Facilitating learning: mine, yours and others' gaining insight into the facilitation of corporate experiential learning programs through the lenses of personal experience and the learning styles analysis

Tracey Dickson
University of Wollongong, tdickson@uow.edu.au

Recommended Citation
Facilitating learning: mine, yours and others’ gaining insight into the facilitation of corporate experiential learning programs through the lenses of personal experience and the learning styles analysis

Tracey Joy Dickson
University of Wollongong


This paper is posted at Research Online.
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Certification

I, Tracey J Dickson, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Tracey J Dickson

14th December, 2003
Acknowledgments

A PhD is a combination of a range of experiences and interactions and the journey I have experienced could be referred to as an adventurous exploration involving many moments of ‘geographic embarrassment’. To have been able to continue this journey, without having to follow the many “Lonely Planet” type guides to PhDs has been achieved through the support, and at times, mere tolerance, of supervisors, colleagues and friends.

Supervisors: Those that came and went

Like any journey, not everyone is there at the end, some choose to leave and others were in the wrong place at that time. I have had a wide range of supervisors, each having contributed in their own unique way: Dr Stephen Linstead, Dr Mike Gass, Dr Lorraine Smith and Dr Will Rifkin, who saw me through the midst of this PhD.

Supervisors: Those At the End

Dr Tonia Gray and Dr Bruce Hayllar are friends first, colleagues second and supervisors last. They were the ones who supported me when the going got tough and encouraged me to explore the fringes of research methodologies and process.

NRG

NRG is a group that has provided much support and encouragement over a long road. It is a group where learning is possible due the sharing of the common experience of journeying through a PhD, but also the support of friends all of whom have been exploring very different research interests. Many thanks to Terri, Fran, Judy, Chris and to the late and very dear Cec, the first of us to succeed.

Family and Friends

While this has primarily been a personal journey it has also been one that has been at the cost of maintaining and growing relationships. I am forever thankful to many family members and friends (old and new) who have continued to be interested over such a long time, have helped me maintain perspective and have understood when I did not want them to visit!
Abstract

Writing and research on facilitation of experiential learning, including corporate programs, predominantly focuses upon what the facilitator is to do, with little or no consideration for where the facilitation occurs. Using a heuristic research process that involves an immersion in the dominant literature on experiential learning (with an emphasis upon North American literature), and through the use of the ‘lenses’ of personal experience and the use of the Learning Styles Analysis, this thesis follows a journey of exploration into the world of experiential learning. The journey includes forays into deconstruction of a popular article on facilitation as well as exploring literature from other areas such as urban planning, human geography and organisational aesthetics. Other places ‘visited’ along the way includes surveys of the learning styles of 73 post graduate students as well as the professional practice of 76 facilitators of experiential learning from diverse countries and cultures. The destination at the commencement of the journey while unknown, had a motive to enhance the effectiveness of the facilitation of corporate experiential learning programs. However, by continuing to honour the role of personal experience, as supported by many feminist writers, and by being willing to reflect upon the writings and practice of facilitation of experiential learning, the final destination ended up being a place called Place and Space. Prior to arriving at the final destination, a creative synthesis of the journey is expressed through a weaving of a photo essay with the words of a poem. The final destination of this journey, Place and Space, begins to raise questions about what the impact of the physical environment, natural/wilderness or built, may have upon the individual and/or the group’s learning experience. These questions form the beginnings for another journey.

Abstract
Table of Contents

Acknowledgments............................................................................................................. 1

Abstract............................................................................................................................ 2

List of Figures .................................................................................................................. 10

List of Tables .................................................................................................................. 11

Preface: I am different, this I know, because my reflection tells me so. ...................... 13

Springs Within – Reflections on a Dam ........................................................................... 15

Chapter 1.  Introduction.................................................................................................. 16

1.1.  Beginnings ............................................................................................................... 16

1.2.  Lenses ..................................................................................................................... 17

1.3.  Where to Now? ....................................................................................................... 18

1.4.  A Personal Journey ............................................................................................... 18

1.5.  What Are the Questions? ....................................................................................... 20

1.6.  Where is this Research ‘Located’? ....................................................................... 24

1.6.1.  Feminist, Who Me?, Surely Not! ..................................................................... 24

1.6.2.  Taking a Critical Perspective ............................................................................ 26

1.6.3.  Managers and Organisations for the Future .................................................... 28

1.7.  Learning as an Adventure; Facilitation as Risk Management ............................... 33

1.8.  Different Perspectives, Different Voices ............................................................... 34

1.9.  Learning Styles: What’s that? ................................................................................. 36

1.10.  There’s Nothing New in This! .............................................................................. 37

1.11.  A Journey of Exploration ....................................................................................... 38

1.11.1.  Steps Along the Way ...................................................................................... 38

1.11.2.  Preparing for the Journey ............................................................................. 40

1.11.3.  Scenery Along the Journey ........................................................................... 40

1.12.  If You Are Reading This, I Have Survived the Journey ....................................... 42
4.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 188
   Presenting My Voice ......................................................................................... 188
   Research About Yourself? .............................................................................. 188

4.2. The Story Begins ............................................................................................ 190
   Attempts at Beginning .................................................................................... 190
   A Room of One’s Own .................................................................................... 192
   The LSA in my Own Life ................................................................................ 193
   What Place Jindabyne? ................................................................................... 193
   Clearing the Head ............................................................................................ 194
   Noticing ............................................................................................................ 195
   Jindabyne Settlement Day .............................................................................. 196
   Colour and Space, Movement and Magnificence ......................................... 198
   Not Now! .......................................................................................................... 199
   Making Connections in The Big Apple ............................................................ 201
   Losing Contact in Order to Make Connections ............................................. 205
   “It’s Not the Destination that Counts, but the Journey” .................................. 206
   Place, Space, Peers and Mutuality .................................................................. 208
   My Head’s Full!: Stuck in the Mire of Reflecting Upon Reflection ............ 211
   Reflecting Upon Facilitation of Reflection .................................................... 213
   Too Busy ‘Doing’ to Think and Learn .............................................................. 213
   Feedback and The Big Picture ....................................................................... 215
   Why Is Your View Important? ........................................................................ 216
   What is Knowledge and Learning? ................................................................. 217
   A Sense of Being ............................................................................................... 218
   Supervisors, What Supervisors? ...................................................................... 219
   Slowing Things Down to Create the Space .................................................... 220
   “Remember, if it is Jazz it only happens once!” ............................................ 221
   Seeing What I Need to See ............................................................................. 222
   Like Climbing a Mountain .............................................................................. 223
   More of the Same? ............................................................................................ 225
   Creating That Space For Me .......................................................................... 226
   Who Stole the Time? ........................................................................................ 227

4.3. Conclusion: And the Point is … ? .................................................................. 228
Chapter 5.  So What?: Insights from Others

5.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 229

5.2. Pilot Studies .......................................................................................................... 230
  5.2.1. Pilot Study 1: MGMT 908, 1999 ................................................................. 230
  5.2.2. Pilot Study 2: NRG, 1999 .............................................................................. 232
  5.2.3. Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 233

5.3. Gaining Insight through the ‘Lens’ of the LSA .................................................... 233
  5.3.1. Introduction .................................................................................................... 233
  5.3.2. MGMT 908, 2001 ........................................................................................ 233
  5.3.3. MGMT 946: Personal Learning: The Reflective Manager, 2002 ............... 237
  5.3.4. EDGP 912/3: Facilitation Techniques in Outdoor Education .................... 238
  5.3.5. Insights from the Learning Style Analysis ................................................. 241

5.4. NRG Interviews, 2002 .......................................................................................... 250
  5.4.1. ‘Lane’ ............................................................................................................. 250
  5.4.2. ‘Anne’ ............................................................................................................ 250
  5.4.3. Discussion ..................................................................................................... 251

5.5. Survey of Workshop Participants ....................................................................... 252
  5.5.1. Introduction .................................................................................................... 252
  5.5.2. Results .......................................................................................................... 252
  5.5.3. Discussion ..................................................................................................... 258

5.6. Moving Forward ..................................................................................................... 259

Chapter 6.  What Else?: Exploring Other Perspectives ............................................... 260

6.1. Introduction .......................................................................................................... 260

6.2. Dominant Themes in the Literature: A Journey to Explore the
Development of Thought on Facilitation ..................................................................... 261
  6.2.1. Recommended Readings: A Request to ‘outres’ ......................................... 262
  6.2.2. Images in the Literature ............................................................................... 267

6.3. Deconstructing The Five Generations of Facilitated Learning from
Adventure Experiences ............................................................................................... 272
  6.3.1. Deconstruction: A Lay Perspective ............................................................... 272
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td>Karpin Report: Task Force’s Vision</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>Karpin Report: Management Development System</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-1</td>
<td>Thesis Time Frame</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-2</td>
<td>MGMT 908 1999 Proposed Pilot Process</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>Cottesloe Beach Hotel</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Dimensions of Experiential Education</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-3</td>
<td>The Outdoor Development Matrix</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-4</td>
<td>HRD Process Model</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5</td>
<td>Ebbinghaus’s Curve of Forgetting, 1880’s</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-6</td>
<td>The Funnel</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-7</td>
<td>A Typology of Debriefing Modes</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-8</td>
<td>Onion Model</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-9</td>
<td>Integrating Models</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-10</td>
<td>4MAT System Model</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-11</td>
<td>Kolb’s Learning Style Grid</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-12</td>
<td>Rotated LSQ placed on LSI</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-13</td>
<td>Honey and Mumford’s Learning Cycle</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>View from a Room, Jindabyne</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td><em>The Persistence of Memory</em></td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-3</td>
<td><em>Rind</em></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-4</td>
<td><em>Relativity</em></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>Searching for a Methodology</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-6</td>
<td>Larson Cartoon</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-7</td>
<td>Full of ‘Stuff’</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8</td>
<td>Room for More</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-1</td>
<td>‘Best’ Facilitation Articles</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-2</td>
<td>Schoel, Prouty and Radcliffe, 1988:162</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-3</td>
<td>Luckner and Nadler, 1997:98</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-4</td>
<td>Luckner and Nadler, 1997:102</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-5</td>
<td>Luckner and Nadler, 1997:109</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-6</td>
<td>Priest and Gass, 1997:189</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-7</td>
<td>Production Line Facilitation</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1-1 Thesis Questions .............................................................................................................23
Table 1-2 Developmental Model of Positive Feminist Identity ......................................................25
Table 2-1 Representative Sample of Elements of Research Process .............................................48
Table 2-2 Research Paradigms .......................................................................................................49
Table 2-3 Data Sources, Sample Sizes and Methods ....................................................................53
Table 2-4 Degree Enrolments of Students .....................................................................................65
Table 2-5 Gender and Nationality Distribution .............................................................................65
Table 2-6 MGMT 908, 1999 Interview Questions ........................................................................67
Table 2-7 Profile of MGMT 908, 2001 Participants ......................................................................73
Table 2-8 Profile of MGMT 946, 2002 Participants ......................................................................74
Table 2-9 Profile of EDGP 912/3, 2002 Participants ....................................................................75
Table 2-10 Workshop Survey Demographic Data .........................................................................78
Table 2-11 Workshop Survey Nationalities ..................................................................................79
Table 2-12 Conventional Disciplined Inquiry Methods That Closely Match Four Major Types of Research Questions ..............................................................................86
Table 2-13 Links with the Phases of the Heuristic Research Process ...........................................93
Table 3-1 Activities Used in Outdoor Programs ............................................................................126
Table 3-2 Skill Areas to be Developed ..........................................................................................128
Table 3-3 Heron’s Facilitator Styles ...............................................................................................147
Table 3-4 Personal Development Media ........................................................................................156
Table 3-5 Learning Styles Inventories ............................................................................................170
Table 5-1 MGMT 908, 1999: LSA Preferences, Non-preferences and Flexibilities ......................231
Table 5-2 MGMT 908, 1999 Summary of Sensory Modality Preferences ......................................232
Table 5-3 Comparison of MGMT 908 Groups .............................................................................234
Table 5-4 MGMT 908 Wollongong, 2001: LSA Group Results: Preferences, Non-preferences and Flexibilities .................................................................................................235
Table 5-5 MGMT 908 Sydney, 2001: LSA Group Results: Preferences, Non-preferences and Flexibilities .....................................................................................................................236
Table 5-6 MGMT 946, 2002 Preferences, Flexibilities, Non-Preferences .....................................239
Table 5-7 EDGP 912/3, 2002 LSA Group Results: Preferences, Flexibilities, Non-Preferences ..........240
Table 5-8 Learning Styles Analysis Participants .............................................................................241
Table 5-9 Notable Differences in Learning Style Preferences .......................................................242
Table 5-10 Learning Style Analysis All Results: Preferences .........................................................243
Table 5-11 Learning Style Analysis All Results: Non-Preferences ................................................244
Table 5-12 Learning Style Analysis All Results: Flexibilities .........................................................245
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5-13 Client Groups</th>
<th>253</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-14 Working Environment</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-15 Average Program Length</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-16 Average Group Size</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-17 Previous Study of Learning Styles</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-18 Preferred Learning Styles</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-19 Activities Participated In</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5-20 Reflective Activities Used</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6-1 Demographic Information About Recommended Authors</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6-2 References in Articles on Facilitation</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6-3 Difference Between East and West</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6-4 Banking Concept of Education</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6-5 Educational Dialectics</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preface: I am different, this I know, because my reflection tells me so.

I am left-handed. All my life I have been left-handed. My mother related a story to me about when, as a child, colouring in I would use my right hand (possibly mimicking the rest of my family) but when I needed to colour-in near the lines I would ask if I could use my left-hand (no postmodern colouring in for me, got to keep within the lines!). Left-handedness is not new in my family; I have a Grandfather, a Great-aunt and cousin who are also left-handed.

Even though I am left-handed I believe I see the world much as anyone else does: I see people demonstrating skills in a right-handed way, eating in a right-handed way, living a right-handed way. I even learnt to crochet with my right-hand because my sister could only show me how to do it with her right hand. When I look into the mirror when cleaning my teeth it looks like I am right-handed, even though I use my left-hand. The reflection is not true of my experience. It is merely my reflection, it is not necessarily my reality. What we think we see may not be what we experience, nor may it be our reality. What we don’t see may be more real. This is well expressed by J. K. Rowling describing Harry Potter looking into the Mirror of Erised:

There he was, reflected in it, white and scared-looking, and there, reflected behind him, were at least ten others. Harry looked over his shoulder – but still, no one was there. Or were they all invisible, too? Was he in fact in a room full of invisible people and this mirror’s trick was that it reflected them, invisible or not? (Rowling, 1997: 208)

In looking for answers about the Mirror, Harry consults Professor Dumbledore:

Harry thought. Then he said slowly, ‘It shows us what we want … whatever we want…’

‘Yes and no’ said Dumbledore quietly. ‘It shows us nothing more or less than the deepest, most desperate desire of our hearts. … However, this mirror will give us neither knowledge or truth. Men have wasted away before it, entranced by what they have seen, or driven mad, not knowing if what it shows is real or even possible. It does not do to dwell on dreams and forget to live, remember that (Rowling, 1997:213-4)

Dumbledore’s advice could well apply to doing a PhD!
As a left-handed person I experience the world differently. The photocopier button is always on my right side, so as I stand and photocopy pages from a book I place the book with my right-hand and press the button with my left. Why don’t I change? You try and do it with your other hand! Turning on a tap can be a risky business as I use my dominant hand, my left hand, and reach for the tap – which usually is the left-hand tap, the hot tap. Computer mice are designed for right-handed people, the numeric pad on the keyboard is on the right, scissors and knives are for right-handed people. There seems to be a right-handed conspiracy against me and my minority left-handed brethren, even to the extent that they could be limiting our learning by simply having desks in lecture theatres designed for right-handed people. We are not encouraged to question the correctness of this right-handed world. Technology is produced for the masses, not for individual need.

Historically left-handedness has been derided and as Edwards (1979:33) notes:

> Throughout human history, terms with connotations of *good* for right-handed/left hemisphere and connotations of *bad* for left-handed/right hemisphere appear in most languages around the world. The Latin word for left is *sinister* ... The French word for ‘left’ ... is *gauche* ... for right is *droit* ... in English, ‘left’ comes from the Anglo-Saxon *lyft*, meaning ‘weak’ or worthless’ ... the Anglo-Saxon word for ‘right’, *reht* ... meant ‘straight’ or ‘just’.

Derogatory terms such as cacky-handed and goofy-footed convey the image that we are evil or not normal, a position that has existed for centuries; we are the original ‘others’ as acknowledged by Edwards (1979). Teachers have tried to ‘correct’ our ways by tying left-hands behind backs, or hitting students over the knuckles. Even as a student in 3rd class my sewing teacher told me that if I had been at school when she was a student I would not have been allowed to remain left-handed. But why? That is how I was born. No one made me that way, so why should I change? Yet, as we look at the world of learning, and of particular focus in this context, experiential learning, it would seem that the dominant forces are trying to control the less powerful minority. The ones with the loudest voices, the ones with the most political, academic and/or publishing muscle are telling us how to learn. But maybe I and others were born to learn differently from their way. Maybe, by just being me I won’t fit into their models.
What follows is my journey of exploration of how I learn and a consideration of the implications for facilitating experiential learning programs for those of us who don't fit the dominant models (e.g. Gass and Gillis, 1995; Kolb, 1984; Priest, Gass and Gillis, 2000; Priest and Naismith, 1993). This is a chance for the 'others' to rise and be the 'ones', the dominant voices. But even as I seek to raise the voice of the 'others', it is in the knowledge that the context within which I write and operate may not be interested in listening to those voices, for as Edwards notes when recalling Archimedes' moment of insight in his bath:

This, then, is the right-hemisphere mode: the intuitive, subjective, relational, holistic, time-free mode. This is also the disdained, weak, left-handed mode which in our culture has been generally ignored. For example, most of our educational system has been designed to cultivate the verbal, rational, on-time left hemisphere, while half of the brain of every student is virtually neglected (Edwards, 1979:36).

Springs Within – Reflections on a Dam

The mighty Snowy River has been dammed for years; dammed by a wall of good intentions and scientific models. The good intentions have created much success and wealth with the substantial hydro-electric scheme, but the scientific models forgot to look at the others who do not fit the model - those who do not want their life source dammed and redirected. The beauty of Lake Jindabyne that I see before me as I sit in my study is a result of that damn dam. The structure was built to make some lives better, but at the expense of others. It is too late to remove the dam, but if we acknowledge the impact of the dam and begin to see what negative effects occur downstream with decreased water flows impacting upon the environment, farmers and communities, we can begin to change.

Models of learning can also be well-intentioned structures that may stop the flow of creativity and limit the way people see the world. The models need to be seen for what they are, but they must also be seen for what they are not. Within each of us lies a deep spring. Fresh, clean water full of ideas, creativity and new life. Into that spring is thrown the refuse of good intentions and bright ideas. Models and pseudo-science applied to a source unbound by theories. To let the spring flow, to allow the creativity and new ideas to emerge into the light, the refuse and wastes of past lives, bad experiences and imposed models need to be removed, the dam needs to be broken to let the spring flow.