2004

Medical fraud and inappropriate practice in Medibank and Medicare, Australia 1975-1995

Kathryn Flynn
University of Wollongong, kflynn@uow.edu.au

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG
COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorize you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Recommended Citation

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE
This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
MEDICAL FRAUD AND INAPPROPRIATE PRACTICE
IN MEDIBANK AND MEDICARE,
AUSTRALIA 1975-1995

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

Kathryn Flynn

Science, Technology and Society
School of Social Sciences, Media and Communication
# Table of Contents

Title page

Table of Contents

Glossary

Definitions

Abstract

Acknowledgments

Introduction

1. The philosophy of insurance  3
2. The politics of health  5
3. Accountability to the public purse  7
4. Methodology  9
5. History of health fraud  11
6. Thesis structure  12

Chapter One – Some themes in the literature

1. A hospital system in crisis  15
2. Defrauding Medicare – the size of the problem  17
3. Regulatory practice  19
4. Rationale for the thesis  20
5. Key terms – fraud, doctor-shoppers, criminal fraud, overservicing, moral hazard and fee-for-service  23
6. Some themes in the literature on fraud and overservicing  32
7. Health economists and health policy analysts 34
8. Regulatory approaches 38
   • Publicity as a regulatory tool 40
   • Other legal and criminological approaches 48
9. Entrepreneurial medicine 52

Chapter Two – Accountability and social control in an age of neoliberalism
1. Introduction 57
2. The Enlightenment 60
3. Representative government 63
4. The separation of powers 65
5. The problem of accountability 66
6. On the value of audits – three case studies 75
7. The criminal sanction 79
8. Foucault of governmentality 80
9. Government at a distance 82
10. Social security 83
11. The risk society 86
12. Social control 87
13. The new regulatory state 88
14. Sociology of the media – whistleblowing, scandals and the role of publicity in the structure of accountability 89

Chapter Three – Prior to 1975
1. The growth of health care financing in Australia 99
2. The 1920s and 1930s and the failure of national insurance 104
3. The 1940s and constitutional change 105
4. The Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme 108
5. The 1950s – the Page National Health Scheme 109
6. The 1960s – The shaping of the health policies of the
### Chapter Four – Goldrush: 1975 to 1981

1. Liberal-Country Party Coalition winds back Medibank 139  
2. Medibank Review Committee 143  
3. Medical fraud emerges as an issue on the political agenda 144  
4. The establishment of Medibank Private 146  
5. The Pathology Services Working Party 147  
6. Parliamentary debate and media analysis 150  
7. Australian Medical Association 153  
8. The position of the General Practitioners Society of Australia on fraud and overservicing 156  
9. Health Insurance Commission 158  
10. Setting up a system to manage fraud 162  
11. First skirmishes in the ‘minor war’: Dr. Geoffrey Edelsten 163  
12. The Royal Commission into Deep Sleep Therapy 165  
13. Blue-collar crime discovers medical fraud 167  
14. Inadequacies of the legal system 168  
15. Dr. Shik Aun Low 171  
16. Different perspectives on measures to contain fraud and overservicing 174  

### Chapter Five – Whistleblowing: knowledge without power
1. Introduction and definition of whistleblowing 183
2. The ethical dimension 186
3. Investigative journalism 189
4. Medibank’s first whistleblower 190
5. John Kelly - the second whistleblower 197
6. AMA agrees with Kelly’s estimate of losses of $100m 199
7. Australian media interest in medical fraud 201
8. Joint Committee of Public Accounts Inquiry into Medical Fraud 202
9. Evidence given to the Committee by staff from the Commonwealth Department of Health 204
11. The consequences 217
12. Official views on whistleblowing 223

Chapter Six – Medicare and medical militancy: 1983 to 1985
1. Introduction 225
2. The Hawke government-neoliberalism 228
3. Labor’s health policy 232
4. What Medicare offered 234
5. Background to the response from the medical profession 238
6. The NSW doctors’ dispute 242
7. The Penington Inquiry 244
8. The Federal Election November 1984 246
9. Government backs down on fraud and overservicing 250
10. The summit 256
11. The terms of the settlement of the doctors’ strike 258
12. Media reaction 259
13. The fraud and overservicing function is transferred to the HIC 261
14. Softening of the legislation in fraud and overservicing 264

Chapter Seven - Policing Pathology
1. Introduction – pathology offered the greatest opportunities for fraud and overservicing 269
2. Inducements 275
3. Early signs of the abuse of medical benefits 276
4. The Approved Pathology Practitioners Scheme 279
5. The JCPA – report 236 – Pathology 283
6. Macquarie Pathology Services 286
7. The Bates Report 298
8. The Bachich Case 300
9. The Audit Office and the media respond 301
10. A new legislative approach 303
11. The culture of kickbacks continues 305
12. The view from the Department of Health and Aging 306

Conclusion 309
Interviewees 315
Bibliography 323

Appendices 373
A Media attention to fraud and overservicing 1975 – 1981
B Media attention to fraud and overservicing 1982
C Department of Health - staff memorandum on whistleblowing
D Letter to Michael MacKellar from Kevin Newman Minister for Administrative Services
E Quinn document
F Letter to Neal Blewett, Minister for Health from Thomas Wenkart
G Letter to staff from Thomas Wenkert and Ross Sutton
H Macquarie Professional Services - Office Minutes written by Ross Sutton
Glossary

Abbreviations

AAPP    Australian Association of Pathology Practitioners
ABC    Australian Broadcasting Corporation
ACOA    Australian Clerical Officers' Association
the Act    Health Insurance Act 1973
AFP    Australian Federal Police
AFR    Australian Financial Review
ALP    Australian Labor Party
AMA    Australian Medical Association
allocative efficiency  The extent to which resources are allocated to best effect among competing programs. Allocative efficiency is concerned with choosing to allocate resources to those programs that yield the highest benefits.

bulkbilling  Where doctors accept 85 per cent of the scheduled fee as full payment for a medical service.

coning  The reduction of fees and benefits for identical services which are either performed together or sequentially, rather than as individual items.
**co-payment**  A payment made by a consumer at the point of service which is a contribution to the cost of providing that service.

**corruption**  Usually defined as the exploitation of public office for personal gain or the abuse of power for institutional ends, where there is no explicit personal gain for the offender. In this thesis the definition is broadened to include laws and administrative systems that foster illicit behaviour.

**efficiency**  The production of health services at a minimum cost and in a way that improves health outcomes.

**entrepreneurial medicine**  A group medical practice involving vertical integration, where both general practitioners and other referral services are linked in some form of financial interrelationship, either individual or corporate, often with the involvement of commercial risk capital.

**economics**  The art of choice in the use of scarce resources.

**fee-for-service**  The doctor charges the patient for the cost of the medical service provided. Medicare reimburses this cost, either in part or full, to the patient.

**fraud (against medical benefits)**  This occurs when a doctor makes claim is made for a service not rendered to a patient, or where the service is incorrectly described when billing the patient. Patients and other members of the community can also defraud the system in a variety of ways including lodging false claims and computer crime.

**groupthink**  A deterioration of mental efficiency, reality testing, and moral judgement that results from in-group pressures.

**health care inflation**  The extent to which medical price inflation exceeds general inflation.

**health economics**  A specialized study into the allocation of health resources and how valued goals are achieved.

**Health Maintenance Organisations**  An insurance system prevalent in the United States providing managed care. Many believe that managed care eliminates the problem of fraud. This is not the case.

**managed care**  The arrangement whereby an organisation assumes responsibility for all necessary health care for an individual in exchange for fixed payment.

**medicaid (United States)**  State funded health insurance for the poor.
medicare (United States)  Federally funded health insurance for the elderly.

medicare (Australia)  A system of universal health insurance providing free access to public hospitals and access to the services of general practitioners and specialists. Specialist services are available on referral from a general practitioner. It includes services by pathologists and radiologists.

moral hazard  A term used in the insurance industry that refers to the recklessness induced by the security induced by insurance cover. Fraud is also part of moral hazard but poses different problems, in being a deliberate exploitation of the insurance contract. Moral hazard has been more broadly defined as the ways in which an insurance relationship fosters behaviour by any party in the relationship that immorally increases risk to others.

opportunity cost  Every time resources are used in one way in health care, opportunities are forgone to use these resources in some other way.

overservicing  Medical services that were not reasonably necessary for the adequate medical care of the patient concerned.

qui tam suits  (Latin for “who as well”; that is, who sues for the state as well as for him or herself). It is a civil and not a criminal statute. The statute authorises private citizens to sue on behalf of the government, and to share in any recovery of defrauded funds eventually recovered by the government. In the United States more than half the settlements awarded the Department of Justice in health care fraud cases arise from qui tam suits.

resource allocation  The extent to which resources are allocated to best effect among competing programs.

symbolic power  Activities and resources gain in symbolic power, or legitimacy, to the extent that they become separated from underlying material interests, and hence go misrecognised as representing disinterested forms of activities and resources.

symbolic capital  Symbolic capital is a reformulation of Weber’s idea of charismatic authority that legitimates power relations by accentuating selected personal qualities of elites as supposedly superior and natural.

universal public health insurance  Health insurance which provides coverage to the entire population.

white-collar crime  This term excludes conventional street crimes. An early definition of white-collar crime was deviance committed by people of high status or repute in the course of their occupation. The definition has been broadened to cover illegal acts committed by non-physical means and by
concealment or guile to obtain money or property or to obtain business or personal advantage. The term includes deviant behaviour by corporations or officers of corporations in the service of the organisation.

Abstract

The Australian system of universal health insurance has enjoyed great electoral popularity but the system has been open to abuse and has been beset by administrative inertia, a reluctance by governments to establish reliable estimates of the extent of fraud and overservicing, lack of adequate legislative policy and a very low rate of prosecutions.
The aim of this research is to provide an historical and sociological account of institutional responses to medical fraud and overservicing and the media’s engagement with this issue over twenty years from 1975 to 1995.

Archival sources and interviews with key politicians, public servants and whistleblowers are used to tell the story of how universal health insurance was accepted as a necessary part of the social fabric from the introduction of the Pensioners Medical Scheme in 1951, Medibank in 1975 and Medicare in 1984 but measures to deal with the financial abuse of these systems did not have the same priority. The pathology industry provided the greatest scope for illicit profits through offers of kickbacks and inducements from pathology companies to referring general practitioners and this practice fuelled the growth of entrepreneurial medicine. Whistleblowers in the late 1970s and early 1980s campaigned for legislative and administrative change, but the reform agenda was more successful when it was led by a managing director of the Health Insurance Commission committed to change. These events are contextualised by several theoretical perspectives, including Foucault’s theory of governmentality, the sociology of insurance and of whistleblowing.

The challenges for the 21st century are to maintain the level of resources needed to provide the intensive policing required for the regulation of the financial abuse of medical benefits particularly in the area of electronic fraud and sophisticated criminal fraud.

Acknowledgments

The years of work on this thesis have now drawn to a close.

Along the way many individuals have given generously of their time for my interviews, and imparted their historical knowledge of events and their own key role in them. In addition to this there have been organisations and institutions that have provided the infrastructure for research: the parliament,
the bureaucracies, the libraries, the archives, the media and most importantly the universities. The completion of the thesis is the opportunity to place in the public domain, a document that offers formal acknowledgment to the university system, for the opportunities it provides to students to pursue their research.

I have a huge debt of gratitude to my thesis supervisors Associate Professor Dr. Brian Martin and Dr. Wendy Varney at the University of Wollongong and Dr. David McKnight and Associate Professor Wendy Bacon at the University of Technology, Sydney for all their help and support.

Thanks go to Professor Philip Schlesinger, Dr. Richard Kilborn, and senior staff and post-graduate students at the Centre for Media Studies, Stirling University, Scotland for their gracious hospitality during my stay at the university. Good fellowship, a new appreciation of the intellectual life and important breakthroughs in my research are etched in my memories from my time at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver and for this I am particularly indebted to Professors Maurice Barer, Anne Crichton, and Richard Ericson. Professor Malcolm Sparrow, of the Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, too was gracious in answering my questions in regard to his influential texts.

At the Australian National University, in Canberra, help has also come from Professors John Braithwaite, John Deeble and John McMillan; and in Melbourne, Dr. Richard Scotton, and Professor Chris Selby Smith at Monash University, and at Deakin University, from Dr. Karen Wheelwright.

Others who have not been reticent in the face of my questions have been former Commonwealth Health Ministers Michael MacKellar, Professor Neal Blewett
and Dr. Michael Woodridge, and former head of the Commonwealth Department of Health, Bernie McKay. Past and present staff at the Health Insurance Commission have been most hospitable and I offer many thanks to former Managing Directors Laurie Willett, John Evered, Dr. Jeff Harmer, and to Dr. John Nearhos, Dr. Janet Mould, Ralph Watzlaff, Geoff Proban, Paul Orwin, Dr. Ken Doust, and Dr. Warwick Graco.

Help has also come from Dr. George Repin, former Secretary-General of the Australian Medical Association, Dr. Lindsay Thompson, a former President of the Australian Medical Association, Dr. Peter Taylor, consultant to Medibank Private, Dr. James Ironside, fraud investigator for the NSW Dental Board and Associate Professor Dr. John Dale, President of the NSW Dental Board.

I extend my deep gratitude to the whistleblowers: Joe Shaw, John Kelly, Katherine Beauchamp, Chris Haviland, Gary Patterson, Associate Professor Roy Harvey and to the unauthorised, unofficial confidential sources have gone the extra kilometre to provide information. Also providing unique background material was Michael Boyle, formerly of the Australian Security Intelligence Organisation, now a consultant with the National Archives of Australia.

In the parliamentary arena particular thanks goes to the assistance I received from the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit, to the Hon. Jenny Macklin and from the coalition side of politics, Senator Amanda Vanstone, who was instrumental in helping to obtains some much needed documents.

Also offering their research skills have been Narelle Gregory: Library, Commonwealth Department of Health and Ageing; staff at the J. V. Barry Memorial Library of the Australian Institute of Criminology, Canberra; Anne McLean: National Archives of Australia. It was a great privilege to have been a
Petherick Reader at the National Library of Australia and my thanks go to the librarians who gave so generously of their time and expertise, especially Helen Pechenuik from the Oral History Collection. Thanks also to Petherick Readers, Lado Shay and Josette Wells who were ever ready to celebrate the life of ideas over lunch, morning and afternoon tea and any other occasion at the Bookplate Café.

At the Australian Broadcasting Corporation thanks to Norman Swan of *The Health Report*, Anne Delaney, Sabrina Lipovic, Judith Walker, Quentin Dempster and in *Four Corners*, Chris Masters, Quentin McDermott, Ticky Fullerton and Sarah Kernot.

Thanks to D. D. Flynn who patiently listened to the early chapters of the thesis and brought a sound critical judgment to the material and Olga and Max Theodore for their encouragement along the way.

And thanks above all else, to my sons Bernard and Brenden, who provided lots of patience, understanding and support to enable this project to be drawn towards completion.