Making the intrinsic explicit: a cultural constructivist exploration of the subjective educational ideologies of trainee Malay, Tamil and Chinese language teachers in Singapore

Peter Thomas Bodycott
University of Wollongong

Recommended Citation

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Making the intrinsic explicit: A cultural constructivist exploration of the subjective educational ideologies of trainee Malay, Tamil and Chinese language teachers in Singapore.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

PETER THOMAS BODYCOTT


Faculty of Education

1995
constant support which has helped maintain my personal balance. Throughout life, Syl has brought to each day, to each new twist in the journey, insight, optimism, strength, love and commitment. Her contributions are immeasurable and for them I am eternally grateful.
ABSTRACT

This study explores the intrinsic relationships between the personal constructs of teaching and learning that trainee language teachers bring to their formal teacher education study. The analysis represents an effort to look, from a cultural constructivist perspective, at the subjective educational ideology of trainee language teachers in Singapore. Subjective educational ideologies are grounded in the personal history of trainee involvement in both formal and informal educative cultures. This study demonstrates that it is possible to augment advances in understanding previously gained through research by examining those individuals and cultures that have principally and directly influenced the thinking and learning of the trainee i.e., teachers, parents, family members, peers and schools. Repertory grid and self characterisation written biographies, it is argued, provide a hermeneutic dialectic approach to cultural constructivist inquiry. These techniques are synergistic and ideally suited to the purpose of exploring trainee teacher thinking and underlying ideology.

Analysis of the data indicates that trainee teachers from different cultures, and educated in different mother tongues display a range of intrinsic constructs about language learning, language teaching pedagogy and language teacher characteristics. These trainees, upon entering a formal professional preparatory program, display a knowledge about the language teacher's personal and interpersonal skills and their role in creating an environment that facilitates language learning. Trainee knowledge and constructs about language teaching and learning are grounded in their personal history. That is, both informal and formal experiences of language, teaching and learning environments affect the development of subjective educational ideology.
These ideological principles form the foundation of trainee language teacher thinking and are more closely associated with elements from the informal educative culture of the home, that is, with one or both parents. Furthermore, the closeness of these associations suggests that this group of trainees validated these culturally influenced, personal constructs of language teaching and learning against elements from their formal education. The trainees' preferred approach to language teaching was found to reflect the way they learned language in the context of the home.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Acknowledgments** ................................................................. i
**Abstract** ............................................................................... iii
**Table of Contents** .................................................................... v
**List of Figures** .......................................................................... xi
**List of Tables** ........................................................................... xii

**Chapter 1: Introduction** .......................................................... 1
1.1 Introduction........................................................................... 2
1.2 Purpose and objectives of the study.................................... 2
1.3 Subjective educational ideology: Theoretical presuppositions .. 3
1.4 Background to the study....................................................... 5
1.5 Rationale for the study......................................................... 7
1.6 Conceptual locus: A cultural constructivist perspective.......... 11
1.7 Subjective construction: Interpersonal cultural influences.... 13
1.8 Culture and language......................................................... 14
1.9 *A priori* assertions............................................................. 15
  1.9.1 Prior experience influences thinking.............................. 15
  1.9.2 Subjective formations of knowledge, understandings, and beliefs are the frame or cultural construction of meanings which human beings express and refer to themselves at a particular point in time ................................................. 16
  1.9.3 Personal constructed views can be elicited and interpreted for meaning......................................................... 16
  1.9.4 Knowledge of personal constructs will be beneficial to trainers and trainees............................................... 17
1.10 Physical locus of the study.................................................... 18
  1.10.1 Singapore .................................................................. 18
  1.10.2 Education context...................................................... 18
    1.10.2.1 Historical developments...................................... 19
    1.10.2.2 The British period............................................. 20
    1.10.2.3 Post war developments..................................... 20
    1.10.2.4 Self-government: A period of rapid expansion...... 20
    1.10.2.5 The Goh report and beyond............................... 21
1.11 Methods............................................................................. 24
  1.11.1 Participants................................................................ 24
  1.11.2 Design.................................................................... 24
1.12 Conclusion........................................................................... 25
3.7 Benefits of the methods used…………………………………………………………………………………123
3.8 Cultural constructivist methodology: A hermeneutic dialectic
   process ……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………123
   3.8.1 Fairness ………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………124
   3.8.2 Ontological authenticity..........................................................................................................................125
   3.8.3 Tactical authenticity ……………………………………………………………………………………………….125
3.8 Conclusion …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..126

Chapter 4: Case Study Reports …………………………………………………………………………………………………127
  4.1 Introduction…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………128
  4.2 Case study organisation and structure …………………………………………………………………………………128
  4.3 Trainee: Language information …………………………………………………………………………………………128
  4.4 Trainee case study: Delaina ……………………………………………………………………………………………..131
  4.5 Trainee case study: Normah ……………………………………………………………………………………………142
  4.6 Trainee case study: Norlieza ……………………………………………………………………………………………155
  4.7 Trainee case study: Ernie …………………………………………………………………………………………………170
  4.8 Trainee case study: Faizah ………………………………………………………………………………………………188
  4.9 Trainee case study: Shuh Yi ……………………………………………………………………………………………203
  4.10 Trainee case study: Teow Hiang ………………………………………………………………………………………216
  4.11 Trainee case study: Connie ……………………………………………………………………………………………232
  4.12 Trainee case study: Regina ……………………………………………………………………………………………247
  4.13 Trainee case study: Vimala ……………………………………………………………………………………………261
  4.14 Trainee case study: Bucktha ……………………………………………………………………………………………275
  4.15 Trainee case study: Serena ……………………………………………………………………………………………290
  4.16 Conclusion …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………306

Chapter 5: Shared Meanings and Relationships: Cross Case Analyses and Discussion ………………………………..307
  5.1 Introduction…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………308
  5.2 Description of the categories and subcategories ………………………………………………………………………309
    5.2.1 Aspect 1 – Language learning guidelines ………………………………………………………………………309
    5.2.2 Aspect 2 – Language teacher characteristics …………………………………………………………………311
    5.2.3 Aspect 3 – Pedagogical approaches to language learning …………………………………………………312
  5.3 Commonalities …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………314
    5.3.1 Commonality within cultural groups - Language learning guidelines ………………………………………314
5.3.2 Commonality between cultural groups – Language learning guidelines .......................................................... 318
5.3.3 Commonality within cultural groups – Teacher characteristics ...................................................................... 319
5.3.4 Commonality between cultural groups – Teacher characteristics ...................................................................... 322
5.3.5 Commonality within cultural groups – Pedagogical approach .............................................................................. 324
5.3.6 Commonality between cultural groups – Pedagogical approaches ........................................................................ 327
5.4 Emergent ideological foundation ............................................................................................................................. 329
5.5 Natural-immersive approach ...................................................................................................................................... 330
5.6 The influence of educative learning cultures ............................................................................................................ 332
  5.6.1 Tamil trainee perspectives ...................................................................................................................................... 333
  5.6.2 Malay trainee perspectives ...................................................................................................................................... 336
  5.6.3 Chinese trainee perspectives ...................................................................................................................................... 339
5.7 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................................. 342

Chapter 6: Research Implications and Conclusion ...................................................................................................... 345
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................................. 346
  6.1.1 The personal journey: Meeting objectives ............................................................................................................ 346
6.2 Effectiveness of the research methods and design ................................................................................................... 348
  6.2.1 Trainee participants .................................................................................................................................................. 348
  6.2.2 Grid elicitation and analysis procedures .................................................................................................................. 349
  6.2.3 Written recounts of the contexts of construing ....................................................................................................... 351
  6.2.4 Metaphor as windows on personal construing ......................................................................................................... 352
  6.2.5 Self characterisations and biography ...................................................................................................................... 353
  6.2.6 Authenticating the data: A process requiring commitment and reflexivity ............................................................... 354
6.3 Through the looking glass: Developing educational ideology .................................................................................... 355
6.4 Cultural influences ...................................................................................................................................................... 356
6.5 Plugging in: Relationships and implications for trainee teacher thinking research .................................................. 357
6.6 Individual trainee construing: Principles applied toward a constructivist approach to teacher education ................. 362
6.7 Implications for further research .................................................................................................................................. 364
6.8 Concluding remarks .................................................................................................................................................... 365

References ................................................................................................................................................................. 368
Appendix
Appendix 1  Information to participants regarding research and rep grid................................................................. 396
Appendix 2  Instructions to participants for identifying elements................................................................. 398
Appendix 3  Instructions to participants for eliciting constructs................................................................. 400
Appendix 4  Instructions to participants explaining the rating of elements................................................................. 402
Appendix 5  Trainee demographic information................................................................. 404
Appendix 6  Extracts from Written biography – Self characterisation data................................................................. 407
Appendix 7  Extracts of Written recounts – Contexts of construing data................................................................. 409
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 A cultural constructivist perspective of meaning creation..................12
Figure 2.1 Overview of literature reviewed, major principles and
costum influence..........................................................................................29
Figure 3.1 Structural outline and methodological research influences...........91
Figure 3.2 Completed repertory grid.............................................................109
Figure 3.3 Flow chart of construct elicitation and rating..............................113
Figure 3.4 Cluster analysed repertory grid....................................................114
Figure 3.5 Flow chart for the FOCUS algorithm..........................................115
Figure 3.6 Consensus, correspondence, conflict and contrast in
construct terminology of individuals.........................................................120
Figure 3.7 Summary flow chart of data collection and analysis
procedures......................................................................................................122
Figure 4.1 Case report structure.....................................................................129
Figure 4.2 FOCUS repertory grid: Delaina..................................................134
Figure 4.3 FOCUS repertory grid: Normah..................................................145
Figure 4.4 FOCUS repertory grid: Norlieza................................................158
Figure 4.5 FOCUS repertory grid: Ernie.......................................................174
Figure 4.6 FOCUS repertory grid: Faizah....................................................194
Figure 4.7 FOCUS repertory grid: Shuh Yi..................................................207
Figure 4.8 FOCUS repertory grid: Teow Hiang..........................................220
Figure 4.9 FOCUS repertory grid: Connie..................................................235
Figure 4.10 FOCUS repertory grid: Regina................................................252
Figure 4.11 FOCUS repertory grid: Vimala................................................265
Figure 4.12 FOCUS repertory grid: Bucktha..............................................277
Figure 4.13 FOCUS repertory grid: Serena................................................293
Figure 5.1 Structural overview and developmental links as a result of
cross case analyses......................................................................................310
Figure 5.2 Model of subjective educational language teaching
ideology...........................................................................................................330
Figure 5.3 Links between superordinate constructs and
comprehensive constructs of language teaching.................................336
Figure 5.4 Core construct foundation of trainee teacher construing.............339
Figure 5.5 Cultural influence on trainee language teacher construing........342
Figure 6.1 Structural framework and reflexive nature of the research
journey...........................................................................................................347
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1  Written biography – Self characterisation instruction sheet ...... 104
Table 3.2  Element title list .................................................................................. 111
Table 3.3  Element ratings on elicited constructs .............................................. 112
Table 3.4  Instructions for completing written recounts of context of construing ................................................................................................. 116
Table 4.1  Tabular synopsis of case report organisation, trainee teaching specialisation and mother tongue language ......................... 130
Table 5.1  Language learning guidelines – Malay trainee perspectives ...... 314
Table 5.2  Language learning guidelines – Chinese trainee perspectives .................................................................................................................... 316
Table 5.3  Language learning guidelines – Tamil trainee perspectives ...... 317
Table 5.4  Language teacher characteristics – Malay trainee perspectives ................................................................................................................ 319
Table 5.5  Language teacher characteristics – Chinese trainee perspectives ................................................................................................................. 320
Table 5.6  Language teacher characteristics – Tamil trainee perspectives .................................................................................................................... 322
Table 5.7  Pedagogical approaches to language teaching – Malay trainee perspectives ............................................................................................ 324
Table 5.8  Pedagogical approaches to language teaching – Chinese trainee perspectives ......................................................................................... 326
Table 5.9  Pedagogical approaches to language teaching – Tamil trainee perspectives ............................................................................................. 327
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION