In search of the inner voice: a qualitative exploration of the internalised use of aural, visual, kinaesthetic, and other imagery in the perception and performance of music

Nicole Saintilan
University of Wollongong

2008

Recommended Citation
Saintilan, Nicole, In search of the inner voice: a qualitative exploration of the internalised use of aural, visual, kinaesthetic, and other imagery in the perception and performance of music, PhD thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 2008.
http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/725

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
In Search of the Inner Voice:

A Qualitative Exploration of the Internalised use of

Aural, Visual, Kinaesthetic, and Other Imagery in

the Perception and Performance of Music

Completed in fulfilment of requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Nicole Saintilan BCA (Hons), M Mus, A Mus A, Grad Dip Ed

Faculty of Education,

University of Wollongong

2008
Statement of Sources

Apart from the acknowledged borrowings from other sources, the work in this thesis, to my knowledge, is original. No part of this thesis has been submitted to any other institution for academic credit.

Nicole Saintilan.

September, 2008
Style Guidelines

According to Departmental advice received, the Style Guidelines to be adopted for the presentation of this thesis were optional. Therefore, the guidelines of choice were those of the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Society (5th.ed.). Taken into account was the variation allowed by these guidelines (for material other than journal articles) that is not only permissible, but also desirable in the interests of clear communication.
Abstract

This study is about imagery, mostly sound imagery, but also a more complex set of imageries used by musicians in the perception and performance of music. Imagery is the internal representation of a stimulus, experienced in the presence or absence of that stimulus. Imagery may be of different types, such as visual (imagined seeing), auditory (imagined words or sounds), spatial (imagined distances or placement), or kinaesthetic (imagined movement). The thought processes that musicians use in this regard are not well-documented. This lack of knowledge contributes to the mystique that surrounds music literacy, a mystique that, in turn, does little to help student musicians develop useful strategies for performing and listening to music.

The aim of the study in the first instance was to find out what types of thought processes musicians actively employ during their work. The research expanded progressively to become an exploration of the psychological and physical tools musicians use when they perform and listen to music. The underlying premise was that there is an inner voice with multiple manifestations, and that musicians have the capacity to generate such internal imagery.

A review of the literature in this area showed the absence of a comprehensive description of the sounds that musicians are able to imagine in terms of range, speed, timbre, and complexity. Also lacking from the literature is a description of the differences in the feel of imagery, and the range of imagery skills that musicians combine when performing and listening to music. Thus the starting point for this thesis was the search for an inner voice.
The research centred on a series of questionnaires and interviews with 10 experienced musicians over a 12-month period. In the course of these interviews the musicians were asked to comment on their imagery during different musical experiences such as thinking, listening, score reading, and performance. Their written and spoken answers were collated and compared to search for similarities and differences. The investigation became a sequential and in-depth search, as participant responses raised more and more issues and areas for enquiry. Research Questions were developed progressively, subsequent to the initial two-part theory having been operationalized. This stated that (a) the musician-participants would be able to generate the impression of sound internally (i.e., *inner sing*), and (b) they would agree that there is more than one type of sound imagery.

Although unable to generalise results due to the limitations inherent in research of this nature, the findings shed new light on previous inconsistencies in the literature, provide new knowledge and conceptualisations, clarify terminology, and have implications for the teaching of music in its various forms. The two main findings to emerge from the study are that musicians are likely to employ a variety of imagery types when they work and that they do so in significantly different and individual styles. The results demonstrate that the musicians relied on a wide variety of imagery, including imagery of movement and sound as well as visual imagery of instruments, hands, written music, and analytical representations of the music. The results further revealed the wide range of terminology used when musicians talk about their inner musical worlds. Where
one musician may inner sing music, another may inner hear or inner perform, and the next may do something entirely different.

These findings lead to several conclusions. It is incorrect to assume that any two musicians will think the same thoughts or use the same imagery when they hear or perform a piece of music. Moreover, differences that professional musicians display when imagining music may well be evident in students. Expecting students to conform to one way or another when listening, performing, or thinking about music may be unrealistic or damaging. In gaining a more precise understanding of the inner voice of musicians, it becomes possible to set clear goals for the teaching of hitherto hidden skills. An accentuated awareness of individual differences in this regard holds within it the exciting prospect of full potential being reached by student musicians.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Sources</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Style Guidelines</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter One – Introduction</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Imagery for the Perception and Performance of Music</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 The Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 The initial research question</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Origins</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Delving into the underlying process</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 What Sort of Evidence Might be Gathered?</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Terminology</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Summary of Chapters</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter Two – Literature Review</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Auditory Imagery</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Definition</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 The history of the study of auditory imagery</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3 What does auditory imagery sound like?</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.1.4 What does auditory imagery feel like? 18

2.1.5 How is auditory imagery learnt? 21

2.2 What is Auditory Imagery Used For? 22

2.2.1 Speaking 23

2.2.2 Performing 24

2.2.3 Reading 25

2.2.4 Listening 26

2.2.4.1 Externalist theories 26

2.2.4.2 Internalist theories 27

2.2.4.3 Streaming 31

2.2.5 Internal repetition for perception 34

2.3 Motor Activity Theory 37

2.3.1 Leontyev (1981) 37

2.3.2 Sokolov (1972) 38

2.4 A Multilayered Personal Approach 40

2.4.1 Performance imagery 41

2.4.2 Inner hearing 45

2.4.3 Visual imagery 46

2.4.4 Rhythmic imagery 47

2.4.5 Emotional imagery 48

2.5 Conclusion 49

Chapter Three – Methodology

3.1 Background to Methodology 51

3.1.1 Summary statements 51
Chapter Four – Results (1)

4.1 Questionnaire One: Inner Singing – Part One

4.1.1 Aims

4.1.2 Underlying assumptions

4.1.3 Results

4.1.3.1 Inner singing and sound

4.1.3.2 Inner singing and movement

4.1.4 Conclusions

4.2 Questionnaire Two: Inner Singing – Part Two

4.2.1 Aims

4.2.2 Theoretical underpinnings

4.2.3 Underlying assumptions

4.2.4 Results
Chapter Five – Results (2)

Questionnaire Three: Listening and the Inner Voice

5.1 Aims

5.2 Theoretical Underpinnings

5.3 Underlying Assumptions

5.4 Results

5.4.1 Listening one: Slow melody line

5.4.2 Listening two: Fast melody line

5.4.3 Listening three: Polyphonic music

5.4.4 Listening four: New music

5.4.5 Listening five: German lieder

5.5 Conclusions

Chapter Six – Results (3)

Questionnaire Four: Music Reading and the Inner Voice

6.1 Aims

6.2 Theoretical Underpinnings

6.3 Underlying Assumptions
Chapter Seven – Results (4)

Questionnaire Five: Music Performance and the Inner Voice

7.1 Aims

7.2 Theoretical Underpinnings

7.3 Underlying Assumptions

7.4 Results

7.4.1 Item 1: Playing by ear

7.4.2 Item 2: Transposing by ear

7.4.3 Item 3: Rhythmic variation

7.4.4 Item 4: Free improvisation

7.4.5 Item 5: Playing by memory

7.4.6 Item 6: Performance by reading

7.4.7 Item 7: Sight-reading

7.4.8 Item 8: Imagery for singing

7.5 Conclusions
Chapter Eight – Discussion and Conclusion

8.1 Summary of Research Questions and Related Findings

8.1.1 Terminology
8.1.2 Inner singing
8.1.3 Listening
8.1.4 Whole listening
8.1.5 Imagery for music reading
8.1.6 Imagery for music performance

8.2 Key Findings in Relation to Previous Literature

8.3 Emergent Concepts

8.4 Limitations

8.4.1 Qualitative methodology
8.4.2 Validity and reliability
8.4.3 Variables

8.5 Implications for Education

8.5.1 Ear training
8.5.2 Instrumental practice methods

8.6 Future Research

8.6.1 Children’s education
8.6.2 Society

8.7 Coda

References
Appendix A – Questionnaires

Questionnaire One: Inner Singing – Part One 234
Questionnaire Two: Inner Singing – Part Two 236
Questionnaire Three: Listening and the Inner Voice 239
Questionnaire Four: Music Reading and the Inner Voice 246
Questionnaire Five: Music Performance and the Inner Voice 251

Appendix B – Scores of Musical Works for Questionnaire Three

Albinoni – Adagio, from Oboe Concerto in D Minor Op. 9, No. 2 255
Vivaldi – Allegro Non Molto, from Oboe Concerto in C Major RV 447 259
Bach – Chaconne, from Violin Partita No. 2 in D Minor BWV 1004 266
Schultz – Night Flight, from “Mephisto” 267
Schumann – Ich Grolle Nicht, from Dichterliebe Op 48 273
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Participant Demographics</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Questionnaire Design and Rationale</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Responses to Inner Singing and Sound</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>The Timbre of Inner Singing</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Responses to Inner Singing and Movement</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Responses for Inner Singing and Breathing</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Responses for Linking the Internal and External Voice</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Responses for Internal Pulse (Tempo)</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Activities for the Generation of Internal Pulse</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Responses for Changing the Timbre of Inner Singing</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Responses for Listening One: Slow Melody Line</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Responses for Listening Two: Fast Melody Line</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Responses for Listening Three: Polyphonic Music</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Responses for Listening Four: New Music</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Responses for Listening Five: German Lieder</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Responses for Pulse Imagery During Music Reading</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Responses for Counting During Music Reading</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Responses for Pitch Imagery During Music Reading</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Responses for Other Imagery During Music Reading</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Responses for Chord Imagery During Music Reading</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Information Given for Playing by Ear</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Information Given for Transposing by Ear</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Information Given for Creating a Rhythmic Variation</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.4</td>
<td>Information Given for Free Improvisation</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.5</td>
<td>Information Given for Playing by Memory</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.6</td>
<td>Information Given for Performance by Reading</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.7</td>
<td>Information Given for Sight-reading</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 4.1. Three-Step Model of Thought to External Speech 82
Figure 4.2. Three-Step Model of Perception 83
Figure 4.3. Three-Step Model of Musical Thought to External Sound 84
Figure 4.4. Three-Step Model of Perception and Production 96

Musical Example

Example 6.1. Mozart – Adagio No. 1 in D Minor (violin part) 147
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors Dr Irina Verenikina and Dr Greg Schiemer for the knowledge and experience they have shared. Thanks are due to the ten musicians who gave up an enormous amount of time and did so with diligence, friendliness, and patience. I would also like to sincerely thank my mother-in-law Dr Cynthia Schultz who went above and beyond the call of duty in giving a copious amount of time, gentle advice, and strong support in the preparation stage of the thesis. Also to my husband Andrew, who retained humour and faith, and to my two sons Konrad and Max, who provided love, warmth, and meaning – thankyou.
Driving in our car with the radio on, I asked my two sons what they imagined when they listened to music. They both imagined, in a visual way, the contour of the melody. My elder son reported imagining it as a continuous line graph, the younger imagined someone jumping up and down over the houses as the melody rose and fell.

*A special moment; to glimpse the developing minds of children.*