

1-1-2012

## On crystal sets

Chun Li  
*University of Wollongong*

Jennifer Seberry  
*University of Wollongong, jennie@uow.edu.au*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/infopapers>



Part of the [Physical Sciences and Mathematics Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Li, Chun and Seberry, Jennifer: On crystal sets 2012, 89-110.  
<https://ro.uow.edu.au/infopapers/2068>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

---

## On crystal sets

### Abstract

We are interested in 2-crystal sets and protocystal sets in which every difference between distinct elements occurs zero or an even number of times. We show that several infinite families of such sets exist. We also give non-existence theorems for infinite families. We find conditions to limit the computer search space for such sets. We note that search for 2-crystal sets  $(n; k_1, k_2)$ ,  $k = k_1 + k_2$  even, in a set of size  $n$ , immediately cuts the search space for two circulant weighing matrices with periodic autocorrelation function zero from  $3^{2n}$  to  $2^{2n-k}$ . We show that  $2-(2n; 4, 1)$ , for  $n$  odd, can only exist when  $7|n$  and conjecture that  $2-(2n; q^2, 1)$  crystal sets will only exist when  $q^2 + q + 1$  is a prime and  $(q^2 + q + 1) | n$ .

### Keywords

era2015, sets, crystal

### Disciplines

Physical Sciences and Mathematics

### Publication Details

Li, C. & Seberry, J. (2012). On crystal sets. *Australasian Journal of Combinatorics*, 52 89-110.

# On crystal sets

CHUN LI    JENNIFER SEBERRY

*CCISR, SCSSE  
University of Wollongong  
NSW 2522  
Australia*

## Abstract

We are interested in *2-crystal sets* and *protocrystal sets* in which every difference between distinct elements occurs zero or an even number of times. We show that several infinite families of such sets exist. We also give non-existence theorems for infinite families. We find conditions to limit the computer search space for such sets. We note that search for *2-crystal sets*  $(n; k_1, k_2)$ ,  $k = k_1 + k_2$  even, in a set of size  $n$ , immediately cuts the search space for two circulant weighing matrices with periodic autocorrelation function zero from  $3^{2n}$  to  $2^{2n-k}$ . We show that  $2-(2n; 4, 1)$ , for  $n$  odd, can only exist when  $7|n$  and conjecture that  $2-(2n; q^2, 1)$  crystal sets will only exist when  $q^2 + q + 1$  is a prime and  $(q^2 + q + 1)|n$ .

## 1 Introduction

Two sequences with elements  $0, \pm 1$ , very small periodic or non-periodic autocorrelation function, and small cross correlation function are of considerable interest in signal processing. Two such sequences with zero periodic or non-periodic autocorrelation function are also used to form weighing matrices.

This paper concentrates on searching for the zeros of such sequences; this is called *crystallization* and the zero positions form *crystal sets*. This paper gives conditions on crystal sets and gives algorithms for their construction preparatory to searching for weighing matrices.

## 2 Definitions and Preliminaries

### 2.1 Protocrystal Sets and Crystal Sets

*Difference sets* [1] and *supplementary difference sets* (sds) [8, 9] and their applications have been extensively studied in the past.

We now study two more relaxed sets, *protocrystal sets* and *crystal sets*, which can sometimes be used to form difference sets and supplementary difference sets.

**Definition 1** Let  $K$  be a subset of size  $k$ , written as  $(n; k; \mu)$  protocystal set, of a set of  $n$  elements,  $V$ . Then  $K$  will be called a *protocystal set* if in the totality (multiset), written as  $\Lambda$ , of all the differences between all distinct elements in the subset,  $K$  has an even number of even elements,  $|\Lambda| = \mu$ . Since  $\mu = k(k - 1)$ , we will omit  $\mu$  and write  $(n; k)$ PCset.

**Lemma 1** *If  $n$  is odd, the number of elements of  $\Lambda$  which are even equals the number of elements which are odd; that is,  $\frac{k(k-1)}{2}$ . If  $n$  is even, the number of odd elements in  $\Lambda$  is even and the number of even elements is even, but they may not be equal.*

**Proof.** If  $n$  is odd and the protocystal set has  $k$  elements, then the differences  $(a_i - b_i) \pmod n$  and  $(b_i - a_i) \pmod n$  both occur in  $\Lambda$ . Hence each difference  $d$  and  $n - d$  occurs; one is even and the other is odd, so the number of even and odd elements in  $\Lambda$  is the same. The total number of elements in  $\Lambda$  is  $k(k - 1)$ ; hence in this case the number of even elements is  $\frac{k(k-1)}{2}$ .

However, if  $n$  is even,  $(a_i - b_i) \pmod n$  even (or odd) implies  $(b_i - a_i) \pmod n$  even (or odd, respectively). Hence the number of even elements in  $\Lambda$  is even and the number of odd elements is also even, but they may not equal each other.  $\square$

**Corollary 1** *Suppose  $n$  is odd. We write  $\Lambda_i$  for the number of elements in  $\Lambda$  for  $k \equiv 0, 1, 2, \text{ or } 3 \pmod 4$  respectively. Then we see  $\Lambda_0$  and  $\Lambda_1$  have an even number of even elements; but  $\Lambda_2$  and  $\Lambda_3$  have an odd number of even elements.*

*Hence crystal sets can be made only by having two sets of size  $k_i$ ,  $i = 0$  and/or  $1 \pmod 4$ , or by having two sets of size  $k_i$ ,  $i = 2$  and/or  $3 \pmod 4$ .*

**Example 1** Consider  $C = \{0, 1, 3, 10, 12\} \pmod{13}$ . This has differences  $(a_i - b_i) \pmod{13}$  where  $a_i \neq b_i$ ,  $a_i, b_i \in C$ . Since both  $(a_i - b_i) \pmod{13}$  and  $(b_i - a_i) \pmod{13}$  both occur, and since 13 is odd, the number of even (and odd) elements in  $\Lambda$  will be the same, 10. So  $C$  is a  $(13; 5)$ PC (proto-crystal) set.

$a_i/b_i$	0	1	3	10	12
0	*	1	3	10	12
1	12	*	2	9	11
3	10	11	*	7	9
10	3	4	6	*	2
12	1	2	4	11	*

So the totality of differences (multiset) is

$$\Lambda = [1, 1, 2, 2, 2, 3, 3, 4, 4, 6, 7, 9, 9, 10, 10, 11, 11, 11, 12, 12].$$

**Definition 2** Two  $2\text{-}(n; k_1, k_2; \mu)$  subsets  $C_1$  and  $C_2$ , of a set  $V$  of size  $n$ , which have sizes  $k_1$  and  $k_2$ , respectively, will be said to be *crystal sets* when  $\Lambda$ , the totality (multiset) of all the differences from both of the subsets, has each element occurring zero or an even number of times.

By counting the differences we see that  $\mu = k_1(k_1 - 1) + k_2(k_2 - 1)$ , so we usually write  $2\text{-}(n; k_1, k_2)$  crystal sets.

**Example 2** Consider  $C_1 = \{0, 1, 3, 10, 12\}$  and  $C_2 = \{1, 3, 10, 12\} \pmod{13}$ . These have differences  $(a_i - b_i) \pmod{13}$ , as follows, where  $a_i \neq b_i$ ,  $a_i, b_i \in C_j$ ,

$a_1/b_1$	0	1	3	10	12
0	*	1	3	10	12
1	12	*	2	9	11
3	10	11	*	7	9
10	3	4	6	*	2
12	1	2	4	11	*

$a_2/b_2$	1	3	10	12
1	*	2	9	11
3	11	*	7	9
10	4	6	*	2
12	2	4	11	*

so the totality of differences (multiset) is  $\Lambda =$

$$\{1, 1, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 3, 3, 4, 4, 4, 4, 6, 6, 7, 7, 9, 9, 9, 9, 10, 10, 11, 11, 11, 11, 11, 11, 12, 12\}.$$

Here  $\Lambda$  has each difference an even number of times so we have 2-(13; 5, 4) crystal sets. We note  $\mu = 32$ .

**Example 3** It is possible to have a protocystal set that is by itself a crystal set. For example, consider  $\{0, 1, 2, 4\} \pmod{7}$ .

### 2.2 Weighing matrices

A weighing matrix  $W = W(n, k)$  is an  $n \times n$  square matrix with entries  $0, \pm 1$ , having  $k$  non-zero entries per row and column and inner product of distinct rows equal to zero. Therefore  $W$  satisfies  $WW^T = kI_n$ . The number  $k$  is called the weight of  $W$ . Weighing matrices were first studied because of a statistical application in weighing experiments. Later a conjecture of Seberry Wallis, that if  $n \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , weighing matrices  $W(n, k)$  exist for all  $k = 0, \dots, n$  [10], sparked further work. Further conjectures concerning weighing matrices have been studied extensively; see [7] and references therein. A well-known necessary condition for the existence of  $W(2n, k)$  matrices states that if there exists a  $W(2n, k)$  matrix with  $n$  odd, then  $k < 2n$  and  $k$  is the sum of two squares. The two circulants construction for weighing matrices is described in the theorem below, taken from [3], and is of special interest because of its applications in signal processing.

**Theorem 1** *If there exist two circulant matrices  $A_1, A_2$  of order  $n$ , with  $0, \pm 1$  elements, satisfying  $A_1A_1^t + A_2A_2^t = kI_n$ , where  $k$  is an integer, then there exists a  $W(2n, k)$ , given as*

$$W(2n, k) = \begin{pmatrix} A_1 & A_2 \\ -A_2^t & A_1^t \end{pmatrix} \text{ or } W(2n, k) = \begin{pmatrix} A_1 & A_2R \\ -A_2R & A_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

where  $R$  is the square matrix of order  $n$  with  $r_{ij} = 1$  if  $i + j - 1 = n$  and 0 otherwise.

In this paper we study *crystal sets* which give positions of the zeros for  $W(2n, 2n - a)$  constructed from two circulant matrices of order  $n$ , that is, the 2-( $n; k_1, k_2$ ) crystal sets. If  $n$  is odd the weight  $k = k_1 + k_2$  is equal to  $2n - a = x^2 + y^2$ , with  $x, y$  integers.

### 2.3 Sequences with Zero Periodic Autocorrelation Function

Given the sequence  $A = \{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$ , of length  $n$ , the *non-periodic autocorrelation function*  $\text{NPAF}_A(s)$  is defined as

$$\text{NPAF}_A(s) = \sum_{i=1}^{n-s} a_i a_{i+s}, \quad s = 0, 1, \dots, n-1, \quad (1)$$

Given  $A$  as above, of length  $n$ , the *periodic autocorrelation function*  $\text{PAF}_A(s)$  is defined, reducing  $i + s$  modulo  $n$ , as

$$\text{PAF}_A(s) = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i a_{i+s}, \quad s = 0, 1, \dots, n-1. \quad (2)$$

Two sequences,  $A = \{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$  and  $B = \{b_1, b_2, \dots, b_n\}$ , both of length  $n$ , which will be useful in this paper have

$$\text{NPAF}_A(s) + \text{NPAF}_B(s) = 0, \quad s = 1, 2, \dots, n, \quad (3)$$

or

$$\text{PAF}_A(s) + \text{PAF}_B(s) = 0, \quad s = 1, 2, \dots, n, \quad (4)$$

and are said to have *zero non-periodic auto-correlation function* or *zero periodic auto-correlation function* respectively.

### 2.4 Trivial and Foundational Crystal Sets

We use the following notation:

$|N| = n$  is odd;

$N$  is the set  $\{0, 1, \dots, n-1\}$ ;

$\emptyset$  denotes the empty set;

$C$  is a protocystal set which is a crystal set,  $|C| = k$ ;

$PC$  is a protocystal set;

$C^C$  is the complement of a crystal set in  $N$ , equal to all the elements of  $N$  which are not in  $C$ ,  $|C^C| = n - k$ .

**Theorem 2** *Two sets which are identical (or one a shift of the other, that is, its elements are formed from the first set by adding a constant modulo the size of the set) can be used as crystal sets.*

*Alternatively, if  $PC$  is any protocystal set, then  $\{PC, PC\}$  that is, all  $2\text{-}(n; k, k)$  exist provided  $2n - 2k$  is the sum of two squares.*

**Lemma 2** *Both  $\{0\}$  and  $\{\emptyset\}$  are possible  $2\text{-}(n; 1, 0)$  crystal sets, for  $n$  odd and  $2n - 1$  the sum of two squares.*

**Lemma 3** *The following are always possible parameters for two crystal sets, where  $n$  is odd:*

- (i)  $\emptyset, C$ , are  $2\text{-}(n; 0, k)$  for  $2n - k$  the sum of two squares;
- (ii)  $N \setminus \{0\}, C$  are  $2\text{-}(n; n - 1, k)$  for  $(n - k - 1)$  the sum of two squares;
- (iii)  $\{0\}, C$  are  $2\text{-}(n; 1, k)$  for  $2n - 1 - k$  the sum of two squares;
- (iv)  $N, C$  are  $2\text{-}(n; n, k)$  for  $n - k$  the sum of two squares.

**Remark 1** Let  $n$  be odd and  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  be two protocystal sets of sizes  $k_1$  and  $k_2$  respectively. We recall from the properties of weighing matrices that  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  can only be  $2\text{-}(n, k_1, k_2)$  crystal sets if  $2n - k_1 - k_2$ , the number of non-zero elements, is the sum of two squares.

However it is possible that if  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  are not  $2\text{-}(n, k_1, k_2)$ , that is,  $2n - k_1 - k_2$  is not the sum of two squares, but

- (i)  $C_1$  and  $C_2^C$  could be  $2\text{-}(n, k_1, n - k_2)$  or
  - (ii)  $C_2$  and  $C_1^C$  could be  $2\text{-}(n, k_2, n - k_1)$  or
  - (iii)  $C_1^C$  and  $C_2^C$  could be  $2\text{-}(n, n - k_1, n - k_2)$
- if (i)  $n - k_1 + k_2$ , or (ii)  $n + k_1 - k_2$ , or (iii)  $(k_1 + k_2)$ , respectively, are the sum of two squares.

**Example 4** We note that for  $n = 11$ , there are no  $2\text{-}(11, 2, 6)$  crystal sets because  $2n - k_1 - k_2 = 14$  is not the sum of two squares. In fact:

- neither  $k_1 = 2$  nor  $k_2 = 6$  is the sum of two squares;
- $2n - k_1 - k_2 = 14$ ,  $n - k_1 + k_2 = 15$ : neither is the sum of two squares;
- $n + k_1 - k_2 = 7$ ,  $k_1 + k_2 = 8$  and 8 is two squares;
- $k_1 = 2 \neq k_2 = 6$ . This tells us that we only need to search for sets of size  $11 - 2$  and  $11 - 6$ , as in (iii).

**Lemma 4** If  $A = \{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_{k_1}\}$  and  $B = \{b_1, b_2, \dots, b_{k_2}\} \pmod{n}$ , with  $n$  odd, are two crystal sets  $(n; k_1, k_2; \mu)$ , then  $A^C$  and  $B^C$  are two crystal sets.

**Proof.** Let  $2L$  be the set of all differences from the set  $N = \{0, 1, 2, \dots, n-1\}$  and  $\Lambda_1$  be the set of differences from  $A$  and  $B$ . Then for  $n$  odd,  $2L$  contains  $1, 2, 3, \dots, n-1, 2n$  times,  $n$  odd. Hence  $A^C$  and  $B^C$  will contain each difference an even number of times.  $\square$

**Remark 2** In Lemma 4, if  $A$  has  $k_1$  elements and  $B$  has  $k_2$  elements, then  $A^C$  has  $n - k_1$  elements and  $B^C$  has  $n - k_2$  elements. In order to minimize any searches for crystal sets, we can consider the pair  $A, B$  or  $A^C, B^C$ , whichever has  $\min(k_2, n - k_1)$ .

**Example 5** For  $n = 11$ , let  $A, B$  have  $(k_1, k_2) = 6, 8$ . Hence  $(n - k_1, n - k_2) = (11 - 6, 11 - 8) = (5, 3)$  for  $A^C$  and  $B^C$ . So we could choose to search for the crystal sets with sizes 3 and 5, knowing that if they do not exist and  $\Lambda$  does not have each element an even number of times, then there are no crystal sets with sizes 6 and 8. If each element does occur an even number of times then  $A^C$  and  $B^C$  will be crystal sets.

**Lemma 5** *A 2- $\{n; k_1, k_2; \Lambda\}$  crystal set corresponds to even  $\text{PAF}_A(j) + \text{PAF}_B(j)$  for all  $j \in \Lambda$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose the crystal set needed to give the zero positions in the first row of the circulant matrices  $A = \text{circ}\{a_1, \dots, a_n\}$  and  $B = \text{circ}\{b_1, \dots, b_n\}$ , where the non-zero positions are marked  $*$ , meaning  $\pm 1$ . Write  $C = [AB]$ . Then if  $i \in \Lambda$ , it must occur  $2\lambda_i$  times. That means that in the inner product of row 1 of  $C$  with row  $i$  of  $C$ , a zero element occurs in the same  $2\lambda_i$  columns of  $C$ .

Rearranging the columns of  $C$  to obtain  $C^*$ , we see that row 1 and row  $i$  may be written as

$$\begin{array}{c} \overbrace{00 \dots 00}^{k_1+k_2} \quad \overbrace{* \dots * * *}^{2n-k_1-k_2} \\ \\ \underbrace{0 \dots 0}_{2\lambda_i} \quad \underbrace{* \dots *}_{(k_1+k_2-2\lambda_i)} \quad \underbrace{0 \dots 0}_{(k_1+k_2-2\lambda_i)} \quad \underbrace{* \dots *}_{(2n-2k_1-2k_2+2\lambda_i)} \end{array}$$

So the inner product of row 1 of  $C^*$  and row  $i$  of  $C^*$  has an even number of non-zero terms. Rearranging the columns back to  $C$  gives  $\text{PAF}_A(j) + \text{PAF}_B(j)$  is even, for all  $i \in \Lambda$ .  $\square$

**Corollary 2** *Let  $n = q^2 + q + 1$ ,  $q$  a prime power. Then there exists a 2- $\{n; q^2, 1; \Lambda\}$  crystal set where  $\Lambda$  is the elements  $1, 2, \dots, q^2, q$ , each  $q(q-1)$  times.*

**Proof.** For the first row of  $A$ , put the zeros in the positions given by the complement of the elements in the  $(q^2 + q + 1, q + 1, 1)$  difference set (from the projective plane) in the  $(q^2 + q + 1, q^2, q(q-1))$  difference set. For the first row of  $B$ , make the first element 0.

Now  $n = q^2 + q + 1$ ,  $k_1 = q^2$ ,  $k_2 = 1$  and  $2\lambda_i = q(q-1)$  for all  $i$ . So

$$\begin{aligned} \text{PAF}(i) &= 2q^2 + 2q + 2 - 2q^2 - 2 + 2\lambda_i \\ &= 2q + q^2 - q \\ &= q(q+1), \end{aligned}$$

which is always even.  $\square$

**Theorem 3** *Suppose there exists a cyclic difference set with parameters  $(v, k, \lambda)$ ,  $\lambda$  even,  $v$  odd. Then there exists a 2- $\{v; k, 1; \Lambda\}$  crystal set where  $\Lambda$  is the elements  $1, 2, \dots, v-1$ , each  $\lambda = \frac{k(k-1)}{v-1}$  times.*

**Proof.** Same as above, noting  $\text{PAF}(i) = 2v - 2k - 2 + \frac{k(k-1)}{v-1}$  is even.

**Remark 3** There are combinations, for example, a difference set repeated and 2- $\{v; k_1, k_2; 2\lambda\}$  sds which give similar results.

**Example 6** There is a  $(7, 4, 2)$  difference set  $\{0, 1, 2, 4\}$ , which can be used to give the crystal set  $\{0, 1, 2, 4\} \oplus \{0\}$  and the first rows:



$$\begin{array}{cccccc} 0 & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 & & 0 & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & & 0 & 1 & 1 & - & 1 & - & - \end{array}$$

which can be used in the two circulant construction.

**Example 7** There is a  $(13, 9, 6)$  difference set  $\{0, 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10\}$  which can be used to give the first two rows in the two circulant construction:

$$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccc} 0 & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 & 7 & 8 & 9 & 10 & 11 & 12 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & - & 1 & 1 & - & - & - & - & 1 & 1 & - & 1 \end{array}$$

### 3 Crystalization

In [4], Kotsireas and Koukouvinos have found a number of new  $W(2n, 2n - 5)$  weighing matrices constructed from two circulants, for  $n$  odd. They used  $A$  and  $B$  to denote the first rows of the two circulants used to construct a  $W(2n, 2n - 5)$  as per Theorem 1. In [4] it was observed, experimentally, that if one fixes the locations of four of the five zeros for the sequences to make a  $W(2n, 2n - 5)$  as shown in (5),

$$\begin{array}{l} A = 0 \ 0 \ a_3 \ \dots \ a_n \\ B = 0 \ 0 \ b_3 \ \dots \ b_n \end{array} \tag{5}$$

then the fifth zero, for the pattern  $(3,2)$  or  $(2,3)$ , can only appear in precisely the position  $\frac{n+3}{2}$  in one or the other of  $A$  and  $B$ . Thus we have more generally:

**Theorem 4** *The crystalization pattern  $(t, 1)$  in length  $n$ ,  $n$  odd, is only possible if there is a single crystal set  $(n, t, \Lambda)$ .*

**Proof.** The second sequence,  $B$ , with a single zero, has the corresponding protocystal set  $\{0\}$ , which has each difference occurring an even number of times, that is, zero times. Hence if there is a single crystal set  $(n, t, \Lambda)$ , we have two sets which have  $\Lambda$  as the totality of differences and they are all even.  $\square$

**Lemma 6** *The two sets  $C_1 = \{0, j, n - j\}$  and  $C_2 = \{j, n - j\}$  are  $2$ - $(n; 3, 2)$  crystal sets,  $n$  odd.*

**Proof.** Here  $C_1$  has differences  $\pm j, \pm(n - j), \pm(n - 2j)$ , and  $C_2$  has differences  $\pm(n - 2j)$  and modulo  $n$ ,  $n$  odd. Thus each difference occurs an even number of times and so we have two crystal sets or  $2$ - $(n; 3, 2)$  crystal sets.  $\square$

**Remark 4** These can be used to give the potential zeros of the first rows of two  $0, \pm 1$  circulant matrices giving a  $W(2n, 2n - 5)$  for  $2n - 5$  the sum of two squares,  $n$  odd.

**Remark 5** Kotsiras and Koukouvinos [4] have had great success when searching for cases where there is a total of  $2n - j$  zeros,  $j \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

### 3.1 Crystalization Pattern $(k, \ell)$ or $2-(n; k, \ell)$ Crystal Sets

In future, if the number of zeros in the sequences (first rows)  $A$  and  $B$  are both equal to  $\ell$ , we will say the sequences have pattern  $(\ell, \ell)$ ; if the number of zeros in  $A$  and  $B$  is  $k$  and  $\ell$ , with  $k > \ell$ , respectively, then we will say the sequences have pattern  $(k, \ell)$  [2]. This is the same as saying the structural pattern  $(k, \ell)$  means

there are  $k$  zeros in  $[a_1, \dots, a_n]$  and  $\ell$  zeros in  $[b_1, \dots, b_n]$ .

This pattern of the zeros has been called the  $(n; k, \ell)$  *crystalization* of the zeros. The positions of the non-zero elements in any sequence has been called *the support*.

We will generalize the notion of *crystalization* as outlined in [4] by using *crystal sets*.

**Theorem 5** *Suppose  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  are  $2-(n; k_1, k_2)$  crystal sets. Then  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  can be used to place the zeros for the  $(k_1, k_2)$  structural pattern for the construction of two circulant matrices which may give a weighing matrix.*

**Proof.** Form the totality,  $\Lambda$ , of the differences from the elements of the crystal sets. Suppose difference  $i$  occurs  $\lambda_i$  times in  $\Lambda$ . If the elements of the crystal sets are the zero elements of the first rows of two circulant  $0, \pm 1$  matrices of order  $n$  (even or odd), then the inner product of row 1 and row  $i$  will have  $(2n - 2(k_1 + k_2) + \lambda_i)$ , an even number, of non-zero entries.

This is the same as saying  $\text{PAF}(A, i) + \text{PAF}(B, i)$  is even for all  $i = 1, \dots, \frac{n-1}{2}$ . It must be even so the number of non-zero entries is able to be even, and so, the number of +1s and -1s can cancel to give inner product of rows  $k$  and  $k + i - 1$  to be zero.  $\square$

**Corollary 3** *The two first rows of two circulant weighing matrices must have their zeros in the positions of crystal sets.*

### 3.2 Crystals Sets from Difference Sets and SDS

From Seberry Wallis [9] we see that  $2-(n; k_1, k_2; \lambda)$  sds are similar to  $2-(n; k_1, k_2)$  crystal sets, except that each non-zero difference in  $\Lambda$  must occur the same number of times,  $\lambda$ , and occurs for both even and odd entries.

**Theorem 6** *Suppose there exist  $2-(n; k_1, k_2; \lambda)$  sds (for reference see [8, 9]) with  $\lambda$  even; then they form  $2-(n; k_1, k_2; \lambda)$  crystal sets, and the complementary  $2-(n; n - k_1, n - k_2; 2n - 2k_1 - 2k_2 + \lambda)$  sds or  $2-(n; n - k_1, n - k_2)$  crystal sets.*

Similarly a *difference set*  $(n, k, \lambda)$  is a single set with each non-zero difference in  $\Lambda$  occurring the same number of times,  $\lambda$ .

**Theorem 7** *Every  $(n, k, \lambda)$  difference set with  $\lambda$  even is a single  $(n, k)$ PC.*

Thus we can sometimes combine difference sets to give crystal sets:

**Theorem 8** A  $(n, k_1, \lambda_1)$  difference set together with a  $(n, k_2, \lambda_2)$  difference set, where  $\lambda_1 + \lambda_2$  is even, gives  $2-(n; k_1, k_2)$  crystal sets.

**Definition 3** We call the sets  $(n, n)$ PC,  $(n, 0)$ PC,  $(n, 1)$ PC and  $(n, n-1)$ PC, which always exist, the *trivial cases*. For convenience we will write them as  $(n, \psi)$ PS. We note that in all trivial cases all entries of  $\Lambda$  occur an even number of times.

**Theorem 9** Suppose there exists a  $(n, k, \lambda)$  difference set,  $n$  odd. Then its complementary  $(n, n-k, n-2k+\lambda)$  difference set also exists. If  $\lambda$  is odd (respectively even), then  $n-2k+\lambda$  will be even (or odd respectively). We suppose the  $(n, k, \lambda)$  difference set,  $n$  odd, has  $\lambda$  even (if not we will use the complementary set). Then the  $(n, k, \lambda)$  ( $\lambda$  even) difference set and any  $(n, \psi)$ PC trivial set give  $2-(n; k, \psi)$  crystal sets.

**Theorem 10** Suppose  $n = q^2 + q + 1$ ,  $q$  a prime power. Then there exist  $2-(q^2 + q + 1; q^2, 1)$  crystal sets. If  $n = q^2 + q + 1$  is a prime there exists a  $W(2(q^2 + q + 1), q^2 + 1)$ .

**Proof.** For these values of  $q$  there is a projective plane of order  $q$  which gives a  $(q^2 + q + 1, q^2, q(q-1))$  difference set. The Legendre construction [11, p9] shows there is a  $\{0, \pm 1\}$  circulant matrix of order  $n$ ,  $n$  an odd prime, with  $n-1$  non-zero elements for each row and column and inner products of rows  $-1$ . The incidence matrix of the projective plane has inner product of all its rows 1. Thus these two circulant matrices give the first rows for our 2-circulant matrices to construct the  $2-CW(2(q^2 + q + 1), q^2 + 1)$ .  $\square$

**Example 8**  $\{1, 2, 4\}$  is a  $2-(7, 2, 1)$  difference set. So we use this to make the complementary  $2-(7, 4, 2)$  difference set and with the trivial set with 1 element we find the 2-complementary sequences:

$$0 \ 1 \ 1 \ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 : 0 \ 1 \ 1 \ - \ 1 \ - \ -$$

This example was shown us by I. Kotsireas.

### 3.3 Crystalization Pattern (3, 2) or $2-(n; 3, 2)$ Crystal Sets, $n$ odd

**Remark 6** From Lemma 6 we see that these crystal sets exist for all odd size sets. This greatly reduces the search space in looking for  $(0, \pm 1)$  with zero periodic auto-correlation function as we have cut the search space from  $3^{2n-2}$  to  $2^{2n-5}$ .

### 3.4 The partition (4,1)

**Remark 7** Kotsireas and Koukouvinos [4] mentioned the possibility of the pattern (4, 1) and Kotsireas provided the only known example. These results inspired us to consider the more general question of when the partition (4, 1) could exist.

We note that the general pattern for four zeros in one set is

$$0, \underbrace{*, \dots, *}_j, 0, \underbrace{*, \dots, *}_k, 0, \underbrace{*, \dots, *}_\ell, 0, \underbrace{*, \dots, *}_m,$$

where

$$n = j + k + \ell + m + 4. \tag{6}$$

□

This general arrangement means we can write the zeros as occurring at positions  $x_1 = 0, x_2 = j + 1, x_3 = j + k + 2, x_4 = j + k + \ell + 3$ . We assume  $j, k, \ell, m$  are all nonnegative and each is less than or equal to  $n - 4$ . So the differences we obtain are

$(x_i - x_j)$	0	$j + 1$	$j + k + 2$	$j + k + \ell + 3$
0	*	$j + 1$	$j + k + 2$	$j + k + \ell + 3$
$j + 1$	$-j - 1$	*	$k + 1$	$k + \ell + 2$
$j + k + 2$	$-j - k - 2$	$-k - 1$	*	$\ell + 1$
$j + k + \ell + 3$	$-j - k - \ell - 3$	$-k - \ell - 2$	$-\ell - 1$	*

and each must occur an even number of times, that is, 0 or 2 or 4 . . . .

**Remark 8** We observe that if  $j = k = \ell = m$  then Equation (6) becomes  $4j = n - 4$ , which is not possible for  $j, k, \ell, m$  all non-negative integers when  $n$  is odd.

**Remark 9** We note none of  $j, k, \ell, m$  can be  $-1 \pmod n$ , as each of them is non-negative and  $\leq n - 4$ . For any of them to be non-zero it would have to be the equivalent of  $(n - 1) \pmod n$ . This is not possible. This is exclusion by the pigeonhole principle.

**Lemma 7** Suppose  $n$  is odd. Then if the element given by  $(x_i - x_j) \pmod n$  is even, the element given by  $(x_j - x_i) \pmod n$  will be odd (and vice versa). Hence  $j + 1 \not\equiv (-j - 1) \pmod n$ .

**Lemma 8** Suppose  $n$  is odd. Then it is only possible for two of  $j, k, \ell$  and  $m$  to be equal if  $7|n$ .

**Proof.** Without any loss of generality we will write  $j = k = a - 1$  and  $j + k + \ell + 3 = b$  (that is,  $b = n - m - 1$ ). Then the differences from  $x_1 = 0, x_2 = a, x_3 = 2a$  and  $x_b = b$  are given in the following table:

$(x_i - x_j) \pmod n$	0	$a$	$2a$	$b$
0	*	$a$	$2a$	$b$
$a$	$-a$	*	$a$	$b - a$
$2a$	$-2a$	$-a$	*	$b - 2a$
$b$	$-b$	$a - b$	$2a - b$	*

Those that have not already paired are:

$$2a, -2a, b, -b, b - a, a - b, b - 2a, 2a - b.$$

We note that  $2a \neq b$  since that causes the zero difference to occur. This also occurs if  $2a$  is set equal to  $2a - b$ .

We try setting  $2a$  equal to each of the other differences in turn. We have, from Lemma 7, that  $2a \neq -2a$ . Now  $2a \neq b$  as this would leave the differences  $a$  and  $-a$  to be paired, which is not possible by Lemma 7.

Setting  $2a = b - a$  gives the differences  $\{2a, 3a, 2a, a, -2a, -3a, -2a, -a\}$  or just  $\{3a, a, -3a, -a\}$  to be paired, which implies  $2|n$ . Setting  $2a = a - b$  gives the same result.

Setting  $2a = b - 2a$  gives the differences  $\{2a, 4a, 3a, 2a, -2a, -4a, -3a, -a\}$  or just  $\{3a, 4a, -4a, -3a\}$  to be paired, which implies  $2|n$  or  $7|n$ . Setting  $2a = -b$  gives the same result.

Thus, since  $n$  is odd, we have the result. □

**Theorem 11** *The general pattern (4, 1) described above can only exist for  $n$ , odd, if  $n$  is divisible by 7. This means we can only have  $\{0, 1, 2, 4\}$  modulo 7 or  $\{0, \alpha, 2\alpha, 4\alpha\}$  modulo  $7\alpha$ .*

**Proof.** The “1” in the partition is obtained by having zeros on the main diagonal of  $B$ . From the above array there are a total of 12 differences which arise from the first set. We consider their equality with the first,  $j + 1$ , one by one.

- Case 1** By Lemma 7,  $j + 1 \neq (-j - 1) \pmod{n}$ .
- Case 2** Suppose  $j + 1 = j + k + 2$ . Then  $k = -1 \equiv n - 1 \pmod{n}$ . This is excluded by the previous remark.
- Case 3** Suppose  $j + 1 = j + k + \ell + 3$ . This is equivalent to saying  $k + \ell + 2 = 0$ . This is also excluded, since all are non-negative.
- Case 4** Suppose  $j + 1 = k + 1$ . This is covered by Lemma 8.
- Case 5** Suppose  $j + 1 = \ell + 1$ . This is covered by Lemma 8.
- Case 6** Suppose  $j + 1 = -k - 1$ . This means  $j + k \equiv -2$  and so is excluded by the pigeonhole principle and that all are non-negative.
- Case 7** Suppose  $j + 1 = -j - k - \ell - 3$ . Then  $j = m$ ; this is covered by Lemma 8.
- Case 8** Suppose  $j + 1 = -k - \ell - 2$ , that is,  $j + k + \ell + 3 = n$ . Here, using Equation (6), we have  $n = m + 1$ , which is not possible as  $m = -1$  is excluded by the pigeonhole principle.
- Case 9** Suppose  $j + 1 = -\ell - 1$ . Then  $j + \ell \equiv -2 \pmod{n}$  and so is excluded by the pigeonhole principle.
- Case 10** Suppose  $j + 1 = -j - k - 2$ . Then  $2j + k + 3 \equiv 0$ . This is not possible as  $j$  and  $k$  are non-negative.
- Case 11** Suppose  $j + 1 = k + \ell + 2$ . Using Equation (6) this means  $j + j + 3 + m \equiv n \pmod{n}$ .

To simplify the visualization of this case we will rewrite the above array using  $k + \ell = j - 1$  and then use symbols to identify obviously even numbers of entries. Thus we have

$(x_i - x_j) \pmod{n}$	0	$j + 1$	$j + k + 2$	$j + k + \ell + 3$
0	*	$j + 1$	$j + k + 2$	$2j + 2$
$j + 1$	$-j - 1$	*	$k + 1$	$j + 1$
$j + k + 2$	$-j - k - 2$	$-k - 1$	*	$\ell + 1$
$j + k + \ell + 3$	$-2j - 2$	$-j - 1$	$-\ell - 1$	*

Thus we have the following; as yet unpaired differences is  $\Lambda$ :

$$\Lambda_1 = \{k+1, \ell+1, 2j+2, j+k+2, -k-1, -\ell-1, -2j-2, -j-k-2\}.$$

The only possibilities for  $k+1$  are  $2j+2, j+k+2, -\ell-1, -2j-2$  or  $-j-k-2$ . So we can have the following cases:

**Case 11.1** Suppose  $k+1 = j+k+2$ ; then  $j = -1$  which is not possible by the pigeonhole principle.

**Case 11.2** Suppose  $k+1 = -\ell-1$ . Then  $k+\ell+2 = 0$ . This is not possible.

**Case 11.3** Suppose  $k+1 = -2j-2$ . Then  $2j+k+3 = 0$ . So  $k = m$ . This is covered by Lemma 8. This is not possible.

**Case 11.4** Suppose  $k+1 = -j-k-2$ . However this is not possible as all the remaining differences cannot be paired.

**Case 11.5** Suppose  $k+1 = 2j+2$ . Then we form  $\Lambda$ :

$$\Lambda_1 = \{k+1, \ell+1, k+1, 3j+3, -2j-2, -\ell-1, -2j-2, -3j-3\}.$$

This means the unpaired elements are

$$\{\ell+1, 3j+3, -\ell-1, -3j-3\}.$$

This means that in order to pair them,  $\ell+1 = 3j+3$  or  $\ell+1 = -3j-3$ . Now  $\ell+1 = -3j-3$  gives  $3j+\ell+4 = 0$ , which is not possible.

The remaining pair is  $\ell+1 = 3j+3$  or  $3j = \ell-2$  or  $3j \leq n-6$ , which is possible. Working backwards we have  $\Lambda =$

$$\{j+1, j+1, -j-1, -j-1, 2j+2, 3j+3, 2j+2, 3j+3, -2j-2, -3j-3, -2j-2, -3j-3\}.$$

Hence the only surviving case is that of  $n$  divisible by 7. We replace  $3j+3$  by  $-4j-4$  to clarify the following. This means we can only have  $\{0, 1, 2, 4\}$  modulo 7 or  $\{0, \alpha, 2\alpha, 4\alpha\}$  modulo  $7\alpha$ .  $\square$

We have shown that the general pattern (4.1), that is,  $2 - (2n; 4, 1)$  crystal sets can only exist when  $7|n$ . This leads us to speculate that that the patterns  $(q^2, 1)$ , that is,  $2 - (2n; q^2, 1)$  crystal sets, will only exist when  $q^2 + q + 1$  is a prime and  $(q^2 + q + 1)|n$ .

## 4 Search space size reduction in the search for Proto-crystal sets.

### 4.1 Significance of these results

In a naive search for crystal sets we would first decide to search for all protocystal set sizes for  $k_1, k_2$  from zero to  $n$ .

Next we would see that there is no need to look for  $k_2 = 0$  unless  $k_1$  is a square.

Next we note from Remark 1 that we can reduce our search by only considering this remark and its consequences; the overall search is limited to  $(\frac{n-1}{2})^2$  cases to establish existences (of course there will be far more considering inequivalence).

Now we see that  $k_1 = k_2$  is a special case. We also see that  $k_1 = 1, k_2 = 0$  is a special case; Lemma 6 tells us these always exist.

The search is now further reduced by applying Corollary 1.

Crystal Sets under $n = 9$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8\}$								
	$k_1$	$k_2$	$2n$ $-k_1$ $-k_2$	$n$ $-k_1$ $+k_2$	$k_1$ $+k_2$	$k_1$ $= k_2$	$a^2$ $+b^2$	Reference
1	1	5		13			$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
2	2	2		9		Y	$3^2 + 0^2$	Theorem 2
3	2	3	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
4	2	6	10				$1^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
5	3	3	9			Y	$3^2 + 0^2$	Theorem 2
6	3	6	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
7	3	7	8				$2^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
8	4	4	10			Y	$3^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
9	4	5	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
10	4	8	13				$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
11	4	9	5				$1^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1

Table 1  $n = 9$ : Values for which  $k_1$  and  $k_2$  can give crystal sets

Crystal Sets under $n = 11$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10\}$								
	$k_1$	$k_2$	$2n$ $-k_1$ $-k_2$	$n$ $-k_1$ $+k_2$	$k_1$ $+k_2$	$k_1$ $+k_2$	$a^2$ $+b^2$	Reference
1	1	5	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
2	2	2	18			Y	$3^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
3	2	3	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
4	2	6			8		$2^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
5	2	7	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
6	3	3	16			Y	$4^2 + 0^2$	Theorem 2
7	3	6	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
8	3	7			10		$1^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
9	4	4			8	Y	$2^2 + 2^2$	Theorem 2
10	4	5	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
11	4	8	10				$3^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
12	4	9	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
13	5	5			10	Y	$1^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
14	5	8	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
15	5	9	8				$2^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1

Table 2  $n = 11$ : Values for which  $k_1$  and  $k_2$  can give crystal sets

We assume the set is of size  $n$  and we search for sets of size  $k < n$ .

## 5 Algorithm

```

... pseudocode
MAIN(v)
1  ← input
2  if  $v \geq 2$ 
3  then GENERATE SUBSETS UNDER  $V(v)$ 


---


BOOL DETERMINE(Total[1000], NUM)
1  a[100], b[100] ← 0
2  i, j, k, cnt, No ← 0
3  for i ← 0 to NUM
4  do for j ← 0 to cnt
5  do if a[j] == Total[i]
6  then break
7  if j == cnt
8  then a[cnt + 1] ← Total[i]
9  b[cnt - 1] + +
10 else b[j] + +
11 for k ← 0 to cnt
12 do if b[k] mod 2 == 1
13 then break
14 else No + +
15 if No == cnt
16 then return true
17 else return false


---


SORTING(TotalSet[1000], num)
1  i, j, k, x ← 0
2  k ← num/2
3  while k ≥ 1
4  do for i ← k to num
5  do x ← TotalSet[i]
6  j ← i - k
7  while j ≥ 0 and x ≤ TotalSet[j]
8  do TotalSet[j + k] ← TotalSet[j]
9  j ← j - k
10 TotalSet[j + k] ← x;
11 k ← k/2


---


CRYSTALLIZATION(n)
1  i, j, q, p, t ← 0
2  M ← pow(2, n - 1) + 1
3  malloc SubSet[i]
4  malloc Length[i]
5  _____ Generate subsets under v
6  a, b ← 0
7  position ← 0
8  set[100] ← 0
9  set[position] ← 0
10 for i ← 0 to  $2^{n-1}$ 
11 do if set[i] == 0
12 then SubSet[a][b] ← set[i]
13 b ← b + 1
14 else break
15 for i ← 1 to position
16 do SubSet[a][b] ← set[i]
17 b ← b + 1
18 Length[a][0] = b
19 if set[position] < n - 1
20 then set[position + 1] ← set[position] + 1
21 position ← position + 1
22 if position ≠ 0
23 then position ← position - 1
24 set[position] ← set[position] + 1
25 else break
26 _____ Calculate the differences
27 for p ← 0 to M - 1
28 do if Length[p][0] ≤ (n - 1)/2
29 then if (Length[p][0] * (Length[p][0] - 1)) mod 4 == 0
30 then for q ← 0 to M - 1
31 do Totality[1000] ← 0
32 Num ← 0
33 if (Length[q][0] * (Length[q][0] - 1)) mod 4 == 0
34 then Totality[Num] ← (SubSet[p][i] - SubSet[p][j]) mod n
35
36 SORTING(Totality, Num)
37 if Determine(Totality, Num)
38 then Print Crystal Sets
39
40 for p ← 0 to M - 1
41 do if Length[p][0] ≤ (n - 1)/2
42 then if (Length[p][0] * (Length[p][0] - 1)) mod 4 ≠ 0
43 then for q ← 0 to M - 1
44 do Totality[1000] ← 0
45 Num ← 0
46 if (Length[q][0] * (Length[q][0] - 1)) mod 4 ≠ 0
47 then Totality[Num] ← (SubSet[p][i] - SubSet[p][j]) mod n
48 SORTING(Totality, Num)
49 if Determine(Totality, Num)
50 then Print Crystal Sets
51 for i ← 0 to M
52 do free(SubSet[i])

```



## 6 Further Research

Prove the conjecture:

**Conjecture 1** *The patterns  $(q^2, 1)$ , that is,  $2 - (2n; q^2, 1)$  crystal sets will only exist when  $q^2 + q + 1$  is a prime and  $(q^2 + q + 1)|n$ .*

Find further ways to cut down the search space. Find more infinite families of crystal sets.

## Appendices

### A More permissible values of $n$ , $k_1$ and $k_2$

#### A.1 $n = 13$

Crystal Sets under $n = 13$ , Universal Set = {0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12}								
	$k_1$	$k_2$	$2n$ $- k_1$ $- k_2$	$n$ $- k_1$ $+ k_2$	$k_1$ $+ k_2$	$k_1$ $= k_2$	$a^2$ $+ b^2$	Reference
1	1	9	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
2	2	2		13		Y	$2^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
3	2	3			5		$1^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
4	2	6	18				$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
5	2	7			9		$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
6	3	3	20			Y	$4^2 + 2^2$	Theorem 2
7	3	6	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
8	3	7	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
9	3	10	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
10	4	4	18			Y	$3^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
11	4	5	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
12	4	8		17			$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
13	4	9	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
14	4	12	10				$1^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
15	4	13	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
16	5	5	16			Y	$4^2 + 0^2$	Theorem 2
17	5	8	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
18	5	9		17			$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
19	6	6		13		Y	$2^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
20	6	7	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
21	6	10	10				$1^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
22	6	11	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1

A.2  $n = 15$ 

Crystal Sets under $n = 15$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14\}$								
	$k_1$	$k_2$	$2n$ $- k_1$ $- k_2$	$n -$ $k_1$ $+ k_2$	$k_1$ $+ k_2$	$k_1$ $= k_2$	$a^2$ $+ b^2$	Reference
1	1	5	24	19				Remark 1
2	1	8			9		$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
3	1	9	20				$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
4	2	2	26			Y	$5^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
5	2	3	25				$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
6	2	6			8		$2^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
7	2	7		20			$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
8	2	10	18				$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
9	2	11	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
10	3	3	24	15		Y		Theorem 2
11	3	6		18			$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
12	3	7	20				$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
13	3	10	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
14	3	11	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
15	4	4			8	Y	$2^2 + 2^2$	Theorem 2
16	4	5	21	16			$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
17	4	8	18				$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
18	4	9	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
19	4	12			16		$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
20	4	13	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
21	5	5	20			Y	$4^2 + 2^2$	Theorem 2
22	5	8	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
23	5	9	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
24	5	12	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
25	5	13			18		$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
26	6	6	18			Y	$3^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
27	6	7	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
28	6	10			16		$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
29	6	11	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
30	6	14	10				$1^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
31	6	15	9				$0^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
32	7	7	16			Y	$4^2 + 0^2$	Theorem 2
33	7	10	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
34	7	11			18		$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
35	7	14	9				$0^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
36	7	15	8				$2^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1

A.3  $n = 17$

Crystal Sets under $n = 17$ , Universal Set = {0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16}								
	$k_1$	$k_2$	$2n - k_1 - k_2$	$n - k_1 + k_2$	$k_1 + k_2$	$k_1 = k_2$	$a^2 + b^2$	Reference
1	1	9		25			$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
2	2	2		17		Y	$4^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
3	2	3	29				$5^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
4	2	6	26				$5^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
5	2	7	25				$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
6	2	10		25			$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
7	2	11			13		$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
8	3	3		17		Y	$4^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
9	3	6	25				$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
10	3	7			10		$3^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
11	3	10			13		$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
12	3	11	20				$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
13	4	4	26			Y	$5^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
14	4	5	25				$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
15	4	8		13			$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
16	4	9		13			$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
17	4	12	18				$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
18	4	13	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
19	5	5		17		Y	$4^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
20	5	8			13		$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
21	5	9	20				$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
22	5	12	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
23	5	13	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
24	6	6		17		Y	$4^2 + 1^2$	Theorem 2
25	6	7		18			$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
26	6	10	18				$3^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
27	6	11	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
28	6	14			20		$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
29	6	15	13				$4^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
30	7	7	20			Y	$4^2 + 2^2$	Theorem 2
31	7	10	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
32	7	11	16				$4^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
33	7	14	13				$2^2 + 3^2$	Remark 1
34	7	15		25			$5^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
35	8	8	18			Y	$3^2 + 3^2$	Theorem 2
36	8	9	17				$4^2 + 1^2$	Remark 1
37	8	12			20		$4^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
38	8	13	13				$3^2 + 2^2$	Remark 1
39	8	16	10				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1
40	8	17	9				$3^2 + 0^2$	Remark 1

## B Examples of Permissible $n, k_1$ and $k_2$

### B.1 $n = 9$

Crystal Sets under $n = 9$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8\}$			
	$k_1$	$k_2$	Sample
1	1	5	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,5\}$
2	2	2	$\{0,1\};\{0,8\}$
3	2	3	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,5\}$
4	2	6	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,4,5,7\}$
5	3	3	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,7,8\}$
6	3	6	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6\}$
7	3	7	$\{0,1,3\};\{0,1,3,4,5,6,8\}$
8	4	4	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,5,7\}$
9	4	5	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,2,3,6\}$
10	4	8	$\{0,1,3,6\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8\}$
11	4	9	$\{0,1,3,6\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8\}$

### B.2 $n = 11$

Crystal Sets under $n = 11$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10\}$			
	$k_1$	$k_2$	Sample
1	1	5	$\{0\};\{0,1,2,4,7\}$
2	2	2	$\{0,1\};\{0,10\}$
3	2	3	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,6\}$
4	2	6	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,4,5,8\}$
5	2	7	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,3,4,6,7\}$
6	3	3	$\{0,1,3\};\{0,1,9\}$
7	3	6	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,3,6,7,9\}$
8	3	7	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,3,5,7,10\}$
9	4	4	$\{0,1,2,4\};\{0,2,9,10\}$
10	4	5	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,2,3,7\}$
11	4	8	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6,7,9\}$
12	4	9	$\{0,1,3,5\};\{0,1,2,3,5,7,8,9,10\}$
13	5	5	$\{0,1,2,3,4\};\{0,1,5,7,8\}$
14	5	8	$\{0,1,2,3,5\};\{0,1,3,4,6,7,8,10\}$
15	5	9	$\{0,1,2,3,5\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8,9\}$

B.3  $n = 13$ 

Crystal Sets under $n = 13$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12\}$			
	$k_1$	$k_2$	Sample
1	1	9	$\{0\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10\}$
2	2	2	$\{0, 1\}; \{0, 12\}$
3	2	3	$\{0, 1\}; \{0, 6, 7\}$
4	2	6	$\{0, 1\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 5, 7\}$
5	2	7	$\{0, 1\}; \{0, 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 11\}$
6	3	3	$\{0, 1, 2\}; \{0, 1, 12\}$
7	3	6	$\{0, 1, 2\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 8\}$
8	3	7	$\{0, 1, 2\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 10\}$
9	3	10	$\{0, 1, 4\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11\}$
10	4	4	$\{0, 1, 2, 3\}; \{0, 1, 4, 9\}$
11	4	5	$\{0, 1, 2, 3\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 8\}$
12	4	8	$\{0, 1, 2, 3\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 10\}$
13	4	9	$\{0, 1, 2, 3\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 12\}$
14	4	12	$\{0, 1, 3, 9\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11\}$
15	4	13	$\{0, 1, 4, 6\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12\}$
16	5	5	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 12\}$
17	5	8	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 8, 11\}$
18	5	9	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10\}$
19	6	6	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 12\}$
20	6	7	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 9\}$
21	6	10	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5\}; \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11\}$
22	6	11	$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 6, 8\}; \{0, 1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12\}$

B.4  $n = 15$ 

Crystal Sets under $n = 15$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14\}$			
	$k_1$	$k_2$	Sample
1	1	5	$\{0\};\{0,1,5,6,10\}$
2	1	8	$\{0\};\{0,1,2,4,6,7,10,14\}$
3	1	9	$\{0\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8,12\}$
4	2	2	$\{0,1\};\{0,14\}$
5	2	3	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,8\}$
6	2	6	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,3,8,12\}$
7	2	7	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,5,6,9,11\}$
8	2	10	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,8,9,10,12\}$
9	2	11	$\{0,1\};\{0,1,2,3,4,6,8,9,11,12,13\}$
10	3	3	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,14\}$
11	3	6	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,4,6,9\}$
12	3	7	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,5,8,10,13\}$
13	3	10	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8,9,10\}$
14	3	11	$\{0,1,2\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6,7,8,9,12,13\}$
15	4	4	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,2,14\}$
16	4	5	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,7,13,14\}$
17	4	8	$\{0,1,2,3\};\{0,1,2,3,4,6,7,12\}$
18	4	9	$\{0,7,8,12\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,8,10,12\}$
19	4	12	$\{0,7,8,12\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,13\}$
20	4	13	$\{0,7,9,10\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6,7,9,10,11,12,13, 14\}$
21	5	5	$\{0,1,2,3,4\};\{0,1,2,3,14\}$
22	5	8	$\{0,1,2,3,4\};\{0,1,2,3,4,6,9,11\}$
23	5	9	$\{0,1,2,3,4\};\{0,1,2,4,5,7,8,10,12\}$
24	5	12	$\{0,3,6,9,11\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,8,9,10,11,12,13, 14\}$
25	5	13	$\{0,3,6,9,11\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11, 14\}$
26	6	6	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\};\{0,1,2,3,4,14\}$
27	6	7	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,10\}$
28	6	10	$\{0,1,2,3,4,6\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8,10,13\}$
29	6	11	$\{0,7,8,12,13,14\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6,8,11,12,13, 14\}$
30	6	14	$\{0,3,6,9,10,12\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10, 11,12,13\}$
31	6	15	$\{0,1,2,3,7,9\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11, 12,13,14\}$
32	7	7	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,14\}$
33	7	10	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\};\{0,1,2,3,5,6,7,9,11,14\}$
34	7	11	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,12,13\}$
35	7	14	$\{0,1,2,4,5,8,10\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10, 11,12,13\}$
36	7	15	$\{0,1,2,4,5,8,10\};\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10, 11,12,13,14\}$

B.5  $n = 17$

Crystal Sets under $n = 17$ , Universal Set = $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16\}$			
	$k_1$	$k_2$	Sample
1	1	9	$\{0\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,10,12\}$
2	2	2	$\{0,1\}; \{0,16\}$
3	2	3	$\{0,1\}; \{0,1,9\}$
4	2	6	$\{0,1\}; \{0,1,2,3,6,13\}$
5	2	7	$\{0,1\}; \{0,1,2,4,5,8,14\}$
6	2	10	$\{0,1\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,6,8,10,11,14\}$
7	2	11	$\{0,1\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9,12,14\}$
8	3	3	$\{0,1,2\}; \{0,1,16\}$
9	3	6	$\{0,1,2\}; \{0,1,3,7,10,11\}$
10	3	7	$\{0,1,2\}; \{0,2,3,5,7,12,13\}$
11	3	10	$\{0,1,2\}; \{0,2,3,5,9,10,13,14,15,16\}$
12	3	11	$\{0,1,2\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9,10,13\}$
13	4	4	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,16\}$
14	4	5	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,3,10\}$
15	4	8	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,3,5,6,7,11\}$
16	4	9	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,3,5,6,8,10,16\}$
17	4	12	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9,10,12,13\}$
18	4	13	$\{0,1,2,3\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,6,7,8,10,11,12,13,15\}$
19	5	5	$\{0,1,2,3,4\}; \{0,1,2,3,16\}$
20	5	8	$\{0,1,2,3,4\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,7,8,14\}$
21	5	9	$\{0,1,2,3,4\}; \{0,1,2,3,5,6,10,14\}$
22	5	12	$\{0,1,2,3,4\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9,10,11,12\}$
23	5	13	$\{0,1,2,3,5\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,6,7,8,10,11,12,14,15\}$
24	6	6	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,16\}$
25	6	7	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,11\}$
26	6	10	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,6,11,12,13,14\}$
27	6	11	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,6,8,12,13,15,16\}$
28	6	14	$\{0,1,2,3,4,8\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,13,14\}$
29	6	15	$\{0,1,2,3,5,8\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,12,13,14,15\}$
30	7	7	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,16\}$
31	7	10	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,7,9,10,11,14\}$
32	7	11	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,8,9,10,11,14,16\}$
33	7	14	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,7\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9,10,11,12,14,15\}$
34	7	15	$\{0,1,2,3,5,7,15\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,10,11,12,13,14,15\}$
35	8	8	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,16\}$
36	8	9	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,12\}$
37	8	12	$\{0,2,4,6,8,9,10,11\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,10,11,12,14\}$
38	8	13	$\{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,8\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,11,12,15\}$
39	8	16	$\{0,1,2,3,4,8,9,12\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,16\}$
40	8	17	$\{0,1,2,3,4,8,9,12\}; \{0,1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,16\}$

References

- [1] L. D. Baumert, *Cyclic Difference Sets*, Lecture Notes in Mathematics, Vol. 182, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg-New York, 1971.
- [2] K. T. Arasu, I. S. Kotsireas, C. Koukouvinos and J. Seberry, On circulant and two-circulant weighing matrices, *Australas. J. Combin.* 48 (2010), 43-51.

- [3] A. V. Geramita and J. Seberry, *Orthogonal Designs: Quadratic Forms and Hadamard Matrices*, Lecture Notes in Pure and Applied Mathematics, 45, Marcel Dekker Inc. New York, 1979.
- [4] I. S. Kotsireas and C. Koukouvinos, New weighing matrices of order  $2n$  and weight  $2n - 5$ , *J. Combin. Math. Combin. Comput.* 70 (2009), 197–205.
- [5] I. S. Kotsireas, C. Koukouvinos and Jennifer Seberry, New weighing matrices of order  $2n$  and weight  $2n - 9$ , *J. Combin. Math. Combin. Comput.* 72 (2010), 49–54.
- [6] I. S. Kotsireas, C. Koukouvinos and Jennifer Seberry, Weighing matrices and string sorting, *Ann. Comb.* 13 (2009), 305–313.
- [7] C. Koukouvinos and J. Seberry, New weighing matrices and orthogonal designs constructed using two sequences with zero autocorrelation function—a review, *J. Statist. Plann. Inf.* 81 No. 1 (1999), 153–182.
- [8] Jennifer Seberry Wallis, On supplementary difference sets, *Aequationes Math.* 8 (1972), 242–257.
- [9] Jennifer Seberry Wallis, Some remarks on supplementary difference sets, *Colloquia Mathematica Societatis Janos Bolyai* 10 (1973), 1503–1526.
- [10] Jennifer Seberry Wallis, Orthogonal  $(0, 1, -1)$  matrices, *Proc. First Austral. Conf. Combin. Math.* TUNRA, Newcastle, (1972), 61–84.
- [11] Jennifer Seberry Wallis, in W. D. Wallis, Anne Penfold Street and Jennifer Seberry Wallis, *Combinatorics: Room Squares, Sum-Free Sets and Hadamard Matrices*, Lecture Notes in Mathematics, Springer Verlag, Berlin, 1972.

(Received 3 Jan 2011; revised 1 Sep 2011)