2002

Learning about design in context: an investigation of learners' interpretations and use of real-life cases within a constructivist learning environment created to support authentic design activities

S. Bennett
Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, sbennett@uow.edu.au

Recommended Citation

Copyright WARNING
You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Learning about design in context: An investigation of learners' interpretations and use of real-life cases within a constructivist learning environment created to support authentic design activities

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

from

University of Wollongong

by

Susan Jane Bennett
BSc (Griffith), BSc (Hons) (ANU), MSc (Scientific Communication) (ANU), Grad Cert HEd (UNSW)

Faculty of Education
2002
Declaration

I, Susan Bennett, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other institution.

Susan Bennett
17 April 2002
Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors, Barry Harper and John Hedberg, for their support in taking this study from a vague idea through to completion. Thank you also to my colleagues and peers in the Faculty for their encouragement and advice, in particular the members of F6.

This study would not have been possible without the assistance of members of the Exploring the Nardoo and StageStruck project teams who helped with the preparation of the cases. In particular I would like to thank Rob Wright for helping me search through the project archives for useful material.

Thank you also to the study participants, particularly those who assisted with member checking in the data analysis phase. Thanks also go to Shirley Agostinho who trialled and provided valuable feedback on the coding scheme. A special thank you to my father, Ed, and my friend, Katrina, who assisted with proofreading and editing of this manuscript.

Finally, I would like to thank all of my family and friends for their support throughout the process, especially Brendan, Dad, Mum, Megan and Andrew.
Abstract

Teachers and designers in a range of disciplines are interested in engaging their students in authentic activities that reflect the experiences of practitioners and have begun to explore the potential of cases to present the complexity of real-world situations. Despite a long tradition of cases in legal, medical and business education, there is little empirical research on which to base the design and implementation of case-based approaches. This study addresses this gap by investigating learners’ understanding of multimedia design and development derived from the analysis of two real-life cases, and how this understanding supports learners in their own design projects.

A qualitative case study approach was used to follow a class of graduate-level students enrolled in a technology-supported, case-based subject designed using Jonassen’s (1999) model for a constructivist learning environment. The study was guided by three key questions: (1) How do learners interpret the case materials? (2) How do learners develop solutions to their project design tasks? (3) What aspects of the projects and cases do learners reflect on at the end of the subject? Student work from case analysis, group project and reflective tasks was collected as a key data source. This was complemented by interviews with students and their instructor, observations by the researcher at class meetings, and the collection of documents, such as discussion list records and subject files. Data analysis was guided by the research questions, but also sought to identify emergent themes and issues.

The study found that the case analysis task produced a diverse range of responses from students, both in terms of the issues discussed and the type of responses elicited. Learners found the cases useful in raising their awareness of project issues, and suggesting design approaches and management strategies. The critical role of discussion and reflection in developing students’ understanding of multimedia design and development emerged. The study also revealed some of the limitations of the case approach and highlighted the need for strategies that support learners’ thinking and reasoning. The findings have implications for the design of cases and suggest avenues for further research.
# Table of Contents

Declaration ......................................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................... iii  
Abstract .............................................................................................................................. iv  
List of Tables .................................................................................................................... viii  
List of Figures ................................................................................................................... x  

Chapter One: Introduction to the Study ........................................................................ 1  
1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 1  
1.2 Background to the study ......................................................................................... 2  
1.3 Research strategy and context .............................................................................. 3  
1.4 Research questions ................................................................................................. 5  
1.5 Significance and limitations of the study .............................................................. 7  
1.6 Structure of thesis .................................................................................................. 8  

Chapter Two: Literature Review ..................................................................................... 9  
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 9  
2.2 An overview .......................................................................................................... 9  
2.3 Authentic activities and contexts ...................................................................... 12  
2.4 Case-based learning ............................................................................................ 20  
2.5 Summary and relevance of literature to this study ........................................ 38  

Chapter Three: Research Methodology and Learning Design .................................... 41  
3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 41  
3.2 Theory ................................................................................................................... 41  
3.3 The design of this study ...................................................................................... 44  
3.4 Summary .............................................................................................................. 74
Chapter Four: Learners’ Interpretations of the Cases ................................................. 75
4.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 75
4.2 The case analysis task ......................................................................................... 75
4.3 Relevance to the study ....................................................................................... 77
4.4 Approach to analysis ......................................................................................... 78
4.5 The individual analysis tasks ............................................................................ 92
4.6 Small group discussion of case issues ............................................................... 174
4.7 Whole class discussion of case issues ............................................................... 181
4.8 Summary ............................................................................................................ 189

Chapter Five: Group Project Experiences ................................................................. 190
5.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 190
5.2 The group project task ...................................................................................... 190
5.3 Relevance to the study ..................................................................................... 191
5.4 Approach to analysis ....................................................................................... 192
5.5 Group design statements .................................................................................. 194
5.6 Prototype package ............................................................................................ 207
5.7 Project development process ........................................................................... 217
5.8 Discussion .......................................................................................................... 238
5.9 Summary ............................................................................................................ 245

Chapter Six: Learners’ Reflections ........................................................................... 247
6.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 247
6.2 The reflective tasks ............................................................................................ 247
6.3 Relevance to the study ...................................................................................... 249
6.4 Approach to analysis ....................................................................................... 249
6.5 Heuristics derived from learners’ reflections ..................................................... 250
6.6 Relating project experiences to the cases ......................................................... 275
6.7 Discussion .......................................................................................................... 279
6.8 Key findings ....................................................................................................... 282
Chapter Seven: Discussion

7.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 284
7.2 Summary of findings ..................................................................................................... 284
7.3 Conclusions and implications for practice ................................................................. 298
7.4 Further research .......................................................................................................... 313
7.5 Conclusion ................................................................................................................... 317

References ........................................................................................................................ 319

Appendices
3.1 Subject outline .............................................................................................................. 341
3.2 Descriptions of the case projects ................................................................................ 347
3.3 Sample case materials ............................................................................................... 349
3.4 Class schedule ............................................................................................................ 360
3.5 Assessment instructions .............................................................................................. 364
3.6 Information sheet ........................................................................................................ 368
3.7 Consent form ............................................................................................................... 369
3.8 Interview guide for students ....................................................................................... 370
3.9 Interview guide for instructors .................................................................................... 371
3.10 Member checking consent form .............................................................................. 372
4.1 Nodes and descriptions ............................................................................................... 373
4.2 Coding profile for Anna ............................................................................................. 380
5.1 Design statement template ........................................................................................ 382
5.2 Example of analysis notes for design statements ..................................................... 386
5.3 Example of analysis notes for team products ............................................................ 391
6.1 Example of analysis of student reflective paper ....................................................... 393
6.2 Example of analysis of group reflective case ............................................................. 399
6.3 Skills audit form ......................................................................................................... 406
List of Tables

2.1 Three traditional approaches to case-based learning ........................................... 22
2.2 Summary of research into case-based learning in instructional design courses ........ 30
2.3 Summary of research into case-based learning in teacher education ..................... 32
3.1 The research participants ....................................................................................... 48
3.2 Implementation of key features in the learning design ............................................ 50
3.3 Desired outcomes against case analysis and project tasks ..................................... 51
3.4 Design features of the cases materials .................................................................... 52
3.5 Features of the case analysis activities ..................................................................... 57
3.6 Features of the project activities ............................................................................. 58
3.7 Features of the reflective tasks ............................................................................... 59
3.8 Data collected to answer the research questions for this study ............................... 66
3.9 Summary of data collected from students ............................................................... 67
3.10 Data analysis techniques used in this study ......................................................... 71
3.11 Verification measures used in this study .............................................................. 73
4.1 Example of coding for an individual case analysis paper ....................................... 80
4.2 Elements of learners’ individual responses examined ............................................ 91
4.3 Summary of student responses for each sub-question ........................................... 160
4.4 Summary of general aspects of student responses ................................................. 169
4.5 Summary of student responses to interview questions ......................................... 172
4.6 Issues reported on by Group A .............................................................................. 176
4.7 Issues reported on by Group B .............................................................................. 178
4.8 Issues reported on by Group C .............................................................................. 180
4.9 Issues raised by the team members in whole class discussion ............................... 186
5.1 Analysis framework for advanced prototypes ....................................................... 193
5.2 Group A team members and their project roles ..................................................... 194
5.3 Group B team members and their project roles ..................................................... 199
5.4 Group C team members and their project roles ..................................................... 203
5.5 Key features of Group A’s final product ............................................................... 207
5.6 Key features of Group B’s final product ............................................................... 210
5.7 Key features of Group C’s final product ............................................................... 214
5.8 Summary of discussion postings from Group A ......................................................... 219
5.9 Summary of discussion postings from Group B ......................................................... 225
5.10 Summary of discussion postings from Group C ......................................................... 232
List of Figures

3.1 Model for a constructivist learning environment (Adapted from Jonassen, 1999) .... 49
3.2 The structure of the case materials (showing Nardoo case only) ......................... 54
3.3 The learning process and activities ........................................................................ 56
7.1 Relation between case analysis and project tasks ..................................................311
7.2 Key features of the generic design model ................................................................312