Making links between theory and practice: an investigation into pre-service teacher learning experiences with an online simulation

Lisa A. Carrington
University of Wollongong, lcarring@uow.edu.au

Recommended Citation
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Making links between theory and practice: An investigation into pre-service teacher learning experiences with an online simulation.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

From the

University of Wollongong

by

Lisa A. Carrington
Bachelor of Education (Hons)

Faculty of Education
2009
I, Lisa A. Carrington, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at this or any other academic institution.

Signed:

___________________
Lisa A. Carrington
November, 2009
Acknowledgements

Foremost, I express my sincere gratitude to my advisors Prof. Brian Ferry and Dr Lisa Kervin for their continuous support of my PhD research. I could not have imagined having better advisors and mentors for my PhD. Prof. Brian Ferry - Your expertise, kindness, patience, and most of all your enthusiasm for my personal and professional growth has helped shape me into the woman you now know. Thanks for making molehills out of my mountains. Dr Lisa Kervin - Thank you for your continued guidance, support and encouragement. Your immense knowledge, attention to detail, and generosity has made this journey a reality. Sometimes the simple words say it best... Thank you from the bottom of my heart.

My sincere thanks to the participants of this inquiry. I am very grateful for your contributions to this project. Without you, this study would not exist.

To my fellow research community at the University of Wollongong: Gail Hood, Kylie Roodenrys, Jessica Mantei, Dr. Raelene Anderson, Lisa Kosta, Phill Dawson, Natalie Cooper, Assoc. Prof. Lori Lockyer and Assoc. Prof. Sue Bennett. Thank you for the stimulating discussions, emotional support and all the fun we have had in the last three and a half years. You have changed my life in ways I never thought possible.

To my family - the most important people in my life. Without you none of this could have been possible. Not only did you raise me to believe in myself, but you also gave me the tools to do so. Mum - You are my strength and my idol. I can only hope to become half the woman you are. Dad - You and I are different, but in many ways the same. Thank you for our constant challenges. It has helped make me the person I am today. Kim and Daniel - my best friends. Growing up with you both is something I wouldn’t trade for the world. We only had each other, but that was all we needed. Just knowing you both has made my life better.

Michael Long - thank you for your support and encouragement. You are my world.
Abstract

Current research in teacher education identifies a gap between what teachers are taught during their pre-service teacher education and what they are expected to do at the ‘chalk-face’ in their professional career (Cole & Knowles, 2000; Ramsey, 2000; Sorin, 2004). In response to the perception that theory is often irrelevant to practice, various studies assert that there is a need to integrate the various components of pre-service teacher education (for relevant studies see Brady, Seagal, Bamford & Deer, 1998; Lanier & Little, 1986). An integrated approach is advocated to enable pre-service teachers to gain a better understanding of the theory/practice nexus (Educational Training Committee, 2005; MACQT, 1998). In response to such studies, teacher educators are motivated to investigate strategies that might more effectively and relevantly bridge the gap between theory and practice.

One approach has been to use simulations as a tool to experiment with practical scenarios while providing explicit links to the theory of pre-service teacher training. Simulations have the potential to enhance a learning experience by providing authentic and relevant scenarios in which learners apply their newly-acquired knowledge by experimenting and making decisions within a safe, virtual environment in which mistakes have no consequences, such as they have in the real world (Carrington, Ferry & Kervin, 2006; Aldrich, 2004; Jonassen, 2000). Limited research has been conducted on the use of simulations in pre-service teacher education and how engagement with simulations can support the learning of pre-service teachers.

The purpose of this inquiry was to investigate how pre-service teachers make use of a virtual learning environment provided by an online simulation - ClassSim - to link knowledge from university coursework with field experiences, in particular, whether and how experience with an online simulation contributed to the development of pre-service teachers’ emerging professional identity. A comparative case analysis was adopted, as this design was considered most appropriate as it allowed for an in-depth comparison of two cohorts of pre-service teachers. Andragogy (Knowles, 1970, 1980,
1984; Knowles, Holton & Swanson, 1998) provide a theoretical framework through which the learning of pre-service teachers was examined and assumptions about their learning drawn.

The findings indicate that virtual learning environments, such as *ClassSim*, provide significant potential for teacher education as theory is integrated with virtual practice. It was found that in order to facilitate an adults’ learning within a virtual learning environment, educators must embrace the opportunities afforded by the technology. Virtual learning environments provide flexibility as learners engage with the learning environment anytime, anywhere, and at their own pace. To respond to the needs of adult learners, a virtual learning environment should have an interactive design, be learner-centred and able to facilitate and motivate self-direction in learners. Furthermore, the inclusion of practical real-life scenarios in conjunction with relevant learning/teaching theories is essential if a user is to develop an understanding of the theory-to-practice connection as they develop their professional identity.

Overall, this inquiry has highlighted a number of important learning design principles an adult educator should take into consideration when designing and implementing virtual learning experiences for adult learners. It highlights the importance of a strong theory-to-practice connection in the development of a professional identity, which is explored in this inquiry via reflection.
Table of Contents

Declaration ....................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................... iii
Abstract ........................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................... vi
Table of Tables ............................................................................................................. xiv
Table of Figures ............................................................................................................. xv
Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 2

Background ..................................................................................................................... 2
   Linking Theory to Practice in Teacher Education ....................................................... 3
   Lack of Connection between Theory and Practice ..................................................... 5
   The Challenge of Field Experience ......................................................................... 6
   Mandated Changes in University Coursework ......................................................... 9

Simulation as a Response to Identified Issues .............................................................. 9

ClassSim ........................................................................................................................ 10

Rationale for using ClassSim ..................................................................................... 13
   Supplementing Field Experiences .......................................................................... 14
   Improving the Theory to Practice Connection ...................................................... 14

Purpose Statement and Research Questions .............................................................. 16

Theoretical Perspective ............................................................................................... 17

Research Strategy and Rationale .............................................................................. 19

Context of the Inquiry ............................................................................................... 19
   Faculty of Education .............................................................................................. 20
   Bachelor of Teaching ............................................................................................. 20
   Professional Practice .......................................................................................... 20

Significance of the Inquiry ......................................................................................... 22

Limitations of the Inquiry ......................................................................................... 22
Definition of Terms .................................................................................................................................. 24
Virtual Learning Environment ............................................................................................................... 24
Simulations ............................................................................................................................................ 24
Cognitive Tools ..................................................................................................................................... 25
Professional Identity .............................................................................................................................. 26

Structure of the Remainder of the Thesis .............................................................................................. 27
Chapter Two – Literature Review ......................................................................................................... 27
Chapter Three – Methodology and Research Design ............................................................................ 27
Chapter Four – The Process of Preparing Data for Cross-Case Analysis: Andragogy as the Theoretical Frame .................................................................................................................................................. 27
Chapter Five – First-Year Pre-service Teacher Case ............................................................................. 28
Chapter Six – Third-Year Pre-service Teacher Case ............................................................................. 28
Chapter Seven – Comparison of Cases .................................................................................................. 28
Chapter Eight – Discussion and Conclusion .......................................................................................... 29

Literature Review ....................................................................................................................................... 31

Introduction .............................................................................................................................................. 31
Pre-service Teacher Education as a form of Adult Education ................................................................ 33
Pre-service Teacher Education ............................................................................................................... 34
Pre-service Teacher Education in Australia .......................................................................................... 34
Recent Responses to the Reviews in Australia ...................................................................................... 35
The Problem of Linking Theory to Practice .......................................................................................... 36
The Impact of Pre-service Teacher Education on Beginning-Teacher Transition into the School Setting ............................................................................................................................................................... 37
Influence of Previous Life Experiences on Beginning Teacher Transition .................................. 40
Influence of Pre-service Teacher Education on Beginning Teacher Transition .......................... 42
The Development of Professional Identity ............................................................................................ 47
The Impact of Pre-service Teacher Education on the Development of a Professional Identity ........ 48
Influence of Previous Life Experiences on the Development of Professional Identity ..................... 53
Influence of Pre-service Teacher Education on the Development of Professional Identity .......... 54
Some Alternative Pre-service Teacher Programs Designed to Facilitate Beginning Teacher Transition into Schools and the Development of Professional Identity .............................................................. 57

The Use of the Principles of Andragogy in Teacher Education ........................................................... 60

Simulations ............................................................................................................................................... 62
Review of Simulations .......................................................................................................................... 63
How Simulations can Support Teaching and Learning ...................................................................... 64
The Potential of Simulations to Support Pre-service Teacher Education .......................................... 66
The Potential of Simulations to Support Professional Identity

Summary

Methodology and Research Design

Introduction

Methodology Background

Theoretical Assumptions

Qualitative Design

Interpretative Paradigm

Comparative Case Analysis

Conceptual Framework - A Constructivist Approach to Learning

Social Constructivism in a Virtual Learning Environment

Virtual Learning Environments as Cognitive Tools

Reflection and Reflective Practice in Virtual Learning Environments

Research Design

Data Collection in Relation to Principles of Andragogy and Research Questions

How ClassSim Relates to Pre-service Teacher Current Subjects

Data Collection Procedures

Semi-Structured Interviews

Observations

Monitoring Student Engagement

Artefacts

Phases of Data Collection

Pilot Study

Purpose and Setting

Information Session and Demographic Survey (Participant Recruitment)

Observations of Participants Engaging with ClassSim

Artefact Collection (‘Thinking Space’)

Interview Participants after using ClassSim

Interview Participants after both Engaging with ClassSim and Field Experiences

Phase One: Document Analysis, Information Session and Demographic Survey (Participant Recruitment)

Document Analysis

Purpose and Setting of Information Session

Demographic Survey

Purposive Sampling

The Participants
Phase Two: Observations of Participants Engaging with ClassSim .................................................... 113
  Purpose and Setting .................................................................................................................. 113
  Capturing Observations ......................................................................................................... 113
  Role of Researcher .................................................................................................................. 114
Phase Three: Artefact Collection ('Thinking Space') ........................................................................ 114
  Purpose and Setting .................................................................................................................. 114
Phase Four: Interview Participants after Engaging with ClassSim ...................................................... 115
  Purpose and Setting .................................................................................................................. 115
  Semi-Structured Interview Design ......................................................................................... 116
Phase Five: Artefact Collection (Field Experience Reflections) ......................................................... 117
  Purpose and Setting .................................................................................................................. 117
Phase Six: Interview Participants After Both Field Experiences and Engaging with ClassSim .......... 118
  Purpose and Setting .................................................................................................................. 118
  Semi-Structured Interview Design ......................................................................................... 118

Data Analysis .......................................................................................................................................... 119
  Data Preparation ....................................................................................................................... 120
  Computer-Assisted Qualitative Data Analysis ........................................................................... 121
  Data Analysis Using NVivo7 ....................................................................................................... 122
    Coding .................................................................................................................................... 122

Quality of Data .......................................................................................................................................... 123
  Credibility ................................................................................................................................... 123
    Prolonged Engagement and Persistent Observation ................................................................. 124
    Triangulation ............................................................................................................................ 124
    Peer Debriefing ....................................................................................................................... 126
    Negative Case Analysis .......................................................................................................... 127
    Member Checks ........................................................................................................................ 128
    Researcher Bias ...................................................................................................................... 128
    Thick Description .................................................................................................................... 128
  Dependability and Confirmability ............................................................................................ 129
    Audit Trail ................................................................................................................................ 129

Ethical Issues .......................................................................................................................................... 130
  Anonymity, Confidentiality, and Access to Information .................................................................. 130
  Participant Recruitment and Informed Consent .......................................................................... 130

Summary ............................................................................................................................................... 131

The Process of Preparing Data for Cross-Case Analysis: Employing Andragogy as the Theoretical Frame .......................................................................................................................... 133

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 133
Readiness............................................................................................................................................. 136
Orientation........................................................................................................................................... 138
Motivation ........................................................................................................................................... 140
Experience ........................................................................................................................................... 142
Self Concept ........................................................................................................................................ 145

Summary ................................................................................................................................................. 147

First-Year Pre-service Teacher Case ......................................................................................... 150

Context .................................................................................................................................................... 150
The First-Year Participants .................................................................................................................. 151
Kim ............................................................................................................................................ 152
Leonie ........................................................................................................................................ 152
Rachael ...................................................................................................................................... 152
Sarah .......................................................................................................................................... 152
Serena ........................................................................................................................................ 153
Kellie .......................................................................................................................................... 153
Jasmine ...................................................................................................................................... 154
Daniel ........................................................................................................................................ 154
Michael ...................................................................................................................................... 154
Bruce .......................................................................................................................................... 154

Findings of First-Year Pre-service Teachers ....................................................................................... 155
Readiness ............................................................................................................................................. 155
Purpose of Engagement .................................................................................................................. 155
Value to Learning ........................................................................................................................... 160
Changing Role from Student to Teacher ....................................................................................... 161
Timing of Engagement .................................................................................................................. 164
Orientation ........................................................................................................................................... 167
Relevant Scenarios .......................................................................................................................... 167
Need for New Knowledge ............................................................................................................. 170
Motivation ........................................................................................................................................... 173
Success ....................................................................................................................................... 173
Volition ...................................................................................................................................... 175
Value .......................................................................................................................................... 176
Enjoyment .................................................................................................................................. 178
Experience ........................................................................................................................................... 179
Previous Knowledge and Experience ............................................................................................. 180
Reflecting on Experience .................................................................................................................. 185
Self Concept ...................................................................................................................................... 189
Structure and Support of Learning Experiences ................................................................................. 189
Value to Learning ................................................................. 254
Changing Role ......................................................................... 255
Timing .................................................................................. 256
Orientation ............................................................................ 257
Relevant Scenarios ................................................................. 257
Need for New Knowledge ....................................................... 259
Motivation .............................................................................. 260
Success ................................................................................ 260
Volition ............................................................................... 261
Value .................................................................................. 262
Enjoyment ............................................................................ 263
Experience ............................................................................ 264
Making Links between Knowledge and Experience (Theory to Practice) .......... 264
Reflection ............................................................................ 266
Self Concept .......................................................................... 267
Structure and Support and Learning Experiences ...................... 267
Professional Identity ............................................................... 268

Discussion and Conclusion ....................................................... 271

Model of Virtual Learning Environments in Adult Education ........................................... 272

Design Considerations for a Virtual Learning Environment in Adult Education Learning Contexts ................................................................................................................................. 273

Features of the Virtual Learning Environment ................................................................. 274
Relevance to the Profession .................................................................................. 274
Structure and Support .................................................................................. 274
Motivation .............................................................................. 275
Professional Learning within a Virtual Learning Environment ......................................... 276
Professional Experience ................................................................................ 276
Professional Knowledge ............................................................................. 277
Connections between Professional Experience and Professional Knowledge (Reflection) ...... 278

Implementation of the Virtual Learning Environment in Adult Education ................................ 279

Defined Purpose ....................................................................... 279
Timing of Engagement ................................................................... 280
Flexible Implementation ................................................................... 280

Implications of Research ............................................................................ 281

Implications for the Theory of Andragogy ................................................................. 281
Implications for Virtual Learning Environments (Beyond ClassSim and into Other Contexts) .... 283
Implications for Linking Theory to Practice and the Development of Professional Identity ...... 284
Table of Tables

Table 1.1: Limitations of Data-Collection Procedures ................................................................. 23
Table 3.1: Paradigms of Post Positivist Inquiry Identified in Lather (1992) .................................. 76
Table 3.2: Research Questions in Connection with Principles of Andragogy .............................. 90
Table 3.3: Data Collection in Connection with ‘Readiness’ .......................................................... 91
Table 3.4: Data Collection in Connection with ‘Orientation’ ......................................................... 92
Table 3.5: Data Collection in Connection with ‘Motivation’ ......................................................... 93
Table 3.6: Data Collection in Connection with ‘Experience’ .......................................................... 94
Table 3.7: Data Collection in Connection with ‘Self Concept’ ..................................................... 95
Table 3.8: Overview of First-Year Participants ................................................................. 112
Table 3.9: Overview of Third-Year Participants ................................................................. 112
Table 4.1: Example of ‘Readiness’ in Data (purpose of engagement) ........................................... 137
Table 4.2: Example of ‘Readiness’ in Data (timing of engagement) ............................................ 138
Table 4.3: Example of ‘Orientation’ in Data (relevant scenarios) ............................................... 139
Table 4.4: Example of ‘Orientation’ in Data (relevant scenarios) ............................................... 140
Table 4.5: Example of ‘Motivation’ in Data (enjoyment) ............................................................ 141
Table 4.6: Example of ‘Motivation’ in Data (volition) ................................................................. 142
Table 4.7: Example of ‘Experience’ in Data (previous knowledge and experience) ...................... 144
Table 4.8: Example of ‘Experience’ in Data (reflecting on experience) ........................................ 145
Table 4.9: Example of ‘Self Concept’ in Data (structure and support of learning experience) ...... 146
Table 4.10: Example of ‘Self Concept’ in Data (professional identity) ........................................ 147
Table 5.1: Overview of First-Year Participants ................................................................. 151
Table 6.1: Overview of third-year participants ................................................................. 202
# Table of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>‘Student Update’ of Harley</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>‘Thinking Space’</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Summary of Parent Helpers in the Classroom</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Model of Literature Review</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Design of Study</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Data Type to Inform Andragogy</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Data Type in Connection with Data Collection Procedures to Inform Andragogy</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>When and how ClassSim was integrated into the 1\textsuperscript{st} year ‘Professional Practice’ subject</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>When and how ClassSim was integrated into the 3\textsuperscript{rd} year ‘Professional Practice’ subject</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Data Collection Timeline</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Phases of Data Collection</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Purposive Selection of Participants</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>The Iterative Qualitative Process</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Triangulation of Data (methods)</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Triangulation of Data (sources)</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Assumptions of Andragogy</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Pre-service Teacher Learning in Relation to Andragogy</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Model of the Design, Implementation and Adult Learning in a Virtual Learning Environment</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>