Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray
University of Wollongong

Recommended Citation
Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray
University of Wollongong
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
MANAGEMENT OF OPEN INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND SYSTEMS (ITS) ARCHITECTURES IN THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

Development of a Perspectival Model for Information Systems Management.

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

From

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

VOLUME I

by

DEBORAH J. BUNKER-MURRAY, BA 1980, MCom (Hons) 1991, UNSW

SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND INFORMATION SYSTEMS

2004
CERTIFICATION

I, Deborah J. Bunker-Murray, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray

22 June 2004
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A PhD can often be a long and lonely journey. On this journey, however, you can meet many wise, interesting and helpful people. I would like to thank all of my family, friends and colleagues for their words (and actions) of advice, encouragement and support.

Thanks must also go to DMR Group Australia Pty. Ltd. for their funding of this research as well as access to their expertise and industry contacts.

Special thanks go to Graham Winley, who supervised the early stages of this thesis and to Helen Hasan who gave me critical advice and supervision at the end of the thesis process.

Finally a very heartfelt thankyou, to my partner Bill Murray, whose unshakable confidence and support for what I was doing, kept me moving forward.
For Bill...

...and also for Eric (my father), Jim, Peg, Len and Rosemary who I will see once more at the end of a greater journey.
This thesis looks at the limitations of current ITS management objective (normative) theory and develops a new Perspectival ITS Management Model so as to supplement this theory and overcome some of its limitations. The proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model is an approach to reconciliation/integration of object/subject from a phenomenological viewpoint. The development of the Perspectival ITS Management Model has been heavily influenced by the work of John Haynes (2001a).

In order to investigate the applicability of the Perspectival ITS Management Model a constructionist epistemological stance is taken in the thesis, which describes an overview of current objective ITS management theory, that is analysed and focussed through a normative ITS Management Model (developed by the candidate in the early stages of the thesis). The thesis goes on to develop the objective theoretical view of the management of open systems architectures and uses this to investigate the subjective case study accounts of the management of open systems architectures from 1993–1996 in the Australian federal government. These cases are used to highlight how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can be utilised to enhance, extend and transform our understanding of ITS Management in ways that the current body of theory does not.

A postscript has also been developed to illustrate how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can also be applied to the ITS management landscape (whole-of-government ITS outsourcing) of the Australian federal government (1996 – 2001) after the initial open systems case study period (1993-1996).

INDEX WORDS: ITS Management, ITS Architecture, Perspectival Thinking, Phenomenology, Australian federal government.
PUBLICATIONS RELATING TO THIS THESIS


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VOLUME 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1 - THESIS OVERVIEW, RESEARCH PROBLEM AND QUESTIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Current Management Context and Research Questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 The Research Problem (chapter 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Literature Review: An Objective ITS Management Model (chapter 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Research Design for Data Collection and Analysis (chapter 3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Background to the Objective Theory of the Management of Open ITS Architectures as it Applies to the Australian Federal Government (chapter 4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Data Analysis: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Management of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective (chapter 5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Discussion and Conclusion (chapter 6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Summary of Research Findings, Contributions, Limitations and Opportunities (chapter 8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW: An Objective ITS Management Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Literature Discussion Using the ITS Management Model (figure 2.1) as a Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Derivation of an Organisation's General Business Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Derivation of an Organisation's ITS Business Unit Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 ITS Architecture and Infrastructure Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 The User Requirements of ITS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 The Organisational Context (Boundary) and Its Effect on ITS Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6 The External Environment to the Organisation and Its Effect on ITS Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.7 ITS Planning Cycles in a Typical Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The Objective ITS Management Model and Its Relationship to the Galliers and Sutherland (1991) Revised Stages of Growth Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Conclusion and Areas of Inquiry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 3 - RESEARCH DESIGN FOR DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS

Chapter Overview 105
3.1 Research Framework 107
3.2 Epistemology 109
3.3 Research Investigation and Resulting Research Problem, Question and Approaches 113
3.4 Research Methods - Including Steps for Data Collection and Analysis 118
3.5 Research Instrument 123
3.6 Justification of the Research Sites 125
3.7 Research Stages 127
3.8 Reconciliation of Object and Subject 129
3.9 Challenging Methodological Issues 140
3.10 Conclusions 142

CHAPTER 4 - BACKGROUND TO THE OBJECTIVE THEORY OF MANAGEMENT OF OPEN ITS ARCHITECTURES AS IT APPLIES TO THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

Chapter Overview 144
4.1 Introduction 144
4.2 Objective Theory of Open ITS Architectures 145
4.4 Australian Federal Government Policy on Management of Open ITS Architectures 166
4.5 Australian Federal Government Use of Open Systems Architectures 169
4.6 Conclusions 171
CHAPTER 5 - DATA ANALYSIS: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective

Chapter Overview

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Organisational Contextual Factors - Mutual Contingency of Skills and Tools

5.2.1 Case Organisation Contextual Interpretation

5.2.2 Case Organisation Interpretation - Obvious Contextual Factors Influencing Management of Open Systems Architectures

5.2.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Emerging Contextual Factors Influencing the Management of Open Systems Architectures

5.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Subjective Case Account Data (Explanation Sketches)

5.3.1 Case Organisation 1

5.3.2 Case Organisation 2

5.3.3 Case Organisation 3

5.3.4 Case Organisation 4

5.3.5 Case Organisation 5

5.3.6 Case Organisation 6

5.4 Discussion

5.5 Limitations of Objective Views of Open Systems Architecture Management - (Tool Based Model of the IS Discipline)

5.6 Conclusions

CHAPTER 6 - DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Chapter Overview

6.1 Research Problem, Questions and Approach

6.2 Reconciliation of Object and Subject

6.3 Proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model

6.4 Conclusions


Chapter Overview

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Objective Theory of Outsourcing ITS Architectures
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Figure 2.1 – ITS Management Model (modified from Bunker 1994) – pg 152
Table 2.1 - Basic Tasks at Different Levels of MIS Planning – from Goa & Oppelland (1994) – pg 287
Figure 2.2 – The Elements of IT Infrastructure – from Weill et al. (1996) – pg 6
Table 2.2 – Key Issues of EUC (N=74) – from McLean et al. (1993) – pg 86
Table 2.3 – Possible Stakeholders in MIS Planning within an Organisation - from Goa & Oppelland (1994) - 288
Figure 2.3 – The New Age – from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79
Figure 2.4 - Managing the New Age - from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79
Table 2.4 – Five Approaches Summarised – from Earl (1993) – pg 12
Figure 2.5 - A Contingency Framework for Choosing an Appropriate SISP Approach Based on Stakeholder Motivations (amended from Galliers 1987f p 344) – from Galliers (1991) – pg 67
Table 2.5 - A revised “stages of growth” model – (Sutherland & Galliers, 1989, p23 reproduced in Galliers, 1991, pp 61-62)
Figure 2.6 - Research Model – from Prekumar & King (1994) – pg 81
Exhibit 2.1 - A Model of IS Leadership Roles – from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 15
Exhibit 2.2 - Four Forms of IS Partnering - from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 16
Figure 2.7 – Four ‘Faces’, or Tasks, of the Emerging IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 6
Figure 2.8 – Nine Capabilities for the IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 7
Table 2.6 – Research Agenda – from Clark (1994) – pg 49
Table 2.7 – The predictions for the next decade – from Benjamin & Blunt (1994) –pg 55
Figure 2.9 – Putting the business back into IT – from Earl (1992) – pg 79
Figure 2.10 - IS Complexity Framework – Hackney et al. (2000) – pg 16
Figure 3.1 – Research Framework for Data Collection and Analysis
Figure 3.2 – Steps for Data Collection and Analysis
Table 4.1 Open Systems Architecture (OSA) revised “stages of growth” model - adapted from Sutherland & Galliers (1989) – pg 23
Table 4.2 – Strategy Objective Characteristics