From a personal theory to a grounded theory of staff development

Jan Turbill
University of Wollongong, jturbill@uow.edu.au

Recommended Citation


Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
FROM A PERSONAL THEORY TO A GROUNDED THEORY OF STAFF DEVELOPMENT

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

JANICE BETINA TURBILL
MEd (Sydney), BA (Macquarie)

FACULTY OF EDUCATION
1993
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

As with most studies of this magnitude there are many people who help to make it all possible. In this study these people span two continents. First in the United States of America, the administrators, teachers and children in the school district of Marcus Whitman, in upper New York accepted me as a friend and a colleague as well as a researcher. Their support and willingness to give so much of themselves I will always value highly. It is my hope that my work with them and the outcomes of this study have supported and will continue to support them as they work towards their vision for effective literacy education. In particular, I want to thank Jackie Metz, Gail Langton and Jack McCabe for their faith in a dream and their continued support in realising that dream.

Back on my side of the Pacific, I received a great deal of support from colleagues and fellow students; Bridgit Barton, Phil Fitzsimmons, Lois Leitch, Kylie Pickford and Rosalie Nott. Thanks guys.

I also wish to acknowledge the support of the Women’s Academic Committee, within the University of Wollongong. The financial support gained through the Women’s Academic Scholarships enabled me to have some valuable time for the final writing of the thesis.

To my friends Andrea Butler and Brian Cambourne, I say ‘thanks’. Andrea’s faith in my ability ‘to just do it’ and Brian’s thoughtful, sensitive and expert guidance as my supervisor, saw me through the many hours of confusion, insecurity and growth in my own learning.

Final thanks must be given to my family who have always supported me in all that I have done, but particularly in this endeavour over the last few years.
ABSTRACT

This study set out to develop a grounded theory of staff development for teachers. The aims of the study were:

- to evaluate the impact that a staff development program, called Frameworks, had on teachers beliefs and practices in literacy education

- to evaluate a personally developed staff development theory which underpinned the design and delivery of that program

- as a consequence of the above, to develop a staff development theory which had been formally grounded in the real world of classrooms and schools.

The study employed a naturalistic mode of inquiry, and in particular was framed by the parameters of a responsive constructivist evaluation paradigm. The methods of naturalistic inquiry were employed. In particular there was a strong emphasis on a hermeneutic/dialectic process which takes full advantage, and account, of the observer/observed interaction in order to create a constructed reality that is as informed and sophisticated as it can be made at a particular point in time.

The study comprised four case studies of four class teachers which analyse and describe their experiences as a result of their participation in the eight week program. These four case studies were further analysed into a construction of Frameworks as it was run in the Gorham Middlesex School District (more commonly known as Marcus Whitman Central School District).

A theory of staff development grounded in the data emerged which has been depicted in schematic form and described in detail. Recommendations for the future of staff development, based on the principles emerging from this theory are made. Finally it is argued that effective staff development in the future is contingent upon the adoption of a new paradigm of teacher learning, namely, one that views learning cultures of teachers as social semiotic systems.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Purpose and Aims of the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale for the Study</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background to the study</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Socio-political Context of Literacy Education</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is Literacy?</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A New Paradigm in Literacy Education</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Challenge of Staff Development</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Personal Theory of Staff Development and Teachers' Learning</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background Information</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Role in Schools as a Staff Developer</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase One</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Two</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory into Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Three</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory's Impact on Teachers' Beliefs and Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Four - An Interactive Model</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Five</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Language in Teacher Learning</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitating Staff Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What did all this mean for staff development?</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locus of the Study</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Site</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Participants</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Case Study Teachers</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Evaluand - FRAMEWORKS</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is Frameworks?</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims of Frameworks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Roles and Responsibility of the Facilitator ........................................... 42
Roles and Responsibilities of the Participants ................................. 42
Broad Themes Running Through Frameworks ................................. 43
Conclusion ......................................................................................... 43
CHAPTER 2: A FUTURE AGENDA FOR STAFF DEVELOPMENT - A LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction ................................................................. 45
Some Definitions ....................................................... 49
An Overview of Effective Staff Development ................. 52
  The Authoritarian Model ........................................... 53
  The Support or Training Model .................................. 56
  The Individual to Co-operative Model ......................... 60
  The Collaborative Model ......................................... 64
A Future Agenda for Staff Development ......................... 67
The Problem: Why Has Staff Development Worked? ........... 72
An Alternate View to the Problem ................................. 72
Towards a Paradigm Shift in Staff Development ................ 79
School Cultures as Semiotic Systems ............................. 87
  Changing the Roles and Organisers ............................. 87
  The Need for an Explicit Learning Theory .................... 90
  Role of Language ................................................... 96
Summary: A Future Agenda for Staff Development .......... 98

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY .............................................. 101
Introduction ................................................................. 101
Methodological Orientation for the Study ....................... 104
The Constructivist Methodology in Action ....................... 106
  Natural Setting ....................................................... 108
  The Human as Instrument ......................................... 109
Qualitative Methods .................................................. 112
  Observations ........................................................ 112
  Interviews ........................................................... 114
  Surveys ............................................................... 118
  Documents ........................................................... 118
Tacit Knowledge ....................................................... 119
The Hermeneutic Dialectic Process in Action: Data Analysis 120
Activating the Hermeneutic Dialectic Process .................. 123
Coding the Data Using the Constant Comparative Method .... 126
  Step 1 ................................................................. 128
  Step 2 ................................................................. 129
  Step 3 ................................................................. 130
  Step 4 ................................................................. 131
Description of Themes and Categories .......................... 133
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS OF THE STUDY .................................................. 146

Introduction .................................................................................. 146

Part One:

The Learning Culture of Frameworks at Marcus Whitman

Central School District ................................................................. 147

The Socio-Political Context ......................................................... 147

The District .................................................................................. 147

The District's Involvement in Frameworks ................................. 149

The Superintendent's Perspective .............................................. 149

The Principals' Perspective ......................................................... 152

The Context Established by The Facilitator ............................... 154

The Physical Setting .................................................................... 154

Professional Background of the Facilitator ............................... 155

Beliefs and Understandings about Staff Development and

Teacher Learning ....................................................................... 156

Facilitator Concerns During the Program ................................. 158

Frameworks in Action ................................................................. 160

Making Explicit .......................................................................... 161

Making Explicit the Purposes of Activities ............................... 162

The Power of Demonstrations ................................................... 162
Expectations ......................................................... 164
Feedback ............................................................. 164
Responsibility for Learning ..................................... 166
Adding Information .............................................. 166
Role of Language ................................................. 167
Creating a Community of Learners ......................... 167
Summary .................................................................. 168
Part Two: The Four Case Study Reports ..................... 170
Case Study 1 - Lonnie Gunzalus, Gorham Elementary School .......................... 170
  Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices .......... 170
  Making Connections - New Knowledge .................. 171
    Nature of Learning ........................................... 171
    Nature of Teaching ......................................... 172
    Nature of Language ......................................... 173
  Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice .......................... 173
    Physical and Social Environment ....................... 173
    Strategies ..................................................... 174
    Evaluation ..................................................... 175
    Planning......................................................... 175
    Resources ...................................................... 175
    Time .................................................................. 176
    Language Used ............................................... 176
  Process of Change - Intellectual Unrest:
    A Precursor To Change ...................................... 176
    New Knowledge ............................................... 177
    Implementing New Practice ................................. 178
      Teaching ....................................................... 178
      Time .................................................................. 178
      Evaluation ..................................................... 178
  Process of Change
    Enablers in the Process ...................................... 179
    Understanding ‘New’ Knowledge ......................... 179
    Understanding ‘New’ Knowledge
      Focus on Content ........................................... 179
      Readings ....................................................... 179
      Activities ...................................................... 180
      Input .................................................................. 181
    Understanding ‘New’ Knowledge
      Focus on Process ............................................. 181
# Making Connections - New Knowledge

## Nature of Learning

## Nature of Language

## Nature of Teaching

## Role of Language in Learning

# Making Connections - Implementation of New Practice

## Physical and Social Environment

## Strategies

## Planning

# Process of Change

## Intellectual Unrest, a Precursor to Change

## Enablers in the Process

### Understanding 'New' Knowledge

#### Focus on Content

#### Input

#### Readings

#### Activities

### Understanding 'New' Knowledge

#### Focus on Process

#### Group Work

#### Language

#### Support

#### Setting

# Implementing 'New' Practices

## Students

## Teaching

## Process

## Support

# Process of Change: Inhibitors in the Process

# The Learning of 'New' Knowledge

## Focus on Content

## Readings

## Input

## Activities

## Focus on Process

## Time
Process Of Change: Enablers in the Process ...................................................... 251

Understanding 'New' Knowledge
  Focus on Content...................................................................................... 251
  Input......................................................................................................... 251
  Activities ............................................................................................... 251
  Readings ............................................................................................... 252

Understanding 'New' Knowledge
  Focus on Process .................................................................................... 252
  Group Work ............................................................................................. 253
  Support ................................................................................................... 253
  Timing ..................................................................................................... 254
  Focus on Language ................................................................................... 255

Implementing 'New' Practice
  Focus on Students ................................................................................... 256

Implementing 'New' Practice
  Focus on Process .................................................................................... 257

Implementing 'New' Practice
  Focus on Support/Personnel .................................................................... 257

Process of Change: Inhibitors of the Learning of New
Knowledge and Its Implementation ......................................................... 258

Focus on Content...................................................................................... 258
  Readings ............................................................................................... 258
  Activities ............................................................................................... 258
  Input ...................................................................................................... 259
  Focus on Process .................................................................................... 260
  Focus on External Pressures ................................................................... 260

Attitude to the Change Process ................................................................. 261

Insights into the Change Process ............................................................. 262

Part Three - The Impact of a Staff Development Program Called
Frameworks on Teachers' Beliefs and Practices in Literacy Education ...... 264

  Pre-existing Beliefs, Knowledge and Practices ....................................... 265
  Making Connections - New Knowledge, Covert Teacher Change .......... 268

  Nature of Learning .................................................................................. 269
  Insights into Their Own Learning (Personal Theory) ......................... 269
  Natural Learning Theory (Theory of Others) ........................................ 271

  Nature of Language ............................................................................... 273
  Nature of Teaching ............................................................................... 276
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS

Towards a Grounded Theory in Staff Development

A Theory of Teacher Learning

REFERENCES

APPENDIX A

APPENDIX B

APPENDIX C
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Overview of SLIC Process (SLIC Manual, 1989, 6) ........................................... 29
Figure 2: Models of Professional Development (Barton, 1992) .................................... 53
Figure 3: A Model of the Process of Teacher Change (Guskey, 1986, 7) ....................... 58
Figure 4: A Comprehensive Framework for Classroom and School Improvement .................................................. 80
Figure 5: A Model of Cambourne's Theory of Learning (Turbill, 1993) ....................... 92
Figure 6: Doctoral Study in Relation to Frameworks Pilot Evaluation .......................... 103
Figure 7: Interconnectedness between the Paradigm of the Staff Development Model and the Research Methodology .......................................................... 106
Figure 8: Diagrammatic View of the Methodology of Constructivist Inquiry .................. 107
Figure 9: My Construction of Each Teacher's Interviews ........................................ ..... 122
Figure 10: Process of Construction of each Case Report .............................................. 122
Figure 11: Final Case Report ....................................................................................... 123
Figure 13: The Pattern of Themes and Categories Which Emerged from the Analysis of the Case Study Teachers' Data ............................................................... 133
Figure 14: The Final Case Report Categories .............................................................. 140
Figure 15: The Physical Layout of the Room ............................................................... 155
Figure 16: An Interactive, Integrative View of Staff Development ............................ 289
........................................................................................................................................ 332
Figure 17: A Model for Developing Personally Empowered Professionals ................. 335