .....	95
<i>CBT Rehabilitation Unit</i> .....	95
<i>Twelve-step Rehabilitation Unit</i> .....	96
DESCRIPTION AND DEMOGRAPHIC DATA OF CONSUMERS .....	96
PROCESS OF INTERVIEWING .....	97
DEPENDABILITY AND ADEQUACY OF RESEARCH .....	101
DATA ANALYSIS .....	102
<i>Substantive coding</i> .....	102
<i>Selective coding</i> .....	103
<i>Theoretical coding</i> .....	103
<i>Analytic ordering</i> .....	104
CONCLUSION.....	105
<b>CHAPTER FIVE INSTITUTIONS.....</b>	<b>108</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	108
TREATMENT PHILOSOPHY .....	110
DISCOURSE .....	114
SERVICE PROVISION.....	122

CONCLUSION.....	133
<b>CHAPTER SIX CLINICIANS.....</b>	<b>136</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	136
CHANGE.....	137
<i>Changes in the clinical area.....</i>	<i>138</i>
<i>Strategies used to implement change.....</i>	<i>141</i>
CONTROL .....	144
<i>Out of control .....</i>	<i>144</i>
<i>Learning control.....</i>	<i>146</i>
<i>Responsibility for control .....</i>	<i>147</i>
<i>Maintaining control.....</i>	<i>150</i>
EMPOWERMENT .....	152
<i>Having choices .....</i>	<i>153</i>
<i>Finding a balance.....</i>	<i>155</i>
<i>Whose responsibility?.....</i>	<i>156</i>
<i>Needing to be empowered before you can empower others .....</i>	<i>157</i>
<i>Needing to be shown.....</i>	<i>158</i>
EMPOWERING OTHERS .....	159
<i>Who can empower consumers? .....</i>	<i>160</i>
<i>Characteristics, knowledge and skills to empower others.....</i>	<i>163</i>
BEING DISEMPOWERED .....	164
<i>Hierarchical disempowerment .....</i>	<i>165</i>
<i>Colleagues.....</i>	<i>166</i>
<i>Nurses.....</i>	<i>167</i>
<i>AOD counsellors .....</i>	<i>169</i>
<i>Fitting in.....</i>	<i>170</i>
<i>Other health services.....</i>	<i>171</i>
<i>Effects of disempowerment .....</i>	<i>171</i>
<i>Disempowering consumers.....</i>	<i>173</i>
WORKING AGAINST EMPOWERMENT .....	175

<i>Resistance to empowerment</i> .....	176
<i>Not everyone wants empowerment</i> .....	178
<i>Sabotage of empowerment</i> .....	180
CONCLUSION .....	184
<b>CHAPTER SEVEN CONSUMERS</b> .....	<b>188</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	188
CONTROL .....	190
<i>Wanting to be normal</i> .....	190
<i>Women and control</i> .....	194
CHANGE .....	196
<i>Decision making</i> .....	197
<i>Taking the plunge</i> .....	199
<i>Responsibility for change</i> .....	200
<i>Strategies to maintain change</i> .....	202
BEING EMPOWERED .....	203
<i>Meaning of empowerment</i> .....	204
<i>Feeling empowered</i> .....	205
BEING DISEMPOWERED .....	206
<i>Women's experience of disempowerment</i> .....	210
EMPOWERING OTHERS .....	211
WHAT STOPS EMPOWERMENT? .....	214
<i>Empowered by the drug</i> .....	214
<i>Women and dissonance</i> .....	215
<i>Tension between power and empowerment</i> .....	216
CONCLUSION .....	217
<b>CHAPTER EIGHT DISCUSSION</b> .....	<b>221</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	221
THE RHETORIC OF EMPOWERMENT IS USED TO CONVEY THE 'TRUTH' .....	223
EMPOWERMENT DOES NOT HAPPEN .....	228

MAJOR VALUE ACTUALLY UNDERPINNING PRACTICE IS NOT EMPOWERMENT, BUT CONTROL .....230

THE PURPOSE OF TREATMENT IS TO MAKE PEOPLE NORMAL.....232

WOMEN ARE PARTICULARLY DISADVANTAGED .....237

IT IS NOT EASY BEING AN AOD CLINICIAN.....246

USEFULNESS OF A FOUCAULDIAN ANALYSIS.....252

THE FUNDAMENTAL QUESTION: IS EMPOWERMENT POSSIBLE? .....255

CONCLUSION.....259

**CHAPTER NINE CONCLUSION .....261**

INTRODUCTION .....261

THEORETICAL INSIGHTS .....262

IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE.....263

IMPLICATIONS FOR SERVICE PROVISION .....266

LIMITATIONS OF RESEARCH .....268

SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH.....270

**REFERENCES.....272**

**APPENDIX 1 .....309**

**APPENDIX 11.....310**

**APPENDIX 111 311**

**APPENDIX 1V.....312**

**APPENDIX V .....319**

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 4.1 .....Place of employment and number of clinicians interviewed

Table 4.2 ..... Clinicians

Table 4.3 ..... Consumers