2010

Developing managerial thinking through "reflection-on-experience" using an online discussion forum and a reflective journal in a health services management subject

David John Ritchie
University of Wollongong

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG
COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced, or any process or exercise be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Recommended Citation


Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
Developing Managerial Thinking through “Reflection-on-Experience” Using an Online Discussion Forum and a Reflective Journal in a Health Services Management Subject

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

from

University of Wollongong

by

David John Ritchie
B.Sc. (Cant), D.H.A. (Massey), M.H.A (UNSW)

Faculty of Education

May 2010
I, David Ritchie, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

David Ritchie
May 2010
Abstract

Clinicians and managers often think differently about how health care should be organised, what constitutes best practice and how resources should be allocated (Degeling, Maxwell, Kennedy & Coyle 2003; Greater Metropolitan Clinical Taskforce 2004; Lawson & Rotem 2004). Despite management education using a variety of approaches to develop managerial thinking, there are concerns about management development and education in Australia (Karpin, 1995; Holian, 2004). In this study the development of managerial thinking using a “reflection-on-experience” approach was explored as a method that could address differences between how clinicians and managers think about the organisation of work and the use of resources.

The purpose of this study was to investigate whether clinicians in a postgraduate health services management subject developed managerial thinking through a reflection-on-experience approach supported by an online discussion forum and reflective journal. This purpose was addressed by two research questions: 1. To what extent did clinicians develop managerial thinking and how did the online discussion forum influence this development? 2. What was the nature of reflection that helped clinicians to develop their ways of thinking using an online discussion forum and reflective journal?

The study was implemented within a subject entitled, HSM401 Perspectives on Health Care Systems. This subject was developed over several years to promote the reflection-on-experience approach. A single offering of this subject was the basis for this case study research. The data to address the first research question drew on changes in 12 participants’ definitions of management concepts at the commencement and conclusion of the academic session and their engagement with the online discussion forum. Three major conversations in the online discussion forum were examined for evidence of managerial thinking. The data to address the second research question were based on analysis of three in-depth case studies focussing on nominated examples of reflection selected by each learner. The analytical framework used to analyse reflection was developed by Kember et al. (1999) which focused on three levels of reflective writing - content, process and premise reflection. Content reflection described the problem; process reflection considered the strategies to resolve the problem; while premise reflection reviewed the problem and could lead to a change in perspective.
Analysis of the data to address the first research question revealed that the majority of participants who consented to the study (12/19) demonstrated a more comprehensive understanding of a health services manager’s role. Learners identified issues with managerial implications and engaged in sustained conversation about these in the online discussion forum. The discussions increased the students’ depth of analysis of issues but their influence on the development of managerial thinking varied according to the level of participant interaction and relevance to their work context and experience. The relationship between use of the online discussion forum and reflective journal was examined in greater detail through the case studies.

In the second research question, analysis of three case studies found that the learners did not always progress stepwise through each level of reflection. A recursive process of reflection was observed with each learner revising at least one of the problems of their nominated examples of reflection. Revision resulted in vacillation between content and process reflection until problem clarity was achieved. This revision process varied from the linear reflective frameworks commonly identified in the literature (Boud & Walker 1993; Korthagen, 1985; Loughran, 1996; Moon, 1999, 2006). Progression through the levels of reflection depended largely upon the quality of the content reflection. The online discussion forum and reflective journal were often used in a complementary fashion to develop reflective thinking.

This study found that the online discussion forum and reflective journal supported the use of reflection-on-experience as an integral part of the development of managerial thinking. Implications arising from the findings include the benefit of designing learning resources and activities to increase learner recognition of different perspectives that arise from sharing experiences and contexts. The activity of writing key concept definitions and expectations to make explicit tacit understandings helped learners to experience thinking that was conducive to reflection and two of the three case studies make specific reference to that. That activity also raised the potential for learners to recognise the authority of that experience (Munby & Russell, 1994). Further research could investigate the use of richer descriptions to represent understandings such as vignettes and scenarios. It is recommended that online subjects should encourage learners to reflect on their workplace experiences scaffolded with appropriate resources.

Keywords: reflection, managerial thinking, asynchronous online discussion forum
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1: Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1  
  Background to the Study ........................................................................................................ 1  
  Statement of the Problem ........................................................................................................ 5  
  Purpose of the Study and Research Question ......................................................................... 6  
  Significance of the Study ......................................................................................................... 6  
  Outline of the Thesis ................................................................................................................ 7  
  Researcher’s Biography ........................................................................................................... 8  

Chapter 2: Literature Review .................................................................................................. 10  
  Section 1 Managerial Thinking ............................................................................................... 10  
    Complexity of Management in Health Care Organisations .................................................. 10  
    Different Perceptions of Clinicians and Managers ............................................................... 14  
    Differences between Clinical and Managerial Thinking ..................................................... 18  
  Developing Managerial Thinking ............................................................................................ 23  
    Approaches to developing managerial thinking ................................................................... 26  
      Traditional management lectures ...................................................................................... 27  
      Action research/action learning ......................................................................................... 28  
      The five mindsets of managing .......................................................................................... 31  
      Scenario planning .............................................................................................................. 33  
      Problem-based learning ..................................................................................................... 33  
      Case method ....................................................................................................................... 33  
      Soft systems methodology .................................................................................................. 34  
    A need to extend approaches to management development ................................................ 36  
  Summary of Managerial Thinking Section ............................................................................. 37  

Section 2 Reflection ................................................................................................................... 40  
  Processes of Reflection ......................................................................................................... 42  
    The intent of reflection ........................................................................................................ 49  
  Levels of Reflection ............................................................................................................... 50  
  Evidencing Reflection ............................................................................................................ 51  
  Summary of Reflection Section ............................................................................................... 53  

Section 3 Distance Education and the Use of Technology ...................................................... 54  
  The opportunities of distance education .............................................................................. 55  
  Extending distance education interactivity online ................................................................. 56  
  Incorporating the Use of Computer Mediated Communication ........................................... 59  
  Analysing asynchronous interaction ...................................................................................... 62  
  Summary of Distance Education and the Use of Technology Section .................................... 65  
  Summary of Literature Review ............................................................................................... 66  

Chapter 3: Design of the Learning Environment .................................................................... 70  
  The original Australian Health Care Systems subject ............................................................. 70  
  Reviewing the pedagogical framework ................................................................................... 74  
    The role of experience ......................................................................................................... 75  
  Designing the new Perspectives on Health Care Systems ..................................................... 77  
    Redesigning the content .................................................................................................... 79  
    Redesigning the learning activities ..................................................................................... 81  
    Redesigning the learner supports ....................................................................................... 87  
  Summary ................................................................................................................................. 90  

Chapter 4: Methodology ......................................................................................................... 92  
  Research Design .................................................................................................................... 93  
  Participants ............................................................................................................................. 95
Selection.................................................................96
The Process of Selecting Cases......................................97
Data Collection Methods..............................................100
Data Collection for Research Question 1..........................100
Data Collection for Research Question 2..........................101
Data Source - Forum postings........................................101
Data Source - Reflective Journal.....................................102
Data Source - Interview/Survey.......................................102
Methods of Analysis...................................................104
Data Analysis for Research Question 1............................104
Coding elements of managerial thinking..........................106
Data Analysis for Research Question 2............................107
Coding reflection.......................................................107
Textual Analysis.......................................................110
Trustworthiness of interpretations..................................111
Ethics........................................................................117
Limitations of the Study...............................................118
Summary...................................................................120
Chapter 5: Developing Managerial Thinking......................122
Research Question One...............................................122
Changes to the definition of health services management........123
Use of the online discussion forum to develop managerial thinking...126
Thread Analysis: Who makes the decisions?.........................134
Thread Analysis: Benchmarking/Performance indicators..........137
Thread Analysis: Workforce........................................142
Summary...................................................................151
Chapter 6: The Case of Katie.........................................154
Overview..................................................................154
The case of Katie......................................................155
Katie’s initial approach to reflection.................................156
Katie’s use of reflection..............................................159
Issue 1. Katie’s reflection on her political views..................161
Issue 2. Katie’s reflection on private versus public health systems...174
Issue 3. Katie’s reflection on Benchmarking.......................180
Issue 4. Katie’s reflection on clinician and manager differences...187
Katie’s review of her approach to reflection.........................194
The nature of Katie’s reflection....................................196
Content reflection.....................................................197
Process reflection......................................................199
Premise reflection.....................................................202
Affordances of the online discussion forum.........................203
Chapter 7: The Case of Ella..........................................205
Overview..................................................................205
The case of Ella......................................................206
Ella’s initial approach to reflection.................................209
Ella’s use of reflection..............................................210
Issue 1. Ella’s reflection on Benchmarking.........................211
Issue 2. Ella’s reflection on clinician and manager differences...218
Issue 3. Ella’s reflection on resourcing..............................230
Ella’s review of her approach to reflection.........................239
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Degeling at al. (2003). Differences between clinical and managerial conceptions of work and accountability……………………………………16
Figure 2.2 Pesut & Herman’s 1999 OPT Model of Clinical Reasoning……………….. 19
Figure 2.3 Comparisons between different decision making processes…………… 21
Figure 2.4 Talbot’s (1997) definition and depiction of the relationships between management development, education, training and experience…….. 25
Figure 2.5 Comparison of different models or processes of reflection………………43
Figure 3.1 The learning resources, tasks and support (1996).……………….. 73
Figure 3.2 The learning resources, tasks and support (2000)……………………86
Figure 4.1 The Case Study Design…………………………………………………….94
Figure 4.2 The process of selecting cases……………………………………………... 98
Figure 4.3 Coding scheme for reflective thinking in a managerial context adapted from Kember et al.’s 1999 method…………………………………………….109
Figure 4.4 Trustworthiness of interpretations………………………………………….. 112
Figure 5.1 Thread Map – Who makes the decision……………………………………131
Figure 5.2 Thread Map – Who makes the decision + Doctor know best + Knowledge of patients/clients Part 1……………………………………………...………… 132
Figure 5.3 Thread Map – Who makes the decision + Doctor know best + Knowledge of patients/clients Part 2………………………………………………..………… 133
Figure 5.4 Benchmarking/Performance indicators thread map…………………… 138
Figure 5.5 Workforce thread map……………………………………………………. 143
Figure 6.1 Chronological representation of Katie’s reflective process on the issue of her political views………………………………………………………….………………….. 172
Figure 6.2 Chronological representation of Katie’s reflective process on the issue of the differences between private and public health care……………….………..…… 179
Figure 6.3 Chronological representation of Katie’s reflective process on the issue of benchmarking…………………………………………………………..………………….. 186
Figure 6.4 Chronological representation of Katie’s reflective process on the issue of the differences between clinicians and managers……………………….………………….. 193
Figure 7.1 Chronological representation of Ella’s reflective process on the issue of benchmarking…………………………………………………………..………………….. 217
Figure 7.2 Chronological representation of Ella’s reflective process on the issue of differences between clinicians and managers……………………………..………………….. 229
Figure 7.3 Chronological representation of Ella’s reflective process on the issue of resourcing…………………………………………………………..………………….. 238
Figure 8.1 Chronological representation of Lynne’s reflective process on the issue of Payers for Health Service……………………………………………….………………….. 269
Figure 8.2 Chronological representation of Lynne’s reflective process on the issue of Public versus Private health care……………………………..………………….. 275
Figure 8.3 Chronological representation of Lynne’s reflective process on the issue of clinician/manager differences…………………………………….………………….. 285
Figure 9.1 The pattern of reflection for the clinician/manager reflection………………… 310
Figure 9.2 The pattern of reflection for the benchmarking reflection………………… 310
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Comparison of approaches to the development of managerial thinking........... 38
Table 3.1 HSM401 Forum Statistics................................................................. 89
Table 4.1 Data collection for Research Question 1.............................................. 101
Table 4.2 Data collection for Research Question 2............................................. 101
Table 5.1 Major managerial thread activity analysis................................. 128
Table 5.2 Major Non-managerial thread activity analysis.............................. 129
Table 6.1 Summary of Katie’s reflective entries............................................. 197
Table 7.1 Ella’s entries on her clinician and manager deliberations............... 220
Table 7.2 Ella’s entries on her resourcing theme deliberations..................... 230
Table 7.3 Summary of Ella’s reflective entries............................................... 241
Table 8.1 Journal entry statistics................................................................. 251
Table 8.2 Forum activity statistics of high posters..................................... 252
Table 8.3 Major subject headings in Lynne’s Journal................................. 256
Table 8.4 Summary of Lynne’s reflective entries........................................ 287
Table 8.5 Chronology of Lynne’s journal and forum entries by issue and word count.. 294
Table 9.1 Comparison of approaches to the development of managerial thinking..... 304
Table A11.1 Thread Length Counts per Month............................................ 374
Table A11.2 Message Counts by Thread Length per Month............................ 374
Table A11.3 Activity Statistics of Forum High Posters.................................. 375
Table A11.4 Activity Statistics of Forum Low Posters.................................. 376
Table A11.5 Total Forum Activity Statistics............................................... 376
Table A11.6 Journal entry statistics............................................................ 378