The impact of the introduction of a pilot electronic health record system on general practitioners' work practices in the Illawarra

Karolyn Annette Spinks

University of Wollongong
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
The Impact of the Introduction of a Pilot Electronic Health Record System on General Practitioners’ Work Practices in the Illawarra

Includes an Observation Study

A thesis submitted in fulfillment for the award of Masters of Information and Communication Technology (Research)

Karolyn Annette Spinks
RN, Assoc Dip Comp Apl, B Comm BSA

School of Information Technology and Computer Science
University of Wollongong

2006
Certification

I, Karolyn Annette Spinks declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the award of Master of Information and Communication Technology, in the school of Information Technology and Computer Science, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualification in any other university or academic institution.

________________________________________

Karolyn Spinks

24 April 2006
As reported anonymously in the London *Times*: “After René Laënnec invented the stethoscope in 1816… That the [stethoscope] will ever come into general use notwithstanding its value is extremely doubtful, because its beneficial application requires much time and gives a good bit of trouble to the patient and to the practitioner, and because its hue and character are foreign and opposed to our habits and associations…”

Acknowledgements

I feel much gratitude to a number of people who provided assistance in many forms during the years of undertaking this research.

Firstly, acknowledgement must be given to all the GPs and patients from the Illawarra involved in the Illawarra Division of General Practice Diabetes Research Program who agreed to participate in the research and who gave me their valuable time. Without you there would be no thesis.

My supervisors Professor Joan Cooper, Flinders University and Dr Ping Yu, University of Wollongong, for their enduring encouragement, guidance and insightful feedback throughout the research undertaking and thesis preparation. I have gained from your experience and wisdom during this project. Thank you so very much.

The invaluable and continuous reassurance, support, patience and guidance given by my husband, Professor Geoffrey Spinks. I am conscious that you lived through this project with me, sharing both the ups and downs. I am indebted to you for your support and also your gracious gift of time. Acknowledgement must also go to my two wonderful children Robert and Richard Spinks for their understanding, patience and encouragement.

The staff and students of the University of Wollongong involved in the Smart ID Information System project.

Staff at the Illawarra Division of General Practice

I would also like to acknowledge the financial support of an Australian Postgraduate Award Industry (APAI) scholarship whilst undertaking this research.

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to all the people that read it who may take some interesting and worthwhile information away with them in doing so.
Abstract

This thesis assessed the impact of the use of information technology (IT), specifically, electronic health records (EHRs), on general practitioners’ (GPs’) clinical work practices in NSW, Australia. The research framework and context was taken from EHR initiatives proposed by the Australian Commonwealth and State Governments for improving the Australian Healthcare system. A new system that provided increased access to electronic patient information was trialed in the Illawarra Region of NSW specifically utilizing a Smart ID Information System. The current research was administered under this larger project. The current research examined the Smart ID Information System (a pilot system designed to emulate EHRs) so the impact of EHRs on GPs’ work practices could be considered.

GPs work practices are hindered partially because Information and Communication Technology (ICT) infrastructure is not yet available to support them in their need to easily exchange patient information. Consequently patient clinical information is sometimes unavailable because it involves a labour intensive process to obtain that information. In solving the above problems with EHRs other problems are created such as positive identification of patients and their results and records. Also, issues of the threat to patients’ privacy and confidentiality are enormous. The research question is therefore: how are GPs’ clinical work practices impacted by the introduction of EHRs and associated unique patient identifiers (UPIs)?

The research methodology was both a quantitative and qualitative inquiry which focused on two aspects of the Smart ID Information System project. It was broken into two parts plus supplementary results from a closely related study were used as secondary data. Firstly, a perception study investigated GPs’ perceptions of current and future accessibility to patient clinical information and what their needs were, for acceptance of EHRs in general practice. This study was achieved through interviewing GPs. Secondly, an observation study investigated how the adoption of EHRs in the form of a pilot EHR system (Smart ID Information System) impacted on GP clinical work practices through observation of GP work practices. Results from secondary data were included here and discussed in the conclusion.
Results of the perception study showed GPs agreed there was a problem with the exchange of patient information and the information flow between health service providers. The GPs were generally willing to use IT (via EHRs) to improve their work efficiency. They believed EHRs could help provide a solution, which overcame the existing problem of lack of patient information. The GPs were keen to increase the amount of information exchanged. Overall the idea of the Smart ID Information System as a pilot EHR system was well received by the GPs interviewed but the GPs highlighted the pilot EHR system implemented must be simple to use. Results of the observation study showed GPs successfully used the pilot EHR system within their consulting environment. The GPs proved they could successfully access the patient’s record, integrate this access procedure and subsequent discussion of the information with the patient, into the consultation whilst maintaining their autonomy for their personal routine and work practices. The GPs found the access and consent procedure facilitated via the I-keys was quick and simple to use despite slow system performance. Both consultations in which the system was used were longer. Results of follow-up interviews from secondary data indicated GPs were willing to accept the technology knowing the benefits they would gain from its use. Of the GPs interviewed one GP thought consultations were longer, a second GP thought the length of consultations stayed the same.

In conclusion the research found GPs agreed their work practices were hindered by inefficiencies due to non-availability of patient clinical information, and any system to improve this efficiency must be simple to use. EHRs (and UPIs) have minimal impact on GPs work practices and GPs studied were reasonably comfortable with the impact EHRs have on their work practices but this is only if EHRs do not significantly lengthen consultation times, such an EHR system runs efficiently, and excellent infrastructure is in place to support GPs. Results relating to consultation length with EHRs were inconclusive due to some consultations staying the same and some becoming longer. However, there is a possibility consultation length will increase with EHRs due to increased availability of patient information and dependency on prevailing technology.

The current research involved a direct GP – patient relationship. Future research of EHRs in general practice could include an extension of the current research to incorporate an indirect GP – patient relationship. This is where significant benefits lie
for GPs and patients from using EHRs. Another suggestion of future research could be the impact of EHRs and UPIs on the work practices of practice management staff, including receptionists and practice nurses working in GP’s surgeries.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements and Dedication .......................................................... i  
Abstract ..................................................................................................... ii  
Table of Contents ....................................................................................... v  
List of Figures ........................................................................................... xi  
List of Plates .............................................................................................. xii  
List of Tables ............................................................................................. xii  
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations ......................................................... xiii  
Publications Arising from the Research ................................................... xiv

## Chapter 1 Introduction ............................................................................. 1  
1.1 Research Topic .................................................................................. 2  
1.1.1 Smart ID Information System Project ........................................... 3  
1.2 Background to the Research Problem ................................................. 6  
1.3 Statement of the Research Problem and Research Question ........... 7  
1.4 The Study .......................................................................................... 10  
1.4.1 Components of the Study .............................................................. 10  
1.4.2 Research Aim and Objectives ...................................................... 10  
1.4.3 Scope and Limitations ................................................................... 11  
1.4.3.1 Scope of the research ............................................................ 11  
1.4.3.2 Limitations of the research .................................................. 12  
1.4.4 Research Design .......................................................................... 13  
1.4.4.1 Project Plan ........................................................................... 13  
1.4.4.2 Clinical Work Practices ........................................................ 15  
1.4.5 Research Relevance and Justification ......................................... 15  
1.5 Thesis Overview ............................................................................... 16  
1.6 Assumptions ..................................................................................... 17  
1.7 Conclusion ......................................................................................... 17
Chapter 2 Literature Review

2.1 Information Flow within the Australian Healthcare System
2.1.1 Factors Impacting the Isolation of GPs From Hospitals
2.1.2 Factors Impacting the Isolation of GPs from Each Other
2.1.3 The Increased Need to Improve the Flow of Patient Information

2.2 Barriers to Use of IT in General Practice
2.2.1 Driving Forces Forging Clinical Computerisation of General Practice
2.2.2 IT’s Contribution Supporting the Clinical Role of General Practitioners
2.2.3 Australian and UK Comparison of General Practice Clinical Computerisation

2.3 Evolution from Computerised Patient Records to Electronic Health Records
2.3.1 Impact of CPRs and EHRs on GPs’ Work Practices During Consultations

2.4 Benefits of EHRs

2.5 Challenges of EHRs
2.5.1 Impact of Information Privacy Legislation on GPs’ Work Practices
2.5.2 Patient Authentication and Anonymity with UPIs
2.5.2.1 Access Control Management with UPIs
2.5.3 Security Considerations

2.6 Conclusion

Chapter 3 Methodology

3.1 Description of Research Design
3.1.1 Rationale for Two Research Components
3.1.2 Rationale for Selection of Quantitative and Qualitative Research Methodologies
3.1.3 Canvass of Alternative Designs
3.1.3.1 Case Study Strategy
3.1.3.2 Experimental Research ......................................................... 56
3.1.3.3 Action Research ................................................................. 56
3.1.3.4 Naturalistic Inquiry ............................................................. 56
3.2 Method Details of Perception Study ........................................... 57
3.2.1 Justification for Survey Approach ........................................... 57
3.2.2 Selection of Participants ......................................................... 57
3.2.3 Design of the GP Interview Questionnaire ............................... 57
3.2.3.1 Justification for Choice of Questions: Content and Purpose ...... 59
3.2.4 Piloting the GP Questionnaire and Interview .......................... 61
3.2.5 Method of Data Collection ..................................................... 61
3.2.6 Ethics Approval ................................................................. 61
3.2.7 Quantitative and Qualitative Data Entry .................................. 61
3.2.8 Method of Analysis of Results ................................................. 62
3.3 Method Details for Observation Study ....................................... 62
3.3.1 Justification for Observational Approach ................................. 62
3.3.1.1 Application of Visual Media as Qualitative Research Method ... 62
3.3.2 Selection of Participants ......................................................... 63
3.3.3 Identification of Work Practices Through Secondary Data .......... 63
3.3.4 Method of Data Collection ..................................................... 63
3.3.5 Ethics Approval ................................................................. 64
3.3.6 Qualitative Data Entry .......................................................... 64
3.3.7 Method of Analysis of Results ................................................. 64
3.3.8 Follow-up interviews From Secondary Data ............................. 64
3.4 Likelihood of Bias ................................................................. 65
3.5 Conclusion .............................................................................. 65

Chapter 4 Research Results, Analysis and Discussion of Perception Study 67
4.1 Presentation of Results from Perception Study .......................... 68
4.1.1 Computer-based Patient Records (Q1) ................................. 68
4.1.2 Identifying Patients and Accessing Patient Records (Q2) ......... 69
4.1.3 Electronically Transferring Pathology Results (Q3) .................. 70
4.1.4 Frequency of Use of Computer-based Patient
Record System (Q4)..................................................................... 71
4.1.5 Connection to Internet/Intranet Services (Q5) .......................... 72
4.1.6 Information Flow When Exchanging Patient Information (Q6) ................................................................. 73
4.1.7 Specific Information Flow Problems Experienced (Q7) ......... 74
4.1.8 Types of Media for Sharing Information (Q8) ......................... 75
4.1.9 Patient Identification and GP Work Practices (Q9) .................. 77
4.1.10 Ownership of Patient Information (Q10) ............................. 79
4.1.11 Access To Patient Information (Q11) ................................. 80
4.1.12 Issues of Electronic Exchange of Patient Records (Q12) ....... 81
4.1.13 Data Fields Used When Transferring Patient Information (Q13) ................................................................. 82
4.1.14 Remote Access to Patient Records (Q14) .......................... 86
4.1.15 Mobile Phones (Q15) ......................................................... 87
4.1.16 Remote Searching for Patient Records Using a Wireless Device (Q16) ................................................................. 88
4.1.17 Preferences for Portable Electronic Device and
Additional Comments Regarding the Smart ID Information System (Q17) ................................................................. 89

4.2 Analysis and Discussion of Results from Perception Study ....... 91
4.2.1 CPRs and Pathology Results .............................................. 91
4.2.2 Identifying Patients and Accessing Patient Records ............. 91
4.2.3 Information Flow .............................................................. 92
4.2.4 Increased Use of IT ............................................................ 92
4.2.5 UPIs .............................................................................. 93
4.2.6 Ownership of Patient Information ...................................... 93
4.2.7 Access to Patient Information ........................................... 94
4.2.8 Issues for Electronic Exchange of Patient Records ............. 95
4.2.9 Data Fields Used When Transferring Patient Information ...... 96
4.2.10 Wireless Remote Access to Patient Records ....................... 97
4.2.11 General Opinion Towards the Pilot EHR System:
Smart ID Information System .............................................. 97

4.3 Conclusion ........................................................................... 98
Chapter 5 Research Results, Analysis and Discussion of Observation Study

5.1 Presentation of Results from Observation Study

5.1.1 Tabular Results of Consultations

5.1.1.1 Table 5.1: Consultation 1 - GP 1, Patient 1, with use of Smart ID Information System

5.1.1.2 Table 5.2: Consultation 2 - GP 1, Patient 2, without use of Smart ID Information System

5.1.1.3 Table 5.3: Consultation 3 - GP 2, Patient 1, with use of Smart ID Information System

5.1.1.4 Table 5.4: Consultation 4 - GP 2, Patient 2, without use of Smart ID Information System

5.1.2 Flowchart of Consultations

5.2 Analysis and Discussion of Results from Observation Study

5.2.1 Analysis of Tables

5.2.2 Analysis of Flowchart

5.2.3 Analysis of Follow-up Interviews From Secondary Data

5.3 Conclusion

Chapter 6 Summary of all Research Results, General Conclusion and Further Research

6.1 Summary of all Research Results

6.2 General Conclusion

6.2.1 How The Thesis Achieved Its Research Aim and Objectives

6.3 Suggestions For Further Research

Bibliography

Appendices

Appendix A Definition of Terms
Appendix B Summaries of Commonwealth HealthConnect project, NSW Health’s EHR*Net project
Appendix C Ethics Approval letters
Appendix D Excel spreadsheet of raw data from perception study interviews
Appendix E  GP information kit describing GP interview including GP questionnaire and consent forms from perception study
Appendix F  GP and Patient information kits describing videotaping including consent forms from observation study
Appendix G  Secondary data - workflow diagrams by Frean
Appendix H  Jovanovski’s questionnaires and results
List of Figures

Fig 1.1 Smart ID Information System ......................................................... 5
Fig 1.2 Statement of the Problem ................................................................. 9
Fig 1.3 GP – Patient Association ................................................................. 12
Fig 1.4 Final Project Plan ............................................................................... 14
Fig 2.1 Simplified Probabilistic Matching Algorithm used in UPIs ................... 46
Fig 3.1 Selection of Research Methodology ................................................... 54
Fig 4.1 Distribution of clinical & practice management software .................... 68
Fig 4.2 Type of information used to access patient records ........................... 69
Fig 4.3 Frequency of electronic transfer of pathology results ........................ 70
Fig 4.4 Frequency of use of computer-based patient record system ............... 71
Fig 4.5 Connection to internet/intranet ........................................................... 72
Fig 4.6 Existence of a problem when exchanging patient information ............ 73
Fig 4.7 Specific problems experienced when exchanging patient information ... 74
Fig 4.8a) Current media considered useful for sharing patient information ...... 75
Fig 4.8b) Future media considered useful for sharing patient information ...... 76
Fig 4.9 Perceived problems/benefits of UPIs ................................................... 78
Fig 4.10 Ownership of patient information stored in portable device .............. 79
Fig 4.11 Access to patient information stored in portable device ................... 80
Fig 4.12 Issues of electronic exchange of patient records .............................. 81
Fig 4.13a) Data fields used in transfer of patient information – current .......... 83
Fig 4.13b) Data fields used in transfer of patient information – future ............ 85
Fig 4.14 Remote access requirements to patient records ............................... 86
Fig 4.15 Use of Mobile phones .................................................................... 87
Fig 4.16 Perceived use of a wireless technique to search for patient records ...... 88
Fig 4.17 Preference for portable electronic device ......................................... 89
Fig 5.1 Flowchart with Summarised Work Practice During Consultations Showing Use With and Without EHR System – Based on Results from Videotaped Consultations During Current Research ......................... 114
Fig 5.2 Steps Required to Access Patient Information in Smart ID Information System ............................................................................................. 118
Fig 6.1 Further Research .............................................................................. 133
List of Plates

Plate 1.1 Example of an I-key, Appendix A – Definition of Terms

List of Tables

Table 3.1 Content and Purpose for Each Question in GP Interview Questionnaire........... 60
Table 5.1 Consultation 1 - GP 1, Patient 1, with use of Smart ID Information System ...... 101
Table 5.2 Consultation 2 - GP 1, Patient 2, without use of Smart ID Information System .. 104
Table 5.3 Consultation 3 - GP 2, Patient 1, with use of Smart ID Information System ...... 107
Table 5.4 Consultation 4 - GP 2, Patient 2, without use of Smart ID Information System .. 111
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

AHMAC  Australian Health Ministers Advisory Council
AMA    Australian Medical Association
APA    American Psychiatric Association
CPR    Computerized Patient Record
DHAC   Department of Health and Aged Care
DHHS   Department of Health and Human Services
EHR    Electronic Health Record
GP     General Practitioner
GPB    General Practice Branch (in Dept of Health and Aged Care)
GPCG   General Practice Computing Group
GPFG   General Practice Financing Group
GPPAC  General Practice Partnership Advisory Council
GPSRG  General Practice Strategy Review Group
HIC    Health Insurance Commission
HINA   Health Information Network Australia
ICT    Information and Communication Technology
IDGP   Illawarra Division of General Practice
IS     Information System
NSW MACPHI  NSW Ministerial Advisory Committee on Privacy and Health
           Information
NEHRT  National Electronic Health Records Taskforce
NHIMAC National Health Information Management Advisory Council
NHS (UK) National Health Service, UK
MRN    Medical Record Number
PAS    Patient administration system
PCP    Primary Care Partnerships
PDA    Personal Digital Assistant
PIP    Practice Incentives Program
RACGP  Royal Australian College of General Practitioners
SSL    Secure Socket Layer
WAP    Wireless Application Protocol
UOW    University of Wollongong
UPI    Unique Patient Identifier
Publications Arising From the Research

