

1993

From a personal theory to a grounded theory of staff development

Jan Turbill

University of Wollongong, jturbill@uow.edu.au

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Turbill, Jan, From a personal theory to a grounded theory of staff development, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 1993. <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/1779>

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**FROM A PERSONAL THEORY TO A GROUNDED THEORY
OF STAFF DEVELOPMENT**

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of
the requirements for the award of the degree**

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

**JANICE BETINA TURBILL
MEd (Sydney), BA (Macquarie)**



**FACULTY OF EDUCATION
1993**

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

As with most studies of this magnitude there are many people who help to make it all possible. In this study these people span two continents. First in the United States of America, the administrators, teachers and children in the school district of Marcus Whitman, in upper New York accepted me as a friend and a colleague as well as a researcher. Their support and willingness to give so much of themselves I will always value highly. It is my hope that my work with them and the outcomes of this study have supported and will continue to support them as they work towards their vision for effective literacy education. In particular, I want to thank Jackie Metz, Gail Langton and Jack McCabe for their faith in a dream and their continued support in realising that dream.

Back on my side of the Pacific, I received a great deal of support from colleagues and fellow students; Bridgit Barton, Phil Fitzsimmons, Lois Leitch, Kylie Pickford and Rosalie Nott. Thanks guys.

I also wish to acknowledge the support of the Women's Academic Committee, within the University of Wollongong. The financial support gained through the Women's Academic Scholarships enabled me to have some valuable time for the final writing of the thesis.

To my friends Andrea Butler and Brian Cambourne, I say 'thanks'. Andrea's faith in my ability 'to just do it' and Brian's thoughtful, sensitive and expert guidance as my supervisor, saw me through the many hours of confusion, insecurity and growth in my own learning.

Final thanks must be given to my family who have always supported me in all that I have done, but particularly in this endeavour over the last few years.

ABSTRACT

This study set out to develop a grounded theory of staff development for teachers. The aims of the study were:

- to evaluate the impact that a staff development program, called *Frameworks*, had on teachers beliefs and practices in literacy education
- to evaluate a personally developed staff development theory which underpinned the design and delivery of that program
- as a consequence of the above, to develop a staff development theory which had been formally grounded in the real world of classrooms and schools.

The study employed a naturalistic mode of inquiry, and in particular was framed by the parameters of a responsive constructivist evaluation paradigm. The methods of naturalistic inquiry were employed. In particular there was a strong emphasis on a hermeneutic/dialectic process which takes full advantage, and account, of the observer/observed interaction in order to create a constructed reality that is as informed and sophisticated as it can be made at a particular point in time.

The study comprised four case studies of four class teachers which analyse and describe their experiences as a result of their participation in the eight week program. These four case studies were further analysed into a construction of *Frameworks* as it was run in the Gorham Middlesex School District (more commonly known as Marcus Whitman Central School District).

A theory of staff development grounded in the data emerged which has been depicted in schematic form and described in detail. Recommendations for the future of staff development, based on the principles emerging from this theory are made. Finally it is argued that effective staff development in the future is contingent upon the adoption of a new paradigm of teacher learning, namely, one that views learning cultures of teachers as social semiotic systems.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....ii

ABSTRACTiii

LIST OF FIGURES.....xvi

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 1

 The Purpose and Aims of the Study 1

 Rationale for the Study 2

 Background to the study 6

 Current Socio-political Context of Literacy Education..... 6

 What is Literacy?..... 6

 A New Paradigm in Literacy Education..... 8

 The Challenge of Staff Development 9

 A Personal Theory of Staff Development and Teachers’ Learning..... 9

 Background Information 9

 My Role in Schools as a Staff Developer..... 11

 Phase One

 Practice 12

 Phase Two

 Theory into Practice 12

 Phase Three

 Theory’s Impact on Teachers’ Beliefs and Practice 13

 Phase Four - An Interactive Model 15

 Phase Five

 The Role of Language in Teacher Learning Facilitating Staff Development 17

 What did all this mean for staff development?..... 25

 Locus of the Study..... 38

 The Site..... 38

 The Participants 38

 The Case Study Teachers 39

 The Evaluand - FRAMEWORKS 39

 What is Frameworks? 39

 Aims of Frameworks 40

Roles and Responsibility of the Facilitator42

Roles and Responsibilities of the Participants42

Broad Themes Running Through Frameworks43

Conclusion43

CHAPTER 2: A FUTURE AGENDA FOR STAFF DEVELOPMENT- A

LITERATURE REVIEW	45
Introduction	45
Some Definitions	49
An Overview of Effective Staff Development	52
The Authoritarian Model.....	53
The Support or Training Model.....	56
The Individual to Co-operative Model	60
The Collaborative Model.....	64
A Future Agenda for Staff Development	67
The Problem: Why Has Staff Development Worked?	72
An Alternate View to the Problem	72
Towards a Paradigm Shift in Staff Development.....	79
School Cultures as Semiotic Systems	87
Changing the Roles and Organisers	87
The Need for an Explicit Learning Theory	90
Role of Language	96
Summary: A Future Agenda for Staff Development.....	98

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

Introduction	101
Methodological Orientation for the Study	104
The Constructivist Methodology in Action.....	106
Natural Setting.....	108
The Human as Instrument	109
Qualitative Methods	112
Observations	112
Interviews	114
Surveys	118
Documents	118
Tacit Knowledge	119
The Hermeneutic Dialectic Process in Action: Data Analysis	120
Activating the Hermeneutic Dialectic Process	123
Coding the Data Using the Constant Comparative Method	126
Step 1	128
Step 2	129
Step 3	130
Step 4	131
Description of Themes and Categories	133

Pre-existing Beliefs and Practices	134
Making Connections.....	134
The Process of Change	135
The Final Construction - Case Report	137
The Physical Setting	138
Professional Background of the Facilitator	138
Beliefs and Understandings about Staff Development and Teacher Learning.....	138
Facilitator Concerns During the Program	138
Frameworks in Action	138
Criteria for Judging the Adequacy of ‘Fourth Generation Evaluation’	141
Fairness.....	142
Ontological Authenticity	143
Educative Authenticity	143
Catalytic Authenticity.....	143
Tactical Authenticity	144
A Final Comment	
The Issue Of Subjectivity	144
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS OF THE STUDY	146
Introduction	146
Part One:	
The Learning Culture of Frameworks at Marcus Whitman Central School District	147
The Socio-Political Context	147
The District.....	147
The District's Involvement in Frameworks	149
The Superintendent's Perspective	149
The Principals' Perspective.....	152
The Context Established by The Facilitator	154
The Physical Setting	154
Professional Background of the Facilitator	155
Beliefs and Understandings about Staff Development and Teacher Learning.....	156
Facilitator Concerns During the Program	158
Frameworks in Action	160
Making Explicit.....	161
Making Explicit the Purposes of Activities.....	162
The Power of Demonstrations	162

Expectations	164
Feedback	164
Responsibility for Learning	166
Adding Information	166
Role of Language	167
Creating a Community of Learners	167
Summary	168
Part Two: The Four Case Study Reports	170
Case Study 1 - Lonnie Gunzalus, Gorham Elementary School	170
Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices	170
Making Connections - New Knowledge	171
Nature of Learning	171
Nature of Teaching	172
Nature of Language	173
Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice	173
Physical and Social Environment	173
Strategies	174
Evaluation	175
Planning	175
Resources	175
Time	176
Language Used	176
Process of Change - Intellectual Unrest:	
A Precursor To Change	176
New Knowledge	177
Implementing New Practice	178
Teaching	178
Time	178
Evaluation	178
Process of Change	
Enablers in the Process	179
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	179
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content	179
Readings	179
Activities	180
Input	181
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	181

Group work.....	181
Support	182
Setting.....	182
Time and Timing	182
Implementation of New Practices	183
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Students.....	183
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Teaching.....	184
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Process	185
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Support.....	185
Process of Change	
Inhibitors of the Process	186
Learning of 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content.....	187
Readings	187
Activities	187
Input.....	187
Learning of 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	188
Time and Timing	188
Support	188
Groups	188
Implementation of 'New' Practice	189
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Teaching.....	189
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Process	190
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Support.....	190
Attitude to the Change Process	190
Insights into the Change Process.....	191
Case Study 2 - Denny Clark, Rushville Elementary School	193
Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices.....	193
Beliefs and Knowledge	193
Practices.....	194

Making Connections - New Knowledge	194
Nature of Learning	194
Nature of Language	196
Nature of Teaching	197
Role of Language in Learning	198
Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice	200
Physical and Social Environment	200
Strategies	201
Planning	202
Process of Change Intellectual Unrest, a Precursor to Change	202
Process of Change: Enablers in the Process	203
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content	203
Input	203
Readings	203
Activities	204
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	204
Group Work	204
Language	205
Support	206
Setting	207
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Students	208
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Teaching	208
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Process	208
Implementing 'New' Practices	
Focus on Support	209
Process of Change: Inhibitors in the Process	209
The Learning of 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content	209
Readings	209
Input	210
Activities	210
The Learning of 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	210
Time	210

Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Teaching.....	210
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Process	211
Attitude to the Change Process	211
Insights into the Change Process.....	212
Case Study 3 - Ginny Gridley, Gorham Elementary School.....	215
Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices.....	215
Beliefs and Knowledge	215
Practices.....	216
Making Connections - New Knowledge	217
Nature of Learning	217
Nature of Language	218
Nature of Teaching	219
Nature of Evaluation	220
Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice	221
Strategies	221
Integration	222
Physical and Social Environment.....	222
Process of Change: Intellectual Unrest, a Precursor to Change	222
Process of Change: Enablers in the process	224
Understanding New Knowledge	
Focus on Content.....	224
Input.....	224
Readings	225
Activities	225
Understanding New Knowledge	
Focus on Process	226
Time.....	226
Group Work.....	226
Support	227
Implementing New Practices	
Focus on Teaching.....	227
Implementing New Practices	
Focus on Students.....	228
Implementing New Practices	
Focus on Process	228
Implementing New Practices	

Focus on Support	229
Process of Change: Inhibitors of Process	229
Learning 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content	229
Input	229
Activities	230
Readings	230
Learning 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	230
Time	230
Activities	231
Support	231
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Teaching	231
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Students	232
Implementation of 'New' Practice	
Focus on Process	233
Time	233
Group Activities	233
Attitude to the Change Process	233
Insights into the Change Process	234
Case Study 4 - Gail Burr, Rushville Elementary School	236
Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices	236
Beliefs and Knowledge	236
Practices	237
Making Connections - New Knowledge	238
Nature of Learning	238
Nature of Language	240
Nature of Teaching	242
Nature of Evaluation	244
Role of Language in Learning	245
Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice	245
Strategies	245
Role of Language in Learning	247
Physical and Social Environment	248
Evaluation	248
Process Of Change: Intellectual Unrest, A Precursor To Change	248

Process Of Change: Enablers in the Process	251
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Content	251
Input	251
Activities	251
Readings	252
Understanding 'New' Knowledge	
Focus on Process	252
Group Work	253
Support	253
Timing	254
Focus on Language	255
Implementing 'New' Practice	
Focus on Students	256
Implementing 'New' Practice	
Focus on Process	257
Implementing 'New' Practice	
Focus on Support/Personnel	257
Process of Change: Inhibitors of the Learning of New	
Knowledge and Its Implementation	258
Focus on Content	258
Readings	258
Activities	258
Input	259
Focus on Process	260
Focus on External Pressures	260
Attitude to the Change Process	261
Insights into the Change Process	262
 Part Three - The Impact of a Staff Development Program Called	
Frameworks on Teachers' Beliefs and Practices in Literacy Education	264
Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices	265
Making Connections - New Knowledge, Covert Teacher Change	268
Nature of Learning	269
Insights into Their Own Learning (Personal	
Theory)	269
Natural Learning Theory (Theory of Others)	271
Nature of Language	273
Nature of Teaching	276

The Nature of Evaluation	278
The Role of Language in Learning.....	280
Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice, Overt	
Teacher Change	281
Strategies	282
Physical and Social Environment.....	283
Planning.....	285
Concluding Comments for Part Three.....	285
Part Four - The Nature of Change - How The Theory of Staff	
Development Works.....	290
An Overview of How the Staff Development Theory Worked:	
Towards a Grounded Theory.....	291
Intellectual Unrest - the Precursor of the Change Process	294
Enablers and Inhibitors in the Change Process	299
Enablers in the Change Process - Structures	300
Enablers in the Change Process - Processes.....	307
Enablers in the Change Process - Role of	
Language	310
Enablers in the Change Process - Contexts and	
People	312
Inhibitors in the Change Process - Structures	316
Inhibitors in the Change Process - Processes	318
Inhibitors in the Change Process - Role of	
Language	319
Inhibitors in the Change Process - People and	
Contexts.....	320
Attitude to the Change Process	322
Insights into the Change Process.....	326
Concluding Remarks	328
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS.....	330
Towards a Grounded Theory in Staff Development	331
A Theory of Teacher Learning	334
REFERENCES	352
APPENDIX A	362
APPENDIX B.....	385
APPENDIX C	398

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Overview of SLIC Process (SLIC Manual, 1989, 6)	29
Figure 2: Models of Professional Development (Barton, 1992)	53
Figure 3: A Model of the Process of Teacher Change (Guskey, 1986,7)	58
Figure 4: A Comprehensive Framework for Classroom and School Improvement	80
Figure 5: A Model of Cambourne's Theory of Learning (Turbill, 1993).....	92
Figure 6: Doctoral Study in Relation to Frameworks Pilot Evaluation	103
Figure 7: Interconnectedness between the Paradigm of the Staff Development Model and the Research Methodology	106
Figure 8: Diagrammatic View of the Methodology of Constructivist Inquiry	107
Figure 9: My Construction of Each Teacher's Interviews	122
Figure 10: Process of Construction of each Case Report	122
Figure 11: Final Case Report.....	123
Figure 13: The Pattern of Themes and Categories Which Emerged from the Analysis of the Case Study Teachers' Data.....	133
Figure 14: The Final Case Report Categories.	140
Figure 15: The Physical Layout of the Room	155
Figure 16: An Interactive, Integrative View of Staff Development	289
.....	332
Figure 17: A Model for Developing Personally Empowered Professionals	335