Social welfare aspects of development in a transition economy: application to Vietnam

Dzung The Nguyen
University of Wollongong

Recommended Citation

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
SOCIAL WELFARE ASPECTS OF DEVELOPMENT
IN A TRANSITION ECONOMY: APPLICATION TO
VIETNAM

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

Dzung The Nguyen

BA & MA, Moscow Mining Institute

Department of Economics
University of Wollongong, Australia

2001
To Binh Thanh and Thanh Chau
AUTHOR'S CERTIFICATION

I, Dzung The Nguyen, certify that this thesis has not been submitted as a part of the requirements of another degree and that it is the product of my own independent research.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis and all sources used have been acknowledged in the thesis.

Signed

[Signature]

11 July 2001
Abstract

Social welfare aspects of development in the transition from a centrally planned system to a market driven economy are of increasing theoretical and practical interest. However, this subject area is characterised by a number of important knowledge gaps concerning both essential concepts of social welfare and methodologies of its exploration, which are magnified by the fundamental changes introduced in the transition process. Specific features due to geography and history add to the complexity.

This thesis represents an attempt at reducing the gaps by developing an innovative conceptual framework and methodological tools for studying social welfare in a developing transition economy and applying them for the empirical analysis of the impact of Vietnam’s transition on its welfare. The main contribution of this thesis is two-fold. In terms of methodological development, it introduces an innovative framework for analysis of social welfare during the transition and develops an intertemporal CGE model with rational expectations and an econometric model for the quantitative analysis of social welfare conditions and the social welfare system, respectively. In terms of empirical work, the thesis has applied qualitative and quantitative methodologies to analyse recent changes in Vietnam’s social welfare conditions and social welfare systems.

The analysis has unveiled important insights into recent evolution of Vietnam’s social welfare and its dynamics, which lead to a number of important conclusions. Firstly, it has been established quantitatively that Vietnam’s transition has produced dramatic changes in social welfare in Vietnam. The chosen transition strategy is appropriate for the country’s conditions. However, the transition and welfare policies are not always optimal. Within the chosen transition strategy, the country can obtain greater improvement in living standards by accelerating economic reforms, particularly in the areas of market liberalisation and ownership reform.

There is an urgent need to deepen the reform of the social welfare system, which is still lagging behind reform efforts in other areas and produces limited effects on household welfare. To address the social welfare problems facing Vietnam, such as continuing wide-spread poverty, growing inequality and insecurity, and limited effectiveness of the existing social welfare system, the reform measures should aim at improving targeting of public transfer schemes at the most needy such as the poor, the ethnic minorities, and vulnerable groups and introducing new more selective instruments such as unemployment benefits. Moreover, the analysis confirms the appropriateness of the newly developed methodology for analysis of social welfare under the transition.

Chapter 2 clarifies concepts of social welfare in a transition economy. Having made a clear distinction between social welfare conditions (SWC) and the social welfare system (SWS) – two interlinked aspects of social welfare, the thesis provides a comprehensive review of literature on existing research methodology, studies done on the subject, and identified a number of knowledge gaps to be addressed.

In chapter 3, the thesis introduces an innovative analytical framework, which views the transition as the expansion of people’s choices of their occupation,
consumption, and investment and considers social welfare in terms of opulence, equality, and security. These allow studying the two aspects of social welfare in an integrated and interactive manner.

Based on the analytical framework, this chapter also develops theoretical basis for quantitative analysis of social welfare during the transition through modelling social welfare conditions and the social welfare system in a developing transition economy. The former model distinguishes itself by the combination of neoclassical intertemporal profit and utility optimisation of respective agents with various structuralist features of the developing transition economy, the introduction of HDI-like utility function and rational expectations, and the focus on welfare aspects. The novelty of the former is that it takes into account both public and private transfers as integrated and interacting elements of the social welfare system in a developing transition economy. A theoretical exploration of social welfare aspects of the transition on the models has unveiled that while in general the long-run impact of the transition on social welfare conditions is positive, it may result in short-term production contraction and worsening living standards, depending on the initial conditions and adopted transition policies. Concerning the social welfare system, public transfers may be of impure altruism and crowd out the private transfers. In general, public transfers and the SWS in general have a limited role and cannot replace a rapid and equitable growth in maintaining living standards during the transition.

Next, the study reports a qualitative analysis of changes in social welfare during Vietnam's transition. Chapter 4 focuses on the impact of the transition on social welfare conditions. The chapter reviews the transition process in Vietnam in comparison with other transition countries. It concludes that in contrast with almost other transition countries, Vietnam's transition has produced not only remarkable production gains and increasing macroeconomic stability, but also a rapid improvement of living standards. However, as predicted by the theoretical analysis, this is accompanied by growing, although still slightly, inequality and insecurity.

Chapter 5 offers a qualitative analysis of the response of Vietnam's social welfare system to the increasing need for social protection and assistance during the transition. The analysis points that Vietnam's social protection system is primarily designed for public employees and focuses on urban areas. The system is characterised by limited number of instruments, restricted coverage, benefits, and efficiency. However, there are innovative efforts to address the need of the most destitute, including working and non-working poor. Other pillars of Vietnam's social welfare system, such as labour and employment policies, education and health care, are also considered. In general, the effectiveness of the system still limited due to its slow response to the new economic environment, weak targeting, and lack of resources.

Chapter 6 is devoted to a quantitative analysis of social welfare in the transition. The thesis demonstrates how an intertemporal model of SWC with rational expectations and an econometric model of SWS can be built on the basis of the methodological development and applied for practical quantitative analysis of social welfare in a developing country such as Vietnam. The former represents the first intertemporal CGE model of Vietnam's transition economy. Six policy experiments with different transition and welfare scenarios provide additional insights into welfare dynamics of Vietnam's transition. In particular, they confirm that different transition policies tend to produce different effects on SWC and long-term impacts can be quite different from short-term ones. Next, the modelling has established quantitatively that
while the transition strategy chosen is relevant and has resulted in a remarkable improvement in SWC, they are not optimal. Fostering the reform process, particularly through accelerating market liberalisation and ownership reform, certainly leads to more impressive achievements. However, the transition policies are interlinked and need to be carried out coherently. Further, as improvement of SWC in the transition economy is positively linked with the development of the non-state sector, the latter is most critical for further enhancement of living standards and poverty reduction. Moreover, SWC is better off from more targeted social policies such as the establishment of unemployment benefits while “populist” policies such as lump-sum public transfers do not produce the effect.

The analysis of the econometric model of the social welfare system also has unveiled a number of important issues facing Vietnam’s existing SWS. In support of the qualitative analysis in chapter 5, the quantitative analysis has established that the existing public transfer schemes produce statistically quite insignificant impacts on the welfare of Vietnamese households in general and recipient household in particular. Only poverty reduction assistance – a relatively recently emerging scheme – represents an exception by making statistically significant impacts on household welfare. Next, contrary to social security, social assistance and poverty reduction assistance are impure altruistic and, thus, require recipients’ service in return. It has also confirmed that the social protection system is weakly targeted at the most needy, in particular the poor, those affected by disasters, and the vulnerable. Next, private transfers play an essential role in Vietnam’s SWS but they are crowded out by public transfers, although slightly. More important, as private transfers deteriorate as a result of covariate risks and irregularities, such as natural disasters, there is a need to strengthen the formal SWS, particularly public transfer schemes. However, Vietnam SWS reform appears still lagging behind reform measures in other areas and this creates an additional constraint to the on-going reform process. The above also represents direction for future reform of Vietnam’s SWS and social policies, in general.

The thesis is concluded by chapter 7, which summarises major findings and conclusions of the thesis. Moreover, it discusses existing limitations of the study and suggests future research in this subject.

The thesis utilises existing time series of macroeconomic data and cross-section data accumulated by both national and international agencies as well as the data collected under the two consecutive Government/World Bank/UNDP/SIDA Living Standards Measurement Surveys in 1992-93 and 1997-98. The data sets are complemented by other data collected from the Vietnamese Government’s regular household surveys, census and sectoral surveys conducted by line ministries such as labour, education, health, agriculture and rural development, as well as data collected by international organizations such as the World Bank, IMF, UNDP, UNICEF, FAO ILO and EU and the NGO community in Vietnam.
Acknowledgement

It is my great privilege to express my deep sense of gratitude to my supervising teachers, Professor DP Chaudhri and Professor Rob Castle, to whom no acknowledgement can give full credit for their valuable guidance and unselfish support throughout my doctoral program. I am particularly indebted to Professor Chaudhri for the intellectual inspiration, which he gave me generously through our frequent discussions not only on the thesis’s topics but also on a wide range of issues of contemporary development economics. My special debt is also owed to Professor Castle for his sustained encouragement and tremendous help, particularly by subjecting my works to his thoughtful scrutiny through all stages of this investigation.

I gratefully acknowledge the financial support provided by the National Australia Bank and the Department of Economics of the University of Wollongong, without which this study would not have been possible. I am particularly honoured to have been awarded the National Australia Bank’s PhD fellowship.

I am also especially grateful to Ass. Professor Tran Van Hoa for his constructive criticism and invaluable advice on econometric aspects of this study. The friendship and hospitality he kindly extended to me made my stay at the University of Wollongong a great experience.

I also would like to express my appreciation to a number of other individuals who have supported me in various stages of this study and left their imprints in my thinking. Particularly, the intellectual interactions with Professor David Dapice, International Development Institute, Harvard University during our work under the United Nations’ studies on poverty in Vietnam in 1995-96 inspired me to engage in this PhD programme. In the early stage, I also greatly benefited from the involvement of Ass. Professor Charles Harvie, whose extensive knowledge about transition economies and professionalism were extremely helpful for shaping respective parts of this research programme. Professor Peter Dixon and Dr. Ho Van Thiep, Centre of Policy Studies/IMPACT Project at Monash University, were extremely supportive and provided unselfishly valuable insights into intertemporal CGE modelling and the GEMPACK software package. Dr. Paul Chen, Faculty of Economics and Commerce, Australian National University, gave constructive comments on an early draft of various parts concerning the social welfare system.

In various stages of research, I had privilege to work with several outstanding Vietnamese scholars and government officials as well as international consultants in areas related to the thesis’s topic. Among them, I would like to express my particular appreciation to Dr. Nguyen Xuan Nguyen, Deputy Director, Economic Department, VCP’s Central Committee, Dr. Nguyen Hai Hieu, Director, Department of Social Protection, Ministry of Labour, Invalid and Social Affairs, and Dr. Preston, ILO consultant on social security. For this privilege, I am most grateful to UNDP Hanoi, especially my former colleagues, Mr. Edouard Wattez, Resident Representative, and Ms. Minoli de Bresser, Assistant Resident Representative.

I also wish to extend my thankfulness to Ms. Sophie Abercrombie, Administrative Assistant, Department of Economics, University of Wollongong, for her effective administrative support. The research facilities provided by Mr. Wolfgang Brodesser, Professional Officer in Department of Economics, and Merss. Justin Norris, Administrative Assistant, Dean Trifunovich, Computer Systems Officer, and Laszlo
Abel, Desktop Support Officer, in the Faculty of Commerce of the University of Wollongong were excellent and I am extremely grateful for these.

My personal thanks are due to my Australian old friends, Mrs and Mr. Samaras, for the continual encouragement and thoughtfulness they extended to my family and me.

Last, but not least, I owe a debt of great gratitude to my loving wife and daughter for their understanding, patience and moral support.

Dzung The Nguyen
University of Wollongong
Autumn 12/07/2001
Table of contents

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................. i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT ........................................................................................... V
TABLE OF CONTENTS ............................................................................................ VII
LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................................. XI
LIST OF TABLES ..................................................................................................... XIII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ....................................................................................... XV

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................... 1

SECTION 1.1 PROBLEMS TO BE ADDRESSED ...................................................... 1
SECTION 1.2 OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE THESIS ................................. 4
SECTION 1.3 STUDY METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 5
SECTION 1.4 PLAN OF THE THESIS ...................................................................... 7
SECTION 1.7 CHAPTER SUMMARY ....................................................................... 9

CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON SOCIAL WELFARE AND
ECONOMIC TRANSITION ...................................................................................... 11

SECTION 2.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................... 11
SECTION 2.2 THEORETICAL CONCEPTS, BOUNDARIES, AND METHODOLOGIES .... 11
2.2.1 Social welfare: definitions and boundaries .................................................. 11
   A. Social welfare conditions ................................................................................. 11
   B. Social welfare system ...................................................................................... 12
2.2.2 Social welfare conditions: methodologies .................................................. 15
   A. Measurement and judgment about social welfare conditions ........................... 15
   B. Approaches to studying social welfare conditions .......................................... 18
      a. Traditional approach .................................................................................... 18
      b. Social choice approach ................................................................................ 20
2.2.3. Social welfare system: principles and typologies ....................................... 23
   A. The concept and principles.............................................................................. 23
   B. Typology of the social welfare system ............................................................ 26
2.2.4 The economic transition ............................................................................. 33
   A. The concept .................................................................................................... 33
   B. Factors influencing the transition ................................................................... 34
      a. Initial conditions .......................................................................................... 34
      b. Alternative transition strategies and policies ................................................. 35
SECTION 2.3 REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON SOCIAL WELFARE CONDITIONS DURING THE
TRANSITION ........................................................................................................... 38
2.3.1 Literature on outcomes of the transition ...................................................... 38
2.3.2 Literature on impact of the transition on social welfare conditions ............. 44
2.3.3 Review of other related significant contributions ......................................... 49
2.3.4 Summary and conclusion ............................................................................ 55
SECTION 2.4 REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON THE SOCIAL WELFARE SYSTEM DURING THE
TRANSITION ........................................................................................................... 56
2.4.1 Literature on the social welfare system in transition economies ..................... 56
2.4.2 Review of other related methodological contributions .................................. 64
2.4.3 Summary and conclusion ............................................................................ 68
SECTION 2.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ................................. 69
CHAPTER 3 FORMULATION OF ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK AND THEORETICAL EXPLORATION OF SOCIAL WELFARE IMPACT OF THE TRANSITION

SECTION 3.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 70
SECTION 3.2 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK .................................................................................. 71
  3.2.1 The economic transition ............................................................................................... 72
  3.2.2 Social welfare conditions ............................................................................................ 75
  3.2.3 Social welfare system .................................................................................................. 80
  3.2.4 Transition and social welfare: Effects of initial conditions ........................................ 83
SECTION 3.3 THEORETICAL MODELS AND EXPLORATION OF SOCIAL WELFARE EFFECTS OF THE TRANSITION ........................................................................................................... 84
  3.3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 84
  3.3.2 Model of occupation and consumption choices and social welfare conditions during the transition ........................................................................................................................................... 85
    A. The model ....................................................................................................................... 85
    a. Key assumptions ........................................................................................................... 85
    b. Occupational choices and static changes in social welfare conditions ................... 86
    c. Consumption choices and welfare dynamics during the transition ......................... 100
    B. Effects of the transition ................................................................................................. 113
    a. Effects of economic liberalisation ................................................................................. 114
    b. Effects of the ownership reform .................................................................................. 117
    c. Effects of restructuring ............................................................................................... 119
    d. Effects of macroeconomic policies ............................................................................. 122
  3.3.3 Model of social welfare system and its comparative statistics ........................................ 125
    A. Public transfers ............................................................................................................. 129
    a. Altruistic transfers ......................................................................................................... 134
    b. Exchange transfers ........................................................................................................ 135
    c. Transfers incidence ....................................................................................................... 137
    d. Institutional aspects of public transfers ...................................................................... 138
    e. Distribution effects of public transfers ........................................................................ 140
    B. Private transfers ............................................................................................................ 141
    C. Interactions between public and private transfers ...................................................... 142
    D. The transfers and the transition .................................................................................... 145
    a. Transfers and poverty .................................................................................................... 145
    b. Institutional changes ..................................................................................................... 148
SECTION 3.4 DATA ORGANISATION AND CONSOLIDATION ..................................................... 152
  3.4.1 Sources of data ........................................................................................................... 152
  3.4.2 Data consolidation and verification ............................................................................ 153
SECTION 3.5 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ......................................................................... 157

CHAPTER 4 SOCIAL WELFARE CONDITIONS DURING VIETNAM'S ECONOMIC TRANSITION

SECTION 4.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................... 161
SECTION 4.2 OVERVIEW OF VIETNAM'S TRANSITION ............................................................. 161
  4.2.1 Initial conditions for Vietnam's transition ................................................................... 161
  4.2.2 Milestones of the transition ....................................................................................... 164
  4.2.3 Comparative analysis of Vietnam's transition ............................................................ 169
    A. Goals ............................................................................................................................ 170
    B. Progress of Vietnam's transition in key areas ............................................................ 171
    C. Macroeconomic development ..................................................................................... 172
Table of Contents

4.2.4 Transition outcome and its causes............................................. 182
4.2.5 Challenges to Vietnam's transition............................................. 191

SECTION 4.3 ANALYSIS OF SOCIAL WELFARE DURING VIETNAM'S TRANSITION..... 194
4.3.1 Changes in opulence indicators............................................. 195
4.3.2 Changes in output-oriented indicators..................................... 200
4.3.3 Changes in equality................................................................. 202
4.3.4 Changes in Human Development Indicators................................. 202

SECTION 4.4 CHAPTER SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS................................ 203

CHAPTER 5 SOCIAL WELFARE SYSTEM DURING VIETNAM'S ECONOMIC TRANSITION ................................................................. 205
SECTION 5.1 INTRODUCTION...................................................................... 205
SECTION 5.2 CHANGES IN THE SOCIAL PROTECTION SYSTEM......................... 205
5.2.1 The development........................................................................... 205
5.2.2 Comparative analysis of Vietnam's social protection system.............. 209
5.2.3 Instruments and their coverage..................................................... 213
A. Social security................................................................................. 213
   a. Social insurance........................................................................... 213
   b. Preferential treatment of war veterans........................................ 216
B. Social assistance:............................................................................ 217
   a. The Social Guarantee Fund for Regular Relief.............................. 217
   b. Contingency Fund for Pre Harvest Starvation and Disaster Relief.... 221
C. Poverty reduction assistance.......................................................... 224
E. Institutional aspects of Vietnam's social protection system.................... 234
5.2.4 Micro analysis of efficiency and effectiveness of selected instruments... 234
SECTION 5.3 CHANGES IN LABOUR AND EMPLOYMENT POLICIES..................... 243
5.3.1 Labor supply:................................................................................ 247
5.3.2 Changes in employment.............................................................. 248
SECTION 5.4 CHANGES IN EDUCATION POLICIES..................................... 250
SECTION 5.5 CHANGES IN THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM............................... 253
SECTION 5.8 CHAPTER SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS................................. 256

CHAPTER 6 MODELLING SOCIAL WELFARE IMPACTS OF THE TRANSITION AND POLICY SIMULATION......................................................... 259
SECTION 6.1 INTRODUCTION.................................................................... 259
SECTION 6.2 MODELLING DYNAMICS OF SOCIAL WELFARE CONDITION IN THE TRANSITION ECONOMY......................................................... 260
6.2.1 Finalising dynamic model of occupation and consumption choices...... 260
   A. Dynamics of investment............................................................... 260
   B. Household expenditures and saving............................................. 262
   C. Expectations................................................................................. 264
   D. Macro balances............................................................................ 265
6.2.2 Model implementation and calibration........................................... 267
   A. Solution strategy............................................................................ 267
   B. Data .............................................................................................. 270
   C. Model estimation and calibration.................................................. 275
      a. Estimation of the production functions...................................... 275
b. Estimation of the household human capital and wage earning functions 276

c. The model calibration ......................................................... 277

6.2.3 Policy simulation ......................................................... 285

A. Choice of transition paths ................................................ 287

a. The gradual approach vs the shock therapy .......................... 287

b. Effect of ownership reform .............................................. 291

B. Choice of redistribution instruments .................................. 292

b. Imposing an increase in public transfers to the control scenario 296

6.2.4 Discussion ................................................................. 298

SECTION 6.3 ECONOMETRIC MODELLING OF VIETNAM’S SOCIAL PROTECTION SYSTEM

6.3.1 Sources of data and data transformation .......................... 301

6.3.2 Specification of the econometric model ............................ 306

6.3.3 Results of estimation .................................................. 314

A. Social security transfers .................................................. 315

B. Social assistance transfers ............................................... 319

C. Poverty reduction assistance ............................................ 322

D. Private transfers given ................................................... 325

E. Private transfer receipt ................................................... 327

F. Overall impacts of the SWS on household welfare .................. 330

G. Welfare impacts of public transfers schemes ........................ 333

6.3.4 Discussion ................................................................. 340

SECTION 6.5 CHAPTER SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ................... 343

CHAPTER 7 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS .................................. 347

SECTION 7.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 347

SECTION 7.2 MAIN ACHIEVEMENTS AND CONCLUSIONS ................ 348

SECTION 7.3 LIMITATIONS AND SOME PROPOSALS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH ...................... 355

APPENDICES ........................................................................ 360

ANNEX. 1. LIST OF EQUATIONS AND VARIABLES IN THE MODEL OF SOCIAL WELFARE
CONDITIONS IN A TRANSITION ECONOMY ................................. 360

A. The equations ................................................................. 360

B. The variables and parameters ............................................ 363

ANNEX. 2. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERTEMPORAL MODEL OF SOCIAL WELFARE
CONDITION DURING VIETNAM’S TRANSITION ............................ 365

A. GEMPACK codes .............................................................. 365

B. GEMPACK command file for simulation of social welfare impacts of the transition .... 375

LIST OF REFERENCES ......................................................... 377
List of figures

FIGURE 1. VIEWS ON SOCIAL WELFARE CONDITIONS .............................................................. 18
FIGURE 2. FRAMEWORK FOR STUDY OF SOCIAL WELFARE CONDITIONS AND THE SOCIAL WELFARE SYSTEM DURING TRANSITION ................................................. 72
FIGURE 3. WELFARE DYNAMICS OF CAPITALISTS COMPARED WITH OTHERS .................. 110
FIGURE 4. WELFARE DYNAMICS OF WORKERS ................................................................... 112
FIGURE 5. TWO-SECTOR EQUILIBRIUM IN A PRE-TRANSITION ECONOMY ......................... 115
FIGURE 6. EFFECTS OF REMOVING RESTRICTIONS ON EMPLOYMENT AND WAGES .... 116
FIGURE 7. THE DYNAMICS OF TOTAL PRODUCTION RELATIVE TO THE NON-STATE SECTOR’S SHARES IN TOTAL CAPITAL AND LABOUR ..................................................... 119
FIGURE 8. EFFECTS OF STATE SECTOR’S RESTRUCTURING ................................................... 120
FIGURE 9. HOUSEHOLD WELFARE DYNAMICS AND TAX AND PUBLIC TRANSFERS ........ 123
FIGURE 10. SOCIAL WELFARE OPTIMISATION & MOTIVES OF PUBLIC TRANSFERS .......... 131
FIGURE 11. CHANGE IN RECIPIENT’S INCOME AND PUBLIC TRANSFERS ......................... 133
FIGURE 12. OUTLINE OF AN ANNUAL SOCIAL ACCOUNTING MATRIX FOR VIETNAM ...... 155
FIGURE 14. PROGRESS OF VIETNAM’S TRANSITION COMPARED WITH OTHER TRANSITION ECONOMIES, 1986-99 .......................................................... 171
FIGURE 15. NONSTATE SECTOR OUTPUT AS PERCENTAGE OF GDP .................................. 176
FIGURE 16. TREND IN GDP GROWTH, 1990-98 ................................................................... 184
FIGURE 17. VIETNAM’S OUTPUT PERFORMANCE AND PROGRESS IN STRUCTURAL REFORM COMPARED WITH OTHER TRANSITION ECONOMIES, 1989-1999 .................. 187
FIGURE 18. VIETNAM: ANNUAL PER CAPITA FOOD GRAIN PRODUCTION (KG/PERSON), 1979-98 ........................................................................................................... 188
FIGURE 19. VIETNAM: PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION IN 1998 PRICES, D000’, 1992-98 .... 197
FIGURE 20. VIETNAM: FOOD POVERTY RATES, % TOTAL POPULATION, 1992-98 .......... 198
FIGURE 21. RELATIVE SIZES OF COMPONENTS BY THEIR SHARE IN TOTAL FUNDS IN THE PROGRAMME FINANCIAL PLAN:, 1998-2000 .................................................. 229
FIGURE 22. LORENZ CURVES FOR INCOME AND TRANSFERS .......................................... 242
FIGURE 23. DISTRIBUTION OF VIETNAM’S LABOUR FORCE BY AGE GROUP, 1996 ........ 247
FIGURE 24. VIETNAM: TOTAL GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURES FOR EDUCATION, HEALTH, AND SOCIAL PROTECTION, IN VND BILLIONS, 1995-2000 ................................. 255
FIGURE 25. STRUCTURE OF THE SWC MODEL ..................................................................... 269
FIGURE 27. THE MODEL’S RESPONSE TO AN INCREASE BY 5% IN INCOME TAX FROM YEAR 2 ...................................................................................................................... 279
FIGURE 28. THE MODEL’S RESPONSE TO AN INCREASE IN INVESTMENT SUBSIDY BY 5% FROM YEAR 2 ........................................................................................................... 280
FIGURE 29. THE MODEL’S RESPONSE TO AN INCREASE IN LUMP-SUM PUBLIC TRANSFERS BY 5% FROM YEAR 2 .................................................................................. 281
FIGURE 30. VIETNAM: CONTROL SCENARIO WITH ANNUAL 2% GROWTH OF LABOUR FORCE AND SLOW GRADUAL MARKET LIBERALISATION ........................................... 286
FIGURE 31. VIETNAM: EFFECTS OF A SHOCK-THERAPY APPROACH TO MARKET LIBERALISATION COMPARED WITH THE CONTROL SCENARIO .............................................. 288
FIGURE 32. VIETNAM: EFFECTS OF SPEEDING MARKET LIBERALISATION TO 1% PER ANNUM COMPARED WITH THE CONTROL SCENARIO ..................................................... 289
FIGURE 33. VIETNAM: EFFECTS OF PRIVATISATION OF 10% ASSETS OF THE STATE SECTOR IN YEAR 0 COMPARED WITH THE CONTROL SCENARIO ........................................ 293
FIGURE 34. VIETNAM: EFFECTS OF THE INTRODUCTION OF UNEMPLOYMENT BENEFITS AT THE LEVEL OF 10% OF THE MARKET RATE COMPARED WITH THE CONTROL SCENARIO

295

FIGURE 35. VIETNAM: EFFECTS OF 5% INCREASE IN PUBLIC TRANSFERS IN YEAR 2 COMPARED WITH THE CONTROL SCENARIO

297
List of tables

TABLE 1. COMPARISON OF TYPOLOGIES AND MODELS OF THE SOCIAL WELFARE SYSTEM 27
TABLE 2. TAXONOMY OF WELFARE DYNAMICS OF WORKERS ........................................... 112
TABLE 3. SUMMARY OF COMPARATIVE STATISTICS OF PUBLIC TRANSFERS .......................... 138
TABLE 4. SUMMARY OF COMPARATIVE STATISTICS OF PRIVATE TRANSFERS ....................... 142
TABLE 6. VIETNAM: ANNUAL AND AVERAGE GDP GROWTH BY PERIOD OF THE TRANSITION (1980-99) ................................................................. 165
TABLE 7. VIETNAM: MACROECONOMIC STABILISATION DURING THE TRANSITION, 1989-2000 .............................................. 166
TABLE 8. MAJOR REFORM MEASURES AND THEIR TIMING BY SUBJECT AREA ................. 168
TABLE 9. SELECTED CHARACTERISTICS OF VIETNAM’S TRANSITION COMPARED WITH OTHER TRANSITION ECONOMIES ......................................................... 170
TABLE 10. VIETNAM’S EBRD TRANSITION INDICATORS COMPARED WITH SELECTED TRANSITION ECONOMIES, 1999 .................................................. 177
TABLE 11. VIETNAM’S INDEX OF INSTITUTION QUALITY COMPARED WITH SELECTED TRANSITION ECONOMIES, 1999 ................................................ 181
TABLE 13. VIETNAM: SHARES OF OWNERSHIP SECTORS IN THE TOTAL GDP AND EMPLOYMENT 1980-99 ................................................................. 185
TABLE 15. VIETNAM: HOUSEHOLD PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION BY QUINTILE, D000’ IN 1998 PRICES, 1993-98 ......................................................... 196
TABLE 16. VIETNAM: HOUSEHOLD PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION IN 1998 PRICES BY GEOGRAPHICAL REGION, D000’, 1993-98 ........................................ 196
TABLE 17. VIETNAM: ACCESS TO SOCIAL SERVICES, 1980-98 ............................................ 200
TABLE 18. VIETNAM: SOCIAL WELFARE OUTPUT INDICATORS, 1980-98 ......................... 201
TABLE 19. HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX ................................................................. 202
TABLE 20. SOCIAL EXPENDITURES BY FUNCTIONS AS % OF GDP (1993) ......................... 210
TABLE 21. DYNAMICS OF SOCIAL EXPENDITURES BY FUNCTIONS AS % OF GDP (1993) ......................... 211
TABLE 22. DYNAMICS OF BENEFICIARIES BY TYPE OF BENEFITS AS % OF POPULATION (1993) ................................................................. 212
TABLE 23. NUMBERS OF BENEFICIARIES OF PENSION SCHEMES AS % OF TOTAL POPULATION .................................................................................. 216
TABLE 24. TRENDS IN COVERAGE OF REGULAR SOCIAL RELIEF .................................. 218
TABLE 25. SUPPLEMENTARY ASSISTANCE IN 1998 .................................................... 221
TABLE 26. ASSISTANCE TO SOCIO-MEDICAL PROBLEMATIC GROUPS .......................... 221
TABLE 27. DISASTER EXPENDITURE - MILLION DONG ................................................. 223
TABLE 28. PRE HARVEST STARVATION REPORTS ....................................................... 223
TABLE 29. PROGRAMMES AND POLICIES TO BE INTEGRATED .................................... 231
TABLE 30. VIETNAM: TARGETING OF SOCIAL WELFARE SCHEMES, % IN THE TOTAL NUMBER OF BENEFICIARIES, 1992-98 .................................. 236
TABLE 31. VIETNAM: TARGETING OF SOCIAL WELFARE SCHEMES PER RURAL/URBAN, % IN THE TOTAL NUMBER OF BENEFICIARIES, 1992-98 ................. 237
TABLE 32. VIETNAM’S SOCIAL PROTECTION: VERTICAL EFFICIENCY (% OF THE EQUIVALENT POVERTY LINE) ......................................................... 238
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 33</td>
<td>Vietnam: Effects of public transfers on income and poverty</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 34</td>
<td>Effectiveness of social protection as a whole</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 35</td>
<td>Distribution effect: Gini coefficients</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 36</td>
<td>Vietnam: Changes in structure of employment under the transition, 1986-99</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 37</td>
<td>Summary statistics of data for the estimation of the production functions</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 38</td>
<td>Summary statistics of data for the estimation of the HRD function</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 39</td>
<td>Summary statistics of data for the estimation of the wage earning functions</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 40</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of production functions per ownership sector</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 41</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of the household human capital function</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 42</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of HH wage earning functions</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 43</td>
<td>Vietnam: Summary statistics of the panel data used for estimation of transfer functions in period 1992-98</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 44</td>
<td>Vietnam: Changes in scope and average value of transfers, 1992-93 and 1997-98</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 45</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of social security transfer functions</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 46</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of social assistance transfer functions</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 47</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of poverty reduction assistance function</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 48</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of the private giving function</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 49</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of the private receipt function</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 50</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of the general impacts of SWS</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 51</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of impacts of social securities schemes</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 52</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of impacts of social assistance programmes</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 53</td>
<td>Vietnam: Estimates of impacts of poverty reductions programmes</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 54</td>
<td>Variables in the intertemporal model of social welfare conditions during Vietnam’s transition</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**List of Abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bill.</td>
<td>Billions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSS</td>
<td>Basic social services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEE(s)</td>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe or Central and Eastern European countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEMMA</td>
<td>Committee for Ethnic Minorities and Mountainous Areas (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE</td>
<td>Computable general equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIS(s)</td>
<td>Commonwealth of Independent States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMEA</td>
<td>Council for Mutual Economic Assistance and Cooperation (also COMECON)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPV</td>
<td>Communist Party of Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCED</td>
<td>Development in communes faced with extreme difficulties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doi moi</td>
<td>Vietnam's reform process (English translation: renovation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBRD</td>
<td>European Bank for Reconstruction and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESCAP</td>
<td>United Nations Centre for Economic and Social Development in Asia and the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>Foreign direct investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSU</td>
<td>Former Soviet Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross domestic product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEMPACK</td>
<td>General Equilibrium Modelling Package</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSO</td>
<td>General Statistical Office (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSP</td>
<td>Gross social product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Human development index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEPR</td>
<td>Hunger eradication and poverty reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HH</td>
<td>Household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPI</td>
<td>Human poverty index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human resources development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMR</td>
<td>Infant mortality rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSA</td>
<td>International Social Security Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS</td>
<td>Left hand side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARD</td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mill.</td>
<td>Millions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MO Culture</td>
<td>Ministry of Culture and Communication (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOET</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Training (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOH</td>
<td>Ministry of Health (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOI</td>
<td>Ministry of Interior (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOLISA</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPI</td>
<td>Ministry of Planning and Investment (of Vietnam; successor of SPC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCPFP</td>
<td>National Committee for Population and Family Planning (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO(s)</td>
<td>Non-government organisation(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIC(s)</td>
<td>Newly industrialised country (countries)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMP</td>
<td>National material product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP(s)</td>
<td>National programme(s) (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTP(s)</td>
<td>National target programme(s) (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLS</td>
<td>Ordinary Least-Square estimation procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDCEP</td>
<td>Programme for socio-economic development in communes faced with extreme difficulties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPC(s)</td>
<td>Provincial People's Committee(s) (in Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RHS</td>
<td>Right hand side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Asian countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAM(s)</td>
<td>Social accounting matrixes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBV</td>
<td>State Bank of Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEA</td>
<td>Southeast Asian countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SESAME(s)</td>
<td>System of economic and social accounting matrixes with extensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIDÁ</td>
<td>Sweden International Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOE(s)</td>
<td>State-owned enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPC</td>
<td>State Planning Committee (of Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRV</td>
<td>Socialist Republic of Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWC</td>
<td>Social welfare condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWF</td>
<td>Social welfare function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWS</td>
<td>Social welfare system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB</td>
<td>Tubercles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCED</td>
<td>United Nations Centre for Environment Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFPA</td>
<td>United Nations Population Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLSS</td>
<td>Vietnam’s living standards survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLSS(s)</td>
<td>Vietnam’s living standards survey(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLSS1</td>
<td>Vietnam’s living standards survey in 1993-94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLSS2</td>
<td>Vietnam’s living standards survey in 1997-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VND or D</td>
<td>Vietnam’s currency (US$1=VND15,000 as of June 2001)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>