Art and transference: a comparative study of psychoanalytic transference and art and documentation of the exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery

Anthony Hull
University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses
ART AND TRANSFERENCE

A Comparative Study of Psychoanalytic Transference and Art and Documentation of the Exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF CREATIVE ARTS

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

ANTHONY HULL

B.A. (Hons.,) Camberwell, A.T.C., Goldsmiths, London

FACULTY OF CREATIVE ARTS
1997
ART AND TRANSFERENCE

A Comparative Study of Psychoanalytic Transference and Art and Documentation of the Exhibition *Memory Mammary Mummy*

ABSTRACT

Interpretations of the psychic contents of art, their means of transmission, the motivations of the artist, the viewer's response and a personal documentation of an artist's major exhibition are linked in this thesis. In Chapter One an examination is made of definitions of transference, transference-neurosis and counter-transference and these terms are put into a developmental and historic context. In Chapter Two consideration is given to the importance of transference in psychoanalysis and of the clear linking of art with transference from the earliest days of the development of psychoanalysis. Data is referred to that connects Freud's interest in art with a deliberate attempt at manipulation of art to serve his needs. Material is then put forward, both contemporary and historical, that compares psychoanalysis to an artform, the psychoanalyst to an artist and psychoanalytic consultations to artworks. What emerges is the centrality of transference to both art and psychoanalysis.

In Chapter Three consideration is made of the importance of psychoanalytic theory to art therapy and its specific uses of transference. Similar to psychoanalysis, though perhaps with more obvious connections, substantial data is presented that relates the therapeutic alliance of client, art and therapist to the roles of artist, art and viewer. Art therapists, generally, are also practising artists. Consequently, the connections and overlaps of transference in both of the professions they pursue is significant. Art therapy, therefore, emerges as an intermediary point of reference between psychoanalysis and fine art.

Chapter Four is a visual and literary documentation of the author's major art exhibition associated with this thesis. It considers the concepts and language that relate psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art to transference. The documentation encompasses and records the processes of making work for the exhibition whilst, at the same time, researching the psychic phenomena discussed above. Chapter five, the conclusion, reasons that transference offers a means of interpretation in visual art that has, to this point in time, been unrecognised in any direct way by artists. The thesis addresses this situation by presenting the authors hypothesis of *visual transference* in art and brings together in a comparative context contemporary thought from the areas of psychoanalysis, art therapy and visual art.
FOR MY FAMILY

PAST PRESENT AND FUTURE
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume One**

Acknowledgments

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One - The Definitions of Transference:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Background to the texts used</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Transference</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Transference-Neurosis</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Counter-Transference</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Summary</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Two - A Review of Contemporary Data from Psychoanalytic Sources:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Introduction</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Freud's interest in Art</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) The Work of Ellen Handler Spitz</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Other Contemporary Writing</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Summary</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Three - A Review of Contemporary Data from Art Therapy Sources:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Introduction</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) A Background to Art Therapy</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Contemporary Writing</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Summary</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Volume Two

Chapter Four - Documentation of the Work presented in the Exhibitions:
* Memory, Mammary, Mummery, Wollongong City Gallery 1992
* Illusive Reality, University of Western Sydney 1993
* Memory, Mammary, Mummery, University of Wollongong 1995
(i) Introduction 182
(ii) Discussion of the Artwork 187
(iii) Summary 318

Chapter Five - Conclusion, parts:
(i) 331
(ii) 336
(iii) 348
(iv) 357

List of Plates 359

Bibliography 362

Appendix:
Catalogue 370
Résume
Exhibition Brochure
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

When it comes to thanking people for the assistance support and motivation I have been given in completing this Doctorate of Creative Arts the list could be endless. This is because the results are, in part, the sum of my life experience and I have so much to be grateful for. Nevertheless, I will attempt to curtail my acknowledgments to an essential few.

This study discusses psychoanalytic concepts at length. Even though psychoanalysis is a psychology of the individual many of the concepts and complexes that affect the individual have their roots in his or her family backgrounds and relationships. Therefore, it is appropriate that I dedicate this work to my family and that I start by thanking them. I mean 'family' in an extended and historical sense though essentially the locus for my thanks starts with my parents, who are both deceased and will not be aware of my gratitude. As will be realised the exhibition and thesis for this degree has large sections about my parents, my memories of them and their relatives. All that I am, I am because of my parents, and in large part I have lived a happy, successful and fulfilling life that has been sustained by the knowledge of their love. Their love was supported and developed by my relatives, brothers and sisters. Notably by my Aunties Anne, Louie, Mary and Elsie and by my Uncles Jack, Jim, Ernie and Ben. In turn, I also acknowledge the friendship and love I shared with their children as I grew and I here make special mention of my cousin John who was as close to me as a brother. The family environment has always been important to me and the environment I shared with my brothers and sister was always a loving and close one. Childhood was important to us and has formed the basis of a deeply felt but unspoken love. Albert, Patricia and Billy are all still in England but their importance in my life and work will never diminish.

Lastly, in the familial round of thanks is my wife Denise and our children Daniel and Sophie. Over the last eight years I have needed and received their strength, encouragement and understanding. Initially, it was no secret that Denise was against my getting involved in such a major, time-consuming study ... if nothing else, it would take some valuable time away from the experience, and involvement in, our children's growth. For this loss I have no reasonable excuse. In a quandary at the time, I asked my mother (on her only visit to Australia from England) what I should do. In reply she said I should think seriously and then do what I thought was really necessary. It is with thanks that I acknowledge all of the support given to me by Denise. In the early stages of my study she gave assistance in typing large parts of the thesis and in proof-
reading endless drafts. She has given me advice and opinions along the way and provided emotional buoyancy, especially when facing those inevitable troughs that are part of a doctoral study and an artist's life. Denise and I are grateful for having two marvellous children and they have given me their unquestioning love and approval throughout this study. My thanks and love go to Daniel and Sophie.

I now wish to thank my supervisor, Dr Peter Shepherd. He gave me the confidence and assurance that I needed. Peter's calm and organised approach to supervision has strengthened this submission. His scrutiny of the initial drafts ironed out many problems. Therefore, I sincerely thank him. Special mention must also be made of the extensive advice and assistance given to me by Dr. Andrea Gilroy, senior lecturer in art psychotherapy at Goldsmith's College, University of London. Andrea stepped in at a late stage in the completion of this thesis. She, very generously, gave her valuable time and advice on many aspects of thesis completion. Without doubt, Andrea's expert understanding of the theoretical and technical problems I have been dealing with has been second to none. It is fortunate that I made contact with Andrea and reassuring to have been advised by someone so knowledgable in thesis form and content.

Four good friends contributed to the brochure written to accompany the exhibition and included in the appendix of this thesis. I give them special mention in Chapter Four, but again, I thank Lachlan Harris, Debbie Westbury, Robert Hood and Ron Mathers. The exhibition has been shown at three prestigious venues and I thank the gallery directors for their assistance in each case, Peter O'Neill (Wollongong City Gallery), Barry Gazzard (University of Western Sydney), Liz Jeneid (University of Wollongong).

Other people that deserve special mention for their support at various stages are, my friends David Fairbairn, Suzanne Archer and Norm Cook. Psychologist, Barbara Bicego. Jonathan Adamson from the Department of Art Theory at Camberwell School of Arts, London. Julie Cowie and Annette Coulter from the Australian National Art Therapy Association. Several staff members at the University of Wollongong including Dr. Sharon Bell, Dr. Susan Rowley, Shiela Hall and Jenny Rallings from the Faculty of Creative Arts; Dr Nigel Mackay from the Psychology Department and the staff of the Michael Birt Library.

To all the above and those I may have inadvertently overlooked I give my sincere thanks.

Anthony Hull 1997
INTRODUCTION

This study concerns a deep personal search utilising my professional skills as an artist and a central concept of psychoanalysis - transference - as a conceptual structure to understand aspects of the unconscious. In 1988 when I commenced the study I had, what now seems, some vague ideas and interests in the psychological and particularly psychoanalytical concepts of the relationships of artist to artwork and viewer to artist and artwork. Increasingly, these issues have come to dominate my thoughts and my work. This thesis proposes visual transference as a form of psychoanalytic transference particular to the fine arts. As data is presented and reviewed from chapter to chapter the argument is constructed that visual transference in fine art can be identified by referring to the theory and practice of psychoanalysis and art therapy. This position is furthered by documenting and examining aspects of the psychological contents of the exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery, that I made in partial fulfilment for the award of the degree Doctor of Creative Arts. The concept of visual transference, I propose, is a significant contribution to an understanding of the psychological contents of art. However, I wish to indicate that my intention in this thesis is not to render art and transference in reductive terms. I distance myself from the position that all art is symptomatic of mental ill health or neurosis that requires clinical treatment or that all transferences are about conflict and pain. In fact, I will argue that art is not reduced to a symptom by accepting that it contains visual transferences. Simply because psychoanalysis has identified, and opened up, the discussion on art's transference properties there is no need to assume that all art contains transferences or that all transferences are about conflicts and psychopathological symptoms.

The thesis is divided into five main chapters, three of which have their own introductory sections, somewhat circumventing the need for a lengthy introduction at this point. Chapter One defines psychoanalytic transference, a term which is loaded with various interpretations and definitions depending on where, when or by whom the term is used. Therefore, I devote this whole chapter to explaining its usage from five different perspectives together with its other two main sub-terms, transference-neurosis and counter-transference. These two terms are, again, contentiously and variably used depending on the intellectual or therapeutic allegiances the user holds. Interpretation emerges as a key factor to psychoanalytic pursuits and, as I point out in a postscript to chapter three, the uses of interpretation and language can have implications in the realms of intellectual politics. This is an issue which the confusing linguistic uses of the term transference does nothing to assist. Perhaps this is why those who discuss
transference, or for that matter, psychoanalysis in general, commonly refer back to
Sigmund Freud.

Freud undoubtedly holds a fascination for me. One only has to read his works to
become absorbed with his theories and writing. Of course, today, many of his
patriarchal views are discredited. Nevertheless, he still holds a unique interest for
various groups of academics, researchers or those interested in the psychological,
whether they are male or female, feminist or non-feminist. In some respects, his
theories of psychoanalysis are as controversial today as when they were first written.
Christopher Badcock sums up Freud's position in our culture aptly:

Freud, like Einstein, is a name which everybody knows. But psychoanalysis, Freud's
new science of the mind, is like Einstein's relativity, widely misunderstood. This is
paradoxical in view of Freud's immense influence on twentieth century thought, culture
and psychological medicine. The insights he has given us into the workings of the
mind have brought relief to countless distressed individuals and his science of
psychoanalysis employment, professional standing and wide influence to many
thousands of counsellors and psychotherapists - some of them orthodox Freudians, many
more using methods only peripherally related to psychoanalysis, but all derived, in one
way or another, from his pioneering example.

More than this, Freud has changed once and for all our whole manner of looking at
ourselves, our relations with others and our conceptions of culture, society and
behaviour. He has been described, rightly or wrongly, as the father of feminism; a
revolutionary thinker on a par with Karl Marx; a social and sexual reactionary; a
moralist who substituted personal fulfilment through psychotherapy for morality based
on guilt; an ideologist who undermined the Protestant ethic of duty and hard work; an
old-fashioned believer in positive science; a new kind of novelist; a psychologist of
genius; a case of psychopathology, drug addiction, sexual perversion, and so on,
practically ad infinitum. 1

In the context of this thesis, my interest in Freud is as the first person to describe the
concept of transference. As far as possible, I have not concerned myself with the
political correctness of his views in other spheres.

Even though Freud has been dead over fifty years and there have been many revisions
and interpretations of psychoanalytic practice and theory, his views and those of

classical psychoanalysis are still regularly referred to as a benchmark when confirmation and understanding of theoretical positions are required. Consequently, in the thesis I return, time and time again, to a Freudian perspective on what transference is and how he saw it developing, particularly concerning its importance to, and its connections with, art.

Chapter Two gives an in-depth discussion of transference's theoretical and practical uses from a psychoanalytic perspective when applied to the arts. Starting with Freud and going right through to some of the most influential and current writers in this area such as Winnicott, Liebert, Vann Spruiell and Handler Spitz, chapter two systematically examines the links between, and interpretations of, art and transference. What emerges consistently are the clear links between art and transference and the connections both these areas have to night and day dreams, parapraxes, and perhaps surprisingly, jokes... and in fact any opportunity where the unconscious can be tricked, caught off guard or revealed. Another clear pattern to emerge is the comparison of psychoanalysis to an art form rather than that of a science. Convincing arguments are put forward to link Freud's interest in archaeology and art to a deliberate conscious and unconscious manipulation of art to serve his needs.

Psychoanalysts discussed in this chapter make direct and uncompromising comparisons of art to their profession. As will be seen, some claim that art is 'adaptive transference', others that they are the 'blank canvasses' upon which the unconscious paints. This chapter for me was revealing and enlightening to research. As a lay person, I found it remarkable that there is so much recent discussion by psychoanalysts about the comparison and uses of psychoanalysis, transference and art that links in with Freud's consistent views and developments on these subjects. Yet, this work is comparatively unknown or ignored, in any direct way, by art theorists and those writing specifically about the arts. One of the few exceptions to this rule was the late Peter Fuller and his works are referred to on several occasions in this thesis. Even though I do make reference at relevant points in the thesis to topical psychoanalytic writers such as Jaques Lacan, the reader might wonder why I have not written more extensively about his work. The answer is that even though Lacan's revisions of psychoanalysis are fundamental, positing a linguistic rather than a biological base to the unconscious, transference emerges from his revisions intact and relatively unscathed. In fact, it appears from texts such as the *Four Fundamental Concepts of Psycho-Analysis* that transference is as ubiquitous and as important as ever to Lacan's psychoanalytic endeavours. In short, Lacan's importance cannot be ignored when it

---

comes to semantics, especially when the implications of what he reveals are applied to French Feminism. However, within the context of art and transference it appears his writings have little new to offer and I have found nothing of substance to further this position. As will be seen many of the latest and most exciting contributions concerning art and psychoanalysis are being written by an American woman, Ellen Handler Spitz. Leaning towards a Freudian and object-relations account of psychoanalysis, Handler Spitz sees important implications for transference and art.

Chapter Three pursues the relevance of art and psychoanalysis into its next logical domain, art therapy. Compared to psychoanalysis, art therapy as a distinct profession is a relative newcomer to the arena of practice and theory. However, its legacy, historically, is perhaps as old as art itself. As psychotherapeutic practices have evolved and developed through the twentieth century, art therapy has become a significant means of interpreting the unconscious. The reasons for this are outlined in chapter three and include such things as art's historical links with magic, religion, medicine, the mind and healing, as well as, its importance to the development of psychology in the nineteenth century and its uses educationally in the twentieth century. Furthermore, because of the importance Freud and Jung always placed on art it was included in their therapeutic developments from the beginning and it is out of Freud's and Jung's theories that art therapy grew. In recent times, art therapy has accepted psychoanalysis as the most constructive and dominant theory for its uses and further development as a profession. Central to art therapy's working methods is transference. Whereas, psychoanalysis traditionally tended to use a confrontationist approach to therapy and the meeting of conscious with unconscious material, art therapy has put even more stress on an empathic alliance between therapist and client, channelling aspects of the unconscious into the artwork and using the artwork as the container of transference. This method of working marks a radical departure from classical psychoanalysis and shifts importance in the therapy away from the therapist (analyst) towards the artwork. The matrix of working method becomes a three cornered event between client, art and therapist, not unlike the three cornered matrix of artist, art and viewer. Interestingly, whereas psychoanalysis has traditionally been seen and criticised as a patriarchal structure set up and manipulated by men, art therapy is a profession substantially of women practitioners and women clients that places theoretical importance on psychoanalytic theories that have a matriarchal component. Nearly all art therapists are also practising artists in their own right and as will be seen there is clear recognition of the importance of transference here too.

Perhaps, it is the emergence of art therapy as an important therapeutic method and the fact that so many therapists are artists (and a number of clients continue making art after
therapy has finished) that has revitalised contemporary interest in psychoanalytic
theories in the art world during the 1990s. I feel it is quite possible, that within a short
period of time, interest in the properties of transference will be identified as an
important issue for art professionals generally.

Chapter Four documents and discusses the art made for the exhibition *Memory,*
*Mammary,* *Mummery.* In my journal at the time of making work for this exhibition I
recorded:

The works are conscious memories. They were conceived by the application of my artistic
processes, psychic and material. The process starts with a feeling. An inkling of what it is
I want to express. The feeling relates to a significant memory that enters consciousness
upon contemplation and 'inner dialogue'. The inner dialogue is a 'timeless' experience, not
unlike daydreaming. It is a deliberate experience that can be frustrating and tedious, but
somewhere inside, I know there is this memory wanting to emerge. It becomes clear and
developed in the artwork.

As these artworks have developed they seem to have become ever more complex in their
execution. Looking back over my working notes I am reminded of the complexity of
construction..... (does this relate to the complexity of the layering of signs?). I start with a
base idea that comes to me 'in a moment of inspiration'. This moment of inspiration is
significant. It is in fact the daydream. It is the elusive allusion when slippage occurs in
consciousness and I am momentarily arrested by the re-emergence of long repressed thought.
I grab at the glimpse and write it down or sketch it. It comes to me in symbols of
significance.

Contained within this chapter is a personal record of the making of the work and a
journey that attempts to locate aspects of the unconscious. Not only personal glimpses
of my own unconscious but a slow building and piecing together of the fragments and
jig-saw that links psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art to transference. To do this, I
ask the reader to take into account all that has gone before in chapters, one, two and
three and carefully consider the implications and close comparisons that have been made
of psychoanalysis to art, of art therapist to psychoanalyst and of artwork to psychic
experience. Throughout all these activities transference emerges as a key factor in
binding them together. It is the very phenomenon that Freud initially saw as his
greatest hindrance and that he was later to acknowledge as one of psychoanalysis' most
profound discoveries. For within the kernel of transference is the recognition of the
unconscious, the validation of meaning and the potential for interpretation.
Chapter Five is the chapter of conclusion, it is here that I consolidate the argument for the hypothesis of visual transference. I posit that as a concept it contributes a new structure for artists and viewers when contemplating the psychological, ineffable or unconscious contents in artworks. The articulation of visual transference is made all the more difficult because visual transference is most often experienced as an unconscious or preconscious inner and personal dialogue between artist and artwork, or viewer and artwork. Referring to the research presented in the earlier chapters and examples of artworks from the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*, documented in chapter four, I bring together theory and practice to explain the operation of visual transference. In particular, I focus on the work of Handler Spitz, a psychoanalyst, and Schaverien, an art therapist. These two authors present models of interpretation used in connection with their respective fields that I argue can be constructive when considering the ways in which visual transference operates in fine art. For example, Handler Spitz's three models for the viewing of art, *the pathographic, the psychoanalysis of autonomous texts and artistic style*, and *psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience* all include issues concerned with transference. In the conclusion I consider the three models and examine how Handler Spitz's theories relate to my artwork.

Pursuing Handler Spitz's and Schaverien's theories I discuss the self-analytic properties of making art and the potential there is through self-analysis to develop an awareness of visual transference. Visual transference is a complex phenomenon and its presence is suggested by many authors reviewed in this thesis. Handler Spitz does so in her tripartite structures for the viewing of art and Schaverien in her text *The Revealing Image*. However, in the conclusion to this thesis I put forward a sequence, informed by the theory and practice presented earlier, that articulates visual transference. What I am proposing in this thesis is a new approach to a phenomenon discovered by psychoanalysis in a world outside that of medicine. This is just the sort of application that Freud envisioned was possible for his theories all those years ago.

---

CHAPTER ONE

THE DEFINITIONS OF TRANSFERENCE

(i)

Background to the texts used

I am using five definitive texts to discuss transference. These texts are being used for the following reasons. Firstly, they give varying levels of definition ranging from introductory and easily understood concepts through to an advanced understanding. Secondly, they define transference and its associated terms taking into account the main schools of psychoanalysis such as, ego psychology, Kleinian psychoanalysis, object-relations theory and Lacanian psychoanalysis. The method I will use to discuss transference in this chapter is that I will quote the transference related term, (i.e., transference, transference-neurosis, counter-transference) and then define and discuss it, referring to the five texts mentioned above. Using this approach will give an integrated and clear understanding of the concepts involved when considering transference. However, before referring to the definitions I will give some background about the texts I am using.

A Layman's Guide to Psychiatry and Psychoanalysis is explained very well by its title.1 Eric Berne was a practising psychoanalytic psychiatrist for well over 30 years. He trained as a Freudian analyst and his book according to its preface written by Dr. A.A. Brill is thoroughly Freudian in its position. Berne's aim was to attempt an explanation of psychoanalysis without using "big words", that would assist laypersons and experts alike. The book firstly describes normal and abnormal psychic development and then methods of psychoanalytic treatment. It also contains a glossary of terms.

Essential Freud by Christopher Badcock is a more recent publication than Berne's.2 It also attempts to explain Freudian psychoanalysis in a way that informs both the

---

layperson and the expert, and like Berne's book there is a glossary included. However, here the similarities end as the other aims and intentions of his book are quite different. Firstly, Badcock views psychoanalysis from an ego psychology position, (he was analysed and instructed in psychoanalysis by Anna Freud, one of its main exponents). Secondly, as Badcock explains he is not a member of the "official psychoanalytic establishment," he is a reader in sociology at the London School of Economics and Political Science. Therefore, he has "emphasised the general relevance of psychoanalysis to everyday life and to normality, as well as to groups and society at large" (xi). In this second sense Badcock's description of the implications of psychoanalytic theory are broader than those of Berne's.

Charles Rycroft is an influential and practising psychoanalyst. A Critical Dictionary of Psychoanalysis is written with three main aims in mind. The first is to give as precise a definition of psychoanalytic terms as possible. The second is to attempt to explain the differing interpretations of the terms depending on the particular psychoanalytic school that uses them. The third is to explain and question the theoretical problems that psychoanalysis presents for discussion and debate. Rycroft's dictionary is extensively cross referenced with short discussions of each term and it is a far more technical reference than Berne's or Badcock's books; this being the case, the definitions are complex and require considered reading.

The Language of Psychoanalysis by Laplanche and Pontalis is the most complex and technical reference used in this presentation of the definitions of transference. It is arranged as an alphabetical dictionary of terms with each term being described by a definition and a commentary. "The definition seeks to sum up the concept's accepted meaning as it emerges from its strict usage in psycho-analytic theory."(xii). The commentary, on the other hand, describes how concepts have evolved historically, how they have developed structurally with psychoanalysis and how they have presented theoretical problems in their development. The position taken is basically Freudian, though views of other schools have been incorporated as appropriate to the critical evaluation of the term being described.

My references to On Learning from the Patient are contained under the definition of counter-transference. Patrick Casement gives a contemporary view of psychoanalytic practice and in particular discusses the therapeutic relationship that is built up between

---


patient and therapist. In the context of defining transference Casement's book gives an account of the ways in which counter-transference can be considered constructive in therapeutic practice today.

(ii)

Transference

Eric Berne describes transference simply in the glossary to his book as,

The emotional relationship which develops between any two or more people, especially between an adviser and his client or a doctor and his patient, when it is based on the emotional attitudes left over from childhood which are transferred to the current situation. (407).

In the main text of his book transference is discussed in much the same terms, his only development on this is to add that,

One of the psychoanalyst's chief aims is to analyse and dissolve the transferred feelings (263).

Christopher Badcock, on the other hand, describes transference in his glossary in the following way:

In psychoanalytic therapy a process of externalisation of the analysand's libidinal attachments to include the person of the analyst and the process of the analysis; generally, any reforming of a contemporary relationship or experience on the lines of an earlier one (190).

In the first part of Badcock's definition language is used that has far more psychoanalytic content than Berne's account. For example, externalisation refers to the projection or outward flowing of an internal mental image, libidinal attachments means the mental energy associated with the emerging unconscious imagery and analysand is the person being psychoanalysed. The term analysand is used as not all people that undergo analysis are patients suffering from a mental disorder. For example all psychoanalysts are themselves psychoanalysed in training and many individuals who require a better understanding of their own mental apparatus (and who can afford the treatment) decide to be psychoanalysed. A good example of someone that chose this
course of action is the late Peter Fuller, art critic and theoretician. The second part of the definition refers to transference as it happens outside of psychoanalytic therapy. Discussing this phenomenon Badcock writes:

Transference is certainly one of the strangest and, until recently, one of the most inexplicable findings of psychoanalysis. According to what most people know, it amounts to the patient being in love with the analyst. Whilst this can certainly be one aspect of it, transference is a much wider and more profound phenomenon. Essentially it consists in the tendency of the unconscious to interpret present experiences and relationships as repetitions of earlier ones - usually as repetitions of childhood. As a consequence, transference is by no means something confined to the analytic situation (107).

To confirm this, Badcock gives a personal example of an experience of transference occurring outside a psychoanalytic consultation concerning his mother and Anna Freud; it occurred two or three years after his analysis with Anna Freud had ended (107-108). Besides this personal reference, further on in the book, Badcock gives a summary of the importance and implications of transference in society, culture and the psychology of the group, what Freud referred to as "mass psychology". Badcock explains that it is transference that holds the psychological group together "by a personal identification with the leader" (129). Writing of very large psychological groups "such as nations or churches," Badcock states:

The leader need not be a living person (although usually there will be someone performing a leading role) but could be a dead or mythical one, or even an abstract ideal. What matters as far as the group is concerned is that each one of the members should have individually identified with the leader (129).

Badcock maintains that it is the "identification" that is the transference:

members of the group see the leader or focus of the group as conformable with their own, image of their parents/ideals/morality - the group focuses on a common tendency of the members to form such a transference - that is to see the group membership as resembling their own earlier membership of their own family and the group leader as resembling the parents, either in their persons or in their abstract role as providers, protectors, leaders or judges (129).

---

Here Badcock's statements concerning mass psychology are reflecting the views of "ego psychology" first developed by Sigmund Freud and later by his daughter Anna. He elaborates on the role of transference in the group setting at several points through his book (132, 134-136, 138, 142, 173-174). This is because Freud, in the final stages of his evolvement of psychoanalytic theory, (what Badcock refers to as "the second psychoanalytic revolution"), gave great importance to the relationship of transference to mass and ego-psychology. In his discussion of transference Badcock also points out that transference replaced the unsatisfactory use of hypnotism in the psychoanalytic situation.

When it comes to Rycroft's definition of transference in A Critical Dictionary of Psychoanalysis it is a much more complex and dense account than either Berne's or Badcock's. In this respect the Rycroft definition is similar to that of Laplanche and Pontalis" definition to be discussed shortly. The reasons for the length and complexity of defining transference in both cases is, undoubtedly, due to its very important position in psychoanalytic theory and practice. I will not quote the whole of the Rycroft definition for the following reasons, firstly its length, secondly some of the ground covered is similar to the Laplanche and Pontalis definition, and thirdly Rycroft discusses transference at length in the introduction to his dictionary and I will refer to these entries also. His definition of transference commences:

1. The process by which a patient displaces on to his analyst feelings, ideas, etc., which derive from previous figures in his life (see DISPLACEMENT); by which he relates to his analyst as though he were some former object in his life; by which he projects onto his analyst OBJECT-REPRESENTATIONS acquired by earlier INTROJECTIONS (see PROJECTION); by which he endows the analyst with the significance of another, usually prior, object. 2. The state of mind produced by 1 in the patient. 3. Loosely, the patient's emotional attitude towards his analyst (168).

In the remainder of the definition Rycroft sketches some very brief historical data concerning transference and then itemises the sub-terms that are used with the prefix of transference (i.e., transference-interpretations, etc.). He also lists various categories of transference which vary "according to the object transferred and the stage of DEVELOPMENT being recapitulated" (169). However, as the sub-terms or categories of transference do not concern us at this point, I will move on to Rycroft's references to transference in the introduction to his dictionary.

The introduction comprehensively describes the aims, objectives and problems in compiling the dictionary. Rycroft classifies the problems "under the headings of
linguistics, dissension and sources" (x). The reference to transference occurs in the section discussing sources. He explains that the crucial data concerning psychoanalytic theory does not come from,

the direct observation of human behaviour in everyday life, but from the analyst's experience of a particular kind of therapeutic relationship invented by Freud (xxi).

As an example of this Rycroft cites transference. He explains that transference became identified as a phenomenon by Freud through the process of analysing mentally disturbed patients and other analysts. Once identified it was, at first, considered a hindrance to treatment but then later it was recognised as a cornerstone of it. Because of transference's importance in the treatment and practice of psychoanalysis it was incorporated into the theory and, therefore, enabled further developments of psychoanalytic practice and reasoning. Rycroft reminds the reader that this is not unlike empirical methods used in other 'sciences'. This process goes some way towards explaining how and why psychoanalytically theoretical positions (in this case transference) have shifted and changed over the decades of its development.

The final and fullest definition of transference by Laplanche and Pontalis spans eight pages. As mentioned earlier, for each term Laplanche and Pontalis have a definition and a commentary. In the interests of brevity I will quote only the definition and then summarise in my own words the lengthier commentary:

**Transference**

For psycho-analysis a process of actualisation of unconscious wishes. Transference uses specific objects and operates in the framework of a specific relationship established with these objects. Its context *par excellence* is the analytic situation.

In the transference, infantile prototypes re-emerge and are experienced with a strong sense of immediacy.

As a rule what psychoanalysts mean by the unqualified use of the term "transference" is *transference during treatment*.7

Classically, the transference is acknowledged to be the terrain on which all the basic problems of a given analysis play themselves out: the establishment, modalities, interpretation and resolution of the transference are in fact what define the cure (455).

---

7 This use of the term transference will be discussed at length in chapter three of this thesis, see 175-178.
In the context of this definition and considering psychoanalysis generally it might help to explain what is meant by the use of the term object. The object is the thing to "which action or desire is directed" by the subject (person being analysed). As Rycroft explains, The object is typically:

... that which the subject requires in order to achieve instinctual satisfaction; that to which the subject relates himself. In psychoanalytical writings, objects are nearly always persons, parts of persons, or symbols of one or the other.

Looking at the commentary Laplanche and Pontalis start by pointing out that in its historical, practical and theoretical evolution transference "has taken on a very broad extension" in meaning and interpretation by analysts. Due to its importance transference has become the focus of debate and some of the questions that have been raised about transference are:

1. Is it only exclusive to the analytic situation?  
2. How can transference be gauged in relation to concepts of reality?  
3. What is the therapeutic value of transference?  
4. What specific areas of theory does transference address?

Laplanche and Pontalis go on to discuss the importance of the discovery of transference to Freud and point out certain ambiguities in his development of the concept. They indicate that Freud determined transference was not exclusive to the analytic situation.

The encounter with the signs of transference in psycho-analysis - an event whose strangeness Freud never tired of emphasising - was what cleared the way for recognition of the operation of this process in other situations.

As Freud's theory of psychoanalysis developed, the position of transference to it became increasingly important and it was from the observation of transference that the practice of transference-neurosis came into being; transference became one of the most powerful tools that the analyst had to promote a cure to illness. Freud's difficulty in defining transference within his theory of psychoanalysis without ambiguity was problematic. On the one hand, he saw transference as a possible mask (or cover) for the unconscious, what in this context can be referred to as a resistance. On the other hand, he realised transference as a manifest way for the unconscious to reveal its

---

8 (i) Clearly from the sources already cited, Berne, Badcock and Rycroft, transference is not considered exclusive to the analytic situation.  
(ii) As will be shown, many other authors including Freud and Lacan consider transference as ubiquitous.
libidinal impulses. Freud recognised that there could be both positive and negative versions of transference, in other words, affectionate or hostile transferences. He intended the patient in analysis to have complete recollections of repressed memories and transference was seen as a constructed means of achieving this aim. Laplanche and Pontalis then point out that, for Freud, the repetition of situations and emotions in a contemporary setting actualised the essence of childhood conflict and sexuality. However, repeated transferences do not occur in a literal sense but are 'symbolic equivalents of what is being transferred' (460). Two key aspects of transference are (i) actualisation of the past and (ii) unloading (or displacement) of the transferred material (unconscious/pre-conscious/conscious mental energy) onto the analyst (which in this sense becomes the object). It is suggested by Laplanche and Pontalis that it is transference that legitimates the need for an analyst. In this respect they refer to Freud's criticisms of self-analysis (even though he analysed himself). Expanding on this they note that for the therapeutic needs of analysis it is felt that a dialogue with an analyst is required so that transferences can be analysed, directed, discharged and confirmed. This places special emphasis on the analyst and the need for a linguistic element (remembering that psychoanalysis has been referred to as a "talking cure"). According to Laplanche and Pontalis, Freud never completely clarified "the role played in the treatment by the analyst" (460). This was left for post-Freudians to debate. Some pursued the path that Freud had initiated, attempting to qualify the need for an analyst with transference and verbalisation or language. Others, increasingly, linked transference with the psychoanalytic object and the subject's relationship to it; this formed one of the bases for object-relations theory, (which will be discussed later in the thesis). Still others argue that transference is "a purely spontaneous phenomenon" brought on by the subject's "predisposition to transference". Then, as a reaction to this last position, some argue that the special conditions of the analysis provide the ideal setting for transference to occur.

(iii) Transference-Neurosis

In defining transference-neurosis it is important to realise that it is not the same phenomenon as transference, though it is a very important condition of analytic treatment. Considerable confusion can arise if this is not recognised. The confusion is partly explained in the point made by Laplanche and Pontalis that "As a rule what psychoanalysts mean by the unqualified use of the term "transference" is transference during treatment" (455). This implies that the term transference is used to describe, in
a general way, all transference phenomena during treatment, even though the type of transference activity (i.e., transference versus transference-neurosis) might be very different in form and content. As an example of this use or misuse of the term transference Berne does not have a glossary entry for transference-neurosis and it is not a term cited anywhere in his book even though it is described in some detail under the general heading of transference. When Berne writes the following simple description, in the main body of his text, he is clearly relating the general process of transference-neurosis not transference:

During analysis the image of the analyst tends gradually to become charged with all the piled up energy of ungratified Id wishes which has collected since the patient's earliest infancy. Once this energy is corralled in one image, it can be studied and redistributed, and the tensions partly relieved by analysing the patient's image of the analyst (271).

Badcock, on the other hand, does have a glossary entry for this term and defines it as:

A term with two related meanings (1) a category of neurosis (hysteria and obsessional neurosis) typified by the attachment of the libido to real or imagined objects, and therefore particularly susceptible to psychoanalysis thanks to its second meaning : (2) the re-creation of a latent psychological conflict in the manifest content of an actual analysis (190).

There are also many references to transference-neurosis in the main body of Badcock's text. He describes it as related to the therapeutic process of acting-out when he writes,

Here, another astonishing aspect of transference came to the rescue when it became apparent that patients could not merely be induced to remember but that they usually began spontaneously and compulsively to act-out the transference in the course of the analysis.... In short, what we have is a transference-neurosis - a situation in which patients recreate important aspects of their original neurosis in the new conditions of the analysis.... the transference neurosis is a kind of artificially induced neurotic disturbance which represents a contemporaneous recapitulation of the past, a return of the repressed which carries the analysand, so to speak, back with it to the time in which the original conflict situation occurred.... In the transference neurosis such a return to the Oedipal period carries with it the possibility of retrospectively correcting the past by resolving the neurosis in the present (109-110).

To Freud, Badcock explains, the benefit of creating a transference-neurosis in the analysis was that it gave analysands the opportunity to understand and overcome their
clinical neurosis in the unique position of the analysis and therefore master their unconscious and cure the neurosis.

Badcock also discusses the implications of transference-neurosis in the crowd/group or mass psychological situation. He indicates that according to ego-psychology a form of transference-neurosis is possible in certain group formations, though he does point out that these group transference-neuroses are morally and therapeutically incongruous with the aims of psychoanalysis which is concerned with individual liberation of the ego, not servitude to a group neurosis. In this regard, Freud cited religion as an example of a group neurosis with its foundations in repressed identifications with parental figures from the past. Furthermore, he saw the contribution of psychoanalysis to culture and society as a whole was that, rather like the psychoanalyst with the individual patient, eventually the mass (or group) would come to understand that religion (and similar superstitions or beliefs) were induced neuroses brought on as a "defence" by the mass to avoid them facing reality. In this sense, there are similarities in the uses of transference-neurosis in the group and clinical settings. Nevertheless, transference-neurosis was developed as an artificial means of curing symptoms and is unique to the psychoanalytic situation.

When it comes to Rycroft's definition of transference-neurosis, there is no single entry, instead it is defined under the two separate headings of transference and neurosis. Under the heading of transference, transference-neurosis is referred to as "the patient's emotional involvement with the analyst" (168). Whereas, under the heading of neurosis, it is referred to as

... either a neurosis in which the patient is capable of TRANSFERENCE or the obsessive interest in the analyst which develops during the course of psychoanalytical treatment (97).

It is interesting to note Rycroft's description of the term transference-neurosis and compare it to that of Laplanche and Pontalis. Rycroft refers to transference-neurosis as a sub-term of transference and a category of neurosis. However, Laplanche and Pontalis make a specific and lengthy entry for transference-neurosis and similarly to Badcock point out the important difference between transference and transference-neurosis. They tell the reader that transference-neurosis is a special condition of psychoanalytic treatment, it is an artificial neurosis brought about in the patient with intention by the analyst. Their definition explains:
I. Nosographically, a category of neurosis - comprising anxiety, hysteria, conversion hysteria and obsessional neurosis in which Freud distinguishes from the narcissistic neuroses within the group of psychoneuroses. In contrast to the narcissistic neuroses the transference neuroses are characterised by the libidos always being displaced onto real or imaginary objects instead of being withdrawn from these and directed onto the ego. They are consequently more amenable to psychoanalytic treatment, for they lend themselves to the constitution, during the treatment, of a transference neurosis in sense II.

II. In the theory of the psychoanalytic cure, this term refers to an artificial neurosis into which the manifestations of the transference tend to become organised. It is built around the relationship with the analyst and it is a new edition of the clinical neurosis; its elucidation leads to the uncovering of the infantile neurosis (462).

As can be seen, part I of the definition is purely concerned with placing transference-neurosis within the Freudian system of classification of neuroses. The commentary following goes on to expand on part II of the definition. It establishes that transference-neurosis is an artificial neurosis brought on deliberately in psychoanalytic treatment. In this sense, a transference-neurosis is special and different from transference. Transference-neurosis in psychoanalytic treatment is induced in the patient with intention by the analyst in order to facilitate a cure to mental illness.

(iv)

Counter-Transference

Eric Berne views counter-transference from a Freudian perspective. He does not have a glossary entry for it and treats it with disdain:

Since the analyst's job, in a way, is mostly to point out to the patient when he is fooling himself, the doctor must maintain a continual attitude of self-criticism to make sure that he is not, out of sympathy or irritation, allowing the patient to fool the doctor as well as himself. An uncalled for emotional attitude on the part of the analyst towards the patient is called counter-transference (269).

As already mentioned, Christopher Badcock is writing his book from an ego-psychology position and it is interesting to note that he does not discuss counter-
transference at all. It is likely that as Freud considered counter-transference a hindrance to analytic treatment Badcock chose not to discuss it.

Rycroft does define counter-transference:

1. The analyst's TRANSFERENCE on his patient. In this, the correct, sense, counter-transference is a disturbing, distorting element in treatment. 2. By extension, the analyst's emotional attitude towards his patient, including his response to specific items of the patient's behaviour. According to Heimann (1950), Little (1951), Gitelson (1952) and others, the analyst can use this latter kind of counter-transference as clinical evidence, i.e., he can assume that his own emotional response is based on a correct interpretation of the patient's true intentions or meaning (25).

The Laplanche and Pontalis account of counter-transference is fuller than Rycroft's. Their definition asserts:

The whole of the analyst's unconscious reactions to the individual analysand - especially to the analysand's own transference (42).

In the commentary, Laplanche and Pontalis place this term within its historic and structural context. They note that Freud made few references in his writings to counter-transference and give the impression that Freud viewed counter-transference from the analyst with caution. However, they comment, further development of psychoanalysis has put increased emphasis on counter-transference as a technique of the analyst and a useful phenomenon. Two important reasons for these developments are:

1. Increasingly, psychoanalytic treatment has come to be seen as a relationship between analyst and analysand.
2. The application by Freud's successors of psychoanalysis into areas where interaction of the analyst is considered constructive.

Laplanche and Pontalis go on to record that counter-transference is problematic and that there is argument regarding its use and scope. For example, it is contended that if counter-transference is apparent in the analyst then it is also apparent in the analysand. Furthermore, technical positions about its use in treatment are in contention. Analysts have a range of opinions about counter-transference. Some say that it should be excluded (as far as possible) from the treatment. Others that counter-transference is useful if controlled. While still others believe that counter-transference allows true "unconscious to unconscious" communication between analyst and analysand and is therefore a valid tool to aid interpretation of the unconscious.
The above points in favour of the use of counter-transference in psychoanalytic treatment are, as Laplanche and Pontalis indicate, the more accepted positions today. For an explanation of how and why counter-transference is now considered constructive in psychoanalysis, and therapies that use psychoanalytic theories, I will discuss Patrick Casement's text *On Learning from the Patient*. Casement's book is written with sensitivity towards the therapeutic relationship. Indeed, he stresses the value and quality of the relationship between patient and therapist,

It is my thesis, here, that the nature of a patient's experience of the therapeutic relationship is at least as important a therapeutic factor as any gain in cognitive insight. It is within this relationship that there can be new opportunities for dealing with old conflicts, for recovering what had been lost, for finding what had been missing in earlier relationships (168).

The therapeutic relationship, Casement indicates, is, as far as possible and whenever appropriate, a sharing relationship in which therapist and patient jointly develop and resolve the therapy.

From his perspective it is inevitable that in psychoanalytic treatment the therapist and patient will communicate together unconsciously:

Because unconscious speaks to unconscious it is essential that a therapist should have maximal access to this deepest level of interactive communication via his own unconscious responses to the patient. It is for this reason that analysts and therapists have to be analysed; and it is that experience, combined with a knowledge of theory, that helps most to make sense of a therapist's unconscious resonance to what is being communicated by the patient (217).

Once this position is accepted by the therapist then, Casement writes, the therapist is able to learn from the patient by employing psychoanalytic techniques. He describes methods of "learning to listen" to unconscious communications and then employing "internal supervision" to "analyse from the patient's perspective what [I think] is happening" (3). It is in this way that counter-transference can be useful in a therapeutic situation. Casement points out that therapists are trained to monitor their counter-transference responses to a patient so that they do not respond inappropriately to a patient. However, he indicates, denying counter-transference communications would be thwarting the development of the therapeutic relationship which leads to trust, understanding and acceptance by the patient. The meaningful development of the
relationship is seen as very important but must not be based on preconception of thought processes or theories by either therapist or patient. This is particularly so for the therapist as the blind acceptance of theory, Casement indicates, may well act as a preventive block when it comes to listening to the patient's unconscious. This again is where counter-transference can help.

By employing Casement's method of internal supervision the therapist can learn to balance his or her responses to the patient to maximise therapeutic benefit. He explains that the patient will often relate to the therapist as a "transferential object". However, this position must not be reversed (i.e. the therapist relating to the patient as transferential object), as the "needless interference" of the therapist's personality can be a hindrance to the psychoanalytic process. The balance of maintaining a neutral personality by the therapist during the process of analysis is difficult and Casement refers to this state of equilibrium in the therapist as that of "a transitional or potential presence (like that of a mother who is non-intrusively present with her playing child)" (29). "Learning how to listen" to the patient's conscious and unconscious and developing an availability to be "present" and/or "absent" psychically during therapy is a difficult task and this is learnt as part of the therapist's training when they themselves undergo analysis. As part of their training they learn how to differentiate between the "observing ego" and the "experiencing ego". Casement indicates, "It is here, in their own experience of being a patient, that therapists establish the first roots of what later becomes the internal supervisor" (31). Internal supervision is seen as an "island of intellectual contemplation" and a "mental space" from which the therapist can learn to monitor his or her operation in the therapeutic process.

Casement's viewpoint throughout is that communication between therapist and patient is interactive. By this he means consciously and unconsciously interactive in which each is responding to cues from the other. He argues:

Since the papers on countertransference by Heimann (1950) and Little (1951) it has been increasingly recognised that the analytic relationship is one in which there are two people interacting. Each is seeking to know the other. Consciously or unconsciously each is affecting the other. This dimension to the analytic relationship is implicit (and sometimes explicit) throughout the writings of such authors as Balint, Winnicott, Bion, Sandler and Searles to name just a few. Langs, on the other hand, has made an extensive study of these phenomena.

It is no longer adequate to think of the analyst as the one who observes and interprets, and the patient as the only person in this relationship who presents evidence of
unconscious communications and pathology. Patients do not see the analyst as a blank screen. They scrutinise the analyst, who aims to remain inscrutable, and they find many clues to the nature of this person they are dealing with. They sense the state of mind of the analyst and respond accordingly (57-58).

This is why it is necessary not only for the therapist to be listening to the patient but also, through internal supervision, to be listening to his or her communications consciously and unconsciously. To aid in this listening process Casement employs what he refers to as "trial identification". By this Casement means he attempts to listen, or be sensitive, to both the patient's transferences and his counter-transferences. This is because, used in the correct way, the therapist's counter-transferences are often what "trigger" the transferences of the patient. Identifying these transferent cues in therapeutic treatment calls for great skill and sensitivity and this, Casement indicates, can only be learnt through experience and maturation in the therapist's practice.

There is a delicate balance between the correct or incorrect use of counter-transference. Casement demonstrates in the presentation of clinical examples that internal supervision, listening and trial identification are not easy processes but that it is often by employing these techniques that it is realised that the therapy is drifting away from its focus or that the therapist has made a counter-transferent mistake. Therefore, it is the employment of these techniques that enables the therapist to correct his or her errors. Intriguingly, Casement indicates, the therapist's mistakes are often picked up, or unconsciously sensed, by the patient before the therapist has realised them. Casement comments that if therapeutic errors, which are often counter-transferent, are not observed by the therapist they can seriously affect, or even ruin, the course of therapy. However, in the clinical examples he cites, it appears one of the ways monitoring counter-transference is most helpful is the checking of mistakes or possible problems in the therapy. For example, Casement discusses the concept of "role-responsiveness" in therapy whereby the therapist might get inadvertently, or unconsciously, drawn into re-enacting, through counter-transference, the active role of an object from the patient's past in the therapeutic treatment. If not checked and corrected by internal supervision of the counter-transference the role-responsiveness could seriously interfere with therapy.

Casement goes on to discuss "forms of interactive communication" (72-101) and acknowledges that these unspoken, often unconscious, communications, are not exclusive to psychoanalytic technique:

Patients clearly demonstrate that the dynamics involved are by no means just theoretical, nor are they confined to analytic therapy. The forms of communication illustrated here
are universal. Too often they are not recognised or they are seen as bewildering: the communication then remains unacknowledged or not understood (72).

The unconscious interactions are in large part transferential and in this chapter Casement develops discussion of the subtle and complex uses of counter-transference in the therapeutic situation. He describes ways in which counter-transference can be used positively and ways in which counter-transference can be transgressive. To summarise his views on counter-transference Casement refers to the positive uses of counter-transference as a "diagnostic response" as opposed to a "personal counter-transference" by the therapist which can, if not checked, be negative. However, being attuned to the subtle signs of counter-transference can greatly aid the therapy. It is transference and counter-transference that, to Casement, are the communication channels that operate at a deep and dynamic level. This is why, from the therapist's perspective, he advocates care and caution in the use of counter-transference. It is a constructive and powerful tool to use, but it must not be misused as the intention is not to burden the patient with the therapist's personal feelings or personal life. By observing the patient's transferences and monitoring his or her counter-transferences with internal supervision the therapist can often identify cues from the patient of how to proceed with the therapy. It is from this psychic interaction that a greater insight can be achieved.

Casement places stress on the therapeutic relationship that is built up. The patient, in coming for treatment is often in a fragile and vulnerable mental state. The relationship has got to be managed by the therapist so that the patient can be held securely and with confidence that they are not going to be let go, or treated irresponsibly by the therapist during treatment. This, again, is where the monitoring of counter-transference can be constructive. The patient has to be confident that the therapist is mentally strong enough to contain the transferent and counter-transferent feelings that are emanating in the therapy. This knowledge and also knowing the therapist is empathic give the patient strength to delve further into his or her psychic problems. It is the capacity of the therapist to be able to experience, in the therapeutic relationship, "the patient's own unbearable feelings ... and yet ... find some way of going on" (154) that assists the patient in coming to terms and dealing with them. It is this containment of the therapy, aided by counter-transference, that gives the therapist's timely interpretations meaning to the patient. The therapist is the container of the transferential feelings but must maintain a balance of objectivity and subjectivity in the treatment to be able to best understand and interpret the intense feelings that are being generated in the treatment.

In conclusion, reviewing Patrick Casement's book *On Learning from the Patient* helps to put in perspective current thought and therapeutic practice on the uses of counter-
transference whilst, at the same time, explaining some of the intricate and complex interactions that take place in psychoanalytic therapy.

(v)

Summary Chapter One

By reviewing several definitions of transference I have given an introductory explanation of the ways in which transference operates in psychoanalytic theory and practice. From this information it will be noted that Berne refers to transference as an emotional relationship between two or more people. Badcock, and Laplanche and Pontalis inform the reader that transference occurs in situations other than that of psychoanalysis. Whilst Badcock also indicates that Freud clearly recognised that transference was ubiquitous and occurs in many situations concerning the individual or the group. Laplanche and Pontalis go on to say that transference is a relationship with "objects" and as I point out Rycroft and Laplanche and Pontalis indicate that the term object includes both human and inanimate symbols of human objects. As I illustrate in chapter two, there are grounds to propose that Freud used art objects as transference objects. Laplanche and Pontalis indicate that transferences are symbolic equivalents of original events. In this sense, and others, they point out that transference "has taken on a very broad extension" in meaning and interpretation by analysts. However, they indicate that in the therapeutic situation an analyst is needed to direct, discharge and confirm transferences.

When discussing transference-neurosis Badcock and Laplanche and Pontalis indicate that it is a deliberately formed artificial neurosis around which aspects of the psychoanalytic situation between analyst and analysand are based. As I will argue later, the importance of transference to therapy and the focus of psychoanalysis on transference-neurosis can obscure the relevance of transference's ubiquitous nature. When discussing transference and counter-transference, Casement indicates that it is a clear example of unconscious to unconscious communication and that it is a universal phenomenon. In the therapeutic situation it is inevitable and he indicates that for unconscious to unconscious communication to operate successfully there should be an empathic relationship.

By presenting the above evidence I intend to demonstrate, as I develop my hypothesis, that these features are significant. In an understanding of the effects and uses art is put to by individuals and society I will propose that fine art has the potential to contain
transferences and that what I call *visual transference* can be a characteristic of fine art's aesthetic effects. In chapter two it will be seen that one of the main situations transference is crucial to psychoanalysis is the comparisons of psychoanalysis to fine art and fine art to psychoanalysis.

---

9 In the context of this thesis I am using the term fine art to differentiate between art made in therapy and art made by professional artists such as painters and sculptors.
CHAPTER TWO

A REVIEW OF CONTEMPORARY DATA FROM PSYCHOANALYTIC SOURCES

...an artist is originally a man who turns away from reality because he cannot come to terms with the renunciation of instinctual satisfaction which it at first demands. He finds his way back to reality, however, from this world of fantasy by making use of special gifts to mold his fantasies into truths of a new kind, which are valued by men as precious reflections of reality... (Sigmund Freud).

(i)

Introduction

Having presented definitions of transference in chapter one, I will now move on in chapters two and three to a discussion of the contemporary uses of transference theoretically and practically when applied to art in the therapeutic and fine art situations. This survey, or literature review, reveals significant implications for the uses of transference when considering contemporary perceptions of the psychic contents of fine art. As will be seen in this chapter, psychoanalysts have been aware for many years of the intricate connections between psychoanalysis and art. Entwined in that relationship is transference. It has been pointed out in chapter one that transference is ubiquitous and that psychoanalysis accepts that an object on to which transference is directed may be inanimate. In this chapter I will present arguments that describe the similarities between psychoanalysis and art, aesthetic experience and transference. As will be seen,

1 S.E. vol.12, 224.
the positions presented further the hypothesis that fine art contains visual transferences and that these contribute towards personal meaning and aesthetic experience.

(ii) Freud's Interest in Art

_Sigmund Freud and Art - His Personal Collection of Antiquities_ gives some interesting insights into one of the two obsessions that were paramount to Freud throughout his adult life.² The first obsession, as we know, was psychoanalysis, that science or art (depending on your philosophic position) that from at least Freud's thirtieth year until his death in 1939 absorbed his being.³ The other, and perhaps less widely recognised, obsession for Freud was archaeology and the art and mythology that his archaeological collection of artefacts gave substance to. _Sigmund Freud and Art_ comprises of photographs recording some of the finest examples of Freud's extensive collection of art and a series of essays by some of today's leading Freudian scholars from the fields of art history, art criticism, philosophy, archaeology and psychoanalysis.

The importance of the collection to Freud can not be overstated. In a letter to Stefan Zweig dated 7 February, 1931, Freud wrote "I have sacrificed a great deal for my collection of Greek, Roman and Egyptian antiquities, and have actually read more archaeology than psychology" (16).⁴ Richard Wells, in the preface to the _Sigmund Freud and Art_ informs us that Freud's collection of antiquities was extensive. It must also be taken into account that as an avid collector Freud was constantly buying and selling pieces of art. The actual number of artworks that went through his hands during his lifetime was far greater than the "more than two thousand pieces that crowd Freud's


³ For an interesting discussion of psychoanalysis compared to an art form see Hans W. Loewald M.D. "Psychoanalysis as an Art and the Fantasy Character of the Psychoanalytic Situation" _Papers on Psychoanalysis_ (New Haven: Yale UP, 1980).

⁴ It should be noted that Stefan Zweig was also responsible for introducing Salvador Dali to Freud. See S. Romm and J.W. Slap, "Sigmund Freud and Salvador Dali: Personal Moments", _American Imago_, 40 Winter (1983): 337-347, for an account of the meeting. Dali idolised Freud and had attempted unsuccessfully on three previous occasions to meet him. Freud on the other hand was indifferent to Dali and regarded Surrealists, prior to his meeting with Dali on 19 July, 1938, "as complete fools". Romm and Slap put forward a scenario in which Dali may have regarded Freud as his Father Imago. For example, (i) there were similarities between Dali's father and Freud, (ii) Dali associated with Freudian themes and theory on the basis of his own personal history; notably guilt, sublimation and omnipotence over the death of his brother in their childhood, (iii) Freud also experienced loss of a brother in his childhood and (iv) Freud's apparent indifference to Dali could be seen by Dali as rejection of him by Freud (Father Imago) in favour of his dead and "perfect" brother, a position Romm and Slap indicate Dali was forever attempting to replace or attain.
extraordinary working environment at 20 Maresfield Gardens, now the Freud Museum, London" (11). His collection of archaeological and art books was similar in number to his collection of antiquities5. It is significant that this collection of books and his art objects spilt over into and influenced his development of psychoanalysis. Freud's psychoanalytic writing on the arts and artists is also extensive. The standard edition of 24 volumes of his psychological works is riddled with references to "painting and sculpture, music, drama, poetry, fiction, as well as some myths, legends and fairy tales" (S.E. vol. 24, 187). Some of the better known of Freud's writings on art-related subjects include:6

*Delusions and Dreams in Jensen's Gradiva*, S.E. vol.9.
"Creative Writers and Day-Dreaming", S.E. vol.9.
*Leonardo Da Vinci and a Memory of his Childhood*, S.E. vol.11.
"The Occurrence in Dreams of Material from Fairy Tales", S.E. vol.12.
"Dostoevsky and Parricide", S.E. vol.21.
"To Thomas Mann on his Sixtieth Birthday", S.E. vol.22.
"Medusa's Head", S.E. vol.18.

Freud's fascination with collecting art spread over forty years and it is interesting to note that when he had to leave Vienna, due to the persecution of the Nazis, he moved all of his antiquities and nearly his entire library of art books to London for what was to be the last year of his life. The many photographs of Freud's consulting rooms in both Vienna and London confirm his interest in art, as does the portrait of Freud by Max Pollack which shows him at his desk accompanied by some of his favourite art pieces. All these things indicate the importance to Freud of his art collection. From some perspective's Freud could be thought eccentric, obsessive or even childlike in his passion for collecting artefacts. Perhaps there are elements of all three characteristics displayed. Certainly some psychoanalytic interpretations can be made to hypothesize about Freud's need, or desire to, collect and I shall make reference to these shortly. However, it must be kept in mind that during the era in which Freud lived, archaeology

---

5 In an essay in the same book Wendy Batting and J. Keith Davies inform the reader that "Estimates of the number of books in the collection in Vienna and the number moved to London are necessarily approximate, but the contents of the Bergasse 19 library are thought to have numbered some 2,500 volumes in 1938.... Freud's interest was eclectic, and this is reflected in his library. Topics include sculpture and figurines, ceramics, painting and frescoes, amulets, vases, glass and jewellery, as well as the large-scale monuments and architecture of antiquity" (185-186).

6 It should also be noted that Freud had many associations with artists. See Reuben Fine, "The Effect of Psychoanalysis on the Creative Individual", *Current Issues in Psychoanalytic Practice*, vol.1 (1) (1984) 3. Fine writes, "Freud was also friendly with a large number of artists, particularly writers: Jones mentions the Zweigs, Arnold and Stefan, Thomas Mann, Gerhardt Hauptmann and H.G. Wells, among others".
and collecting archaeological works received much public attention and was going through a period of dynamic growth. Archaeology had developed from being a fashionable and romantic pursuit of the upper classes into a systematic science. It was accessible to a wider public giving substance to myth and legend and revealing secrets about ancestors and their lives. Perhaps in this sense, a parallel can be made with the general study of psychology for up until the late nineteenth century it, also, had not been developed as a separate, systematic or scientific study.

Freud intentionally applied the analogy of archaeology to psychoanalysis. In fact, it is reasonable to say that in Freud's view the analogy of psychoanalysis to archaeology served many purposes and that the two obsessions of his life became metaphors\(^7\) of each other. This is certainly the argument put forward by Donald Kuspit in his essay "A Mighty Metaphor: The Analogy of Archaeology and Psychoanalysis" (133-152). He maintains that to Freud the ancient artworks "were preserved pieces of the mind, petrified parts of the psyche. Surrounding himself with them, he symbolically immersed himself in the psyche." (142). The archaeological artefacts surrounded his working and creative environment. They gave substance to the theory of his discoveries and to the meaning of his life. Time and again he would return to the analogy of archaeology and psychoanalysis. As Peter Gay notes in the introduction to *Sigmund Freud and Art*, virtually all Freud's visitors to Bergasse 19 attest to the collection's significance to him... "They were beginning to crowd every available space in his consulting room and the adjoining study" (16). Many of Freud's clients, such as the famed "Wolf Man", could attest to the significance of the art collection to Freud. Peter Gay writes,

> Freud employed his collection as a master metaphor for the psychoanalytic process. "The psychoanalyst, like the archaeologist in his excavations", the Wolf Man recalled Freud telling him, "must uncover layer after layer of the patient's psyche, before coming to the deepest, most valuable treasures" (16).

Touching on Freud's unconscious motives for collecting art, Gay continues,

> Collecting, as psychoanalysts have taught us, is literally a childish activity. But this does not mean that on Freud's showing it stands condemned; psychoanalysis sees the child as not merely father to the man: the child is, or at least inhabits, the man... collecting stamps, or china - or Greek and Egyptian and Chinese statuettes, for that

---

7 For a discussion of the similarities of the use of metaphor in art and psychoanalysis, see 83-84 of this thesis.
matter - partakes of, and preserves, early erotic pleasures; Freud, we are told, liked to
gaze at the antiquities on his desk as he worked and, at times, moving from looking to
touching, would stroke his favourites. But there is more passion to it still: collecting,
as anyone who has ever collected can testify, gives power. To possess a complete
collection of certain stamp issues or of one's reviews or letters to the editor is, in some
intimate fashion, a way of controlling and commanding the world (18).

Sigmund Freud at his desk. An etching by Max Pollack, 1914

Moving on to another contributor to the book *Sigmund Freud and Art: His Personal Collection of Antiquities*, Ellen Handler Spitz, psychoanalyst and humanities scholar, makes some interesting observations in her essay, "Psychoanalysis and the Legacies of
Antiquity\textsuperscript{8}. Handler Spitz reflects on Freud's deep love of the arts and attempts to indicate some further psychological reasons for the allure of archaeology and its artefacts to him. Focusing on individual objects from Freud's extensive collection to explain his investment in ancient mythology and art, she indicates that perhaps for Freud the assembled artefacts acted as audience, companions, relatives and contributors to his life and work. In this regard it should be kept in mind that essentially all of Freud's collection of artefacts were figurative or had figurative elements or connotations. Consequently, they were a direct visual and psychological link to the human mind and body. Handler Spitz posits,

Seated in his consulting room, listening hour by hour, penning the theories that were to transform our self-understanding, Freud shared physical space and visual field with these carved, limned and modelled objects; he worked, as it were, under their gaze (154).

Pursuing the theme of Freud's relatedness to his collection Handler Spitz continues:

We also gain insight into the depth of feeling associated with these objects when we learn that Freud had the habit of occasionally bringing a newly acquired purchase, such as a statuette, to the dinner table and placing it in front of him as he ate, then returning it later to his desk (155).

She then focuses on a single bronze that sat on Freud's desk. It was of Amon-Re the Egyptian King of the Gods. Handler Spitz suggests that this statue, and statues like it that Freud admired, could have been an unconscious sign of Freud's ambivalence towards his Jewish origins and of relations to his father. She argues that Freud's interest in Egyptology was a form of introverted, or unconscious, rejection of his Judaic origins. Handler Spitz emphasises that Freud only started his archaeological collection after his father's death and that later in one of Freud's most problematic and controversial texts, Moses and Monotheism: Three Essays (S.E., vol 23, 54), Moses (the father of Judaism) is cast as an Egyptian nobleman who supplanted the worship of the god Amun only later to be murdered by the Jews. She indicates that there is evidence (in Freud's own writing and that of Freudian scholars)\textsuperscript{9} to support the notion that Freud's rejection of Judaism, and the ambivalence sometimes displayed towards his father, were manifest in his love and adoption of Egyptian, Greek and Roman culture:

\textsuperscript{8} Other works of Ellen Handler Spitz's will be considered in part (iii) of this chapter.

\textsuperscript{9} See Sigmund Freud and Art (154-157).
In emphasising that Freud elected for himself an intellectual heritage different from that of his ancestors, it seems hardly necessary to point out that none of his cherished ancient objects is in any sense Jewish and that Jewish rituals and observance were anathema to him (158).

Handler Spitz conflates the relationship of the statue of the god Amun on Freud's desk to Moses and comments on "Freud's lifelong fascination with the figure of Moses". She argues that Freud wanted to see Moses as Egyptian and patriarchal, so that he might see himself as from Egyptian not Judaic ancestry. Handler Spitz points out that there is evidence in Freud's own record of his self-analysis to indicate oedipal and ambivalent feelings towards his father (159-157). Furthermore, she suggests the displacement of unconscious emotions concerning his father, and revealed in Freud's record of his dreams, onto statuettes such as that of Amon-Re.10

In "The Origins of Freud's Antiquities Collection" (21-22), Lynn Gamwell furthers Handler Spitz's argument concerning Freud's art collection and its transferent connections to his relationship with his father. Gamwell's essay sensitively reconstructs the origins of Freud's interest in collecting as coinciding with the death of his father. However, Gamwell sees Freud's interest, initially at least, as a consolation and replacement for the now missing relationship he had shared with his father. Gamwell suggests that the collection became the living and symbolic representative of both the memory of the relationship Freud had with his father and the phantasized relationship he would have liked to have had. As the collection grew it became as much a presence in Freud's consulting rooms as Freud himself and Gamwell reports that Freud regarded the collection as his "companions": "He was in the habit of stroking the marble baboon, as he did his pet chows, and of greeting the Chinese sage every morning" (27). Poignantly, Gamwell informs the reader that at the end of his life Freud "chose to die" in his consulting rooms surrounded by his art collection. These were the objects, she argues, that Freud saw as his ancestors, relatives and "his most faithful colleagues".

Martin S. Bergmann's essay, "Science and Art in Freud's Life and Work" (173-183) furthers Handler Spitz's inferences about the importance of Freud's art collection when

10 Concerning Freud's love of Greek history and mythology and his ambivalence both to Judaism and his father, it is interesting to note that the most prized piece of Freud's entire art collection was that of the female god "Athena" - goddess of war and patron of the arts. In the hierarchy of arrangement on Freud's desk, Athena sat at the centre and when in 1939 his entire antiquities collection was threatened by the Nazis, Athena was the sole piece selected to be smuggled personally by Freud from Vienna to London (see Sigmund Freud and Art 110 and 178).
used for therapeutic purposes. He refers to one of Freud's most famous analysands, the poet Hilda Doolittle, and relates Doolittle's account of Freud using his favourite art object (that of Athena) in a therapeutic context. Bergmann informs us that this use "avoids a confrontation that could bring about a transference crisis and might be a source of danger to the patient" (178). Going on to say that Doolittle was in "a state of positive transference" towards Freud, due to her identification with Alcestis (interestingly also a figure from Greek mythology), Bergmann indicates that it was the use of the statue Athena that facilitated a transference of unconscious thought between Doolittle and Freud. According to Bergmann it was a negative transference towards Freud (recorded by Doolittle in her own hand) that when deciphered on a symbolic level revealed an unconscious conflict concerning Doolittle's sexuality (178-179). The use of Freud's art collection as "transference objects" is a point also made by Donald Kuspit. He considers that, for Freud, the objects of his collection allowed him to carry on an interminable intra-psychic dialogue that was synonymous with his self analysis:

Freud used his antiquities to summon up the spirits of his own underworld and to reflect on them, to question them about himself. They were, in effect, inside him: instruments of self analysis. They were transference objects, in which he could read his own prehistory (150 emphasis added).

Bergmann goes on to suggest that psychoanalysis conflates art and science. He does this by referring to the events of Doolittle's analysis as an example. Freud saw himself as a scientist, yet used his art collection to elicit transferences. Furthermore, Bergman suggests that Freud realised that psychoanalysis could have applications in the area of art and culture over and above its applications in medicine. He quotes Freud:

As a "depth psychology" a theory of the mental unconscious, it can become indispensable to all the sciences which are concerned with the evolutions of human civilisation and its major institutions such as art, religion and the social order... The use of analysis for the treatment of the neuroses is only one of its applications; the future will perhaps show that it is not the most important one. In any case it would be wrong to sacrifice all the other applications to this single one, just because it touches on the circle of medical interests. (S.E., vol. 20, 248).

Bergmann takes the position that "psychoanalysis is a domain of both art and science" (181). He makes the point that even though psychoanalysis has many of the requirements of science, for example: evolutionary techniques, order, method, models, etc., it also has, in common with other sciences, the requirement of talented and original practitioners. For Bergmann these practitioners are the artists of psychoanalysis - the
intuitive and perceptive interpreters. But Bergmann points out psychoanalysis has an even more unique property which places it even closer to art. The property is interpretation. He argues:

No two psychoanalysts make the same interpretation. The data patients present as their histories, the dreams they report, the slips of the tongue they make and the transference relationships they develop are seldom, if ever, open to only one interpretation.... the most important interpretations occur to the analyst through a co-operation he receives from his own unconscious. Every psychoanalysis is to a lesser or greater extent, a voyage of discovery. It is here that no amount of training can take the place of psychoanalytic talent (182, emphasis added).

As seems to happen consistently when reading about the qualities of psychoanalysis by various authors, one cannot help but see the comparisons to artistic endeavours that are being so obviously made. In his essay, Bergmann compares the psychoanalyst to an artist. However, if one were considering the role of the art critic or theoretician to that of the psychoanalyst, would one not say that it is only the truly talented practitioners of criticism and theory that make the most compelling and intuitive interpretations?

In conclusion, Bergmann argues that Freud created psychoanalysis rather than discovered it. This for Bergmann makes Freud the master artist. The argument continues as to whether psychoanalysis is an art or a science. However, one might ask, where does this place theories of psychoanalysis like transference or infantile sexuality? Are they scientific or artistic phenomena? In all probability and like aspects of many other disciplines, they are combinations of both. Consequently, there is a degree of symmetry that might have pleased Freud. He was, after all, a compulsive dualist. Duality appears essential in Freud's life and work, it appears in combinations such as: ego and id, masculine and feminine, object and subject, active and passive, love and hate, infantile and adult. In each by necessity, because they are part of the larger whole, there is an overlay. This Bergmann concludes is how it is for psychoanalysis, Freud's science and art.

---

The work of Ellen Handler Spitz.

Over the last decade some of the most important contributions concerning the applications of psychoanalysis to art, and art to psychoanalysis, have come from Ellen Handler Spitz who is resident at Columbia College, New York University. In the last several years, Handler Spitz, has published two books concerning art and psychoanalysis: *Art and Psyche* and *Image and Insight* and I will refer to these shortly. However, initially I wish to commence by discussing an earlier essay of hers entitled "The Past of Illusion: A Contribution of Child Psychoanalysis to the Understanding of Aesthetic Experience". It was first published in *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* in 1982. The aim of the paper was to illustrate the role that psychoanalysis can play in elaborating on our understanding of aesthetic experience. Aesthetic experience is:

... both our responsive encounters with works of art and the artist's creative moments, for it is clear upon reflection that we must, as artist and audience, engage in both modes: to respond, we must be capable of imagining; and to create, we must continually serve as our own first audience. (59)

From the outset Handler Spitz makes reference to Margaret S. Mahler and D.W. Winnicott and their object-relations theories of psychoanalysis. These theories concerning child psychology put great emphasis on the relationship of the child or baby as subject to those of the mother as object in the earliest stages of infancy. During this crucial stage, from birth to the first year of life, there is considered to be a state of psychological fusion between baby and mother which is considered necessary for the normal development of the individual's psychology. This state of fusion, Handler Spitz argues, is analogous to that of aesthetic experience:

Thus, symbiotic fusion can be linked with the aesthetic ideal in that encounters with the beautiful may temporarily obliterate our sense of inner and outer separateness by dissolving both the boundaries between self and other and the categories into which we normally divide the world (63).


Object-relations theory claims that the first individual act of creation occurs, in this early symbiotic period of life, when as babies we mentally create the mother's breast. This may seem paradoxical, and in fact is accepted as such by Winnicott. However, in effect, it is considered that immediately after birth the child does not differentiate between self and (m)other or mother's breast. Consequently, as consciousness emerges, in the rapidly developing infant, he or she registers a need for the breast and the mother registering the need offers it. To the child's psyche this is an act of creation and magical omnipotence: "a subjective phenomenon which we call the mother's breast develops in the baby's mind and [that] the mother offers the real breast just at the point when the infant is ready to create it" (63). Handler Spitz sees this act of creation in the same way as Mahler and Winnicott; it is the nucleus of the future development of creativity, and the "magical omnipotence" the child feels, the ability to create the breast on command, is closely related to the repetition of artistic experience. Handler Spitz writes, "The artist, like the symbiotic infant, believes somehow in his power to recreate the world according to his inner wishes" (64).

Handler Spitz continues by describing how object-relations theory proposes that the child evolves from breast dependence to a more advanced stage of psychic development, (the physical counterpart of this process we know as weaning). In object-relations terms it is called separation-individuation. To achieve this stage there is a mental change in both the mother and baby. However, whereas the mother relinquishes all mental need to breast feed, the child never completely loses the desire for symbiotic fusion. This fuels the duel concept of desire and loss. Loss of "oneness" or symbiosis with the mother involves the individual in what Mahler calls "a lifelong mourning process" and is the reason for the child investing in transitional objects. Transitional objects are in their fundamental form, substitutes for the breast and mediate during the individual's development. Quoting Winnicott, Handler Spitz writes, "use [is] made of objects that are not part of the infant's body yet are not fully recognised as belonging to external reality". It is this universal use of transitional objects, in one form or another, that initiates a higher stage of creation than that of "magical omnipotence." This enables the child to develop creative play which in turn leads to imaginative development and on into full "adult involvement in cultural, specifically


aesthetic experience" (66). Handler Spitz goes on to compare the transitional object to the art object:

Like the work of art, it [the transitional object] comes into being during encounters with the child (artist), and it exists in what Winnicott calls the intermediate area of experience, in "that potential space between the subjective object and the object objectively perceived." The transitional object (again like the aesthetic object) preserves that which must be lost. It is the embodiment of illusion, a covenant between fantasy and reality, an external testament to inner experience. It bridges the lacuna between isolation and fusion. (67).

For Handler Spitz, "fusion," "illusion" and "magical omnipotence" are invested in the transitional object and these are the qualities that later the mature adult invests in the art object, therefore, allowing aesthetic experience the quality of "oneness" that we knew as infants. Handler Spitz writes "In aesthetic moments, the tension of inner and outer is overcome as we contemplate the beautiful - be it poetry, music, dance, or the visual arts" (68). In "The Past of Illusion" Handler Spitz, describes and develops object-relations positions first put forward by D.W. Winnicott and M.S. Mahler.17

In Handler Spitz's first book, entitled Art and Psyche, the preface states that her intention in the book is to examine three models of psychoanalytic interpretation used with art. Each of the three models discussed have in common three components for comparison. These are, "an aspect of psychoanalytic theory, an aesthetic problem, and a critical mode" (x). In each of the three models Handler Spitz points out that "issues of transference and empathy [are] implicit in all three models, [and] move into the foreground and assume appropriately central roles" (xi).

The position on the centrality of transference to the interpretation of art is reinforced when one considers the emphasis Handler Spitz puts on the connection between art and dreaming. The interpretation of transferences entails the revelation of unconscious content and in this sense is closely linked to dreaming.18 For Handler Spitz one of Freud's great contributions to understanding cultural activity lies in his theoretical underpinning of art to the dream:

17 Peter Fuller also considered these theories and I will discuss his contribution later in this thesis.

18 It must also be taken into account that many of Freud's earliest references to transference were directly concerned with transferences that occur whilst dreaming. For example see:
(i) S.E. vol. 4, 184.
(ii) S.E. vol. 5, 552-605.
Ricoeur states that the interpretation of dreams stands as paradigmatic in Freud's oeuvre for all interpretations in the cultural sphere. He accounts for this by pointing to the continuities between dream and art from the psychoanalytic perspective: (1) for Freud dreams have meanings that are continuous with working meanings and, hence, deeply imbedded in the cultural context; (2) these meanings concern the disguised fulfilment of repressed desires that must be unmasked, brought to light via interpretation; (3) disguise is brought about by the complex mechanisms of dream-work, which, for Ricoeur, constitutes a paradigm for all 'stratagems of desire' (160); (4) the desires disguised by dreams are necessarily infantile and, therefore, interpretation based on analogy with dreams must not only unmask hidden meanings but also unearth archaisms of various types and on many levels; and (5) dreams require the exquisite elaboration of "the language of desire" (160), the representability by symbol of man's fundamental sexuality; hence they serve as an appropriate model for myth, legend, and folktale, the "great popular daydreams" (160), as Ricoeur puts it (7).

Handler Spitz sees transference in art as never ending, both for the individual and for culture. The artist's externalisations:

... are only temporary, transitory: (conflicted) investment in the primary objects is never fully transferred from the intra psychic to the cultural realm. From the point of view of society and culture, on the other hand, the work of art serves as a highly valued transformation of narcissistic instinctual energy into products that have a life of their own and that derive added and continuous overlays of meaning from their successive cultural contexts (8).

In this context, Handler Spitz sees art as a transmitter of messages, back and forth, between artist and audience. She compares the "art experience" to the analytic relationship between analyst and analysand and also alludes to the "aesthetic distance" required between artist and audience:

It is interesting to note the parallel here with psychoanalytic process itself, in which the patient, through gradual identification and insight, becomes capable of understanding and interpreting his own behaviour, becomes, on the analogy, his own analyst, his own artist ... there is a parallel to the psychoanalytic situation in which, without an optimal distance that includes both empathy and therapeutic neutrality, counter-transference and the maintenance of an evenly suspended attention on the part of the analyst, the process is impeded. (9-10.)
Handler Spitz continues by putting emphasis on the relationship between artist, critic and audience. She sees these relationships as inextricably linked and overlayed:

As artist, one must continually step back from work in progress to appraise it critically; as critic, one's perceptual acuity, inventiveness, general knowledge and unconscious fantasy determine to a large extent the character and quality of aesthetic encounters and judgements; as audience, one must re-create in imagination, resonate in fantasy, with aspects of the works perceived. Hence, to separate these contingent categories of aesthetic functioning is to serve the needs of philosophical discourse rather than to describe accurately what actually takes place in creation, criticism, or aesthetic encounters, where the real differences are in emphasis only and where each mode is implicit in the others (12).

During the lengthy and complex introduction to her book, Handler Spitz reviews literature that has relevance to her own writing. One of the authors referred to is Gilbert Rose. Handler Spitz reports that in his essay, "Some Aspects of Aesthetics in the Light of the Rapprochement Subphase" Rose also finds that the aesthetic experience has distinct characteristics analogous to those experienced in the analytic situation:\textsuperscript{19}

For Rose, orientation to reality is central to the aesthetic experience, which, he believes, expands the present moment for us by offering us an intimate contact with the past without regression. As we bring our own past feelings and desires to bear upon the work of art, we have an intensified and extended encounter with the present; hence, a more integrated adaptation to reality (21).

Turning now to the three models of psychoanalytic interpretation that Handler Spitz addresses in \textit{Art and Psyche}, the first is \textit{Pathography}. This model of interpretation was developed by Freud. It was employed by him in such works as \textit{Leonardo Da Vinci and a memory of his Childhood} (\textit{S.E.} vol. 11). Essentially, Handler Spitz indicates:

...this model takes as its interpretive context the work of art plus whatever can be known about the artist's life and larger oeuvre. Emphasis is placed on conflict and repetition, and the theoretical base typically involves classical Freudian theory, that is, the analysis of drives and drive derivatives, reconstruction and the oedipal constellation. This model is equipped to address such aesthetic issues as artistic creativity, the precise relations between an artist's life and work, and artistic intention and expression (x).

This model Handler Spitz explains is within...

...the Romantic or expressive critical tradition.... The relevant question for the critic in each case is: what is the underlying feeling, psychic state, conflict, or desire that is finding expression here, possibly disguised? (26-7).

Citing the advent of Romantic criticism in the early nineteenth century, Handler Spitz claims that by the time Freud developed his pathographic technique, the world of art criticism was ready and waiting to accept such an interpretive model. This is because Romantic criticism put special emphasis on,

...the artist [to myths] and cults of the artist, to views of the artist as different from other people, as hypersensitive, fragile, "possessed" and so forth, reviving in modern times Plato's notion of the artist's madness (28).

Consequently, Handler Spitz claims, the legacy of Romantic criticism also fuelled art movements such as Symbolism, Post-Impressionism, Expressionism, Fauvism, Surrealism and Abstract Expressionism. However, Handler Spitz informs us that pathography is,

A less inclusive term than biography, [pathography] implies writing about suffering, illness or feeling, with important overtones of empathic response on the part of the author for his subject. It suggests selected aspects of a life, precisely, in fact, those aspects that pertain to (mental) disease and to intrapsychic conflict, its symptoms and their etiology. Thus the conception of the artist implicit in Freud's terms grows solidly out of the Romantic tradition, in which artistic creativity is variously associated with moments of intense emotion, altered states of consciousness and pain (28).

Pathography, Handler Spitz claims in many respects "represents a final flowering in the twentieth century of Romantic criticism" (29). As a technique Romantic criticism itself has received substantial criticism in the twentieth century, and as a result other critical modes have been introduced to address other problems of art.20 However, in various ways ranging from biographical to pathographic applications, the legacy of Romantic criticism still emerges regularly in dialogue and argument concerning art and artists21.


21 Two recent examples of major texts that include biographical, pathographic and Romantic critical aspects are:
The continuing appeal of the pathographic approach must surely lie in its ability to give a full and complex account of the artist's intentions, using psychic interpretation of the artist's life and artworks.

Handler Spitz points out that:

In the best examples of pathographic literature, three major psychoanalytic viewpoints are carefully developed and interwoven. These are (1) the genetic or developmental viewpoint; (2) the dynamic, structural, and economic viewpoints which are independent; and (3) the adaptive viewpoint (42).

1. The genetic or developmental viewpoint will encompass aspects of the artist's very early life between the ages of 0 and 6 years old. This is because psychoanalytic theory holds that relationships and events in this period have a life-long effect on the individual. Three psychoanalysts who have written extensively on this subject are Ernst Kris, Phylis Greenacre and William G. Niederland.22

2. The dynamic, structural and economic viewpoints are concerned with works of art "seen as the outcome of conflicting energetic forces". The task of pathographer here is to "pinpoint specific areas of intrapsychic conflict and to trace such conflict to (and from) its expression in certain aspects of the artist's work" (47).23

3. Considering the third viewpoint, Handler Spitz comments:

... the adaptive or constructive mode, is little stressed by pathographers.... Adaptation involves twin notions: (1) that the creation of works enables an artist, through a process of release and satisfaction (Kris, 1952, 317), to adjust to or endure his internal and external environment; and (2) that the creation of works of art serves also to transform the environment itself in myriad ways so as to make it more viable - to bring it into conformity, that is, with intrapsychic needs. (49)


She points out that this mode of pathography has been little developed, probably because analysts have been more interested in looking at artists where conflicts are evident. However, in the adaptive mode they would not be evident, due to the very adaptation the art brings about.

Before going on to give examples of pathography in practice Handler Spitz points out some of the recognised limitations of traditional pathographic technique. Firstly, and as touched on above, even though pathography provides an in-depth model for investigating "the workings of the artist's mind", it does not go far enough in informing us of the adaptive properties of art. In other words how does art successfully provide conflict free solutions to living? This is due to the concentration of pathographers on the developmental and dynamic aspects of conflict in the artist's past which is, of course, a traditional view of classical psychoanalysis. Hence, there is a tendency to see artists exhibiting mental problems and this tendency has developed a limiting view for pathography. A second limiting factor of pathographic technique concerns the biases of counter-transferential choice. In this case there is concern that the pathographer will make choices and decisions about art and artists from the position of their own intrapsychic biases. This position would negate the perceived classical psychoanalyst's need for neutrality in the analytic process and perhaps devalue the results of the pathographic inquiry. Thirdly, pathography might not sufficiently consider the rigours of the medium the artist is working within as a contributing factor to the work itself. In other words, there is, in some cases, too much emphasis on the individual psychic problems and not enough on the external physical realities and dictates of production. Finally, there is a serious problem of ethics concerned with pathography that affects all biographical pursuits to a lesser or greater extent. How can it be known that what is being written, often about dead or historic figures, is correct in every aspect and to what extent is this need for factual information necessary? Obviously, without thorough research there is the possibility of error and in this respect Freud's essay on Leonardo Da Vinci has received much criticism. Nevertheless, in the case of the artist the product of his

---

24 This point is expanded on by R.S. Liebert, Michelangelo: A Psychoanalytic Study of His Life and Images. He writes: "In applying psychoanalytic knowledge to particular works of art, one may be tempted to circumvent confusion and complexity by reducing the problem to a few universal motives (as if one could fully understand Hamlet by giving proper attention to his Oedipal conflicts). Rather, it is essential to hold the principle that all significant behaviour, including works of art, is determined by many and diverse motivational themes. These motives are organised in a dynamic hierarchical structure which is continuously shifting in relation to internal (intrapsychic) factors and external pressures and opportunities. For example, the organisation of motives determining a specific work could vary with the content of the work, where it fits into the artistic tradition of the day, whether it was to be painted or sculptured, the nature of the relationship between the artist and his patron, as well as in other circumstances in the artist's life during the period in which the work was planned and executed" (12).
work already has significance and it is this that gives the pathography or biography its context and meaning. Therefore, one could argue, any pathography or biography whether it be fictive, documentary or thematic in style has the potential to give us a greater insight into the artist and his or her work. Furthermore, there are many levels on which stylistic interpretation can operate. Handler Spitz maintains that pathography comes close to the psychoanalytic situation in the context and insight gained from the relationship between analyst and analysand. Perhaps, Handler Spitz suggests the author of pathography, when achieving well, can bring us close to those same insights of the analysis even though there may be sacrifices to certain unknown facts and truths outside of the pathographer's control.

To illustrate the differing styles of pathography Handler Spitz gives three accounts of classic approaches:

(i) For the fictive approach Handler Spitz uses Freud's *Leonardo Da Vinci and a Memory of His Childhood* (S.E. vol 11).

(ii) For the documentary approach she looks at Robert Liebert's *Michelangelo: A Psychoanalytic Study of the Man and His Images*.

(iii) For the thematic approach Handler Spitz refers to Martha Wolfenstein's, "The Past Recaptured in the Work of Réne Magritte".

Looking, firstly, at Freud's *Leonardo* study, Handler Spitz is critical of the method Freud used:

Freud based his work quite heavily on a methodology founded on unanalysed counter-transference plus the ad hoc application (and creation) of new theory. In lieu of the meticulous reconstruction that characteristics (sic) his clinical case presentations, he offers here what might be classified as an example of the "wild" analysis which, that same year (1910), he himself was to describe and deplore (57).

Interestingly, in speaking of the *Leonardo* study, Handler Spitz correlates something quite noticeable in much of Freud's references to art, artists and art terminology; namely the "use both of artist and works to illustrate aspects of psychoanalytic theory with which Freud was struggling at that time" (57). This is a point also expressed by many other writers on the *Leonardo* study and other texts. Also, it can be added

---


that, writing about real and creative people like artists is usually interesting and has appeal both for author and reader; something about which Freud would have been consciously aware of. Handler Spitz goes on to enumerate other criticisms against the Leonardo text. These tie in with the position that Freud was indeed using the essay to illustrate, imaginatively, aspects of psychoanalytic method rather than Leonardo's artistic intentions:

[Freud] assumes (1) the absolute reliability of the author, in the absence of dialogue with the (deceased) artist; (2) the power of the interpreter to move confidently from manifest to latent content in the absence of associations and live transference; and (3) the equations of works of art with ordinary symptoms or dreams as if they were transparencies through which primary process could be read rather than unusually complex compromise formations (see Bergler), in which specific unconscious meanings can be glimpsed only dimly and often only after they have been subject to a series of filters that minimally establish perimeters for interpretation (60 emphases added).

Handler Spitz indicates that a number of flaws have been found in Freud's account of Leonardo Da Vinci and she goes on to discuss the presumptuous tone Freud adopts towards Da Vinci's life and work.27 One of the main criticisms of the Leonardo text is in the area of transference association between author and subject. Handler Spitz believes that Freud had too many vested interests in Leonardo as a subject to arrive at an unbiased and psychoanalytically pure result. Due to the many criticisms levelled at the Leonardo work one might think that these would render it unacceptable as a pathographic document, yet this is not the case. There are as many accolades for the work as there are criticisms, not least of which are praises for the texts inherent aesthetic qualities.

Freud was recognised as a writer of great eloquence and skill. As Handler Spitz points out, the Leonardo work is praised for its "beautiful simplicity and vigor".28 Moreover, the work's quality in helping to explain psychoanalytic concepts (perhaps Freud's main intention) gives the essay its inherent values and marks it as a fictive approach to


27 See particularly M. Schapiro, "Leonardo and Freud".

28 Shapiro, 303.
pathography. This is an account of an artist's life that is written by someone that is an expert in psychoanalysis but (even by his own account) not an expert in art. Handler Spitz connects Freud's *Leonardo* to the descriptive method of psychoanalytic technique. Often, the analyst is only guided by the fragments of the story presented at analysis by the analysand, necessitating interpretive construction by the analyst. This is another example of the *Leonardo* text corresponding to psychoanalytic technique in the *fictive* narrative style, therefore, helping to explain the essay's considered value and contribution by "distinguished psychoanalysts, art historians, and philosophers" (62).

A position such as this echoes, once again, the comparison of psychoanalytic interpretation to an art form. Handler Spitz points to a text by Donald Spence in which he argues:

> an interpretation can be seen as a kind of artistic product, and as such, it becomes possible to consider its effect on the patient as a kind of aesthetic experience. What might be called its *beauty* need have no necessary relation to its *truth* (64-65).

There are many accounts, written by psychoanalysts, comparing psychoanalysis to art. In conclusion, Handler Spitz summarises her position on the *Leonardo* text by writing:

> I have called Freud's approach "fictive" not in a derogatory sense, but to emphasise its special qualities as an imaginative piece of interpretive writing that serves to raise, if it does not fully answer, intimate and searching questions about Leonardo's real intentions, above all it offers us a design, a "seamless web of belief" (65).

Handler Spitz then looks at the *documentary* approach to pathography by considering Robert Liebert's *Michelangelo: A Psychoanalytic Study of the Man and His Images*. Firstly, she points out that as this is a much more recent pathography than Freud's, it encompasses not only new psychoanalytic concepts, but also emphasis from a contemporary art critical framework. Therefore, this account of Michelangelo stresses the "primacy of the work of art" rather than Freud's emphasis on the artist: "the

---

29 "I may say at once that I am no connoisseur in art, but simply a layman...I am unable rightly to appreciate many of the methods used and the effect obtained in art" (*S.E. vol.,* 13, 211).


31 For example, Liebert ties in aspects of object-relations theory and the response of the artist to audience and audience to artist. On 2 of the introduction to his book he writes, "if we entertain the proposition that an essential component of a beholder's aesthetic experience is the symbolic substitution of the image for some earlier repressed wish-fulfilling or need-gratifying person or experience of his own (Fairbairn, 1938; Segal, 1952; Waelder, 1965), it behoves us to consider the connection between the unconscious intention of the artist and the unconscious response of the beholder." (Leibert, 2).
artist's intentions, manifest and latent, become important only insofar as they illuminate particular works" (66). Liebert's account is referred to as documentary for a number of reasons, not least of which its thorough and scholarly approach, which compared to Freud's *Leonardo* is "meticulous". Liebert amasses a vast array of available data in a serious attempt to achieve psychic explanations that tally with those of other disciplines and interpretive methods. Obviously, Liebert's method, ambitious and thorough as it is, still raises questions about accuracy and ascertainable truths, but in this case the questions concerning validity are not just directed at pathography, but at the amassed data from other spheres of historical and aesthetic record, as it is presented to the pathographer. Whilst reviewing the Liebert approach to pathography, Handler Spitz furthers the position proposed for Freud's *Leonardo*, (that its possible psychic contamination was due to Freud's biased or counter-transference involvement with the subject of his essay), by saying that Liebert's account of Michelangelo, due to its "careful research", stands more chance of being objective and, therefore, less (psychologically) contaminated than Freud's. Liebert puts a central emphasis on tracing the complex iconographic history of Michelangelo's sources to arrive at statements about his psyche. It is this pursuit of historic and iconographic detail that enables Liebert to interpret "the unconscious factors in Michelangelo's aesthetic choices" (69). Handler Spitz clearly believes that Liebert's approach to pathography enables applied psychoanalysis to make a coherent contribution to a subject that has considerable cultural and art historical significance, by placing less emphasis on Michelangelo as "patient" and more on his artworks as signifiers and symbols of the unconscious. This approach has the effect of heightening our aesthetic sensitivity rather than only explaining psychoanalytic concepts.

On balance however, it appears that Handler Spitz believes either account of Leonardo or Michelangelo has a lot to offer. One in the fictive (aesthetic, intuitive, interpretive) mode, the other in the documentary (objective and scholarly mode). The final decision on preference depends on what the individual reader is seeking, it is this position that reveals its own truths. What can not be ignored are Liebert's views on transference when considering art. When talking of Michelangelo, like Handler Spitz when talking of art generally, he clearly puts great emphasis on the role of transference:

---

32 Liebert acknowledges this when he writes: "In trying to interpret Michelangelo's behaviour and his art in situations where the supporting evidence is meagre, I have often taken risks. That is, I have offered what seemed to me to be the most likely explanations under the circumstances - yet they may fade in the light of new facts or explanations that are more economical and consistent with other information about Michelangelo. It is my hope that the reader will consider these theories in a spirit of curiosity, venturing into halls that are dimly lit but nevertheless rewarding to enter" (Liebert, 10).
Any biographer whose subject is long dead faces a fundamental problem. With what degree of confidence can he apply the psychoanalytic method, which is so reliant on a continuous, dynamic interaction between patient and analyst? In the clinical psychoanalytic situation, by contrast with biography, understanding of the patient's psychological functioning and behavior is achieved through explorations of his free associations, dreams, fantasies, and outward behavior, along with the nature of the effect that accompanies them. A crucial element in the process is the transference of repressed thoughts and feelings that originated with formative figures of the past onto the relatively neutral and anonymous person of the analyst - albeit in forms modified by intervening experiences and the present context. The understanding and resolution of this transference are central to the psychoanalytic process. Largely through the analyst's interpretations of the material presented, the patient's unconscious conflicts, forgotten experiences from the past, and emotions isolated from their basis in thought are brought into awareness. The outcome of this lengthy undertaking, if it is successful, is that the patient can understand the determinants of his character structure, self representation, and troublesome behavior in a way that frees him from the necessity of re-enacting unresolved conflicts from the past in a maladaptive way in the present.

In studying Michelangelo however, we are most engaged with a highly adaptive means of resolving conflict - his art. (Liebert 3, emphases added).

The final pathographical approach reviewed by Handler Spitz is the thematic illustrated by Martha Wolfenstein's manuscript on Rene Magritte. Wolfenstein works in clinical, theoretical and applied psychoanalysis focussed on one major theme, that of parental death and the effects on the child. It is this theme that Wolfenstein applies to Rene Magritte's life and work. Loss of the parents in childhood, as Handler Spitz points out, is a central theme to psychoanalysis. For example, Freud's and Liebert's choices for pathography were Leonardo Da Vinci and Michelangelo. Both of these artists suffered loss of their mothers in childhood - one by death, the other by separation. However, to explain the differences in Wolfenstein's approach to that of Freud's or Liebert's Handler Spitz indicates:

Unlike the fictive and documentary approaches, the thematic model sets somewhat more circumscribed goals. Wolfenstein, having chosen her subject in part because he suffered the loss of a parent in childhood, aims to trace this theme and does not presume to explain or account for all aspects of the artist's work. Nor does she extend her findings to artistic creativity in general (77).

From Wolfenstein's viewpoint any loss or prolonged separation from the parent(s) during childhood can threaten developmental and psychic stability. In some individuals
psychic instability can introduce a "dualism" in the ego where alternates can co-exist in
the psychic present and concepts such as "present and absent," "living and dead," "near
and far" can lead to continual psychic "counterpoint and ambiguity". It is these qualities
of duality and ambiguity that Wolfenstein points to in Magritte's work and life. With
regard to Magritte's domestic situation Wolfenstein gives some prominence to the
artist's relationship to his mother and his wife, and indicates the duality of "role"
between them. Concerning the build up of "loss" and instability, Wolfenstein points
out Magritte's potential sibling rivalry and continual disrupted home life. As a child he
moved house several times before his mother's death by suicide when he was thirteen
years old. These factors Wolfenstein says account for his later ambiguous surrealist art
and conservative life style.

The above brief account of factors that influenced Wolfenstein's interpretation do not
attempt to explain her interpretations and are merely given as indications of the many
thematic factors which have influenced her account. Wolfenstein's interpretive work
connects Magritte's imagery with childhood trauma and Handler Spitz reminds the
reader of the psychoanalytic view that, "for an artist, externalization [eg., the painting]
does not signify working through, that the same intrapsychic themes persist and are
continuously reworked throughout the artist's career" (82). Like Liebert's study of
Michelangelo, Wolfenstein's pathography is also thorough and painstaking. She traces
the prolific output of Magritte's painting to what she believes are their psychic source.
For example:

She interprets in this context a painting called The Rape (1945), a work whose title is
surely no accident, expressing as it does the aggressive sexuality that can attend the act
of image-making. In the painting the torso of a naked woman is presented as if it were
a head (the breasts her eyes; the navel, her nose; the vulva, her mouth). Wolfenstein
views this as a "pretended mistake," an "overscrupulous covering up," a "grimly
humorous alibi" (447). Instead of seeing his mother's face, which was covered by her
nightgown, the young Magritte saw her body, which he should not have seen; hence he
created an image in which he seems to protest that face and body are conflated, that what
was body looked like face, thereby denying his guilt" (83-4).33

33 This passage relates to Magritte finding his drowned mother's corpse after her suicide.
Handler Spitz regards Magritte's images as concerned with the psychoanalytic "defensive mechanisms of projection and displacement" (86), concepts clearly linked with transference phenomena. As is apparent, Magritte's paintings are ripe with ambiguous and disguised meanings and Wolfenstein fully explores his life and work to uncover the cloaked meanings of his imagery, relating them to Magritte's personal intrapsychic experiences. Handler Spitz points out that Wolfenstein's method of pathography, like that of Liebert's and Freud's is also possibly affected by counter-transference due to her undoubted personal involvement with the subject. However, because Wolfenstein applies her own area of psychoanalytic expertise (childhood parental death and mourning) towards Magritte, Handler Spitz feels that her counter-transference is probably "more in check." A negative aspect of Wolfenstein's thematic approach is that it may be too narrow in concentrating on one major aspect of the subject's psyche and not exploring sufficiently external factors that may well have impinged on his art.

In summary then, from the account I have given of Handler Spitz's description of the three styles of pathography: fictive, documentary, thematic, it is clear that pathography has the potential to be used interpretatively. By analysing the external data available, (i.e., the artist's work, the events of his/her life, the environmental and historic milieu), in absence of a clinical psychoanalysis, a construct of the artist's psyche is built. On the one hand, the major problems with the pathographic method are incomplete or inaccurate external data and the contamination of counter-transference. On the other, however, even though some pathographies may suffer from these problems pathography does allow the development of narrative and insight that could not be achieved in any other way. Additionally, it is clear that pathography provides an interpretive method using a transferential framework. This, I argue, correlates with the position that transferences are contained in fine artworks.

Psychoanalysis maintains that the unconscious intention of the artist is externalised in the artist's work. Therefore, this phenomenon can be considered analogous to aspects of the psychoanalytic encounter between analyst and analysand. Furthermore, pathography is pursued in the manner of an analysis, revealing the externalised material:

In the absence of that shared therapeutic context peculiar to clinical psychoanalysis the pathographer must substitute sound scholarship and self-scrutiny in the hope of creating between himself and his subject a semblance of the privileged space that comes into being between analyst and analysand, and in which the dramas of transference neurosis and counter-transference are enacted ... the interpretations that result reflect how context is conceived and constructed, just as in the clinical analysis the force and reverberation
Pathography, as applied psychoanalysis, utilises interpretive method. It is this thread of insight that the "author/reader"- "analyst/analysand" - "artist/viewer" must gain from their respective experiences if the activity they are involved in is to have meaning. This insight heightens our aesthetic awareness. In the three approaches to pathography reviewed loss or trauma in early childhood were seen as significant factors. Handler Spitz suggests that events such as these might well be as important in an artist's life as they would be in the life of a person with a neurotic disturbance. However, she adds that in the case of the artist, there is an adaptive means, through the artwork, of coping with the repressed memory of loss. Pathography contributes in our effort "to discover the distinct and personal meanings to the artist of his imagery and in exploring the genesis and quality of effect evoked by this imagery" (96).

In concluding this review of Handler Spitz's account of pathography I will two questions:

1. If pathography is analogous to clinical psychoanalysis and transference phenomena are contained in both activities, as Handler Spitz clearly points out, from where, in the case of pathography (when the artist is "in-absentia"), does the transference phenomena emanate?

2. If psychoanalysis is analogous to art and transference is an essential component of psychoanalytic interpretation and method, what does this imply for art?

The next model of psychoanalytic interpretation of the arts that Handler Spitz describes is associated with New Criticism. Here she is referring to interpretation and criticism that is not concerned with the psyche of the artist (as Romantic criticism and pathography are) but with the artwork as autonomous object. In this model:

Art objects are viewed as having the capacity to take on aesthetic qualities beyond anything that could have been consciously or unconsciously intended by the artists.

The aim of critics who view art in this way is:

[to] free the work of art from its attachment to the artist, but not in doing so to reattach it to its audience. From their point of view, works of art are seen as independent and autonomous, constituted by their own materials or language, structures, and internal relations - severed as fully from the expressive needs of their makers as from the
responsive activities of their beholders. The context for interpretation shrinks in this
model to the boundaries of the individual work of art (99).

Rather than insight or "reading-in", what characterises this critical position is its
attention to a "close-reading" of what is visible and available in the art object. Parallel
with this approach to criticism, which made its appearance in the 1930s and 40s, was
an art that was already concerned with "form" rather than "content" and appearance
rather than narrative. Where in all this is there a place for psychoanalysis Handler Spitz
asks? How can theories of individual psychic apparatus function when critical
discussion of the individual's intentions are not considered relevant?

Handler Spitz attempts to answer these questions by suggesting that once the art is
established as autonomous and we are not concerned with the artist's psyche, then the
art is liberated to speak to us of universal problems. Therefore, the art object itself is
viewed for what it can reveal from its surface about common unconscious patterns.
Needless to say, there is an enigmatic quality about attempting to use constructs that
emanate from intra-psychic theories concerning individual humanity with reference to
autonomous inanimate objects without referring to those individual psyches. Not
surprisingly, problems abound with this approach. For example, how does one equate
psychoanalytic structures with those internal structures of the art object, that are its
visible aesthetic qualities, without making reference to artist or audience? Maintaining
the argument that art objects have an unconscious structure of their own, autonomous
of artist and audience, is a difficult position to adopt because the question obviously
arises from where this unconscious structure emanates and how to define it? There are
no simple answers.

To illustrate this model of psychoanalytic criticism Handler Spitz reviews the work of
Elizabeth Dalton entitled, Unconscious Structure in "The Idiot": A Study in Literature
and Psychoanalysis.34 She concludes that Dalton's work raises more questions than it
answers. By attempting to divorce artist and audience from art object, Dalton
contradicts her position on several counts, Handler Spitz reports, not least of which is
in the realms of transference phenomena. Again, in this description of what I will call
for brevity "the autonomous text model", Handler Spitz reminds us of the centrality of
transference to psychoanalysis and art:

It is the recognition and use of transference that, in my view, distinguishes
psychoanalysis from all other interpretive theories, and it is precisely the absence of this

crucial dimension that impoverishes most theorizing about psychoanalysis and art, including the theory of autonomous texts (106).35

Due to the ambiguities and inconsistencies of arguments such as Dalton's, Handler Spitz maintains that rather than convincing us that artworks have their own autonomous unconscious structures, the arguments concerning autonomous texts tend to highlight the unavoidable inclusion of transference phenomena operating between artist and art object, and critic and audience:

... if we agree that one major contribution of psychoanalysis of the arts is its illumination of emotional factors ... then central to such understanding must be the circuitous displacements [sic] of feelings and attachments from one object to another and from past to present - the transference reactions - which occur not just between an author and his work during the process of creation, but in critics during their private reading, before, during, and after the writing of public critiques, and in the subsequent readings of critiques by others. Sensitivity to the riling effects of these transferences, though they lead beyond the boundaries of strictly internal textual reference, provides that richness of context and authenticity necessary.... The finest examples of psychoanalytic interpretation among the models I present resonate with such transferences, though often these transferences remain uninterpreted, overlooked, or disavowed (107).

It is clear from psychoanalytic theory that transferences could, or would, be overlooked or disavowed, due to defence mechanisms of the ego sublimating our awareness of transference. However, to overlook the potential of transference phenomena is to relinquish some of the most powerful and personal insights art can offer. The contradiction of the autonomous text model is basically that its protagonists espouse the unconscious autonomy of the art object, yet inevitably find it necessary, in one form or another, to revert to details concerning the creator of the object. Once this breach is made, Handler Spitz maintains, then the argument for the autonomous nature of the art object is violated and watered down. The strength of psychoanalytic interpretation when applied to art, (or to an analysand), is that the interpretation is as individual as the art. Thus, psychoanalysis provides us with a method of interpretation rather than

35 To further her claims for the centrality of transference to psychoanalysis Handler Spitz quotes Freud (adding her own emphases): "[Transference] Happens, however, to be the hardest part of the whole task. It is easy to learn how to interpret dreams, to extract from the patient's associations his unconscious thoughts and memories, and to practice similar explanatory arts: for these the patient will always provide the text. Transference is the one thing the presence of which has to be detected almost without assistance and with only the slightest clues to go upon, while at the same time the risk of making arbitrary inferences has to be avoided. Nevertheless, transference cannot be evaded, since use is made of it in setting up all the obstacles that make the material inaccessible to treatment, and since it is only after the transference has been resolved that a patient arrives at a sense of conviction of the validity of the connections which have been constructed during the analysis. " (S.E. vol. 7, 16-117, emphases added) - [Handler Spitz 106]
prescribing a rigid objective theory. It presents us with structures that can be applied. However, the individual in communion with the art will inevitably eke out insights specific to the individual artist or viewer, time or place. Psychoanalysis in the clinical setting is a means to an end, providing interpretation of the individual's psyche. When applied to art the intention is to interpret the art from a psychic perspective thus maintaining a dynamic between artist and art object / art object and viewer. As Handler Spitz reminds us: "psychoanalysis is not a unified system but a conglomerate of theories, not all of which can be happily reconciled, it is unclear how one goes about choosing which aspects will best suit the problem at hand" (132). For this reason the psychoanalysis of art objects as autonomous may have something to offer, perhaps in the way it can isolate individual art works for interpretation. Because of the attempt to disregard artist and viewer, it may highlight more thematic, impersonal and universal tendencies. Freud's later writing concerned group and "mass" psychology, so perhaps here there is room for a dialogue between the psychoanalysis of autonomous art objects and its applications in the realms of "mass" or group psychology. However, Handler Spitz remains unconvinced concerning the psychoanalysis of autonomous texts. Psychoanalysis, she argues, is a psychology of the individual. As we have seen, Handler Spitz contends it is the intricacies of the individual's life and history that influence the artwork produced. Therefore, returning to the individual human unconscious is inevitable. Following Handler Spitz one can postulate that as long as there is human life there will be the unconscious. Thus, there will be endless interpretation. The patterns will be varied and the solutions provided will be personal. However, without the attempt at structure, insight and understanding would be narrow and limited.

The third and final model that Handler Spitz looks at when considering the application of psychoanalysis to art is that of the spectator's relationship to the art work. In this model the work of art is "seen as conjointly constructed by and with its audience in an affective as well as cognitive dialectic that has many features in common with psychoanalytic process" (165). To ask what constitutes the aesthetic experience in this realm Handler Spitz looks at two approaches to the subject. Firstly, the theoretical framework provided by object-relations theory and secondly, the clinical psychoanalytic situation where 'such notions as transference, empathy, and "the working model" are significant factors (136). The dynamic relationship that is set up between artist and audience, vis-a-vis the artwork, and that is crucial to its appreciation is here examined.

Object-relations theory is a branch of psychoanalysis concerned with two main aspects of investigation: "(1) the infant's earliest ties to its first object, the mother, as well as preverbal and preoedipal development generally, and (2) the interactions between the
endopsychic self and the external world" (138). Earlier in this thesis I reviewed Handler Spitz's essay, "The Past of Illusion: A Contribution of Child Psychoanalysis to the Understanding of Aesthetic Experience" in which object-relations was discussed. It is held by object-relations theory that the first period of a baby's life, when it is completely reliant on its mother, puts into train a paradox in which the baby believes it has "magical" omnipotent control over its environment. This is partly due to the adaptation of the mother to the baby's needs. The 'symbiosis" or fusion with the mother is experienced as extremely pleasurable and it is this experience which is described by object-relations theory as the nucleus for "aesthetic pleasure, aesthetic emotion, the privileged moment, or the sense of beauty" (141).

Great emphasis is put upon the child's reliance on the mother and the mother's breast. It is the child's relationship to the mother's breast that affords the child its first sense of illusion and its first acts of creativity. As the child's consciousness develops, it believes it can create the breast as part of itself. It is only later and in a state of relative security that the child is "weaned" off this notion and accepts the breast as separate and external. Object-relations theory maintains that these are the rudimentary steps of omnipotence, illusion, creation and fantasy through which the majority of humans pass in one form or another, and that to a lesser or greater degree these facets are retained in the unconscious of every individual. However, it is suggested that in the case of artists "and those who are most responsive to the arts" these facets maintain a high profile in the psyche. Later, the child experiences disillusion as the growing consciousness recognises the mother as external and separate. This experience, which is crucial for the child's adaptation to external reality, introduces the child to a sense of loss. Furthermore, the "oneness" with the mother that is lost is retained as a feeling of "loss" throughout the individual's life. This introduces what Margaret S. Mahler referred to as a "lifelong mourning process".36

Additionally, D.W. Winnicott proposed that to reduce or sublimate a sense of loss the child introduces, or is introduced to, the transitional object. This object is an object in external reality, such as a prototypic toy, (rag, rug, teddy-bear, etc.) to which the child attaches the attributes of "oneness" in an attempt to offset loss. During the early stages of this process it is held that the child is not (fully) aware of the separateness of the transitional object. It is the transitional object which Winnicott maintains is the primer that allows individuals to "invest in cultural objects of all kinds, to forge creative links between his inner and outer worlds. Later in childhood, imaginative play will form a

bridge between the transitional object and adult involvement in cultural, specifically aesthetic experience" (145-6). It is important to note, however, that the transitional object is a mental construct as well as a physical reality and it is this interplay between subjective and objective means that creates what Winnicott referred to as "the potential space". Comparing aesthetic object to transitional object, Handler Spitz posits:

The transitional object (again, like the aesthetic object) preserves that which must be lost. It is the embodiment of illusion, a covenant between fantasy and reality, an external testament to inner experience. (146)

In this connection, Handler Spitz refers to the work of Marion Milner, a psychoanalyst and artist, who recorded her development of object-relations theory and art in her book *On Not Being Able to Paint* (1957). Milner, besides writing of the positive aspects of her research, warns of the experiential and aesthetic dangers that can beset the individual in consciously attempting to connect with the earliest resonances of transitional phenomena. Milner points out that an attempt at regression, however well understood, may become very upsetting or even frightening. This is because in the individual's (child's/artist's) psyche, the opposite of omnipotence is helplessness, abandonment and threat. Handler Spitz points out the many references linking art and artists to madness from Plato onwards and makes a direct association to regression in the analytic situation "to risk the transference of any analysis takes courage as well, because what is at stake is the experience of loss of self, the seductive pulls toward regressive modes of experience" (149). Of course, the majority of individuals (artists and analysands) that might be exposed to these regressive tendencies will not be affected by the frightening aspect of regression if their early childhood was sufficiently stable and their early environment prepares them for a life of creative development. Conversely, the transitional phenomena which allows an avenue to creation in psychic development, if absent or lacking, could force an individual to be creative, in an attempt at reparation for earlier loss.

Essentially, Handler Spitz is sympathetic to the object-relations view. However, she feels that the developmental links between transitional object, childhood toys and imaginative experience, and then later artistic and creative experience, were never pursued to the degree they should have been if Winnicott's ideas are to have total credibility (see *Art and Psyche* 153). Additionally, Handler Spitz points out that there are opposing dynamic scenarios in psychoanalytic research that point towards ongoing

---

37 When discussing the demise of Mark Rothko, Peter Fuller suggests that Rothko regressed to an "Oceanic" condition not dissimilar to that referred to by Milner. Fuller argues that this is reflected in Rothko's paintings and their development until his unhappy death (Fuller, *Art and Psychoanalysis*).
unresolved childhood conflict as a driving force behind and within creative activity, therefore, bringing into question some aspects of the object-relations approach (eg. *Art and Psyche* 150).

Following on from object-relations theory Handler Spitz discusses the similarities and analogies that can be drawn between the clinical psychoanalytic relationship of analyst to analysand and those relationships of, artist to audience; audience to art; and critic to audience. Here, communication and understanding are key principles. Handler Spitz makes a comparison between the role of the analyst and that of the critic, "Common to both analyst and critic is the need to convey understanding in such a way that it can be assimilated and used by another person" (160). In this regard she makes reference to W. Empson and R. Greenson. They point out the analogous subtleties of competent psychoanalysis and art criticism. First, there is common ground on the dangers of "over interpretation", which both in the case of psychoanalysis and art criticism can have the effect of building resistances to the analyst or critic and their interpretation of the subject if it is threatening, overbearing or dogmatic, rather than explained empathically. Secondly, empathy itself is seen as problematic. It is necessary, but its use must be understood, there must be both emotional and intellectual empathy and they must be in the right proportions. If this is not achieved the results of the analysis or the critical text can be misunderstood and misinterpreted. Empson maintains that similar to the analyst, the critic is not to be seen as a teacher. The critic must not directly inform the reader (analysand) of what is there in the art (psyche) to be found. The reader (analysand) may be directed towards the interpretation, but cognitively must find it for themselves if it is to have meaning (*Art and Psyche* 161). Handler Spitz indicates the similarity of this procedure to transference neurosis in the analytic situation, where the analysand re-lives the original neurosis artificially under the direction of the analyst. In ideal circumstances, the analysand is unaware of the role the analyst plays in the direction of the transference neurosis. Handler Spitz then goes on to consider transference phenomena generally and the analogy between psychoanalyst/analysand and artist/audience. She asks, "How does transference work with respect to aesthetic experience?" and concludes,

---

whereas transference is usually considered (when it is encountered outside the analyst's office) to be maladaptive and unrealistic, it may be well to think of it in quite the reverse terms when it appears in the realm of the aesthetic, where associations are permitted to range widely, primitive pleasures to be experienced, and memories awakened. (164)

Referring to Greenson, Handler Spitz explains:

Greenson emphasises the frame of "reality" that encloses the analytic relationship and permits the "full flowering and ultimate resolution of the patient's transference reactions" (27). This frame may be likened to the formal qualities, the conventions and traditions, of art, which serve as a container for more amorphous and elusive content" (164).39

However, Handler Spitz points out that this frame is not exclusive to a conventional analysis or to a particular format of aesthetic presentation where there are given norms and expectations. Transference, she indicates, may proliferate in many forms. Consequently, the usual and accepted means of its evocation (the analytic situation or traditional art object such as a painting) can omit as much as is revealed. Thus, unconventional means of rendering transference possible both in the analytic sphere and in the aesthetic are to be experimented with, "If transference is defined as ubiquitous, indiscriminate repetition, can one not count on it to occur without special priming by the frame?" (164). This experimentation may include some dangers or risk taking for the artist and audience, or the analyst and analysand, but without it the transference may not occur.40

To conclude her description of the three interpretive models applied to art in Art and Psyche Handler Spitz indicates that what emerges from each is that they do have a contribution to make to our understanding of art. However, it is important to carefully select one of the three models for "the problem at hand". Art and Psyche was published in 1985 and Handler Spitz points out that the early and mid-1980s generated a new relevance for psychoanalysis and the arts, with the publication of papers and books by leading psychoanalysts and art theorists concerning the inter-disciplinary connections

39 In chapter three of this thesis, Joy Schaverien's text, The Revealing Image develops the analogy of "framing" within the psychoanalytic and art contexts 144-150.

40 In the context of using unconventional means of evoking transference in the analytic and art situations refer to,

(i) Hilda Doolittle's account of Freud utilising an art object to elicit a transference, 31-32 this thesis.
(ii) Mike Parr's extreme performance art, 255 this thesis.
between the two.\(^{41}\) I have already referred to the clear connections made by psychoanalysts comparing aspects of psychoanalytic theory and practice to the processes and aesthetics of art. Handler Spitz indicates that in recent years this has got to a point where psychoanalysts are now crossing the boundaries of dialogue. They are looking at inter-disciplinary problems from an arts perspective, "borrowing their terms and notions from aesthetics" (167), to give new insights into their own discipline. Obviously, I agree that this is a constructive and useful approach to the dialogue of art and psychoanalysis. Moreover, following Handler Spitz, I contend that if it is valid for psychoanalysts to use art and aesthetics to explain aspects of their theory and practice then it is also valid for artists to use aspects of psychoanalysis, such as transference, to explain aspects of their theory and practice. Handler Spitz has put forward in an illuminating book three models for interpreting the arts that by her own admission are "flexible" but not all inclusive. However, it is important to note a key sentence in the opening pages of her book that is so relevant to this thesis: "Issues of transference and empathy, implicit in all three models, move into the foreground and assume apropriately central roles" (xi emphases added). She points out that the questions raised by the interminable problems concerning the arts and the psyche are vast. Inevitably, our attempts to answer them by separate categories of intellectual construct are bound to be inconclusive. The questions and problems are larger than the individual categories and more complex than any individual solution. This is why the questions and problems are so absorbing and never ending. They concern the meaning and reasoning of existence. Therefore, a cross-disciplinary approach is relevant.

Following \textit{Art and Psyche}, in 1991 Handler Spitz published her second book, \textit{Image and Insight}. This book is a collection of her essays on psychoanalysis and the arts. All of the essays were written in the 1980s. However, in this collection they have been modified where necessary. \textit{Art and Psyche} was specific in its aim of presenting the major models of psychoanalytic interpretation applied to the arts but this book is varied in its approach to subject matter. In this sense, it is not as cohesive as \textit{Art and Psyche} but, nevertheless, extends and develops an understanding of the relationship of psychoanalysis to art. The subjects dealt with in \textit{Image and Insight} are far ranging, from painting and theatre, to literature, graffiti art and film. Consequently, I will be

\(^{41}\) (i) Fuller, \textit{Art and Psychoanalysis}
(v) Hans W. Loewald, \textit{Papers}.
selective in my survey, focussing on aspects of the essays that further the subject of this thesis.

The first essay "Looking and Longing" concerns the psychoanalytic interest in pleasure and desire, discussing as it does, the spectator's relationship to the art object. It discusses the pleasure of looking at the art object and the desire this creates. Pervasive in this essay is Handler Spitz's interest in the connection of object-relations theory and transference phenomena to art. Essentially, she argues, the spectator forms a psychic relationship with the painted image (e.g., 16-17). The image is a 'signifier' of loss and desire, that connects back to our earliest experiences in childhood. In the spectator's relationship with the image, the image can go some way to fulfilling or sublimating a desire, therefore, producing pleasure. This Handler Spitz suggests constitutes the unconscious aspect of aesthetic pleasure:

Psychoanalysis is equally concerned with tracing the signifier back to the body and back to the earliest human relationships in which one's own body and that of the other are not differentiated. Longing looks evoked by works of art are, in part, a response to the ambiguous lure of painted images that promote fantasies of narcissistic completion but terrify by their lure to places where the law no longer holds sway (26).

In another essay, "The Artistic Image and the Inward Gaze," Handler Spitz furthers a view already expressed in Art and Psyche that art can inform psychoanalysis as much as psychoanalysis can inform art. Not only does this consolidate the case for interdisciplinary research it also illuminates the long history of psychoanalysis using art and art's concepts to explain and expand its theory.

I have already reviewed some essays in Sigmund Freud and Art in which the various contributors confirm Freud's undoubted influences to theory from art. Indeed, one of the essays in that book was written by Handler Spitz. In this present essay, she contends, "Works of art may come to serve, as they more than occasionally did for Freud, as primary sources of understanding about the human psyche" (90-91). Even though this essay looks predominantly at Italian trecento and quattrocento art, Handler Spitz maintains that it serves to illustrate the "paradigm" of relatedness between art and psychoanalysis. In an analogy to transference and counter-transference, Handler Spitz contends that paintings can speak to us across the centuries like analysands, if we allow them to transfer their unconscious secrets and we in turn allow our counter-transferences to flow from within ourselves:
Perhaps we must allow them, by means of their rich resources of imagery, to teach us; treat them as primary sources of knowledge about the human psyche; give them the opportunity to blend their perspectives with ours and thus enrich our storehouse of interpretive possibilities. (101)

Consequently, much as counter-transference was once frowned on in the clinical psychoanalytic situation but is now generally accepted, counter-transference Handler Spitz maintains, should be accepted as constructive to applied psychoanalysis. It is clear in this essay that Handler Spitz affords imagery great psychic power. Not only does she speak of paintings as 'symbols' and 'signifiers' of unconscious resonance but they are spoken of as having a life force and energy of their own. Handler Spitz is aware of the power she gives to images. She argues, "Against prevailing intellectual fashion" that it is the artistic image and not the written or spoken word that is primary to conscious and unconscious understanding. She points out the "competitiveness" (obvious today) between image and text, where text is used both to exalt and to "control" the power of the artistic image. The power of the word wins control because of its associations with intellect, logic and law, and because even though the word idolises the image it also fears its power and, therefore, exerts control. Here, the analogy to ego and id is compelling:

For the image without the word, without the label, without the security of a narrative context, collapses all distance between signifiers and signified: Image becomes reality - a phenomenon both too radically other and too horrifyingly same. To keep, therefore, images (and the arts) in place, to arrest them, volumes of history and criticism and papers such as this one are written - all to preserve our unsteady mastery over their troublesome ability to fix and transfix our gaze.42

"Conflict and Creativity: Reflections on Otto Rank's Psychology of Art" is an essay towards the end of Image and Insight that offers some interesting concepts concerning art and psychoanalytic theory. Otto Rank was a pioneer in theoretical development, being one of the first psychoanalysts to point out the importance of art and artist to psychic understanding. Handler Spitz informs us that there is evidence to support the notion, that like Freud, (and us all to some extent), Rank's personal history from childhood influenced the development of his own theoretical base (235-236). His theories denounced the father in favour of the mother, gave primary importance to the act of birth, both for mother and child, and gave prominence to the place of the artist in

the hierarchy of psychic balance. All of these propositions went against Freudian theory of the time.

Rank apparently disowned his own father due to his father's alcoholism and early childhood conflict. It is proposed that this is one of Rank's reasons for associating so strongly with Freud and seeing him as his "second father":

Favourably impressed, Freud rapidly became Rank's patron and mentor: thus, in him, Rank acquired a new and idealizable father. Gradually mentorship evolved into collegial companionship, and Freud accorded Rank a place of honor in the coveted inner circle of Viennese psychoanalysis (237).

Following this, Rank published his major work *The Trauma of Birth* which went against Freudian theory and resulted in the rift between Rank and Freud. In *The Trauma of Birth*, Handler Spitz indicates, "it became clear that the nurturing, protective, powerful birth mother - relatively neglected by Freud - had moved to center stage in Rank's thinking" (238). Rank also gave primacy to the role of the artist in his description of "basic personality types." Here, a comparison can be drawn between his placement of the mother and the act of birth as central to the psychic development of the individual and the artist's drive to create works of art. When discussing art there are many references to it as a "creation" of the artist and Rank had great empathy with the artist's ability to give birth to works of art. For him the artist achieves an "advanced status" in personality due to the artist's ability to externalise and synthesise "inner and outer worlds" (238). These early writings by Rank, Handler Spitz informs us, tie in well with later developments by object-relations theorists and others concerning the psychic connections between artist, child, mother and birth (238-239).

Rank's interest in the parent's views of the child not only coincides biographically with his marriage and subsequent fatherhood, it also relates to his interest in the artist's views of the artwork (237-238). His text, *Art and Artist*, stresses not only the relationship of the artist to his own work, but also the artist's relationship to other art, both contemporary and historic. Here again, the analogy to parenthood and birth is apparent. The artist strives to create new art but is constrained by convention. However, through the artist's striving, new forms do evolve and emerge. There is a struggle not only with one's own attempts at artistic creation and birth, but also with the

43 Otto Rank, *The Trauma of Birth* (New York: Harcourt, Bruce 1929)

creations of others. Thus, an intrapsychic struggle emerges in which the artist becomes deeply involved both consciously and unconsciously with his own work and the work of others. Rank indicates that the struggle can become obsessive for artists, to a point where they "regard their work as more important than all the rest of life" (242). Rank maintained, Handler Spitz implies, that for the artist the act of creation is perhaps the most intense experience he or she can have. Unavoidably, therefore, the drive to create will come into conflict with other aspects of the artist's life. These psychic conflicts for the artist can be deep and disturbing and can emerge as serious psychic or physical problems for the artist, resulting in illness. In this regard, Handler Spitz refers the reader to work carried out by the French psychoanalyst Joyce McDougall and her work with "artist-patients". Handler Spitz also reminds us of the many accounts both fictional and non-fictional of breakdown and illness amongst creative minds. Rank believed that the relationship of artist to art could become so all consuming that the only way the artist could deal with the anxiety caused was to deny his or her art, or to get away from it. For Rank this explained why artists often have significant problems starting or finishing artistic projects. Rank goes further and connects the intense anxiety concerning beginnings and endings of art projects with the underlying and deep anxieties concerning life and death. Artworks, seen as creations, are life and death objects (issues). Not only may they have a life and death of their own but they also connote the creator's mortality. The artist's persistent and uncontrollable need to create (to externalise) can induce a fear that the unstoppable drive to create will exhaust their life source. Handler Spitz indicates, "Rank's larger theory of procreation conflict dovetails with his theory of artistic creation. With undeniable intensity, life invades art: biography interpolates theory" (245-6). For Rank there was a clear connection between the act of childbirth and that of giving birth to a work of art. Rank indicated that this might give some insight into the often recorded unstable relationships male artists enter into with women (246). He suggested that confusion or conflict can arise in the male artist's psyche when there is a merging of bisexual phantasies concerning his art as creation and his women as creators. This can result in several differing presentations of relationships, but often there is confusion and conflict as the artist strives to resolve his role as creator:

45 Stephen Spender describes how Frank Auerbach paints with open books showing plates of paintings by 'the masters' as if he is duelling with them: Stephen Spender, Frank Auerbach: Recent Paintings and Drawings (London: Marlborough Fine Art 1982).

46 Again, Peter Fuller's account of the last years of Mark Rothko's life in Art and Psychoanalysis comes to mind.

Thus, the male artist's fight with art is fought on many fronts. He struggles against the traditions out of which his art is made, contends against the dynamism of the work itself, and, finally, strives against its completion - lest he undergo an analogue of postpartum depression, terror, and loss - loss, that is, of himself. (246)

Even though she does not mention it, it is no doubt implicit in Handler Spitz's treatment of Rank's theories that what is applicable to the male artist would also have its relevance for the female artist. This after all concurs with a fundamental tenet of psychoanalysis concerning bisexuality of both male and female individuals. In this case, it is interesting to consider the concept that some women artists may choose not to give birth to children in favour of giving birth to art.

Discussion of the above essay in Image and Insight concludes my review of the contemporary work of Ellen Handler Spitz. Necessarily, this review has been prolonged as I believe Handler Spitz's contribution to the current dialogue concerning art and psychoanalysis is significant and compelling. Her thoughts are made all the more relevant to this thesis by the primacy she so clearly gives to the role of transference phenomena in the making and viewing of art.

(iv)

Other Contemporary Writing

Similar to Handler Spitz, Hans W. Loewald, also puts stress on the connections between art and psychoanalysis and the comparison of transference neurosis to the artistic and aesthetic process. From his book, Papers on Psychoanalysis , I will refer to an essay entitled, "Psychoanalysis as an Art and the Fantasy Character of the Psychoanalytic Situation" (Loewald 352-371). In it Loewald considers aspects of psychoanalytic process as it compares to artistic process. For example, he compares aspects of dramatic art (theatre) to aspects of the events in a clinical analysis. Central to the comparison is transference neurosis. According to Loewald:

... the psychoanalytic situation and process involves a re-enactment, a dramatization of aspects of the patient's psychic life history, created and staged in conjunction with, and directed by, the analyst. The idea of the transference neurosis expresses this understanding of psychoanalysis as an emotionally experienced recapitulation of the patient's inner life history in crucial aspects of its unfolding. Seen in this light, psychoanalysis shares important features with dramatic art (353).
Pointing out that transference neurosis "is uniquely a creature of the psychoanalytic process" Loewald states that it can be seen as a "dramatic play" conceived and performed between analysand and analyst. Initially, the analysand may be unaware of the emerging transference neurosis (dramatic play), but as he or she recognises its symptoms, (which often includes the recapitulation of childhood conflict or trauma), the analysand collaborates with the analyst in acting out the play (transference neurosis). The analyst and analysand create a "fantasy" or an "illusion" and Loewald points out that the word "illusion derives from the Latin ludere, to play" (354). In clinical analysis the transference neurosis is both fantasy and an actual event and this Loewald maintains corresponds well with the intentions of theatre. After all, audiences go to the theatre as analysands go to the analysts. It is an event, and for the serious theatre goer, as for the analysand, their lives continue on around such events, though there is always the potential that their lives can be irrevocably changed due to a "performance" affecting them in a deeply significant way.

Loewald argues that the material brought forth in a transference neurosis can be a "re-enactment" of suppressed memories from the earliest stages of a child's life right through to adolescence, depending on the nature and circumstances of the memory or neurosis. Often an original core memory of conflict, perhaps occurring in early childhood, will be unconsciously repeated in the individual's development in a different situation but with the resonance of the original conflict (358-360). So for instance, a conflict or trauma occurring whilst a baby, could be unconsciously repeated again when the individual is 5 or 6 years old and then again in different circumstances when an adolescent. This has the effect of layering memories, which in the clinical analytic situation, when transference neurosis occurs, emerge as a new edition or conglomerate fantasy of the accumulated memories. Seen in connection to art there is the obvious comparison of the re-telling of deep and significant myths in the guise of the new story or the new image. Or yet again, the repeat performance of a play in a new and unique time and place. Again, the analogy to visual art and transference emerges. An image, such as a painting is affected by paintings that have come before it. Conversely, paintings in history are reinterpreted by the emerging new painting.

Loewald maintains that from a psychoanalytic perspective, for the mentally healthy adult, there is a recognition, that as in childhood playing, fantasy and reality merge. So for the adult there is recognition that art provides an important connection, not only with childhood, but also with the rational coalescence of fantasy and reality, thus allowing the adult "to tap deeper sources of reality and meaning than the sober rationality of the workaday world alone can call forth." (363).
For Loewald, both the analyst and the analysand are "artists". The role of the analysand is to bring forth (externalise) the content of the analysis and the analyst's role is to "direct" it. Perhaps here, there is an obvious comparison to the dual roles of analyst and analysand to the handling of form and content that every single artist wrestles with. By promoting the "artificial" neuroses in the analytic situation, which has the name of transference neurosis, the analyst hopes to perform his or her therapeutic task and cure the analysand of their original neurotic symptoms. Loewald maintains "that a piece of good analytic work is an artistic creation fashioned by patient and analyst in collaboration." (368). He refers to the analytic consultation in the following way:

The progression in such an hour is quite similar to the progression of a work of art, a poem, a musical composition, a painting, at a propitious moment or period during the artist's work. There, too, it is the momentum of an active imaginative process that creates the next step, propelled by the directional tension of the previous steps. This directional tension is the resultant of the artist's imagination and the inherent force of his medium. A word, a sound, a color, a shape - in the case of dramatic art an action - or a sequence of these, once determined, strongly suggests the next step to be taken. In the mutual interaction of the good analytic hour, patient and analyst - each in his own way and on his own mental level - become both artist and medium for each other. For the analyst as artist his medium is the patient in his psychic life; for the patient as artist the analyst becomes his medium. But as living human media they have their own creative capabilities, so they are both creators themselves. (369 emphases added).

For Loewald it is the transference neurosis itself that becomes the equivalent of the art object; "it is a transitional state between mere inner fantasy and actuality" (369). If we follow the trajectory of Loewald's argument and accept his analogies as concrete constructions, that give us new insights into the relatedness of art and psychoanalysis, then it seems that if a psychoanalyst can be artist in his or her own right, then so too can an artist be an analyst or analysand in theirs.

In the essay, "The Psychoanalysis of Art: Some Ends, Some Means" Donald Kaplan discusses the relatedness of clinical and applied psychoanalysis to art.48 He points out that clinical and applied psychoanalysis are "radically different endeavours" but that each complements the other and each can give us insights into art. Kaplan also

---

consolidates opinions put forward earlier in this thesis that art can and does inform psychoanalysis and also reminds the reader of art's fundamental position in the development of psychoanalytic theory: "The psychoanalysis of art has been a lively activity for virtually a century, ever since Freud first likened certain findings of his self analysis to certain turns of Plato in Oedipus Rex and Hamlet" (259). Kaplan makes several points about the relatedness of clinical psychoanalysis, applied psychoanalysis and art, but I shall only concentrate on those relevant to this thesis.

Firstly, he makes the point that clinical psychoanalysis is a pursuit that has specific theoretical bases concerned with the origin and development of the individual's mind and the therapeutic uses of the theories to cure neuroses. The theories have been developed and gained through the continued observation and record of actual case histories. All other developments from psychoanalysis are, strictly speaking, applied uses of psychoanalysis. Controversially, and as an example, Kaplan points out that this could put the position of such well established areas of psychoanalytic research as theories of (early) child development into the category of applied psychoanalysis, as much of its terrain is mapped by theory gained (or applied) from mainstream psychoanalysis. This, of course, is due to the analyst's inability to psychoanalyse very young children. Kaplan's point here is that to contribute to the very valuable area of child psychology, psychoanalysis has to resort solely to theory and analogy, much as it does in art. This is not to say that either the research into child development or art is impoverished, however, it is by necessity different. The difference, Kaplan argues, has some advantages and disadvantages. Kaplan points out that when Freud applied psychoanalysis to art it allowed him to test and verify his theories against the myths or "working models" of culture relating them to everyday life and normality. It is not accidental, Kaplan suggests, that Freud named one of his most important constructs the "Oedipus complex" after one of the most important works of ancient Greek art, the play Oedipus Rex (267). A finer reading of this phenomenon indicates that Freud, by pairing the neurotic symptomatic theory of the Oedipus complex against Oedipus Rex was interested in establishing the link between abnormality (in neuroses) and normality (in art). By pursuing this concept, Freud was not only giving credence to his theories, he was also establishing the ground for saying that psychoanalytic method does not differentiate between everyday life and neuroses. Therefore, what is apparent in art is apparent in psychoanalysis. Art lent itself to Freud's uses because of its ability to record and reveal every facet of the human emotions, when defences are weakened and the repressed can re-emerge. From this perspective art and psychoanalysis are complementary, each giving insights, not only on their respective domains, but on each other. As an example, Kaplan points out that psychoanalysis reveals the phenomenon of transference in the individual and clinical situation, but cultural institutions and
pursuits (such as religion and art) reveal the presence of transference phenomena (to psychoanalysis) in society at large. This is one reason, Kaplan suggests, why psychoanalysts maintain an interest in art. By reducing the focus of attention to only certain aspects of the total experience of art, psychoanalysts are able to expose aspects of art which correlate with psychoanalytic theory. Because art is concerned with myth and fantasy, the deepest conflicts of the psyche can be revealed safely and in a situation that is culturally acceptable. In this sense art can reveal things about life that can not be revealed in any other way. Art therefore, according to psychoanalysis, performs a useful function, by allowing aspects of the unconscious to re-emerge. In this sense the analogy of art to psychoanalysis is obvious and concrete.

Kaplan also refers to the use of analogy when discussing art and psychoanalysis and points out, that in many situations, the only way to compare art and psychoanalysis (because they emanate from such disparate areas of human inquiry) is by analogy (274-275). He indicates that when psychoanalysis is analogised with art, only part of the art form will be revealed by the analogy, yet conversely, all of the psychoanalytic theory or concept will be presented. This is because when analogising an aspect of psychoanalytic theory to an art form, the intention is to reveal or clarify the psychoanalytic concept, not to demystify the art form. In fact, Kaplan indicates, it is impossible to reveal every aspect of art with any one theory, (aesthetic or scientific) as a theory is only a focussed mechanical device, whereas art is a product of both the conscious and unconscious individual mind and, therefore, infinitely more variable. Kaplan concludes his essay by indicating that psychoanalysis has, from its earliest beginnings, enmeshed art into its theoretical and conceptual development and, consequently, there is an inextricable and complementary link between the two.

Another recent essay, "Art and Psychoanalysis: The Case of Paul Cezanne" by Laurie Schneider gives an interesting, if somewhat short account, of aspects of Cezanne's life and work. In some respects the essay is pathographic in approach, although in such a short account there is hardly time to develop a comprehensive and rigorous study of her subject. Nevertheless, the essay does offer some interesting psychoanalytic perspectives into one of art's most renowned practitioners. In this essay, Schneider discusses Cezanne's development as an artist and compares it to the development of his personal and psychological circumstances. Schneider points to three salient features in Cezanne's work:

(1) his early paintings depict overt sexual themes while in the course of the 1870s his iconography shifts to a predominance of ales and female bathers; (2) Cezanne's relationship with Hortense Fiquet and the birth of their son, Paul Junior, coincide with the artistic developments of the 1870s; (3) Cezanne's fantasy life actively emerges in both his early paintings and his literary productions, notably his letters and poems.

In attributing the changes in Cezanne's art to changes in his personal relationships, Schneider gives examples of the "rupture" in his friendship with Emile Zola (a friendship referred to as 'sublimated adolescent homosexual attraction" by Schneider) and his marriage to Hortense Fiquet (which occurred after his falling out with Zola). Schneider indicates other factors that changed Cezanne's referral to sexual imagery included the birth of his son and Cezanne's relationship with Camille Pisarro, whom Cezanne "revered" as "a new father image, more compatible with his talent than was his bourgeois and uncultured biological father" (221). To consider the three salient features of Cezanne's art, referred to above, Schneider discusses two examples of his artwork.

Looking at early examples such as, The Battle of Love, The Murder, The Rape, The Foreign Woman, Schneider suggests that these and many other early paintings of Cezanne's indicate a clear identification with his (unconscious) interest in the "Primal Scene" and "his more general preoccupation with violence inflicted on women by men." (222). Schneider indicates that in paintings such as these Cezanne uses metaphors to represent his own physical presence in paintings of this period. The metaphors include the repeated and deliberate use of the colour black, the inclusion of a black dog, a blackamoor and darkly dressed men next to a nude woman. These are all identified as (unconscious) representative symbols of Cezanne's physical presence in the paintings.

Other fears and fantasies that Schneider claims can be read into Cezanne's figurative work include the fear of castration and the fantasy of vagina dentata where instead of man being the aggressor, woman is seen as the threat to man.51 Examples of paintings that highlight this are Cezanne's Medea and Samson and Delilah both (according to psychoanalytic theory) mythical accounts of castration. Also noted is Cezanne's interest in the story of St. Anthony, and his paintings and drawings of "exotic and erotic visions" and 'sexual deprivation" concerning St. Anthony. Schneider reports that

---

50 "The primal scene is the patient's (child's) conception of his parent's having intercourse regarded as an idea around which Phantasy has been woven rather than as a recollection of something actually perceived": Rycroft 123.

51 'The vagina dentata fantasy in which the female genitals are pictured as having teeth to castrate the male lover': Schneider 222.
Cezanne's fears concerning women shown in his paintings are supported by his shyness or avoidance of women:

His reluctance to paint directly from female nudes is well-known. He is said to have fled from his gardener's daughters because he was afraid they would seduce him (Reff, 1962b, 114). Until he met Hortense Fiquet, Cezanne admired women from a safe distance and, at the end of his life, withdrew from virtually all sexual contact with women. (222)

Schneider goes on to link Cezanne's fear of castration and women with his fear of death. In psychoanalytic theory these three fears are related and recurrent themes in the unconscious fantasy life of men. Schneider claims they emerge both in Cezanne's paintings and his poetry. She continues to glean Cezanne's biography for the psychoanalytic symbolism that can be brought forth and moves on to discuss Cezanne's Oedipal development surfacing through his art and life.52 Schneider indicates that there is evidence to suggest Cezanne's oedipal development was essentially "positive (heterosexual)" and that he displayed ambivalence to both parents. For example, Cezanne's choices for subject matter in the writing of his poems such as The Dream of Hannibal indicate the "normal" "fear of the father's retaliation" and "the forbidden desire for the mother" (224). The forbidden desire for the mother, Schneider suggests, might well account for Cezanne's relative fear of women expressed both in his painting and his personal life. Schneider also points out that Cezanne's mother rarely appears in his artwork, "even more telling is his avoidance of using his mother as a model although he painted many portraits and did many drawings of the other members of his family" (224). With the arrival of Cezanne's son, Paul junior, and his relationship with Hortense Fiquet, Schneider implies that Cezanne was gradually able to resolve his oedipal struggles with his father and, therefore, not be so reliant on Zola's friendship.

For Schneider, Cezanne's sketchbooks reveal aspects of his unconscious fantasy life in operation. What Cezanne looks at and how he looks at it reveal his oedipal development in states of resolution. His sketchbooks, it appears, often overlap or juxtapose drawings of family members with mythical or sexual imagery, together with drawings of his son, his wife and father in unison with such explicit renderings as Leda and the Swan. Cezanne's friendship with Camille Pisarro is also considered part of his oedipal resolution. Pisarro's interest in and encouragement of Cezanne's art

---

52 Oedipus Complex: "Group of largely unconscious ideas and feelings centering around the wish to possess the parent of the opposite sex and eliminate that of the same sex... Resolution of the Oedipus Complex is achieved typically by IDENTIFICATION with the parent of the same sex and (partial) temporary renunciation of the parent of the opposite sex, who is "rediscovered" in his (her) adult sexual object. Persons who are fixated at the Oedipal level are mother fixated or father fixated - and reveal this by choosing sexual partners with obvious resemblances to their parent(s). Oedipal rivalry with the father is a cause of (CASTRATION ANXIETY)." Rycroft, 105.
"coincided with Cezanne's early years with Hortense". Thus, for Schneider, Pisarro "became a kind of artistic father and benevolent superego for Cezanne" (225).

In conclusion, Schneider is careful to point out that Cezanne's personal life was not exceptional. The emotional trauma and conflict he suffered were no less and no more than that experienced by other "normal" and "well adjusted" human beings, in the course of a relatively straightforward development from childhood to maturity and then old age. Furthermore, in his professional life as an artist Cezanne was particularly successful and gifted. Perhaps then, the value of Schneider's essay is in her choice of "adaptive" subject, Paul Cezanne. Schneider's intention is to "offer new and multi layered views into certain iconographic problems as well as into the artist's personal dynamics" (221). In *Art and Psyche* Ellen Handler-Spitz indicates that there is a shortfall in the area of "adaptive" applied psychoanalytic writing. In this sense, Schneider's essay is a constructive contribution to a field of research neglected in favour of more obviously pathologic personalities and case studies. However, even though Schneider's account makes reference to the many art historical and psychoanalytic studies of Paul Cezanne's life it does no more than indicate the potential for further research into a fascinating topic. Nevertheless, she does reinforce Handler-Spitz's contention that transference phenomena are apparent in many of the very best works of art.

Reuben Fine's article, "The Effect of Psychoanalysis on the Creative Individual", discusses some of the noted studies concerning this subject. Essentially Fine's conclusions are that those artists that enter into analysis gain by the experience. In their personal lives, (as is common with all other categories of analysand), artists experience a 'straightening out' of their emotions. In their working lives, in general, they experience the removal of "blocks" to their artistic productivity. This, Fine maintains, is contrary to the myth that some artists have, concerning psychoanalysis, that it will rob them of their ability or need to work creatively. As a starting point for his review, Fine refers the reader to a study by Edrita Fried which reported on the analysis of six established artists, analysed a minimum of three times a week for over three years "to evaluate the relationship between changes in personality and changes in the artist's work habits" (4). Fried's study is similar to the previous review concerning aspects of

53 Considering an artist's adaptive abilities in general R.S. Liebert argues, "placing the emphasis on the ego strengths of the artist, it can be said, in sum, that the artist is distinguished not by the specific nature or depth of his inner conflicts, nor by trauma in his early history. Rather, he is distinguished by his capacity to sublimate unacceptable drives by expressing them creatively in images. He is also pressed by a need to communicate with and be responded to by others through this symbolic medium". (Liebert, 7)

Paul Cezanne's life in that Schneider's and Fried's essays discuss "adaptive" personalities. Similar to Schneider's essay it finds that psychic reparation leads toward enhanced creative potential and output. In Fried's study the six artists include "a sculptor, three painters, one actor-singer and a writer". In each case it was found that psychoanalytic therapy for the 'six artists improved their work capacity, helped them to overcome blocks, led to more gratifying interpersonal relationships and led to a better life all round" (6). This was due, Fine indicates, to the therapeutic effects of analysis, relieving tension, aggression and the reliance on "rituals" used in the creation of art. These "controls" were introducing "lethargy, tightness and depression". Once these were removed, work and life patterns changed significantly and positively for each artist in the study.

Following the Fried study, Fine considers briefly the lives of some artists that were either involved with psychoanalysis or may have benefited from it. Firstly, he considers F. Scott Fitzgerald, as typical of the artist that 'squanders his earnings, takes to drink, goes downhill and dies prematurely." He goes on to indicate, "Whatever his literary status, Fitzgerald was a miserably unhappy man" and then asks the question, "What would have happened to him if he had been analysed?"(9). Perhaps predictably and with insufficient argument, Fine answers his rhetorical question by indicating that based on the previous study by Fried, Fitzgerald may well have lived a longer and happier life. Similarly, when Fine looks briefly at the life of August Strindberg he concludes that had Strindberg been analysed, he may also have lived a much happier life. For even though Strindberg was extremely prolific and successful as an artist, "During his life he had a number of breakdowns... was quite paranoid, eccentric, extremely rebellious, somewhat insane (in the popular sense of the word) and obviously a man struggling with terrible inner torment.... He, too, was a lifelong alcoholic and depressive" (11). However, in Strindberg's case, Fine implies that artistic success was a greater lure than mental health.

Looking at other artists, in his somewhat underdeveloped paper, Fine asserts that many artists consciously or unconsciously live in various states of deteriorating mental health in the precarious and erroneous belief that this state of mind preserves his or her artistic output. He then looks at some prominent clinical case studies of artists or creative individuals. Firstly, as a prima-facie and somewhat neglected subject, Fine looks at Freud's own self-analysis as an example of creativity and productivity being spurred by psychoanalysis. Freud conducted his self-analysis during the years 1895 to 1902. A major study of Freud's self-analysis by the French psychoanalyst Didier Anzieu has shown, Fine reports, that Freud's germinal period of theoretical creativity and originality coincides with his self-analysis (15). For Fine, Freud's subsequent prolific
writings and discoveries bear witness to the value of this self-analysis. Thus, Fine writes "analysis removed his [Freud's] blocks and allowed an enormous surge of creativity" (15). Then, looking at some of Freud's well-known case studies, Fine discusses Sergei Pankejeff, better known in Freud's writings as The Wolf Man. Fine points out that subsequent to his long period of analysis with Freud and other psychoanalysts he was largely cured of his crippling neurosis and went on to become a lawyer, amateur painter and writer. All of this creative and work-related potential, Fine claims, only came to fruition because of "the wolf man's" successful period of psychoanalysis.

Fine then turns his attention to the poet Hilda Doolittle, one of Freud's most celebrated artistic clients. Doolittle, according to Fine, led an unhappy life "dominated by strong men", put in train by a repressive father and compounded by her first and lifelong infatuation with Ezra Pound. Pound, described by Fine as "a sadistic lover who later identified with fascism and spent years in a mental hospital" deserted Doolittle (17). She went on to have a succession of relationships including those with Richard Aldington (a poet), D.H. Lawrence (who is credited as being the father of Doolittle's illegitimate son), and a lesbian relationship with a woman called "Bryher." Freud's psychoanalysis of Doolittle left a lasting impression on her life and, according to Fine, enabled her to free herself of dominating and sadistic father-figures. It appears that Doolittle's personal life never fully recovered a mental equilibrium, though her artistic life gained inner strength and personal identity, where previously it had been dominated by her relationships with Aldington, Lawrence and Pound. In his essay Fine goes on to superficially touch on other issues concerning psychoanalysis and creativity. The main concern for Fine, which he returns to at several points through his essay, is to reassure the reader that the benefits for the artist of entering into psychoanalysis are the same, as they would be for any other individual. Namely, the artist's creative potential becomes unblocked, his or her interpersonal relationships mature and become more successful, feelings of anxiety diminish, potential neuroses dissolve. Much of this "healing process" occurs due to the analytic relationship and the transference exchanges between analyst and analysand. As Fine indicates the potential for transference phenomena is also present in the production of artwork. Discussing F. Scott Fitzgerald he reports:

Another dynamic factor that plays a role is the transference constellation. In Tender is the Night, Fitzgerald unconsciously described his transference wish: to drag the analyst down to his own level and destroy him (26).
Following Fine a further development of this position would be to say that a record of Fitzgerald's transference was isolated and maintained in his art work without his conscious knowledge. Discussing this proposition one might ask where, when and how does the transference that is sealed into the artwork manage to fuse with it? An answer to this problem could be that the transference occurs for the artist in the studio or writing situation, which is centred on creativity and the objective of producing an art object not transferences. Therefore, the transference may well remain unconscious to the artist but sealed into the art. However, in the clinical situation transference emerges for analyst and analysand in the treatment, which is centred on the therapeutic relationship and the eventual recognition of transference phenomena. In conclusion, it is interesting to note that even though there are similarities in both psychoanalysis and the production of art, only the transferences of art enter the public domain and become completely available to the superego of mass psychology.

Another essay concerning imagination and creativity is "The Joke in The Moses of Michelangelo" by Vann Spruiell. He addresses some of the key psychic reasons that may have driven Freud to write one of his most important art related works, "The Moses of Michelangelo" (S.E. vol. 13 209-238). Freud's fascination with Moses is well documented and I have already made reference to it when reviewing the essays contained in Sigmund Freud and Art. In that book Ellen Handler Spitz informs the reader of Freud's inverted fascination with Moses, compounded by his renunciation of Judaism. She reminds us that in one of his last, most problematic and controversial texts, Moses and Monotheism, he makes the case for Moses being an Egyptian nobleman who was murdered by the Jews (S.E. vol. 23 1-54). This Handler Spitz ties to unconscious motives concerning ambivalent emotions towards his father and Judaism. Later in this thesis, when I consider Peter Fuller's book Art and Psychoanalysis, it will be seen that Fuller also devotes considerable time to analysing Freud's reasons for writing both "The Moses of Michelangelo" and Moses and Monotheism. He comes to conclusions not dissimilar to those put forward by both Handler Spitz and Vann Spruiell.

55 Interestingly, this area of discussion is touched on by Liebert in Michelangelo "Although it is possible to regard a work of art as the artist's attempt to resolve unconscious conflicts and to express unacceptable wishes in disguised form, it should be emphasised that works of art are not to be equated with either neurotic symptoms or dreams. This issue may be clouded by the fact that all three phenomena are manifest expressions of latent and conflicted dark motives; all three involve the compromise of an acceptable symbolic representation of unacceptable unconscious content. The creative act, the neurotic symptom, and the dream all draw upon repressed, more primitive thought. It is, however, the artist alone who is able to make constructive contact with this conflicted material without being overwhelmed by it" (Liebert 7).

Vann Spruiell arrives at a range of insights concerning Freud's particular interest in Michelangelo's statue of Moses:

Freud was first fascinated with the statue, then fascinated with his own fascination. Over 13 years, he spent many, many hours standing before the statue, brooding about its meaning. The final work of art - and that is what the paper turned out to be - came as a result of insights that were simultaneously derived from unresolved conflicts out of Freud's infantile past, unresolved conflicts in his contemporary external world, and unresolved conflicts of a transference nature toward his own creation, psychoanalysis. The paper represented an actualization of a complex synthesis Freud made: it was at once a work of art which could be shared with others, an intimate (and highly "mutative") interpretation made to himself, and a joke that he enjoyed privately. (491-92 emphases added).

To say that Vann Spruiell views Freud's "Moses of Michelangelo" as a seminal work would not be overstating the case. In developing his argument, Vann Spruiell firstly considers the relationship of a joke to a work of art and points out that several artists (among them Picasso and Diego Rivera) considered every worthwhile art object to be "like a joke." In this they were in good company, for not only did Freud write an influential text on jokes - Jokes and Their Relation to the Unconscious, he also envisaged relationships between jokes, dreams and works of art (S.E vol 8). Vann Spruiell contends:

Every piece of worthwhile art, properly understood, is not only like a joke, it is shocking. It must connect its elements in a new way; the world comes to be seen in a new way. A punch line of a joke may get a laugh, or perhaps only a smile. A first view of a great work of art may make one smile, more likely not. But it will be shocking, often without the viewer knowing quite why. (475)

Vann Spruiell informs us that in a letter Freud wrote to two of his closest associates, (Ernest Jones and Karl Abraham) he told them that "The Moses of Michelangelo", "is only a joke" (475). This could have been construed as embarrassment, modesty or doubt on Freud's part, but whatever it was that concerned him, it was powerful enough to convince Freud to publish "The Moses of Michelangelo" anonymously. Freud had been thinking about writing the Moses essay for many years and yet he did not admit authorship of the work until 1924, ten years after the work's publication in 1914. In a letter to Edoardo Weiss he explained:

My feeling for this piece of work is rather like that towards a love-child. For three lonely September weeks in 1913 I stood every day in the church in front of the statue, studied it, measured it, sketched it, until I captured the understanding for it which I ventured to express in the essay only anonymously. Only much later did I legitimize this non-analytical child (475).\footnote{qtd. in Ernest Jones, \textit{The Life and Work of Sigmund Freud} 3 vols. (New York: Basic Books, 1953-57).}
It is worth noting at this point the other two works that Freud published anonymously. They were, *Totem and Taboo* (S.E. vol. 13 1-162) and *Moses and Monotheism*. Vann Spruiell argues that Freud's concern over his essay "The Moses of Michelangelo" was due to his seeing it as "a work of art rather than as a scientific document". This proposition would certainly tie in with Freud's determined aim of putting forward his "legitimate child", psychoanalysis, as a scientific endeavour. The "love-child" and works like it would only hinder and embarrass his legitimate concerns.

The connection of the joke to the work of art is pursued by Vann Spruiell. It appears Freud, in his anonymous publication, built in a joke that only he and his close associates would be privy to. On the title page of "The Moses of Michelangelo" the anonymous author tells his readers that he "moves in psychoanalytic circles" and that the paper has "certain resemblance to the methodology of psychoanalysis" (S.E. vol. 13 211). This coming from the "father of psychoanalysis" must have raised a few smiles. Vann Spruiell informs us that Freud had a persistent sense of humour, even though to his colleagues "he relayed so many bad jokes, and was so intrigued by plays on words" (481). Freud was aware of the usefulness of jokes in our personal and communal lives. In one of Freud's most important works, *The Psychopathology of Everyday Life*, Vann Spruiell informs the reader that Freud discusses the similarities in the functions of jokes, dreams and art (S.E. vol. 6). The similarities were discussed further in *Jokes and Their Relation to the Unconscious*. Vann Spruiell asserts that Freud saw the connection between jokes, dreams and art in their ability,

... [to] involve condensation, displacement, indirect presentation by means of allusion, plays on words, the breaking of ordinary burdensome rules of logic, and the establishment of unexpected connections between disparate ideas.... What dreams, fantasies, humor, wit, symptoms, creative acts - what psychic acts have in common is that all emanate from a psychic structure shared in qualitative essentials by almost all human beings.... More specifically, what creative acts and jokes, and to a lesser extent, dreams, share is the sudden, shocking, joining, by the viewer or listener, of previously buried sexual and aggressive fantasies with fantasies more closely related to everyday, conscious perception (481-82).

From the opening pages of "The Moses of Michelangelo" Freud compromises the scientific position of psychoanalysis by admitting bewilderment and confusion in the face of art and argues that the power contained in a work of art must "have to do with the intention of the artist" (476). Vann Spruiell goes on to reveal what is there for all to see... Freud rationalises that the only way to understand the intention of the artist is to
analyse the work of art in a similar way to psychoanalytic method. It is at this point that Freud obliquely implicates the transference constellation into the process of art analysis. Following Vann Spruiell, one can conject that this explains Freud's trepidation at claiming authorship to such a radical and compromising document as the Moses essay. For to achieve transference information from a work of art Freud might reveal (his) counter-transferent tendencies, something which Freud would see as damaging to his and psychoanalysis's objectivity and neutrality. Nevertheless, by employing a proto-psychoanalytic method to a work of art Freud aimed at revealing the psychic intentions and motivations of the artist:

In my opinion, what grips us so powerfully can only be the artist's intention, in so far as he has succeeded in explaining it in his work and in getting us to understand it. I realize that this cannot be merely a matter of intellectual comprehension; what he aims at is to awaken in us the same emotional attitude, the same mental constellation as that which in him produced the impetus to create.... The product itself after all must admit of such an analysis, if it really is an effective expression of the intentions and emotional activities of the artist. To discover his intention, though, I must first find out the meaning and content of what is represented in his work; I must in other words, be able to interpret it. It is possible, therefore, that a work of art of this kind needs interpretation, and that until I have accomplished that interpretation I cannot come to know why I have been so powerfully affected." (S.E. vol.13 212, emphases added)

Here, then, in the opening pages to Freud's anonymous document he gives a thumbnail sketch of applying psychoanalytic method to a work of art to achieve similar insights (with similar means) to those achieved in a clinical analysis. The corollary of this announcement can only imply the emergence of transference phenomena.

Vann Spruiell contends that Freud's essay not only reveals Michelangelo's deep motives and intentions but also Freud's. He implies that Freud's interpretation of the Michelangelo statue is an assumption that suited Freud's own counter-transferent ends. Contrary to the art historic and prevailing reading of the Michelangelo statue, that Moses was depicted rising to his feet in wrath to "cast down the tablets" Freud claims that Moses was not about to smash the tablets, but in fact was attempting to save them. This Freud implies might have gone against the Biblical text but was in accord with Michelangelo's intention. Needless to say, this is an extraordinary and radical conclusion to draw and disregarding whether it is the right or the wrong one, Vann Spruiell claims that it suited Freud's counter-transferent wishes:
It (also) had personal meanings having to do with three spheres: (1) Freud's feelings about - one might say transferences to - his own great creation, the concepts of psychoanalysis. His own "highest mental achievement" was then endangered by the defections of Jung and Adler. (2) The necessities of his outside professional life: to retain his leadership and control of his own passions for the sake of a higher cause. (3) The resolution of specific conflicts which had arisen during infancy, which had manifested themselves repeatedly in his adult life - particularly before periods of great creativity (478).

Assuming Vann Spruiell is correct and Freud was imposing his own transferent thoughts onto his reading of a statue one can only conclude that these were in fact counter-transferent thoughts oscillating between Michelangelo's statue and Freud.58

Vann Spruiell continues looking for Freud's counter-transferent thoughts in the essay that Freud regarded as a joke and Vann Spruiell regards as a work of art, by discussing some of the unconscious and conscious motivational factors that may have driven Freud to be fascinated with the statue and to write his extraordinary essay. Freud was fascinated by what the statue represented. Not only was it a statue of Moses but it was created by Michelangelo and sponsored by Pope Julius II, characters that Freud knew much about and in the case of Moses at least, identified strongly with (477-478). In a complex web of thought and interpretation Vann Spruiell conceives a scenario in which multiple identifications may have emerged between the characters connected with Freud's essay. Taking as read Freud's identification with Moses, Vann Spruiell constructs the argument for a possible identification between Michelangelo and Pope Julius II, and a more likely identification of Freud to Michelangelo. Even though, Vann Spruiell's persuasive and complex arguments are here summarised, it is clear that a strong psychic investment by Freud, in both Moses and Michelangelo must have strongly influenced him in writing his essay. Briefly, Vann Spruiell reminds us that Michelangelo suffered loss and trauma at the oedipal period in his childhood. His mother died when he was 6 years old and he was raised by a surrogate family of stonecutters. When as adolescent he entered the house of the Medicis and commenced his famed career as sculptor, painter and poet. In his lifetime, Michelangelo was acclaimed as one of the great artists and intellects of the Renaissance. This is one of the main factors that contributed to the admiration of him by Pope Julius II. Vann Spruiell indicates that this admiration may have been reciprocal and there is evidence to suggest that Michelangelo may have identified Pope Julius with Moses, especially as

58 It is worth remembering here the importance Freud placed on figurative statues. In his consulting rooms he had a vast collection on display and as I have pointed out Freud wrote and mused with them, as well as including them as aids in his consultations.
Like Michelangelo, Freud suffered childhood loss, only in his case, loss of a brother eleven months younger. His brother, whose name was Julius, died when Freud was nineteen months old. Vann Spruiell points out that like Michelangelo, Freud was regarded as "a gifted, adored, oldest son" (486). Besides the common factor of childhood loss Vann Spruiell points to similarities in childhood sibling rivalries and relationships between Michelangelo and his four younger brothers and Freud and his four younger sisters and two brothers. There is also the relationship of Freud to his father which, as recorded in Freud's self-analysis, was ambivalent. Additionally, Freud's relationship with his mother, who was much younger than the father, had the typical oedipal overtones of sexuality and were strained by the loss of Freud's childhood nanny when he was about three years old. Other losses of note in Freud's childhood include the loss of the parent's family home and the separation of close family members, due to "economic necessity". The importance of names in Freud's psychical make-up can also not be underestimated in this case. For example, his younger sister (born one year after his brother Julius' death) was named Anna. When Freud had his own daughter he gave her the name Anna. The death of Freud's younger brother, devastated his family, particularly his mother, in turn, this much affected Freud. Freud reveals this in the record of his self-analysis. Vann Spruiell indicates the importance of this and Julius' name:

Freud described his inability to recall the name of Julius Mosen, a well known poet. His self-analysis showed that he had "personal reasons" for repressing the name Mosen, that infantile material determined the repressions, and that the substitute names that did occur to him were, like neurotic symptoms, compromise formations. This was the first recorded conjunction by Freud of the names, Julius and Mosen." (479)

The references here to both Julius Freud, Pope Julius II and then Moses and Mosen are apparent. Vann Spruiell presents the believable and probable scenario that Freud was both consciously and unconsciously repeating the differing aspects of a complex set of psychic connections in "the Moses of Michaelangelo". Following through the importance of the Oedipus complex and loss and mourning to psychoanalytic theory, Vann Spruiell writes, "With the consolidation of his oedipal conflicts, the boy [Freud] undoubtedly condensed and reworked all of these losses. No other inference is reasonable" (487).
Vann Spruiell goes on to assert that "The Moses of Michelangelo" in its writing had a cathartic effect on Freud and that because of its publication Freud had exorcised a whole series of deep psychic conflicts concerning guilt, ambivalence, sexuality, jealousy, loss and mourning:

The "Moses of Michelangelo" was analogous to a good interpretation. It imaginatively brought together elements of transference, "outside" life and infantile past. (491)

In this sense, Freud's essay can be seen as resembling a (partial) transference neurosis. Vann Spruiell certainly indicates that subsequent to "The Moses of Michelangelo" Freud was a changed psychic personality and attributes to it Freud's reassessment of psychoanalysis, enabling him to go on and reshape psychoanalysis into what Christopher Badcock has referred to as "the second psychoanalytic revolution" (Badcock 103).

In summary, Vann Spruiell's essay is an argument for the importance of "The Moses of Michelangelo" to Freud on a number of psychic levels. He postulates that for Freud it addressed (i) unresolved childhood conflicts concerning loss and the death of his younger brother Julius, (ii) Unresolved oedipal conflicts concerning both his father and mother (iii) unresolved conflicts in his professional life and as Vann Spruiell puts it, "unresolved conflicts of a transference nature toward his own creation, psychoanalysis" (491). Utilising Freud's own interest in jokes, and in art, Vann Spruiell identifies the similarities between the two phenomena and their relationship to the unconscious. He convincingly proposes that Freud regarded "The Moses of Michelangelo" as both a work of art about a work of art and as an essay concerning a series of highly personal jokes and jokes that would only be understood by the initiated. Vann Spruiell's essay reveals aspects of Freud's sensitivity to art and identifies his method of interpreting art as similar to psychoanalytic interpretation in the clinical setting. Additionally, and importantly, this essay identifies an investment and interest in transference running through a major work (of art) by Freud. Essentially, Vann Spruiell clearly indicates that transference phenomena and art are inextricably linked.

The next and penultimate article that I will review in this chapter is by Carl T. Rotenberg. Entitled "A Psychoanalytic Study of the Appreciation of Art" this essay addresses what is referred to as "the self-object phenomenon."59 Rotenberg reports that

---

the self-object phenomenon, "was discovered in the context of the analytic situation," and in particular it was during aspects of the treatment when transference was manifest that the self-object phenomenon was identified. "Self-objects are objects [important figures from the past] which we experience as part of our self" (119). In the context of the appreciation of art, Rotenberg uses the self-object phenomenon to explain aspects of our appreciation. In the "normal" individual the self-object parts of our psychological structure are in balance with the self and are utilised by the individual to maintain stability and "optimal" functioning of the psyche. Self-object material is invested, Rotenberg reports, in everyday situations by the majority of society. Examples of cultural models of the self-object phenomenon in operation might include such situations as the classroom where there is a reciprocal acceptance of the self-object phenomenon between student (child) and teacher (parent), or perhaps the theatre where a sense of participating in a play is experienced between actors and audience.

For the visual artist and his audience Rotenberg proposes that the self-object component is contained within the artwork. What are Rotenberg's reasons for proposing this? Firstly, Rotenberg looks at the role of empathy in both the psychoanalytic and artistic situations. In the psychoanalytic setting empathy is a key concept. Rycroft reports that "The capacity to empathise is an essential pre-condition of doing psychoanalytical therapy" and he describes empathy as "The power of projecting one's personality into (and so fully comprehending) the object of contemplation.... The capacity to put oneself into the object and remaining aware of one's own identity as another person." (Rycroft 42-43). Without empathy in the psychoanalytic situation transference will not be possible or successful. Looking at art, Rotenberg points out that empathy is an important aspect of the artistic experience for both artist and audience. The artist empathises with his or her process, materials and audience and expresses this in the artwork. The audience, on the other hand, empathises with the artist through the artwork. For Rotenberg, it is this that gives an artwork vitality.

Rotenberg then goes on to suggest that the processes of the artist and of the psychoanalytic situation are similar. Referring to Winnicott's concept of "the potential space" and "the transitional object" he maintains that what relates the artist to the psychoanalyst, is his ability to both immerse and fuse himself with the artwork and then, like his audience, stand back, "to detach oneself and maintain an aesthetic distance" (121). This process is similar to the psychoanalyst and the analysand in the consultation where at times complete immersion is necessary and then an objective

---

60 Self: "When used by itself: the SUBJECT regarded as an AGENT, as being aware of his own IDENTITY and of his role as subject and agent." (Rycroft 149).
detachment. Winnicott identified the "potential space" as a psychic phenomenon dating back to the child's earliest experiences with the mother and the breast, where the psychic space between baby and breast and child and mother is a "potential space" that is charged with psychic content. Rotenberg, in the now familiar rhetoric of a psychoanalyst comparing himself to an artist, takes the unfamiliar but logical step of comparing himself to the artist's canvas, and of the analysand to artist:

To some extent, the relationship of the self to the self-object is a creative one, in which the self creates in the self-object the particular combination of properties and qualities which then enables the creator, the self, to realize itself. In my clinical practice, for example, I am often a canvas onto whom patients paint and try to maintain the specific portrait of the self-objects they require. In art the painting for the artist represents the particular combination of properties whose realization in visual form at that time enables him to make further steps toward his self-realization. (122).

Therefore, for Rotenberg, it appears, the artistic process of creation is essentially therapeutic and concerned with personal psychic development. Within the realms of "normality" art is, as others have pointed out, an adaptive means of the artist self realising his or her potential. Rotenberg, then makes a direct comparison of the art object to a transference effected in the psychoanalytic consultation. Focussing on the concept of originality and newness in art works, Rotenberg argues that it is the properties of originality and newness that give artworks aspects of their authenticity and significance. Similarly, for Rotenberg, it is the aptness and originality of the transference in the analytic situation that gives the analytic situation its meaning and authenticity. The transference is "new" in the sense that it is as Freud first regarded it, "a new edition" of an old and deep psychic conflict that is relevant and appropriate to the analysand and analyst at the time of its manifestation in the treatment. For Rotenberg, the transference allows new insights in a similar way to the new insights gained through art. He indicates that in mature and "normal" individuals the 'self-object" can be transferred or contained in an artwork. This is possible because of the multi-various and inter-changeable concepts and contents that can be invested in artworks, allowing both artist and audience an active and inter-active relationship, which is at once both illusion and reality.

In conclusion, Rotenberg indicates that the artwork can contain the transference and the artwork can be the object onto which the transference is made. This process is achieved for artist and audience by empathic response and by psychic immersion and

detachment, a process that Rotenberg compares closely to that of the psychoanalytic situation.

The final paper for review in this chapter is, "Insight Through Metaphor in Psychotherapy and Creativity" by Jitka Linden. The aim of this complex paper, is "to relate the phenomena of psychoanalytic and creative insight." (377). To do this Linden employs the "phenomenon of metaphor". He points out that metaphor was at first seen as a hindrance to the psychoanalytic process, but (like transference) was then recognised as "an integral feature of therapeutic communication" (387). Apparently, analyst and analysand often communicate through the use of metaphors as they provide rich sets of imagery on which to draw and aid in the eliciting of transferences. Linden reports studies have shown that:

... the therapeutic process as a continuous process of metaphorization to literalization and vice versa where insight is associated with verbalizing implicit experiences in novel figurative experiences, followed by describing the implications of these expressions (388).

Furthermore, Linden reports that some analysts see metaphor and transference in the analytic situation as identical. Quoting J.A. Arlow he explains:

Transference, perhaps the most significant instrumentality of psychoanalytic technique, and metaphor both mean exactly the same thing. They both refer to the carrying over of meaning from one set of situations to another. The transference in the psychoanalytic situation represents a metaphorical misapprehension of the relationship to the analyst. The patient says, feels, and thinks one thing about a specific person, the analyst, while really meaning another person, an object from childhood. Thus meaning is carried over from one set of situations, from experiences or fantasies of the early years, to another situation, a current therapeutic interaction in which the old significations are meaningless and irrelevant. Transference in the analytic situation is a particularly intense, lived-out metaphor of the patient's neurosis (398).

---


63 Pollio, Barlow, Fine, Psychology and the Poetics of Growth (New Jersey: Hillsdale 1977).

Linden, whilst agreeing with Arlow in principle, differentiates the types of transference in an analytic situation that create direct and indirect metaphors. However, he implies that regardless of the transference enacted, metaphor and eventual insight is arrived at. For Linden, metaphor, transference and image are inextricably linked. In this context Linden uses the word image to imply the reproduction of a "concrete object" in the analysand's past. Following Linden's position, the use of the word image overlaps with its uses in a creative and arts context and conceptually it is but a short step to consider the string of words as metaphor, transference, drawing or metaphor, transference, painting etc.65 Linden then moves on to compare the similarities of insight gained by psychoanalysis as opposed to insight gained through creativity. A main difference, Linden claims, is that psychic insight in psychoanalysis is a directed aim, whereas in creativity it is "a spontaneous production process" (402). Here, Linden is not only including artists as creators but also other professionals such as scientists. Nevertheless, metaphor he asserts is crucial here too. How the metaphor emerges and is then comprehended is dependent, Linden claims, on the modus operandi of the creator. This will not only be determined by personal psychological motivations but also by the working methods and formal constraints imposed by the particular creator's discipline.

For Linden, what the creator produces "is always a symbol of some kind", whether or not it has a literal connection with the original "object" in his or her psyche. There will always be in the created object some referent however obscure that will allow the comprehender (viewer) the "preconditions" to obtain an insight. This referent will operate within the realms of metaphor and it is the recognition of metaphor that releases insight. This for Linden is how the creative process becomes "a co-creative process" and knowledge is acquired, completing a phase of the communicative cycle.

---

65 Once again, this raises the issue that so many psychoanalytic and art terms overlap: e.g., acting out, concept, imagination, creativity, symbol, emotion, interpretation etc., etc. Following through the history of psychoanalysis it is apparent that there is a link. In his essay, "The Psychoanalysis of Art: Some Ends, Some Means," Donald M. Kaplan argues that psychoanalytic terms are linked to art terms intentionally. This raises the further question, following Handler Spitz, of whether mental functioning operates through visual images: Handler Spitz, Image.
Summary Chapter Two

Several positions emerge confirming the association of art and psychoanalysis and the significance of transference phenomena to both disciplines. The positions include,

a. The importance of art to the development of psychoanalytic theory
b. Comparisons of psychoanalysis to an art form and vice versa
c. Differences between psychoanalysis and art
d. Potential uses of art in adaptation
e. The importance of object-relations theory to a psychoanalytic theory of aesthetics
f. The use of artworks as transference objects and the connections of transference to art.

In concluding this chapter I will summarise these positions.

a. The importance of art to the development of psychoanalytic theory.

From the beginning, Freud used art consciously to describe his theories and concepts and in his psychoanalytic practice. He and his followers related art to dreaming and the revelations of the unconscious. Furthermore, evidence is presented to argue that Freud consciously and unconsciously used his personal collection of art, and famous public examples, as transference objects. It is claimed that he had psychic interactions and dialogues with art. For example, Handler Spitz refers to Freud's art collection as having a personal set of relations to his psyche. Then she, and later Vann Spruiell, argues that Freud himself created art in his psychoanalytic texts. Vann Spruiell pursues this and posits that Freud used his writing as a container for his transferences.

Kaplan argues that art and psychoanalysis are complementary, each giving insights on each other. As an example, he says that art reveals transferences in culture and serves a useful purpose. Furthermore, we have seen that Handler Spitz, following Winnicott and others, compares aesthetic experience to symbiotic fusion and connects it to various other object-relations phenomena. Handler Spitz then gives examples and points out that psychoanalysts, even in recent times, have been using art as a model to solve problems in psychoanalysis. If this interdisciplinary conjecture and theorising is valid in psychoanalysis, I argue, then it is also valid for artists to draw conclusions concerning art from psychoanalysis. In fact, of course Freud anticipated that this might well be one of psychoanalysis's greatest uses. It is reasonable to posit that Freud saw psychoanalysis as having profound implications outside of its medical uses. He
believed that, in the long term, psychoanalysis would have more to contribute to society or culture than solely a therapeutic method.

b. Comparisons of psychoanalysis to an art and vice versa.

Among the many comparisons of psychoanalysis to art Bergman makes the points that (i) psychoanalysts, like artists, are interpreters of memories and of the past and (ii) to be a good analyst you have to be a talented practitioner, or in his terms, like a talented artist. Bergman conflates psychoanalysis and art positing that Freud created psychoanalysis and is its master artist. Handler Spitz discusses the similarities of the "art experience" to the psychoanalytic situation. She argues that it is possible, through art, for the artist to conduct a self-analysis. The problem though with the artist's process is the problem similar to all self-analysis, the artist is often too close and too biased when considering his or her own work. Analysis and interpretation, for the artist is, for example, impeded by counter-transference. Handler Spitz goes on to argue that there are overlaps and similarities between the psychoanalytic situation and roles of artist, critic an audience. Loewald also compares psychoanalysis to art. Both art and psychoanalysis, he posits, have the potential to transform peoples lives. For Loewald both the analyst and analysand are artists. More than this, they become the media of art for each other. The transference neurosis becomes equivalent to an art object. On this basis, I argue that if it is possible for analysts and analysands to be artists and create art in the analytic session, then it is surely possible for art to contain potential psychoanalytic possibilities for the artist and viewer. This is confirmed in Kaplan's essay in which he contends that the analogy of art to psychoanalysis is very close due to the capacity of both to reveal the unconscious.

This position is reinforced by Vann Spruiell who indicates that Freud's essay, "The Moses of Michelangelo" is a work of art into which Freud transferred his conscious and unconscious thoughts. Furthermore, he posits that for Freud the Moses essay was cathartic and acted in ways similar to psychoanalytic therapy. Rotenberg also discusses the similarities of psychoanalysis and art at length. He points out that empathy is a key concept to both activities and that it promotes transferences in both situations. He goes on to compare the analyst to a blank canvas onto which the analysand paints. The analysand creates the "self object" in the analyst in a way similar to an artist creating an artwork. Rotenberg compares artist and psychoanalyst in their ability to immerse themselves in the subject of their study and then stand back and detach themselves from it. This suggests that the artist has a degree of self-analytic potential invested, consciously or unconsciously, into the art making process. He views transference as equivalent to an artwork in that both allow insights into the subject's psyche.
Transferences, he argues, can be invested and contained in artworks in complex layers allowing a relationship and dialogue to develop between artist and artwork, and artwork and viewer that is both an illusion and a reality. Thus, an artwork may operate as a transitional object in the potential space of illusion and reality as Winnicott first proposed. Finally, there is Linden's association of metaphor to both psychoanalysis and creativity. Linden contends that metaphor and transference in the psychoanalytic situation are very close, if not the same thing. He then points out that metaphor is a key component in creativity and deduces, therefore, that creativity must include transference.

c. Differences between psychoanalysis and art.

An important difference between art and psychoanalysis revolves around their disciplinary emphases. Psychoanalysis in practice is concerned, at least in the main, with problems of psychopathology. Whereas, art is concerned with such things as aesthetic experience and expressions of thought. In this regard, art is not therapy and therapy is not art though they may share features in common. However, each has distinct roles to perform in our compartmentalised and complex view of the world. This, it seems, is particularly true in Western and "developed" cultures. Nevertheless, as we have seen, the unconscious does not discriminate between our divisions of professions and our conscious sectioning of experience. One may inform or even help another. This, as we shall see in chapter three, is exactly what Happens with art in therapy.

Following Fine's position on art and transference, I have argued in chapter two that if it is possible for transferences to be sealed into artworks unconsciously then a difference between art and psychotherapy is that in psychotherapy there is an imperative to uncover transferences, whereas, in art there is not. This position is confirmed by Linden, who argues that psychic insight in therapy is a directed aim, whereas, in creative pursuits such as art, if it Happens, it is a spontaneous process. Nevertheless, he points out the potential for insight is always included in creative pursuits and that this is done in a transferent and metaphoric way.

d. Potential uses of art in adaptation.

There has been reference to art as an adaptive process. Handler Spitz has discussed the associations of pathography and the adaptive processes. This is a position taken further by Liebert who indicates that art can play an adaptive role in an artist's life due to its capacity to incorporate transferences. This is all well and good if adaptation is defined
as adjustment to the world and environment in a benign and healthy manner. However, if there is an inference that all art performs an adaptive role then it is important to stress that this is not a position I share. There is no argument in this thesis to say that all art is adaptive. Art is many things to many people, psychic insight is only one of its possibilities and there is no insinuation that on this basis art indicates psychic illness. Apparently, the term adaptive, in psychotherapeutic circles, can have this universal interpretation. Nevertheless, across psychology, as a whole, there are many other interpretations of the psychic reasons people make art. Psychoanalysis is but one form of interpretation, albeit an important one in this present era. Yet, even within psychoanalysis there are varied theories on creativity. For example, Winnicott did not accept that adaptation was the only way of interpreting psychoanalytic theory. Within his object-relations view of psychic development he proposed the term "creative living" contained a more positive definition of viewing psychic experience in the creative realm.

e. The importance of object-relations theory to a psychoanalytic theory of aesthetics.

Following Winnicott, Handler Spitz posits that the transitional object and the potential space could well be a source of aesthetic experience and artistic creation. For example, she refers to art as a signifier for loss and desire. Nevertheless, Handler Spitz points out that, in her opinion, Winnicott's original speculations are underdeveloped and that further work is needed to consolidate this position. It will be seen that in the conclusion to this thesis that, on the research presented, I propose a hypothesis that furthers an object-relations view, from an arts perspective, of the art experience.

f. The uses of artworks as transference objects and the connections of transference to art.

This is a theme that is revealed time and time again in chapter two. For example, Kuspit compares Freud's transferent dialogue with his art collection to the interminable and internal dialogue of Freud's self-analysis. He claims that the art objects were, in fact, transference objects to Freud. Then, Vann Spruiell in his discussion of Freud's complex transferent dialogue with "The Moses of Michelangelo" infers that, even though Freud realised he was having a transference relationship with a work of art, he may have been reluctant to admit this due to his dislike for counter-transference.

Other authors, such as Rotenberg, make direct comparisons of transference to an art object. The interminable nature of transferences to and from art is pursued by Handler Spitz and Loewald who both point out that this process is one of overlaying and compounding transferences. Loewald goes so far as to compare this process to the
processes of layering imagery and paint. Indeed, the whole of Handler Spitz's book, *Art and Psyche*, stresses the importance of transference phenomena in the experience of making and viewing art. For example, Handler Spitz indicates that transference is ubiquitous and is valuable to the development and understanding of art. Then again, in *Image and Insight* she argues that transference and counter-transference can flow in a dialogue between artwork and viewer. She views artworks as a living energy fuelled by transference. This will be an important reason for me returning to a discussion of Handler Spitz's text *Art and Psyche* in my final presentation of visual transference in chapter five of this thesis.

From the above presentation, it is reasonable to conclude that transference is crucial to an understanding of psychoanalysis and art's effects. Up to this point, the connections to, and uses of, art and transference have not been sufficiently examined from a fine arts perspective without the implications of psychopathology. In subsequent chapters I posit that, like psychoanalysis, art contains specific potential for transference. Because the transferences exhibited in fine art need have no psychopathological symptoms and can operate creatively and benignly I will argue that it is constructive, in an understanding of fine art, to call them visual transferences.

In the next chapter, it will be seen that, in recent times, the connections of art and psychoanalysis have been, and still are being, considered in the development of art therapy. Once again, transference emerges as a central concept in this relation. Psychoanalysis and art therapy acknowledge the importance of transference to their disciplines and there is a large body of research that connects transference to art. However, even though the visual (and other) arts evidence links to psychoanalytic theory, surprisingly, transference, an area so important to psychoanalysis and art therapy, is a relatively neglected subject.
CHAPTER THREE

A REVIEW OF CONTEMPORARY DATA FROM ART THERAPY SOURCES

Art therapy is in the position of being between two fields: rooted in art, it is a hybrid of cross-fertilisation with psychoanalysis. Thus, it has its roots in art history, aesthetics, in psychoanalysis and psychotherapy (Joy Schaverien).¹

(i)

Introduction

In chapter one it was established that transference occurs outside of the psychoanalytic situation and that objects onto which transferences are made may be manifest symbolic representations of objects from the subject's past. In chapter two I have demonstrated the importance of art in psychoanalytic theory and thought. It emerges clearly that art has been used and is considered by psychoanalysts as a container of transferences. Art therapy is a discipline that uses psychoanalytic theory extensively. In chapter three I will present data that argues for the importance of transference in art therapy. Indeed, it emerges that transferences and the transference relationship are essential features of art therapy. In The Handbook of Art Therapy, a text that I review in chapter three, the following definition positions the importance of transference to its theory and practice:²

Art therapy involves the use of different art media through which a patient can express and work through the issues and concerns that have brought him or her into therapy. The therapist and client are in partnership in trying to understand the art process and

---

² Case and Dalley (1992)
product of the session. For many clients it is easier to relate to the therapist through
the art object which, as a personal statement provides a focus for discussion, analysis
and self evaluation. As it is concrete, it acts as a record of the therapeutic process that
cannot be denied, erased or forgotten and offers possibilities for reflection in the future.

The transference that develops within the relationship between therapist and client also
extends to the art work, giving a valuable "third dimension" or three-way
communication. (1, emphasis added).

Art therapy's scope for therapeutic treatment is as wide as that of psychoanalysis and it
may be applied to people with the most profound and severe mental problems as well as
to those with only mild neurosis or, similar to psychoanalysis, those that are in training
as practitioners. Because art therapy puts great importance on transference it is a
significant and illuminating area for discussion which furthers my hypothesis of visual
transference in the fine arts. To put art therapy in context I will, firstly, give a brief
overview of its history and development as a profession.

(ii)
A Background to Art Therapy

As a profession art therapy is a relatively new endeavour and has only evolved over
approximately the last fifty years. However, the notion that art is an aid to the
understanding and healing of the individual's psyche is not by any means new. In his
essay "Art Therapy and Romanticism", Michael Edwards outlines some legacies and
relationships between art, the psyche and healing over the ages.3 He explains that:

• Religious and spiritual uses of artefacts for teaching, worship, meditation and
  healing purposes have been used since prehistoric times.
• The use of such artforms as dance and theatre in classical antiquity were used to
diagnose certain phobias. He also mentions Plato's and Aristotle's dissertations
  on creativity, madness and the artistic temperament.4

---

4 For an expanded account of Plato's discussion of art and "divine madness" refer to Handler Spitz, Image.
• Complex discourses of the arts have evolved over the ages and have allowed interpretation and criticism of the particular aesthetic and psychological modes relevant to the art concerned.

• Anthropological interpretations of art have developed our understanding of diverse "customs and belief systems".

• The medical "discovery" in the early nineteenth century "that institutionalised psychiatric patients like prisoners before them, sometimes engage in spontaneous art-making" was recognised as psychically significant (77).

• The development of educational theories proposing that art has "a civilising influence upon human behaviour" had an important effect.

• The development of psychological theories of the unconscious by such people as Freud and Jung proposed "methods of recognising unconscious processes in dreams, fantasies and pictorial imagery" (77).

Edwards then discusses art therapy's links to psychoanalysis. In their inception, he writes, psychoanalytic theories were influenced by neoclassicist and Romantic art and philosophy that was dominant in the nineteenth century. Romantic theory in particular was still current at the time Freud began formalising psychoanalytic theory. Edwards gives examples of German and French Romanticism directly affecting the attitudes of physicians in those countries during the nineteenth century and indicates that there is historical record of psychiatrists considering the uses of art in therapy as long ago as 1790.5 Another nineteenth century attitude that influenced the early development of art therapy in the mid-twentieth century was the linking of art with educational and "civilising" benefits for society. Edwards points to John Ruskin's theories in this respect.6

As has been detailed in chapter one of this thesis, Freud produced his theories of psychoanalysis at the same time as he developed his passion for archaeology and its artefacts. Several authors have indicated that the two obsessions of Freud's life, psychoanalysis and archaeology, directly influenced each other and, therefore, entwined the relationship of art to psychoanalysis (e.g. Fuller, Art; Handler Spitz, Art). Then, as Freud further developed psychoanalysis, he wrote several influential texts on art and artists, (eg. Michelangelo, Leonardo da Vinci, Dostoevsky, Thomas Mann, etc.) and throughout the enormous output of his writings there are countless references

5 In particular Edwards points to the work of Johann Christian Reil (1759-1813).

Following on from Freud, many other psychoanalysts have utilised art, artists and art theory to elucidate the theory and practice of psychoanalysis.\(^7\)

Another major influence on art therapy during its development was *analytical psychology* as originated by Carl G. Jung and his followers. Edwards points out that, like Freud, Jung was also influenced by Romantic philosophy. However, Jung utilised painting and drawing in his own self-analysis "and encouraged his patients to do the same, as an essential part of their psychological work with him" (82). Both the theories of Freud and Jung point towards art acting as a medium for communication of conscious and unconscious thought. Their theories have had a major influence on the development of art therapy. Jung's contribution to art therapy will be discussed later in this chapter.

Besides the psychological theories of psychoanalysis and analytical psychology, Caroline Case and Tessa Dalley point out in *The Handbook of Art Therapy* that another motivation for the progression of art therapy has come from education (146). Philosophers such as John Dewey and Herbert Read developed the notion that art, education and therapy were inextricably linked.\(^8\) Their theories directly influenced art education and it is from the areas of psychology (psychoanalysis/analytical psychology) and education that the contemporary art therapist has evolved. Case and Dalley indicate that as art therapy has grown, professional organisations and institutions have recognised the importance that "Most art therapists have an art training" and "all applicants for the various training courses (must) show an on-going commitment to their own art work and its development" (146).

Even though in North America and Britain the formal training of art therapists as a profession has been established over several decades, in some countries, such as Australia, recognised tertiary training is still in its infancy. In recent years art therapy has developed a role closer to that of psychotherapy than of education. This has occurred as art therapists have identified the potential for their therapies being a bridge between conscious and unconscious creativity. In turn, this has initiated a revival of interest in the complex processes described by psychoanalytic theory.

---

\(^7\) Some of the psychoanalysts mentioned in this thesis include, Otto Rank, Melanie Klein, Ernst Kris, Marion Mülner, Donald Winnicott and Ellen Handler Spitz.

The development of art therapy as a distinctive psychotherapeutic practice and a profession in Britain and the USA is explained very well by two recent publications, *Becoming A Profession: the History of Art Therapy in Britain 1940-82* by Diane Waller and *The History of Art Therapy in the United States* by Maxine Borowsky Junge with Paige Pateracki Asawa.9

Waller's book, in large part, is a description of "the struggle of art therapist's to gain professional recognition and validation for their work within the British National Health Service and higher education." (xi). But, more than this, it is also a record of the intellectual and psychological philosophies that have influenced the development of a vital and still evolving dynamic form of psychotherapy. Waller records that in the latter part of the nineteenth century and the first half of the twentieth century psychiatrists began to take an ever increasing interest in the art of the insane, "By the early 1940s the link between art and medicine was firmly established and set to continue" (32). Additionally, going back to the "roots" of art therapy in Britain she describes how, between the two world wars, art therapy began to emerge from a professional and philosophic connection with art education. Waller then discusses its development in the 1940s and 50s through the pioneering work of such people as Adrian Hill and Irene Champernowne in Britain and the writings of Margaret Naumburg in the USA.

Between the 1940s and early 1960s the term "art therapy" began to be used to describe the various approaches to the uses of art with physically and psychologically ill patients. The term appears to have evolved, though in Britain, Waller indicates, Adrian Hill "claims to have coined" it (45-51). Hill, though he had no formal training in psychology or art therapy, was an artist. Whilst seriously ill himself he realised that art was constructive as an occupational therapy. He began introducing it at the hospital in which he was a patient and then with mounting support at other hospitals. Hill published the book *Art versus Illness* in 1945 and did much to promote and encourage the values he saw in art therapy. In 1963 he became the first vice-president of the British Association of Art Therapists (BAAT).

Other early pioneers in the development of art therapy in Britain include Edward Adamson, Rita Simon and Gilbert and Irene Champernowne. Adamson and Simon, like Hill, became involved with art therapy "by accident". However, in the case of the Champernownes, especially Irene, their background was based in a deep interest in Jungian psychology. The Champernownes went on in 1942 to establish the

---

Withymead Centre which, as a psychotherapeutic community, practised art therapy on Jungian lines. The Champernownes and Withymead was to have a significant influence on the development of art therapy in Britain from the 1940s to the 1960s. The other main sphere of intellectual and theoretical influence to emerge in art therapy in the 1950s was that of psychoanalysis. Interest in the application of psychoanalytic theory to art was generated, in the main, by Donald Winnicott, Marion Milner and Ralph Pickford. I discuss Winnicott's and Milner's work elsewhere in this thesis. Pickford was a psychologist also practising as a psychotherapist using psychoanalytic principles and art in combination. In 1967 he published *Studies in Psychiatric Art* which reflected his uses of psychoanalysis in art therapy. Pickford became a founder member of BAAT.

Art therapy in Britain took its first tentative steps towards professional organisation and recognition with working parties that commenced in 1949. Waller describes the first stages of the complex and intriguing struggle that culminated, over a fourteen year period, in the formation of BAAT in 1964. The period following the establishment of BAAT, according to Waller, up until 1982 when her study ends, was one of dynamic growth, political struggle and professional consolidation. Initially, BAAT aligned itself with the National Union of Teachers (NUT) with one of its aims being the gaining a salaried professional status for art therapists similar to that of adult education lecturers. As Waller records, "For many years, an art teaching qualification formed part of the membership requirements of the professional association, which was for ten years a central association of the National Union of Teachers." (16). Negotiations got under way in the late 1960s and early 1970s to establish the correct criteria for the professional status and registration of art therapists. However, after ten years of central association with the NUT the BAAT decided it would be necessary to, reluctantly, sever these links. Nevertheless, relations with the NUT remained cordial and BAAT went on to establish its affiliation to the Association of Scientific, Technical and Managerial Staff (ASTMS) in 1976. At the same time BAAT was building on its professional strengths and status in other spheres. Education and training was becoming more organised. Colleges such as St. Albans School of Art (later called Hertfordshire College of Art), in the late 1960s, and Goldsmiths College, the University of London, in the mid-1970s, began operating professional level courses in art therapy.

BAAT aimed to improve the status of art therapy within the health care professions. Art therapy in the 1970s was an occupation that required just one or two years

---

undergraduate training. However, philosophically and practically, art therapists in Britain and the USA had realised for many years that, in general, it was essential for art therapists to have a thorough education as artists before embarking on study to become an art therapist. This realisation became a requirement and prolonged the period of education and training to four years undergraduate study followed by a minimum one or two years post-graduate training. This had the effect of helping to consolidate recognition of professional status for art therapists in Britain. The push to link art therapist's salaries to those of adult education lecturers had not been successful and so in the 1970s, with ASTMS, BAAT decided to attempt recognition in the National Health Service (NHS) and by 1982 they had established this.

What becomes clear in Waller's account of the development of art therapy as a distinct profession in Britain is the determination, vision and belief a few committed people had. Waller and her colleagues in BAAT believed in the benefits that the establishment of a viable and strong professional status for art therapists would give to health care in Britain as a whole. Though the campaign for recognition has been hard and long, and is on-going, the achievements of British art therapy have been considerable.

Similar to the concerted effort in Britain, the evolution of art therapy in the USA as a discrete and strong profession over the last fifty years has been a story of commitment to the value of art in psychotherapeutic treatment and peoples lives as a whole. *A History of Art Therapy in the United States* by Maxine Borowsky Junge and Paige Pateracki Asawa tends to record the individual personalities, philosophies, influences and major contributors that have shaped art therapy in the United States. Notwithstanding the difference in emphasis, the books do have many similarities in their lineal descriptions of the historical development of art therapy in their respective countries. Interestingly though, the different emphasis in each book does perhaps highlight the influences that environment, location and personalities can and do have on the development of a profession and a therapy. For example, in post-war Britain the introduction of a socialist welfare policy led to the development of the National Health Service. Consequently, for art therapy to be recognised amongst health professionals and society generally it was identified, by those involved in its development, that acceptance and registration within the National Health Service would be essential. This necessity, linked to Britain's geographical differences compared to those of the USA, possibly enabled art therapists to network and negotiate a remarkable progression in professional status. The United States, on the other hand, being a very large country with a free market orientated economy made up of many states, produced quite a different emphasis on development. Responsibility for development and organisation of art therapy in the USA appears to have relied on the efforts of comparatively isolated
individuals, or groups, in some cases, unaware for many years of the work being carried out in different parts of the country. However, the development of the profession that the two books present reflects the essential need for art in the psychotherapeutic therapies of those countries.

Junge and Asawa record the development of art therapy in the USA from its early influences in the 1900s to 1994. Special emphasis is put on how important the organisation of the American Art Therapy Association (AATA) has been and their book, in part, was written to commemorate AATA's formation in 1969. Since then AATA has:

... established professional standards which provide[d] a basis for the national registration of art therapists; developed guidelines for academic, clinical and institute training programs; and instituted a procedure whereby those training programs meeting specific education guidelines could receive AATA's endorsement as "Approved" programs. Originally organised around educational and clinical issues, AATA has increasingly moved into the political arena to fight for art therapists on matters such as state licensing, inclusion in civil service job classifications, and insurance for art therapy services (261).

Concurrent with AATA's development has been the organisation of educational programs in art therapy. There is some dispute over whether the first art therapy course started in 1957 at the University of Louisville, or 1967 at Hahnemann Hospital. Nevertheless, since then, art therapy courses in the United States have proliferated, "By 1992 there were 32 academic training programs nationwide and a number of well respected institute and hospital based clinical programs as well." (277). Reflecting this situation there were over 4,200 members of AATA in 1994 (277). Junge and Asawa trace early theoretical influences in art therapy to psychoanalysis and education. They point out that in the United States psychoanalysis still underpins the majority of art therapy practise and theory. They discuss the impact of Freud's visit to the USA in 1909 and the lasting importance Freudian theory has had on "Western thought" and intellectual practice. The American psychoanalyst A.A. Brill translated Freud's *The Interpretation of Dreams in 1913* and it was Brill who analysed Margaret Naumburg whom Junge and Asawa refer to as "the mother of art therapy" (22).

Margaret Naumburg, together with her sister Florence Cane, founded the Walden School in 1915. The school was progressive and influenced by educators such as John Dewey, Jean Piaget and Maria Montessori. Emphasis was put on the contribution art
could make to the child's overall expressiveness, personal development and communication skills. Naumburg and Cane had backgrounds in art, education and psychoanalysis. It is from these beginnings that they formed their concepts of the therapeutic uses of art.

Another important influence in the development of art therapy in the USA was that of Edith Kramer. Arriving from Czechoslovakia in 1938 Kramer established a polarity in theory between art therapists that continues to this day. Kramer like Naumburg was influenced by psychoanalysis. However, Naumburg viewed art as an aid to psychotherapy, whereas, Kramer viewed art as therapy in itself (6-7). This, at first, might seem a subtle distinction but its implications, or at least the way Naumburg and Kramer interpreted them, has produced a focus for debate by art therapists about the role of art therapy. Essentially, Naumburg put less emphasis on the art product of the therapy session and any aesthetic value it might have and more on the part in the process of psychotherapy that art can play. Kramer, on the other hand, valued the aesthetic and therapeutic quality of the art process. She viewed this, matched with the aesthetic quality of the finished artwork, as giving the client/artist the potential of sublimating their problems in the production of art. Art, therefore, to Kramer became a healing agent in itself, whereas, for Naumburg art was an adjunct to psychotherapy.

Other important personalities in the forming of art therapy in the USA include Mary Huntoon, Don James, Elinor Ulman, Hana Yaxa Kwiatkowska and Myra Levick. Elinor Ulman financed and edited the very first art therapy journal in the USA. Initially in 1961 it was called The Bulletin of Art Therapy, then, in 1970 it changed to The American Journal of Art Therapy. This publication served as a lifeline for art therapists across North America and was, along with AATA, one of the fundamental building blocks of dialogue and professionalism in art therapy.

Due to the influence of psychoanalysis in American art therapy, transference was recognised by Naumburg, Kramer, Ulman and Levick as an important feature of art therapy from its earliest days. According to Junge and Asawa, "Naumburg thought that art therapy always took place within the transference relationship and that evidence of the transference feelings could be seen in both the visual and verbal communication" (163-164). Levick sided more with Naumburg's position and believed transference was a constructive aid to the therapeutic relationship. Kramer and Ulman, however, believed that transference was directed more towards the artwork than the therapeutic relationship. Even so, they acknowledged that, at times, transference and counter-transference relations occur between client and therapist. Similar to art therapy in Britain object-relations theory has also influenced developments in America. This is
reflected, for example, in the work of Arthur who has written extensively on its uses in art therapy (337-338). Once again, transference is important to his working method and theoretical base. Junge and Asawa point out that to Robbins:

... the artwork is a safe container for transference issues which are defined by the early development of object relationships. These issues are reconstructed and resolved in the artwork. Early object-relations are frequently coloured with loss, annihilation, pain and love (200).

The importance of transference also features in the work of Judith Rubin another important contributor to American art therapy:

The concept of transference is a useful one for an art therapist to know, and is quite congenial, for it is simply an extension of the human sphere of what is already suspected about the meaning of artistic symbols (Child Art Therapy [1978]).

Rubin sees transference as constructive in the therapeutic relationship and the artwork.

An impressive feature of Junge and Asawa's book is the extensive and inclusive objectives it sets. Besides looking at mainstream psychoanalytic theory in art therapy it also reviews "alternative perspective's". Phenomenology, Gestalt theory, cognitive theory, transpersonal psychology, Jungian theory and even psychocybernetics are all briefly discussed. Interestingly, Junge and Asawa also consider the effects of "the Women's Movement as an influence on art therapy" (270). They reflect that in the USA, as in other countries, art therapists have been and are predominantly women. They posit that art therapy has emerged as "one of the most important new mental health professions" concurrent with positive developments in the women's movements. They argue that as women have strived for recognition and equality in society and the workplace there has been a liberated and intensified interest in art generally and specifically when applied to psychic health. In art therapy women have asserted their professional expertise and their positive contribution to the welfare of the respective countries in which they work (270).
Myra Levick's article, "Transference and Counter-Transference as Manifested in Graphic Productions" illustrates how an art therapist who is also a teacher of art therapy techniques views transference from a psychoanalytic perspective.11 In the paper Levick proposes that drawing, during psychotherapeutic treatment by both patient and therapist, facilitates a direct and "concrete" form of visual free association that contains transferences by both patient and therapist "that can not be denied" (204). An important advantage of drawing, Levick claims, is that it quickens the therapeutic process. Drawing explains and documents the transferences in a way that traditional verbal psychotherapy cannot. Having said this, it is interesting to note that in some examples of treatment given in this article utilising drawing, the treatment still seems to spread over several years. It will be noted as well that Levick writes not only of the patient's transferences but also of the therapist's, which as I have described are called counter-transferences. Increasingly, counter-transference has come to be seen as a constructive element in the development of the therapeutic relationship Levick goes on to point out that, to some extent, transference phenomena occur in everyday life and that sometimes it is an objective of treatment to explain this to clients by getting them to draw people they relate to in their lives.

As a teacher on a "graduate training program for art therapists" Levick gives examples of methods used to explain transference related phenomena to her students (205). As an aspect of their training her students were given classroom exercises or projects which were used as the basis for discussion around concepts of transference. However, it must be pointed out that there is no intention to indicate that students of art therapy receive therapy from their teachers or supervisors in these circumstances.12

Levick gives examples from her own practise of transference phenomena occurring in the artwork of client and therapist in cases that spread over many months and in some cases several years. Her survey describes clients from the mainstream of life and include a "professional artist", a young man "very sophisticated in psychological terminology" and others with various degrees of neurosis. It is interesting to note the

---


12 As is made clear by Case and Dalley in *The Handbook of Art Therapy* (167-170) a clear division between the objective task of training and any personal material a student may need to work through with a therapist is maintained. A supervisor or teacher does not act as a therapist for a student.
range of transference material presented in both the drawings of client and therapist. A common thread to all the work produced in the therapeutic sessions was that it was spontaneous. Sometimes, clients and therapist intended to draw one thing but found themselves drawing something quite different. Additionally, the drawings often related to identifiable dreams. Levick concludes that the potential of drawing in the therapeutic process "to facilitate the awareness of transference and counter-transference feelings and their connections to early childhood experiences" (215). Levick comments that in some therapeutic situations the drawings of both client and therapist are useful in the process of therapy. Furthermore, she believes that in the training of art therapists it is constructive to give students explanatory exercises in the uses of drawing to identify transference and counter-transference reactions in client and therapist.

Another contribution by Myra Levick is in the paper "Transference and Countertransference in Art Therapy" is a collection of papers from the 12th Annual Conference of the American Art Therapy Association.13 In this presentation the contributors discuss the question "What is the place of art in art therapy?" (3). The replies illustrate varying degrees of influence from psychoanalysis. Furthermore, what all contributors share is a conviction about the importance of transference in the artwork produced during art therapy. Elinor Ulman, views art therapy very much from a psychoanalytic perspective and begins by pointing out that, "Transference is ubiquitous, for we all bring to every new encounter attitudes and expectations stemming from our past experiences with people" (5). Ulman goes on to point out that:

Art therapists who are really expert in their own province can offer something that psychoanalysts and other kinds of specialists in the "talking cures" cannot: the opportunity to experience the kind of functioning that is possible only in the process of making art works and to gain insights that may be obtained through this kind of experience and in no other way. With this end in view the art therapist must indeed understand transference and know how to deal with it (5).

One of the main differences between classical psychoanalysis and art therapy that Ulman identifies is the use of counter-transference. Ulman indicates that whereas a Freudian analyst withholds his or her counter-transferential feelings to engender a transference neurosis within the client the art therapist reveals their counter-transferences, often in the artwork, to promote a "therapeutic alliance" with the client.

Ulman's approach therefore suggests a therapy based on "positive" rather than "negative" transferences.

Arthur Robbins again views art therapy from a psychoanalytic perspective and in his account he emphasises an object-relations and Kleinian approach. Robbins stresses the use of art in art therapy but points out that the way it is used in treatment will differ from case to case. Sometimes the role of the therapist will be that of a silent facilitator, unobtrusively observing, approving empathically. At other times, a much more active and involved approach may be required, where, for example, the therapist plays a parental and directing role. "Art becomes the bridge for deep communications" Robbins asserts... "There is a parallel here between the creative and therapeutic processes between a relationship mediated by deep non-verbal symbols and the work of these experiences" (7). As with Ulman, counter-transference is very much a feature of Robbin's therapeutic method, and he indicates the involved level on which client and therapist work, pointing out the inherent dangers for the therapist in the apparent closeness:

We have then a symbolic dialogue in which both patient and therapist struggle with their respective ghosts and demons. It is hoped that art therapists will be more in charge of the process than their patients, but therapists should not fool themselves with false notions of professionalism or objectivity. By the very nature of their professions, art therapists, more than other members of the therapeutic team, are especially vulnerable to the primitive, non-verbal messages that constitute so large a part of communication... Countertransference reactions are often unavoidable as art therapists move with their patients into deep, uncharted non-verbal territory where their own past fears are invariably touched upon regardless of how much personal treatment they have undergone... Both therapist and patient are in treatment within any given art therapy relationship, each struggling with his or her particular attachments to the past and emotional responses to the other (7).

For Robbins, transference and counter-transference are an indispensable part of art making in the therapeutic relationship and it is clearly the art that promotes the most profound insights and transferences.

Judith A. Rubin, another adherent of psychoanalytic technique opens her essay with a number of direct statements:

I view the role of transference in art therapy from the vantage point of an art therapist and a trainee in adult and child analysis. I have not the slightest doubt that transference
is ubiquitous, present in all human relationships to a greater or lesser degree... I believe the concept of transference parallels what art therapists already know about symbolism in visual expression. Just as colour or image can stand for something because of an individual's past experience, so do people project ideas and feelings onto other human beings. Given our need to make sense out of experience, we tend to fill in what we don't know about any new person, just as we tend to complete a visual "Gestalt". The conditions that facilitate transference reactions are much like those that foster the emergence of personal material in art (10).

As opposed to the previous two contributors, Rubin believes the role of the art therapist should be as neutral as possible. Nevertheless, she concedes that due to the facilitating, empathic and relational role of the therapist in treatment this is not always feasible. Transference, she posits, affects the totality of the therapeutic relationship and, in these circumstances, counter-transference is inevitable. However, it is the art produced in therapy that allows the best possibilities for expressive and unique forms of transference. Rubin indicates that the recognition of transference in the art, by the client, in some cases, can lead to the client using art as a sublimative activity. However, she points out that, the therapist's counter-transference, if mishandled by the therapist, may obstruct the client acknowledging their own psychic situation and taking control of it, therefore, she cautions against the inappropriate use of counter-transference. Rubin posits that art therapists, in the main, are artists in their own right and, consequently, have the opportunity to work through their (counter-)transferences, if needs be, in their own artwork away from the therapeutic situation. Clearly, in this paper, Rubin argues that transference is apparent in the separate art work of client and therapist and that each is valid as a psychic organisational process. In her summary Rubin contends:

Transference is a powerful phenomenon that, when attended to, can be used for understanding and as an agent for change. The greatest danger, I believe, lies in ignoring it (12).

Christine W. Wang's paper makes a strong case for transferential feelings being contained within the images of both art therapist and client. Similarly to the previous contributors, her view is one determined by psychoanalysis, though she goes further

14 Definition of sublimation: "Developmental process...by which instinctual ENERGIES ... are discharged...in non-instinctual forms of behaviour. The process involves (a) displacement of energy from activities and objects of primary (biological) interest on to those of lesser instinctual interest; (b) transformation of the quality of the EMOTION accompanying the activity such that it becomes "deseexualised" and "deaggressified"... and (c) liberation of the activity from the dictates of instinctual TENSION - Some definitions include a social element, viz. that true sublimations are socially acceptable." (Rycroft 159)
than them in advocating the use of counter-transferential feelings and the use of collaborative artwork with her clients. Wang proposes that there is a phenomenon that she refers to as graphic transference. To illustrate this she gives examples of the artwork of two of her clients. Both clients, she claims, show the clear signs of transference in the work (16).

Though acknowledging that the techniques of interpreting and using transference have been gained from psychoanalytic insights, Wang differentiates between art therapy and psychoanalytic therapy. Psychoanalysis brings to a head psychic conflicts in the transference neurosis, whilst art therapy overcomes anxiety through visual 'symbolic activity" and the freeing of "creative expression". Each method of treatment, Wang claims, has its own contribution to make. For this reason Wang ends her paper by making a number of recommendations to be included in the training of art therapists. The recommendations essentially call for a clear understanding of psychoanalytic theory and transference. In particular:

Students should be encouraged to continue their own art expression in order to better empathise with their patients' task and to become aware of counter-transferential feelings via their expression in graphic form (17).

Like the previous contributors Gladys Agell acknowledges the importance of Freudian psychoanalysis and the phenomenon of transference. However, Agell, as an art therapist, gives central position to art in her practice. For her, the importance of art is that it is able to incorporate and store the transference for analysis by the therapist and client. This has a very important double value that conventional psychotherapies do not have. Firstly, it enables the therapist to remain detached from direct transference feelings (as they are contained in the artwork), therefore, allowing the therapist to concentrate on empathy and gratification for the client. Secondly, it promotes a situation for the client to see the art work as sublimational activity, enabling a move towards ego control of the client's anxieties:

Since the canvas, the art material, bears the brunt of the transference, the art therapist is free to explore the art work with the client, giving recognition to the transference (as revealed in both the manifest and latent content of the art), at the same time applauding the transformation of primary process material (19).

This role is vitally different to a psychoanalyst's whose aim is to re-live the psychic conflict within the analyst/analysand relationship, encouraging transferences to engender a transference-neurosis in the analysis. The "double role" of psychoanalyst
can promote positive and negative effects, whereas for the art therapist, the transferences are contained in the art work enabling a "detached, co-operative position" to develop between client and therapist. The strengthening of the therapeutic alliance in this way, Agell posits, enables both client and therapist to concentrate on the art, the transferences it contains and resolution of the client's psychic problems (19).

The penultimate contributor to the article "Transference and Countertransference in Art Therapy" is Laurie Wilson. Wilson's account, similar to that of Agell's, stresses the role of art in the art therapy process:

... given the fact that the art therapist plays an active and autonomous role during the session ... handing out supplies, receiving products and giving technical assistance when necessary ... it is the art materials (the empty canvas and unformed clay) that actually serve as the blank screen for the patient to project onto. The art work thus becomes the equivalent of what is a transference neurosis in psychoanalysis. For those who know how to read pictorial and sculptural expression, it is a guide to the patient's psychological state, the one essential guide for the art therapist's interventions (21).

Wilson, again heavily influenced by psychoanalytic theory, tends to view art therapy from an object-relations base. She begins by pointing out that not all relationships of client to art therapist are transferential and differentiates between responses of empathy between art therapist and client, built up in the therapeutic alliance, and those that include transference phenomena. Wilson reminds the reader that both can occur and that the art therapist is to be aware of how to identify the differences between each. What is important, she asserts, is that non-transferential feelings are dealt with in the empathy of the therapeutic alliance and transferential feelings are contained and dealt with in the art work. This direction of empathic and transferential energy should be directed by the art therapist. For this reason, Wilson argues that counter-transference can be a harmful and distracting aspect of the art therapist's activities and should be discouraged. She points out that avoiding becoming enmeshed in counter-transferential feelings is difficult for the experienced (and psychoanalytically trained) art therapist but is positively dangerous for the student or new practitioner of art therapy. This is because if counter-transferential feelings emerge, they can, if not understood, overwhelm the art therapist and adversely affect the outcome of treatment. The focus in art therapy is on helping the client and if counter-transference gets out of hand it could interfere with, or possibly seriously distort, the outcome of therapy.

Wilson suggests that comparisons can be made between the client that physically comprehends art materials and tools as part of him or herself and the professional artist,
"who must use particular tools because the tools seem to have magical qualities and have become for these artists extensions of themselves" (21). Likewise, she suggests, some clients look upon their artwork as "a gift" for the art therapist, whilst some professional artists look upon their work as a "gift to the world". Both sets of events, when viewed from an object-relations base, reveal the investment of deep psychic content in art and its materials. Moreover, Wilson writes that perhaps the most direct form of psychic phenomena occurs in artwork when the client or professional artist invests the artwork with emotions connected with people:

Artists identify in some measure with almost all of the artwork they make, but there are times when the art products seem to stand not for the artist but for someone else (21).

Wilson reports that this most often happens to art therapy clients when they are given the opportunity to work in a self-directed and spontaneous mode,

In these instances the symbolic imagery is fuelled by feelings from the past re-experienced in the present. In such cases, I think the art work itself becomes the object of transference (21).

In the last essay from this article Janie L. Rhyne presents the reader with the only argument against the misguided use of transference theory in art therapy. Yet, even in this essay, Rhyne concedes that there are definitely occasions when transference occurs. Rhyne's position is that she objects to the general application of the notion of transference to any and every art therapeutic problem. She sees the danger of the theory of transference being applied as an excuse for not having a thorough understanding of the "here and now" relationship of therapist to client. In other words, by attributing the client's reactions in treatment to "formative figures" in the clients past, the art therapist may be using theory as a reason for avoiding solid research and pastoral care of the client's individual situation (22). Likewise, an undue fear of counter-transference "contaminating" a therapeutic relationship is seen by Rhyne as inhibiting the normal interaction of human relationships and so, therefore, is questionable in a procedure that is meant to be co-operative. On this basis, Rhyne begins her essay by arguing that there is a survey required of what art therapists mean when they use the term "transference". For example, are they actually just implying the normal transference of thought between the present and our interactions with the past that common sense tells us we all partake in? Or, are art therapists consciously applying the psychoanalytic definitions of transference to each and every instance? If
either is the case to the exclusion of the other then, Rhyne fears, the art therapist might be missing the point central to what she sees as the practice of art therapy:

We can bring into our work as therapists intuitive understanding gained from our own struggles and excitements as artists. We can identify with our client's efforts to create visual referents to deeper reality. Art therapy goes beyond literal interpretation.

In my thinking art therapy offers a special kind of therapeutic understanding. An art therapist's role is not that of an analyst; it should be more like that of a fellow artist, one who has special training in comprehending another's imagery and in clarifying communications that are difficult to put into words. (An) art therapist's special competence lies in recognising how their client's imagery makes sense and in guiding the clients toward an awareness of how they create their personal reality.

In my view the art therapist makes and maintains contact with clients through acceptance of interpretations made by the one who created the art in the first place (22).

Therefore, like contributors before her, Rhyne puts central importance on communications gained through the artwork. However, unlike the previous contributors Rhyne does not interpret through an exclusively psychoanalytic perspective. She concedes that transferences are contained in artwork but feels strongly that there are other levels of emotional activity in the artwork as well. Discussion of this last essay by Janie L. Rhyne concludes my review of the article "Transference and Countertransference in Art Therapy".

In the next article, by Beth A. Althofer, "Uses of Sensory Images in the Therapeutic Interaction" I return to a psychoanalyst's account of transference. This is not the view of an art therapist. However, as this article discusses a psychoanalyst's use of 'sensory imagery" I believe it makes relevant links to both art and art therapy experience.

Althofer's use of analogous art and psychoanalytic terms such as image, picture, shape, frame, etc., resonates with earlier discussion (in chapter 2) of the marked associations of the psychoanalytic process/relationship to that of the art process/relationship. However, in Althofer's opinion there is "an important distinction... between psychoanalytic therapy and an aesthetic or art form." (47). For Althofer, even though

there are many comparisons between art and psychoanalytic modes, such as, the possibilities of "progressional" and sublimational activity, empathic response, free play with imagery and the development of "deeply personal and idiosyncratic languages", etc., the main difference is in the public nature of art and the private nature of the therapeutic relationship.

On top of the above concerns, Althofer's paper also discusses the 'sensory imagery" of psychoanalytic communication and interaction. By sensory imagery Althofer means that which is visually imagined in the minds of the analyst and analysand during treatment. What is so interesting about Althofer's view of the uses of sensory imagery is how they compare to Freud's late view of the development of thought-transference. For Althofer, having access to the sensory imagery of the analysand's transference, and of her own counter-transference, not only enriches the psychoanalytic experience but also gives a depth of insight that can be achieved in no other way. This parallels to Freud's views on telepathic thought-transference. Althofer gives the example of an analyst/analysand relationship in which she and her client were psychically exchanging the same sensory transferential images quite unbeknown to themselves until the transference material was analysed by Althofer.16 In Althofer's case, the use of sensory imagery in psychoanalysis sanctions her use of counter-transference. In fact, she argues, inter-personal sensory imagery relies on counter-transferential material. Althofer reports that sensory imagery can be triggered by the analysand's "transference attitude" which might be displayed in the behaviour and appearance of the analysand:

... her transference attitude of the moment, reaches me through a Gestalt composed of visual and kinaesthetic, rhythmic, postural, facial, gestural and behavioural cues (49).

Through the process, and careful analysis of the treatment, recognition of thematic and interpersonal imagery emerges from the minds of both analyst and analysand. Althofer indicates that in the process of an analysis (which may last months or years),

16 The concept of "thought-transference" which Althofer's experience parallels first makes its appearance in Freud's late writings on transference. As Freud's theories of psychoanalysis evolved, the importance of transference grew. In "Dreams and Occultism", he reports on his observations concerning thought-transference: "the phenomenon of thought-transference, which is so close to telepathy and can indeed without much violence be regarded as the same thing... claims that mental processes in one person - ideas, emotional states, conative impulses - can be transferred to another person through empty space without employing the familiar methods of communication by means of words and signs" (69). In the same essay Freud goes on, in great detail, to report on one of many instances of thought-transference in his own analytic experience and concludes: "I must confess that I have a feeling that here too the scales weigh in favour of thought-transference. Moreover, I am certainly not alone in having been in the position of experiencing "occult" events like this in the analytic situation. Helene Deutsch published some similar observations in 1926 and studied the question of their being determined by the transference relations between patient and analyst." (84). Sigmund Freud, "Dreams and Occultism," New Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis, trans. James Strachey, eds. James Strachey, Angela Richards (London: Pelican 1988) 60-87.
sensory imagery is thematic. Though it may evolve, it will have common threads for both analyst and analysand. As the personal language of the analysis grows the sensory images "will repeat themselves, with infinite variations on the same themes, over and over again" (55). As we have seen, art therapists advocate that transferences are contained in artworks. Following through the trajectory of both Althofer's position and the theories of art therapy would indeed suggest that an interactive transferential response is possible between artist, artwork and viewer.

In "The Struggle for Self-Cohesion: An Analytically Oriented Art Therapy Case Study" by Arthur Robbins examines the potential for art work in a therapeutic session to generate mirror transferences. In the earlier essay by Robbins he emphasises an object-relations approach to art therapy and stresses the unavoidable interaction of transference and counter-transference in the therapeutic situation (qtd. in Agell et al. 3-24). In the present article, Robbins furthers this position by discussing the role of the mirror transference in treatment. By mirror transference Robbins means "that patient and therapist alike can view the complex and unique self as it is mirrored in the patient's art." (107 emphasis added). Robbins relates this property of the art therapeutic process to the role of art and artist in society:

... the artist attempts to organize dimensions of form, color, space, depth and shading.
Since the gestalt principle that the whole is more meaningful than its independent components is inherent in all visual organization, a work of art can capture the dimensions of the self and transcend the limitation of words (107).

However, for Robbins, the intensity of the mirror transference in art therapy allowed by imagery is different to that of general art processes, as by its nature, the art therapeutic process is an intimate relationship where the empathic responses of counter-transference correspond to an object-relations mode, close to Winnicott's notion of a "transitional or potential space". Before giving a prolonged report of an example of "mirroring" in his own practice, Robbins "identifies six principles that summarise the mirroring process" (107). The first of these stresses that it is the client's artwork that stimulates and reflects "the patient/therapist interaction". The second emphasises that the "transitional space" created between therapist and client is psychic and non-verbal. The third concerns the inter-relatedness of visual and sensory mirroring. The fourth concerns the psychoanalytic content of the artwork that becomes manifest during


18 The concept of sensory mirroring is related to that of 'sensory imagery" as discussed in the review of the previous article: Althofer 47-55.
therapy. The fifth points out that the mirror transference does not preclude the normal emotional interaction of therapist and client. Whilst the sixth principle points out the need of the therapist's empathy to facilitate constructive therapy (107).

In the case study put forward as an example of mirroring we learn that it developed over a period of treatment lasting four years and that for over two of those years the method of treatment was not art therapeutic but verbal and close to traditional psychoanalytic lines. Apparently, it was in frustration that Robbins resorted to the use of art therapy with the client discussed. Where conventional verbal therapy had failed, the process of transference emerging through the artwork provided a key for psychic interaction, which eventuated in the client's recovery from neurosis. It is interesting to note that over the period of art therapy, not only did the client's health improve, but also his means of visual communication. His first images, though powerful, were crude and repressed. The client was not an artist. However, later images reveal a level of confidence in visual communication not apparent in the early drawings. Robbins discusses, and gives visual examples, of how the artwork utilised in the therapeutic session related both to the client's fantasies and to his dreams, therefore putting the visual imagery well within the realms of psychoanalytic interpretation.

In conclusion, Robbins points out that art therapy does not work for all of his clients and that each might require a different approach to achieve a balance in their psyches. However, in the case discussed, the imagery and symbols in the artwork stimulated and reflected powerful transferences in a way that words alone could not:

Crucial in the facilitation of Bob's inner life finding expression in his outside behaviour was the development of the mirror transference through art. Where words alone seemed to encourage repetition of Bob's sterile early childhood experience, the non-verbal medium of art permitted a profound connection necessary to transform stagnant sessions into exciting and magical worlds where the discovery of new paths was possible. The patient and therapist rediscovered the lost parts of the self through a mutual psychic adventure. A mirroring transference must have the dimensionality of vision of a good work of art so that this rediscovery can take place (118 - emphasis added).

It is interesting to note the similarities in approach between Althofer and Robbins. In the first instance, Althofer uses "sensory imagery" in a psychoanalytic setting. In the second, Robbins, as an art therapist, is familiar with utilising both sensory and art imagery. Yet, both emphasise the unique relationship of transference to the image.
*Pictures at an Exhibition: Selected Essays on Art and Art Therapy*, presents a wide range of essays on two related areas, psychoanalytic views of the arts and the practical application of psychoanalytic, psycho-therapeutic and art theory to art therapy and related issues (Gilroy and Dalley). The contributors to the book include artists, art theoreticians, art therapists and professionals working in the arts, health care and education areas. The one thing they all have in common is a deep interest in the power of visual imagery to act constructively on the psyche. It explores present day thinking about the capacity of art to help individuals "understand both the natural world and the inner world of the psyche rather than a wish to escape from either" (xi). Part one, Gilroy and Dalley posit, "is primarily concerned with the different ways in which the theories of psychoanalysis may be used to assist an understanding of imagery," whilst part two "is based on the theory and practice of art therapy" (xv). Taken as a whole the book gives the reader the opportunity to understand some of the lively debate, ideas and interests that infuse the art therapy profession today.

Even though Gilroy and Dalley point out that the book centres around psychoanalytic theories it also discusses other psychological theory as well. This reflects the influences that have shaped art therapy and continue to shape it professionally today. In this regard Anthony Storr remarks how the "book bears ample witness to how far the limitations of Freud's original formulations about art and artists have been transcended by modern theorists and practitioners." (xi). Storr also points out the contribution of Carl Jung to art therapy... "Jung may justly be called the founding father of art therapy" (xi) and this reference to Jungian concepts is reflected by a number of authors in this text.

In "Mother and Child in Henry Moore and Winnicott" Peter Fuller illustrates parallels between Moore's art and Winnicott's theories. Fuller's essay is not an attempt at "interpreting" Moore's sculpture "and telling you what it is "really about" as if Moore was mentally ill or disturbed (6). Fuller sees these uses of psychoanalysis as "obsolete" as art by itself "is not a symptom". Rather, Fuller's essay attempts to reveal similarities in the "insights and the vision" of two esteemed practitioners in their own respective fields of endeavour.

An important point of contact between the two mens interests is made by Fuller when he outlines the three recurring themes in Moore's sculpture. These were, as Moore said himself, the mother and child, the reclining figure and interior/exterior forms. The resonance of these themes is clear to those familiar with psychoanalytic concepts and practice. However, in particular, the mother and child theme for Moore was the most
"fundamental obsession" (8). Fuller points out that here there is a clear linking to Winnicott's object-relations theories which, as we know, were based around the relationships of mother and child and were part of his everyday practice. Another point of comparison between the two men's views is made by Fuller when he writes about their respective concerns for "form and content" in their work. In the case of Winnicott Fuller sees this as an aesthetic striving for "balance and proportion" in his writing and theory. Winnicott was undoubtedly interested in the source of the aesthetic and in such essays as "The Location of Cultural Experience" he made links between the arts and his theories. The concern for form and content is also very apparent in Moore's work and Fuller reflects that the two men shared a vision of proportion and balance in their work and lives which informed their sense of reality and adaptation to life itself. For Fuller, Moore exemplifies Winnicott's view of the naturalness of art and artistic creativity and reflects that object-relations theory indicates "there is no necessary link between artistic creativity and neurosis, nor between genius and psychosis" (10). To be specific, Fuller ties Winnicott's theories to Moore's motivation and aspects of his sculpting. He relates the much told story of Moore's childhood memory of massaging his mother's back and Moore connecting this to his unconscious needs to sculpt. Fuller sees clear resonance here to the broad base of Winnicott's object-relations theory. Fuller suggests that this one conscious memory summarises many more unconscious and earlier memories for Moore.

He goes on to make other links between Moore and Winnicott. Referring to Winnicott's concept of transitional phenomena Fuller proposes that Moore had an intuitive relation to this in his striving to be true to the material he was working with. He proposes that Moore recognised the need to create "the moment of illusion" between concrete sensation and latent memory within his work. Inside the object must be held a magical omnipotence. This was achieved by a transitional quality in the sculpture's manufacture hovering between abstract form and physical material. Fuller then develops the argument of analogy between Moore's sculpture and Winnicott's theories by referring to formal conventions in Moore's sculpture such as the holes and spaces within forms, the predilection for "interior-exterior forms....of one form enclosing another" (13). Fuller posits that these devices of Moore's sculptural vocabulary might indicate a further attempt at intuitive linking to the transitional phenomena of his childhood and the merging of internal and external environments. Fuller again sees these links between form and content in Moore's prolific series of 'stringed figures'. Winnicott recorded that in a case study string had metaphorical connections to transitional phenomena and Fuller suggests that, here again, Moore could be intuitively, or unconsciously, making contact with deep and latent sensations.
Besides Fuller's reference to Moore's sculptures he also claims that parallels to Winnicott's theories of transitional phenomena can be found in Moore's drawing. Fuller cites as examples Moore's technique of "transformation drawing" and the series of some of his most famous drawings of the underground bomb shelters completed when he was an official war artist. These drawings, invariably of women and children, dealt with concepts of fusion, transformation and the now perennial themes of mother and child.

As a final comparison of Moore's sculpture as visually analogous to Winnicott's theories Fuller discusses Moore's marvellous segmented sculptures of reclining figures. He reflects on Moore's intention for the figures to be understood both as women and as landscapes. Fuller relates this splitting of object and meaning to Winnicott's concept of the "object mother and the environment mother". Convincingly, Fuller argues that these reclining figures in their fragmented wholeness can stand metaphorically for Winnicott's underdeveloped theory of the location of cultural experience. In Winnicott's theories Fuller sees the connections to aesthetic theories and these he feels are visually connected in Moore's art.

Fuller's essay is a strong and persuasive argument for parallels of meaning in very different pursuits. Seductively, he edges under the superficial skin of professional differences to reveal what he has referred to elsewhere as relatively immutable common concerns (Fuller, Art 16-21). The connection between art and the psyche being discussed within a psychoanalytic framework on a concrete and abstract level is very clearly established by Fuller's essay.

The theme of comparison between professions is pursued in Brandon Taylor's essay, "Early Modern Painting in Europe: The Psychopathological Dimension." Taylor proposes that what artists at the beginning of the 20th century were doing and what therapists today are doing has similarities in that both explore aspects of feeling that are often not accessible by other means (21). The feelings, in the cases of the artists discussed, are expressed in their works. They centre around individual problems the artists had in their lives but also account for fears and emotions that were prevalent at the time in European society. These artists reflected the time in which they lived and Taylor maintains that there is a deliberate psychopathological aspect to their work incorporated by the legacy of Romanticism of which they were the heirs. To argue his case Taylor considers three artists, Kandinsky, Picasso and Matisse.

19 Brandon Taylor, Reader in History of Art at Winchester School of Art (1989)
Looking at Kandinsky, Taylor discusses the "apocalyptic themes" that occur in his work between 1908 and 1913. The themes, Taylor indicates, reflect Kandinsky's fears of the crisis which he believed Europe was experiencing and also reflect the traumatic mental state in Kandinsky's personal life of the same time. The mental conflicts were not only reflected in the apocalyptic themes of the artwork but also in their surface and appearance as well. This is a characteristic that Taylor develops with the three artists that he discusses and, he indicates, it helps to explain, in part, their move towards abstract imagery. In Kandinsky's case Taylor suggests that abstraction may have been a defence to veil and obscure the nature of the imagery he was dealing with. Taylor points out that there is record of Kandinsky becoming very stressed "about the stability of the physical world" (23). This stress was concerned both with Kandinsky's view of the external world in which he was living and his own internal mental identity. Kandinsky emphasised the need for himself and other artists to always be aware of what he called "inner necessity". Taylor interprets Kandinsky's "inner necessity" as a reference to the unconscious. Inner necessity was, Taylor implies, the component in Kandinsky's life at this time over which he strove to have control. He saw inner necessity as the creative process and spoke about it metaphorically as "the horse and rider" (24). Through inner necessity he could express his spirituality, his innermost feelings and his relationship to the world. This expression was invested into his artworks. It would appear therefore, from Taylor's proposition, that Kandinsky was indeed using his artworks to embody transferential material.

Turning to Picasso Taylor then discusses his uses of Cubism. Traditionally, he writes, Cubism has been viewed as an objective, intellectual movement in art. Yet we know that Picasso, from a view of his total oeuvre, was far from being a detached unemotional artist. Therefore, Taylor deduces, Cubism reveals facets of Picasso's emotional and internal life to reveal. For example, Picasso's aggression to women expressed in his art can be traced in his early Cubist works. Clearly, from 1907 on Picasso begins to fragment, detach and angularise his female figures, "endowing the female figure with persecutory attributes, or else inflicting damage on the female form in retaliation, it would seem, for some real or imaginary pain caused to him." (25). The analysis, deconstruction and resembling of the female form by Picasso was developed in ever more violent and innovative ways. Taylor refers the reader to examples of Picasso's work where he penetrates into the female form visually distorting, opening it up and substituting human and non-human "objects and forms" (25). Personal sexual themes run through much of Picasso's work. Often, for conscious reasons, the references in Picasso's work to individual females (such as his lover[s]) was covert or obscured. The vocabulary of sexual reference in Picasso's work between such things
as guitars and female form and developments in the fragmented collage techniques of the Cubists is part of the story of Cubism itself. Seen on a surface level these metaphors can be interpreted sociologically. However, when looked at from a psychoanalytic perspective there is the potential to reveal aspects of Picasso's inner thought processes in a convincing and challenging way that elaborates on his possible motivations on a personal and unconscious level. Taylor discusses the substitution of one symbol for another and postulates that on a latent psychic level dissimilar physical objects, such as female form and guitar, are brought together visually, to unconsciously defend against and avoid activating "emotions which the artist wishes to hide" (27). These emotions often relate to early childhood phantasies of aggression associated with the mother's body and a sadistic wish to destroy parts of it. The early and real fears of a child, Taylor indicates, are the phantasies which often stimulate the creation, by manifold equation, of new and original thought patterns in the adult. These can, as they did in the case of Picasso, result in being included in such things as works of art, increasing the visual complexity and intensity of the work (27).

As a final example of early twentieth century artists being affected by transferential material Taylor looks at Matisse. He sees Matisse's work as analogous to aspects of Freud's theories through their conscious and unconscious use of "condensation, simplification and elimination" which "Freud had postulated for the dreamwork only a few years before" (29). As with Kandinsky and Picasso, Taylor believes that manipulation of the surface of the painting was an all important cue in identifying the "psychopathological dimension" in Matisse's art. Taylor traces, albeit briefly, aspects of Matisse's working methods from 1904. Focussing on Matisse's experiments with differing surface treatments to his paintings, eg., line versus tone, the brightening of his palette, the uses of impasto paint and areas of untouched canvas within individual works, Taylor suggests that these experiments with surface were all part of a search by Matisse to find "an authentic and gratifying style" that brought him closer to a description of the spiritual and mental serenity towards which he aspired (28). This explains, Taylor indicates, why Matisse, even though he always used figurative subject matter was able to detach himself from the pedantry of objective copying. Through a complex development of condensed marks, shapes and pure colours he arrived at an "unconscious transcription" of the spirit of the object perceived. Matisse wished his audience to view his work, in its completion, and receive from it the serenity with which he had attempted to imbue it. Taylor posits that Matisse used his artworks as the vehicles for personal psychic fulfilment and that he wished his audience to receive the same fulfilment from them. Matisse's relationship to his art was very close and Taylor indicates there is record of Matisse thinking of the painting process as a fertility rite and of "his paintings as offspring" (30). The scenario that Taylor sketches of the somatic
and spiritual energy that Matisse attempted to put into his work suggests that he transferred unconscious content into his art and working life.

In "Fantasy and the Figurative" David Maclagan argues, provocatively, that figurative art is by definition a convention. He postulates that the figurative symbols of the convention were used, perhaps even exploited, by Freud and the early developers of psychoanalysis to explain, or diagnose, certain conditions in the psychic states of clients. This set of conventional symbols, Maclagan argues, has been developed into a vocabulary and sometimes misused as part of the necessary and prerequisite repertoire of visual symbols for diagnosis. Maclagan questions the validity of this reliance on "the figurative" by psychoanalysts and art therapists. He asks the question, can unconscious fantasy be governed, or interpreted, by a convention? He also questions the privilege of analysts and therapists to interpret from a narrow set of figurative symbols that re-assert diagnostic authority over the patient and his/her unconscious. The result Maclagan argues

... is to confine therapy to a narrow waveband of meaning, and to render its stance both reductive and conservative. Not every form of fantasy conforms to this template, but the pervasive influence of figurative conventions has subtly skewed our understanding of what fantasy typically consists of, and how the images it gives rise to might be understood" (36).

Maclagan's essay stimulates thought about the conceptual and intellectual 'straitjackets" that we set ourselves, or are set for us, by conventional theories. Art, Maclagan indicates, has a crucial responsibility in the interface between reality and fantasy. If artists and art therapists blindly accept the repertoire of conventional symbols, connected by the figurative, then they will be doing their respective professions a disservice. Critically, Maclagan writes, "in a psychiatric context politics often wears a clinical disguise". The dangers of this he warns are that if a profession becomes too reliant on conventional theory "the authoritarian effects of a model imagination that is inherently conservative" might prevail (39). Maclagan's essay points toward a reassessment of fantasy and art and art therapies understanding of it. The re-examination, he suggests, may reveal new insights and force a re-evaluation of the kind of therapies that are presently used to deal with our "inner and outer" worlds. Maclagan's essay displays a liveliness in debate around crucial issues that affect our understanding of transference in art. Accepting conventions in art or art therapy without question can be dangerous as it could lead to a restrictive political and

20 David Maclagan, Artist and Art Therapist (1989)
professional vision. Indeed, this is a concern that I will touch on in my postscript to *The Handbook of Art Therapy* when I discuss the various definitions, and the uses they are put to, of transference in psychoanalysis and art therapy.21

In John Birtchenell's essay "Chagall's Erotic Imagery" he reasons that the imagery allows Chagall's inner fantasies to spill out uncritically on to the canvas", thus making "it so much easier to see the kinds of processes with which the art therapist should be concerned".22 Birtchnell continues,

> One of the many skills required of the art therapist is the ability to enter into the fantasies of the patient, get the feel of them, and get some idea of how the world is experienced from the patient's inside. The patient's creations are like a new language which has to be learned before communication with him becomes possible; for it is incumbent upon any good therapist to become able to communicate on the patient's terms rather than compel the patient to communicate on his (43).

Continuing his analogy with language Birtchnell writes, "The language of an artist's pictures is learned by looking for recurrent themes, images, symbols, scenes, colours, etc. and observing the contexts in which they are presented" (43). Often, Birtchnell informs us, if the content of the artist's intended imagery is confrontational (ie. overtly sexual or psychically threatening) it may be multi-layered or disguised and, as we know, art images are inevitably overlayed with signifiers, symbols and meaning. Some of this meaning will be built in consciously by the artist, other meanings may be invested unconsciously. For Birtchnell, some of Chagall's art presents the viewer with "non-sexual images to represent sexual themes" thus, "imparting a certain poetry to the sexual themes which are depicted by them" (44). In this, Birtchnell sees a comparison to motivations that make art therapy clients produce "apparently innocent objects and scenes" that "are sometimes a cover for certain underlying obsessions and preoccupations" (44).

Birtchnell gives several examples of Chagall's iconography that he believes stand for other things, or are major preoccupations for Chagall. To illustrate this I will refer to Birtchnell's discussion of Chagall's references to the pubic triangle of hair that covers female genitalia. He cites examples in Chagall's painting where this happens literally in

21 In a different context Handler Spitz's essay, reviewed later in this chapter, "Art Without History: Reflections on the Paintings of a Schizophrenic Child" also questions conventional notions of theory and fantasy when she discusses the abstract paintings of a severely disabled child.

mythical depictions such as Adam & Eve circa 1911 and examples where it occurs in disguised or symbolic form ie. Bella in Green 1934, The Bride with Double Face 1927, Equestrienne 1931 and The Bride and Groom of the Eiffel Tower 1938-9. In the symbolic examples above, Birtchnell claims that the symbol for the female pubic triangle is a fan. Later in Chagall’s development "the fan gave way to the posy or bouquet of flowers which was sometimes held over the pubic area in a similar sort of way, eg. Nude in Ochre 1949. For Birtchnell the substitution by Chagall of fans or bunches of flowers for the literal depiction of female genitalia enhanced Chagall’s imagery and its potential meanings on several levels. Besides the direct sexual reference to male arousal, there are associated sexual and metaphorical connections such as occasions in Chagall’s imagery where the fan or flowers overlap both man and woman, connoting fusion in love of male and female gender, (a theme pursued elsewhere in Chagall’s imagery). With the fan or flowers, there is also the connotation of enhanced colour, perfume and enlarged size that make poetic reference to female genitalia; there is the provocative movement of fans and flowers, and then there is the biological reference of flower as centre of the plant's reproductive organ.

Birtchnell moves on to discuss other symbols of sexuality for Chagall that appear in his paintings. These include, cockerels, fish, cows, donkeys and a violin. For all of these objects Birtchnell has a sexual referent and explains them with apparent ease. When the viewer looks at Chagall’s paintings, one is left in little doubt that many are about male and female love. One can see that the objects in the paintings are both narrative and symbolic and that there is an emotional charge in much of his work. Having read Birtchnell’s essay, one is left with the feeling that perhaps he is correct in his assessment of aspects of Chagall’s art. However, his essay is brief in its discussion of what is obviously a study that deserves greater attention. A fuller qualification is required to substantiate the claims that are made. Perhaps this short essay falls into the pattern of inquiry that Ellen Handler Spitz refers to as fictive in that its actual truth is secondary to its ability to instruct or enlarge our knowledge of psychic possibilities in the interpretation of art or art therapy clients (Art 54-64).

In a similar vein to Birtchnell, Annie Hershkowitz in her essay "Symbiosis as a Driving Force in the Creative Process" attempts to convince the reader that some artists make art as a means of negotiating the unconscious memories of their earliest relationships with their mothers (54-64). Furthermore, she suggests they also make art as a means of sharing this primal experience with their audience. In Hershkowitz’s short essay we are presented with a wide array of theoretical (and unfortunately thinly described)

positions from many psychological sources to confirm a point of view made by earlier contributors to psychoanalytic thought (Winnicott, *Playing*; Handler Spitz, *Art*). In ten pages, Hershkowitz makes sweeping statements about no less than four of this century's leading artists, Camus, Jean Genet, Henry Moore and René Magritte. What one is left with at the end of such a brief and incomplete account of the four artist's psychic lives is the impression that Hershkowitz expects the reader to take on trust her account. Perhaps her essay is directed at those already converted to psychoanalytic concepts and willing to accept at face value ideas about these artists that in reality require much more substantiation and considered presentation. For example, from her essay one could be given the distinct impression that *all artists* come from a seriously disturbed family life and have severe psychic problems. Whilst not disagreeing with Hershkowitz's general statement concerning the importance of a child's earliest relationships with its parents, one is left wondering whether it is this kind of essay that deters so many in the arts from even considering psychoanalytic concepts.

Joan Woddis discusses one of literature's most eccentric and original 19th century thinkers.24 "More or less a Sorrow: Some Observations on the Work of Edward Lear" concerns Lear's "nonsense poems" and how they reveal and incorporate aspects of his psychic life. Woddis informs us that Lear was "a serious landscape painter, one-time drawing master to Queen Victoria, who also wrote an abundance of comic limericks and poems, ostensibly for children, which he characterised as "pure nonsense" (65). Examples of his work include such well-known poems as *The Owl and the Pussycat*. Woddis points out that Lear, along with Lewis Carroll was one of the first to write supposedly innocent, humorous verse and stories in a nonsensical fashion that in fact concealed deeper, more serious motives. Talking of "nonsense literature" as a genre, Woddis indicates,

> ... the overriding expression is of a logical order in an absurd setting, nonsense thus has a methodical feeling, a sense of rationalising and taming wild irrationality. Perhaps the essence of nonsense is detachment; neither author nor reader becomes involved with the characters, so that their vicissitudes, even torments, do not distress us and need not be taken seriously. Their feelings are not part of the game and, like Lear's remain hidden and secret (67).

In this sense one can see a connection between nonsense poems and Surrealist art.

---

Even though Woddis' essay is not an attempt at pathography it does pick up on a thematic approach to Lear by concentrating on his nonsense verse, related drawings and diary entries. One of her main intentions is to point out to the reader how a person, living in a repressed and unsympathetic (19th century) society, could divert much of his private anxiety, or unconscious thought, into concealed sub-texts, the meaning of which, he may or may not have been fully aware. Woddis argues:

Edward Lear was, as I hope to illustrate here, a man of great courage, battling throughout his life with both epilepsy and his latent homosexuality, for at that time either of these attributes might render the sufferer a social outcast and the resultant constraints produce profound isolation and loneliness. I believe his nonsense to be a significant defence, and means by which he could articulate the suffering he had experienced, but in such a way that he was protected from close scrutiny; the very absurdity of the form obscured the meaning and the pain. Perhaps it is this feature of his work that will most interest us as therapists (65).

Though born into a middle class family, when he was four years of age his parents sank seriously into debt. As he was "the twentieth of twenty-one children, many of whom had died in infancy" (65-66), Lear was given to a sister twenty one years older than himself, from which date he hardly ever saw his mother again. There is record that Lear as a child felt seriously hurt and rejected by his mother. Woddis informs us that Lear's childhood "was strange and unhappy". Epilepsy occurred, and then, when he was only seven years old, acute bouts of depression set in. His older sisters did what they could to cocoon and protect him, but Lear's real "safe harbour" became his art, both visual and written. Lear's own childhood was estranged, yet as he grew older, came the realisation that he, as a severe epileptic, would not have children of his own. His sense of abandonment and loneliness led to lifelong turns of depression and restlessness. These tendencies were displayed in Lear's constant wide ranging travel, and deep emotional ties to many men and women, that apparently were never, or rarely, long lasting or consummated.

By Woddis' account, Lear was a sincere man who espoused truth and honesty, yet amazingly and by necessity, he kept his epilepsy and love of men a secret throughout his life. This repression of illness and love bears graphic analogy to similar symptoms in some types of neurosis: Lear's life was paradoxical. Inwardly, he was desolate and ill, outwardly, he gained popular recognition through his humour and art. He longed for a childhood and a mother he never had and yet had a deep suspicion of a woman's love (65-73).
In conclusion, Woddis gives examples of Lear's verse and drawings that illustrate his inner turmoil in a believable and decoded way. This interpretive essay illustrates well the uses of art to incorporate transferences. However, I do not intend to get involved with their detailed discussion in this short review of Woddis' essay, as to do so would certainly include a lengthy paraphrasing of her text. The position I wish the reader to take account of, however, is that as opposed to Hershkowitz's essay, Woddis' essay, through its well defined choice of subject and its empathic and carefully constructed interpretation, has credibility. It convinces the reader of a link that is apparent between an artist's work, and his or her unconscious experience.

Roger Cardinal's essay "The Primitive Scratch" opens with a quote by Joan Miró, "It is signs that have no exact meaning, that provoke the sense of magic" (113-126).25 It is this sentence which sets the scene for Cardinal's hypothesis. By using examples of prehistoric drawings on rocks at Val Camonica, Italy, Cardinal posits that, "metaphoric connotation may be a surplus of significatory energy which spontaneously accretes around a sign once it has fulfilled its initial referential task" (116-117).

In his essay Cardinal presents the reader with a brief outline of the scientific and scholarly ways in which prehistoric drawings such as the Val Camonican examples may be interpreted by experts in the fields "of anthropology, ethnography and semiotics" (107). He reminds the reader that these interpretations are hypothetical constructs used to explain prehistoric phenomena in a logical and specific context. Intriguingly, the rational theories which Cardinal puts forward are then compared to his individual feelings and thoughts from the experience of being at the site and in the presence of the drawings. Cardinal writes of these experiences as the ones that have personal psychic meaning. He indicates that perhaps for the prehistoric drawings to be viewed with a fuller understanding "one should not overlook the more immediate resources of one's own sensibility" (125). It appears, from Cardinal's essay, that an empathic, environmental and psychic interaction with the drawings gave him an understanding of the work in a counter-transferential way. Once he allowed himself "To establish a dialogue across thousands of years" (25) in the presence and environment of the drawings he felt a deep psychic communication with the drawings and their makers. The communication told him as much about himself as it did about the makers of the drawings. In this there is an analogy to Casement's position concerning the exchange between therapist and

25 Roger Cardinal, Professor of Literary and Visual Studies at the University of Kent at Canterbury (1989).
client in psychoanalysis. This he concludes is the value and magic to be found in the ambiguity of abstracted meaning in art. Cardinal draws analogies to the ways in which prehistoric drawings and their "polyvalence" of meanings connects with the same multifaceted meanings that are applied to abstract works carried out in this century by such artists as Dubuffet, Miró and Michaux. The value of the art in the prehistoric and the contemporary context Cardinal implies is that because signification is not, and can not be, fixed a dialogue is possible with the imagery on a psychic and emotional level where, "we are in the final analysis left with the task of drawing together a sense from these marks for ourselves" (125). Cardinal's essay suggests that transferential energy is contained in art and that this can be elicited by counter-transferential response.

Mary Leven's essay "Working with Defence Mechanisms in Art Therapy" concentrates on clarifying the psychoanalytic concept of defence mechanisms when applied to art therapy (143-146). Defence mechanisms are those by which the ego protects itself from threats by the id, the super-ego or the outside world. The commonly accepted types of defence mechanism include the psychoanalytic classifications of regression, repression, reaction-formation, isolation, undoing, projection, introjection, turning against the self, reversal and sublimation. Levens contends that during art therapy, clients put up resistances to treatment in the form of defence mechanisms. In this sense, art therapy is no different to conventional psychoanalysis. However, Levens points out that the art work in art therapy, such as painting and sculpture, helps to break down resistances and allows the interpretive work of the art therapist to proceed. She also indicates that because of the severe nature of defences in some clients, the timing of "transference interpretations" is crucial. If they are given too early in the treatment the client may not consciously recognise the transference being interpreted or may psychically apply a defence mechanism to disown the interpretation. Levens suggests that this situation has its similarities with the attitudes of some professional artists, as it is possible for unconscious material to be incorporated in art without the conscious knowledge of the artist. It is also possible that the artist will disown or deny the incorporation of unconscious material in his or her work. This situation however,

---


27 Sublimation is also considered a defence mechanism of "normal" subjects, not just neurotics.

28 Resistance: "When used as a technical term, the opposition encountered during psychoanalytical treatment to the process of making UNCONSCIOUS processes CONSCIOUS - patients are said to be in a state of resistance if they oppose the analyst's interpretations and to have weak or strong resistances according as to whether they find it easy or difficult to allow their analyst to understand them. Resistance is a manifestation of DEFENCE" (Rycroft 142-143)
is most obvious in art therapy, because it is the intention of the treatment to interpret sensitive, previously unconscious material, in the client's artwork.

Levens discusses some types of defence mechanisms, indicating the advantages that the identification of defence mechanisms in the artwork has for the art therapist and client in the development of a therapeutic relationship. For example, projection "operates constantly in art" and in art therapy involves the client's investment of libidinal and aggressive tendencies in the artwork.(144) Regression is an interesting and deeply felt defence as it involves returning to an earlier stage of development. This has its dangers but is managed in the therapeutic situation by the therapist. Regression helps to explain the often simplistic and child-like imagery presented by the client before a recovery to more ordered adult-like image presentation. Once again, the concrete record of this defence presented in the client's artwork is invaluable. Regression is sometimes a precursor to sublimation. Sublimation is seen as an adaptive activity that often indicates recovery or, at least, the resolution of a mental problem.

It is useful to review Leven's work as her discussion of defence mechanisms may well have relevance to my artwork and the documentation of it. It might help to explain, for example, why I have been aware of some aspects of the psychic material presented in my work and unaware of other aspects. As I will propose, in the conclusion to this thesis, my project has included self-analytic elements, wherein counter-transference might have introduced defences. Leven's essay discusses the ways in which art enables a better understanding of the psyche and the advantages she believes it has in breaking down defences. In documenting and "analysing" my work I found it incredibly hard sometimes to arrive at verbal descriptions of the psychic content. Self-analysis is fraught with problems of defence mechanisms coming into play.

Gerry McNeilly's essay "Group Analytic Art Groups" is an interesting account of individual and group dynamics with group analytic art groups (156-166).29 McNeilly's working methods are psychodynamic "allowing for the totality of the group experience. The image-making is but part of the process" (157). McNeilly indicates that because of his emphasise there is less need to explore, in depth, the imagery within "the triangular arrangement of patient, therapist and artefact, and to explain the imagery and final meanings" (157). In this respect McNeilly's essay is not directly pertinent to a discussion of transferential issues solely in an art therapy

---

situation or on a one to one basis between therapist and client. Rather, McNeilly's essay discusses recurrent themes in the dynamics of imagery and its creation in the group setting.

In this sense, the essay is an intriguing insight into group dynamics and group transference that probably has relevance to activities and issues well outside the arena of group therapy. For example, it is possible to recognise the themes he refers to in other situations. Themes such as "the blank page", "the written word", "the shocking image", "the recurrent image" and "copied pictures" that he cites as part of group therapy communication can also be recognised in a broader context. Such divergent settings as, for example, the classroom situation, the fine art world and its products, and society at large where different interests seek attention through the use of such themes. Interestingly, the way McNeilly advocates dealing with these issues in a group therapy setting also parallels the similar ways a "well balanced" society attempts to deal with confrontational issues or challenging concepts when he writes, "Tolerance and understanding may therefore be equated with containment" (161).

McNeilly's essay does discuss transferential issues but on a group basis. In this respect there is a link to earlier sections of my thesis where I have discussed the roles of transference in the group setting and transference's ubiquitous nature. The continual endorsement of transferences' ubiquitous nature, especially in the group setting, is important to keep in mind when considering my thesis. If it is accepted that transference is ubiquitous and that it may occur in groups then it helps to consolidate an argument for the importance of visual transference between artist and audience.

"Some Aspects of Art Therapy and Family Therapy" by Michael Donnelly describes his uses of art therapy within a frame of structural family therapy. His application of art therapy is therefore ordered by this model and the visual results, discussed in his essay, appear to fall into what Schaverien (discussed later in this chapter) might refer to as a diagrammatic mode of visual expression. Even though Donnelly's essay does not alter my general hypothesis concerning art and transference I feel it has relevance to the artwork presented in my exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery. Like Donnelly's essay much of my artwork for that exhibition was about family relationships and at times in the making of the

---

30 Michael Donnelly, Family Art Therapist, Lecturer and Committee Member of the British Association of Art Therapists (1989).
work, even though they were physically absent, I felt a very close presence of family members.

Donnelly describes differing methods of working with family groups and indicates that art therapy techniques are often introduced to gain insights into the psychic family structure that can be gained in no other way. For example, one of the benefits of art in family therapy is that it can break down, or approach, intellectual and relational structures in a condensed and displaced format in a way that verbalisation can not:

One result of this is the placing of family members in a less hierarchically determined position, offering greater opportunities for clearer communication, unstructuring the family in order to establish how it sees itself.

This is facilitated by one of the intrinsic features of art therapy, the phenomenon of freedom from linear and temporal constraints that are so much a feature of verbal expression, in artwork a number of ideas can be expressed at the same time, all having different chronologies (200).

In the point Donnelly is making I found interesting parallels to my own artwork. For example, in the making of the series of work Father Imago I found a clear resonance to Donnelly's summation of the benefits of a family group making artwork in the context of therapy. In the series Father Imago and the many other works in the exhibition concerned with family issues the constraints of linear time and chronology are deliberately condensed, altered and rearranged in a visual and "fictive" manner that is perhaps, as I will argue in the conclusion to this thesis, related to Handler Spitz's presentation of fictive pathography.

This concludes my review of Pictures at an Exhibition, Selected Essays on Art and Art Therapy. In its scope, Gilroy's and Dalley's text contributes greatly to an understanding of art therapy's processes, theories and related areas of interest.

Next, I will discuss an article published in the newsletter of ANATA by Jo Spence.31 "Photo-Therapy Theatre of the Self", is a description of a new development in the use of media available to art therapists. Spence and her techniques are described in the newsletter as:

---

Jo Spence is a U.K. photographer, artist and phototherapist. In the 1980s, following her experiences as a cancer patient, she invented with her colleague, Rosy Martin, a technique called Phototherapy. Phototherapy is a synthesis of photography and psychoanalytic theory. It has been referred to as unconsciousness raising with a camera. At the core of phototherapy is the process of power sharing and collaboration by photographer/therapist and sitter/director. Jo's part involvement in art therapy, her current training as an art therapist, and the significance of her work make this article of particular interest to those of us further investigating the relationship between imagery and psychotherapeutic processes (1).

Spence's own art includes powerful photo-images connected with her experiences of breast cancer. The images reveal the trauma of the experience using photo compilation and montage techniques together with carefully staged props and compositional devices. A typical image Victim or Heroine?, a collaborative work by Jo Spence and Terry Dennett, depicts Spence naked to the waist, wearing a motorcycle crash helmet, arms above her head, photographed close up and revealing her scarred and mutilated left, cancerous breast and under-arm hair. The image is stark and confronting. It is painful, at first, for the viewer to look at and gives some indication of the physical and psychic pain and anguish every woman with breast cancer must surely go through. In the image, Spence's eyes look directly at the viewer from behind the guard of the crash helmet; they confront and question the viewer. The image, in total, appears an obvious attempt to expel and reveal the trauma. The bizarre juxtaposition of sexuality with violence; breasts, mutilation, under-arm hair, is reminiscent of some of the most confronting Surrealist art. But, whereas, in Surrealist art women are invariably the passive victims of male violence, here a woman confronts the notion of herself as victim. No doubt, other women viewing this image would identify with it strongly. Moreover, if the person viewing happened to be a cancer victim (female or male) then Spence's imagery might have a deeper psychic effect. This then, sets the scene for Spence's art therapeutic work with clients.

Spence applies techniques learnt through her own art and self therapy background together with her knowledge of psychoanalysis. Using familiar object-relations and art therapy techniques, Spence develops an intimate, yet objective, working relationship with her clients. However, Spence points out "unlike most other therapies" phototherapy attempts to avoid any hierarchical power relationship between client and therapist. Neither is to dominate, the therapeutic work is to be "reciprocal". Using a range of therapeutic techniques, such as acting out, role playing and re-framing experiences Spence uses photography as "visual markers of such work". The therapeutic arrangement is that Spence provides the photographic and art therapeutic
skills and the patient provides the psychic material that is to be worked through. Together they combine to share the experience of therapy. Her clients are usually referred from existing therapeutic practices and come to phototherapy with expectations that the treatment will have an effect. To engender the notion of the photograph as a therapeutic aid, a typical session might commence by going back over the client's life record of photographs (from family albums, etc.) making known significant and insignificant associations with the images, in a sort of visual free association. This is usually part of the first stage of treatment, when the client and therapist work on a strategy and course of "photo-treatment" that will be constructive. To develop the acting out and role playing experiences of therapy the client (and it appears maybe the therapist) will dress up as, for example, in a re-enactment of her youth/childhood or significant figures from the client's past. The photographer/therapist will offer technical advice on the photography and props available to aid the therapy. The client will also contribute props and ideas to assemble the phototherapeutic image. Often, the images created are versions of, or recreations of, earlier family photos or significant images from the past.

In the second stage of treatment, the opportunities created by these images offer the client and therapist a means of interpretation. The initial images can then be analysed and transformed or destroyed as the client recognises the stereotypical or damaging role she or he has assumed in relation to the image. The phototherapist's role here is to photographically record and direct the session, create a safe and unthreatening environment for acting out and to assume a neutral, supportive and un-hierarchal mode. The phototherapist's aim is to direct the patient further towards the surfacing of unconscious material as the session(s) develops. The third stage of treatment is arrived at when the photographic images from the sessions are given to the client for reflection. Spence indicates this event is often cathartic, as the client faces and recognises her conflict, pain or trauma in the images. These photographs then go on to form the fourth and final stage of treatment. The client is encouraged to share her or his emotions with the therapist. The photographs form the basis of photo-narratives and photo-montages and are constructed by client and therapist in such a way as to allow further interpretation and "un-blocking" of unconscious memory. Spence indicates that this four-staged cycle of treatment is repeated as many times as necessary. In the process, greater trust is built up and deeper layers of the psyche are revealed. Spence suggests that photographic imagery has great potential meaning to clients due to its perceived power to signify "truth". In the illusion of a "photographic truth" the deconstruction of images becomes possible as clients realise not only the fallacy of

32 This has strong associations to the work of contemporary artist/photographer Cindy Sherman.
Photographic truth, but also the possibility of many truths or narratives that can be invested and extrapolated from imagery generally (1-2).

Phototherapy then, fits in to some well-established concepts of both art therapy and psychoanalysis, but perhaps extends the boundaries of both with its concentration on the use of a medium that is dominant in the visual cultures of the twentieth century. "Photographs can potentially provide unfiltered contact with the unconscious, transcending talking and making possible the direct use of images and symbols" (6). The role of transference within phototherapy appears implicit and as the therapy has developed from Spence's own self therapy and artwork, one might conject that transference is also apparent in her photography, for surely, it is the transferential potential of photography that Spence is tapping here.

In the next essay concerning art therapy and transference I return to the writings of Ellen Handler Spitz. To Handler Spitz, the role of transference in art is one of the central concepts in understanding art's psychic potential. This essay "Art Without History: Reflections on the Paintings of a Schizophrenic Child" relates to work carried out with an art therapist and a client receiving art therapy (Handler Spitz, Image 111-127). She commences:

For two years I worked as a volunteer at a residential and day center for Schizophrenic children. In tandem with a registered art therapist, I spent several hours each week with a young boy who challenged me, heart and mind, with painting that sparked tantalizing questions (113).

"Avi", the young boy in question was eleven years old, institutionalised and severely affected by schizophrenia. He came from a seriously disturbed family background in which both parents had attempted suicide on several occasions (his mother had done this in front of him and his father had other disturbing problems, both physical and mental). Avi's own problems were severe and Handler Spitz describes them in her initial meeting in the following way:

... he was withdrawn, silent and painfully anxious. He made meaningless perseverative hand motions and spoke only in barely audible whispers with his head averted, so that it was virtually impossible to decipher his verbal communications. Almost totally absorbed in an inner world, he seemed to be responding to experiences accessible to himself alone (119).

She then reports,
Slowly, however, over many months, the act of painting became a source of pleasure to him. To witness the unfolding of this drama with the paints and brushes and to see their intimate links with the bodily issues that preoccupied him was a lesson in the power of art's physicality, its materiality, and its insistence on the engagement of flesh with external substances (120).

Avi's painting was abstract, it contained colour, movement and expressionistic marks. In these respects only, Handler Spitz compares it to the work of Hans Hofmann and other abstract expressionists. She indicates that as Avi's confidence and joy in painting increased so did his ability to communicate verbally.

The therapeutic relationship grew and there was a mutual interest in each other's actions and words which Avi reflected in his painting and Handler Spitz invested in them. It appears an interpretative process was taking place both for Handler Spitz and Avi. The central question is whether the paintings produced by Avi are art? And the part answer Handler Spitz gives to this question, is that it depends on our definition and regard for conventional histories of art. Conventional histories of art are, like other forms of history writing, highly selective and often narrow in the interpretation of events, styles, artists and definitions that they choose to describe. There may be well intentioned efforts to write art histories with a broad base. But, inevitably she feels, art and artists from other times, places, cultures and psychic states, other than "normal" will to some extent be marginalised or excluded. As an example of this process, Handler Spitz indicates, that there is evidence to suggest that even though some of the best contemporary art histories try to contain varying points of view, relevant to an historic "work of art" when it was produced and today's contemporary theory that shapes our perception of it, some aspects of art theory, such as its imperialistic, dogmatic, opportunistic or exploitative properties (from the past or present) will build into the history:33

Thus, any history of art is a complex story of inclusions and exclusions. When we view any one position (or period) from another, we incur the inevitable risk of exposing the partiality not only of the other but of our own current position (117).

(iii) Spitz gives the following (humorous?) illustration: "for example, an Ethiopian camel pot that was conceived by its maker as purely functional can be displayed as a work of art by its contemporary New York owner, yet its figuration and/or design interpreted according to a sophisticated knowledge of the culture in which it originated" (117).
She argues, that today there are attempts at addressing the art and histories of what can broadly be called those on the outside of mainstream culture and society (ie. the mentally ill, the underprivileged, the handicapped, the racially dominated etc.). Nevertheless, Handler Spitz feels the strength and dominance of mainstream culture and society is such that the marginalised groups are still marginalised or ignored. In these circumstances, Avi's painting cannot be and will not be considered art in the conventional, mainstream or "normal" histories and theories of art. Whether or not what Avi does (and people like him) is art, is destined in the present circumstances to remain a point of view or the prerogative of a marginalised minority. However, as more is understood about the relationship of art to the unconscious, there will perhaps be more regard for work that is created by those that are not considered "normal", or work that defies the established aesthetic considerations. Handler Spitz suggests that in Avi's case the process and context within which his paintings were produced should be paid attention to and valued. The meaning and intentionality expressed in such a basic form in Avi's paintings is perhaps an essential ingredient in art and human experience.

Next, I will review a book which is extremely constructive in the development of my thesis as so much of the ground it covers has similarities to aspects of my own study. Joy Schaverien's *The Revealing Image* is an extraordinary and enthralling text. The book was published in 1992 the year that I first held the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*. Indeed, it is possible to consider that Schaverien's book was being written as I was making the artwork for that exhibition, something that I find pleasingly coincidental and a reaffirmation of the work that was made. Schaverien's book is relevant to my hypothesis of visual transference as it argues, "that, in the form of art therapy which has been designated analytical art psychotherapy, the picture itself may become an object of transference and countertransference" (227).

Even though, in the closing pages of her book, Schaverien pays tribute to Sigmund Freud and psychoanalysis, "Psychoanalysis has been a central foundation for this book, particularly the concept of transference... the debt to Freud has run throughout this whole work", it is evident that Schaverien has been (possibly predominantly) influenced by Carl Jung and analytical psychology (229). Schaverien makes this clear in a number of ways. For example, besides referencing Jung on many occasions throughout her work, in chapter eight Schaverien compares a text by Jung, the "Alchemical Metaphor", directly to a case study of one of her patients.34 Furthermore,

Schaverien redefines her own therapeutic practice as "analytical art psychotherapy", surely a clear reference and alignment to Jung's analytical psychology.

I am pointing out Schaverien's alignment to Jungian psychology for two main reasons. Firstly, my thesis is centred on psychoanalysis and does not address Jungian theory. In this thesis I have focussed on discussing art and transference within the framework of psychoanalysis. This is because I have wanted a clear and unconfused theoretical base from which to work and there are some significant differences between Jungian theories and psychoanalysis. I discuss these differences later when reviewing *The Handbook of Art Therapy*. As Case and Dalley point out in that text, psychoanalysis has become the central theoretical base of art therapy. However, my second reason for referring to Schaverien's inclusion of both psychoanalytic and analytical psychological theory is that it demonstrates how some psychotherapists and art therapists actually work in their practises. Even though, theoretically art therapists have, in recent times, aligned themselves with psychoanalytic theory, the reality, in practice, is not so clear cut. In this sense, Schaverien's book reflects this situation.

Schaverien puts forward three main reasons for the re-naming of her therapy techniques from "art therapy" to "analytical art psychotherapy". These are:

1. The terms "art therapy" and "art psychotherapy" do not adequately account for "the full import of the pictured image as an object of transference itself, within the context of the transference and countertransference relationship" (6).
2. "art therapy has come to embrace a very wide field; it has become an umbrella term which includes all shades of opinion, and a variety of approaches." (6).
3. Schaverien wishes to clearly align her therapy with that of Carl Jung and the philosopher Ernst Cassirer whom she also refers to extensively throughout *The Revealing Image*.

Schaverien's book is a marvellous exposition of art and transference, in an art therapeutic context, that gives insights into art and the psyche that can, and do, apply to the fine arts. When considering this book, however, (or indeed any position that discusses art and psychoanalysis), it important to keep in the forefront of one's mind Freud's premise on the psyche which underscored all his developments and has remained a key component of psychoanalytic thought. Freud maintained that the distinction between mental health and neurosis was a quantitative not a qualitative measure. By this he meant that all mentally healthy individuals contained the potential to be neurotic and that, therefore, the reverse was also true. For example, in a lecture in which Freud discussed transference at length he argues:
We are obliged to carry over to healthy people a number of hypotheses which arise in connection with neurotics as a result of the link between the latter's dreams and their symptoms. We cannot deny that healthy people as well possess in their mental life what alone makes possible the formation both of dreams and of symptoms, and we must conclude that they too have carried out repressions, that they expend a certain amount of energy in order to maintain them, that their unconscious system conceals repressed impulses which are still cathected with energy, and that a portion of their libido is withdrawn from their ego's disposal. Thus, a healthy person, too, is virtually a neurotic; but dreams appear to be the only symptoms which he is capable of forming. It is true that if one subjects his waking life to a closer examination one discovers something that contradicts this appearance ... namely that this ostensibly healthy life is interspersed with a great number of trivial and in practice unimportant symptoms.

The distinction between nervous health and neurosis is thus reduced to a practical question and is decided by the outcome ... by whether the subject is left with a sufficient amount of capacity for enjoyment and of efficiency. It probably goes back to the sizes of the quota of energy that remains free and that which is bound by repression, and is of a quantitative not a qualitative nature. I need not tell you that this discovery is the theoretical justification for our conviction that neurosis are in principle curable in spite of their being based on constitutional disposition.

The identity of the dreams of healthy and neurotic people enables us to infer thus much in regard to defining the characteristics of health. But in regard to dreams themselves we can make a further inference: we must not detach them from their connection with neurotic symptoms, we must not suppose that their essential nature is exhausted by the formula that describes them as a translation of thoughts into an archaic form of expression [199], but we must suppose that they exhibit to us allocations of the libido and object-cathexis that are really present. (S.E vol. 16 456-457).

Freud re-states this position many times in the recording of his theories. Linked to this fundamental argument Freud also extolled the virtues of the artist as those among healthy individuals who have a means at their disposal to sublimate and transfer their unconscious feelings into their artwork. For example, in "The Paths to the Formation of Symptoms" he contends:

35 e.g., (i) "Five Lectures on Psycho-analysis" S.E vol.11 50. (ii) "The Paths to the Formation of Symptoms" S.E. vol.16 358; 372-375. (iii) "Transference" S.E vol.16 435 and 446.
Consequently, like any other unsatisfied man, he turns away from reality and transfers all his interest, and his libido too, to the wishful constructions of his life of phantasy, whence the path might lead to neurosis. There must be, no doubt, a convergence of all kinds of things if this is not to be the complete outcome of his development; it is well known, indeed, how artists in particular suffer from a partial inhibition of their efficiency owing to neurosis. Their constitution probably includes a strong capacity for sublimation and a certain degree of laxity in the repressions which are decisive for a conflict. An artist, however, finds a path back to reality in the following manner. To be sure, he is not the only one who leads a life of phantasy. Access to the half-way region of phantasy is permitted by the universal assent of mankind, and everyone suffering from privation expects to derive alleviation and consolation from it. But for those who are not artists the yield of pleasure to be derived from the sources of phantasy is very limited. The ruthlessness of their repressions forces them to be content with such meagre day-dreams as are allowed to become conscious. A man who is a true artist has more at his disposal. In the first place, he understands how to work over his day-dreams in such a way as to make them lose what is too personal about them and repels strangers, and to make it possible for others to share in the enjoyment of them. He understands, too, how to tone them down so that they do not easily betray their origin from prescribed sources. Furthermore, he possesses the mysterious power of shaping some particular material until it has become a faithful image of his phantasy; and he knows, moreover, how to link so large a yield of pleasure to this representation of his unconscious phantasy that, for the time being at least, repressions are outweighed and lifted by it. If he is able to accomplish all this, he makes it possible for other people once more to derive consolation and alleviation from their own sources of pleasure in their unconscious which have become inaccessible to them; he earns their gratitude and admiration and he has thus achieved through his phantasy what originally he had achieved only in his phantasy (S.E vol. 16 376-377).

It is clear that Freud saw a connection between neurosis, health, transference, sublimation and art. My point here is that psychoanalysis does not distinguish between the mental processes of ill or healthy people as each individual has the same faculties but in different proportions. Additionally, psychoanalysis, from Freud onwards, has given a special place to artists in their ability to mediate between their unconscious and conscious lives. Therefore, we should not be surprised to find that many of Schaverien's proposals and theories apply to healthy individuals, such as artists, as well as the art therapy clients she writes about.

*The Revealing Image* is written, in large part, about the potential of art to aid in the cure, or relief, of mental health problems. What becomes clear is that, in many
respects, what Schaverien is describing is Freud's implicit formula for the containment of transferences in art and the potential for mental "normality" and health that art can and does assist with. The major difference in Schaverien's text is that she is writing about a therapy based on psychoanalysis and art to heal people with mental problems. Whereas, Freud was describing, as he saw it, a philosophy, or science, which had applications far beyond therapeutic goals and which embraced life, society and culture in general.

To a lesser or greater extent Schaverien's book centres around the use of art as a container of transferences. It is thus central to the development of my thesis. Schaverien's introduction makes it clear that her concern is with artwork as experienced in art therapy, "The aim [of the book] is to develop an understanding of the distinctive features of the art therapy experience" (1). However, it is evident at an early stage in the book that there are many parallels and analogies to the experience of the fine artist. Schaverien argues throughout that artwork can be a container of transferences and counter-transferences. She also argues that artwork can generate transferences that can affect the patient/artist and the therapist/viewer. From the beginning, Schaverien points out that art, in itself, is not a symptom of mental illness and that, therefore, diagnosis does not rest on a set of assumptions made about an artwork in isolation of other factors concerned with the patient. Reassuringly, Schaverien states, "There are no rules governing interpretation of pictures" (3). In the introduction she posits that artworks in art therapy act as mediators through which unconscious and conscious phenomena can come together for the patient and therapist and be understood through the process of making and reviewing the artworks therapeutically and aesthetically.

As has been indicated, transference is a hard phenomenon to define because its meaning has evolved and changed along the way and also, as Schaverien points out, because it is a personal experience that is not openly, or generally, acknowledged. Schaverien starts by discussing the difficulty in defining what is a "concept", or a term, that is used "to structure experience through language" (13). It is interesting to consider here that, in this respect, the concept of "aesthetic experience" is also difficult to define for similar reasons.

Schaverien outlines the familiar psychoanalytic definition of transference as the transferring of emotion from early childhood into the present. In psychoanalytic therapies patients experience an "intense" version of transference, though Schaverien points out that transference affects "all human relations" (13). The analysis, interpretation and working through of the transferences in the therapy are what define the cure. According to Schaverien, transference is present, to some degree, in every
The two main characteristics of transference "are that it is both *repetition* and *inappropriate*" (16). She indicates that ambivalence is present in all transferences. By this it is meant that when the patient exhibits a positive transference there is also a negative transference as its counterpart, though this may not always be obvious. Similar to data that I have presented to support the notion of transferring to an artwork Schaverien also gives an example of a Freudian analyst that argues that transferences can be made to "inanimate objects". Citing R.R. Greenson she quotes, "Furthermore transference reactions can also occur to animals, to inanimate objects, and to institutions, but here too, analysis will demonstrate that they are derived from the important people of early childhood" (16). Schaverien's concept of transference is viewed from a psychoanalytic perspective and it is psychoanalytic theory that gives her concepts of transference credence, "It substantiates the case I am making to locate it within the frame of the psychoanalytic tradition, even though I shall be approaching this idea from the viewpoint of different disciplines" (16).

Discussing counter-transference Schaverien concurs with the contemporary position that counter-transference in therapy is inevitable and that it must be understood and controlled if it is to contribute to the overall therapy and not become overwhelming for the therapist or client. Intriguingly, in relation to counter-transference Schaverien cites research that indicates that "even in self-analysis there is an analyst and analysand. In self-analysis the transference and counter-transference are responses to parts of the self" (19). Self analysis, Schaverien indicates, is a condition which is promoted in analytical art psychotherapy as an agent for reflection and interpretation.

Here there is a comparative base to fine art practices. Forms of self-analysis are a normal procedure of fine art. As Handler Spitz has pointed out, the artist has to be the viewer of his or her own work and the process involves an analytic and intellectual introspection of one's own work and one's reasons for making the work (Art 12). Needless to say, the self-analysis is not always psychological in inquiry, but may, for example, be aesthetic, theoretical or technical. Additionally, and similar to therapeutic processes, the self-analysis of the fine artist will most likely be operating on conscious, pre-conscious or unconscious levels... and there is no reason to expect that transferences are not occurring. The analogy of the psychotherapeutic situation to the aesthetic experience and of art making, as I have pointed out, is not new and

---


psychoanalysts have repeatedly compared psychoanalysis to art.38 Therefore, it should not surprise us if there is an overlap in the 'self-analytic" or "duo-analytic" processes of therapy to those of the making and viewing of fine art. According to Schaverien:

The artist part of the self makes the picture, during which time she or he is totally absorbed in it. Meanwhile the viewer part of the self watches, as if from a distance, intervening as little as possible. When the picture is finished the artist will stand back to view it, and now the roles are reversed. The viewer comes to the fore and the artist watches, as if from a distance, while the viewer responds to the picture. We could understand this process as the artist-self making a transference to the picture and viewer-self, like the therapist, bringing a more objective response to the picture. She or he considers its meanings and implications, and makes links (19).

Though here Schaverien is describing what she sees as one of the key processes of analytical art psychotherapy, it is my thesis that these same processes have the potential to happen either consciously, pre-consciously, or unconsciously when fine art is being made. Within a psychological and/or aesthetic frame whenever an artist makes art there are varying degrees and types of self-analysis taking place. This parallels Schaverien's discussion of transference in art and literature. Looking at the work of James Hillman she describes from a Jungian perspective that the making of art can be viewed as a spiritual act and that in Jungian terms spiritual acts are transferent.39 In these circumstances, Schaverien argues, the product of the fine artist can become a vehicle of transference for the artist and the viewer:

Although the artist and viewer never meet, this connection may be soul making for the viewer; thus the viewer too is "in transference". This transference is a response to the artist's initial transference and it is evoked through the picture, so this could be called a countertransference; the viewer then has a countertransference response to the picture (26).

So here, early in Schaverien's text, we have a description of the nucleus of the triadic relationship forming between artist, art and viewer. Schaverien proposes that this can happen on a self analytic basis for the artist alone or on a detached/interactive basis between artist, art and viewer.


In chapter two of *The Revealing Image* Schaverien goes on to describe what she refers to as the 'scapegoat transference'. This is a term which she first introduced in her essay "The Scapegoat and the Talisman: Transference in Art Therapy" (1987). Discussing the concept of the scapegoat generally, Schaverien puts forward data to show that this phenomenon is not just particular to Jewish culture but is a "universally practiced method of atoning for sins and ridding a community of evil". Referring to the philosopher Ernst Cassirer she indicates:

Fundamental to a notion that evil or illness can be transferred to a scapegoat is the belief that attributes and states are transferable substances. The transference to the goat is thought of, not as a symbolic substitution but as a "real physical transference" (30).

Schaverien contends that this is the process that occurs in analytical art psychotherapy and that the artwork becomes the scapegoat through a series of methodical or "ritualistic" stages in the therapy. The scapegoat is essentially the artwork which contains the transference. The stages of this process are; the transference to the artwork: the empowering of the object as a talisman: the disposal of the object "in a manner compatible with the effect which it embodies" (30). Schaverien proposes that the scapegoat transference is one of the distinct differences and advantages between analytical art psychotherapy and other therapies.

The processes involved in the scapegoat transference enable the psychoanalytic concept of 'splitting" to be used constructively in the therapy. There can be conscious acknowledgment by the patient of the good and bad aspects of the psyche that are being revealed. The good can be re-incorporated in the psyche whilst the bad can be disposed of. Schaverien links this process of splitting to those of object-relations theory and transitional phenomena. Artworks, she maintains, are transitional phenomena in the object-relations sense and, therefore, can be used as a container for the unwanted and split off material of the therapy. This deflects destructive and negative psychic material from being directed on to the therapist. In this sense the

---

40 The terms 'scapegoat" and "talisman" are important to Schaverien's thesis. Dictionary definitions of these terms read:
(i) *Scapegoat* 1 a person bearing the blame for the sins, shortcomings etc. of others. es as an expedient 2 bibl. a goat sent into the wilderness after the Jewish chief priest had symbolically laid the sins of the people upon it.
(ii)*Talisman* 1 an object es an inscribed ring or stone, supposed to be endowed with magic powers es of averting evil from or bringing good luck to its holder. 2 a charm or amulet; a thing supposed capable of working wonder. *Oxford Encyclopedic English Dictionary* 1991 ed.

41 The term "dispose" is also important to Schaverien's thesis. A dictionary definitions reads: *Dispose of,* 1a deal with b get rid of c finish d kill. *Oxford Encyclopedic Dictionary* 1991 ed.
therapist is sometimes "in the role of companion on a journey" (35), with the patient experiencing a form of self-analysis. The advantage of these processes is that they are relatively benign. Unwanted psychic material can be split off and disposed of in a way that psychically or physically hurts nobody, least of all the patient or therapist. Therefore, there is no guilt (or less guilt) on the part of the patient concerning burdening the therapist with psychic material as this is disposed of through the artwork. As Schaverien writes, "Ultimately a picture can be disposed of in ways no person ever can." (37).

To strengthen her argument concerning the scapegoat transference Schaverien draws on the work of Ernst Cassirer. Cassirer was a Neo-Kantian philosopher who argued that attributes and mental states are objective phenomena and substances that can be transferred from person to person, person to object and object to person. To explain his argument he used the scapegoat process to explain that these rites of purification and atonement were based not on symbolic substitution but on a "real physical transference".42

This is an irreducible characteristic of the scapegoat process and this is what Schaverien posits as happening in the therapeutic scapegoat transference. Action, thought and memory become live objective substances in the artwork, they are transferred into the object by the patient. However, following Cassirer, Schaverien indicates that the potential for the scapegoat phenomenon is universal and not restricted to art therapy practices. The scapegoat process is based, she indicates, on a mythical world view where objects, events and thought can become symbolic realities, "In such thinking there is no distinction between what is represented and what is real." (40). This is the basis upon which for the artist in therapy the artwork takes on physical and deep meaning. The art object comes to represent the object of the artist's unconscious. It is a way of getting "out there" what has been inside and repressed for so long. Once acknowledged, then eventually, the unconscious material can be disposed of.

Schaverien describes how Cassirer, to substantiate his case regarding the transference of attributes and states, relates the scapegoat process to that of alchemy. Interestingly, Schaverien points out that alchemy is an area in which Jung also recognised a comparison to transference in therapy. In Cassirer's case he was concerned to give an example of what was an empiric science and at the same time a mythical activity. Thus, in alchemy, there was both a recognised aim of objective scientific research and mythical subjective research. The alchemist was striving to scientifically produce gold

from base metals whilst, at the same time, conducting a personal 'spiritual journey'. Schaverien uses the metaphor of alchemy to describe the processes, as she sees them happening, in therapy when the patient is making art. She likens the artwork to the alchemist's vessel, a container, wherein the materials are mixed. In this process there is a transformation as the materials of the artwork are attributed with mental states in a substantial way. This is the process of the transference.

To validate her use of the ritualistic concepts of scapegoat and talisman Schaverien indicates that, historically, most scapegoat processes are ritualistic and tied to magic or religion in which the influence of the ritual can be enacted to intensify the experience. In our secular and scientific, twentieth/twenty first century, world belief in magic and religious faith have diminished and been explained as mere superstition and in some cases nonsense. Nevertheless, ritual, mythical belief and superstition are still powerful forces that are encapsulated in human activity and interaction. They may be observed in many disparate activities, structures and pursuits such as, sport, art, family relationships, health care and astrology, to name just a few general categories that present accessible examples. Consequently, Schaverien indicates, it is understandable that ritual and mythical activity have found their place in psychoanalysis and psychotherapy. In such intense personal experiences as these the rituals are observed and used to generate, or initiate, the dynamic which presents and intensifies the transference.

In chapter three of *The Revealing Image*, "The Picture Within the Frame". Schaverien describes the ways in which analytical art psychotherapy differs from analytic psychotherapy. In this she reiterates the argument already put forward by her and other art therapists that two of the main differences between art therapy and conventional psychotherapy are: the relative importance given to art produced during therapeutic treatment; and the fact that in art therapy there is a visual record of the therapy, in the form of the artwork produced, that can be used constructively throughout the therapeutic processes.43 To do this, and to reference art therapy's antecedence to fine art, Schaverien compares aspects of fine art and art therapy process and practice to argue that there are interactive values to be gained from both disciplines.

Firstly, she compares the art therapist's studio to that of a sacred religious site. This comparison links fundamentally with her concepts of the scapegoat and the talisman ritual. Schaverien points out that in religious ceremony the scapegoat ritual is practised

---

in the most sacred of locations. Spaces are designated and there are rules and conventions which have to be observed if the ritual is to have conviction and succeed. This, she says, is similar to art therapy where conventions, rules and methodology have to be observed. These "boundaries", the art therapy studio or room and the ritualistic behaviour set the scene and tone for the transferent activity which is to take place.

Schaverien uses the term "the frame" to describe the ability of art therapy to contain the psychic picture and drama that is unfolding. The art therapy studio helps to hold the relationship and alliance between therapist and client, this Schaverien conceives of as the "outer frame". Then there is the "inner frame", this is the client's artwork. It is within this frame that the picture emerges from the client's psyche and it is the picture which generates the transferent activity of the therapy. Interestingly, Schaverien again indicates that this inner frame of artistic production, at times, allows "an opportunity for self-analysis". Furthermore, she implies that the processes of dialogue between client and art therapist are similar to those of the psychic and visual dialogue that an artist has with his or her artwork.

Schaverien also compares the outer frame/inner frame experience of the art therapy studio to that of a theatre or art gallery. She argues that in our secular world theatres and art galleries can contain and ritualise experience in ways that have similarities to those of sacred, re-enacted and empowered experience. For example, in the art gallery the viewer is already in one frame, within the holding environment of the gallery, which contextualises the experience of looking and perceiving. He or she then looks within the bounds of the picture, the second frame, to experience the aesthetic and psychic material of the picture. This, Schaverien remarks, focuses the viewer's attention on the artwork and allows it to have its effect on the viewer. A similar focussing effect is achieved in art therapy. Though obviously in each situation, the art gallery and the art therapy room, different types of image are presented.

At this point I would comment that in the art therapy situation there is an expectation of transference and the objective to deal constructively with psychic conflict and pain that

44 Here there is a clear comparison to the theories of Marion Milner. In an article entitled "Aspects of Symbolism in Comprehension of the Not Self" Milner wrote: "The frame marks off the different kind of reality that is within it from that which is outside it; but a temporal spatial frame also marks off the special kind of reality of a psycho-analytic session. And in psychoanalysis it is the existence of this frame that makes possible the full development of that creative illusion that analysts call transference" International Journal of Psychoanalysis, 33 (1952): 181-195.

45 This resonates with earlier accounts, referred to in this thesis, by psychoanalysts of the comparisons between fine art and theatre to psychoanalysis. See Loewald, 352-371; Rotenberg, 113-127; Kaplan, 259-293.
the client suffers. This is not the case in the art gallery where, generally, professional artists without any psychopathological symptoms display their work. Nevertheless, perhaps there are more unconscious similarities than conscious ones. As I have shown, psychoanalysis proposes that transference is most likely to happen when one least expects it or without knowing it has happened. Therefore, I would propose that transference is likely to occur in an art gallery situation. Supporting this position, much of the research in this thesis has presented comparisons between both the products and processes of art therapy and psychoanalysis to the processes of fine art and its products.

Schaverien discusses the environment of the art gallery in ways that build in ritualistic and aesthetic considerations. The aesthetic is then intermingled with the psychological in her description of the ways in which artworks are framed. Using the example of paintings, she describes how the first boundary, or frame, to the painting is the shape or the surface (usually rectangular) on which the painting is created. Within this first frame the image is contained but, conversely, it is also unrestricted. By this Schaverien means that once the physical area of the painting is established it is the artist's own very personal space within which he or she may explore unchartered psychic and visual territories. The second frame is the frame which is decided upon for the finished work. The frame which delineates the finished artwork from its surrounding environment is as much a part of the decision making process of the creation of the painting as the painting itself. Sometimes a frame is not needed as the painting appears to have a natural boundary, it contains itself, or perhaps it is not an image that needs to be contained. At other times the frame might be elaborate and say as much about the artwork as the artwork itself. The reasoning behind the choice of frame is both psychological and aesthetic (71).

Pursuing the concept of framing of transferent experience Schaverien compares the picture to "a window on the transference... the picture is like a window with a view into the inner world of the patient" (71). She explains that, like a window, one may stand on either side of the picture, on the inside looking out or the outside looking in. The window she implies serves as a useful metaphor for transference and counter-transference. It helps to explain these complex relationships, for it is possible for the artist/patient or viewer/therapist to be either on the inside or the outside of the artwork/window. Taking the metaphor one step further Schaverien points out that (most) windows have glass which, to a greater or lesser degree, reflect an image off its surface which can be observed by the viewer. This, she writes, is close in analogy to the situation of the therapist trained to observe obscure imagery and to recognise his or her own counter-transference. Schaverien's description of therapeutic process here has
resonance to Patrick Casement's technique of "internal supervision" described in chapter one of this thesis.

In conclusion to "The Picture Within the Frame" Schaverien makes two further comparisons to fine arts practice. The first is to the art therapeutic "review" of collected works and to the fine art "retrospective" exhibition. Each, can have "a profound effect" on patient and therapist or artist and viewer. The second is to the picture frame and art gallery as organisational constituents. The picture frame is comparable to the therapeutic relationship, whereas, the art gallery is comparable to the art therapy studio. In each case the settings are used to organise and render legible what might, in other circumstances, be illegible or unfocussed.

"The Picture Within the Frame" is an extended and reworked version of Schaverien's earlier essay and many of her conclusions are similar. However, she does not sufficiently account for the similarities and processes of art and art therapy. I contend that Schaverien falls short of a full or accurate comparison. Firstly, she indicates that the client in therapy might make many repetitive images thematically related to expelling a feeling or manifesting a transference. However, she does not develop sufficiently the concept that artists also often make many artworks in series, or that they re-work, reconstruct and scrape down artworks, in the process superimposing, overlaying or altering many pictures, until they have completed as close as possible the image they wish to express, expel or resolve.

Secondly, Schaverien implies that artists "very rarely" reinterpret the same image and are "only occasionally [reinterpreted] by another" (75). This ignores the fact that artists have been well known to repeat and rework the same image time and time again. It is easy to see that artists such as De Chirico, Picasso, De Kooning, Moore and, of course, many historic examples such as Rubens and Rembrandt made art that was based on exactly the same subject matter each time they made a version or interpretation of it. In some cases the versions were almost exact copies of earlier works. There are also theories, referred to in this thesis, to support the argument that some artists, even though the superficial subject matter of the image changes, are concerned with making and remaking the same image for long periods of their working lives. Take, for example, the case of René Magritte, thematically, as Margaret Wolfenstein points out, Magritte repeated the same image over and over in different guises (Handler Spitz, Art. 75-92). Then, of course, Willem De Kooning spent long periods of his working life painting series of "women" pictures (Rosenberg, De Kooning). Whilst Henry Moore

---

made many versions of his mother and child sculptures and drawings (Fuller, "Mother"). Furthermore, looking at Schaverien's statement that one artist's image is only occasionally reinterpreted by another artist appears to fly in the face of the history of fine art. There are enumerable examples of artists reinterpreting another artists work. This, if nothing else, is one of the basic criteria of studio based learning and has been one of the fundamental evolutionary methods of stylistic and technical development.47

Thirdly, in discussing the comparison of art gallery to art therapy room Schaverien does not pursue the notion of the public versus the private nature of the venues or the activities of each. The conscious intention of producing imagery by either patient or artist is undeniably different. However, Schaverien does not develop sufficiently that the difference between the public and private viewing gives each its transferent power and potential.48 Images produced in therapy are produced consciously with the aim or furthering the therapeutic work, whereas, images produced by an artist are produced consciously to satisfy an internal need and to communicate the pleasure or pain of that experience to a wider public. Whether the psychic communication is on a private, client to therapist, basis or is generated by an individual artist for public exhibition is a matter, perhaps, only of the quantitative exposure of the transference not, necessarily, of the quality or integrity of it. It should be taken into account, for example, that Freud realised as much potential for transference in the group or mass setting as he did in the individual setting of psychoanalysis. It follows, therefore, that if transference can take place through an artwork in an art therapy room then it can also take place through art in an art gallery. It has been proposed by authors cited earlier in this thesis that there are examples of this happening in Freud's own writings and self analysis as well as texts written about Freud's motivations concerning artworks. It is established that Freud mused over and analysed Michelangelo's statue of Moses for weeks on end and deliberated for years before publishing his pathographic (psycho)analysis of "The Moses of Michelangelo". In turn, Freud's essay has fostered psychoanalytic studies of his reasoning for analysing Michelangelo's Moses. Many of these studies deduce that Freud's relationship with "the Moses" sculpture fostered transferent activity between Freud and the sculpture.49 In discussing the above points I am emphasising that


48eg., Ellen Handler Spitz's Art and Psyche reaffirms the transferent importance of fine art.

49(i) See Fuller Art; Vann Spruiell 473-492; Handler Spitz Art.
(i) The comparison between art gallery and therapy room can be taken further when it is realised that Freud's consulting rooms were not unlike an art gallery filled with archaeological and antique art works to which, it has been recorded, Freud entered into a dialogue with, or perhaps used in forms of transferent activity. Refer, Gamwell and Wells.
neither the art therapy room or the art gallery exerts exclusive control over the manifestation of transference but that it is possible in either place. Furthermore, following Handler Spitz, it is reasonable to say that in the art gallery situation transference occurs within the context of "normal" interaction and not psychopathological symptom.

There is one last issue that I wish to emphasise, in the review of this chapter of *The Revealing Image*. A more complete comparison of framing and the processes of fine art and art therapy could have been achieved if Schaverien had put emphasis on the comparative base of the art therapy studio to that of the *artists studio*. Of course, the art gallery is important for the public viewing of art and the transferent activity that it engenders especially for the viewer. Nevertheless, another, and primal, psychic dialogue analogous to that of client and therapist, as Marion Milner points out in *On Not Being Able to Paint* goes on behind closed doors in the artist's studio. Like the three cornered transferent interaction and dialogue of client, artwork and art therapist, the transferent interaction and psychic dialogue between the fine artist and his or her artwork is a personal and often three cornered activity between artist/maker, artwork and artist/viewer (Handler Spitz, *Art*). This activity of the fine artist might be on a conscious or unconscious level and is often a highly personal ritual. It must be said that Schaverien has already pointed out that art therapy patients are often in a state of self-analysis with their own artwork. Similarly, self-analysis, of various sorts, is one of the most basic traits of the fine artist. When considering the retrospective exhibition Schaverien writes that this type of event can have profound psychic effects on the artist and his or her audience because it can allow a greater analysis and interpretation of the artists oeuvre and life to occur. However, the artist *lives with* his or her own internal and visual retrospective throughout his or her life. The artist that is committed to his or her activity is constantly sifting through and going over the work and ideas that they have generated in their lives. This is often the source from which they move forward. Additionally, artists most often produce far more work than they sell or that ends up on gallery walls. Some of it may be destroyed but often examples, or whole collections, of the artists work remain in the studio, or close by. Therefore, they are referred to consciously or unconsciously as the artist lives and works from his or her self-analytic and continuous retrospective studio base.

In discussing the retrospective exhibition Schaverien contends, "My interest is to point out that this idea [the therapeutic review of a client's work] is one of the many areas of fine art which have been borrowed and adapted by art therapists" (76). She comments with reference to psychoanalysis:
My point is that psychoanalysis, through the use of couch and daily session, offers an opportunity to explore deeper unconscious material. It permits a freedom which is limited in the weekly session, where the patient has to be able to contain, and sustain, the material between sessions. I suggest that this could be seen as analogous to the artist, whose work is constantly in mind, and has a high priority in her or his life. In following this train of thought I have come to regard the process to which Harry was subject as parallel to the experience of the artist and of the patient in psychoanalysis.

He was engaged in the process five days a week, and even though the art therapist was not present every day, he had daily access to the art room, while the community interactions continued to be explored. Thus, his own process was always in mind, his pictures developing and finding expression as they arose. I consider that this accounts, in some part, for the depth of engagement and self-motivation which are evident in these pictures (162).

The self-analysis of the fine artist might not be a conscious analysis of the psyche, the analysis might, for example, be aesthetic and related to a deep consideration of the artworks form, surface or content. Nevertheless, the creation of artwork is mentally taxing, and at times a very intense mental activity indeed, that demands analysis through the artwork. The artist may not consciously interpret the analysis, he or she may not need to, (or want to). However, through the process of the self-analytic work, I propose that transferent activity is generated and incorporated into the artwork. This self-analysis for the fine artist most often takes place during the process of making the artwork in his or her studio. Therefore, I propose that Schaverien's comparison of the art therapy studio may not have been appropriately centred on a comparison to the art gallery. It should have taken into account, as well, the central importance of the artist's studio. As Schaverien indicates at one point, "the art therapist is like the viewer who visits the artist in her studio" (75).

Chapter four of Schaverien's book is entitled "The Life in the Picture: the Embodied Image". It is concerned with discussing the different types of transferent artworks produced in art therapy and the validation of both the process of production and the independent existence of the artwork. Schaverien posits that art therapists may not, to this point, have valued sufficiently their client's work from an aesthetic viewpoint. She suggests that as most art therapists have extensive art training and are often artists themselves that the aesthetic consideration of a client's work should be more valued and incorporated into a viewing of the client's art (79-83).

50 Accounts of the special significance of the studio to the artist can be found by such well known painters as Paula Rego and Frank Auerbach. Refer (i) Paula Rego, SBS Television c. 1991. (ii) Spender, Frank Auerbach.
Schaverien maintains that there are, broadly speaking, two types of image produced in art therapy, the "diagrammatic image" and the "embodied image". The diagrammatic image, "approximates experience and evokes effect in relation to it". Whereas, the embodied image "is formative, in the true sense, and it mediates in the space between patient and therapist." (85). Schaverien points out that often the two types of image are produced during a therapy, or that the two types of image can be intermingled in one artwork. Each type of image is valid in the therapy. However, in Schaverien's thesis it is only the embodied image which can become "an object of the scapegoat transference" and "may subsequently become empowered as a talisman within the therapeutic relationship" (86). By this she means that the effect and purpose of the diagrammatic image in no way contains the transference though it may greatly assist verbal communication in a session. Often, the diagrammatic image is of little consequence aesthetically and this helps to explain why it is not "imbued with life" (86). The embodied image, on the other hand, is an altogether more intense image in therapeutic and artistic process. It can be initiated in a number of ways, from diagrammatic beginnings, from mental imaging, from automatic drawing or from free form drawing. From this base an "interplay between the mental and the pictorial image" begins to emerge (87). The act of making the artwork begins to take precedence over the initial idea for making it. Through this absorption into the work, outgoings from the preconscious or unconscious are possible, they are embodied into the image "from a combination of selective attention and inattention" (87): "It is the life in the picture which distinguishes the embodied from the diagrammatic picture. The embodied image embodies unconscious processes, while the diagram may evoke unconscious processes through associations made in relation to it" (102).

As the aesthetic/psychic interplay develops unexpected events often take place within the process of creation which intensify the transference effect of the artwork:

> The act of drawing or painting transforms the mental image into an embodied form....
> Unlike the mental image a pictorial image can be carried, unchanged, through time... its existence as an object is potentially as significant as the process of creation (87).

It is this that makes the artwork so significant to the art therapy process. The overlap and importance of the substantial nature of the form of the artwork, between aesthetic value and psychic manifestation, is significant in the embodied image. Referring to Cassirer, Schaverien indicates that the unconscious is revealed in this type of image

---

51 There appears to be clear similarities here with the initial processes of the fine artist when making art.
because it asserts its formal presence in physical action. All of these factors are reliant on the patient's/artist's need to express the content which is within and all of these factors transfer psychic material into the artwork. According to Schaverien, "this type of image making is a form of transference which takes place in relation to the picture... the embodied image is an object of transference" (90). However, in the art therapeutic process this type of image is also reliant on the relationship between client and therapist.

Besides referring to Cassirer, Schaverien discusses the role of aesthetic theory in describing the making of the embodied image. Referring to Langer and Reid she writes from a position that is based in the practices of many fine artists:52

in the embodied image form and content are unified, and so the meaning and the feelings associated with it are inextricably linked. In the embodied image the form and content are unified in a way that may be expressive, but it is more than mere expression. The difference that I would postulate is that, in making the picture the person expresses feeling and, as a consequence, the picture may come to be an embodiment. In such a picture there is likely to be a sympathetic connection between the artist and the picture. The picture may be experienced as an extension of the feeling world of the artist/client. (92)

Schaverien comments that even though Langer's, Reid's and Cassirer's views are concerned here with the discussions of aesthetic values in "great art" these same values may be applied to art therapy. Indeed, in her discussion of the embodied image (85) Schaverien indicates that her views are shaped in part by her own knowledge of art and the aesthetic. In closing this chapter on the embodied image Schaverien writes of it in a context which, once again, has its parallel in fine artwork which is of necessity and by design a complex matrix of personal and cultural expressions: "The embodied image is multi-dimensional, multi-faceted, and simultaneously public and private. Such a picture exhibits and connects with feeling on several levels simultaneously" (102).

From discussing how conscious and unconscious life is transferred into an artwork Schaverien goes on in chapters five and six of The Revealing Image to discuss "The Life of the Picture". By this Schaverien is referring to the transference which is contained within the image and that which emanates from it. This is the "public" life of the artwork once it is created. In art therapeutic terms this public life is the effect the picture may now have on its viewers, namely, the art therapist and the artist/client. In

the complexity of the creation of the embodied image the image is now viewed acknowledging that complexity and responding to it. Aspects of the image that are spatial, temporal, tactile, sensual and aesthetic all affect the viewer's response and often deepen the transferences of the respective viewers. Interpretation, then, begins shortly after, or even during, the creation of the artwork. Often this interpretation cannot be put into words. It is non-verbal interpretation taking place within the individual viewer. This is particularly so for the artist/client whose fragility and resistance to the newly uncovered unconscious material may require a contemplative and quiet period of reflection before the psychic material in the image can be discussed. Schaverien identifies five stages in the therapeutic interpretive process which are generated by the life of the picture. The order in which they occur is not fixed and is not meant as precluding more or less stages in an event which is often dependant on the individuals needs. As these stages resonate so clearly with many of the processes of fine art production I here quote them:

1. **Identification.** The state immediately after the picture is made. "The phenomenon is bared", and the artist contemplates the picture. There may be a sympathetic connection. The artist is attached to the picture by the gaze. Words can rarely add to the experience at this stage.

2. **Familiarisation.** The picture is viewed and begins to become familiar. The artist begins to understand the "immanent articulation" of the picture. The picture is seen as "outside", and so this is the beginning of differentiation. Words are still not usually helpful at this stage.

3. **Acknowledgment.** The artist now begins to consciously acknowledge the implications of the picture. Speculation about other possible, previously unconscious, aspects of the picture. This is likely to be explored in discussion with the therapist and so words, and even interpretations, are likely to help.

4. **Assimilation.** This is the stage of reintegration of the material which is held in the picture. Having become conscious this is now owned and the implications assimilated. This is an additional contemplative stage and so it takes place between the artist and the picture. Words are unlikely to be needed.

5. **Disposal.** This stage is a direct result of the previous stage. Some embodied images become empowered in the process of their making, or during the life of the picture. Such pictures come to be valued as talismans within the therapeutic relationship. The

---

53 At this point, there is a connection to Lacan's use of the term "the gaze" in his examination of scopophilia and mirroring. For example Lacan connects "the gaze" with the transference activity of the artist: "I shall advance the following thesis... certainly, in the picture, something of the gaze is always manifested. The painter knows this very well... his mortality, his search, his quest, his practice is that he should sustain and vary the selection of a certain kind of gaze... you will see in the end, as in filigree, something so specific to each of the painters that you will feel the presence of the gaze." Jacques Lacan, *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psycho-Analysis*, (London: Hogarth and Inst. of Psychoanalysis, 1977) 100-101.
disposal, the last stage of the life of the picture, is dependent on the type or quality of
the investment which the artist has made in the art object. Some pictures lose their
power once the implications of the image have been consciously assimilated, others
continue to be empowered long after termination (106).

Referring to the stage of "acknowledgment", Schaverien points out that in this stage
there are some differences between work made by art therapy clients and the work of
fine artists. She indicates that the differences centre around aesthetic sensibility and ego
control. By this she means that there is a professional level of conceptual functioning,
with the fine artist, in operation which may be consciously diverting and controlling the
purpose of making the art object. The fine artist's reasons for making art can be
manifold and, no doubt, it would be reasonable to assume considerable influences
from, amongst other things, the artistic medium itself and aspects of aesthetic
sensibility. Therefore, psychic aspects of the work are often incorporated and/or
differentiated in the fine art work unconsciously. This helps to explain the difficulty of
verbalising the higher reaches, or spiritual levels, of aesthetic experience where words
are transcended by the non-verbal experience. The artist often incorporates content in
an unconscious, diverted or displaced manner. Echoing Handler Spitz, Schaverien
indicates this is one of the criteria that marks a work of art as successful. When art
"transcends the word" it becomes spiritual. It may be that written or spoken language
can assist the description of spirituality in an art work. Words may control or mediate
the unknown, unconscious content of a work of art. However, in describing visual art
they cannot arrive at the elevated aesthetic plane to which one is lifted in looking and
seeing, because the aesthetic plane which is experienced in front of the successful work
of art is beyond words. It has to be experienced first hand. This, in part, explains the
life that emanates from a successful work of art.

Schaverien argues in chapter six that many of the phenomena which occur in art therapy
also occur in fine art and psychoanalysis. A common factor to all three pursuits is the
"interplay" between, psychoanalyst and client - art therapist, artwork and client - and
fine artist and viewer. By interplay Schaverien means the intermediary psychic space
between the parties involved which "is notoriously difficult to describe" (117). Through
this interplay a form of relating and communicating is initiated. This is a
conscious/unconscious act in each case. In the case of the psychoanalyst and client
they will establish the intermediary space and relationship with words. The art therapist
will do the same with words and visual art. The fine artist and viewer will do it, by and
large, solely with visual art.
The fine artist paints to communicate, the viewer is the receiver and the interpreter of those communications. Each party attempts in some way to relate to the other. The exchange is mental and silent, it is an exchange on a private, visual and psychic level. Taking into account that the investment already made by the artist is of a transference nature, the viewer may now commune with the invested and live transference artwork with his or her own counter-transferences:

the viewer is deeply moved by such pictures, whether the effects are consciously or unconsciously received. The work of art can act as a conductor for deep psychic forces and channel a profound level of communication between viewer and the picture. Great art is intensely personal and yet it transcends the merely personal. It is the recognition of the human condition which is embodied in the work, which induces such affect.

In these situations there is the possibility for the merging of thought between artist, artwork and viewer. Referring to Wollheim Schaverien writes that the artist and the viewer are connected in a conscious/unconscious "possessive relation".

The psychic relationship operates in a space that is detached from real time because the investment is in and to the artwork, and the artwork may relate to events long since passed but viewed in the present. The live transference is fixed and contained within the artwork and may emanate from it or be "expressed" by any viewer that can relate to it:

In a successful work of art it is as if the artist has made a transference to the materials, through which attributes and states, which were known to the artist are conveyed.... A work of art is a form of intelligence, and an authentic presence. It induces a complementary response, a countertransference, in the viewer. The experience may be linked to the idea the viewer forms of the artist, and so the artist is the imagined person the viewer constructs. The idea the viewer forms of the artist may be accurate, but it may, equally, be very different from the reality. It may be an internal image which corresponds to something in the viewer's own psyche. This is a projection or a transference to the idea of the artist, which then extends beyond the remit of the painting. Certain pictures profoundly affect the viewer and may even alter her perception of the world. The work of art is, then, an object which mediates between people, and a triangle is formed which is made up of artist - painting - viewer. Even when the artist and viewer never meet, and even if the artist is no longer alive, the picture is a link between these two people.

These properties which are connected to the aesthetic experience are, Schaverien contends, employed into the art therapy process which is a focussed and intense psychotherapeutic situation.

Reflecting on Schaverien's position I would comment that the focus in art therapy, like other therapies, is on healing. It is in this context that the transferences in the artwork can be used and interpreted as healing agents, or in Schaverien's terms, a scapegoat and a talisman. However, in the fine art situation there is usually no conscious aim at psychotherapeutic interpretation, or healing, in the psychoanalytic sense. In fact, as I have argued to this point the transference of the fine artist is usually benign and not symptomatic. Supporting my position, Schaverien indicates that even if psychotherapeutic interpretation is attempted it is not an activity that can provide simple or immutable solutions to the personal narrative of a fine artist or the properties of a fine art object that can be considered definitive. Referring to Kuhns, Schaverien postulates, that this is partly because of the complex symbology introduced into imagery by manifest and latent thought processes and partly because of the complex processes of identification, familiarisation, acknowledgment and assimilation that she has identified as occurring in an artist's or viewer's responses to the artwork. Artworks should not be thought of as easy psychic communications to read just by the application of a few rules and guidelines. They are complex psychic structures that work on a highly charged interpersonal level. Therefore, often the interpretation is relevant only to the parties involved. As Handler Spitz has indicated in Art and Psyche the interpretation only assumes credibility in society at large due to its complex, well researched and well presented arguments.

Following Kuhns, Schaverien indicates that some works of fine art are given a special cultural status in society. So much so that they gain a life which is independent of the artist. In these circumstances the relationship between fine artist, and artwork and viewer can become intensely transferent. This helps to explain, she indicates, the great psychic, aesthetic and spiritual investment that some viewers of art make and, by implication, the reason why in a therapeutic context art offers such a useful way of eliciting transferences. Artwork created in the art therapeutic situation can contain the same attributes and states for therapist and client as fine artworks can for viewer and artist. Because of its independent status the artwork whether produced in a fine art or art therapeutic context has the ability to "speak" to its viewer; "They [artworks] inform interpretations... the viewer in this state is connected with the work and so, in a sense,

---

with the artist" (126). Referring to Handler Spitz Schaverien agrees with her presentation of the categories of the psychoanalytic interpretation of art; the "pathographic", the "autonomous art object" and "aesthetic object-relations" models as presented in *Art and Psyche*. As Handler Spitz indicates each category, or model, includes transference implications, none more so than the aesthetic object-relations model. Kuhns concurs with Handler Spitz's position concerning object-relations and, as I will show in the review of the final text in this chapter, Case and Dalley in *The Handbook of Art Therapy* also point out the significant role of object-relations theory in the development of theory within art therapy. Therefore, Schaverien argues, the inclusion of aesthetic considerations that have transference object-relations implications is consequential in the art therapeutic process.

Throughout Schaverien's text the importance of transference in the art therapeutic process is restated. In chapter seven, "The Talisman: the Empowered Picture" she describes how the intensity of the transference investment in the artwork results in the way the picture is valued by the client and therapist. To do this Schaverien uses the evaluative terms, "token" and "talisman". This comparison might be considered similar to her comparison of the terms "diagrammatic picture" and "embodied image". Schaverien explains that the artwork that embodies a transference may be regarded either as a token or a talisman. The distinction is made on the basis of how "the picture is incorporated and integrated in the therapeutic relationship" (137). For Schaverien, certain artworks can be imbued with a mystical or "magical" quality in their own right. This distinguishes them as a talisman. Other artworks, though very special to the client or therapist, may not have this visual, evaluative and independent status, they are more a record of the relationship. The concepts of magic, spirituality and religion are embedded into Schaverien's thesis and are furthered, as mentioned earlier, by her alignment with Jung's and Cassirer's theses concerning the importance of these phenomena on the human psyche. It is apparent, that nearly all of humanity, to a lesser or greater extent, has been, and is, affected by aspects of superstition, magic, religion or spirituality either on a mass or individual level. Of course, in contemporary and secular societies the way that this is expressed is often in a repressed, displaced or modified way. Schaverien argues that these *spiritual* qualities are incorporated into individual art objects to the extent that they can become empowered as a talisman. This investment can happen on a societal or personal level and it is this talismanic property which she indicates is utilised in the final processes of analytical art psychotherapy. For, once the client believes the artwork has incorporated, through transference, aspects of the psyche then these unwanted, or resolved, aspects can be disposed of in a way that suits the client. The investment of the artwork as a talisman is an intrinsic part of the therapy. In this, Schaverien acknowledges the ritualistic aspects of analytical art
psychotherapy. She argues that these aspects are needed in order to focus the transferent energy into the artwork. Superficially the ritual can be explained as a set of processes. However, without psychic investment, and/or inevitably belief in the processes, it will be much more difficult for the therapeutic treatment to have effect. Carrying the analogy of religious activity to analytic art psychotherapy still further Schaverien indicates that the client's are initiates in a ceremony that can be directed and, in part, empowered by the therapist.

The investment of an artwork produced in art therapy as a talisman, Schaverien indicates, is related to aesthetic values and the materialistic system that operates in society's connection with art generally. We are aware, for example, that great works of art are accorded "reverence" and some are considered priceless. This value of the original great artwork is entwined with its direct connection to the artist and the artist's psyche. There can be no replacement for the original artwork because it contains aspects of the artist's psyche which empower, and emanate from, the artwork in a live and transferent way. Artworks are regarded so highly, in part, because they are sublime or beautiful evocations of the human spirit and/or because often they connect with aspects of the human psyche that are forbidden, repressed or contentious. This gives the work and its maker special licence and power in society and cultural history. The talismanic investment in fine art by the viewer is similar to the investment in the artwork by the client/viewer "and sometimes by the therapist" of analytical art psychotherapy (147). Referencing psychoanalytic theory Schaverien gives examples of art being discussed in terms of its talismanic powers. She indicates, as others have, (eg., Fuller Art; Handler Spitz Art), that Winnicott's proposal of the transitional object comes closest to developing a connection between psychoanalytic and aesthetic theory. However, it would appear that Schaverien's thesis and art therapy practise consolidates and furthers Winnicott's unresolved proposals by cementing the transferent power of artworks operating on and within an aesthetic and psychoanalytic frame:

The picture in analytical art psychotherapy is animated by the transference and countertransference relationship between the people. In addition the transference and countertransference which is the aesthetic appreciation of the picture animates the relationship between the people (153).

In conclusion, Joy Schaverien demonstrates admirably the importance of transference in art therapy and the overlaps and implications with fine art that art therapy assists in

56 (i) Winnicott, Playing.
revealing. Central to Schaverien's discussion of art therapy and many of the other texts reviewed in this chapter is the artwork. It is made clear by Schaverien that an artwork, be it produced in art therapy or a fine arts context has the potential to contain transferences. These transferences can be made to the artwork by client or fine artist and they can be recognised by the therapist or viewer. Similarly, the artwork may evoke counter-transferences by the therapist or viewer which, may, inform, enrich or enliven the communication between client, artwork and therapist, or artist, artwork and viewer. Moreover, Schaverien argues that the artwork does not only contain transferences but that it can transmit the "live" transferences that it contains. Needless to say, this gives works of art a very special quality, position and potential, not only in a psychotherapeutic context, but also, as I will argue in chapter five in the ability art has to psychically enrich understanding and experience in society generally.

Schaverien introduces new terms to describe the processes of art therapy. Terms and concepts such as, the scapegoat transference, the embodied image, the life in and of the picture, and the artwork as talisman. These all help to explain processes in art therapy that are difficult to articulate and elusive to comprehend. To aid in this articulation of processes Schaverien introduces and discusses a series of stages that the client/artist works through with the therapist and the artwork. This analysis of processes reveals as much about the relationships of art therapy to fine art as it does about the power of art therapy to aid in healing psychic disorientation, conflict and pain.

As is revealed in Schaverien's text, we are all subject to and affected by imagery. For example, art gives us the potential to unload emotions and states of mind that, if not dealt with, might overwhelm us. Art presents us with a socially acceptable means of visualising and discussing our innermost feelings. This is also the value of art therapy except that in art therapy the therapist is usually working with clients that have distinct mental problems. In acknowledging the power of art, the professional artist and the art therapy client are acknowledging the transfer of internal mental imagery and empowering the image to represent their innermost feelings. In some cases, if internal images of significance are not acknowledged, by the individual or the group, they may well cause serious mental disturbance for an individual or society at large. Expressing the internal images, even if not fully acknowledged, understood or interpreted, at least allows them to surface on some level, and this is a very important safety valve for the self and society generally. One is reminded by Schaverien's text that art can and does cause public outrage, it may be denied or even destroyed.57 However, once it has been

57 This has happened throughout the history of art, one only has to think of examples such as:
   i. Edouard Manet's *Olympia* and *Le Déjeuner sur l'herbe*
   ii. Pablo Picasso's *Guernica*
   iii. Graham Sutherland's portrait of Winston Churchill
created something has changed that can not be reversed or denied. Similarly, in art therapy, recognition, ownership and acknowledgment of the image by the client, no matter how cursory, is on some level, recognition and acceptance of the power of the image to contain the client's feelings.

Summing up, Schaverien's book is lucid and compelling. Her explanation of the place of art and transference in art therapy is thorough and her comparison of art therapy to the world of art generally is relevant and direct. Her views draw many comparisons and parallels with fine arts practice. In principle, there are similarities here to Freud's view of art and his ideas concerning the narrow bridge between psychic stability and conflict when applied to civilisation generally. These are views that we should not necessarily be scared of or wish to deny.

The final text to review in this chapter is by Caroline Case and Tessa Dalley. The Handbook of Art Therapy is a comprehensive attempt "to give clear guidelines and a detailed understanding of how art therapy is practised and the theory on which this is based" (viii). The book is written from a British perspective in terms of how art therapy is practised. I will focus on discussion in the book that is of particular importance regarding art and transference, or that gives new insights into the relationships of art therapy, professional art and psychoanalysis.

In chapter three Case and Dalley discuss "The Therapy in Art Therapy". By this they mean the theoretical base from which it is practised today. Clearly, this base is psychoanalytic:

... as the profession and practice of art therapy has evolved, it is more and more based in the psychoanalytic framework through which the process of image-making and the relationship with the therapist can be understood (54).

A central concept to art therapy, reinforced throughout the book, is that of transference. For the transference to emerge through the therapy and through the art, a special set of rules, ritual, materials and "safe" working spaces have to be established. All of these criteria are arranged, directed or negotiated (with the client) by the art therapist. It is noticeable that all of the criteria have their resonance with the normal activities of artists and art making, namely: rules, ritual, materials and work spaces (studios) - all have to be established for the art making process to begin.

A recurring and popular psychoanalytic model in art therapy is object-relations theory, as developed by Melanie Klein, Margaret Mahler and Donald Winnicott in which the concept of potential space plays a significant role. The interaction of the potential space, Case and Dalley inform us, is re-enacted in the space of the therapy room, the relationship between therapist and client and the relationship between, therapist, client and artwork. Once the working environment for client, art and therapist have been established and secured, a main role of the therapist is as facilitator and validator of the art activities and of the therapy:

As the focus of the sessions is narrowed onto the object of the image and onto the person of the therapist, early infantile experiences will be experienced in the exploration of original relationships. This is how the transference relationship becomes established (59-60).

At this point, I feel it is necessary to remind the reader of ways in which the terminology of transference is being used here. The transference relationship is defined by Rycroft as the client’s relationship with the psychoanalyst (as representing an earlier person in the client’s life) that develops during the course of treatment (Rycroft 168). The relationship is the sum of the individual transferences to the point in the therapy that they have developed. The term transference relationship is often shortened to the term transference by psychoanalysts and art therapists to signify the transferences accrued to that point in the treatment. This orientation of terminology is often employed by therapists utilising object-relations theory. As Laplanche and Pontalis point out:

Following the line of thought that has brought the idea of object-relationships to the fore, there has been an attempt to treat the transference relationship as an expression of the particular modalities of the subjects relations with his different types of (partial or whole) object. As Michael Balint has remarked, such an approach ends by "interpreting every detail of the patient's transference in terms of object-relations" (460).

Case and Dalley indicate that object-relations theory has a major incorporation into art therapy techniques, and it appears that they are using the term transference to signify the transference relationship. For example, in their discussion of transference they describe it as occurring, "when the patient transfers strong, infantile feelings that originate from childhood experiences or early relationships onto the therapist". (emphasis added, 60). This appears to indicate that a set of transferences represent to them the transference relationship. To corroborate this they quote Freud:
What are transferences? They are new editions or facsimiles of the tendencies and phantasies which are aroused and made conscious during the course of the progress of the analysis, but they have this peculiarity which is characteristic for their species, that they replace some earlier person by the person of the physician. To put it another way: *a whole series of psychological experiences are revived*, not as belonging to the past, but applying to the physician at the present moment (S.E. vol. 7 116 qtd. in Case and Dalley 60 emphasis added).

Going on to quote Winnicott, Case and Dalley indicate that art therapy utilises the process of the transference relationship and the transference neurosis to interpret, organise and integrate the emerging transferences, 'so that they become part of the [client's] conscious ego-controlled content of psychic life"(60). They also indicate that art therapy methods incorporate Melanie Klein's concepts of the transference relationship So that, not only is there a reconstruction of the relationships of the client's past in the therapeutic session, but also, art therapists utilise the client's ways of interacting in the present, (in the outside world) as a mechanism for developing the transference relationship within the role playing activities of the therapeutic session. This way of working might well involve the therapist's counter-transferential feelings as part of the therapeutic procedure. As has been noted, in classical psychoanalytic procedure counter-transferential feelings are denied and the festering transference neurosis is promoted, developed, isolated and then interpreted. However, in art therapy, the transference relationship can be developed as a three way communication between therapist, client and artwork, allowing aspects of the neurotic symptoms emerging in the treatment to be directed into the artwork by the client and sometimes by the therapist. This way of working is interactive for client and therapist, not only because they are involved in the transference relationship but also because of the common interest in the artwork:

As art therapists, this can inform our understanding of how the process of transference operates within art therapy and the effect of the introduction of the art object made within the relationship (Weir, 1987). The process of making the image will set up three lines of communication: between therapist and client, client and painting, therapist and painting. The image often becomes the focus through which the transference relationship is explored. It holds the significance of feeling in that it acts as a receptacle for the phantasies, anxieties and other unconscious processes that are now emerging into consciousness for the client in therapy... it therefore must not only contain aspects of the transference relationship but a separate response also takes place in terms of the painting in its own right (62).
Interpretation involves making conscious unconscious processes and puts the understanding of this process into words. It can come from either the artist/patient in an attempt to make sense of the significance of her own work, or from the therapist who might see some important aspects emerging either in the picture or within the relationship. This can be either clarification of the transference process that has been going on between therapist and client or some feelings that are emerging through the image itself, in terms of symbolic statements (64).

Within, therefore, the art therapist's notion of the transference relationship is an acknowledgment that counter-transferences also enter into the relationship at varying levels. The acceptance of counter-transference as an instrument of treatment appears to flow from the art therapist's incorporation of object-relations theory, in which it is seen that the maternal relationship of mother to child is fundamental. Therefore, in the art therapeutic relationship, the therapist often accepts a maternal and accepting role in which acknowledgment of his or her counter-transferences adds to the value and empathy of the overall therapeutic relationship.

Similarly to other art therapists, Case and Dailey warn that interpretation of the transferences contained in the images of clients should not be made too early in the treatment, on the part of the therapist, as this can be detrimental to the course of treatment, making the client too defensive and perhaps destroying trust in the validity of the therapy. The interpretation should occur only when the client is ready and this may not happen until a long time after treatment has begun and many images have been made. This situation too has its resonance with fine arts practice. An individual painting may not have meaning by itself, or may not generate the significance for artist or viewer that a series or a whole body of work can. Case and Dailey suggest this process when they assert:

> How often one hears in a gallery: Well it's very nice - but what is it? The viewer is moved by the image but cannot stay with the uncertainty or lack of clarity because there is a need to understand it. The strength of feeling or impact of the image is in some way modified or even relieved if its content or form can be identified or "named" in a similar way to Bion's idea of generating "meaning" (65).

I would point out that this process of interpretation in fine art may never happen, as professional art is not made in the context in which there is a need for a psychic interpretation. This presents a clear difference between art therapy and fine arts practice. Art therapy induces a concentrated series of events that generates meaning and transference potential with the aim of interpretation. Fine art practice, on the other
hand, does not have this as its conscious central aim. However, this does not imply that transferences do not occur in fine art, but only that there may not be a direct need to interpret them. Referring to *Psychoanalytic Theory in Art* by Richard Kuhns Case and Dalley indicate that he identifies the potential for the phenomenon of "cultural" transference in "the art object" and counter-transference in the way it is perceived by the artist's audience. They write that he indicates the potential for transference in professional art lies in the aesthetic and "tradition within which the work is carried out" and "the viewer's response to the peculiarities of the object in terms of his or her associations and interpretations [of it]" (67).

Chapter four of *The Handbook of Art Therapy* gives perspective to the different theoretical influences which affect contemporary art therapy. Overwhelmingly, these influences come from psychoanalytic sources. Late in the chapter, reference is made to analytical psychology and the work of Carl Jung, but it is indicated that (in Britain at least) Jungian analytical psychology has been superseded by a return to mainstream psychoanalytic theory:

> The work of Jung was a major influence on the early development of art therapy in Britain.... It is unfortunate that the split between Freud and Jung seems to have cut off Jungian insight into the spiritual dimension of man's life from British mainstream psychoanalysis so that it often seems difficult to find bridges between a classical analytical approach and his work that had such early influence on an older generation of art therapists (94).

However, as I have not so far, made reference to Jung's influence on art therapy, I will do so briefly now and then move on to other psychoanalytic sources that have not been sufficiently discussed so far.

In total, *The Handbook of Art Therapy* pays little attention to Jungian theory and practice. This is not to say that art therapy is not influenced by Jungian theory. However, it does appear clearly, from this text at least, that the main thrust of theory in art therapy is psychoanalytic. Perhaps, this is because, as Case and Dalley suggest, Jungian analysis puts "less dependence on the transference relationship", or perhaps it is because Jungian psychology is too radically different in its theoretical approach (91). As they say, "In exploring a Jungian approach to imagination one is immediately involved in a whole new terminology" (89). Some areas of departure from psychoanalytic theory taken by analytic psychology, that may have caused confusion to a clear art therapeutic theory, include:
1. Jung's development of "the concept of two types of personality, introvert and extrovert, and four psychological functions (sensation, intuition, thinking and feeling), of which one or more are held to predominate in any one person" (Oxford 773).

2. Jung's renunciation of Freud's "preoccupation with sexuality as the determinant of personality" (Oxford 773).

3. The concept of a collective unconscious where archetypes are contained. Archetypes being "collective images or symbols".

4. Stress on "the importance of a search for meaning, encompassing religion and concepts of soul and spirit" (89).

5. Rejection of "the Freudian idea that symbols were forbidden wishes in a disguised form... concealing a latent or repressed desire" (90-91).

6. Seeing the work of art as outside of personal experience and a symbolic expression that emerges from the collective unconscious.

7. A conceptually different view of art and artists to that of psychoanalysis:

   Jung saw the artistic disposition as involving "an overweight" of collective psychic life as against the personal. He thought that art was a kind of innate drive, an instinct, that seized a human being and made him its instrument. Artists were not people endowed with free will who could seek their own ends, but people who allowed art to realise its purposes through them. He therefore saw a "ruthless passion for creation" and the artist's "personal desires" as being at war within them. Rather than art arising from the artist's personal problems, he saw art giving rise to problems in the artists by the developments of their abilities in one direction leading to a heavy drain on their other capacities which gave rise to difficulties in the personality (93).

Nevertheless, Jung employed the use of painting and drawing in the development of his therapy and perhaps it is this that influenced early art therapists. Jung believed that through art, his clients could identify the personal and collective symbols of meaning to them. The images produced aided his clients toward integration of the conscious and unconscious and aided their search for wholeness or "individuation". Symbols revealed in the individual's dreams were important factors to Jung and "He found that it was very limiting to attempt to pin down a meaning of a symbol in words, and that it
was possible to express dream images directly in visual forms rather than sentences" (91). To Jung, symbol-making was a "transcendent function". His stress on the creative activity of the imagination must also have appealed to early art therapists. Analytic psychology promotes the concept of self healing through a "growing recognition of the creative potential of the self" (91). Jung's aim was to produce a balance of forces between the conscious and unconscious and a recognition in the individual of a personal unconscious and a collective unconscious. It is in this area that he felt creative imagination and art could help. Jungian psychology differs from psychoanalysis in that it believes in a spiritual, archaic component to the psyche invested in every individual which is referred to as the collective unconscious. In some respects, there is a similarity between Jung's collective unconscious and Freud's later writings on instinct theory, super-ego institutions and mass psychology, in that both attempt to explain interpersonal and mass psychic relations and activity. However, Jung's insistence on the embracement of a spiritual, mystical and even religious component to his understanding of the psyche is bound to put him at odds with Freud's attempt to explain the workings of the mind on a scientific and rational level. Art therapy today, taking its main thrust of theory from a psychoanalytic model, is put in an invidious position. Many art therapists utilise aspects of Jungian theory, yet most psychoanalysts disagree with Jungian concepts, or find them incomprehensible.58

On that note I shall return to Case and Dalley's discussion of psychoanalytic theory that has influenced art therapy. The main schools of psychoanalysis they identify are 1. classical (Freudian) analysis and 2. the work of Melanie Klein, Marion Milner and Donald Winnicott, all of which can be said to be based on object-relations theory. Certainly, throughout this thesis I have discussed classical psychoanalysis and object-relations theory sufficiently for it not to be discussed further here. However, perhaps the only identity in the above group that I have not mentioned sufficiently, with regard to art therapy, is Marion Milner.

Milner's contribution to the psychoanalytic literature concerning art and psychoanalysis is significant and Case and Dalley indicate that as honorary President of the British Association of Art Therapists, she is a highly respected figure amongst art therapists. Her books including On Not Being Able to Paint, The Hands of the Living God and The Suppressed Madness of Sane Men (1989) have made a lasting impression on art therapy.59 Of central importance to art therapists in Milner's work is the thesis that art


can provide an adaptive means of realising the self. As a means of learning more about her own mental processes she decided to teach herself how to draw and paint. This experience had a profound effect on her conception of the powers of the creative process. In visual art she found that her feelings could be conveyed through line, space and colour. To Milner, a dialogue was possible between her and her artwork: "Just as in free imaginative drawing the sight of a mark made on paper provokes new associations: the line, as it were answers back and functions as a very primitive type of external object (Milner, *Hands* 92 qtd. in Case and Dalley 81). Through learning to paint Milner realised the psychic power of the spontaneous and intuitive image. These images of feeling negated the intellect, or suppressed it, allowing unconscious contents to emerge onto the "ground" of the artwork where a dialogue between artist and artwork was possible in the act of creation. As well as giving self knowledge, this process, like that of the psychoanalytic process, had to be understood and respected, because the power of this interaction between artist and her or his imagination could become so all absorbing that it could induce psychic instability and "a fear of letting in madness" (82).

Case and Dalley indicate that in *On Not Being Able to Paint* Milner recognises the similarities between artistic space and analytic space is a similarity concerned with transference:

In painting, one creates one's own gap and frame and fills it. In analysis there is a reflection of the framing made in the arts by the analytic time and space which becomes a constant for the patient, framing a symbolic mode of relating in the transference (83).

To Milner, art was like a private and personal language and this was its power and use in psychoanalysis; once the analyst learnt to understand the analysand's images, then the analyst could interpret them psychically. This, for Milner, is the relation between the analytic situation and art; within art, the artist has the possibility for self-analysis and self-cure. The artist might learn this process of self knowledge through art, or it might be an intuitive part of the artist's personality. Therefore, Milner believed, "Art provides a method in adult, life for reproducing states that are part of everyday experience in healthy infancy" (84). However, for the client in therapy this imaginative or "unknowing" way of creating, or behaving, might have to be learnt, or might be so terrifying that it will become the focus of therapy, allowing slowly, bit by bit, the unconscious "picture" to emerge:
It is a process in which the patient is enabled to do for herself what she cannot do on her own. The therapist does not do it for her, but she cannot do it without the therapist. The task of the art therapist is to facilitate a re-engagement with the past (59).

In *The Hands of the Living God*, Milner describes in detail the case study of a client's struggle for sanity. The client, referred to as "Susan", once introduced to drawing found in the process "a momentary integration" of her psyche. In drawing:

... she saw the paper as having a particular role, as it were a substitute for the responsive ideal mother, receiving from her hands and giving back to her eyes, a give and take on a primitive non-verbal level. ... The drawings were a foundation in communication so that she was able to get in touch with the deep layers of her self-knowledge from which she had been cut off (84).

Remarkably, Milner's treatment of Susan lasted over twenty years, in which time over 4,000 drawings were produced. This record of Susan's therapy is a testament to Milner's commitment to the uses of art in the treatment of mentally disturbed clients, and of art's potential for personal growth and self-knowledge. Case and Dalley indicate that her last book *The Suppressed Madness of Sane Men* is a summary and consolidation of her life's work in which the ideas of her earlier books are restated.

Chapter six of *The Handbook of Art Therapy* develops and sharpens the reader's perceptions of the ways in which psychoanalytic theory has been utilised by art therapists to clarify their position and discusses further the importance of art processes in therapeutic work. Case and Dalley basically concentrate on the theoretical models of classical psychoanalysis and object-relations theory discussed in Chapters three and four but develop and isolate three aspects of art therapeutic practice that can be further explained by reference to a variety of contributors to the psychoanalytic literature. Earlier in this thesis I have already discussed some of the contributors they mention. However, as there are some that I have not, I will briefly summarise the three processes isolated by Case and Dalley.

The first is the *creative process* of the art therapy client. Case and Dalley have already pointed out the importance of art therapists coming from an art trained background and being practising artists. This they feel is essential, not only practically to aid the construction of the artwork, but also for an empathic reading of the client's work and an understanding, from a practising position, of the often chaotic and vulnerable psychic states artists (and, of course, their clients) can find themselves in. To this end they review some of the important contributors to the discussion of the creative
process. Even though Freud maintained that "artistic talent and capacity were intimately connected with sublimation", it was left for later theorists to consider in detail, how the creative process achieved this (120). The first contributor discussed by Case and Dalley is Ernst Kris. Kris, they report, 'suggests there is a subjective experience common to all manifestations of creative imagination. The characteristics are a limitation of conscious effort, a high emotional charge, and a mind working with high-precision problem-solving" (120). He felt that artists had the ability to "tap unconscious forces" without surrendering control of conscious forces in their entirety. Instead, there is a relaxation of the conscious in the lacuna of creation. The creative activity of artists is, for example, unlike dreaming as artists still have a conscious level of control over their creation. Kris also put forward his thesis that art making takes on a "magical" or mystical experience because of its ability to capture and isolate events in time. This is particularly true of the visual artist: "The artist is able to preserve that which vanishes" (121). By a total absorption into the artist's unconscious, of that which he or she intends to convey, the artist is able to recreate new and original forms and solutions to psychic content. Kris considered these problems from a classical psychoanalytic viewpoint.

Ella Sharpe, on the other hand, viewed things from a Kleinian perspective and maintained that psychic and physical experience were entwined in the making of art. The entwinement goes back to the earliest stages of life and pre-dates oral language to a stage when expression and reciprocation were bodily. This helps to explain the re-emergence of those infantile communications in new and original artistic languages and forms:

The child communicates [it] by crooning, gurgling, crying, screaming, by gesture, urinating, defecating. The artist, the "pure" artist, communicates his emotional experience by manipulation of sound, gesture, water, paint, words. The same bodily powers are used as in babyhood but infinitely developed, the same substances, symbolically (as in water and oils) are used (Sharpe 142 qtd. in Case and Dalley 123).

For Sharpe, art performed a service to civilisation in its ability to alleviate anxiety and on some levels consummate an illusion of immortality and stability. Art allows "an ordering of emotional experience" and advances humankind's self-preservative

60 Ernst Kris, Psychoanalytic Explorations in Art (London: Allen and Unwin, 1953).

impulses in its abilities to sublimate aggression, anxiety, hate and fear and to incorporate love and well-being (122).

Case and Dalley then look at the writings of Anton Ehrenzweig, whom, like Marion Milner, had "a full experience of psychoanalysis" and was a practising artist. Ehrenzweig believed "that in creativity there was a conflict between conscious and unconscious control" (123). To him, conscious thought was marked by an obvious, highly developed, focussed and linear logic. By contrast, art products often seemed chaotic. He explained this by saying that in the chaos was the "hidden order of the unconscious". For Ehrenzweig, it is in the slippage's of art, between conscious and unconscious controls:

... [that] something like a true conversation takes place between an artist and his own work.... The medium, by frustrating the artist's purely conscious intentions, allows him to contact more submerged parts of his personality and draw them up for conscious contemplation. While the artist struggles with his medium, unknown to himself he wrestles with his unconscious personality revealed by the work of art. Taking back from the work on a conscious level what has been projected into it on an unconscious level is perhaps the most fruitful and painful result of creativity (Ehrenzweig 57 qtd. in Case and Dalley 124 emphasis added).

The dialogue between artist and artwork for Ehrenzweig was active and alive.

Considering the work of A. Storr, Case and Dalley report that he saw art and creativity as an abreaction. Through the mechanisms of creativity artists have a means of retaining psychic stability in their lives. He points out that even though connections are often made between artists, genius and madness, on the basis that all three often display neurotic symptoms, the artist is different in that he or she has an adaptive means of revealing the neurosis in the artwork. This he feels is a main benefit of creativity and on that basis posits that all human beings should have creative release. Pursuing the derivatives of creativity, Storr feels that these might be compounded by the human child's long childhood and delayed maturity compared to other species. Storr 'sees our "inner world" developing as a direct result" (126). As the child is diverted into the

---


63 (i) A. Storr, The Dynamics of Creation (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1972).
(ii) Laplanche and Pontalis in their discussion of abreaction indicate that it is an "Emotional discharge whereby the subject liberates himself from the effect attached to the memory of a traumatic event in such a way that this effect is not able to become (or to remain) pathogenic... concepts such as transference, working through and acting out all imply some reference to the theory of abreaction" (1-2).
conformity of culture and society, the sexual imagination of childhood is repressed but then satisfied creatively in activities such as art.

From discussing the creative experience, Case and Dalley discuss the second process affecting art therapy isolated from the psychoanalytic literature. This is the aesthetic experience, which, as we have seen from earlier accounts, tends to isolate the viewer or audience response to art rather than the artist's creative experience. Ernst Kris held that audience response is the reverse of the artist's creativity. So, whereas, artists move from activity to passivity, the viewer moves from passivity to activity. In this interactive process there are overlaps at centre points where unconscious and conscious thoughts intermingle; the artist experiences creation, the audience "re-creation". This is how psychic dialogue between artist and audience is stimulated. The dialogue is further stimulated by the notion of enjoyment and "play" when looking at art. This promotes the "aesthetic illusion": "The maintenance of the aesthetic illusion promises the safety to which we were aspiring and guarantees freedom from guilt, since it is not our own fantasy we follow" (Kris 45-6 qtd. in Case and Dalley 129).

Two comparatively early psychoanalytic writers on aesthetic experience, W.R.D. Fairbairn and J. Rickman are mentioned by Case and Dalley. Fairbairn contributes the notion of the art object as symbolic of the psychoanalytic object:

> Aesthetic experience may accordingly be defined as the experience which occurs in the beholder when he discovers an object which functions for him symbolically as a means of satisfying his unconscious, emotional needs (Fairbairn 173 qtd. in Case and Dalley 130).

Case and Dalley indicate that Fairbairn also developed concepts to explain aspects of the viewer's involvement in the aesthetic experience. He postulated that art promoted the aesthetic experience by containing within it the knowledge of creative and destructive forces. Good art, on the one hand, provided a means for the ego to connect with the forces of the Id, whilst at the same time, recognising the necessities of the superego. The Id is here being seen as the well-spring of the creative whilst the superego is seen as repressive and, therefore, destructive: "The artist represents in a neutral medium the

---


65 Take into account Picasso's statement that "a painting is the sum of its destruction's".
interplay of creative and destructive instincts and this allows us, the beholders, to comprehend better our conflicts" (131).

Rickman pursues the notion of art containing creative and destructive forces but adds two more concepts that enrich aesthetic experience. Firstly, he cites the sensuous pleasure derived from looking at art, and secondly the immortal or "eternal" illusion created by art which sublimes our feelings of despair in the face of our own mortality; "In all nature death is the only irrefutable reaction, the triumph and the illusion of art is that it can turn back the dead into the world of the living" (Rickman 308 qtd. in Case and Dalley 132). Once again, Case and Dalley tie back Fairbairn's and Rickman's views of the aesthetic experience to an object-relations base. Moreover, Case and Dalley comment that the aesthetic experience is related to the therapeutic experience in that there is a "loss of self" as the artist or viewer give themselves up to the "illusory role" of art, as a child gives over to the illusion of "play". Therefore, like play and like the therapeutic experience, art has the potential, in the aesthetic experience, to integrate the artist's and viewer's understandings of inner and outer reality in a symbolic and imaginary format. This process has great psychic value in reassuring us that we are not alone in experiencing the power of our imagination's.

Lastly, in their discussion of the aesthetic experience Case and Dalley consider the work of Adrian Stokes. Stokes agreed with the object-relations concepts of art providing a restorative and reparative means for the artist and viewer to recreate a harmonious inner world where there was a recognition of both creative and destructive forces. However, he furthered this view by maintaining that through the making of art and its appreciation an "oceanic" state of fusion and oneness was possible as artist and viewer contemplated its 'sublime' qualities. These moments of intense pleasure in the aesthetic experience are likened to our earliest experiences of harmonious pleasure of "oneness with the breast and the world" (133). But art distinguishes itself by not only offering the illusion or memory of fusion but also the status of "object otherness". By this he meant that he saw "the work of art itself as an individual object differentiated [from the self] yet made of undifferentiated [psychic] material" (133 emphasis added). Art to Stokes was "an emblem of the state of being in love" (Stokes "Form" qtd. in Case and Dalley 134). In its ability to bridge the gap between inner and outer world... fusion and object otherness... the art object becomes a "model of a whole and separate reconstituted object". It is apparent from Case and Dalley's discussion of Adrian Stokes' work that his concepts of aesthetic experience approach aspects of the transference relationship,

wherein, there is consideration and connection with the earliest object-relations of oneness and love, whilst at the same time recognising the otherness of relationship between client and therapist. Therefore, as in therapeutic work, art can integrate and create balance between the conflicting trends of creativity and destruction.

In discussing symbolism, the last of the three psychoanalytic processes that develop an understanding of art therapeutic practice, Case and Dalley come close to acknowledging the connection between the transference relationship and art:

The analogy of art being a bridge between inner and outer worlds is sometimes used by art therapists to describe their role as mediator and to describe the function that a picture can have, holding and symbolising past, present and future aspects of a client, linking unconscious to conscious imagery. All this, with its ambivalence's and conflicts, can be mutely "said" in a picture (136).

Case and Dalley briefly sketch the development of the psychoanalytic understanding of symbolism. Pointing out that Freud's early formulations of symbolism were as a defensive function, ie. symbols are substitutions for the desires of primary and secondary processes. They go on to discuss Ernest Jones' development of the theory of symbolism and his introduction of the concept of two types of symbolism; "true" symbolism and 'symbolism in its widest sense". By true symbolism Jones meant the symbolism of "intrapsychic conflict... between the repressing tendencies and the repressed... only what is repressed is symbolised; only what is repressed needs to be symbolised." By symbolism in its widest sense Jones implied that symbols are the stuff that civilisation is made of:

... if the word symbolism is taken in its wider sense, the subject is seen to compromise almost the whole development of civilisation. For what is this development but a never-ending series of evolutionary substitutions, a ceaseless replacement of one idea, interest, capacity, or tendency by another? (Jones 181 qtd. in Case and Dalley 137).

Current psychoanalytic thinking has taken Jones' ideas on board and furthered the range of symbolism. Symbols are no longer seen as just defensive substitutions for the repressed but also as allowing the possibilities of growth and adaptation. This is because they are now seen as operating through the ego, and super-ego derivatives, as well as the Id. Case and Dalley point to the work of Susan Langer and indicate that she introduced the concept that activities and institutions such as religion, art,

---

magic and dreaming were "languages, arising from a basic human need to symbolise and communicate" (142). Langer also made distinctions between discursive and non-discursive symbolism; "conscious rational thinking is symbolised through words which have a linear, discrete successive order. The symbolism of the primary process (unconscious) is non-discursive, expressed in visual and auditory imagery rather than words (143). As there is not a linear logic to primary process symbolism it is presented as a conglomerate or multi-layered "feeling". Primary process symbolism is distinguished by not being able to be put into words in an objective and logical manner, there is, as such, no vocabulary. There is only a "form" which allows the discharge of symbolised emotion and feeling.

To conclude their discussion of symbolism, Case and Dalley indicate that Charles Rycroft influenced by the work of Langer, has extended the psychoanalytic understanding of both primary process and secondary process symbolism to the extent that both are seen as adaptive if they are related and balanced. It is only when they are unbalanced or dissociated that symbolism can become symptomatic of illness. Therefore, to art therapists, this reading of symbolism gives new meaning to the power and potential of visual art as a symbolic medium. Visual art becomes not only a means of acquisitioning the symbolism of the regressed unconscious, but also a progressive means of letting unconscious symbols emerge and be re-ordered by secondary process discursive thought.

As a postscript to the review of The Handbook of Art Therapy I wish to discuss Case and Dalley's use of the term transference. I have pointed out elsewhere in this thesis that the term transference depending on how, where and when it is being used can have different meanings and interpretations. Laplanche and Pontalis for example indicate:

The reason it is so difficult to propose a definition of transference is that for many authors the notion has taken on a very broad extension, even coming to connote all the phenomena which constitute the patient's relationship with the psycho-analyst. As a result the concept is burdened down more than any other with each analyst's particular views on the treatment... on its objective, dynamics, tactics, scope, etc. (456 emphasis added).

---


In essence however, transference has the following irreducible characteristics. It is, "a process of actualisation of unconscious wishes. Transference uses specific objects and operates in the framework of a specific relationship established with these objects" (455). Laplanche and Pontalis point out that as a psychoanalytic discovery, transference is essential to psychoanalytic technique and, therefore, appears to occur most readily in the psychoanalytic situation. However, they also point out that transference occurs in situations outside of psychoanalysis and that Freud also realised this. Freud's own understanding and development of the concepts of transference changed throughout his working life. As we know, he first saw the phenomenon of transference as detrimental to psychoanalytic technique, but then embraced it as one of its greatest characteristics. Initially, Freud recognised transference as strongly associated with dreams. Transferences were a means for the unconscious to surface and this became their benefit. In the analysis they could be interpreted, manipulated and destroyed. Carefully managed, they could aid the therapeutic relationship, which inevitably develops into a transference relationship.

In the psychoanalytic situation the relationship often develops, aided by the transferences, into a relationship that mimics or re-enacts aspects of the parent/child relationship, though it must be kept in mind that this kind of transference and relationship is a result of the psychoanalytic demeanour and process. It is not necessarily indicative of the range of transference potential. Freud went on to realise that transference had far reaching applications and manifestations outside of psychoanalytic treatment and that psychoanalysis merely describes and utilises a phenomenon which is apparent in other situations. What is perhaps unique about the psychoanalytic situation is that it facilitates and channels transferences concerned with conflict and pain into a transference neurosis. The transference neurosis is an "artificial" neurosis that aids the psychoanalytic cure. To this point, this thesis has put forward the multifarious applications of transference in therapy and of the differing interpretations of what it is in therapy. This being the case, it will also be realised that there are many accounts by psychoanalysts and art therapists to indicate that, not only does psychoanalysis have many similarities to an art form but also, various types of art including visual art, can contain transferences. However, it appears that because of transference's importance and centrality to psychoanalysis, and therapies that utilise psychoanalytic technique, the interpretation and professional control of the definition of transference can validate the therapy and also limit the activity of transference to the

70 This is one of the reasons why I devoted chapter one to the definitions of transference. What emerges is that transference is a wide ranging phenomenon that is not exclusive to the psychoanalytic situation,
therapeutic session and its uses in the resolution of conflict and pain. The control exerted by theory, therefore, could be misleading.

What is required, however, is a realisation that transference (like dreams, parapraxis, jokes and art) is ubiquitous and a normal part of human interaction not necessarily connected with neurotic symptoms. Without this, one might be misled into believing that transference only occurs in psychoanalysis and related therapies. Nevertheless, I have already indicated that Laplanche and Pontalis point out the ambiguities and difficulties in defining transference. This is further confused when it is considered that "what psychoanalyst's mean by the unqualified use of the term "transference" is transference during treatment," and that the sum of the transferences culminate during psychoanalytic treatment towards a transference neurosis which is also vicariously referred to as "the transference" (455).

Pursuing the notion of professional control exerted by theory it is interesting to consider that art therapist's have incorporated transference through the use of psychoanalytic techniques into their working methods. In the glossary to Case and Dalley's book transference is defined in the following way:

Transference refers to the process by which a person in analysis or therapy displaces feelings on to the person of her analyst or therapist which were originally felt in relation to previous figures in her life, i.e. the patient behaves as though her therapist were her father, mother, etc. it is the resolving of conflicts dating from infancy and childhood through transference interpretations that form the basis of the work in psychoanalysis. In art therapy one works with the twin concepts of transference to the picture as well as transference to the person of the art therapist, i.e., the picture embodies thoughts and feelings towards relationships in the past (252, emphases added).

What will be observed from the above definition is the inference that the term transference is being used to connote the sum of transferences embodied in the artwork(s) and the client's relationship with the therapist. The definition also validates the art therapist as a bona fide receptor or facilitator of transferences. In Chapter three of their book Case and Dalley discuss the role of transference in therapy. It is perceived from an object-relations position. Working with clients that have some form of mental disturbance and are directed towards the art therapist for treatment, the client or the client's supervisors (guardians, etc.), have an expectation that the art therapist will facilitate the working through of unconscious contents or long forgotten

memories. The therapist's task will be "to interpret these earlier stages or experiences, to integrate them and to understand them so as they become part of the conscious ego-controlled content of psychic life" (60). In this context transference takes on a therapeutic role. However, this is only one of transferences potential roles or possibilities. In the conclusion to this thesis I will propose that what I am calling visual transference has uses and relevance outside of therapy.

Case and Dalley, in their references to transference, do not develop the theory that it occurs naturally in human interactions and most readily in art. What they describe is the need of an art therapist to interpret the transferences of mentally disturbed clients. They describe, not singular transferences but, the sum of transferences that amount to a transference relationship between client and therapist and/or the culminating transference neurosis in which, through interpretation, the therapist is able to aid a cure to the client's original neurotic symptoms.

However, one of the validations of this present thesis is that it reviews current research on transference and then ties it closely to fine art and an artist's major exhibition. The thesis highlights the potential of visual transference to act as a framework for the understanding of aspects of psychic phenomena in the fine arts. In fine art it is proposed individual transferences, or a series of transferences, might be generated by the artist, artwork or viewer. The visual transferences generated by the fine arts process are not symptoms of mental illness they are, however, connected to the artist's or viewer's unconscious.

(iv)
Summary Chapter Three

It is established in this chapter that art therapy has a clear and close relationship to psychoanalysis and fine art. We have seen, for example, that similar to Handler Spitz, authors such as Schaverien and Case and Dalley indicate that Winnicott's concept of the transitional object helps articulate the connections between psychoanalytic and aesthetic experience. In Winnicott's terms art does not have to be connected simply with illness and for Schaverien art can be a talisman related to normal and mentally positive experience.

When discussing the history and development of art therapy it emerged that an important debate within the profession, that is still relevant today, is whether art is an
aid to the therapeutic properties of art therapy or whether art is a therapy in itself. This
debate, though important to art therapy, I do not see as of immediate concern to my
hypothesis. As an artist, I am not specifically or directly concerned with art's healing
properties. My interest here is with the living psychic energy that artworks contain and
generate in the form of transferences. The emotions transferred to and from and
contained in the artworks are often unconscious and ineffable and can only be
expressed within the framework that art allows. Furthermore, similar to the view
expressed by Fuller in his essay on Henry Moore I do not see the need to apply
psychoanalytic theory to the work of professional artists in order to prove that they have
symptoms or that they require healing. As both Moore and Winnicott postulate, making
art is a natural process and not necessarily a symptom of neurosis or psychosis.
Nevertheless, through arts making and viewing we have the potential to work through
emotions and unconscious thought due to the transferent psychic energy that is invested
to it and emanating from it.

In the case of patients that are referred to in these chapters there are clear grounds on
which the psychoanalysts and art therapists can claim that the patient's problems and
artworks display psychopathological signs and symptoms. However, when discussing
professional and often renowned artists there has been a tendency, by some
psychoanalysts or art therapists, to refer to the artist and their work as if they were
psychopathological in nature. This is a reductive view and the problems with such a
limiting outlook are identified in a related context in this chapter by Maclagan in his
essay, "Fantasy and the Figurative". Viewing art or artists in the same light as patients
or those with diagnosed mental illness is inappropriate. Simply because art contains
unconscious thought does not mean it is a product of a psychopathological mind.
Transference is ubiquitous and can take many forms, it is not necessarily a process that
only manifests in mental illness. However, an attribute of art is that it can isolate and
contain transference. To say that this quality of art and artists to contain and generate
transferences labels them as psychopathological is misplaced and, of course, could be
interpreted in a prejudicial way.

This whole problem, it seems to me, goes back to the quantitative aspect of our psyches
first proposed by Freud. As he saw it, we all have the potential to have neurotic
symptoms, just as we all have the potential to be physically ill or injured. It happens,
however, that only a proportion of us do develop illnesses of a physical or psychic
nature that require medical treatment, and often, this happens at different periods in our
lives for different reasons. Art and artists, like others in the community are not all
psychopathological and do not overtly or always display symptoms. An artist's work
can be made for a number of reasons and can contain many aspects of the unconscious
other than those that are concerned with mental illness. Furthermore, these positive or "normal" aspects of the psyche are just as likely to be transferred into artworks in a benign and healthy manner as are neurotic symptoms. This positive outlook is what authors such as Winnicott are referring to when they discuss art as a cultural pursuit that enables creative living rather than the adaptation of the individual to live with psychic problems. The attitude that all art contains psychopathological symptoms goes back to a reductive application of theory by Freud and his followers. As Freud said it would, psychoanalysis has moved forward and its theories developed to embrace positive attitudes to art and creativity. For example, as we have seen authors such as Stokes view art positively. He sees artworks having the potential to be objects of love and intense pleasure. This view is acknowledged by others in this chapter such as Fuller, Schaverien and Winnicott who point out that art is not always, or necessarily a symptom.

In chapter two, the relationships between psychoanalysis, art and transference were identified and several positions emerged from the psychoanalytic literature reviewed. These included:

a. The importance of art to the development of psychoanalytic theory.
b. Comparisons of psychoanalysis to an art form and vice versa.
c. Differences between psychoanalysis and art.
d. Potential uses of art in adaptation.
e. The importance of object-relations theory to a psychoanalytic theory of aesthetics.
f. The use of artworks as transference objects and the connections of transference to art.

By reviewing art therapy theory and literature in chapter three the above points are reinforced especially the use of artworks as transference objects and the connections of transference to art. However, a significant difference between art therapy and psychoanalysis concerns the production of artwork in art therapy as a permanent record of the treatment and art therapy's ability to focus transference activity towards, and into, the artwork. These factors often set up quite a different dynamic between the two therapies. Central to art therapy's development has been transference. Art therapists have furthered the theory and practice of the transference relationship. It is seen as more empathic and less confrontational than that of classical psychoanalysis due to the use of artworks as containers of transference. Through this more relational use it is possible to look on transference in more holistic terms. Indeed, it becomes possible to put a greater value on positive as well as negative transferences. It is through this
evolutionary development and the positive views of creativity referred to earlier that I propose my hypothesis of visual transference.

Emerging from chapter three I identify the following salient positions:

(i) The importance of transference in the processes and theory of art therapy.
(ii) Differences between art therapy and art.
(iii) The abundant connections of art therapy to fine art and the overlap of rituals, symbols and transference activity.
(iv) Art as a permanent container and transmitter of transferences.
(v) Transference as a factor in psychic dialogue between artist and artwork, and/or artwork and viewer.
(vi) The potential for self-analysis in art.

I will now summarise the above positions which, together with those identified in the summary of chapter two, contribute towards the hypothesis of visual transference.

(i) The importance of transference in the processes and theory of art therapy.

The pattern that builds in chapters two and three is of the overwhelming evidence presented by psychoanalysts and art therapists of patients, clients and professional artists investing transferences into their work. To illustrate this I will refer to a few contributors. Among them, Levick, Ulman and Rubin point out that transference is ubiquitous. Additionally, many authors including Taylor and Spence indicate that art is a particularly good conductor of transference. Transferences in art, it appears, are incorporated in complex ways. Taylor, for example, discussing Picasso's work argues that he overlayed, compounded and fragmented imagery as a means of investing his artworks consciously and unconsciously with emotions and transference metaphors.

Transference is a central component in art therapy and this is acknowledged by several authors. For example, Borowsky Junge and Pateracki Asawa point out that art therapy in the USA from its earliest developments has recognised the importance of transference.

Schaverien traces back transference to physical and material antecedents. She argues that a phenomenon such as the scapegoat can help to explain the psychic significance of the transference object in art therapy. A scapegoat transference can be made to an art object, therefore, sublimating psychic and physical desires or instinctual needs. Referring to Cassirer, Schaverien argues that transferences are objective experiences
and may operate from person to person, person to object and object to person. Pursuing Cassirer's theory she maintains that, like transference, the scapegoat phenomenon occurs universally in various cultures.

Linked to Schaverien's view, Case and Dalley, when reviewing Stoke's work report that he considered artworks as both physical independent objects and psychic internal objects. This position, corresponds well to Cassirer's views on transference. Stokes' position is further consolidated when the similarities between aesthetic experience and the transference relationship are taken into account. According to Case and Dalley, Stokes considered art objects in a benign manner capable of incorporating intense pleasure and love, yet also detached objects capable of giving inner reflection. Therefore, in the transference relationship there is the possibility of positive experience in the potential space between art and artist or client and therapist.

(ii) Differences between art therapy and art

Althofer, writing of psychoanalysis, discusses the public nature of art and the private nature of psychoanalytic treatment. This, it would appear, is similar in art therapy. Confidentiality and security of personal content are primary issues, whereas, in fine art often the reverse is true. This difference, in itself, might lead to different forms of transference and different means of experiencing or expressing them. For example, it could be that because of the public nature of fine art, transferent imagery is overlayed and condensed in more complex or sophisticated ways as the unconscious attempts to disguise them to a greater extent than if the transferences were being made in therapy. In this connection, it should be pointed out that in art therapy there is an imperative and expectation placed on the interpretation of transferences in art to aid in healing conflict and pain. This imperative and expectation in fine art is not required and, therefore, this might explain why the concept of transference in fine art has not been developed.

The focus of Fine art is not with psychic healing but with such things as creativity, expression, symbolic activity and aesthetics. Therefore, I am positing that visual transference has not been defined as a specific psychic phenomenon from a fine arts perspective. The trajectory of this position is that when transference is discussed in terms of fine art there is no need to understand it in terms of its healing potential. Fine art and art therapy are different disciplines with different aims and objectives. However, as I will argue in chapter five, the recognition of visual transference in fine art contributes to our understanding of transference and fine art. For example, visual transference can be used constructively as (a) a structure, applied benignly, without the implications of psychopathology, to allow an approach to psychic and intellectual
contemplation of art and artistic activity, (b) a theory to help explain ineffable processes.

(iii) The abundant connections of art therapy to fine art and the overlap of ritualistic, symbolic and transference activity.

Case and Dailey, and others, have pointed out that most art therapists have an art training and are practising artists. Furthermore, early in chapter three, Rubin indicated that the conditions that facilitate transference reactions in art therapy are similar to those that promote transference in fine art. Pursuing this, she maintains that as the majority of art therapists are artists they can work through their own transferences in their own fine artwork.

Much of Schaverien's work concerns the ritualistic and symbolic qualities of art. These qualities also raised by other authors. For example, Wilson, and later Taylor, argue that the rituals and symbols that occur in the processes and products of art therapy also have equivalents in fine art. So too do Case and Dalley when discussing Langer's work. They point out that her views of symbolism indicate that it is non-rational, non-linear and multi-layered, therefore, linking it to such phenomena as art, art therapy, transference and metaphor.

In reviewing Schaverien's work, I discussed Freud's references to artists transferring unconscious imagery into their art in an overlayed and disguised way and of using art objects as objects of sublimation. I pointed out that this coincides with and reinforces aspects of Schaverien's theories. As I have argued earlier, the implications of Freud's and Schaverien's theories are just as important for healthy individuals as they are for people with psychic problems. By considering Freud's original formulations and Schaverien's new theory it is possible to arrive at a more specific designation of transference in the fine arts. For example, Schaverien points out that the ritual activities of the scapegoat phenomenon intensify the potential for transference in art therapy. Then, later she indicates that ritual is an important aspect of making and experiencing art generally and that the scapegoat phenomenon is not restricted to art therapy.

Schaverien's text The Revealing Image has many direct comparisons of art therapy and fine art practices. She identifies that there are interactive values to be gained from both disciplines. Schaverien discusses the art therapy studio as the "outer frame" of therapeutic and transference experience, where ritualistic activity can take place, and compares this to the "outer frame" of the art gallery. However, I argue that in doing this Schaverien overlooks the more obvious comparison of art therapy studio to fine
artist's studio. She refers to the client's artwork as the "inner frame" of psychic experience where transferent activity can take place. This art making experience, she indicates, is similar to the psychic and visual dialogue that a fine artist has with his or her artwork. She indicates that it is within the "inner frame" experience that self-analysis can take place. The outer frame/inner frame experience of art therapy studio, she explains, is analogous to the experiences occurring in an art gallery. This is because each has the potential to contain and ritualise experience. For example, in both situations the viewer, or client and therapist, is focussed on the artwork and it is in these situations that transference can operate. It is through such things as the comparison of art gallery to art therapy studio that Schaverien intermingles aesthetic and psychological concerns forging connections between the two. However, in some respects, I argue that Schaverien's analysis of the similarities between art therapy and art is deficient. For example, she points out that art therapy clients make many repetitive images to expel transferences. However, she does not discuss that artists also often make repetitive and overlayed imagery.

A major aspect of Schaverien's theoretical base is her five stage process of interpretation. This is reliant on what Schaverien refers to as "the life of the picture". Essentially, the life of the picture is the transference contained within and emanating from the artwork. Schaverien indicates that fine art also contains these transferences which are enhanced and deepened by the physical appearance, attributes and aesthetic qualities of the image. As I contend in chapter three and chapter five of this thesis Schaverien's five stage process of interpretation has many clear comparisons to the experience of the fine artist's processes of assessment and dialogue with his or her artwork. However, as I point out the five stage process for the artist does not happen within the context of psychotherapy and, therefore, the process for fine art may not have been articulated or acknowledged in the same manner Schaverien has for analytic art therapy. Nevertheless, it is significant that Schaverien indicates that the five stage process does occur for fine artists though this probably, or possibly, happens unconsciously. In chapter five of this thesis I identify, by referring to examples, how Schaverien's five stage process relates to my own artwork. Furthering her discussion of fine art, and echoing Handler Spitz in chapter two, Schaverien posits that it is the unconscious content of fine art that renders it ineffable and often marks it as successful.

(iv) **Art as a permanent container and transmitter of transferences.**

The theory of art as a container of unconscious material is clearly identified in the discussion of psychoanalysis. The art therapy perspective elaborates and consolidates on this position. Robbins and Levick, for example, view artwork as a container for
transference and Rubin sees transference contained within "artistic symbols". Case and Dalley indicate in their definition of art therapy that transferences from the maker (client) and the viewer (therapist) are communicated and mediated through the artwork and that the artwork provides a permanent record of these events. This is a position shared by Agell who points out that two advantages of transferences being directed into artworks are that it saves them being invested onto the therapist and also gives the possibility of art becoming a sublimational activity. Schaverien, again echoing Handler Spitz and others, argues that art becomes an object of transference and counter-transference. Pursuing this, she indicates that artworks can emit the contained transferences and affect the artist or viewer. This, she argues, identifies the artwork as a transference object enabling an intra-active and transferent dialogue for the artist alone, or an interactive and transferent dialogue for artist and viewer. This is possible, Schaverien contends, because artworks embody transferences and this is the life in and of the artwork. The transferences are embodied and remain alive as the artworks psychic presence and in its aesthetic qualities. Though Schaverien is essentially writing of the art therapeutic experience she validates her arguments by referring to Cassirer who was writing about the transference of meaning as a psychic and objective phenomenon in the world at large and by referring to authors such as Langer and Reid who were writing about processes, experiences and aesthetic theory concerned with fine art. Therefore, I posit that Schaverien's position furthers my hypothesis of visual transference in the fine arts.

(v) Transference as a factor in psychic dialogue between artist and artwork and/or artwork and viewer.

Case and Dalley in their definition of art therapy indicate that transference opens up a dialogue which is conducted through the artwork. The concept of psychic dialogue is developed by considering Althofer's discussion of sensory imagery which connects to Freud's views on "thought transference" and Casement's theories on the unconscious to unconscious exchange of transference material. Althofer discusses the thematic threads that link sensory imagery. In this there is an analogy to the knowledge of an artist's work which is built up through stylistic and psychic similarities and working on themes or in a series. She points out that the thematic links, in turn, feed the dialogue of sensory imagery. Althofer's position, concerning sensory imagery, I reason, would also support the concept of transference between artist, artwork and viewer. The concept of thematic linking is developed by Birtchnell's position that art is an individual's personal language. He proposes that by following the themes and imagery of an artist's work over a series of artworks, or period in the artist's life and the context in which they are made and presented, visual and psychic knowledge of the artist's
work can be interpreted. The thematic transferences, Birtchnell posits, may be incorporated in the work in multi-layered and disguised ways but it is from them and knowledge of the artist's life that the personal language of the artist may be deciphered. Then again, for Cardinal, artworks that are hundreds of years old can embody, emit and promote transferent and counter-transferent dialogue that can have manifest significance for an individual if he or she can empathise with them.

Schaverien furthers the concept of the similarities between fine art and psychoanalytic processes by discussing processes common to fine art, art therapy and psychoanalysis. For example, she discusses the "interplay" or "intermediary psychic space" that operates between all three pursuits. She argues that in the case of fine art there is often a silent mental dialogue of transferent exchanges occurring between artist and artwork and/or artwork and viewer. It is this process that I am isolating in my thesis. Following Wollheim she refers to intermediary psychic space as a conscious/unconscious "possessive relation". This phenomenon is the "live" transference contained in the artwork and emanating from it. It is this that I am referring to as visual transference.

The visually transferent dialogue is silent and Rhyne refers to the difficulty of expressing imagery in words, whilst Robbins and later Spence and then Schaverien refer to art expressing thoughts that go far beyond words or the need for them. The difficulty in expressing verbally, or in literary terms, aspects of the unconscious that are sealed into images is explained by Levens as due to counter-transferent defence mechanisms. This position is supported by that of Case & Dalley when writing of Milner's and then Ehrenzweig's work. They argue that the artist enters an inner dialogue. The dialogue is between the artist's conscious and unconscious mind and can be a form of self-analysis.

(vi) The potential for self-analysis in art.

In this summary I have already identified several references to the self-analytic potential of art. Besides these we have seen that Wang argues that in therapy the artwork, due to transference, can help clients understand themselves and their relationships as well as giving them satisfaction through creative expression. Schaverien concurs with this view pointing out that in her therapy self-analysis is encouraged as an agent for reflection and interpretation. Many of Schaverien's propositions draw on analogies to fine art and/or research that can be applied to both art therapy and fine art. This is so in her discussion of the self-analytic properties of art and on this basis I argue that the processes Schaverien describes can and do occur on either a conscious or unconscious level in
fine art. However, by omitting to discuss the artist's studio as a site of transference Schaverien does not address the potential to compare self-analytic activity between art therapy and fine art practices in this situation. Nevertheless, the potential for self-analytic activity in the fine arts is an issue that I address in chapters four and five.

In conclusion, Case and Dalley indicate, the self-analytic potential of art is recognised by Milner who posits that the difference between the patient's and artist's ability to undertake self-analytic work is often determined by the fragile state of the patient's mental condition.

In chapters two and three we have seen the many overlaps in theory and practice between psychoanalysis and art therapy. These include:

* The importance of art to the development of theory and practice in both disciplines.
* The relevance of object-relations theory to a psychoanalytic understanding of artistic and aesthetic processes.
* The use of artworks as transference objects and the connections of transference to art.
* Art as a permanent container and transmitter of transferences.
* Transference as a factor in psychic dialogue between artist and artwork and/or viewer and artwork.
* The potential for self-analysis in art.

In the remaining chapters I will go on to document and examine my own artwork and my psychic relations to aspects of it. In this process I aim to identify and isolate visual transference and discuss its characteristics. In chapter three I have already pointed towards these by discussing the differences between art therapy and art. However, there are also many similarities between fine art and art therapy identified in chapter three. Because of these similarities I posit that transference in the fine arts must be identifiable in its own right without the overtones of mental illness. It is unreasonable, reductive and may have prejudicial outcomes to assume that the visual transferences in fine art necessarily contain psychopathological symptoms. Acknowledging that art has its own particular potential to generate transferences that are part of "normal" mental functioning widens our understanding of art and transference.
ART AND TRANSFERENCE

A Comparative Study of Psychoanalytic Transference and Art and Documentation of the Exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF CREATIVE ARTS

from

THE UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

ANTHONY HULL

B.A. (Hons.,) Camberwell,
A.T.C., Goldsmiths, London

FACULTY OF CREATIVE ARTS
1997
CERTIFICATION

I certify that this work has not been submitted for a degree to any other university or institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by any other person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

Anthony Hull
18th April, 1997
ART AND TRANSFERENCE

A Comparative Study of Psychoanalytic Transference and Art and Documentation of the Exhibition Memory Mammary Mummery

ABSTRACT

Interpretations of the psychic contents of art, their means of transmission, the motivations of the artist, the viewer's response and a personal documentation of an artist's major exhibition are linked in this thesis. In Chapter One an examination is made of definitions of transference, transference-neurosis and counter-transference and these terms are put into a developmental and historic context. In Chapter Two consideration is given to the importance of transference in psychoanalysis and of the clear linking of art with transference from the earliest days of the development of psychoanalysis. Data is referred to that connects Freud's interest in art with a deliberate attempt at manipulation of art to serve his needs. Material is then put forward, both contemporary and historical, that compares psychoanalysis to an artform, the psychoanalyst to an artist and psychoanalytic consultations to artworks. What emerges is the centrality of transference to both art and psychoanalysis.

In Chapter Three consideration is made of the importance of psychoanalytic theory to art therapy and its specific uses of transference. Similar to psychoanalysis, though perhaps with more obvious connections, substantial data is presented that relates the therapeutic alliance of client, art and therapist to the roles of artist, art and viewer. Art therapists, generally, are also practising artists. Consequently, the connections and overlaps of transference in both of the professions they pursue is significant. Art therapy, therefore, emerges as an intermediary point of reference between psychoanalysis and fine art.

Chapter Four is a visual and literary documentation of the author's major art exhibition associated with this thesis. It considers the concepts and language that relate psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art to transference. The documentation encompasses and records the processes of making work for the exhibition whilst, at the same time, researching the psychic phenomena discussed above. Chapter five, the conclusion, reasons that transference offers a means of interpretation in visual art that has, to this point in time, been unrecognised in any direct way by artists. The thesis addresses this situation by presenting the authors hypothesis of visual transference in art and brings together in a comparative context contemporary thought from the areas of psychoanalysis, art therapy and visual art.
FOR MY FAMILY

PAST PRESENT AND FUTURE
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume One**

Acknowledgments

Introduction 1

Chapter One - The Definitions of Transference:

(i) Background to the texts used 7
(ii) Transference 9
(iii) Transference-Neurosis 14
(iv) Counter-Transference 17
(v) Summary 23

Chapter Two - A Review of Contemporary Data from Psychoanalytic Sources:

(i) Introduction 25
(ii) Freud's interest in Art 26
(iii) The Work of Ellen Handler Spitz 34
(iv) Other Contemporary Writing 63
(v) Summary 85

Chapter Three - A Review of Contemporary Data from Art Therapy Sources:

(i) Introduction 90
(ii) A Background to Art Therapy 91
(iii) Contemporary Writing 100
(iv) Summary 172
Volume Two

Chapter Four - Documentation of the Work presented in the Exhibitions:
* * Memory, Mammary, Mummy, Wollongong City
  Gallery 1992
* * Illusive Reality, University of Western Sydney 1993
* * Memory, Mammary, Mummy, University of Wollongong 1995
(i) Introduction 182
(ii) Discussion of the Artwork 187
(iii) Summary 318

Chapter Five - Conclusion, parts:
(i) 331
(ii) 336
(iii) 348
(iv) 357

List of Plates 359

Bibliography 362

Appendix:
Catalogue 370
Résumé
Exhibition Brochure
CHAPTER FOUR

DOCUMENTATION OF THE WORK PRESENTED IN THE EXHIBITION, *MEMORY, MAMMARY, MUMMERY*

(i)

Introduction

In chapter four I will discuss and review the concepts and content contained in my artwork and consolidate the hypothesis concerning art and transference. Where I identify obvious connections with psychoanalytic theory in the artwork I will point these connections out as they will often assist in identifying transferent material. However, it must be realised that the documentation in chapter four is invested with references to psychoanalytic concepts and it should be closely read in this light. This has been done deliberately to suggest possible interpretive formats to the reader. At points there are descriptive passages in the documentation that not only reference psychoanalytic and art therapeutic concepts but also indicate how I perceive the work self-analytically. Nevertheless, it must be realised that, if the self-analysis is anywhere it is in the artwork.

Reflecting on my overall project of artwork, exhibition and thesis I wish firstly to point out the chronology and relationship between these things. After commencing study in 1988 I spent a year defining my thesis topic and writing a substantial progress report. Having done this, I then put emphasis on making the artwork for exhibition. This, I considered, would give me time to work through and familiarise myself with some of the theoretical, formal and technical problems in writing a thesis whilst, at the same time, making artwork for exhibition. Consequently, the main focus of the first four years of my study was on making artwork. During this period I was also researching data for the thesis. I feel it is important to explain that the artworks were completed before the thesis. The artworks were driven by an intuitive and introspective search through my psyche attempting to reveal glimpses of my unconscious, rather than works made to explain a theoretical position. This is not to say that I was not absorbing
psychoanalytic concepts along the way but, rather, that the artwork has always had its own momentum, independent of the thesis topic, driven by my personal concerns.

Even though there are, from the earliest times, countless references to art and artists in the psychoanalytic and art therapeutic literatures concerning transference, I have been unable to find any direct references to it in visual art texts. However, there are innumerable references to psychoanalysis. Since Freud's earliest developments, psychoanalysis has been one of the most widely used and controversial psychological theoretical positions applied to the discussion of art and artists. It is, therefore, unusual that transference, one of the fundamental cornerstones of psychoanalytic theory and practice, has been neglected by art theorists whilst it has been made so much of by psychoanalysts and art therapists.

The works that artists produce are objects. In making work for the exhibition I had the intention of investing objects with conscious and unconscious thought... the objects were containers for conscious and unconscious thought, they capture conscious and unconscious energy. This brings into focus the use of the word object. Psychoanalytically the word is important. Rycroft defines it as "that towards which action or desire is directed; that which the subject requires in order to achieve instinctual satisfaction; that to which the subject relates himself. In psychoanalytical writings, objects are nearly always persons, parts of persons, or symbols of one or the other"(Rycroft, Critical 100). In a psychoanalytic consultation the analyst often becomes the object onto which the subject transfers unconscious content. The content is, during the course of the analysis, then interpreted. The interpretation and opportunity to unload the psychic content can, for example, facilitate recognition for the subject and lead to a cure of the symptoms or a restructuring of the psychic energy so that sublimation can be achieved. Significantly, in art therapy it is held that the subject transfers unconscious content in the same way into artwork. It is clear too that Freud believed that artists, in particular, have a special disposition which enables them to achieve the transfer of unconscious content into their work:

The deeper you penetrate into the pathogenesis of nervous illness, the more you will find revealed the connection between the neuroses and other productions of the human mind, including the most valuable... The energetic and successful man is one who succeeds by his efforts in turning his wishful phantasies into reality... In certain favourable circumstances, it still remains possible for him to find another path leading from these phantasies to reality, instead of becoming permanently estranged from it by regressing to infancy. If a person who is at loggerheads with reality possesses an artistic gift (a thing that is still a psychological mystery to us), he can transform his
phantasies into artistic creations instead of into symptoms... The neuroses have no psychical content that is peculiar to them and that might not equally be found in healthy people... Whether that struggle ends in health, in neurosis, or in countervailing superiority of achievement, depends on quantitative considerations, on the relative strength of the conflicting forces... You must not suppose, moreover, that the phenomenon of transference (of which, unfortunately, I can tell you all too little today) is created by psycho-analytic influence. Transference arises spontaneously in all human relationships... the less its presence is suspected, the more powerfully it operates. So psychoanalysis does not create it, but merely reveals it to consciousness and gains control of it in order to guide psychical processes, towards the desired goal. (S.E. vol. 11 49-51).

Consequently, I have deliberately conflated the use of the term object in titling works for this exhibition to bring into focus its fine art and psychoanalytic significance.

The format for presentation used in this chapter is as follows. To document the artworks I present a colour photocopy of each piece proceeded by a discussion of the individual work. However, where there is a series of work (e.g., Object Relations) I commence the discussion with an overview of that series.

Part of the project for this exhibition was to combine ceramics and painting, the two areas of my professional practice, into one art form. Over the period of making the artwork I developed a method that enabled me to create "paintings" that contained ceramic components. The successful combining of ceramic into the formal constructs of a painting is a complex and challenging project. To achieve this the artworks were made of component parts: oil paint, ceramic, wood and glass. To help with the time-consuming and complex organisational frame needed for the construction of these objects I developed a journal system of working notes and drawings. The journal entry for each artwork usually started with a random idea connected to my working concerns that might come into my head at any time. As will be understood, this is a working process that many artists use and often acts as the starting point for a major work. I see these random thoughts as "glimpses", or as a spontaneous self-analytic method of free-association, when tiny fragments of the unconscious break through, unexpectedly, into consciousness.¹ The journal for each work was developed with diagrammatic sketches, again snatching at random ideas and then a working list (or plan) of notes on how I was to construct the artwork. Even though fragmentary, the journal followed each piece (or series) through from conception to completion. This method of working

¹ This is the term Willem De Kooning uses to describe those rare moments of spontaneous recognition of the unconscious in painting. Refer: Harold Rosenberg, De Kooning (New York: Abrams, 1974).
was useful as a conceptual structure, especially with the earlier work, as I was working through ideas and building up continuity. The notes and sketches were flexible and could be reviewed and altered. This allowed me to develop ideas in the work as it was being made. As I find it necessary or appropriate during the discussion of the artwork I will refer to a paraphrased account from my journal notes.

Considering the method I am describing above I can see how this relates to Schaverien's theories concerning "the embodied image" and how transferences are invested into artworks. Schaverien describes the process by which clients in art therapy access their pre-conscious and unconscious imagery. The artist/client initiates the embodied image from a range of possible motivating processes. These include such things as, (i) freely associating to imagery as it occurs, (ii) working from a pre-conceived idea, (iii) doodling or playing with art materials, (iv) reacting to marks and textures, (v) initiating major works from diagrammatic beginnings, (vi) associating words and images, and generally going through a series of developmental stages until the embodied image is arrived at. Schaverien indicates, that it is from these tentative first steps that significant artworks are created that embody transferences and reveal the client's unconscious:

thus the physical act of painting takes precedence over the original idea. Even when there was a preconceived aim, the picture develops in unexpected ways and usually takes a form which could not have been predicted and so it may surprise even its maker. The colours, shapes and figurations combined, may reveal previously unconscious aspects of the client's intra-psychic life (87).

The text in chapter four is often constructed from three sources. Firstly, there is a paraphrased account from my journal which analyses the image during or shortly after it is made. Secondly, there are the innumerable references, explicitly or implicitly used, related to psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theories which contextualise and tie back my propositions concerning visual transference, demonstrated in the artwork, to a theoretical construct that has been developed in chapters one, two and three. Thirdly, there is additional text written some time after the work was made. This text is further analysis of my reasons for making the artwork which often identifies the realisation I have of the visual transferences contained in it.

In this introduction, to a discussion concerning the artwork, I also wish to bring to the readers attention the brochure produced by Wollongong City Gallery and included in the appendix to this thesis. In designing the content of the brochure I decided that I wanted it to be more than a dry theoretical commentary on the artwork. I wanted the
text in the brochure to be a response to the artwork written by practising artists from the perspective of their own artistic insights. Consequently, three out of four of the contributors are artists. I asked the contributors, Robert Hood, Debbie Westbury, Lachlan Harris and Ron Mathers to view the work prior to the exhibition and we discussed the way their contribution would be handled. It was agreed that each person would write a short response to the work from the perspective of their expertise and that no constraints were to be put on the nature of their response or on how it was to be written. Each of the contributors did empathise with my working concerns, however, it was agreed that there would be no discussion of the work with me prior to their viewing and that after the viewing I would only respond to questions they needed answered in order to construct their individual texts.

The result was a document with a unique artistic momentum. I am deeply grateful to the contributors to the brochure. Each has given his or her response to my artwork and in the case of Debbie Westbury and Robert Hood they have created artworks of their own in the process. I am inspired by their artwork. I am intrigued by the perception of all four contributors and can only thank them. In some small way the perceptive level on which their works were written confirms aspects of my research concerning transference and counter-transference.

In the context of the exhibition and brochure it is relevant to consider the following position taken by Ellen Handler Spitz in *Art and Psyche*:

... "free play" is fundamental to our experience in art; we must be able to give ourselves up to the painting, the sculpture, the music, the drama and allow it to control us... To state my point in another way, in aesthetic experience and in applying psychoanalysis to art, the analyst/interpreter must assume (at least intermittently) the role of patient himself, in the sense that he must permit himself the luxury of free association within the presence of the works he seeks to interpret in order to learn from them and to experience his own inner change in their presence (94).

---

2 (i) Debbie Westbury's poem *The Gaze* is included in her recent book of poetry, *Our Houses Full of Smoke.* (Sydney: Angus and Robertson, 1994).

(ii)

Discussion of the Artwork
THE SEARCH
The Search
The Search

Artworks such as this take a long time to construct. I started work on this piece in 1988 and completed the work in January 1990. Because of the time involved in such work, one has to start with a concept, even if the concept is not too clear at the outset. To some extent, all the work in this exhibition traces the development (to that point) of my research into transference and into areas of my psyche that I had previously ignored or made no conscious attempt to examine. However, these twin aims were and have increasingly become, the central focus of my doctoral study and artistic practice. As artworks of this kind develop, due to their complexity and time consuming methods of production, ideas and priorities in the artwork mature and change in the process. I look on this as a positive feature as it allows ample time for a complex dialogue to develop with the work. In this there is a relationship to psychoanalytic and art therapeutic practise. It has already been established that these therapies often involve lengthy periods of regular (weekly or daily) treatment that can continue for years as the focus of the treatment changes and evolves. Schaverien has also pointed out that as "embodied" artworks emerge in art therapy they take on an evolving life of their own that generate visual, unconscious and conscious dialogue that incorporate transferences.

I originally started work on The Search by making the central self-portrait in clay. This was worked up from an analytic and intense drawing in charcoal and pencil. Further design drawings developed the idea of embedding the ceramic self-portrait into paint. The interpretation of the charcoal and pencil drawing into a ceramic drawing changed the appearance of the self-portrait significantly. From being a psychologically intense drawing of myself in middle age it became an idealised outline and contour drawing reflecting a more timeless or youthful quality. I settled on this version as I wanted the

---

3 (i) Frank Auerbach is an artist whose work I admire. His work has been interpreted as having deep psychological content with psychoanalytic overtones. In the monograph on him by Robert Hughes he reflects on the length of time it takes Auerbach to complete his drawings and paintings and the inner dialogue conducted by Auerbach with his work during this time. Robert Hughes, Frank Auerbach (London: Thames and Hudson, 1990).
(ii) Marion Milner, Adrian Stokes and others discussed in chapters two and three refer to the psychoanalytic significance of the artist entering into a dialogue with his or her artwork. Milner, On; Stokes, "invitation."

4 In one version of the ceramic self-portrait, subsequently destroyed, I had drawn myself with female breasts. This was done semi-consciously and suggests the psychoanalytic concept of bisexuality. Ryroft defines bisexuality:
"BISEXUAL, BISEXUALITY These refer only occasionally to persons who are bisexual in the sense of engaging in both heterosexual and homosexual relations, but usually to the presence of masculine and feminine psychological attributes and attitudes in a single person. Psychoanalytical theory has always assumed that all human beings are constitutionally psychosexually bisexual. Freud took over this idea from his friend Fliess, and it was originally justified by reference to the biological and anatomical data which suggest that males contain vestigial female organs (and vice versa). Contemporary theory, however, tends to explain psychosexual bisexuality by reference to the fact that children identify (to varying degrees) with both parents" (13).
The figure in the self-portrait was to display both strength and fragility... presence and non-presence. This appearance is enhanced by the solid "case" of black tiles around the figure, the solid impasto of red paint and the three dimensional modelling of the ceramic symbols embedded into the paint. The Search was the first work that I considered significant enough to put forward for the exhibition. Having said this, it was to some
extent, prototypical and acted as a departure point for work that followed. This transition and discovery is reflected in the title of the piece.

In *The Search* there is a very thick and textured bed of red oil paint. This is deliberately applied at diagonals across the painting like rain.

The use of red paint was to become significant throughout much of the later work. The red, falling like rain, becomes a sea, an oceanic all embracing presence. Applied as a thick liquid it becomes encrusted to form the living substance of the painting frozen in time. It contains aspects of my thought as much as the drawing in the ceramic self portrait. The "sea" became symbolic of the unconscious. The reference to water is significant. My use of red paint in this way was intuitive, yet Schaverien refers to the symbolism of water in much the same way that I discuss it above. Referring to Jung
she quotes "Water is the commonest symbol for the unconscious... psychologically... water means spirit that has become unconscious" (Schaverien, Revealing 99). Later, she refers again to Jung discussing the implications of sea. The sea appearing in imagery can refer to "the solution and dissolution of a problem" (186). It is symbolic of taking the subject back to his or her pre-birth wherein one floats oceanically in the waters of the uterus. Considering this particular artwork is called The Search and refers to an initial reflective search into a personal sense of meaning it appears significant to me that initially the "red rain" began to fall. Then it became so heavy that a 'sea" was formed into which the ceramic self-portrait was embedded surrounded by the emerging objects of my thought processes as I identified with and revealed them.

The selection of the ceramic symbols around the central self-portrait was, at first, quite arbitrary. I had a mish-mash of ideas, but I did not know how I wanted to express them. Initially then, I made many ceramic pieces, intuitively referring to ideas, sketches or reproductions from the books in my personal library. I made several ceramic pieces and began to arrange them around the central self-portrait. Essentially, I was playing with the symbols until a narrative emerged and an interaction with the self-portrait. Once I had established the thread of a narrative I then knew which other ceramic symbols should be made. Even so, the narrative, in its final form, has an open-frame, it is not visually definitive. Many of the meanings are fragments of thought adrift in a sea of red paint. The narrative is a record of a personal "game" of free-association. In The Search, the first exploratory piece in this exhibition, I was touching on ideas that would re-emerge in later works. I was establishing ideas and thoughts... sifting the ground of the mind, as if exploring an archaeological site, looking for the significant forms, fragments and archaic psychic information. This is why I decided to coat the ceramic symbols, and the black tiles around the self-portrait figure, in a heavy black encrusted glaze. They are like shards found at the site. The black tiles suggest my thoughts surrounding and encasing me. The symbols are fragments of thoughts that co-join and set up meanings and dialogues between themselves as I look at them. They recount episodes or phases in my life and because many of the symbols are appropriated and historical they set up, or suggest, a possible narrative for the viewer. A number of the symbols are connected with "belief systems" whilst others indicate some of the objects and associations in my life that have affected it positively or negatively. My use of visual symbols here appears similar to the uses of visual symbol discussed in Brandon Taylor's essay "Early Modern Painting in Europe: The Psychological Dimension". Taylor argues that many of the formative artists to influence art of this century (i.e., Kandinsky, Picasso, Matisse) were employing working methods and results analogous to art therapeutic practice used today. Referring to the above artists works Taylor cites examples of the ways in which
symbol, metaphor and visual construct may have aided these artists to work through, sublimate or even resolve psychic content that was either highly personal or unconscious.

The fragment of the gold frame in *The Search* I interpret as a device, similar to Schaverien's theories concerning frames it is a structure that organises. It makes reference to the art of painting, acting in this instance, as the frame for self-analysis. There is also an element of parody mixed with homage, (perhaps oedipal ambivalence) in the fragment of gold frame. Often, when an artist paints he or she makes reference, in some way, to those (artists) who have inspired us. Here, and in many of the works in this exhibition, I had in mind several artists whose work I admire. Perhaps, in this sense, these artists act as my set of *father imagos.*\(^5\) For example, the fragment of gold frame and rich red paint in *The Search* obliquely makes reference to my admiration for the paintings of Peter Paul Rubens.

\(^5\) See 247 of this thesis for a discussion of the term imago.
Another reference to Rubens is in the pose chosen for the self-portrait figure. Rubens' self-portraits are inspirational and full of psychological strength. In this and other ways *The Search* is a history painting. Many of the symbols in it make reference to various periods in history, all of the symbols are fragments of thought connected with my personal history\(^6\). The self-portrait genre for *The Search* makes reference to the history of painting and its representational means.

\(^6\) Aspects of this personal history will be discussed in chapter five.
SELF PORTRAIT IN A SEA OF EYES
Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes
Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes

This piece was made over a period of two years. During this time, the influences from my studies into psychoanalysis and particularly object-relations theory, were becoming more pronounced. In *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* I decided to consciously invoke associations with infancy, therefore, greatly increasing the range of time spanned in the autobiographical work. A main point of reference for my interest in object-relations theory was reading Peter Fuller's *Art and Psychoanalysis*.

It is not possible to adequately describe Fuller’s arguments in such a short account. However, as I have given an overview of object-relations theory in chapters two and three of this thesis it will be understood that object-relations theory puts emphasis on the infant’s earliest relationships with its mother. It maintains that in the earliest stages of life the baby is psychically fused to its mother and the mother's breast. Then, as the baby matures it begins to realise that the mother and breast are not part of him or her but, nevertheless, believes that it has "magical" omnipotent control over them and can create them at will. As development proceeds a psychical phenomenon akin to weaning takes place, this is referred to as *separation-individuation*. The child has to give up belief in its omnipotent control over the mother and the breast and to achieve this it unloads its psychic investment onto *transitional objects*. During this phase the concept of the *potential space* is introduced. Fuller sees this as particularly important to artists. The potential space is that psychic space when a baby regards a transitional object (toy, rag-doll, rug, etc.,) as: (i) an object subjectively perceived and fused, over which he or she has omnipotent control: and (ii) an object, objectively perceived; separate, other and lost to omnipotency. Later in development, the psychic convergence of potential space merges with the potential for artistic creation and aesthetic illusion. In *Art & Psyche*, Ellen Handler Spitz explains:

> The transitional object (again like the aesthetic object) preserves that which must be lost. It is the embodiment of illusion, a covenant between fantasy and reality, an external testament to inner experience. It bridges the lacuna between isolation and fusion (67).

D.W. Winnicott argues in *Playing and Reality* that transitional objects and the child's investment in them, are the basis for the individual's future development in play and then cultural and creative pursuits such as art and science etc. There is a need to create, he felt, to satisfy deep instinctual and object-relational longings that go right back to the earliest days of life. Fuller concurs with the object-relations account of development.
and sees great potential for it, as others have, in explaining aspects of artistic creation and aesthetic response. Discussing the potential space Fuller indicates:

... the baby necessarily posits the idea of a "potential space"... when the infant has begun to apprehend the difference between self and not-self phenomena, development of the ego proceeds by a process which, in one sense, can be seen as defensive denial of that separation: the infant identifies with, and takes into himself representations of, the mother, and later also of other objects in the environment (father, siblings, etc.) from which he continues to make, strengthen and structure himself.

The idea of this "potential space" remains, however, of the greatest importance in development, experience, and above all, creative living.... Winnicott suggests that it can usefully be thought of as a "third area of human living, one neither inside the individual nor outside in the world of shared reality." The capacity to explore and investigate this "potential space" in a situation of trust, allows the individual to develop his internal sense of place and integration, his sense of external reality, and his ability to act imaginatively and creatively upon the latter (202-3).

Fuller continues,

Winnicott held that this "potential space" between the baby and the mother was the precursor of that between the child and the family, and eventually of that between the individual and society, or the world. In Winnicott's view, one development derived from the "potential space" was thus, for the adult, the location of cultural experience itself. The "potential space" could be looked upon as sacred "to the individual in that it is here that the individual experiences creative living" (204).

Upon reflection, Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes symbolically represents the narrative of my development into cultural life, and introduces the importance of object-relations theory into the interpretation of my work. Even so, why some decisions about its completed appearance were taken I am not fully, consciously, aware of. For instance, why did I decide to make the shape of the piece oval? I can put forward rational explanations for this, and in fact, in my journal I attempted to do so. "The conscious reason during the formal process of design", I wrote, "was compositional". I placed the central rectangular self-portrait on the floor in my studio and considered what would look best around it. After deliberating and "working through", (with sketches etc.), I decided upon an oval shape. However, once this decision was taken, other reasons for

---

7 e.g. (i) Handler Spitz Art; Image. (ii) Schaverien "Scapegoat"; Revealing. (iii) Case and Dalley.
the oval shape proposed themselves and other possibilities in the development of the work became feasible. The oval shape is, proportionately, not such a radical departure from the rectangle, yet visually, it seems suggestive of completely different emotions or memories to me. Is it indicative of the embryonic, or of the beginning? Is it symbolically analogous to the womb or perhaps to the vaginal opening? These are some of the thoughts that occurred and can be interpreted by referring to object-relations theory.

Considering Joy Schaverien's reference in *The Revealing Image* to the use of circles and ellipses in visual art she proposes that these can be seen as a 'symbol of the self, of consciousness, or as the mandala which contains chaos" (99). It is significant, therefore, that I intuitively circumscribed *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* with a containing frame of consciousness. The "sea" of paint surrounding the self-portrait (as in *The Search*) represents the infinite unconscious. The conscious blue "framing" oval is containing the potentially tumultuous energy of the unconscious. *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*, then, demonstrates the increasing significance I began to give to the "holding" power of frames as I delved further into unconscious and unchartered waters. The significance of framing theoretically has already been discussed at length in chapter three. My decision to put greater emphasis on the relationship between painting and frame until there was a kind of fusion or integration I explained to myself at the time as reasoning of a formal and aesthetic nature. However, in the light of theories such as Schaverien's it is possible to view my decision as both conscious and unconscious. As will be seen, as my work progresses, from *The Search* onwards, framing becomes a greater physical and psychic feature of my work. My decision to give greater emphasis to framing was taken long before I had any conscious or theoretical knowledge of its significance in psychoanalysis or art therapy.

A key mental image then proposed itself to me, it was an image of my mother holding me as a baby. As I grew, like many children, I became intrigued by the family albums full of photographs. Certain photos fascinated and delighted me. These photographic images must have been implanted within my mind from a very early age and would have resonated with the memory of the physical experiences they described. The images have never left my psyche and at various times through my life the memory of the image has re-entered my consciousness. At some point in my early adult life I wanted to review the original photographs. Since that time the photographs have always been with me, in a personal album, that is like a resource of memories and emotions. This connects with art therapy theories discussed in chapter three. Firstly, Jo Spence discusses the importance of family photos in her article, "Photo-Therapy Theatre of the Self". Spence's therapeutic methods often examine and re-work the
images of family photography to invoke the unconscious. Secondly, Schaverien discusses the importance of personal family mementos as either "tokens or "talismans" to the respective owner or keeper of the objects. These photos operate like that for me, though I am not sure whether they are tokens or talismans; they are keepsakes to which I attach great psychological importance. This is not an unusual phenomenon, many people attach great importance to particular personal family photos. It is this which Spence and Schaverien are referring to in their respective theories. In the completed artworks, however, that refer to photos for subject matter there is a talismanic quality.

The ceramic mother and child in the bottom half of *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* is based on a photograph/memory from that album. The mother figure, however, is not modelled on the age of my mother in the photo, but for some reason, (the basis of which, perhaps now the work is completed, is clearer), it is based on a memory of my mother in late middle age (about the time I emigrated to Australia). Once again, in hindsight, I can trace this ambiguity in the depiction of my mother's age in the ceramic piece to psychoanalytic theory and a sense of loss. As indicated when I discuss the artwork *Loss* contained in the series *Illusive Reality*, loss is a central concept in psychoanalytic theory and I have referred to it when discussing the work of Handler Spitz, Wolfenstein, Mahler and Winnicott.
My Mother holding me, c.1949

Detail of *Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*
A predetermined aspect of this artwork was the desire to place the central rectangular portrait in impasto paint. The impasto became a white swirling and foaming sea of paint, as if stirring up memories from an archaic sea of emotion. Was the "white sea" also a metaphor for distance and separation? Again, Peter Fuller's discussion of object-relations theory is perhaps relevant here. I am an immigrant, and Fuller writes of the ways in which cultural and familial displacement can affect artists. He considers abstract art of the twentieth century in relation to the concept of the potential space. Fuller indicates that there are grounds to link common themes of colour, application and re-invented perspective/space in the work of such painters as Natkin, Rothko, Olitski, Baranik and De Kooning on the basis of cultural and personal displacement from the mother and the "motherland". He argues:

that there is a specific connection between the abstract painting of America and the experience of the exile. Both Natkin and Rothko came from Russian Jewish families which had emigrated to the United States; so did Baranik and Olistski... I suspect for such artists the psychological longings surrounding the person of the mother, phase and merge into cultural longings. The life of an exile is dominated by the absent presence of the mother-land. This acute private accentuation of cultural displacement paradoxically enables these painters to touch upon a widely experienced sense of alienation or dislocation... it need not surprise us if the exile or immigrant is acutely attuned to the inadequacies of the geometer's space and to the presence of the absence within him of a continent that is elsewhere (230-231).

It seems more than coincidental to me that three of the twentieth century artists I most admire; Willem De Kooning, Lucien Freud and Frank Auerbach, are all exiles or immigrants. These artists have also devoted a significant portion of their working lives to the drawing and painting of women. Furthermore, there is evidence to suggest that the women in their paintings have strong associations with maternal displacement and longings.8 For example, in the case of De Kooning, his most fabled artworks are paintings of women. Rosenberg, and others, indicate that these paintings concern both his mother and Holland, (his mother-country).9

Surrounding and containing the white sea of paint, in *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*, is a frame of eyes and floating to the surface of the sea are all the objects of the self-portrait. The reasons for some of the objects I can only hint at. The decision to have the eyes

---


was "automatic". I knew it was right and what I wanted, but the deeper significance of the decision I have not uncovered. The surface reasons were to do with the pleasure of painting and of viewing painting. Perhaps, it is tied up with scopophilic activity generally. The eyes comment on the activity of visual art, the arena for looking and visual pleasure... the realm of the gaze.

Many people that have looked at this piece have commented on the figure "4" like red symbols floating on the sea of white paint as resembling the genetic symbol for D.N.A. which, to some extent, seems appropriate as the artwork makes allusions towards birth, infancy and individuality. However, this connection is coincidental. The red symbols represent the repeat pattern that occurred on my mother's dress when she held me as a baby. It is of interest to me that, as an infant in my mother's arms, I would have stared at this pattern, covering her breasts, for what might have seemed, at times, a lifetime. The symbols viewed close up would have also appeared much larger. It is significant that on creating this piece of artwork I had an irresistible urge to make the symbols larger and place them in the white paint... is the white paint my mother's dress or my mother's skin? Fuller discusses the significance and potentiality of childhood symbols recurring in an artist's painting. Considering the work of Robert Natkin, an abstract colour field painter, he argues that his paintings and his verbal description of them confirm that, even though these are very large non-representational canvases, the paintings concern childhood memories of fusion, and idealised psychic images of his mother's face:

Here, one suspects, is the mother's face into which Natkin (and not only he) would have liked to have stared: this is the ideal of that which he was denied, or which he perceived only in glimpses, a face suffused with subtle tenderness, apperceived more than it is perceived, a face whose features are in one sense bound, yet in another fluid and gently mobile, a face can transform itself infinitely in response to our gaze, which certainly has a skin which separates it from us but which, in the next moment, can engulf and enfold us into itself... Through painting, he transforms the face into what it might have been, for him, and through this process discovers himself. When I look at Natkin's work, I am suggesting, I experience what Bell would have called "aesthetic emotion" because it arouses a similar nexus of affects in me. (212-213).

---

10 Scopophilia: "Pleasure in looking. Listed by classical theory as one of the infantile COMPONENT-INSTINCTS" (Rycroft 148).

11 It is more than probable that in referring to this example Fuller is linking it to Freud's argument concerning the Mona Lisa's smile and Leonardo Da Vinci's childhood memories (Refer S.E. vol. 11 59).
The last element in *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* that I wish to comment on is the fish. The fish symbol occurs in many pieces of work in this exhibition. The fish symbolises aspects of my *self*. Why a fish? Of course, I can think of surface and conscious, even cliched, reasons ... "Not the only fish in the sea" etc., yet in these paintings I am the only fish in the sea. Or, then again, there is the religious and sexual nature of the fish as a symbol, it is in this respect perhaps that the fish has the most symbolic potency. The symbolic significance of fish assists in tracing resonance with my *self*. But the psychic metaphors and overlays of meaning are fluid and disappear as quickly as they appear... they are invoked when I stare at the image. From what I have said already about *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* I would wish the viewer to draw his or her own conclusions about the appearance of the fish. I rationalise the inclusion of the fish as an attempt at being mildly humorous... the fish dives in and out of the painting, in and out of the sea... the artist is both creator and viewer of his work... the fish attempts to bite its own tail, a reference to the self-portrait revealing as much as it attempts to hide. However, these are only the reasons that come to the surface of my sea.

---

12 Reference to the fish as sexual and/or religious symbol occur in a number of texts, eg:
MEMORY - MAMMARY - MUMMERY
Memory - Mammary - Mummery
Definitions of Memory:

1. the faculty by which things are recalled to or kept in the mind
2. (a) this faculty in an individual... (b) one's store of things remembered...
3. a recollection or remembrance
   (Oxford).

Memory fulfils the biological function of enabling organisms to respond to present circumstances in the light of past experience and thereby to replace simple, automatic, "instinctual" reactions by complex, selective, learned responses. Freud's theory of memory is in reality a theory of FORGETTING. It assumes that all experiences, or at least all significant experiences, are recorded, but that some cease to be available to CONSCIOUSNESS as a result of REPRESSION, this mechanism being activated by the need to diminish ANXIETY. Although this theory explains those instances of forgetting that can be demonstrated to be related to neurotic CONFLICT, other factors presumably contribute to the fact that AMNESIA for infancy and very early childhood is universal and is not decreased by even the "deepest" analysis (Rycroft 90).

Definition of Mammary:

of the human female breasts or milk-secreting organs of other mammals.
(Oxford).

BREAST: This word refers either to the anatomical organ itself or to the idea (OBJECT-REPRESENTATION) of it existing in the subject's mind. "The breast" is the object of ORAL wishes, IMPULSES, PHANTASIES, and ANXIETIES and is synonymous with the "MOTHER regarded as a PART OBJECT" or "the mother regarded as a NEED-SATISFYING OBJECT", i.e., the concept refers not only to the breast as a suckling organ but also to the infant's obliviousness of the mother's person. "Splitting of the breast" refers to the psychological process by which the infant divides its image of a complete breast into two, one part becoming "the GOOD breast", conceived to be perfect, lovable, and all-satisfying, the other part being conceived to be hateful and rejecting ("the BAD breast"). SPLITTING of the breast is a DEFENCE against recognising that LOVE and HATE are directed against the same objects; it purchases freedom from AMBIVALENCE at the price of persecutory anxiety (see PERSECUTION)... "the breast" often means "the primary object" with only a theoretical implication that this was (is) a part of the mother's body (Rycroft 14-15).
Definition of Mummery:

1. ridiculous (es religious) ceremonial.
2. a performance by mummers.  
   (Oxford).

1. performance of mummers.
2. any mere theatrical performance or ceremony or empty spectacular pretence, or what is regarded as such. 
   (Macquarie).

Mummer

1. an actor in a traditional mime
2. archaic or derog. an actor in the theatre. + mummer's play the best-known type of English folk-play, which appears to derive from the folk festivals of primitive agricultural communities. The central theme is the death and resurrection of one of the characters, an obvious re-enactment in human terms of the earth awakening from the death of winter. Texts show a remarkable similarity. The play is first mentioned towards the end of the 18th C. and flourished until the mid 19th C.; it can still be seen in a few English villages (Oxford).

Mummer

1. one who wears a mask or fantastic disguise, es as formerly at Christmas and other festive seasons
2. an actor
   (Macquarie).

Memory, Mammary, Mummery is a condensation of personal conscious and unconscious activity. Condensation is a major component of dreaming and dreaming.
is connected with transference. In this sense, this artwork is one of the most subversive and expressive works in the exhibition and on the level of instinctual and object based psychological activity, sets the scene for the whole body of work in the exhibition. However, I am not sure what I can say about this piece, for whatever I say will be insufficient or could be misconstrued.

paraphrased from journal:

This piece is a wish-fulfilling image. There before me is the "good" breast. There before me lies the unending potential of touching the "good" breast. It is an endless phantasy of instinctual and object pleasure. The breast and hand image become an idealised representation of sexual life that is omnipotent and unrestrained. The concept of the "good" breast has the obvious connections with my mother and childhood. This is the closest I can come to touching my mother - she is 10,000 miles away.\textsuperscript{14} I am an adult, she is an old lady, yet those childhood images - sensations and memories remain. Adult love is meant to cherish, contain, rekindle and protect such memories, it is one of the true sanctuaries and vestiges of childhood that is left and available to us. *Memory, Mammary, Mummery,* serves as a metaphor for all of these wishes and desires. Surrounding the breast and hand image is a deep rectangular frame... rectangular because of the conventions of visual imagery... but there the similarities to convention end. This frame is covered with a visceral sexual skin of oil paint. The frame is female, it fuses and compounds the sexual imagery within. The total image is an object of transference. The painting and its frame become at once, my mother, my wife and a symbol of sexuality. In the artwork are contained my phantasies and desires. The artwork as subject and object contains all of these mental complexities. It is a representation of where they all start, with our births and infancy; from thereon the memory and fascination haunts our lives. Woman is the creator. As an artist I attempt creation when I paint. The closest I come to the vaginal act of birth is the delivery of my painting, the realisation of an object which contains myself, that is the sum of my experiences to that point.\textsuperscript{15} On top of the frame and painting are wavy blue bars, they stand for containment (and for repression). They make reference to the image as a thought. They bring to mind dreaming, both night and day dreaming. When I look at this piece of work I am confronted. I am the voyeur of my own thoughts... the voyeuristic quality in this work for artist and viewer is strong and deliberate. The image is protected and unavailable. The

\begin{footnotes}
\footnotetext{14}{At the time my mother was still alive.}
\footnotetext{15}{See my review of Ellen Handler Spitz's essay, "Conflict and Creativity - Reflections on Otto Rank's Psychology of Art" for an account of Rank's comparison of birth and the creation of art works.}
\end{footnotes}
visceral frame gives an uneasy tension to the piece and the bars heighten the sense of prohibition. As the viewer I am not sure whether I should be looking at this piece, a private event is taking place, a breast is being touched in a gesture of arousal.
Series One

*OBJECT RELATIONS*
Overview of the series

Object Relations

The series *Object Relations* was made in connection with a paper I presented at the 1990 *Austceram Conference* held in Perth, (Australia). The paper, "Ceramic Bodies and Psychoanalysis" focussed on the symbolic use of the human form by contemporary ceramic artists. The idea to make a series had evolved from making *The Search*. That piece had developed a complex and interactive narrative. To develop and systematise the concept of a narrative I concluded that rather than making one large work it would be aesthetically and intellectually clearer to make several small works that isolated key images connected to the theme, which in this case, was object-relations16. However, unlike other forms of narrative such as literary, cinematic or theatrical narrative there need be no conclusive beginning or ending to the method of presenting the story; the series is presented on the art gallery wall complete and simultaneous as several pieces comprising one whole. Entry and exit into the work can be gained at any point. In this series I also further developed the idea of the frame acting as a containing device. Increasingly, as I made work for the exhibition the frame took on new significances. I had already suggested in *The Search* that the colour red had a signifying reference to the unconscious. Now, here, in this series, the matt blue ceramic glaze of the frame became the signifier of the ego; ego controlling the id - content controlled by form - the irrational presented in a rational way.

---

16 Narratives evolving between artworks is of course one of the key means artists and audiences use to interpret their meaning. This position has been developed by several authors in chapters two and three of this thesis.
Face and Breast Image
**Face and Breast Image**

This painting was spontaneous and intuitive. The surface content, as in *Memory, Mammary, Mummy* is sexual, it is concerned with the psychoanalytic concept of the phantasy and the dream of the breast.¹⁷ Like *Memory, Mammary, Mummy* I find this painting confronting and startling; it is innocuous yet subversive. There have been countless images of faces and breasts in close proximity in the history of art, there have even been completely respectable images of grown men being suckled at the breast by virtuous and heroic women.¹⁸ Yet here, in *Face and Breast Image*, the painting confronts because it focuses solely on the face and breast. This placement is direct and provocative; in the proximity/separation, of face and breast there is a potential space. There is a regressive phantasy, a return to the mother's breast. This painting becomes a representation of the origins of transitional objects.

---

¹⁷ Phantasy:

(i) "Imaginary scene in which the subject is a protagonist, representing the fulfilment of a wish (in the last analysis, an unconscious wish) in a manner that is distorted to a greater or lesser extent by defensive processes. Phantasy has a number of different modes: conscious phantasies or daydreams, unconscious phantasies like those uncovered by analysis as the structures underlaying a manifest content, and primal phantasies" (Laplanche & Pontalis 314).

(ii) "The psychoanalytic concept of phantasy shares the ambiguities inherent in the everyday use of the word. In one sense, phantasy refers to imagining, daydreaming, fancying, as contrasted with adaptive thought and behaviour... In this sense it is synonymous with neurotic daydreaming. In another sense it refers to the imaginative activity which underlies all thought and feeling. In theoretical writing the latter sense is usually intended:... All schools agree that conscious mental activity is accompanied, supported, maintained, enlivened and affected by UNCONSCIOUS phantasy, which begins in childhood, is primarily (originally) concerned with biological processes and relations and undergoes symbolic elaboration"... (Rycroft 118).

¹⁸ See overleaf
Peter Paul Rubens, *Roman Charity (Cimon and Pero)*, c.1613
Male Archaic Symbol
Male Archaic Symbol

Considering the concept of the transitional object this archaic figure is walking through the unfathomable time and space of the unconscious. The figure is toy-like in scale and appearance, representing childhood, but is based on an Egyptian archaeological votive object, therefore, signifying adult cultural and creative pursuits. In my journal at the time of making this piece I recorded:

First in this *Object Relations* series one set of images is the face and breast image. That image is crude and primal, it is pre-oedipal, pre-verbal in its iconography, it goes back to the age and world of the breast. This second image of the 'stoic walker of narrative’ could represent thought starting on its complex conscious/unconscious journey through life, treading its storytelling way through the complexities of experience.
Self Portrait
**Self Portrait**

This kind of self portrait image can be traced back into the history of painting and there is a long record of artists producing such images. In painting this work I had in mind some of my favourite self portraits by such artists as John Constable, Stanley Spencer and Lucien Freud. In the context of this series this work is reflective. I have portrayed myself, unclothed, trying to analyse my thoughts and uncover the irrational.
Cycladic Symbol - Archaic Fe/Male
What intrigues me about this figure appropriated from cycladic archaeology is its sexual ambiguity. Is it male or female, warrior or mother? Is the figure saluting by putting its hands on its chest, or is it holding its breasts? Is the object on its stomach a knife or a baby? Does the figure have a penis or is it wearing clothing or an ornament? In making this figure I have deliberately played on the apparent ambiguity that raises the concept of bisexuality.
Female Breast Image


Female Breast Image

Following through the visual reference to "graphic analysis" in Self Portrait earlier in this series the breast here is isolated as a symbol, metaphorically analogous to the breast's psychoanalytic meaning.\(^\text{19}\) The fascination of men (in particular) with painting and sculpting women's breasts is historic. One only has to think of the work of Rubens, Renoir, Matisse, or (Lucien) Freud, to consider the obsession, loving care, beauty or idealisation with which men have painted women and their breasts. Peter Fuller writes at length about this fascination in his discussion of the Venus de Milo\(^\text{20}\). Another author, Janet Hobhouse, also discusses the interest male artists have in painting naked women and their breasts in her book The Bride Stripped Bare: The Artist and the Nude in the Twentieth Century.\(^\text{21}\)

Hobhouse considers artists as radically different in approach as Egon Schiele and Henri Matisse, or Stanley Spencer and Willem De Kooning. In every case she indicates (from a psychoanalytic bias) the artists are motivated by, "thirteen complex ways of feeling by men about women; thirteen selves contemplating the other and projecting on to that abstraction a range of feeling from dread to desire, even detachment, under cover of a technical artistic preoccupation."\(^\text{(9)}\). Her book clearly indicates that what male artists see in the painting and sculpting of women is the potential to explore and analyse psychological issues of deep personal significance to them and this, therefore, gives their work psychological relevance and meaning to society generally. In the process of unloading the deepest secrets of the psyche, by necessity and desire, art is made. In the preface she argues:

This is a book about the bachelor as much as the bride, the artist as well as the nude, because art comes not just from other art but from lives as they are actually lived, and affected by weather and illness, money and politics, sexual excess and domestic strife. At times the life of the nude is so close to the life of the artist that her form becomes his involuntary autobiography; at times a confession, a description of self in the form of the ideal other. At other times the nude may be a refuge from the facts of the artist's life, what he creates instead. At such times she is born not out of what is there but out of what is missing.

\(^{19}\) Refer to my documentation of Memory, Mammary, Mummery for the psychoanalytic definition of breast.

\(^{20}\) See 71-129 of Art & Psychoanalysis. Fuller argues that the fascination with the Venus centres around the Kleinian concept of the phantasy of the breast.

Behind the isolated image of the nude there is always a crowd scene. In this crowd are elements from the artist's present (his anxieties and aspirations), ghosts from his past (memories), fantasies of his future (desires or nightmares). In the crowd are other women from the artist's life (his wife, mother, sister, mistresses or landlady) - all those female beings that collectively create his feelings for the female on the canvas. And there are other images of women, from films, posters, advertisements; and other nudes of Western art, the Titians, Giorgiones, Rubenses, Goyas, Manets, which the artist may intend to challenge. Lastly, there may be the real model herself, whose appearance is incorporated selectively into the painting or may simply be used as a catalyst for the idea of the nude the artist holds in his mind.

The nude is a fantasy of another human being, conjured out of memory and desire and fabricated by a process of subtractions and additions. What may be subtracted are the specifics of the model: her appearance and personality, allowing the artist to treat his unreal being freely - chop her up if he's a cubist, colour her green if he's expressionist, bend her, inflate her, multiply or dissolve her as he imposes his vision on this subject... buried in the notion of nakedness is the notion of candour (uncovering), the nude is a self issued invitation for the artist to speak intimately, about himself, about desire and distance. The artist who paints a nude announces that he has something particular and private... no matter whether the expression exists in cubist, surrealist or neo-realist form... to say about this subject: the entity that stands (or refuses to stand) between himself and his solitude, the soft-skinned edge of the rest of the world (9-10 emphases added).

In my journal notes at the time of making this piece I reasoned:

Even though these images are apart, (Self-Portrait and Female Breast) they reference the first artwork in this series Face and Breast Image. The fact that they are detached is contradicted in that they are the only two "graphic" images in this series. On one level, I am saying this is my face, this is my breast. On another, I am saying I have an internal dilemma/conundrum; my male interest in sexuality and women contrasted with today's complicit visual saturation of women's (and men's) bodies proliferated by such things as photography and the electronic media. How do I deal with these issues?

22 See Joy Schaverien's essay, "The Scapegoat and the Talisman: Transference in Art Therapy" for a comparative account of the uses of visual imagery in art therapy.
Archaic Mother
Archaic Mother

paraphrased from journal:

This piece, ceramic set into impasto red paint and based on *The Venus of Wilendorf* completes this series. It is the completion of a cycle... it promises the beginning of another; it symbolises the cycle of fertility, sexuality and birth. The weighty pregnant figure - an ultimate figure of fecundity - symbolic of the maternal, and explicit of human existence. An optimistic, eternal and sensual figure which confronts subjective positions about sexuality. The figure in its simplicity deconstructs, de-intellectualises and desensitises theories, power games and lusts.
Series Two

THE PARK
Overview of the series

The Park

This series of work pursues my developing interest in the concerns of object-relations theory, and presents a conscious/unconscious thematic link with childhood. Formally, I was developing the method of working "in series" and decided that visually the content for this series demanded a large central "icon" (Object and Relations 96 x 113 cm.) either side of which smaller "icons" should be spaced (e.g., Pram 40 x 47 cm.). The design suggested itself for a number of reasons. Firstly, I considered that this configuration would be visually strong, bringing to mind the compositional arrangement of a "predella". Secondly, it would enhance the arrangement of the series on the art gallery wall in the context of this exhibition; the relative spacing and placement of each piece in this series took on additional significance as I considered the psychoanalytic concept of potential space. However, the most important reason for choosing to have one large central work and four 'satellite" pieces was to do with the subject matter of this series. The title, The Park, refers to childhood memories prior to the age of five connected with Battersea Park, (London, England). The central piece to this series, Objects and Relations is a metaphor for the scale and psychic landscape of the park, of which the satellite pieces are a part.

In The Park, I work (or should it be walk) through my psyche from the omnipotent stage of childhood to the oedipal. I remember, repeat and work through relationships with both my mother, my father and my siblings. Battersea Park has very strong early emotions wrapped up in the memories and physicality of the place. Memories of the park go back to my very beginnings.

paraphrased from journal:

After a traumatic experience with hospital birth, my mother had her next three children at home. I was the first born at home, in Sutherland Street, Victoria, London SW1 in 1949. My mother and father were working class. Being not all that long after the second world war, the mood in central London during the late 1940s and early 1950s was gloomy, dirty and materially very basic; luxuries were few for families like ours.23 My father owned a bicycle. He was Welshman, the son of a baker. In 1949 he was thirty four years old. My mother was Irish, the daughter of a butcher and she was thirty seven. The family (at that time) two boys, one girl and my parents lived in two large rented rooms on the first floor of a decrepit Victorian terraced house. The rooms were lit by gaslight and divided by two pairs

of large folding doors. Today Sutherland Street is a desirable address in an expensive area of London, but then it was close to being a slum and nobody wanted to live there. However, due to the demand for jobs and accommodation after the war, some people had to. From the perspective of the mid 1990s, that period of my childhood, between the ages of birth to five years old, seems now as if it belongs to another lifetime altogether yet it is only forty years ago. Then the streets all around us were still paved with tarred wooden blocks. When they were eventually pulled up, to be replaced by tarmac, I remember everyone in the street going out to collect the wooden blocks to burn in their open fireplaces. My older brother, his friends and I, used to play in a bombed out church across the road. Sometimes we would disturb a tramp sleeping in the rubble. On Saturdays when Dad came home from work at midday we would have lunch; “bangers” and mash and peas. We all sat at the table eating and listening to the radio... ”Wakey! Wakey!, it’s the Billy Cotton Band Show”... ”The Goon Show” or ”Archie Andrews”. I remember summer skies of big billowing clouds and hot days with Dad in a striped ‘T’ shirt, fleeting London sunshine entering two rooms as we ate lunch and listened to the radio. Bath night, once a week, was in front of the coal fireplace in a big galvanised tin bath, lifted into place and then put away again. At night, or on dark days, the gas light mantles were temperamental, they hissed and blew out with a loud bang when you least expected it. Occasionally, Dad would take us to the Victoria public baths, where, besides being a swimming pool, there were rooms with individual baths and hot running water. My brother and I got into the big cast iron bath with my father.

It is during this period of my life that I felt closest to my father. Bit by bit, after the age of five years, even though we lived in the same home, psychically and physically we drifted further and further apart. My Dad was a quiet man. We did talk, there was always parental love, but as I grew he often seemed distant from me. In hindsight, aspects of the relationship I would have liked to have had seem incomplete or missing. He and I didn’t talk enough, there was no intellectual exchange and we were not physically close or relaxed with each other. He loved me as his son and I loved him as my father. Loss and mourning can account for the feelings I have, and so can guilt. Perhaps I never tried hard enough to understand my father. Perhaps I don’t try hard enough to understand my son. Father/son relationships can be strange things. There was always lots of love and emotion, but there was a quietness, a lack. It seems odd to say this, when, as a father he was so good to me, but perhaps we both missed out on something. I feel cheated in my relationship with my father. He died when I was thirty two. He was sixty seven. I was in Australia. At the time of his death, it seemed that we had not talked or shared any experience deeply for years. We used to exchange letters regularly. They were full of interesting but superficial news. I knew that he had lung cancer, but we never discussed it in our letters. It came as a shock to get the phone call in the middle of the night from the other side of the world. Right up until the end his letters were always cheerful and loving. He was strong and quiet until the end, he
never discussed his illness in his letters, he didn't want to worry me. So the most important man in my life left without either of us saying a proper goodbye. We never spoke or shared enough.

I've been carrying this baggage of known and repressed love and experience for years and years. It will never leave me. This is why there is nostalgia and longing for those years before I was five years old. The memories of this period of my life are full of love and closeness from my father and mother. This series of work, The Park, celebrates those times which seem now as though they are several lifetimes away. I dedicate this series to my father, partly for what we had and partly for what we lost.24

24 Ellen Handler Spitz notes that on many psychic levels psychoanalysis recognises that an artist's work is always a gift for a loved one (Image 228).
Objects and Relations
The nucleus for *Objects and Relations* is its centre, the painting of the mother and child. This is based on the same image that was used in *Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* and, therefore, presents a level of thematic continuity for accessing this work.

The mother and child is a classic subject of composition in "Western" painting, and the associations with religious iconography go back many hundreds of years. My painting of the mother and child in this work signifies a thematic link to the history of painting, religious iconography and the cult of the Madonna and child.
The association to religious iconography was made as a deliberate link to my Catholic upbringing and the cultural associations I inherited from my mother. She was Catholic, my father was basically an atheist. The image of the mother and child also positions the period in my life in which this work is placed as that of my infancy. I am now middle aged and have returned to an image of myself as an infant. I have stared at the image of my mother as a person, younger than I am now and painted it. I painted this central
image when she was alive, but by the time I had completed *Objects and Relations* she was dead. The central painting is an account of my childhood memory and relationships to my mother. The photo that the painting is based on is a personal document of an event at the time that I was that child and my mother was that age. The emotive forces that are stirred in me by the photograph were transferred into a painting and initiated a much larger, more complex artwork that deals with sequentially expressing, re-living and working through those emotions and memories connected with childhood. The memories worked through in the artwork encompass more than the photo alone documents.

In *Objects and Relations* there are two spaces enclosed by blue fences, the red "inner park" and the white "outer park". The inner red park symbolises the *id* and the white outer park the *ego*. The fences are blue, just the way I remember them being painted at Battersea Park. On both the red and white parks there are gate entrances. Originally, I had intended to have the entrances with gates across, so that each park of the mind was self enclosed. However, visually and conceptually this did not work; the ego and the id are *not* mutually exclusive. The first and main entrance is into the white park, this has a green and ochre herringbone design within it, which only suggests the possibility of closure. The ambiguity concerning opening and closing is deliberately made to note that access to each other's egos is possible through communication, of which art is one form. The metaphor of the gate indicates the possibility of the opening and closing of the mind and the privilege of both artist and viewer in being allowed to enter that domain.

*paraphrased from journal:*

My father must have been taking my older brother and me to Battersea Park from the time of our births and I can recall going there at least from the age of three onwards. The opening and closing times at Battersea Park were always something to be aware of on our visits there. A park keeper in a uniform of brown trousers, jacket and trilby hat used to announce closing time by walking around the park and ringing a large hand bell. In *Objects and Relations* symbols of my childhood experience are arranged in the white park. The grey heart symbolises the memories of emotion and love that are associated with my childhood; it is now a sculpture like the three female figures it shares the space with. The figures of women refer to a Henry Moore sculpture that was in the park and that my brother and I used to play around.

25 The herringbone design recurs in the next series of work *Father Imago* and is evocative to me of memories concerned with late adolescence and also memories of the 1950s.
Henry Moore's sculpture *Three Standing Figures* (1947-48)

The Moore sculptures are evocative of many memories and emotions. I can remember the strangeness and tranquillity of seeing the statues, stony and motionless, standing in the park. Like all of Moore's figures there were elements of abstraction that could frighten and puzzle a child. Why did they have a hole just there?... Why were their heads made out of stone?... Why were they wearing those flowing sheets of drapery?... Why did they stand so still?...
What was their secret? The Moore sculptures unlock the memories and atmosphere of Battersea Park in my childhood. In the early 1950s it was a busy place. Every Spring in the park there was a large Easter parade with floats and marching bands. There was a permanent fun fair which was one of the largest in London. Then, in 1953 there were special celebrations in the park on the day of Queen Elizabeth's coronation; rows and rows of television sets were wired up to relay the event live... I think it was the first time most people had ever seen a T.V. and there was incredible excitement. Battersea Park was also one of the series of venues for "The Festival of Britain", the event that celebrated not only post-war Britain but also... "the new Elizabethan Age". Connected with the Festival of Britain were the Battersea Park "Pleasure Gardens". The Pleasure Gardens had an array of delights to interest and amuse both children and adults. There was an artificial lake for boating, displays of fountains and landscaped ponds, swings and playgrounds. There was the "Guinness clock" donated by the brewers. It was several metres high and full of mechanical and moving animals that paraded around it, on the hour, including the famous Guinness Toucan. There was a raised wooden walkway called a "catwalk", that had fairy lights on it and took you up through the trees of the park. There was a real Lancaster bomber aeroplane that children could climb all over and get inside, I remember sitting in the cockpit and gun turrets. It was to the park that we used to go as children with my father and to the park that I periodically returned until I was well into my teenage years. We used to play soldiers with Dad, it was so exciting running, falling over, rolling down embankments of grass, marching through piles of leaves.

The Moore sculptures were part of this magical place. The park was a self-contained world where fantasy and imagination reigned, separated from the rest of squalid central London after the war. The Moore sculptures of women are archetypes. To me they are sentinels. They pervade my conscious and guard my unconscious. Entry to the red unconscious park is by way of a gate. In the centre of the unconscious is the mother and child.

---

26 Peter Fuller's essay "Mother and Child in Henry Moore and Winnicott" presents the reader with an object-relations interpretation of the significance of Moore's use of human form in his sculpture, particularly that of women or mother and child. Fuller argues that it was Moore's own childhood memories and events, especially those of his mother, that may have shaped both the form and content of his artistic vision. This, in turn, may explain the psychic power and aesthetic pleasure that Moore's sculptures had on me as a child and still have on me as an adult (Fuller, "Mother" 5-20).
Pram

Pushing the pram around the park was an activity of leisure and necessity in my parents' day. Not many people had cars after the war and the park was a large open space within walking distance. No doubt, in the early 1950s Battersea Park would have been full of prams. Prams then were large affairs; black, sturdily built with big wheels. I fancy I can remember being wheeled in a pram - I can certainly recall blurred memories of the big black pram being in the family, I can remember the textures and feel of the materials it was made from... the spoked hood and the geometrically patterned braid around its edge.
Tea Caravan
Tea Caravan

paraphrased from journal:

On our way to the park, my Dad, older brother and I had to walk across Chelsea Bridge. I was filled with fear and excitement at the sensation of being suspended so high above the dirty brown and cold looking river water of the Thames so far below. My brother and I used to climb up onto the painted thick steel grey gantries that span the bridge and tip-toe between the multiple heads of the large bolts that held the bridge together. On the Battersea Power Station side of the road, adjacent to the park entrance, there was a tea caravan. It was painted post box red with white wheels and white lettering. It sold tea at something like one penny a cup and buns and cheesecakes at one and a half pence each. It was a favourite stopping off point either before or after our visit to the park. We stood there on both warm and very cold days munching on the desiccated coconut and icing of a cheesecake as my father drank tea, steam issuing from our mouths as we breathed. We had on our second hand jackets or overcoats purchased from a shop called "Good as New" in Lower Sloane Street. The coats had shiny metal or leather buttons. We wore hand-knit woollen gloves and we all had runny noses. I remember my dad, looking young with dark "Brillcreamed" hair, dressed in a thick woollen blanket like overcoat, grey trousers, brogue shoes and a scarf tied and folded into the coat. The greyness that pervades the ceramic figures of this series signifies that post-war period, when everything seemed to be grey, including the London fog. Once or twice I remember being at the park in a thick fog, or even yellowing smog. It rolled along the Thames, up the embankments and through the park, things disappeared before our eyes. I remember being in the park in both snow and fog... figures appearing and disappearing in the perishing fog blanket... the sculptures on stark, cold leafless days, the hardness of their stone seeming harder from the cold biting our hands and faces.
In Memoria
In Memoria

There are so many associations connected to this piece that span from my childhood to the present. My father, the park, symbolic sculpture, my move to Australia, my father’s death.

paraphrased from journal:

Dad joined the army in 1937. At the time he was twenty two and living in the Rhonda Valley, South Wales. There was no work, even the coal mines were in recession, so he joined up, later becoming a sergeant. He served in several countries throughout the world, India, Egypt, Palestine, Europe, South Africa and Madagascar, in peacetime and at war as a soldier of the British Empire. In my personal album I have many fine and obscure black and white photographs of my father and his army friends at nameless locations throughout the world. It invokes memory and emotion when I look at these images of him, half my present age and almost unrecognisable in his youthfulness. I can remember being puzzled and fascinated by these photos as a child. Is this really the man whom we played with in the park I used to think? These photos were of my father living such a different life, in exotic and strange places, before I was even thought of.

In the park there were also war memorial statues. My brother and I used to stare at the war memorial and I used to think the statues were like my dad in the photos. Today, when I look at war memorials, I think of my father and then I think of all the soldiers that the statues represent, as they would have been, fathers or potential fathers. The thought of war, particularly the first and second world wars, and all the death and loss, still has a strong emotional effect on me. I think this is because I am the son of parents that lived through the war as young adults. Sometimes I think, if thought could be hereditary then we must have inherited part of our parent’s minds.

The soldier sculptures were part of the adventure of a visit to the park. They were frozen heroic examples of the soldier games we played with Dad. Real soldiers were close at hand too. On our way to and from Battersea Park we used to walk past Chelsea Barracks. A high black iron fence stretched hundreds of yards along Chelsea Bridge Road. Behind it soldiers were drilled on the parade ground; the Sergeant Major bawling at the top of his voice, or the brass band playing regimental music. On the other side of the road was another black iron fence and behind this were the gardens of the Chelsea Pensioners Home and The Royal Hospital. This was where old and infirm soldiers were lodged and came to die. Occasionally, you would see the pensioners in their dark blue/black uniforms or overcoats
and peaked caps trimmed with red. They walked gingerly around the spacious gardens of the hospital, assisted by their walking sticks or nurses and sat on park benches looking strangely Victorian in appearance. They were always contained behind the fences and I was the other side looking at them.

Eric Henri Kennington War Memorial for the 24th Division, (1924).
Battersea Park, London
These memories have always been there, submerged, preconscious, unconscious they are part of my unspoken history. The war memorial statues are part of that history, the signifiers that unlock it. They unlock the memories of childhood intimacy with my father. An intimacy that was to disappear, become quiet and unspoken as we grew older. In my late twenties I met an Australian woman, we married and decided to move to Australia. In the last year or so before going it was established my father had cancer. My father and I said goodbye at the entrance to a tube station in Leytonstone, East London. Emotionally we were stiff and detached. Our relationship was strained, perhaps because I was leaving and it was inevitable we could not allow our emotions to show, or had forgotten how to. He was ill, we were both confused and mute. The farewell was a failure. It was as if I were catching a tube train to the other side of London and would be back soon. In Australia things go well for my wife and I, Dad exchanges letters regularly with me, talking about everyday things in his life. On a trip to Sydney I walk through Hyde Park and stare at the war memorial, I see the stone soldiers. In the back of my mind I worry about my dad. Shortly after he dies of lung cancer.
Hepworth
No doubt, because of the childhood memories I have associated with Battersea Park I have, ever since, had a delight in landscaped gardens and parks generally. The simple pleasure of walking in a park has always eased my mind and allowed me the opportunity to daydream. *Hepworth* signifies memories of the last park that I lived close to in London before coming to Australia. Therefore, it is symbolic of the containment and closure of one phase in my life and the beginning of another. *Two Forms* is a sculpture by Barbara Hepworth situated in Dulwich Park. It is next to the Dulwich College Art Gallery and my wife and I often used to combine a trip to the gallery and the park. At the time I was still at art school and Barbara Hepworth's sculptures had already influenced my work. I was aware of their associations to Henry Moore's art and so the link was made, psychically, to my earliest experiences of sculpture and parks. Dulwich College Art Gallery houses a fine collection of European art, including works by Poussin and Rembrandt. Aesthetically, it was a pleasure to go to the gallery and then after to wander through the park and gaze at the planned gardens, flower beds and neat borders all contained within the park behind its gates and high iron fence. Within this adult experience are many of the elements that gave me pleasure as an infant.
Series Three

FATHER IMAGO
Overview of the series

*Father Imago*

In this series I decided to make artworks that directly related to my research into psychoanalysis and Sigmund Freud. I appropriated two classic images of Freud and transposed them into a series that concerned my family life and aspects of a narrative concerning ageing and progression from birth to death.

The title originates from a term I first saw used in Peter Fuller’s *Art and Psychoanalysis*. Imago is a term used in psychoanalysis to describe an "unconscious prototypical figure which orientates the subject's way of apprehending others; it is built up on the basis of the first real and phantasied relationships within the family environment" (Laplanche and Pontalis 211). By this it is meant that an individual, for deep unconscious reasons associated with his or her childhood relationships or development, will regard aspects of relationships with other people from the perspective of "an acquired imaginary set" of images, feelings and behaviour derived from early childhood experiences. As the individual develops he or she may then invest the residue of the image, which is typically of a father or mother, into objects or things that have some association with the original object (ie., parent). Fuller suggests, as others have since, that on this basis Freud regarded Moses as a father imago, and that this helps to explain his fascination with Moses as a subject for his writing.  

In other words, Freud saw in Moses, unconsciously, a representation of aspects of his relationship to his father, real or imagined. The claim for Freud's need for father imagos is further developed by Lynn Gamwell. Gamwell argues that Freud's art collection took on imago status after the death of his father and that this helps to explain his very close relationship to his art collection throughout his life.

In making this series, I decided to work with the concept of the imago directly and to examine aspects of my fascination with Freud and psychoanalysis. To do this I included images of Freud as a father imago. I acknowledge that I have done this consciously in an attempt to uncover unconscious material. In this series of works I have transposed time and space by appropriating images of Freud, myself and my family, from various periods in time to set them within the frame of a new context and narrative.

---

(ii) S.E. vol. 13 209-238.
(iii) S.E. vol. 23 1-54.

Freud the Father
Freud the Father

paraphrased from journal:

In this image Freud is shown seated with me, as a baby, on his knee. It is a composition that references iconic paintings from the history of art and religion. To suggest both the richness of an icon and allusions to the atmosphere in Freud’s consulting rooms this painting, and the other three in the series, are surrounded by a wide and deep Persian carpet frame.

On the ledge of each frame sits a ceramic tableau. The tableau in Freud the Father depicts a female figure, prostrate and in repose. Standing on the woman’s stomach is the figure of a bird, possibly a crow, with its beak perched over her genitalia. In the painting above, surrounding the seated figure of Freud and myself, is a thick smoke grey impasto paint.
Imbedded into the paint is the ceramic representation of a woman's head (the same woman that is prostrate in this work). Near the woman's head is a bar or stick and to the right of Freud's head is the symbol related to the design on my mother's dress, first used in Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes. Some of the symbolism I am using here I am preconsciously aware of and can recall. However, other aspects are unconscious to me... I get glimpses or flashes but it is elusive and disappears quickly from my conscious or preconscious mind. What I will attempt to do now is deconstruct the "known" and the "partly-known". In the deconstruction, what is mixed and overlayed between the known and the partly-known is significant in the forming of metaphors for unconscious phenomena. The metaphors form the daydreams that release unconscious content. The significance and associations of the ceramic figure of the woman, that I can attempt to make, are as follows.

---

29 (i) The preconscious is defined by Rycroft as "referring to thoughts which are unconscious at the particular moment in question but which are not repressed and are, therefore, capable of becoming conscious (available to recall)" (122).

(ii) In their discussion of the preconscious Laplanche and Pontalis write, "What does the notion of the preconscious correspond to in the subject's lived experience, especially in the experience of the treatment? The most frequently given illustration is that of memories which are not immediately conscious but which the subject can recall at will. More generally, the preconscious is understood to designate whatever is implicitly present in mental activity without constituting an object of consciousness; this is what Freud means when he defines the preconscious as "descriptively" unconscious yet accessible to consciousness, whereas the unconscious remains cut off from the conscious realm" (327).
I can associate this figure with themes of birth, my mother, sexuality and my love of women. In the painting I am a baby of a few months old. Consequently, symbolically, I interpret the placing of the bird on the woman's stomach in the ceramic tableau as a representation of myself outside of her womb. With curiosity the bird stares at where it came from. In this piece I wanted to consciously refer to the notion of birth (as this is the first in the series) and to the theoretical interest of psychoanalysis in the first months of life. The young woman is asleep... she is dreaming. Is this an obverse way of saying "this is my dream" I want to return to the womb or fusion with the mother? Or, alternatively, is this a sinister scene. Is the woman not asleep but dead? Is this a dream of decay? Is it a scene of a corpse lying on the ground with a crow pecking at her genitals? As objectionable and repugnant as this seems it is significant that this series of work was made shortly after my mother's death.

The bird I know is a signifier to me of freedom, sexuality, love and memories of England (my mother-land). Psychoanalysts claim that the transference relationship established by the client with the analyst is close to the condition of a subject being in love, and for reasons that I cannot discuss here, birds are symbolic of love to me.

I am, I believe, obliquely referring to the transference relationship established when in love. However, the obverse of love is hate and the psychoanalytic condition of ambivalence is also a condition that can occur in the transference relationship. The bird sits on the woman's stomach, it is perched over the woman's genitalia, so perhaps here there is a reference to the psychoanalytic concept of castration and loss. This reference is reinforced by the (decapitated) head of the woman and the bar (sword/penis?) between it and Freud's head in the painting. As Laplanche and Pontalis point out, "the castration complex is met with constantly in analytic experience" (57). In men it has been most commonly described as castration anxiety and in women as penis envy. Both these terms can have emotive interpretations and the term penis envy in particular has to the present day caused much heated debate.30

The castration complexes are important concepts in psychoanalysis, they not only make reference to the masculine fear of castration and the feminine lack of a penis, but also to the notion of the young child (between birth and the oedipal stage) being fascinated by the presence and absence of the penis in his or her parents... (the bird stares at the absent penis). Freud developed the concept that fears (dreams or myths) of decapitation, or other attacks upon the wholeness of the body, can be seen as metaphors...

---

30 The notion of penis envy i.e., desire for the phallus is still one of the main points of argument in French feminism. See E. Grosz, Jacques Lacan: A Feminist Introduction (London: Routledge, 1990).
for the castration complex.\textsuperscript{31} The castration complex is connected with the ego in the pre-oedipal stages of development and then the super-ego in oedipal development. This introduces, according to Freud, the father, unconsciously and symbolically, as the castrating agent and, therefore, as representative of authority. In considering feminine sexuality Freud developed the castration complex from the position that women desired a phallus because they realised its absence in childhood, to a position where he proposed that women desired the male's penis as "the wish for a child, in accordance with the symbolic equivalence of penis and child, and the desire for the male as an "appendage to the penis" (Laplanche and Pontalis 303). This, for Freud, gave credence to the feminine "wish to enjoy the penis in coitus" (303). Freud's theories have undoubtedly been contentious and other psychoanalysts have proposed alternative concepts of the castration complex, some of which are relevant to the symbolism in \textit{Freud the Father}.

The basis for the castration complex has been attributed to loss or separation from an object. Object, in this sense, is being used to describe a significant character (i.e., father, mother) from the past. However, it has also been used to describe the loss in infancy of the mother's breast. Laplanche and Pontalis explain:

A. Starcke, following the same line of research, was the first to put the whole emphasis on the experience of suckling and on the withdrawal of the breast as the prototype of castration: "a penis-like part of the body is taken from another person, given to the child as his own, (a situation with which are associated pleasurable sensations), and then taken away from the child causing "pain"... This primary castration, which is repeated at every feed and culminates with the weaning of the child, is considered to be the only real experience capable of accounting for the universal presence of the castration complex: the withdrawal of the mother's nipple, it is argued, is the ultimate unconscious meaning to be found behind the thoughts, fears and wishes which go to make up this complex" (58).

On the other hand, Otto Rank, a protege of Freud, believed that the castration complex had its basis in the trauma of birth and separation from the mother's womb... "He concludes that castration anxiety is the echo - mediated through a long series of...

\textsuperscript{31} In this respect, an example of the castration complex can be seen in the personal mythology of the work of the artist Mike Parr. A sizeable portion of his work is concerned with castration anxiety and the physical loss of his left arm. Parr has based many works on this theme, perhaps the most significant being \textit{Cathartic Action: Social Gestus} No. 5, 1977 where he symbolically and ritualistically \textit{re-enacts} the cutting off of his arm. Parr openly recognises the psychoanalytic connections of this performance work to oedipal fears and longings concerned with his family, particularly his father and mother, and castration anxiety. Continually he has seen (aspects of) his work as a need to repeat, re-enact and work through the (traumatic and formative) events of his life. Refer, David Bromfield, \textit{Identities} (Perth: Uni of Western Australia, 1991).
traumatic experiences - of the anxiety of birth" (Laplanche and Pontalis 58).32 _Freud the Father_ references these psychoanalytic positions, whilst at the same time attempting allusions towards my own unconscious.

In this respect it is worth re-considering the significance of the bird in _Freud the Father_, and its place in psychoanalytic narrative. In his pathographic essay _Leonardo Da Vinci and a Memory of his Childhood_ Freud put great stress on the symbolic significance of a bird to Leonardo.33 As it turned out Freud made a costly mistake in his argument by calling the bird a vulture when in it was apparently a kite. The mistake undermined aspects of Freud's pathography of Leonardo but, nevertheless, as Ellen Handler Spitz points out, it still allowed him to showcase some of the main theoretical claims of psychoanalysis. According to Freud:

Observation of men's daily lives shows us that most people succeed in directing very considerable portions of their sexual instinctual forces to their professional activity. The sexual instinct is particularly well fitted to make contributions of this kind since it is endowed with a capacity for sublimation: that is, it has the power to replace its immediate aim by other aims which may be valued more highly and which are not sexual (167).

Later he contends:

... Kindly nature has given the artist the ability to express his most secret mental impulses, which are hidden even from himself, by means of the works he creates; and these works have a powerful effect on others who are strangers to the artist, and who are themselves unaware of the source of their emotion (199).

Freud made several interpretations of Leonardo's childhood encounter with a bird, and I will outline them here, without developing his arguments. This may make the interpretations appear fanciful, however, they have to be seen within the underlying concepts of psychoanalytic theory. Freud gives an account from Leonardo's notebooks in which he recalls a childhood experience, when he was still in the cradle, of a bird (vulture/kite) landing close to him, parting his lips, poking its tail into his mouth and shaking it about. To Freud this is a phantasized account of an event that _may_ have happened when Leonardo was an infant or even later in his development. Whatever the

32 Otto Rank also proposed that a major psychic reason for artists, particularly men, creating art is as a substitute for not being able to give birth to children (see Handler Spitz, _Image_ 233-250).

context for the actual event, Freud sees this as Leonardo's suppressed sexual desire and connects it to the wish to suck either a penis or a breast. Freud goes on to make the case for the mythical connection of birds with sexuality, and indeed it is not hard to conjure up images of this kind from the history of art (eg., Leda and the Swan). Further into his essay Freud connects Leonardo's phantasy of the bird with theories of homosexuality, androgyne, the castration complex and obsessive love of his mother. He discusses the theory of the child's compulsive curiosity about his or her genitals and those of the parents. He discusses the imagery of the child... (in my case, bird on woman's stomach)... staring at his mother's genitals and wondering why she has not got a penis... perhaps it was cut off, or is it removable? Freud posits that this early desire to gaze develops the child's intense pleasure in looking:

... as an erotic instinctual activity. He wants to see other people's genitals... People will not reach a proper understanding of the activities of children's sexuality and will probably take refuge in declaring that what has been said here is incredible, so long as they cling to the attitude taken up by our civilization of depreciating the genitals and the sexual functions (187).

In the ceramic tableau of Freud the Father I have (unconsciously) walked into a minefield of possible psychic positions, it is apparent that there are motives to the tableau of which I am not consciously fully aware. However, the tableau interrelates with the painting and performs the spontaneous metaphorical task that I want it to. It, together with the other component parts of this artwork, compound an overlayed series of visual transferences contained within the work to present a complex and unconscious whole.

Other intentional symbols in Freud the Father include the thick smoke grey impasto paint in which the objects of my unconscious are imbedded. This has three clear references.

The first is to Freud and to my father - they both smoked cigars and they both died from cancer attributed, in part, to smoking. The second reference concerns childhood and memories of my father and the thick swirling London fogs, where things appeared and disappeared; in this sense the grey impasto is also reminiscent of day and night dreams. The third reference is an allusion to the paintings of Lucien Freud (Sigmund's grandson) in which the backgrounds are often cool grey or neutral colours. Amongst other painters, I had Lucien Freud's psychologically charged images in my mind whilst painting this series.
The green herringbone suit that Freud wears, and that is repeated throughout the series, has the following metonymic meaning. It is similar to a woollen material that I had a suit made from when I was about eighteen years old. The significance of the material itself is that I stole it when I was sixteen from the place I first worked at on leaving school. I worked with my father at an auction rooms in central London. He got me the job and I then proceeded to thoroughly let him (and my mother) down. I became infatuated with a young woman, my first serious and passionate affair that completely strained my relationships with my parents. I ran away from home and the job my father had got me; I took the suit material with me nobody knew I had stolen it. I lived far away from home for nearly two years and did not once contact my parents, but I did have a suit made out of the material. There are deep associations of guilt linked to this material. At that time I deeply injured my parents emotions to satisfy my own instinctual needs. When the affair was over I returned home and they and I re-established the love we had always had, but my guilt has never gone away. For some reason the suit never fitted me properly and I never felt completely comfortable in it. Perhaps in an attempt at requesting repatriation and forgiveness I am dressing my father image (Freud) in the herringbone suit that I had made for myself.

Three more pieces of patterned cloth appear in *Freud the Father* and other works in this series. Firstly, there is the tie worn by Freud and my father.

It belonged to my father, it was his regimental tie and a favourite of his. Symbolically, and in terms of colour, the "tie" links this series to *The Park*. Thoughts of my father and the army pervade my memory of him. He always enjoyed putting on a suit.. (male uniform... the herringbone suit is khaki green). Right up until his death he would don his army tie and suit for a trip up to the regimental club in Whitehall and the "Sergeant Major's mess" for a night out with his army mates and their wives.

In fact, in the last three years of his life my mother and he lived and worked with a friend who had been in the army with him between 1937 and 1945.34

The second piece of material is a yellow and green striped pattern that in *Freud the Father* features as the baby's tunic. The associations to this are less clear. Consciously there was a formal consideration of colour selection wherever the pattern was used. Other than this there are four associations that I can think of: (i) the colours are emblematic of Australia the country I have made my home; (ii) Memories of a favourite shirt I used to wear when I was about eight years old; (iii) a contemporary link with some shorts I have worn in the last few

---

34 Coincidentally, Freud's use of language is peered with military terminology, (ie., conflict, aggression, defence, discharge, attack, etc..) and it was not uncommon for him to sum up theoretical points with military analogies.
years; (iv) an association with colour combinations of floral bouquets I remember from my mother's funeral.

The third material features in the first two works in the series, it is the now familiar pattern from my mother's dress first featured in *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*. In *Freud the Father*, Freud is sitting on a cushion made from this material. Perhaps this symbolically oppressive act ties in with the vulnerability of the woman in the ceramic tableau that lies in front of Freud and the child.

The symbols and signifiers in this piece work on a complex system of personal meaning, and I have attempted to unravel consciously aspects of meaning that go beyond the conscious. In my curiosity as a child and now as an adult I have attempted to look at where I came from... the womb, my mother, the genitals, the unconscious. The baby sits on Freud's knee. He stares out of the picture, distracted in thought by something not connected with the composition and outside the frame. In her poem based on work in the exhibition Debbie Westbury included the following lines:

A baby stares back at us
from his mother's arms.
She's holding him closely
looking into a face that's
already
turning away from her
to a distant Father.
Freud, formal, pre-occupied
hardly notices the infant in his lap.
The steady gaze of the wise child
finds us wanting
and we look away.

This work, *Freud the Father*, has clear visual transferences contained in it. In Debbie Westbury's poem she has responded counter-transferently to the visual transferences.
Phamily Group
The title of this piece is a play on the psychoanalytic spelling of the term "phantasy". This derives from the German *phantasie*, a word which has subtle differences to fantasy the English equivalent.

The definition Laplanche and Pontalis give to *phantasy* is directly relevant to this work. They explain it as:

... [an] Imaginary scene in which the subject is a protagonist, representing the fulfilment of a wish (in the last analysis, an unconscious wish) in a manner that is distorted to a greater or lesser extent by the defensive processes.

Phantasy has a number of different modes: conscious phantasies or daydreams, unconscious phantasies like those uncovered by analysis as the structures underlying a manifest content, and primal phantasies (312).

Portrayed in *Phamily Group*, surrounding Freud, is my father, my mother and myself. The images of all four people are appropriated from photos taken at radically different times. Freud's image comes from a photo taken in 1920. The photo of me was taken in about 1960. The photo of my father in 1976 and that of my mother in 1987. A common type of phantasy is the family romance. Freud coined this term to describe the phantasy "whereby the subject imagines that his relationship to his parents has been modified (as when he imagines, for example, that he is really a foundling)." Such phantasies are grounded in the Oedipus complex" (Laplanche and Pontalis 160). It could be interpreted that *Freud the Father* considers personal and psychoanalytic concepts concerned with birth, death and the infant. However, I believe that *Phamily Group* considers notions of the Oedipus complex and puberty. Family romance phantasies are typically tied up with the Oedipus complex and in this work I am depicted as a child of about twelve, when it is considered that the Oedipus complex reasserts itself as puberty and the "reawakening" of manifest sexuality occurs. *Phamily Group* is a "visual phantasy". Laplanche and Pontalis assert:

... phantasies are still scripts (scenarios) of organised scenes which are capable of dramatisation - usually in visual form... the subject is invariably present in these scenes... he does in fact have a part to play not only as an observer but also as a participant... It is not an object that the subject imagines and aims at, so to speak, but

35 I can also remember having these phantasies between the ages of five to fourteen.
rather a sequence in which the subject has his own part to play and in which permutations of roles and attributions are possible (318).

In this sense, phantasy, of course, permeates this whole series of works. Phantasies, in one of their forms, have a strong relationship to daydreams and, according to Freud, there are conscious, preconscious and unconscious versions of daydreams. Daydreams and night dreams are a form of desire and wish-fulfilment, they are connected to other forms of transferent activity such as, jokes, parapraxes, the production of art works and transference itself (S.E. vol.5 1-277). Psychoanalysis points out that phantasies can transcend clear definition into the conscious, preconscious or unconscious categories and instead work on many levels. They permeate much of our waking lives and are often expressed in:

... aspects of behaviour that are far removed from imaginative activity, and which appear at first glance to be governed solely by the demands of reality... In the light of this evidence, it is the subject's life as a whole which is seen to be shaped and ordered by what might be called, in order to stress this structuring action, a "phantasmatic"... This should not be conceived of merely as a thematic - not even as one characterised by distinctly specific traits for each subject - for it has its own dynamic, in that the phantasy structures seek to express themselves, to find a way out into consciousness and action, and they are constantly drawing in new material (317).

paraphrased from journal:

In Phamily Group, Freud sits presiding over the cluster which stands either behind or beside him. This seated position is similar to a photo of my Irish grandfather, whom I never saw as he died before my birth. Compositionally, (in Phamily Group) triangles present themselves in the negative (unconscious) spaces between the figures. Triangular structures are fundamental to the psychoanalytic concepts of the psyche (eg., [i] conscious, preconscious, unconscious : [ii] ego, superego, id) and to Freud's concept of the interpersonal dynamic in the Oedipus complex, (child, mother, father). It was in my mind that whilst painting Phamily Group, the kind of family I came from; white, European and nuclear, is the kind of family on which Freud based many of his theories. Behind Freud and to his right stands my father. The image is appropriated from a photo taken on my wedding day. Dad has on his "photo" smile, his wedding suit and is very happy. It was 1976, he was sixty one and still a year or so before he would be diagnosed as having lung cancer. These are some of the last full, happy memories I have of him. The image of my mother also relates to memories of the last time I saw her alive. It was 1987, she was seventy five and had come out of Australia to see my wife, two children and me.
To some extent *Phamily Group* is about transition. With all the figures appropriated from photos taken at different times the characters represent spatially different positions in time psychically and physically. Freud sits, formal, Edwardian and serious contemplating a future that he will never see. My father, still the soldier, proud of his uniform, in late middle age. My mother, now widowed, transformed from when she was married to him.
In the intervening years between my father’s death and my mother’s visit to Australia both she and I had aged markedly. When I met her again in 1987 she had readjusted both physically and mentally to the last few years of her life alone. No longer did she have children or her husband living with her, or reliant on her, she was more self-focussed. Still loving, as always, but somehow more concerned, rightly so it seemed, with her own life. She gave me the impression then that she had, in some part, returned to her youth in spirit and to an independence that she had before marriage and before children. I remember thinking she seemed so Irish, so girlish, her Catholicism so sincere, like that of a young nun.

Detail one of Phamily Group

In Phamily Group I am portrayed at about twelve years old. However, I have dressed myself in clothes that I still wear today as an adult and that have significance for me. I stand next to Freud who is sitting on a cushion made out of the same material that covered my pants as a baby in Freud the Father and my shorts as an adult in The Rules of the Game. In this image I am on the edge of puberty and sexual reawakening, this is the connection with the ceramic tableau in this piece. In the tableau the bird is startled in front of the fish/woman. This represents the reawakening of sexuality from the “latency period” at the onset of puberty, therefore, linking the tableau to Freud’s Oedipus
complex. The fish/woman is appropriated from René Magritte's *Collective Invention* (1935), which itself has links to puberty and sexual reawakening.\textsuperscript{36}

Set into the turgid brown (unconscious) impasto between the heads of my father, Freud and my mother a bird flies, re-echoing the quasi-religious iconography of this series... as my Catholic upbringing taught me, the Holy Spirit is in us all. Somehow the notion of the Holy Spirit - which I believed in until at least fourteen years of age - the unconscious which deeply interests me now, and the concept of psychically inherited parental characteristics fascinates and consoles me.

\textsuperscript{36} Wolfenstein argues in her manuscript on Magritte that works such as *Collective Invention* relate to his childhood experience of finding his mother drowned and his unconscious obsession of resolving the incest taboo related to the Oedipus complex.
The Rules of the Game
I am portrayed with Daniel, my son, sitting on my knee. It is a painting of my present situation. I am shown in middle age with my nine year old son beside me (1991).

Allusions towards the superego and patterns of hereditary and patriarchal law are implied here. It is in this painting that the Freudian concept of the superego is most clearly developed and in which it is consolidated and connected with the two previous pieces in the series. Laplanche and Pontalis point out that "In classical theory, the super-ego is described as the heir of the Oedipus complex in that it is constituted through the internalisation of parental prohibitions and demands" (436). This theoretical position is reinforced compositionally in the painting by the positioning and grouping of Daniel and me. My son is not merely being held by me, it is as if he is a smaller mould emanating from me. His seated position is echoed by mine and there is some visual ambiguity as if we are joined together at the legs. Furthermore, I have accepted a seated position similar to that of Freud (as father imago) displayed in the previous two works. The visual allusion to father imago is reinforced in infancy when I am on Freud's knee and then again at pre-pubescence in Phamily Group.31 The concept of the superego has relevance in the sphere of making art, particularly in the area of self-portraiture. The super-ego is an evaluative agency that can impose ethical and aesthetic self-judgements. It has the ability to both punish the ego and please it and as many artists know, both pleasure and pain often come from making art. Rycroft defines the superego as "that part of the ego in which self-observation, self-criticism and other reflective activities develop" (160). Freud claimed these reflective activities take place because of the introjection of the parental figures. The super ego then has the ability to act as a guiding or governing force within the individual and can even lead to the individual attacking or turning aggression onto the self. A metaphor for this is displayed in the ceramic tableau in The Rules of the Game where the bird sits perched on the fish's head. This, of course, is an effective reversal of the tableau in Freud the Father. Then, I was the child on my parent's stomach, now the child sits on my head.

37 Part of my experience as a parent has been the recognition of values and characteristics instilled in me by my parents (and in turn, as Freud believed, by their parents). I had recognised these tendencies before I had children, however, it is as a parent that the knowledge of my parents, inside me, has come to the fore. If the reader is a parent the following practical example may well be familiar to them. In conversation with my children, play, parental education and communication modes generally, I find myself repeating patterns of behaviour (even the same words, songs and antics) that are paraphrased, or even direct accounts of my parent's behaviour. These actions are often disconcerting and nearly always involuntary.
A sense of self-guilt can also be imposed by the super-ego as the introjected objects (usually parents) perform a moralising role. Freud advised (or warned) that by taking control of our egos and accepting the theories of psychoanalysis, a cold reality might replace the superstitions of blind belief, ignorance or super-ego institutions.

paraphrased from journal:

The logic implied in this piece, as third in a series of four, is of middle age. I am sitting on a chair similar to the one that Freud sits on in the two previous pieces. My facial expression is serious and intent as Freud’s was. However, my clothes are less formal than those of Freud. On the lower half of my body (the sensual) I wear the patterned cloth of my childhood, on the upper half (the intellectual) I wear a short sleeve shirt made from Freud’s suit material. By repeating the pattern elements of clothing and pose I am implying that, at this point in my life, I carry the thoughts of psychoanalysis and that, similar to many men and women in this epoch, I appear to have the vestiges of psychoanalytic cause and effect within my thought processes. The striped shorts announce that the viewer is looking at the same person as in Freud the Father only now the baby is an adult; more than forty years in time have passed. To corroborate this I have my son sitting on my knee. Where once I was
held in my mother's arms now I hold my son in the same embrace. Daniel is serious and intent too and looks straight out of the painting. A feeling of inevitability, joy and sadness occurs to me when I look at this image. In my conscience (rightly or wrongly) I carry guilt. Guilt at not being a good son, guilt at not being a better father.

The theme of "the game" is pursued in Daniel's clothes, he is wearing his cricket outfit and to the right of his head is a porcelain cricket ball and bat. Cricket is a favourite game of Daniel's. Analogous to life, cricket is a game of group participation. Daniel is participating in the game just as I have done before him. Daniel wears his outfit and I wear mine, we accept the etiquette, conventions and rules of the game to be able to play. To play the part one has to have the right clothes and this introduces an aspect of theatre. Pursuing this element of theatre I have deliberately "played up" the skin tones in this piece to suggest the effects of strong lighting or make-up. Behind Daniel and me, swirling in the grey impasto are four ceramic cones, the significance of which is unconsciously symbolic... their meaning I cannot realise; are they phalluses or teeth?. Symbols such as these have featured in my artwork for many years and usually there are connotations of sexuality and anxiety.

The tableau in this piece features a fish and bird. Sequentially, the woman from *Freud the Father* has now turned completely into a fish. The mutation from mother to self is complete. No longer is there a barrier of a parent between me and death, she is dead, I am alone. The fish is out of water and gasping for breath. I have been transformed into the same corpse as that in *Freud the Father* and now I am being scrutinised by the bird. The id confronts the ego and threatens to peck its eyes out. The bird stands menacingly at the fish's head. The bird no longer stares at the woman's vagina, it stares instead at the thoughts inside the fish's head. The id is repressed: long live the id. Is this the price we pay for control of the ego?
In the Name of the Father
The last piece in the series, self-evidently, concerns old age and impending death. In it the old man, Freud, is alone in his dark and congealed unconscious of brown impasto. Like many old people there is something pathetic about him, he knows death is close. This painting is based on a photo of Freud taken in the garden of his London house in the last year of his life. He is wearing the same clothes that he has worn throughout this series, only now he has shrunk inside them. The clothes become a metaphor for psychoanalysis; Freud's science or art. The clothes have outgrown the man. Psychoanalysis became a worldwide movement in his lifetime and was developed into schools, of which, Freud was only one. In his last years his theories were already being contested from within psychoanalysis itself. Freud was becoming marginalised, his authority and his writings less appreciated. In a self-fulfilling prophecy of psychoanalysis the father is to be usurped by his sons. Of course, it is inevitable, death claims us all, but that does not make it any easier to bear. Freud (and psychoanalysis generally) is unresolved about the place of death within his theories. Even though he wrote extensively and forcefully about the earliest years of life, youth and middle age, sexuality and the life principle libido, his writings about the death instinct are irresolute. As an outer layer then, his clothes can be seen as a visual metaphor for the ego and superego. They cover his body; his id, his sexuality, which is now old and withering. What is intact and contained, however, are his thoughts and his intellect. Freud wrote and thought lucidly until the last days of his life and, as we know, it is his thoughts and intellect which have allowed him to live on beyond his physical death. Contained within In the Name of the Father is a tribute to Freud. Regardless of the controversies concerning of his theories, what he achieved and laid open for discussion is valued by many.

As has been pointed out earlier in this thesis Freud had two obsessions in his life, psychoanalysis and archaeology, between which he made many comparisons. Therefore, I have included "relics" into the brown paint of this piece. The eye, symbolic of the all seeing third eye of the psyche. The triangle and bone as metaphor for pyramid and archaeology.

The ceramic tableau in In the Name of the Father is appropriated from an Egyptian funerary bronze which was part of Freud's art collection and still remains at the Freud museum, London. The bronze depicts "Horus in his original manifestation as lord of the sky" (Gamwell, Wells 71), a clear allusion to life after death. Psychoanalysis, of course, saw no validity in the notion of god or heaven. Freud scorned religion as a super ego institution.  

38 Egyptology was Freud's particular interest.
that comforted the weak willed. Ironically, however, to Freud his art and his objects, with their mythologies about religion and civilisation, were his comfort and his companions, even on his deathbed.

In this piece I finish the series with a visual concentration solely on Freud. However, there are visual symbols linking it distinctly with the personal narrative discussed in the earlier pieces. The title of this work, *In the Name of the Father* also references personal concerns. Firstly, tied into the title is the legacy and vestiges of my Catholic upbringing, wherein the "Credo" with its deeply patriarchal structure of worship, is embedded in my psyche. And secondly, the title references the psychoanalytic uncovering and exposure of the workings of patriarchal law within society and culture, first identified by Freud and developed by Lacan. *Nom-du-pere* (Name of the Father) is the term coined by Lacan to signify the symbolic and dead father.
Detail two of *In the Name of the Father*
AMBIVALENCE 1 AND 2
Ambivalence 1

Ambivalence 2
Ambivalence 1 and 2

As I delved further into the theory and concepts of psychoanalysis I decided to make these two pieces which directly confronted my psychic demands, desires and anxieties concerning aspects of sexuality. I have a sort of love/hate relationship with them and so decided on the title of Ambivalence 1 and 2. As with other works, the imagery is direct and revealing. It would have been easier to avoid, obscure or abstract these images but this would have been denying the project contained in this exhibition. Laplanche and Pontalis define ambivalence as "The simultaneous existence of contradictory tendencies, attitudes or feelings in the relationship to a single object - especially the coexistence of love and hate" (26). The potential for ambivalence exists within us all and as Laplanche and Pontalis point out Freud made his first direct reference to ambivalence, "in "The Dynamics of Transference"" (1912b), where it is used to account for the phenomenon of negative transference... it is found side by side with the affectionate transference, often directed simultaneously towards the same person." (27).

Because ambivalence is concerned with love and hate it is also seen as connected to the opposition and dualism between the life instincts and the death instincts. Consequently, even though we may have high sexual demands these can be denied by harsh psychic repressions.

Paraphrased from journal:

Similar to Memory, Mammary, Mummery, in Ambivalence 1 and 2 I have used the device of two visual part objects in close u This use of imagery has connotation towards certain kinds of contemporary visual media including, cinema, photography, erotica and pornography. Ambivalence 1 and 2 is about sexual obsession, anxiety, desire and loss. There are many visual referents throughout the two pieces to love and hate, even making the pieces as a complementary pair is connotative of this. The references to cinema, photography, erotica and pornography relates these two works to some interests of Surrealist art with its concerns for juxtaposition, sexuality, psychoanalysis, reactionary and dream imagery. As I made and painted Ambivalence 1 and 2 I had in mind images of Spanish cinematic Surrealism by Luis Bunuel, Carlos Sara and Pedro Amaldovar. This also helps to explain some of the decision making for proportions of the images, depth of frames, repeat pattern elements and choice of colours. Of significance in this context is the repeat element of ceramic heads and phalluses on the frames surrounding the images. According to some authors Surrealist art has many references to castration anxiety and vagina dentata two
concepts closely linked to ambivalence. In Ambivalence 1 and 2 there is clear reference, similar to that in Memory, Mammary, Mummery, to the picture frame as symbolic of the vagina; the decapitated heads and phallic teeth simultaneously alluring and threatening.

There are two other important psychological elements to Ambivalence 1 and 2. Firstly, there is the proximity of the figurative imagery to the picture plane created by the deliberate "close-up" technique. This is suggestive of the duplicity and collusion of artist and viewer in creating the image. The artist is both creator and viewer of his or her images. It is this knowledge which, in part, psychologically affects the aesthetic experience of the viewer. By having the figurative elements so close to the picture plane I am suggesting the "identification" and "mirroring" processes (apparent in cinematic technique) and redolent in the artist viewer relationship, which may, if my thesis is correct, promote the "visual transference" of unconscious content from artist to viewer. Secondly, there is the visual technique, again promoted by the close up, of splitting the image so that only part of an object is revealed in the image. This corresponds to the psychoanalytic concept of splitting.

Splitting has two main themes: splitting of the ego and splitting of the object. Historically, the concept of splitting grew out of 19th century theories, pursued prior to psychoanalysis, which introduced notions such as "the split personality" and the "double conscience". Put in these terms it is easier to see how Freud and his contemporaries developed the concept of the conscious and unconscious mind. Freud firstly used splitting, in relation to the ego, to denote "the fact that the ego comprises a part that observes and a part that is observed" and then developed the concept of splitting used as a defence of the ego, "whose prototypical form is the disavowal of castration" (Laplanche and Pontalis 428). The splitting of the object is a Kleinian concept. It was seen by her as a defence against anxiety, "the object, with both erotic and destructive instincts directed towards it, splits into a "good" and a "bad" object" (Laplanche and Pontalis 430). The split object can be both whole or part object, hence in Kleinian terms, it is possible to have a "good" or "bad" ego, a "good" or "bad" breast, or a "good" or "bad" mother.

(iii) For a definition of vagina dentata refer to review of Laurie Schnieder's essay in chap. two of this thesis.
Series Four

ILLUSIVE REALITY
Overview of the series

*Illusive Reality*

By the time it came to make this series the personal and thematic language I was using to express the thought contained in the work had developed to a more fluent stage. However, as tends to happen when proficiency in language grows, the conceptual density, subtlety and complexity had become exponential. Therefore, what I decided to do in this series was to examine and refine the proficiency I felt I had now achieved. Rather than speeding up the making of this series, the decision had the effect of making the intellectual processes harder to work through, the material process of making the work more time consuming, and the number of pieces in the series greater than in any of those previous.

Knowing that each piece in *Illusive Reality* would hold very different imagery in scale, composition and construction I gave considerable time to working out the correct size, proportions and colours for the series. The replication of appearance and isolation of image achieved by the deep, solid frames was assisted by the selection of a fine grade of maple. I then decided to have ceramic curtains within the frame of each piece. The conceptual reasons for this decision were as follows. Firstly, as work for this exhibition had developed I became aware of a theatrical quality in its presentation, (eg., the development of ceramic tableau's in *Father Imago*) and so considered the introduction of "tableau curtains" to be appropriate. Secondly, the curtains suggested revelation and concealment. As I knew some subject matter would be confrontational and other subject matter concerned with an attempt at uncovering unconscious thought, feelings and motivations, the curtains seemed an ideal device, symbol or metaphor, to promote the theme. Following on from previous work, especially *Father Imago*, I decided to use the same combination of thick and thin paint, deliberately applied in specific areas. Besides making the 'surface' references to texture, control and structure the method of application introduces a deliberate visual ambiguity that I find simultaneously attractive and disconcerting. To me, this juxtaposition of surfaces assists slippages in reality and promotes imaginative qualities. My reasons for colour choices in this series had the same connotations as described in earlier work. However, over and above these reasons, new signifiers and associations began to present themselves.

*paraphrased from journal:*

40 The term "tableau curtains" pertains to the theatre, as does the term "tableau vivant" which literally translated from French means "living picture", a term with special significance to my project.
The red/purple colour on the frames already had associations to life, blood and the unconscious first described in works such as *The Search* and *The Park*. Now, however, in *Illusive Reality* the red/purple related strongly to my Catholic childhood and adolescence. It evokes the richness of the symbolic imagery that I remember from attending church and watching the ritual of the mass take place. This association is reinforced in the curtains. The proportions of the frame, their colour and the curtains themselves began to remind me of the tabernacle that sat on the altar of St. Bede’s church; the church I went to every Sunday from the age of five until about fourteen and the same church in which I was married. In the mythology of the religion of my childhood, the tabernacle was always the most mysterious and secretive object in the church. It was also visually the most important object situated at the centre of the altar. Inside the tabernacle was the body and blood of Jesus Christ. It was always explained as the most holy place. The tabernacle was a dome shaped gilded container that had a door with a lock and a key on it.41 It was covered by rich and secretive curtains and the only person allowed to unlock the tabernacle and look inside was the priest. During the mass, at the appropriate time, the priest would go to the tabernacle, the bells would be rung the required number of times and the incantations recited. Then, secretly and with much reverence, he would take the most holy contents out of the tabernacle and hold it before the faithful before administering it to us for our salvation. The tabernacle was the container of life, secrets, magic and spirituality.

Consequently, in *Illusive Reality* there is a preconscious duality running through the series concerned with theatre and my memories of Catholicism. The themes are joined together by the alliteration of the words tableau and tabernacle.

41 The associations to “guilt container” are not overlooked here.
Mother
In terms of a narrative *Mother* is the beginning. This image is concerned with birth and sexuality and longing. Having been present at the birth of both of my children a view in some ways similar to this is not unknown to me. Connected with the visual memory of being involved with my wife's labour is the visceral purple/red colour of the baby as he or she emerged. This is signified in the frame of this piece. Because of the sexual nature of this image and the connections the title would give it to my own mother, the decision to call this piece *Mother* took some working through on my part. At the time of making this piece my mother had recently died and psychoanalytically it is reasonable to assume there would be a resurgence of infantile desire, loss and mourning. In reality the return to the mother is always consciously just beyond our reach. Our only return is in the unconscious and then mythically beyond the unconscious in death, when we return to the "mother earth".

The obvious object-relations connection to mother, breast and fusion are manifest in a piece such as this. According to Melanie Klien and Margaret Mahler the mourning and loss of our infantile state of dependence and fusion with the mother promotes our later desire and sexual drive. In making *Mother* I was aware of the sexual and psychic predicament such an image would produce for myself and the viewer. In this sense, this artwork is similar to that of work by René Magritte or Lucien Freud. In other genres the work could be considered erotic or pornographic. *Mother* addresses these issues and is put in context by the revealing/concealing metaphor of the curtains placed in front of the image.42

---

42 When Magritte's *The Rape* was first exhibited it was hidden behind velvet curtains and was only to be shown to consenting adults.
Alone
Alone

*paraphrased from journal:*

Placed next to the confrontational image of *Mother*, this piece has the following associations. The obvious one of fish to phallus I would not deny. The fish is a symbol that I have already acknowledged as being both a sexual referent and a symbol for the self in earlier artworks. Consequently, as a metaphor for both phallus and self and placed next to *Mother* it alludes to both sexual intercourse and birth.

As the self, the fish swims alone. Once we are born we are alone and as we grow the more alone we become. By this I mean, after we are born, we progressively, in our natural and physical development, grow away from our parents, our siblings and our original family of childhood. Later, we find surrogates for the original family in friends and new relationships. But they can never replace the complex relation and fusions of childhood, some part of you is always alone. As we grow, we shield ourselves with the armour of the reality principle.
Childhood
I have already written about the significance of the soldier figure in my personal mythologies. It is linked to my father and memories of him during the Oedipal period of my development. Memories of my father, my older brother, the war memorial statues and then the matriarchal Henry Moore sculptures permeate this period. The soldier figure is also linked to my arrival in Australia and one of my first trips to Sydney where I saw the war memorial statues.

paraphrased from journal:

The father imago follows me to the other end of the earth and yet I am alone. Then I move to Thirroul (my home from 1980 to the present) and a new phase of my life begins, including my own fatherhood. Outside the Thirroul R.S.L club is another war memorial soldier and I begin to realise the significance of the soldier figure to Australian culture. It is on this war memorial statue that the soldier in *Childhood* is based. The connection to the Australian mythology of the soldier is reinforced in my personal mythology because, coincidentally, the slouch hat that Australian soldiers wear is similar to the regimental hat that my father wore in many of the photos I have of him as a young man. He brought his hat home with him when he was demobbed after W.W.II and my brother and I used to play with it. Whilst we were children we also used to play with lead and plastic toy soldiers. *Childhood* contains these thoughts.

---

43 R.S.L: Returned Soldiers League
My Father c.1939
Loss
Paraphrased form journal:

The statue of Jesus. Catholicism, I am fourteen years old. There is a crisis of innocence and guilt about to happen as I go through puberty. Jesus stands for Catholicism, Catholicism stands for my mother. I have had the plaster mould of the statue of Jesus used in Loss for sixteen or seventeen years but never before have I resolved the occasion to use it. Hauntings of blasphemy and disrespect run deep in my vestiges of Catholicism. With every year that passed after the age of fourteen I would lose more of my faith in Catholicism and more of the relationship with my mother. I was fourteen in 1963 and as I lost my faith in an ancient religion (partly based on the cult of the virgin and the son of god's love for his mother), I would also begin to lose my faith in absolute truths of any kind. The 1960s came with a bang and everything in the world seemed to be changing in time with my mind and body. In 1963, J.F. Kennedy was assassinated... I went to a Catholic school where he was revered as a saint; the first Catholic President, the hero of a generation was killed. As the sixties passed by there were more assassinations, riots and televised wars from Vietnam to Northern Ireland. I grew into adolescence in those same years, my sexuality developing along with the new found promiscuity of the 1960s, where anything was possible and old truths were seen as false. In those years came ecstatic excitement and the responsibility of disillusion as I realised that we were living in an era where everything is questioned and almost nothing is for certain.

Loss marks the beginning of a sense of loss. Loss and mourning are central concepts to psychoanalytic theory. Object-relations argues that as babies we recognise loss as an emotion when we are separated from the breast and the mother. Then, as we grow and lose fusion and omnipotent control the sense of loss remains with us and is compensated for by transitional objects, desires, new relationships and possessions. Desire is expressed as love and transitional objects will develop into cultural pursuits including such things as religion and art.
Immigrant
The words in *Immigrant* are an enlarged photocopy of my father's handwriting. As a new immigrant to Australia in 1979 this was always the sentence that he opened his letters with when he wrote to me from the other end of the Earth in the last two and a half years of his life.

According to Lacanian psychoanalysis phallocentric law is inscribed in the name of the father and words form the structures of the unconscious. *Immigrant* marks my arrival in Australia, the start of a new life, whilst at the same time corresponding with my dying father. Implanted into the thick (fog, cigar smoke) grey impasto paint are "relics" which signify conscious and unconscious memories.
Children
Children

My daughter Sophie. *Children* marks a new cycle of experience for me, fatherhood. It was the birth of my children and the experience of parenthood that made me want to return to the human condition in painting. With their birth came a reappraisal of my personal values and responsibilities. Now, instead of being on the receiving end of a chain, as the child of parents who gave me life and love, I was to be the deliverer of those same values. Parenthood is daunting and fraught with anxieties. Taking stock of my own experiences from childhood to adulthood I realise that, in their own way, my children will have experiences in some ways similar to mine. *Children*, simply marks this turning point in my life and the love and anxiety my wife and I both feel as they grow and experience their lives.
Mirror Transference
Mirror Transference

paraphrased from journal:

The essential ingredient in this work was to paint a head and shoulders on a mirror leaving
the face area of the portrait transparent so that the mirror would reflect back the viewers
image as it was looked at. In this sense, the painting is diagrammatic of the proposal I am
making in this thesis; Mirror Transference pursues the notion of visual transference
occurring in the experience of making and viewing art.

As will be realised from reading the preceding three chapters of the thesis, there is a
substantial body of opinion that alludes to transference occurring in the visual arts and
also to the comparison of the professional disciplines from which transference emanates
to the experience of making and viewing art. This being the case, Mirror Transference
is an illustration of that body of opinion in metonymic presentation. The metonym can
be explained in the following way.

I paint an image on a mirror in a similar way that I could paint on a canvas. As the image
is constructed I intensely stare at and concentrate on the surface of the painting. The mirror
reflects back my image as the painting reflects back aspects of my mind whilst painting on
any surface. However, as this is a mirror I can physically see my likeness presented on the
surface; this is both disturbing and intriguing. Nevertheless, this is not too different,
psychically, from the sensation I have when I paint an image on canvas. The essential
characteristic, when I paint, is to concentrate intensely on the image before me, in an
attempt to put as much emotional content into the work as I can. This can have the effect of
sending me into a kind of trance as a dialogue emerges between myself and the artwork. At
some stage in this process I will decide the image is complete. This process can be, and is
often, mentally exhausting. To arrive at this stage I will have stared at the image whilst
working on it and sealed my vision into it. This process is the same whether I paint on a
mirror or a canvas. Then, when the work is shown, the viewer looks into and at the
painting. As Mirror Transference is painted on a mirror the viewer literally sees his or her
own reflection. This also for the viewer can be disturbing and intriguing, but perhaps this is
not too different from the sensation the viewer feels when he or she looks at an artwork that
they know or feel has been painted by another individual with deep intent. On looking at the
image the viewer consciously or unconsciously knows that the artist will have stared at the
surface on which the painting is painted and engaged in a dialogue with it. If the viewer
regards the image empathically and responds to the psychic energy contained within the
image, a psychic and visual dialogue commences between viewer and artwork. It is in this
process of visual dialogue between artist and artwork and artwork and viewer that I propose
transference and counter-transference may occur. Similarly to the psychoanalytic situation this is a private process of dialogue between object and subject. Similar to the psychoanalytic situation there may not be conscious knowledge that a transference is occurring.

As Freud was the first to point out, and as Lacan readily agreed, transference is ubiquitous and often occurs in the gaps and omissions of consciousness when the subject least expects or realises it (Lacan 124-125). In discussing Lacan's work Elizabeth Grosz explains:

For Lacan, the unconscious is a discourse quite different from those ascribed to consciousness. Conscious discourse obeys the imperatives of grammar, syntax, logic and coherence; by contrast, the unconscious articulates itself only through the gaps, silences, moments of indecision and error that intervene in consciousness... This may explain why the unconscious has no voice of its own, and can thus have no form of expression independent of consciousness: it can only speak through or as consciousness, as that which intervenes into consciousness as eruption and interruption (123).

It is these moments that are part of the psychic nucleus of art and essential to it. Without the possibility of unconscious phenomena being communicated through art, important aspects of arts meaning would be lost or diluted. It is the conscious and unconscious meaning attributed to art in contemporary society that gives it such importance in stabilising our psyches. It is perhaps, as Peter Fuller argued, the nearest thing we have in a secular world to a symbolic order.

The terms mirror, mirroring and mirror-transference are all important concepts in psychoanalysis (Robbins 107-118). Lacan was one of the first to argue the concept and the reality of the mirror image in the pre-oedipal stage of development (Laplanche and Pontalis 251). He located the origins of the "mirror phase" between the ages of six to eighteen months of age in the developing infant. The first concept of mirroring is that which occurs between mother and child. In the child the mother sees herself and in the mother the child sees itself. This is a period of symbiotic fusion. However, as the infant develops individuation begins and the infant experiences psychic fragmentation and trauma. The infant is only reconstituted as it perceives its likeness in others and mirror images of itself. "The mirror phase is said to constitute the matrix and first outline of what is to become the ego". (Laplanche and Pontalis, 251). For Lacan, it is

---

the mirror phase that initiates the realm of the imaginary. The mirror phase develops the ego's imaginary view of itself into an "ego-ideal" which in turn is linked to the controlling force of the superego. It is in this way that the concept of the mirror image of ourselves stays within our psyches throughout life and to which we make attempts to identify. But the mirror stage for Lacan also locates the infant as an individual and "other". It "is the basis for an alienation, a rift which it will forever unsuccessfully attempt to cover over" (Grosz 22). In this dichotomy of self and other lies the potential for transference.

Winnicott refers to the mirror-role and concurs with Lacan's view of it originating with the infant's earliest relations with the mother. Significantly, Winnicott links the mirror-role to two disparate activities; the psychoanalytic situation and the experience of making and viewing art. It is in the psychoanalytic situation, where the transference relationship is so inevitable and crucial, that the mirror role of analyst to analysand is evident:

This glimpse of the baby's and child's seeing the self in the mother's face, and afterwards in a mirror, gives a way of looking at analysis and at the psychotherapeutic task. Psychotherapy is not making clever and apt interpretations; by and large it is a long-term giving the patient back what the patient brings. It is a complex derivative of the face that reflects what is there to be seen... if I do this well enough the patient will find his or her own self, and will be able to exist and to feel real... But I would not like to give the impression that I think this task of reflecting what the patient brings is easy. It is not easy, and it is emotionally exhausting (Playing 137-138).

Later, Winnicott discusses the work of the painter Francis Bacon. Bacon's work, he indicates, provides an example of the way in which art can also mirror our emotional predicaments:

Francis Bacon says that "he likes to have glass over his pictures because then when people look at the picture what they see is not just the picture; they might in fact see themselves"... John Rothenstein writes: "... to look at a painting by Bacon is to look into a mirror, and to see there our own afflictions and our fears of solitude, failure, humiliation, old age, death and of nameless threatened catastrophe.

His avowed preference for having his paintings glazed is also related to his sense of dependence on chance. The preference is due to the fact that glass sets paintings somewhat apart from the environment... and that glass protects, but what counts more in this case is his belief that the fortuitous play of reflections will enhance his pictures.
His dark blue pictures in particular, I heard him observe, gain by enabling the spectator
to see his own face in the glass (137).

*Mirror Transference*, as the reader may have already deduced, is based on Stanley
Spencer's last major self portrait.

![Sir Stanley Spencer Self Portrait 1959.](image)

Spencer died of cancer in 1959, he was sixty eight. I have long admired his art and the
self-portrait on which *Mirror Transference* is based is one of his best works. It seems a
particularly honest depiction of himself as an old man, not unlike Rembrandt's late self
portraits. Self portraits are extremely hard to complete successfully, but Spencer's for
me at least, captures some essential truth. In my initial planning for this image I did
not intend to use Spencer's self-portrait. All I knew was that I wanted a head and
shoulders portrait painted on a mirror. As the concept for the piece developed I
thought I might use a study of my own head and shoulders but then, when I began to
consider the proportions required, Spencer's self portrait became the "automatic"
choice. His painting is a metaphor for my father and myself as artist. It is quite
possible that when Spencer painted the image, examining in detail the physical characteristics of his head and shoulders, he saw himself and one (or both) of his parents. This is part of the disturbance and intrigue in painting a self-portrait. His penetrating stare, that can only be interpreted in a self portrait painted from life, transfers psychic information in a way that nothing else can. As I age, I look at Spencer's wrinkled skin and the poignancy of his appearance and I see parts of myself (and others) reflected back. Then there is the opportunity for contemplation.
Father
Father

paraphrased from journal:

The last piece in this series shows the middle body and sexual organ of a man. Father creates a symmetry with Mother, the first piece in this series. They are positioned this way to indicate a continuum between mother and father, male and female, life and death. They are at either end of a cycle (a narrative). They not only signal a beginning and an end but, also, the loop of a continuous story. What happens in between them, mother/father, beginning/end, their children's lives, has some similar features, yet is uniquely complex in every case. I am really not trying to make a statement about gender difference, even though it is evident that there is one. By depicting the sexual organs of a female and male I am saying that we all have sexual parts and personas and there are common aspects to our experience. Perhaps somewhere in the middle between male and female there is a balance.
Series Five

TIME TRANSFERRED
Overview of the series

*Time Transferred*

In this last series of work for the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* I wanted to bring together many of the themes I had been working through and at the same time end the conscious and unconscious journey in the present. This is why the very last piece in the series is entitled *Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong*. The title of the series *Time Transferred* is an obvious reference to the research into psychoanalysis and transference that has absorbed me for the past nine years. When transference occurs it is not just unconscious memories that are transferred it is also time that is transferred from the past to the present. As the original event is transferred a "new edition" of the long forgotten memory is remembered, repeated or worked through in the present. Making objects such as paintings has long been considered a means of isolating time and space. In this series the two concepts of transference and the isolation of time and space are considered. Like all of the previous work this series is allegoric and autobiographical.

In *Time Transferred* I decided to return to making work in an oval shape. The previous oval piece I had made, *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*, had presented a formal challenge and I wanted to repeat this in a series. As indicated in *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* the oval shape has symbolic meaning that may have sexual connotations and as this series deals with some issues from early childhood the oval shape again presented itself. An example of the emergence of childhood and sexual vestiges of memory arises in my discussion of the work *Auntie Anne*. Significantly, oval mirrors, which feature throughout this series go right back to early childhood memories of furniture in my Auntie Anne's mews flat in London. This may also explain the "curly" spikes around the oval frames; are they symbolic of pubic hair I ask myself? Or, are they symbolic of vagina dentata, or are they representations of the phallus? Both of these thoughts also propose themselves as I consciously make reference to *Ambivalence 1 and 2*.

Following on from *Mirror Transference* the use of mirrors in this series is a symbolic statement about the artwork reflecting back its psychological content. The artwork is the container and confidant of the artist's and viewer's unconscious.
Dum Dum Dum  Dummy Do Wah
In a partly "tongue in cheek" way I wanted to end the exhibition with a touch of humour, parody and irony. The title of this piece relates to the Roy Orbison song, Only the Lonely. Choosing the background vocals of a 1960s pop song as the title seemed to contain all of the above elements. Only the Lonely biographically positions me at around fourteen years old. This position is reinforced by the use of the three Jesus statues. As mentioned earlier, when writing about the work Loss, the age of fourteen (or thereabouts) is significant as a high point in my associations with Catholicism and imagos of father, son and mother. The confluence of Jesus statue with Roy Orbison song symbolises the sincere basic belief of Irish Catholicism, handed on to me and my siblings by my mother, and the sub-cultural acceptance and enjoyment of American pop music. The three Jesus statues are the backing group singing dum, dum, dum, dummy do wah. Positioned on the mirror at an angle similar to that of erect penises they reflect the conflict of religion and sexuality I was feeling at that time and which no doubt still has its effects on me.
Auntie Anne
Auntie Anne

Paraphrased from journal:

Auntie Anne, Uncle Jack and their son John were in many respects a surrogate family for me. From my infancy through to my late teenage years I very often stayed with them in their small mews flat in South Kensington. On the floors were carpets similar to those featuring in Auntie Anne and the series Father Imago. Anne was my mother's younger half sister. When they were young women my mother and Anne had an emotionally close relationship, but increasingly, as they grew older their relationship became strained and distant. This estrangement was even more obvious with my mother's older full sister Mary. Emotionally, the tension and estrangement of my mother's relationship to her sisters resulted in a marked ambivalence in my mother towards them and perhaps towards other people. I feel this characteristic of ambivalence is present in relationships that I form.

Auntie Anne's only child, John, was just one year older than me and we had a close relationship from a very early age. We played together like brothers and were treated as such by Anne and her husband Jack. Anne was like a second mother to me and yet she was different to my mother and I noticed the difference from infancy. She wore make-up and perfumes and represented glamour and attraction, whereas, from my mother I received love, nurturing and affection. To me it seems, they stood for two different kinds of sexuality. I remember being fascinated by Anne's painted red toe nails. I have a memory of myself as a very young child, on all fours, staring at her red toe nails. Several years ago this image returned into my consciousness after a long absence. I think I may have been trying to work out, why it was that, even though I find make-up and painted finger nails and cosmetics generally pointless, absurd or false, conversely I find painted red toe nails emotionally alluring. Why do women paint their toe nails? After all, in isolation, painting toe nails red is absurd unless it has its basis in sexual attraction. Perhaps from a Lacanian perspective it could be explained as a visual demonstration of desire and repression in action. The painted toe nails and high heeled sandals signal femininity. Leading from them the fleshy bare legs veiled by an edge of an open skirt or dress (Lacanian rim or orifice?) signal female sexuality and at the same time closure and prohibition... desire is maintained but unfulfilled. What comes into focus again, in discussing painted red toe-nails, is my attraction to the colour red when I am painting pictures, particularly as in this case I am associating the colour red with

45 I have often pondered over the emotional turmoil and resentment my mother and her sisters wrestled with and feel it may be connected with the death of my mother's natural mother. She died one month after my mother's birth from a post-natal complication and my mother was brought up by relatives for the first few years of her life and then only reunited with her father when he re-married. It is quite possible that there was trauma associated with these early years, for my mother and her sisters, although this was never elaborated on.
childhood scopophillic pleasure and a real and surrogate mother. Significantly, in preparation for this painting I asked my wife to model the image I painted. In *Auntie Anne* the feet are painted partly placed on a mirror. The mirror is deliberately positioned to suggest voyeuristic and scopophillic tendencies... the red toe nails lead to her feet; her feet lead to her legs; it presents the kind of view a child might have on all fours around a woman's feet. The mirror, besides reflecting up into a woman's skirt also reflects blue sky and clouds. Once again, this image connects to some of my earliest childhood memories. I remember as an infant, in a cot or on my parents bed during the day, looking at the clouds passing by the large balcony windows of our apartment in Sutherland Street. I can remember the images of sky reflected on glass and looking at the play of light and shade from passing clouds reflected on the walls as I gazed, imagined and daydreamed.

I am aware that the admitted interest in painted toes could be regarded, psychoanalytically, as the characteristic of a fetishist. This is why Surrealists often made reference to feet and toes in their work (*Surrealism - Revolution* 48). I am prepared to accept that my interest may have some fetishistic content! Rycroft defines the fetish as:

1. An inanimate object worshipped by savages for its magical powers or as a being inhabited by a spirit. Hence 2. an object which a fetishist endows with sexual significance and in the absence of which he is incapable of sexual excitement. A sexual fetish is either an inanimate object or a non-sexual part of a person, the inanimate ones usually being clothes, footwear, or articles of adornment, the animate ones being typically feet or hair, Fetishists can be said to regard their fetish as being "inhabited by a spirit", since the fetish is clearly associated with a person without being one, and as having "magical powers", since its presence gives them the potency they otherwise lack. Fetishism is a classical example of primary-process thinking influencing behaviour since (a) the fetish has multiple meanings derived by condensation, displacement, and symbolisation from other objects, and (b) the fetishist behaves as though it actually were these other objects and is no more disturbed by incongruity or absurdity than a dreamer is while dreaming (51-52)
Recurrent Dream
Recurrent Dream

This piece makes reference to René Magritte's painting *Time Transfixed*, an acknowledgment which is repeated in the title to this series, *Time Transferred*.

I don't know for sure when I would first have seen Magritte's *Time Transfixed*, it is in the collection of the Tate Gallery, London and I probably visited the gallery for the first time in my early teens. I have many reasons for deciding to make an artwork based on Magritte's masterpiece. Firstly, it is one of his most obvious pieces concerned with the isolation of time and space which is also a central theme of this series and, indeed, this whole exhibition. Secondly, as a Surrealist, Magritte worked with concepts directly
influenced by psychoanalysis. Thirdly, this image reportedly came to him in a moment "of rapid hallucination" not unlike the psychoanalytic concept of daydreaming. Fourthly, as a gilt framed mirror features in *Time Transfixed* it connects well with my use of oval mirrors in this series. With Magritte's use of mirrors, in many of his artworks, there is ambiguity in the reflected image of a mirror as there is in this piece *Recurrent Dream*.

*paraphrased from journal:*

The personal associations I have with *Recurrent Dream* include a string of memories concerned with steam trains and childhood. There are the memories of playing games with, or about, steam trains with my cousin John when I stayed with him. There is the memory of my father walking my brother and me to sit on a bridge near Victoria Station to watch the steam trains pass underneath. Then there is a precious memory of childhood holidays to the seaside. Every year, from my birth to the age of about twelve years, our family would catch a steam train to Bournemouth (to stay with another auntie) for two weeks holiday away from the grime and pollution of Central London. Lastly, there is the association to a recurrent dream I had through my childhood. It was really more like a nightmare. The dream concerned our journey to the seaside on a train called "The Bournemouth Belle". Inevitably, at some point in the dream, I would find myself either hanging by my hands from a railway bridge or tunnel with a steam train hurtling towards me, or standing on top of the train's railway carriages as it sped towards the same bridge or tunnel. Excruciatingly, I was to be cut in two or crushed between tunnel and train... nevertheless, I always woke in fright just before, or at the moment of impact. The sexual referents in the dream could be explained psychoanalytically as connected to the castration complex and the denial of pleasure.

---


For John
For John

When I returned to England in 1991 for my mother's funeral I stayed for a month. My cousin John couldn't attend the funeral and so in the last week of my visit to England I had arranged to go and stay with him and his family. I drove the one hundred and fifty miles or so to see him and arrived to be told by his wife that he had died four hours earlier from a sudden and quite unexpected heart attack, he was forty-two. John was always a bit flippant about death, he had a black sense of humour; when he was twelve his father had died of a heart attack, he wouldn't have been much older than John was when he died. Being Auntie Anne's only son, John always shared some of her attraction and glamour to me. I admired him. He was confident, intelligent and strong. For John commemorates him. It relates to memories of him and me at about ten years old. Uncle Jack, John's father, was a chauffeur for very rich employees. The cars he drove for them, Rolls Royces, Bentley's and Rovers, were housed in the garages under their mews flat. We had endless toys to play with, but one that always fascinated me was a music box that sat on Auntie Anne's dressing table, and contained rings and trinkets. When you opened it a ballerina twirled around, the clockwork mechanism whizzed and the tune chimed out.

When I turned up at John's house four hours after his death I stayed with his wife and children for three days. The eldest of his three boys Oliver, was thirteen and looked a lot like John. Near where they lived Auntie Anne had been put in an old people's home. She has Alzheimer's disease and couldn't remember me or realise that her son had died.
Hello, I'm a Painting, who are You?
**Hello, I'm a Painting, who are You?**

*paraphrased from journal:*

This piece poses the question: can an artwork contain or transfer unconscious content? The thesis has presented an abundance of opinion to say "yes this can happen". In *Hello I'm a Painting, who are you?* the painting of a female figure looks out into a ceramic hand mirror, held by a ceramic hand to analogue the mirroring capabilities of a painting. In metonymy this piece represents the painter or viewer looking into the painting and asking of it who they are; the rhetoric of this position is that the painting is actually asking the question. If making art is an act of communication, what is trying to be communicated and from where? Psychoanalysis goes beyond the obvious surface interpretations of the conscious and offers a deeply layered structure of interpretation with the aim of "unmasking" the unconscious. When an artist or viewer looks into a painting and it asks this question of them it is an attempt at communication. If the invitation is accepted to respond to the communication, and answer the painting's question, dialogue is underway. Dialogue of a private and personal kind, dialogue that, as it develops, has in it the potential for phantasy. As one converses, visually, with the painting's surface and becomes absorbed with aesthetic pleasure, energies are released that may remove you from the physical concepts of time and space... there is a momentary lapse from everyday consciousness as you contemplate self and other. As the painter or viewer defines themself to the painting a relationship is established and one transfers or invests the painting with aspects of the unconscious. When this happens a new knowledge, respect, love or ambivalence is accorded to the painting. The establishment of a relationship with the artwork (and then by proxy with the artist) may happen on your first encounter with it. Alternatively, it may develop over a prolonged period and in consequence of seeing other works by the same artist. Nevertheless, as the relationship develops, and understanding is deepened, the knowledge and accrual of previous dialogues with the artwork(s) is utilised to enrich a personal psychic understanding that is not necessarily rational or predictable.

The symbolism in this work is semi-automatic and partly irrational. All of the elements in this artwork somehow relate to Anne. The libido red of the background is reminiscent of those colours in the mews flat in the 1950s. To make this piece I asked Denise, my wife, to pose. Originally, I had considered basing this piece on Denise, yet, as it developed, I could not help myself putting the "mask" of Auntie Anne over the underpainting of Denise. I deliberately left the painting of this piece unfinished to suggest the oscillation of psychic material. The mask of Anne is semi-opaque and suggests the face's potential as transitional object and ghostly residue. The ceramic hand holds Anne's mirror, this mirror sat on her dressing table, my mother had one like it too. It fascinated me as a child, I would gaze into...
it and I would watch Auntie Anne gazing into it. There is a taboo about bringing forward a memory of how things used to be. It is almost something I don't want to recognise... the passing of time, the changing of circumstance and physical appearance. When I saw Auntie Anne again in 1991 I was with an old, old woman who had lost her memory and bore no resemblance to my memories of her. The set of memories and emotions I have of Anne are unchanging and timeless, locked into a personal and preconscious store.
Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong
Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong

Three fish disappear back into the mirror. This signals the end of the series and the end of the work made for the exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery. The fish swim back into their sea, back into the unconscious. The revelation is closed, but in the unconscious the fish still swim.
Summary Chapter Four

This chapter has been a documentation and examination of aspects of my psychic relationships to the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*. As a visual artist it has been one of the most time consuming and difficult things I have ever had to do, especially as the work is so personally meaningful. Usually, I make artwork as an end in itself, the explanation of its making, for me, is contained within the work. Once it is made the last thing I want to do is write an account of why I made it. I want to get on to making other artworks. Nevertheless, it has been a constructive process and has forced me to scrutinise and consciously attempt to identify aspects of my unconscious reasons for making these particular artworks.

The text in chapter four is filled with cues and clues that link the artwork to my presentation of visual transference. The main points revealed are,

1. Comparisons of practice and theory between psychoanalysis, art therapy and my artwork.
2. Object-relations content in the artwork
3. Self-analytic properties of the artwork
4. Visual, compound and overlayed transferences identified in the artwork.

I will now discuss examples of how these themes are revealed in chapter four. All of the above points contain comparisons of practice and theory between psychoanalysis, art therapy and my artwork. However, I commence in point 1. by giving some straightforward examples.

1. **Comparisons of practice and theory between psychoanalysis, art therapy and my artwork.**

In reviewing the psychoanalytic and art therapeutic literatures in chapters two and three many comparisons of practice and theory were made to fine art. Here again, in chapter four overlap and similarity presents itself. For example, in discussing *The Search* I refer to using images from my personal collection of art books to stimulate artworks. Or, in artworks such as *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* or *Objects and Relations* from the series *The Park* I use family photos to stimulate transferences into the artworks. This process of looking at reproductions of other art or family photos to stimulate imagery and ensuing transference is well documented by art therapists and psychoanalysts. For example, in the case of the art therapy situation Levick, Spence and later Case and
Dalley all refer to these uses. Furthermore, it is reported in chapter two that Freud used artworks in this way to stimulate transferences in his treatment of patients and in his own self-analysis. The practice of artists using other art and imagery as the stimulus for their creations is also well established. A contemporary example of an artist who works from the stimulus of other art is Frank Auerbach. In Stephen Spender's catalogue essay on Auerbach (Marlborough Fine Arts[1982]) Spender refers to Auerbach's working methods in his studio whereby there are often many art books laid open with illustrations of Auerbach's favoured artists to act as psychic mentors.

Another overlap of process referred to in my discussion of The Search, and other artworks, is that of "playing" with ideas until significant content and forms emerge. This is a process that other artists would be familiar with and relates to processes of "free association" in both psychoanalysis and art therapy and Winnicott's concepts concerning transitional objects. In psychoanalysis free association is used as a verbal means of developing the transference relationship. In art therapy Schaverien, Spence and other authors discuss the roles of imagery, drawings and artwork used to aid in developing transferences and transference imagery.

Practice and theory between psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art converge again in the use of the "frame" as a theoretical and practical construct. This is also the case with my own artwork. Starting with The Search and building throughout the exhibition and my documentation of it is a realisation of the significance of the frame as a construct to aid and promote visual transference. The significance of the frame as a conceptual device to aid in the construction of transference and a transference environment is also recognised by authors such as Milner and Schaverien. For example, Schaverien writes of "inner" and "outer" frames and refers to these concepts in relation to the art therapy environment and the art gallery. Coinciding with Schaverien's concepts on an intuitive level I have made several artworks in this exhibition that have inner and outer frames. Some of the artworks, such as Objects and Relations, have frames within frames and in documenting these artworks I have realised the psychic significance of this formal decision. Invariably, I have seen the spaces contained by the frames as psychic spaces related to conscious and unconscious activity. The concept and importance of the frame has also been pursued by my decision to work in series. As I have pointed out in my documentation of a series such as The Park the series as a whole when displayed on the art gallery wall acts as the outer frame and the individual artworks within the series act as the inner framed artworks. Within the series the spaces between each artwork and their placement became very important to me and I began to consider that this visual concern was related to Winnicott's concept of the potential space. The potential space is a real and imaginary space where objective and subjective experience can play creatively
and this is how I view the "potential" spaces between the artworks in series and their (object) relationships to each other and the viewer. The real and imaginary space between artwork and viewer then becomes an activated psychic space.

In many artworks in the exhibition and the documentation of them I am working through aspects of theory in practical and physical terms. Good examples of this are *Mirror Transference* and *Hello, I'm a Painting who are You?* In both artworks and the accompanying texts I illustrate the hypothesis of visual transference and the concept of intra-psychic dialogue by reference to psychoanalysis, art therapy and art.

2. **Object-Relations content in the artwork.**

The connections of object-relations theory to my artworks are encapsulated in many of the titles. Some of the them have distinctly psychoanalytic titles and subject matter, (eg., *Object Relations Series One; Ambivalence; Freud the Father* etc.). However, it must be pointed out that the artworks, especially the early pieces, were made solely from an intuitive, expressive and personal search of meanings and motivations. They were, as is often the case with artworks, only titled later when they were considered for their psychic content and formal attributes. Because of this working method and the brief set for the overall project, the dynamic internal dialogue between myself and the artwork was pronounced. At many times I was, besides being the artist, very definitely also a viewer in communion with the artwork. This intense visual and working dialogue of artist, and artist as viewer has resulted in some self-analytic insights.

Early in the making of the artworks for exhibition I identified object-relations phenomena as an important element in my psyche. In *Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes* I introduce a discussion of the importance of object-relations theory and Winnicott's concepts of the potential space and creative living to illustrate how aspects of this particular work can be interpreted using these concepts. For example, to support this position I refer to Peter Fuller's propositions concerning various artists and object-relations theory. Further to this, in chapter five I demonstrate why Handler-Spitz's "psychoanalytic and aesthetic experience" model of interpretation, which relies on object-relations theory, and Schaverien's which refers to it are the most appropriate interpretive models when considering my artwork.

The text in chapter four is filled with other references to object-relations phenomena. This is because much of the subject matter in the exhibition is autobiographical and consciously relates to early childhood. For example, an intuitive and spontaneous work such as *Face and Breast Image*, from the series *Object Relations*, explicitly confronts
the notion of childhood and adult fascination with the breast. Or there again, in the
series The Park I refer to subject matter concerning my life prior to the age of five.
This period, as I develop in chapter five, is significant to me as one of idealised
happiness, love and familial bonding. Contained in The Park are visual transferences
concerning my early childhood. Some of these memories I can recall and others are
unconsciously invested into the artworks and the transference objects within them. It
can be seen that in the documentation concerning a series such as The Park I attempt to
analyse, or raise into consciousness, the memories and feelings that are contained in the
work. Sometimes, however, this is clearly not possible. For example, in the artwork
called The Pram I am trying to locate a very early memory. It is significant that the
written documentation of it is short and that there is no paraphrased account from my
journal. I can not actually define the memories that I associate with this artwork, I just
know they are somewhere in the unconscious. This amnesia corresponds to Rycroft's
definition of memory which reports that amnesia "for infancy and very early childhood
is universal and it is not decreased by even the 'deepest' analysis" (90).

In the introduction to the series The Park there is a passage from my journal in which I
attempt to analyse memories concerning my father which are invested into the series.
The memories concern a sense of loss. The incomplete sense of relationship that I
identify with my father I see aspects of being repeated with my son and this creates a
further sense of loss and guilt. The conflict and anxiety I identify concerning the
relationship with my father and my son is visually transferred into the series The Park
and re-emerges in other artworks in the exhibition such as the series Father Imago.
Ambivalently though, in these series' and most of the other artworks made there are
also emotions of love, tenderness and pleasure. In a series such as The Park, for
example, I clearly dedicate the artworks as objects of love. In discussing The Park I
identify the quality of transferences that are being made to it and that are invested in it.
This is exemplified in a work such as Objects and Relations in which I rediscover the
memory of sculptures by Henry Moore as very important to my store of childhood
memories. I make replicas (symbols) of my memory and include them into the artwork
Objects and Relations. This inclusion, in turn, triggers and uncovers other memories
that are not just visual. They are sensual, atmospheric and environmental. A
compound effect occurs by placing these small ceramic symbols of childhood memory
within the context of the overall artwork and the series. In the paraphrased text from
my journal I attempt to record these memories. These memories are the visual
transferences that I have invested into the artwork.

As I work through The Park the connections to object-relations theory permeates the
series so that by the time I come to discuss the work Hepworth there is a clear
connection made between childhood and adult life. In discussing Hepworth I associate my love of parks, gardens, aesthetic pleasure and daydreaming. This association can be interpreted using Winnicott's theories on transitional objects and the location of cultural experience. By applying Winnicott's theories to the series The Park, contemplating the work and by analysing the text a clear link is made between childhood and adult experience that is contained and expressed in the artwork.

Loss is another important concept in object-relations theory and this is identified in the artwork Loss within the series Illusive Reality (278-301). Whereas, Hepworth, the previous work discussed, makes a link between childhood and adult life, Loss identifies a specific period in my life, that of puberty and early teenage years, wherein I locate a deep sense of loss. In terms of object-relations and transference Loss emerges as an economic visual essay in personal emotion and psychoanalytic theory.


Another theme to emerge from the artwork and the text in chapter four is that of self-analysis. The documentation in chapter four, as I will develop later in the conclusion to the thesis, becomes a self-analytic text working in unison with the art, aspects of which can be interpreted using psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theory. This is demonstrated in a work such as In Memoria from the series The Park. Reading through the paraphrased journal entries for this work it is evident how much the work means to me and what I have invested into it. The self-analysis stimulated by the artwork and recorded in the text is reliant on the visual transferences made to the work that can be recognised as I look at it. This visual transference is the artworks "live" energy and is contained within it. As I have proposed already and will go on to argue in chapter five it is this containment of energy which corresponds to Schaverien's theories concerning the life in and of the artwork.

In my overview to the series Father Imago I indicate that the series has the intention to "consciously uncover unconscious material" and this is what I set out to do. Consciously and unconsciously I attempt to contextualise the making of the series as a self-analysis through the artwork. The allusion to self-analysis is pursued by deliberately referencing Freud and his consulting rooms in these works. By doing this the context and metaphor is in place. I am in Freud's environment and like Freud, who attempted self-analysis through psychoanalysis his creation (some say his artform), I

48 It is interesting to me that in the text I connote the word "work" with "walk". In the exhibition two works include walking figures and walking in parks as I have pointed out is a pleasureable and contemplative activity to me.
am now attempting self-analysis through my creation my artwork that is informed by psychoanalysis. Sometimes, this self-analytic probing is not easy at all.

As I suggest, when discussing the work *Freud the Father* from the series *Father Imago* I realise that there are defences, perhaps counter-transferences, preventing me from probing too far. However, in that particular work I do attempt to further the analysis by fielding several theories concerning castration complex in order to connect them to thoughts in my own unconscious and contained in the artwork. In fielding some of these theories, particularly Freud's concerning Leonardo Da Vinci's interest in birds, the theoretical constructs do assist in at least presenting scenarios that push towards the unconscious desires that are contained in such things as my visual imaging and focussing on a bird perched over genitalia in that particular work. If *Freud the Father* is looked on as a self-analytic artwork then the ceramic figure, with the bird perched over its genitals in repose on the Persian carpet frame, could be interpreted as a symbol of myself lying on a couch in Freud's consulting room. The ceramic figure would then have resonance with the painting, in *Freud the Father*, of me as a baby sitting on Freud's knee.

However, like the condensation, transformations and ambiguity of a dream the transference presented in the artwork is not straightforward. I have already inferred in the text on *Freud the Father* that the ceramic figure of a female may well be symbolic of my mother. How then can the ceramic figure be both my mother and myself? The answer could be in unconscious symbolic alliteration. There is definitely a connection between the painted figure of Freud with me on his knee and the ceramic figure with a bird perched over her genitals. In either case in the text I have previously identified that I am represented as a bird and a baby. Additionally, I identify *Freud the Father* with self-analysis. An interpretation could be Freud as other, ceramic woman as mother. In both cases I am physically connected to them. This could be interpreted as psychic fusion or oneness. Freud as father of psychoanalysis, ceramic figure as my mother then become a significant and related pair. I am visually connected to both and, therefore, a metaphor of visual self-analysis is created. I see these metaphors as compound visual transferences connected with self-analysis and sealed into the artwork.

Self-analysis is revealed too in the artwork *Phamily Group* from the same series. I attempt to document this in the accompanying text. The text arranged in the three layered matrix, referred to earlier, of journal entry, psychoanalytic theory and reflective analysis presents the interpretive scenario within aspects of the unconscious content of *Phamily Group*. Applying the theory of phantasy helps to unravel the visual
transferences that are contained in this artwork. I realised this once I had made it and, as I indicate in the text concerning this artwork, this is why I titled it *Phamily Group*. It is also why I included the definition of phantasy in the text concerning this artwork. It should be taken into account that the painted and ceramic imagery in *Phamily Group* is intuitively very close to Laplanche and Pontalis’ definition of phantasy to which I can see a direct relationship. The metaphors and metonyms presented in *Phamily Group* connect to visual transferences in the other artworks in this series to reveal a complex web of transference interactions.

The interaction between the artworks in a series is crucial in understanding and attempting an interpretation of them as transference objects. In discussing *The Rules of the Game* from the series *Father Imago* I clearly indicate this. In this artwork I attempt to document and interpret the self-analysis taking place in it by applying psychoanalytic theories concerned with the ego, super-ego and id. Once again, the interaction between the ceramic tableau on the frame and the painting contains visual transferences that I attempt to document. Similarly, this is the case in *In the Name of the Father* the last work in this series. As an artwork this is one of the hardest for me to unravel. Nevertheless, the artwork is intimately interlinked with my personal psychic history and parental relations, particularly to my father. The overlap of symbols is apparent in the use of Freud as a transferent symbol of my visual self-analysis throughout this series and as a symbol of my own fatherhood and of my father. Once again, in this artwork there is a visual dialogue and association between the ceramic tableau and the painting in which transferences are contained. In this work I concentrate on old age and death. By referring to Freud (as father imago) I feel that I am actually working through grief and anxiety concerned with my father's death and my relationship with him. Therefore, in visual metaphor, there is a degree of self-analytic resolution. In this way, *In the Name of the Father* becomes a fitting epitaph to the series *Father Imago*.

Self-analysis is pursued in the pair of works *Ambivalence 1 and 2*. These two works are frank and sexually revealing, they contain explicit transferences. In the documentation supporting them, by reference to psychoanalytic theory and an attempt at recording my reasons for making the works, I probe my conscious and unconscious thoughts. However, because of my defences I find revealing the unconscious thoughts to myself and in this thesis, in public, incredibly hard or impossible. In fact, revealing this unconscious thought in writing may not even be necessary. There is no extreme conflict, anxiety or neurosis and the release I required has already been achieved in the imagery.
In the series *Illusive Reality* I continue the self-analytic mode of image making. At the same time, in this visual self-analysis, it appears I am testing concepts of psychoanalysis that prompt interpretations in a potential space between the text and the image. This scenario has parallels to the conscious/unconscious dialogue between artist as maker and artist as viewer. Each artwork in the series *Illusive Reality* I can interpret as containing particular types of transference or psychic metaphor. That is I see *Mother* as predominantly a container of libido, *Alone* as a container of loss, *Childhood* as a container of childhood memory, *Loss* as a condensation of object-relations, *Immigrant* and *Children* as visual transferences of love and anxiety, *Mirror Transference* as an artwork on the theory of visual transference, and finally *Father* appears to be a work about gender difference and bisexuality.

A final example of self-analysis is the series *Time Transferred*. This series is about the potential of artworks to absorb, contain and reflect visual transferences. In this series I economically provide written documentation to explain the visual referents. The associations that I make to the imagery allude to the transferences and attempt interpretations.

4. **Visual, compound and overlayed transference.**

A major theme revealed in chapter four is that of visual transference. This, of course, is the phenomenon that I am identifying in this thesis. In chapter four, as I document the work, there are numerous references to visual transference. For example, starting with the first work *The Search* I referred to the thick red paint in this artwork as containing a "living" substance. This early identification of a living property in the artwork I equated at the time with the unconscious. This reference has clear resonance to Schaverien's presentation of transference as the life in and of the artwork. When Schaverien speaks in these terms she is referring to the transferences invested into the artwork and emanating from it. In chapter five it will be seen that I return to a discussion of *The Search* to demonstrate how the visually transferent symbols in it can be interpreted using Handler Spitz's object-relations model of "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience". *Memory, Mammary, Mummy* is also a work that I return to in chapter five. There I use it to demonstrate my hypothesis of visual transference and how Schaverien's five stage theory of interpretation and her concept's of scapegoat transference and talisman can be applied when viewing my work. It is evident from the paraphrased journal entry for this artwork that I recognise aspects of the transferent qualities in the work yet find it very difficult to directly reveal or discuss them.
In the artwork *Cycladic Symbol - Archaic Fe/Male* from the series *Object Relations* I return to the theme of bisexuality first raised when discussing *The Search*. As will be seen, when I discuss this theme in chapter five, by taking into account object-relations theory, I connect the visual referents concerning bisexuality to an unconscious wish to fuse with and incorporate my mother and father. The transference of a desire for fusion with my mother and father is invested into several works in this exhibition. As pointed out in the series *Object Relations* the theme of bisexuality in art is also revealed by Janet Hobhouse in her book *The Bride Stripped Bare - The Artist and the Nude in the Twentieth Century*. I refer to her work when I discuss *Female Breast Image* from the series *Object Relations*. She discusses the reasons male artists paint female nudes and clearly infers that in many cases they are using them as transference objects to represent significant female others in their lives. The series *Object Relations* contains such transferences for me. The use of an artwork as a transference object is something I pursue in the series *Father Imago*. In the introduction to this series I refer to the earlier data concerning Freud's uses of art as transference objects and indicate that in making the series *Father Imago* I consciously attempt to invest unconscious content into a series of artworks concerning parental relationships.

In my discussion of the series *Illusive Reality* I identify that as I worked on each successive artwork for the exhibition my proficiency and effectiveness with the visual language I was using to express conscious and unconscious emotions and memories increased. As this happened, the layering of transferences became more complex and rich. For example, in the paraphrased journal entry in the overview to the series I described my associations with the series as being those of Catholicism, childhood and adolescence. Yet, when one reads this passage and compares it to some of the sexual imagery in this series a metaphoric relationship emerges between an unspoken sexuality in the subtext of this passage and the ritualistic activities and objects it describes. By the time it came to making this series an artwork such as *Childhood* contained compound visual transferences that I clearly attempt to interpret in the accompanying text. In this artwork I focus on the image of a soldier made in ceramic and in the text I refer to the overlayed transferences that are invested into this piece that span from my early childhood years through to my adult life in Australia.

In documenting *Mirror Transference*, also from the series *Illusive Reality*, I had begun to realise how my visual language was explaining the concept of compound visual transferences occurring in art. I could now analyse this artwork and reveal how it incorporated visual transferences and how it related to psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theories that I had been describing in chapters one, two and three. In the title I reference psychoanalytic theory concerning mirror transference and in the text I
discuss this phenomenon. The series *Illusive Reality* contains many examples of visual transference. A work such as *Mother* has visual transferences invested into it and in the accompanying text I suggest how this content may be interpreted. *Alone*, another work from the series focuses on the fish as a symbol of the self and for sexuality. The fish, in this case, becomes the focus for complex, overlayed or compound visual transferences. Seen in the context of this series *Alone* sits between *Mother* and an artwork focussed on memories of my father called *Childhood*. As I indicate in the text accompanying *Alone* the fish encapsulates feelings that span from my earliest years to the present.

The compound layering of visual transferences is a concept demonstrated and discussed in the final series of work *Time Transferred*. As I point out in the overview to this series every work in it illustrates the phenomenon of visual transference. It looks back at the previous artworks made and incorporates stylistic and symbolic forms, images and materials from them to create new artworks. Additionally, it references old and new experiences in my life and incorporates conscious and unconscious memory. This is the process of the compound layering of visual transferences in operation. *For John* is an example of this. It contains a compound transference that embodies and evokes memories of childhood, and a sense of loss and sadness both at John's death and of childhood.

The use of the mirror becomes significant in this series. Symbolically, the mirror consolidates and presents the theory of visual transference in metaphoric form. The text supports and interprets this use. However, other dynamics are at play throughout this series as visual transferences present themselves. In *Dum Dum Dum Dummy Do Wah* the artwork and text work in unison to present the interpretation of a dynamic interaction between ego and id expressed as a conflict of religion and sexuality. Further examples of visual transferences that are supported by didactic written interpretations are the works *Auntie Anne* and *Hello, I'm a Painting who are You? Hello, I'm a Painting who are You?* in particular, and similar to *Mirror Transference* in the series *Illusive Reality*, through a combination of image and text, illustrates the hypothesis of visual transference. The final work in this series becomes a fitting end point to the series and the exhibition. I can now understand why I made the three fish in *Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong*. They are symbolic of my transferences which I have attempted to reveal and identify in this thesis and exhibition. In this last artwork they are swimming back into it. In metaphor this says to me that my visual transferences are being sealed back into the artwork and back into my unconscious.
Effectively, in chapter four I have inverted the argument as presented to this point in the thesis. In chapters one, two and three I have been constructing the hypothesis for visual transference by looking at disciplines in which the theory of transference has been developed and used. However, in chapter four I have reversed this position by reinvesting the theories presented with my working knowledge and perspective’s as an artist and through the documentation of artwork made especially for the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*. The documentation and artwork, linked into the overall project, has examined aspects of the psychic contents of art concerned with transference.

Carrying forward and considering the positions established in each of the summaries to the earlier chapters, chapter four and the artworks it documents examines the theories and data concerned with transference to compare the overlaps and similarities of processes between psychoanalysis, art therapy and a body of artwork that is focussed on the psychic contents of art. Contained within this comparative thesis and project overall I propose that the following positions have now been established.

* We have seen in the earlier chapters the emphasis placed on art by psychoanalysis and art therapy. Within this emphasis transference emerges as a central factor in the processes and theory of arts relationship to these disciplines.

* In a contemporary context, object-relations theory establishes an understanding of artistic and aesthetic processes from a psychoanalytic and art therapeutic perspective. Many contributors have identified object-relations as significant in fine art and I have also identified this importance in my artworks.

* Artworks in psychoanalysis and art therapy are seen as transference objects that are permanent containers and transmitters of transference. Much data has also been put forward to support this position in the fine arts. In chapter four I identified these characteristics in my work and presented didactic artworks and texts to explain these phenomena.

* Transference in chapters two and three is revealed as a factor in psychic dialogue between patient and therapist, artist and artwork and/or artwork and viewer. The understanding and interpretation of conscious and unconscious psychic dialogue is seen as significant in the processes of analysis and self-analysis. These processes I submit, as I have documented in chapter four, are apparent in my artwork.

The above overlaps and similarities of processes between psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art presented in chapters two, three and four argues for the recognition of visual transference occurring in the fine arts. However, I also contend that visual...
transference in fine art is usually a healthy and creative aspect of making art. By identifying visual transference in the fine arts recognition is given to the contribution of psychoanalysis and art therapy in establishing its presence whilst opening up to fine art a conceptual structure that has long been suggested but has not been defined without the implications of mental illness.
CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION

(i)

During the course of my research I have not found any other text that has reviewed and critically studied contemporary data from the areas of psychoanalysis, art therapy and visual art, at length, in a comparative context. In this respect and, viewed, as it is, from the perspective of a practising artist, I believe the present thesis is unique. Therefore, It is intended that this thesis is viewed as a constructive contribution for anyone interested in the structures used in the psychoanalytic interpretations of the contents of art. Focusing on transference, a key concept of psychoanalysis and art therapy, I am proposing a hypothesis for the importance of transference in the visual arts. The phenomenon that occurs I am referring to as visual transference.

As Laplanche and Pontalis point out transference is not an easy term to define. Freud changed and developed his concept of it throughout his working life. His successors in psychoanalysis and art therapy have, in turn, made their own developments and interpretations of transference and this has introduced complexity into clearly understanding what the term means. For example, a single transference might be very different from "the transference" in psychoanalytic treatment. "The transference" might indicate a "transference-neurosis" or a "transference-relationship". Then there is "counter-transference" a whole area that Freud disapproved of but has, however, become more accepted by present day psychoanalysts and therapists. Furthermore, very late in his professional life Freud suggested the concept of "thought-transference", which again, though not developed, could have had important implications for psychoanalysis and art. This thesis reviews these various attitudes to transference and questions why such an important concept to psychoanalysis and art therapy has been neglected by fine art. Transference is, after all, concerned directly with the exposure, working through and unloading of the individual's unconscious contents and many of the best examples of fine art are ripe with psychological overtones.
Carrying forward the argument for visual transference in each chapter of this thesis we have seen that in chapter one it was established that transference is a wide ranging term and that it is an ubiquitous phenomenon. Laplanche and Pontalis point out that it is a relationship with objects and that by objects they also mean inanimate and symbolic objects. For example, in chapter two it is pointed out that Freud used artworks as transference objects in his psychoanalytic practice, his theoretical writings and his private life.

Laplanche and Pontalis refer to transferences as symbolic equivalents of original events. Artworks are symbolic objects and the symbolism in art has been recognised and discussed by many authors in this thesis.

In chapter one, Casement goes on to refer to transference as a clear example of unconscious to unconscious communication and that for it to operate successfully there should be an empathic relationship. Later in the thesis empathy also emerges as a key factor in understanding the psychic contents of art and the transference relationship that develops between art and artist and artwork and viewer.

In chapter two psychoanalytic literature was reviewed for its views on art and transference. From this review several positions were established. Firstly, the importance of art to the development of psychoanalytic theory. From its beginnings psychoanalysis has been involved with, and has used, art to further its theoretical and practical base. Handler Spitz and others point out that this is still the case today. On this basis, I argue it is, therefore, also valid for artists to draw conclusions concerning art from psychoanalysis. I point out that Freud always intended his "discoveries" to be seen and used in a much wider field than that of medicine and that he foresaw that psychoanalysis would have cultural applications.

There are also many comparisons of psychoanalysis to art and art to psychoanalysis in chapter two. In these comparisons transference emerges as an important element. Psychoanalysts such as Loewald, Kaplan, Vann Spruiell, Rotenberg and Linden indicate that there is common ground between art and transference and psychoanalysis and transference. On this basis I identify in chapter two that the relationship, to this point, of art and transference has not been sufficiently examined from a fine arts perspective without the implications of psychopathology. This, I contend, is a position that is corrected by this present thesis. In the comparison of art to transference, Handler Spitz, Kaplan and Rotenberg all suggested that there is self-analytic potential in
art. As will be realised the self-analytic potential of art is pursued by art therapists in chapter three and then again in chapter four when I documented my artwork.

Object-relations is a significant theory when discussing art and aesthetics from a psychoanalytic perspective and in both chapters two and three I discussed its relevance. The connections and uses of object-relations theory to art are important because through proposals put forward by Winnicott there is potential to further the concept of visual transference.

It is in chapter two that artworks are first identified in this thesis as transference objects. In the creation of artworks and their subsequent viewing an intra-psychic dialogue develops. The dialogue is the transference relationship between artist and artwork on viewer and artwork. The dialogue may be complex and overlayed and may (as is claimed, for example, in the case of Freud) assist in self-analysis.

It is from data presented in chapters one and two that I begin to construct the hypothesis of visual transference. If visual transferences are contained in fine artworks made by artists with "normal" mental functioning, I argue, then they should not be viewed as symptomatic of illness but as unconscious, and often ineffable, attributes of fine art.

Chapter Three reviewed current literature in art therapy. From that it was established that art therapy has a clear and close relationship to psychoanalysis and fine art. Through this synthesis art therapy brings into focus the roles of art and healing. However, as an artist contemplating the role of transference in fine art I distanced myself from art therapy's debate in this sphere. In fine art there is no clinical expectation of healing and no imperative to interpret transferences. On the one hand, this might help explain why the theory of visual transference in fine art has not, to this point, been developed. On the other hand, it might also indicate that transference in the fine arts has other possibilities, purposes and benefits.

Even though there are many similarities in the theories of art therapy and psychoanalysis, two major differences to emerge in chapter three are firstly, the ability of artworks to contain transferent material and act as a permanent record of the therapeutic session. And secondly, because transferences can be directed into artworks the therapeutic relationship may be more empathic and the transference relationship less confrontational than that of classical psychoanalysis. These two differences in art therapy, theory and practice and the acknowledgment that art does have positive and creative possibilities, outside of its clinical uses referred to earlier, all contribute towards the hypothesis of visual transference in the fine arts.
Besides the above, in the summary of chapter three I also isolated several other points that inform and lead towards the hypothesis of visual transference. Firstly, I discuss the importance of transference in the practice and theory of art therapy. Many examples present themselves in chapter three and in the process authors referred to make reference to psychoanalytic theory and theories that relate directly or indirectly to fine art. For example, Schaverien discusses Cassirer's work in relation to the scapegoat transference. This phenomenon Schaverien informs us is universal and not restricted to art therapy. Or there again, Case & Dalley report that Stoke's writing relates to his thoughts on artworks generally. Stokes regarded artworks as objective and subjective transference objects capable of giving intense pleasure and inner reflection. Because art therapy bridges aspects of the theoretical gap between psychoanalysis and art its emphasis on the importance of transference, I reason, must have implications for fine art.

Secondly, in the summary to chapter three I discuss the differences between art therapy and art. I reason that because art therapy and fine art are different disciplines it is quite possible that different forms of transference present themselves. This I posit opens up possibilities for the constructive uses of visual transference in fine art.

Thirdly, I discuss the many connections of art therapy to fine art and the overlap of ritualistic, symbolic and transferent activity. It is pointed out that most art therapists are also artists and that the rituals and symbolic qualities of art therapy and art are often very close in comparison. I posit that because of these similarities and psychoanalysis's and art therapy's own references to fine art visual transference must be apparent and identifiable in fine art as a phenomenon particular to it without the implications of mental illness. This is important, I argue because it is unreasonable, reductive and prejudicial to (i) assume that fine art contains psychopathological symptoms, simply because it can contain aspects of the unconscious and (ii) cannot contribute to psychic understanding in its own right.

The fourth point isolated from chapter three is that art is a permanent container and transmitter of transferences. These positions are argued by reference to philosophy, psychoanalysis, art therapy and fine art. I concur with these positions and go on in chapter four and the present chapter of conclusion to provide documentation and analysis of the exhibition *Memory Mammary, Mummery*, in which I present examples of works that contain and emit transferences.
The fifth point isolated concerns transference as a factor in psychic dialogue between artist and artwork and/or artwork and viewer. Much evidence is put forward in chapter three to support the concept of transferent dialogue in the fine arts. For example, Case & Dalley indicate that in art therapy a verbal and visual transferent dialogue is conducted through the artwork and that fine artists as well can enter into an inner dialogue. This view is supported by Schaverien who contends that in fine art there is the possibility for a silent mental dialogue of transferent exchanges occurring between artist and artwork and/or artwork and viewer. Importantly, the silent dialogue is incorporated into the imagery and in the normal course of events, without psychoanalytic interpretation, it is often very difficult, impossible or unnecessary, from the artist's or viewer's position, to translate the dialogue into words.

Intense intra-psychic dialogue promotes the potential for self-analysis in art and this is the final point I isolate from chapter three. Many of the sources referred to in chapters two and three refer to this including Handler-Spitz, Rotenberg, Vann Spruiell, Stokes, Rubin, Schaverien and Milner. Within the concept of self-analysis through art, visual transference is revealed in this thesis as the significant constituent.

Chapter Four was a documentation and examination of aspects of my psychic relationships to the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*. In the process I isolated four main points that support the hypothesis for the recognition of visual transference. All of the points concern comparisons of practice and theory between psychoanalysis, art therapy and my artwork. In many of the artworks and the documentation of them I am working through aspects of theory both in their making and their documentation. The first point identified concerned examples of practice and theory.

The second identified object-relations as a specific aspect of psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theory addressed in the artworks. This is because much of the subject matter in the art concerned early childhood, adolescence, familial relations and sexuality. Through the use of object-relations theory and subject matter significant visual transferences are identified in the artwork. The transferences cover a range of experience including issues of conflict, anxiety, guilt, loss, pleasure, tenderness and love. All of these experiences are consciously and unconsciously sealed into the artwork and are within the realms of normal mental activity.

The third point identified from the artworks concerns the self-analytic properties they contain. In the case of this overall project the text in chapter four works in unison with the artworks to reveal their self-analytic properties. The text, organised in a three layered matrix of journal entry, psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theory and reflective
analysis documents my recognition of visual transference. However, as I point out, in some respects and in the normal course of making visual art, recording and documenting the artwork in writing, by the artist, is not usually carried out or even necessary. The act of making the work and the transference dialogue that an artist enters into is, I propose, often intense and deep enough to satisfy such things as unconscious longings, desires and needs and to create a sense of equilibrium in the psyche.

The final point isolated from chapter four is that of visual transference. I submit that the sum of points isolated and discussed from each chapter contribute towards the phenomenon of visual transference that I am proposing and describing in this thesis. Visual transferences I indicate are often overlayed and compounded in the one work or a series of works. The overlay of transference material can concern events from childhood right through to relatively contemporary events that enter the unconscious and are compounded with earlier memories re-emerging in a condensed or distorted form in the artwork. As I indicate in the summary there are examples of didactic artworks and texts in chapter four documenting visually and in literary terms the process and theory of visual transference. From the data presented in the thesis I have concluded that the concept of visual transference offers a framework that may be constructively used to aid in an understanding of the psychic contents of art. Applying the theory of visual transference to my artwork, I have found that it presents a structure for interpretation that is personally meaningful.

However, some further clarification may be required in literary form of the ways in which the theories presented in the previous chapters can be applied to the artwork. To illustrate this process I will focus my discussion on the work of two significant contributors, Ellen Handler Spitz and Joy Schaverien.

(ii)

In Ellen Handler Spitz's text *Art and Psyche*, reviewed in chapter two, she presents the reader with three models of psychoanalytic interpretation that are used with art. The three models are "the pathographic", "the psychoanalysis of autonomous texts and artistic style" and "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience". Even though Handler Spitz points out that "issues of transference and empathy [are] implicit in all three models" (*Art* p.xi) I do not intend to discuss the application of each model at length in respect to my artwork. This is because the first two, "the pathographic" and "the
psychoanalysis of autonomous texts and artistic style" have little direct connection to my project, whereas, the last model mentioned, "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience", does through its emphasis on object-relations theory.

Pathography according to Handler Spitz is a form of psycho-biography. However, as the term implies it is often considered a study of a subject's psychic suffering or illness in relation to aspects of their life and the material record of it. In the case of artists this model would most readily study their art in relation to aspects of the record of their life. A point that is perhaps underdeveloped by Handler Spitz is the connotations pathography has with illness. In this respect I wish to distance myself from this concept of pathography. I have already pointed out that the value I see in developing a hypothesis for visual transference is that it dissociates fine art from the assumption of mental illness or symptom implied by reductive views of psychoanalytic theory.

Moreover, my thesis is clearly not a pathography. For example, it is not a fictive study of an artist's life and work written by a third party to qualify pathological aspects of psychoanalytic theory as Handler Spitz indicates that Freud's study of Leonardo Da Vinci is. It is not a meticulous documentary study of a renowned artist's life and art as Liebert's study of Michelangelo is. And it is not a thematic study of one aspect of an artist's life and work to argue the effects of severe trauma in adolescence as Wolfenstein's study of Magritte is. Nevertheless, it could be considered that there are portions of my artworks and documentation of them that have relationships to aspects of the above. On this basis, in aspects of the artworks and documentation there is autobiographical content. However, the biographical content and form of my project is only one aspect of it. In large part, and by definition, my project is a comparative study of art and transference with my artworks, exhibitions, hypothesis and documentation contributing to the thesis as a whole. Another obvious difference between pathography and my project is that I am not writing a clinical account of someone else's life and work with the predisposition and training of classical psychoanalysis. I am an artist that has examined psychoanalytic and art therapeutic theory and practice to establish the overlaps and similarities with processes concerning transference in the fine arts. The artwork and documentation of it is not auto-pathographic but is closer to being self-analytic and it is in this way that Handler-Spitz's tripartite presentation can be considered constructive.

Considering the next model of psychoanalytic interpretation applied to the arts, Handler Spitz refers to this as "the psychoanalysis of autonomous texts and artistic style". This model, presents some serious and limiting theoretical problems for applied psychoanalysis and Handler Spitz is critical of it. Essentially, it attempts to interpret art
objects without reference to the artist or the artist's audience. The art object is seen as autonomous. Handler Spitz considers this method a contradiction in terms, psychoanalysis is a psychology of the individual, yet here this position is being denied. This reveals a basic flaw in the autonomous text model because transference operates from the basis of an individual's involvement with an "object" and is fundamental to psychoanalytic interpretation. A transference may be contained in an artwork but it has to have been put there by the artist and it may be responded to by the viewer. Consequently, to discuss the artwork psychoanalytically reference has to be made to one, or other, or both. Therefore, Handler Spitz indicates, the rigorous application of the autonomous text model is virtually impossible from a psychoanalytic perspective and where it has been tried it is found to be flawed or watered down. However, she points out that, the principle of the autonomous text model does, perhaps, assist applied psychoanalytic interpretation to objectively look at universal psychoanalytic themes and theories.

Applying Handler Spitz's findings to my own artwork it would appear that contained within examples of it in the exhibition *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* there are explicit symbols, signifiers, textual references and internal relations, independent of reference to myself or an audience, that enable the artwork to have an autonomous meaning in terms of universal psychoanalytic themes. For example, the work explicitly and thematically refers to sexuality, childhood memory, familial relations, parental loss, adult life, transference and the psychic connections between these themes that are found in art. Because these things are the exhibitions subject matter they are expressively and graphically depicted and, therefore, can be clearly interpreted as themes without reference to artist or viewer. This potential is contained within the artwork, so on this level there is an autonomous narrative running through the work that does not rely on my experience even though it is generated by it. This theoretical position can be explained by considering the exhibition as a whole, or by considering 'series' of artworks, or individual works. The artwork, after all, clearly references psychoanalysis. There are images of Freud contained in some artworks and Freud is referred to in the titles of some of the works. Many of the artworks are named with titles that directly or obliquely refer to the terminology of psychoanalysis (e.g., *Objects and Relations, Recurrent Dream, Ambivalence* etc. etc.,) and these would cue any prospective interpreter as to the works thematic meanings independently of artist or audience. However, the prospective interpreter would not have to refer to the titles of the work at all. Upon viewing the work there are significant and clear cues and clues to the thematic trends in the work. Besides the intentional referencing to psychoanalysis the autonomous interpretation would be aided, for example, by such things as,
1. The repetitious nature of the imagery in the work (e.g., breast, mother and child, phallic symbol).
2. The "series" formulation that assists in revealing themes.
3. The schematic intentional and pronounced uses of materials and formats.

The final model of interpretation identified by Handler Spitz is that of "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience". As indicated earlier this model refers to the relationship between artist and artwork and artist and audience. It identifies the dynamic of the relationship between artist and artwork and artist and audience utilising the psychoanalytic theories of the earliest developmental and familial relations between mother and child. Considering my project overall it is this interpretive model to which it is most closely related.

As we have seen, every artist is also his own audience during and after the making of the artwork. This situation has often been referred to as analogous to that of the relationship between therapist and client in the data presented in this thesis. Within the brief for this project I have had to scrutinise and examine my artwork, as a viewer, with an intensity that I have never attempted before. As I have posited earlier, the dialogue between an artist and his or her work is always there but this is not always, if ever, consciously and carefully analysed. In making the artwork involved in this project I have worked from deeply personal motivations and revealed these through the artworks, exhibitions, documentation and thesis overall. The compound effect of making many artworks within this frame, and contemplating the works, as made, over an intense working period of three to four years, and then additionally, another two years living with and considering the artworks implications has indicated the potential for using Handler Spitz's third model of "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience" in interpreting aspects of my artwork's psychic contents.

The "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience" model references two main theoretical frames, object-relations theory and the clinical psychoanalytic setting. The first frame, object-relations theory, has had an important role to play in the development of psychoanalysis and art therapy. As we have seen, it has informed many of the major texts referred to in this thesis including: Handler Spitz's "The Past of an Illusion", *Art and Psyche* and *Image and Insight*; Fuller's *Art and Psychoanalysis*; Gilroy and Dalley's *Pictures at an Exhibition*; Schaverien's *The Revealing Image* and Case and Dalley's *The Handbook of Art Therapy*. The second frame, that of the clinical setting, has also been referred to extensively in this thesis by various authors, perhaps the most contemporary and informative account is Patrick Casement's *On Learning from the Patient* reviewed in chapter one.
Increasingly, the clinical setting has come to be seen as a relationship between analyst and analysand in which issues of transference and empathy come to the fore. In this relationship it is possible to have different dynamic levels of dialogue occurring. These can be either, verbal, mental or visual and aid in the furthering and resolution of therapy. A transference relationship is established and this must be received and understood correctly if the therapy is to have meaning. In this relationship, for example, as Casement, Levens, Handler-Spitz and Schaverien point out, there is a need for the correct timing and emphasis on any interpretation that is to be made. Recognition of the correct timing is often achieved through the empathic relationship between therapist and client. If an interpretation is made too dogmatically or too early in the relationship it might well be denied or misinterpreted and set up resistances in the client. This, Handler-Spitz proposes, is similar to problems that can occur in the interpretations of art. In this regard, I see a connection between my project and the psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience model. I have found it incredibly difficult to put into words the thoughts, meanings and associations that, in random abstract thought, I can glimpse and snatch at on rare occasions. Indeed, there may well be defences and resistances to tapping this material. In some cases the artwork in the exhibition is best left to speak to the individual viewer for itself. It is for the viewer to explore and connect with those aspects of the work with which they are intrigued, disturbed, stimulated or empathise with. After all, in fine art there is no imperative to make a therapeutic interpretation. Where a viewer recognises a visual transference to the artwork by the artist, even on an unconscious level, then a counter-transference can be emitted by the viewer in relation to the artwork, and a dialogue can evolve similar to that of the dialogue between artist and artwork. An interpretation may, or may not, be necessary, as Schaverien and Handler Spitz indicate, sometimes an interpretation is inappropriate, pre-emptive or unnecessary, or alternatively, the artwork can transcend verbal interpretation. Artworks in their discrete, mute and meditative visual language may often ask as many questions of the viewer as the viewer asks of the artwork. In this regard, it is worth remembering that psychoanalysts have compared themselves to artworks and blank canvasses. The visual transference relationship between artist and artwork, or viewer and artwork may, therefore, have the potential to be analogous to the empathic clinical transference relationship, described by Casement, wherein the analyst may learn as much about him or herself in the process of therapy as about the client.

As has been described in earlier chapters, object-relations theory puts emphasis, for example, on the relationships between mother and child, child and mother's breast. This concern is also, very clearly, apparent in artworks for my exhibition. From the
exhibition's conception I began, consciously and unconsciously, in the preparatory drawings, intuitive modelling and free associating games, to search my subject matter for content. The content was contained in the visual symbols and signifiers that were made. Once these symbols and signs are identified in the work interpretations using object-relations theory are possible. For example, starting with the very first work put forward for exhibition, *The Search* there are oblique and direct references to sexuality, childhood, the feminine, breast and mother.

My discussion of *The Search* recounts many of my thoughts at the time of making the work or shortly after. In that account, as Schaverien describes in *The Revealing Image*, there was already some degree of identification, familiarisation and acknowledgment of the content in the artwork and the visual transferences that had been made to it. Since then, the processes of identification, familiarisation and acknowledgment have had a longer period to develop and there has been, at least, a partial process of what Schaverien refers to as assimilation. Whether I could have written then what I can observe now (1996) I do not know. I know that these feelings and thoughts must have been there at the time of making the piece, or shortly after, but I did not feel it necessary or possible to articulate them in writing.

My interest in the earliest objects of childhood became visually clearer as the making of the work proceeded. This recognition is acknowledged within the title of the exhibition, *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* and the titles of several individual works in the exhibition. Concerns related to the breast, for example, and parental relations are invested into *The Search* in ways that can be articulated by object-relations theory. Visual and sensual interest in the breast naturally goes right back to my earliest years as a child. I can remember episodes and imagery concerning the breast and my mother back at least to the age of ten and prior to that there is a general sense of love and involvement with my mother that can be recounted by looking at such things as family photographs. The breast as symbol and object still produces pleasurable and erotic sensations that create day-dreams, night dreams and phantasies and I connect these with the object-relations of childhood. In *The Search* and other works in the exhibition it is apparent by applying Handler Spitz's psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience model that I have tried to address and acknowledge these concerns. At first, in *The Search*, the identification with the breast and my mother and the feminine was referred to pre-consciously or unconsciously. As discussed earlier, I automatically drew myself with female breasts in one of the preparatory works for *The Search*. However, I found this drawing too confrontational and so destroyed (disposed of, or repressed) it. This reference to bi-sexuality in the self-portrait of *The Search* can be interpreted as a search for fusion going back to the earliest period of my life when, according to object-
relations theory, I was fused psychologically with my mother and my mother's breast was part of me. This interpretation is supported by the fact that I have drawn myself naked ("in my birthday suit") in *The Search*, again reinforcing the connections with childhood and fusion. In my earlier discussion of *The Search* I described the self-portrait image as deliberately drawn and re-drawn:

From being a psychologically intense drawing of myself in middle-age it became an idealised outline and contour drawing reflecting a more timeless or youthful quality. I settled on this version as I wanted the self-portrait to have a symbolic, monolithic strength, yet, at the same time, sit back into the heavy red paint in an ephemeral, even ghostly, transitory way (as if the drawing was a memory). The figure in the self-portrait was to display both strength and fragility... presence and non-presence.

If this passage is examined in relation to the self-portrait image it becomes a symbolic reflection of a phantasy on fusion which I interpret in the following way. In drawing myself as "timeless and youthful" I am placing the image, like the unconscious, outside of real time and making a reference backwards to an earlier idealised time or memory. This is explained further in the passage when I indicate that I want the image to act as "a memory"... it is "symbolic monolithic and strong", yet it sits back into the red paint which I identify as the unconscious. I refer to the image as "ghostly", unconsciously here, I think I am, in fact, discussing the introjection I am seeing in the image of my mother and father bi-sexually incorporated into my image. At the time of making this work (1988) my father had been dead six or seven years and, as I will soon explain, I had already consciously introjected my mental image of him. My mother had recently returned to England and I believe I was unconsciously grieving her return. As I indicate the work was to display "presence and non-presence". This I can now see as a condensation of three images, those of my father (non-presence) my mother (presence/non-presence) and myself (present). This ambiguity in the central self-portrait figure of *The Search* is further developed when it is considered that I only drew the top half of my naked body. The genitals are not drawn, consequently the metaphor of bisexuality is unconsciously but visually referred to. Discussing the above passage, however, examples of two phantasies from my past occur to me, helping identify this self-portrait image as a visual transference concerned with reparation and fusion. 1. For the early part of my adult life (late teenage years and twenties) whenever I discussed happiness I always used to reply that the happiest period in my life was when I was five years of age or younger. I can see this phantasy now as a wish to return to the security and love of the parents, the mother and the breast. 2. When my father died in 1982 I grieved his loss for months, if not years. The grieving was lessened when I consciously decided that my father was not (completely) dead.
He was alive inside of me and my child. What he could not see I and my growing son could see for him. I introjected the concept of my father as alive and this helped me cope with his death. When I look at myself, or my son, I see my father.

Looking at the red "oceanic sea" of the unconscious surrounding the central figure in *The Search* there are ceramic symbols embedded into this unconscious red paint. Many of these symbols have parental, transitional and sexual meanings and connotations that can be interpreted using the "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience" model. As discussed earlier in the documentation, "the symbols are fragments of thoughts that co-join and set up meanings and dialogues between themselves as I look at them." For example: 1. There are symbols of ambivalence; (i) screw entering a swastika, (ii) a phallic symbol protruding from the unconscious, the juxtaposition of hammer and sickle to crucifixion, (iv) a decapitated head. 2. There are symbols of introjection and projection. The camera (in the area of the missing genitals) imagery, the television screen (above the head) projects imagery. 3. There are chain link symbols at the top and bottom of *The Search*. These I interpret as symbols of an unconscious desire for fusion (the chain links are embedded into the unconscious red paint) with infantile experience through the aesthetic pleasure (and pain) of making art. 4. There are modelled ceramic figures which are toy-like in scale that depict archaic and pre-historic forms. These are symbolic of the search through my own primal imagery. I can interpret these now as intuitively invoking my associations with the breast and transitional objects, transitional objects and play, play and the creation of artworks. 5. Several of the toy-like objects also make reference to idealised, symbolic and abstracted feminine and/or sexual forms. I will focus on two of these toylike transitional objects to explain a clear identification with object-relations theory.

On the bottom left hand side of *The Search* there is a strip of ceramic with the word "Greenham" on it and next to it a CND (Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament) symbol. Consciously, these can be seen as a clear reference to the women campaigners of Greenham Common and nuclear disarmament. However, I have come to interpret their unconscious meaning in the following way. The strip of black ceramic with the word "Greenham" on it may be seen as a phallic symbol and it will be noticed that it is in an erect position. It is above the CND symbol which in relation to the phallic Greenham sign may be visually interpreted as a symbol of the vulva.

---

1 The campaign at Greenham Common in Southern England in the early 1980s was mounted by women's groups. They were protesting at the installation of nuclear missiles at the Greenham Common air force base as part of the 'cold war' strategy of Britain and the USA in preparedness for nuclear war with the then Soviet Union. At this time, tensions concerning the threat of nuclear war were high and the women's movements staged a very successful campaign. They camped out continuously for months on end, often in the most atrocious weather conditions, at the gates of the missile site.
Significantly, these two unconscious symbols revealed as phallus and vulva are directly below two archaic female forms and then above them a solitary male figure close to a symbolic phallic form protruding from the red paint. To further this interpretation of Greenham sign and CND symbol as phallus and vulva it will be noticed that in relation to the central self-portrait they are in an off-centred alignment with the position of the portraits "missing" genitals. In place of the genitals is a camera which I have already referred to as a symbol of introjection. The camera absorbs the imagery of male and female (mother and father, phallus and vulva) into the bisexual self-portrait. Pursuing
this interpretation it will be seen the "Greenham" sign and CND symbol are associated with a visit I made to the UK in 1982 with my wife and nine month old son. I was returning to visit my mother and inter the ashes of my father whom had died six months earlier. I had been living in Australia since 1979 and had not seen my father since then, or my mother or any of my family in England. This was clearly a very emotional time when many deep and unconscious feelings were being stirred. There was a transition or realignment occurring in my life and the psychic relationship and responsibilities to my mother and missing father. During the visit my mother was in a distracted, slightly unbalanced state of mourning and grief from the loss of her husband to whom she had been married for 41 years. I was also grieving at my father's death and my mother's condition. The connection to the CND symbol and Greenham sign are as follows. Prior to going to the UK I was already involved in nuclear disarmament issues and was deeply moved by the campaign of the women of Greenham Common. The symbology of the Greenham campaign is clear. Women from one country (the UK) were fighting off, in a weak position, an attempt by men from another country (the USA) to impose (phallic) missile weaponry on their soil. Consequently, whilst in England, I felt compelled to go and visit the women, which I did alone. Seen in this light, the visit to the women of Greenham was like an "inner" visit set into my overall visit to the UK (my motherland). It was like a condensation of the visit to my mother and had the same constituent parts: (a) a visit to the feminine, (b) a visit to the caring, compassionate and distressed, (c) a visit to my past (I was born in the UK shortly after W.W.II and at Greenham returned to a feminist protest at war). When, six years later in 1988 I began to intuitively make the ceramic "Greenham" and CND symbols my mother had just finished a visit (her only visit) to see me and my family in Australia and I was, no doubt, saddened by my mother returning home.

It is the above set of circumstances that I can now interpret as having prompted the unconscious need to include these two ceramic objects in The Search. Besides being physical objects, the Greenham sign and CND symbol are psychic objects. They reference my introjection of male and female components in the persons of my mother and father. Handler Spitz's psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience model helps to explain to me the psychic processes that resulted in the creation of superficially disconnected symbols that form a personal and meaningful narrative explaining conscious and unconscious thought at work in the making and viewing of The Search.

2 Coincidentally, I had returned to my mother after a three year absence. This period of time connects with family history concerning my parents. They were married in 1941 when my father was in the army. He had two or three days leave to get married after which he was shipped overseas. They did not see each other again for three years.

3 Later for exhibition, in the series Illusive Reality I would make two artworks each of which focussed on male and female genitalia. Their titles are respectively, Mother and Father.
Referring to the object-relations theory that underpins Handler Spitz's model, one can identify in *The Search* both the desire for "oneness" (or fusion) and the grief associated with loss discussed in the separation/individuation phase referred to by Mahler (1972). These two emotions are transferred to, contained in, and can be interpreted from *The Search* and other artworks in the exhibition. Artworks such as these act as a latent and manifest means of working through and reconciling ineffable and unconscious emotion for me. Object-relations theory provides a structure for explaining the unconscious processes involved.

The analogy to self-analysis that I have made several times in this discussion of the application of Handler Spitz's theories to my work is consistent with Schaverien's presentation in *The Revealing Image* where she discusses the self-analytic properties of making art (19 and 34-35). If it is accepted that in some processes of making art a form of self-analysis is possible or taking place then focussing on the processes of internal dialogue that the artist engages in with the work may well help to explain the comparisons made of psychotherapist and/or client to artist, the clinical situation to an art form and the potential of art to act as a sublimative activity. Furthermore, considering Winnicott's original theory concerning the link between the transitional object and aesthetic experience, which Handler Spitz considers under developed, the potential for self-analysis in some aspects of making art could also help to elucidate his proposals. If it is considered, for example, that the artistic internal dialogue with the artwork and artist contains a series of transference/counter-transference exchanges similar to the scenario identified by Schaverien in art therapy, and Handler Spitz and others in the application of psychoanalysis to art, then it may well be possible, as I indicated in my review of *The Revealing Image*, to further an understanding of the connections between object-relations and aesthetic experience. Thinking through the potential internal transference/counter-transference interactions occurring between artist, artwork and back to artist the following sequence presents itself:

1. The initial visual transference is made to and incorporated in the artwork.⁴

2. The artist then considers and visually analyses the artwork, at some time during and/or after making the work. In this process every aspect of the artwork is considered, the surface, the frame, the materials, the tactile and visual qualities, the subject matter, content, intellectual properties and psychological components etc. During this process the potential for a new visual transference, or visual

---

⁴ Schaverien contends: "In a successful work of [fine] art it is as if the artist has made a transference to the materials, through which attributes and states, which were known to the artist are conveyed" (*Revealing* 118).
counter-transference, is generated by conscious, or unconscious, recognition of the original transference. These two transferences may then be compounded, or overlayed with further intra-psychic dialogue, and re-invested back into the artwork as it is being made or into successive artworks as they are being made.

3. The compound re-investment of visual transferences may generate and fuel further visual transferences, or an internal dialogue, for the artist that is mediated through the artwork. It is this intra-psychic experience, I propose, that may stimulate and help develop aesthetic experience within an artist at work. In the process of art production aesthetic experience (which Handler Spitz and Schaverien both connect to transference activity) may be expressed benignly by the artist in the artwork as a coherent aesthetic form and style. It is perhaps this constant dialectic between the conventional aesthetic principles of a medium and the striving of the artist to express deep personal motivations that often results in the production of new, unique or experimental developments in established forms.

4. The aesthetic experience of artist communicating to and from the artwork, therefore, is invested with an intra-psychic transference relationship, based on visual response, that creates an internal dynamic. This, I propose, is the connecting point to Winnicott's equation of aesthetic experience and the object-relationship of artist to artwork, child and transitional object... mother and child... baby, fusion and omnipotence. Winnicott's concept of creative living and the potential space is, therefore I propose, fuelled by intra-psychic and benign transference.

5. When the artwork is complete and exhibited by the artist it is then viewed by the artist's audience. The above process of an intra-psychic visual transference relationship may then be established as an interaction of the artist or artwork communicating to the viewer. This visual transference may be realised or thought of by the viewer as an aesthetic experience between the viewer and artwork. Through a complex and overlayed system of intra-psychic dialogue (comparable to Handler Spitz's view of art as "unusually complex compromise formations") an internal transference relationship may be mediated through the artwork.

---

5 This position is supported by Handler Spitz's discussion of transference, psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience. Refer, Art 164.
In concluding the discussion of the ways in which Handler Spitz's tripartite structure for the viewing of artworks can be applied, or has relevance to my project, it is appropriate to note, that as she indicates, not one of the three models discussed is all inclusive, and "all three paradigms may be seen as holding more features in common than is readily apparent" (Art p.xi). Each of the three models has something to offer as a means of viewing artworks. Individually, they cannot necessarily provide definitive interpretations of all the psychic phenomena and possibilities there are to be seen in a work of art. However, the model that has the most potential in application to artwork presented in the exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery is that of "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience".

(iii)

When reviewing art therapy I referred to its established connections with both psychoanalysis and fine art, and Joy Schaverien has indicated that art therapy acts as an intermediary between the two. Besides referring to the therapeutic value of art therapy I have used its theories in this thesis to articulate and consolidate the argument concerning visual transference in the making and viewing of fine art. To further this position I will now discuss how Schaverien's theories, as described in The Revealing Image, can be applied to, my artwork. As I have pointed out, on several occasions in her text Schaverien puts emphasis on the self-analytic potential of art and art therapy. Considering this, I have discussed fine art practise which, to a lesser or greater extent, depending on the artist's working methods and subject matter, may include self-analytic processes or unconscious transference processes. In my own case I have argued that aspects of the artwork and documentation in this project has self-analytic elements. As part of this project, I have attempted consciously in the artwork to examine aspects of my unconscious concerns through a visual and professional expertise I have as an artist. The exhibition presented in the doctoral submission and the thesis accompanying it have become, in part, a developing record of that self-analytic process.

Whilst making the artwork and after making it I kept a journal that attempted to record and probe in words the psychic meanings of the work. Having now considered Schaverien's theories I can see why I found this journal record such a difficult, and in some cases inconclusive, written task. Schaverien, similar to Handler-Spitz, discusses the elusiveness that can occur, and on occasions inappropriateness, of using words to describe the psychic contents of art. Sometimes words are not needed, or can not interpret the transference content of the image. This is especially true for the artist at the
time of making the work or within a period after making it. Schaverien discusses this difficulty in verbalising the content of imagery and refers to this problem in her five point presentation of the stages of interpretation, especially points 1. Identification 2. Familiarisation and 4. Assimilation (see also Case and Dalley). She emphasises when discussing this sequence that on occasions interpretation happens in the artwork and, therefore, words are not needed as the process of interpretation, and perhaps even resolution, has taken place without the need for words or detailed verbal articulation. This negation, or sometimes the inability of using words, Schaverien indicates, is a distinction between, firstly, art therapy and psychoanalysis and, secondly, art therapy and fine art. In the first case, psychoanalysis relies, in the main, on verbal communication to interpret the unconscious. This is not so for art therapy, it relies on both visual imagery and words. In some cases, detailed interpretation may not be necessary as there is an empathic realisation between art therapist and client that the transferent material in the image does not require, or at that point, is unavailable to verbal interpretation. The second distinction, between art therapy and fine art, Schaverien indicates, is of a different order. The fine artist can transcend the need for words because he or she has chosen professionally to make art, without the psychic necessity of therapy. Therefore, his or her work may be invested, or embodied, with transferences in a complex psychic and aesthetic matrix that often defies a definitive written or verbal interpretation. The artist often incorporates ineffable content in an unconscious, diverted or displaced manner and, as Handler Spitz points out, the inability of words to describe an artwork is often a mark of its success. Additionally, if the artist is in control of his or her ego and leads a relatively conflict free life, there may be no reason for the artist to bring into his or her consciousness that which is being sublimated or worked through unconsciously. This is as true for the artist as it is for the viewer. This, I feel, is the case in much of my artwork and might, therefore, explain the difficulty I have found in trying to interpret its psychic content in words.

A major concept in Schaverien's work is what she refers to as the "scapegoat transference". Essentially, Schaverien is here describing some of the intrinsic psychic processes and properties involved in making art and how these relate to her five point theory of interpretation referred to above. Schaverien describes how through the ritualistic embodying and empowering of art, transferences can be generated, contained and interpreted. The artworks containing transferences emanating from the unconscious can be "disposed of" as scapegoats and/or reintegrated consciously as "talismans". The concepts of scapegoat and talisman and Schaverien's five point theory of interpretation are, therefore, crucial to her articulation of the theory of transference in art therapy. However, Schaverien indicates that fine art and events other than art therapy, can act as scapegoats and talismans.
Considering the above, I propose that the exhibition, *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*, in its entirety, as well as individual works, has operated as an event that has allowed scapegoat transferences to occur and for recognition of the artworks as talismans of experience. In this sense, there is an analogy to the focus of the exhibition and the processes of art therapy. Working towards the exhibition has provided me with a self-analytic frame of reference spanning several years. The making of work for this exhibition and the accompanying thesis has been a been a major project of my life and I have invested much in it. I have been visually explicit in the artwork and descriptive in the thesis documentation covering aspects of its content. The project overall has therefore provided me with a self-analytic frame of reference informed by psychoanalytic theory.

As an example of how the concepts of scapegoat and talisman, and Schaverien's five point theory of interpretation, can be used when viewing my work I will discuss an artwork from the exhibition. *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*, is a key work in relation to Schaverien's theories. Besides being the name of one particular artwork it is also the name I gave to the entire exhibition. My aim in making a piece such as *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* was to convey the psychic and visual material powerfully and economically in the way that would best allow me to express conscious, pre-conscious and unconscious complex and overlayed feelings to myself and others. The initial decision in making this work was to visually confront and bring into the conscious mind an undercurrent of sexual feelings I knew to be there inside of me. This in itself was a scapegoat act that contains positive and negative visual transference. From a combined process of intuitive mental imaging, free form and exploratory drawings the close up image of a female breast with a hand touching it was conceived. I decided this was the sexual image I wanted to use in an artwork and I composed the drawing of breast, underarm hair and fingers to be as potent and symbolic as possible. My way of working was intuitive, I had feelings about what I wanted to do and thought through and worked through the process of making the piece until I felt it looked as I wanted it. This was an ineffable experience, the work emerged from my conscious, pre-conscious and unconscious mind as a set of complex interactive thoughts. I did not previously have in mind a name for a piece of work called *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* and then make it. The name or title only came much later, upon reflection, when I had time to consider and interpret the works content in a more rational way. Sometimes, as I approached a certain part in the work I recognised the reason why I was making or painting it. The decision making process was arbitrary and guided by a recognition that I was exposing sexual content and feeling, though this was not deeply analysed at the time of making. Even though I knew I was dealing with difficult subject matter for me
to make successfully and for the viewer to contemplate I was determined to complete the work.

From my perspective as artist, Schaverien's five point theory of interpretation can be applied directly to *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*. Whilst making it and upon its completion I experienced the first, second and third stages of Schaverien's interpretive sequence, *identification, familiarisation* and *acknowledgment*.

Comparing my working processes to Schaverien's five point theory I experienced:

1. *Identification*. whilst making and after making the artwork in the sense that I was creating and had created a personal image in a deliberately intuitive manner, revealing sexual conscious and unconscious material. In this process of identification the phenomenon was bared.

2. *Familiarisation*. Prior to making this artwork I had already brought into consciousness the nucleus of what I wanted to create. To achieve this sketches were carried out and the image came together intuitively. My working process often involves working on several different artworks over a protracted period. Therefore, each work has the opportunity to mature and evolve in my mind over an extended period of time. As I studied this piece during its making I glimpsed what I thought should happen next and then I incorporated it. When I felt the image was right I left it. This relates to Schaverien's process of "immanent articulation" and was my working process as I became familiar with the image I was making and what I was revealing. As Schaverien points out "words are [still] not helpful at this stage" (106). This was an intuitive process and I was *deliberately* trying to reveal truths about experience that I could not express in any other way. This, I would suggest, is the reason why many artists make work and what they are attempting to do when they create it. An artist may have the nucleus of the idea before he or she starts making art but it is only *in the making*, when there is a blending of conscious, pre-conscious and unconscious dialogue, that the true and unique meaning of the work is established. Conscious, pre-conscious and unconscious material is then sealed into the artwork. This is visual transference in operation.

3. *Acknowledgment*. This occurred in *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* at every stage of its making. Acknowledgment, in this sense, was an evolving process and was compounded as the internal dialogue between myself and the image was initiated and developed. This process is what I was referring to when
discussing Handler Spitz's "psychoanalysis and aesthetic experience" model of
interpretation and Winnicott's theories. There I am proposing the hypothesis of
visual transference to further Winnicott's theory of transitional object and
aesthetic experience. As the visual transference/counter-transference internal
dialogue was developed within myself through the artwork acknowledgment
was developed and deepened. I propose that in these circumstances
acknowledgment can happen consciously or unconsciously between an artist
and the artwork, or a viewer and the artwork. If the acknowledgment is
conscious then there is recognition of the unconscious material by the artist or
viewer as it surfaces and interpretation may be possible, desirable or necessary.
If the acknowledgment is unconscious then the artwork is performing an
adaptive and/or benign role. In this situation, interpretation, by the artist or
viewer, is not possible and is not necessary. In the case of Memory, Mammary,
Mummery I believe that the processes of conscious recognition and the
processes of unconscious activity were and are taking place concurrently. They
have evolved and changed as the artwork was made and are on-going, after the
work is complete, as understanding of the artwork's implications deepen.
Interpretation, as Handler Spitz and Schaverien point out, is not static or
definitive, like experience it evolves and changes with time and context. This
process of unfolding and evolving meaning can be observed in the
documentation of Memory, Mammary, Mummery. It will be noticed that the
documentation is in three clear parts.

Firstly, there is an introductory set of dictionary definitions of the title, Memory,
Mammary, Mummery, which help to expand on the potential meanings of the
work. As mentioned, the title was only decided on, or thought of, well after the
work had been made and so the title itself is combined with the process of
acknowledgment. In it I am acknowledging some of the key contents and
transfertent material in the work. By referring to dictionary definitions I am
doing this in a detached way that makes it possible for me to acknowledge
aspects of the content in the work and, just as importantly, reveal these personal
thoughts publicly in the exhibition and thesis in an oblique and detached
manner. The definitions resonate with ineffable feelings I have in my conscious
and unconscious mind, they point towards understanding and the potential for
interpretation. They are signifiers for the symbols and imagery in Memory,
Mammary, Mummery.

Secondly, there is a short paragraph written about two years after making the
work. This passage acknowledges its symbolic meaning. It recognises the
important implications of the artwork and suggests to the reader of the
documentation what the content of the image might be and what the investment
to it concerns. This passage was written after the title had been decided on and
the implications of the title had been acknowledged. However, because of the
personal sexual meanings and phantasies that are contained in this work I
indicate in the passage that I can not, or do not want to, discuss them publicly or
openly in such an arena as this thesis. These meanings and phantasies are, after
all, contained in the artwork and this is why I made it. This is why the work
contains a scapegoat transference. The making of the work has allowed me to
unload and acknowledge consciously, and publicly, aspects of my preconscious
and unconscious. The work has enabled me to consciously admit to these
personal sexual meanings, not in a direct way, but in a condensed narrative, the
way that dreams and many art forms operate.

Thirdly, there is a passage paraphrased from my working journal. My decision
to paraphrase the journal entries in the documentation was made for two
reasons. The first reason is straightforward enough, grammatically, the journal
would be hard to comprehend if I had not reorganised it into the paraphrased
account. However, the second reason has more to do with censorship and
confidentiality. The original journal entries are personal and reveal to me much
more than I wish to include in this thesis. They were written either at the time of
making Memory, Mammary, Mummery or within a few months of completing
it. In these jumbled and private notes I can recognise Schaverien's interpretive
processes of identification, familiarisation, and acknowledgment, and in the
paraphrased account it is also possible to identify my visual recognition of these
same processes, though I am doing so in a deliberately oblique way. There is
still an element of public censorship and like the work itself an element of
condensation.

It is evident from each of these three parts of the documentation of Memory,
Mammary, Mummery that acknowledgment for me is an on-going and evolving
process. I do not necessarily consider that it will ever be over because what has
been revealed to me in a work such as this is not so traumatic that I have to
dispose of it in a final or conclusive way. In works such as Memory,
Mammary, Mummery this on-going interpretive process parallels what
Schaverien refers to as "the life of the picture". She indicates that long after the
work is made it can continue to have meaning and that this is one of the
properties of fine art and, in some cases, the work of art therapy clients. Once
the work is empowered it has the potential to be consistently discussed,
criticised, re-evaluated and interpreted. This is because the work continues to "live" and have meaning for the artist and/or the viewer.

It is only after making *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* and all the other works in the exhibition that I was able to enter into a more rational, analysis of them that involved ordering the writings of my journal entries. Even then this was not easy and perhaps would not have been necessary on a personal level. The initial attempts were jumbled sets of words, cryptic and idiosyncratic entries. It was only on rewriting and re-analysing the artwork in later sessions that I was able to better order my thoughts. Then it was only the imperative of having to present this documentation in the finished thesis that has driven me towards written organisation and explanation of the visual psychic material.

The fourth stage of Schaverien's theory is *Assimilation* and involves reintegration of the psychic material, revealed. Assimilation to me with *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* is a partial and continuing process and perhaps relates to Schaverien's fifth and final point *Disposal*. As Schaverien indicates, this five point description of the interpretive process is not all inclusive and does not necessarily happen in the same order, or the same way, in every case. When discussing *Disposal* Schaverien points out that some artworks continue to be empowered long after they have been completed. This is one of the characteristics she assigns to fine art. The continuing and enduring empowerment of fine art, she indicates, is due to the aesthetic qualities and transference presence of the particular work.

*Memory, Mammary, Mummery* is a scapegoat and a talisman in Schaverien's terms. It acts as a scapegoat in the way it has enabled me to consciously expose instinctual sexual feelings, that I have no doubt, go right back to the earliest days of my life. The instinctual wish and desire to focus on the breast, as discussed in *The Search*, emerges in work for this exhibition from its very beginnings. Slowly, this desire to *work with the breast* becomes more explicit. In *Memory, Mammary, Mummery* I am revealing in a contradictory covert/explicit way the desire/denial of a phantasy and an obsession. In *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*, I reveal my love for the breast in making it the focus of the image in soft "dream-like" flesh tones heightened by a central darkened pink/red/brown areola that in the iconography of my imagery is distinctly sexual. I reveal my repressive admission of these emotions in the rough, invasive masculine hand that enters surreptitiously from the top left hand side to touch the breast and areola. The image is then encased (embodied) in a red visceral sexual frame that visually expands and contracts on the image contained like a muscle. The visceral red
is an announcement of an unconscious and powerful sexuality. Finally, on top of the sexual frame there are blue controlling (super ego) wavy bars, consciously applied. The bars subjugate the images beneath. They create and enhance the quality of depth and layering which is one of the essential metaphors in this artwork and the exhibition as a whole. The wavy blue bars incorporate and deliberately suggest the notion of the dream. And so, through a complex, but explicit, set of layered metaphoric/metonymic images, symbols and signifiers, the condensation of the dream/phantasy state of wish-fulfilment and denial is described. Contradictorily, even though I love the content, or the idea of the content, in this image I am also self-consciously resistant of the admission that it reveals in its explicit and public depiction fundamental sexual and instinctual emotions. On viewing Memory, Mammary, Mummery and reading through my entry for it in the documentation of this thesis Schaverien's theories of the five point process of interpretation and the concepts of scapegoat and talisman can be identified. In the three distinctive parts to the text of the documentation of Memory, Mammary, Mummery I obliquely refer to the interpretive content of the work and discuss aspects of its meaning.

Another point of connection in my artwork with Schaverien's theories occurs in her discussion of framing. In developing the works for the exhibition frames intuitively became important components integral to all of the artwork, symbolically interacting with it. This characteristic of the work was developed prior to my knowledge of Schaverien's theories and yet parallels aspects of them. The use of framing is very deliberate and in some cases (e.g., The Search, Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes, Objects and Relations and the series Illusive Reality), I set one frame inside another. Schaverien refers to this phenomenon of an "outer frame" and an "inner frame" and in a series such as The Park I very clearly need an outer and inner frame. This is not only shown in Objects and Relations, the central work of the series The Park, but also by the four 'satellite" works exhibited either side of it. In the documentation I record this inner/outer phenomenon as a need to symbolically represent the conscious and the unconscious. Parallel to my interpretation Schaverien uses the concepts of the outer frame to describe the environment that the artwork is set into and the inner frame to describe the artwork and the unconscious events that are being revealed in it. What Schaverien expresses theoretically in words I am dealing with intuitively in the artwork. The concept of outer and inner frames is further understood in my work by explaining how it developed. The first works, The Search and Self-Portrait in a Sea of Eyes contained many thoughts and transferences in the one artwork. As described when discussing the series Object Relations, I found this presentational method too complex and visually confusing so I decided to make the artworks in series. The series, therefore, acted as the "outer frame" allowing me to articulate in individual works
within the series the "inner frame" experiences of the single works. This is why aesthetically the spatial relationships of the works in the series is important. The "potential space" between each of the artworks cognitively empowers interactive psychic experience between them. In this sense, the artworks individually, the series of works and the exhibition as a whole take on the aesthetic mantle of an installation which have their own scapegoat and talisman properties and effects.

Schaverien refers to the frame as a boundary that contains the psychic drama that is unfolding. Pursuing the connections between Schaverien's theories on framing and my work it is constructive to consider her presentation of the artwork as "a frame" on the transference, which she also refers to as a "window on the transference" (71). This concept resonates with aspects of the unconscious content of my artwork. As the work developed the frames deliberately became larger, or heavier, or deeper, or more complex as they began to isolate the imagery in time and space. A work such as Memory, Mammary, Mummery, for instance, shows this very clearly, it appears like a secret view through a barred window. This is also very clear in a series such as Illusive Reality. This series deliberately references theatre by including window/stage curtains on each piece in it. This makes a clear reference to theatre and fine art being a mirror of, or a window onto, experience. Mirrors and glass are also a prominent feature of the last series of work made for exhibition, Time Transferred. Glass and the reference to mirrors and mirror transference features in every work.

The unconscious transference metaphor concerning frames and windows as frames on to the transference appears consistently in the exhibition and this was recognised by those that reviewed it. For instance, in Inchoate, one of the essays included in the brochure accompanying this exhibition, the author Robert Hood, counter-transference, opens his fictional work with the words "Passed by a window".6 This theme is pursued by Hood in his essay as a device to isolate the staccato shifts of (un)consciousness in his writing style and at the same time reference my work. Similarly, in Debbie Westbury's poem The Gaze, also in the brochure and equally as counter-transference, the second verse opens with the words,

Like orphans we press our noses against the windows of living rooms

As Schaverien develops her analogy of artwork to window she refers to the reflective qualities of window glass acting as a mirror, this she indicates is analogous to the

6 Included in the appendix of the thesis
transference/counter-transference experience of client/therapist or artist/viewer. Significantly, as I developed my work, intuitively and symbolically, I began to include mirror glass into the artworks I was creating. The first work I did this in was *Mirror Transference* where there was a conscious recognition of the visual transference the original painting by Stanley Spencer was making to me. I decided that if I painted this image on glass I would be able to express or suggest the visually transference quality of Spencer's original image. I, or any viewer, would be able to stand in front of the image and align their own image with that of Spencer's. The physical superimposition of artist and viewer thus alludes to, and explains, the concept of visual transference and counter-transference in art and the metaphor of art being a window on the realms of inner and outer experience. However, additionally, when I made *Mirror Transference* I incorporated visual transferences of my own into that work. The visual transferences incorporated into *Mirror Transference* enabled me to recognise and interpret the visual transferences I had for many years received from Spencer's original work and this is explained in the documentation of *Mirror Transference*. Therefore, *Mirror Transference* is an example of a complex set of visual transference/counter-transference interactions taking place inter-psychically to and from Spencer's painting that are reinvested into the new work *Mirror Transference* causing a new set (or as Freud expressed it "a new edition") of transference interactions. On viewing the work *Mirror Transference* the audience then receives the transference I have invested and interacts with their own visual counter-transference.

(iv)

In this chapter of conclusion I have presented the reader with examples of artwork that demonstrate the relationships between theory and practice. To pursue this with every work in the exhibition would indeed be a lengthy undertaking. Besides this it might take away the quality of ambiguity and enigma upon which so much art thrives and perhaps upon which the viewer depends imaginatively. My interpretations are just that, my own. Other people are able to make their own interpretations and these may be at odds with mine as they intertwine their own counter-transferences. Perhaps it is better to let the viewer muse meditatively and silently over the majority of the images in the exhibition (and reproduced in this thesis) and consider the theory presented in the thesis to arrive at conclusions and interpretations that are appropriate to them personally.

The convergence of an inter-disciplinary approach and the presentation of objective and subjective data in this project has been difficult to balance (and at times disturbingly
revealing). As a layperson to psychoanalysis and art therapy I have had to grapple with concepts and language that were new to me. However, perhaps to my advantage I have had no preconceptions or theoretical allegiances to defend. Seen in isolation and confirmed in the data compiled for this thesis, the connections between art and transference might now seem obvious to the reader. However, there is far more room for research in an area that I believe will take on more significance in the future. It would be interesting, for example, to see a doctoral study of the processes of transference compared and evaluated with a range of art making processes carried out in a similarly systematic way. Alternatively, a prolonged study of a number of living and disparate artists would be useful in order to monitor, analyse and verify possible transferential material. Both of these considerations, however, are outside the scope of this thesis. Indeed, one of the problems with such a potentially vast topic has been to limit the areas for research. Nevertheless, it would be interesting in a future study to carry out more in-depth research into fine art that alludes to concepts of visual transference in oblique or obscured ways.

Like many doctoral studies this one has been a long and, at times, arduous experience. In nine years it has encapsulated a major and psychically demanding body of artworks, three related exhibitions and an extensive thesis. Considered in this light, the doctoral creative arts candidate is often said to be the producer of two theses; one as artwork and exhibition and the other as academic text. Both are demanding and creative processes and I have made a conscious attempt, in different ways in both mediums, to reveal aspects of my unconscious motivations. As I write this, Joy Schaverien's comparison of artworks to scapegoats and talismans comes into my mind and I have to admit of a cathartic sensation as I draw close to finishing one of the major projects of my life.
LIST OF PLATES

Works from the Exhibition Memory, Mammary, Mummery

page 189  The Search
oil ceramic on composition board 122 x 100 cm

page 197  Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes
oil ceramic on composition board 108 x 78 cm

page 207  Memory - Mammary - Mummery
oil and ceramic on wood 56 x 49 cm

page 214  Face and Breast Image
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 217  Male Archaic Symbol
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 219  Self Portrait
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 221  Cycladic Symbol - Archaic Fe/Male
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 223  Female Breast Image
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 226  Archaic Mother
oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

page 232  Objects and Relations
oil ceramic wood 113 x 96 cm

page 238  Pram
oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

page 240  Tea Caravan
oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

page 242  In Memoria
oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

page 246  Hepworth
oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

page 251  Freud the Father
oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

page 260  Phamily Group
oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

page 266  The Rules of the Game
oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm
In the Name of the Father
oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

Ambivalence 1
oil ceramic wood 29 x 33 cm

Ambivalence 2
oil ceramic wood 29 x 33 cm

Mother
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Alone
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Childhood
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Loss
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Immigrant
oil ceramic wood glass shells on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Children
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Mirror Transference
oil ceramic wood glass on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Father
oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

Dum Dum Dum Dummy Do Wah
oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

Auntie Anne
oil ceramic wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

Recurrent Dream
oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

For John
oil ceramic glass wood music box shells stones on composition board 62 x 49 cm

Hello I'm a Painting, Who are You?
oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 60 x 49 cm

Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong
oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 60 x 49 cm
Illustrations concerned with Text

page 29  Max Pollack *Sigmund Freud at His Desk* 1914
etching
Freud Museum London

page 48  René Magritte *The Rape* 1934
oil on canvas 73.2 x 54.3 cm
Menil Foundation Collection Houston

page 75  Michelangelo *Moses*
marble
San Pietro in Vincoli Rome

page 191  Photo of *Self Portrait* drawing
charcoal and pencil 60 x 42 cm

page 192  Close up photo of *The Search*

page 195  Sir Peter Paul Rubens *Self Portrait* c.1638 - 1640
oil on canvas
Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna

page 202  Photo of my mother and me c.1949

page 202  Detail of *Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*

page 216  Sir Peter Paul Rubens *Roman Charity (Cimon and Pero)* c.1613
oil on canvas 140.5 x 180.3 cm
The Hermitage St Petersburg

page 233  Detail of *Objects and Relations*

page 234  *The Virgin Hodigetria* early 15th Century

page 236  Henry Moore *Three Standing Figures* 1947-48

page 244  Eric Henri Kennington *War Memorial for the 24th Division* 1924
Battersea Park London

page 247  Dame Barbara Hepworth *Two Forms (Divided Circle)* c.1970
Dulwich Park London

page 252  Freud's Consulting Rooms
The Freud Museum London

page 253  Detail of *Freud the Father*

page 263  Photo of my Irish Grandfather with one of his daughters c.1910

page 264  Detail one of *Phamily Group*

page 265  Detail two of *Phamily Group*

page 268  Detail of *The Rules of the Game*

page 272  Detail one of *In the Name of the Father*
page 273 Detail two of *In the Name of the Father*

page 287 My father c.1939

page 298 Sir Stanley Spencer *Self Portrait* 1959
oil on canvas 50.8 x 40.6 cm
Private collection

page 310 René Magritte *Time Transfixed* 1939
oil on canvas 146.3 x 97.5 cm
The Tate Gallery London

page 344 Detail of *The Search*
BIBLIOGRAPHY


---------. "Project for a Scientific Psychology." S.E. vol. 1, 1950 (1895), 281-293.

---------. "Editors Appendix A: Freud's Use of the Concept of Regression." S.E. vol. 1, 1950 (1895), 344-356.


---------. "Case Histories (i) Fraulein Anna O. (Breuer)." S.E. vol. 2, 1893-1895, 253-306.

---------. "The Material and Sources of Dreams." S.E. vol. 4, 1900, 163-276.

--------. The Psychopathology of Everyday Life. S.E. vol. 6, 1901.

--------. "Fragment of an Analysis of a Case of Hysteria." S.E. vol. 7, 1905 (1901), 1-122.


--------. Delusions and Dreams in Jensen's Gradiva. S.E. vol. 9, 1907 (1906).

--------. "Notes upon a Case of Obsessional Neurosis." S.E. vol. 10, 1909, 151-318.


--------. Leonardo Da Vinci and a Memory of His Childhood. S.E. vol. 11, 1910.

--------. "The Future Prospects of Psycho-Analytic Therapy." S.E. vol. 11, 1910, 139-152.


--------. "The Dynamics of Transference." S.E. vol. 12, 1912, 97-108.

--------. "Remembering, Repeating and Working Through (Further Recommendations on the Technique of Psycho-Analysis, II)." S.E. vol. 12, 1914, 145-156.

--------. "Observations on Transference - Love (Further Recommendations on the Technique of Psycho-Analysis, III)." S.E. vol. 12, 1915 (1914), 157-171.

--------. "Formulations on the Principles of Mental Functioning." S.E. vol. 12, 1911, 213-226.


--------. "Repression." S.E. vol. 14, 1915, 141-158.


--------. "From the History of the Infantile Neurosis." S.E. vol. 17, 1918 (1914), 1-122.

--------. "On Transformations of Instinct as Exemplified in Anal Erotism." S.E. vol.17, 1917, 125-134.


--------. Beyond the Pleasure Principle. S.E. vol. 18, 1920.
Group Psychology and the Analysis of the Ego. S.E. vol. 18, 1921.

"Dreams and Telepathy." S.E. vol. 18, 1922, 195-220.

"Two Encyclopedic Articles." S.E. vol. 18, 1923 (1922), 235-262.

The Ego and the Id. S.E. Vol. 19, 1923.


"A Short Account of Psycho-Analysis." S.E. vol. 19, 1924 (1923), 191-212.


An Autobiographical Study. S.E. vol. 20, 1925 (1924).

Inhibitions, Symptoms and Anxiety. S.E. vol. 20, 1926 (1925).

The Question of Lay Analysis. S.E. vol. 20, 1926.


"Fetishism." S.E. vol. 21, 1927, 147-158.


An Outline of Psycho-Analysis. S.E. vol. 23, 1940 (1938).


Works Consulted


ZENTNER, OSCAR. "On Beauty, Neither Transient Nor Everlasting." Freudian School of Melbourne, 1990.

APPENDIX
Tony Hull

MEMORY, MAMMARY, MUMMERY
THE LONG GALLERY
UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG
9-20 JANUARY
1995
CATALOGUE

1. *The Search*
   oil ceramic on composition board 122 x 100 cm

2. *Self Portrait in a Sea of Eyes*
   oil ceramic on composition board 108 x 78 cm

3. *Memory - Mammary - Mummery*
   oil and ceramic on wood 56 x 49 cm

4. *Face and Breast Image*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

5. *Male Archaic Symbol*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

6. *Self Portrait*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

7. *Cycladic Symbol - Archaic Fe/Male*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

8. *Female Breast Image*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

9. *Archaic Mother*
   oil ceramic 22 x 22 cm

10. *Objects and Relations*
    oil ceramic wood 113 x 96 cm

11. *Pram*
    oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

12. *Tea Caravan*
    oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

13. *In Memoria*
    oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

14. *Hepworth*
    oil ceramic wood 47 x 40 cm

15. *Freud the Father*
    oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

16. *Phamily Group*
    oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

17. *The Rules of the Game*
    oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm
18. **In the Name of the Father**
   oil ceramic wood carpet 60 x 52 cm

19. **Ambivalence 1**
   oil ceramic wood 29 x 33 cm

20. **Ambivalence 2**
   oil ceramic wood 29 x 33 cm

21. **Mother**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

22. **Alone**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

23. **Childhood**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

24. **Loss**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

25. **Immigrant**
   oil ceramic wood glass shells on composition board 43 x 28 cm

26. **Children**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

27. **Mirror Transference**
   oil ceramic wood glass on composition board 43 x 28 cm

28. **Father**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 43 x 28 cm

29. **Dum Dum Dum Dummy Do Wah**
   oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

30. **Auntie Anne**
   oil ceramic wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

31. **Recurrent Dream**
   oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 62 x 49 cm

32. **For John**
   oil ceramic glass wood music box shells stones on composition board 62 x 49 cm

33. **Hello I'm a Painting, Who are You?**
   oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 60 x 49 cm

34. **Alive and Well and Living in Wollongong**
   oil ceramic glass wood on composition board 60 x 49 cm
Résumé

I was born on 18th April 1949 and lived in or near to London for 30 years. In 1979 I moved to Sydney and in 1980 to Thirroul, N.S.W. In 1989 I became an Australian citizen. I am married with two children. I have an extensive background in ceramics and painting, having commenced my professional studies in 1974.

Formal Study:

1974-78  Camberwell School of Arts & Crafts, London.
         First Class B.A. (Hons.,) Ceramics and Painting
         Special Commendation for Painting

1978-79  Goldsmith's College, University of London
         Post Graduate Art Teacher's Certificate

1988-1997 University of Wollongong
         Candidate for Doctor of Creative Arts

Exhibitions

Solo:

1983  Painting, Recent Work, University of Wollongong.


1991  Painting, Feature Exhibition, Juanita Studio Gallery, Austinmer.

1992  Painting, Memory, Mammary Mummery, Wollongong City Art Gallery.

1993  Painting, Illusive Reality, University of Western Sydney.

1994  Painting, Feature Exhibition, Juanita Studio Gallery, Austinmer.

1995  Painting, Memory, Mammary, Mummery, University of Wollongong
Selected Group:

1977
Ceramics, Playhouse Gallery, Barlow, Essex, England

1978
Ceramics and Painting, B.A. (Hons.) Graduation, Camberwell School of Arts & Crafts London

1978
Ceramics, Other Contemporaries, St. Martin's School of Art, London.

1978
Ceramics, Contemporary Ceramics, Carmel College, Oxfordshire, England.

1979
Ceramics, Advanced Diploma Exhibition, Goldsmiths College, University of London.

1979
Ceramics, Showplate 79, Blackfriars Gallery, Sydney.

1980
Ceramics, Four Visiting Potters, Latrobe Valley Arts Centre, Victoria.

1982
Painting, Wollongong Artists, Cooks Hill Galleries, Newcastle, Australia.

1982
Ceramics, Four Ways with Clay, University of Wollongong

1983
Painting, Landscapes, Stephen Mori Galleries, Sydney.

1984
Painting and Ceramics, Dapto TAFE Staff Show, Performing Shark Centre, Thirroul, NSW.

1985
Ceramics, Guest Lecture and Associated Exhibition of Ceramics, Wollongong City Art Gallery.

1987
Ceramics, Illawarra Ceramics, Wollongong City Gallery.

1988
Painting, 8 x 8, Art Arena Gallery, Wollongong

1988
Ceramics, Tea for 200 years, Graham Gallery Mount Kembla, NSW

1988
Painting, Illawarra Artists Bicentennial Exhibition, Wollongong City Gallery.

1989
Ceramics and Painting, Fishers Ghost Exhibition, Campbelltown City Art Gallery.

1990
Ceramics and Painting, Fishers Ghost Exhibition, Campbelltown City Art Gallery.

1990
Painting, Studio Artists Group Show, Juanita Studio Gallery, Austinmer.

1992
Painting, Visual Orchestra, Wollongong West TAFE Staff Show, University of Wollongong.
1993
Painting, Two Works, Wollongong West TAFE Staff Show, University of Wollongong.

1993
Painting, Fishers Ghost Exhibition, Campbelltown City Gallery.

1994
Drawing, Drawing On The Illawarra, University of Wollongong.

1994
Painting, Untitled, Wollongong West TAFE Staff Show, University of Wollongong.

1995
Painting, Berrima Art Prize Exhibition.

1996
Painting, James Kiwi Watercolour Prize Exhibition, Wollongong City Gallery.

Teaching Experience

1977
Project Assistant "Adventure Playground Project", London Borough of Southwark.

1977-79
Teaching Ceramics and Painting at Institutes of Adult Education in London Area.

1979
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Sydney College of the Arts

1979
Part-Time Lecturer of Painting, Nepean College of Advanced Education

1980
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Forestville Community Arts Centre

1980
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Wollongong Ceramics Society

1980
Visiting Lecturer Ceramics, Gippsland Institute of Advanced Education, Victoria

1983
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Camberwell School of Arts and Crafts, London

1983
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Goldsmiths College, University of London

1984
Visiting Lecturer Ceramics, Gippsland Institute of Advanced Education, Victoria

1985
Guest Lecturer Ceramics and Painting, Wollongong City Art Gallery

1986
Guest Lecturer Ceramics, Wollongong Ceramic Society

1987
Guest Lecturer, Ceramics and Painting, Kiama Arts Society

1980-83
Teacher in Charge of Ceramics, Dapto College of TAFE
1984-91 Acting Head Teacher Art & Design, Dapto College of TAFE
1992 Guest Lecturer, 'Arts to Lunch' in connection with my solo exhibition, Memory, Mammary, Mummery
1992 to present Teacher of Art & Design and occasional Acting Head Teacher, Wollongong West College of TAFE

Commissions

1979 Ceramic Commission to produce a series of oxidised and reduced stoneware dishes for Podmore Ceramic Ltd., London and Stoke-on-Trent. Examples of this work included in their International Catalogue.
1981 Painting Commission. Watercolours for the office of Harbison ACI Pty Ltd., Unanderra, NSW

Prizes

1987 Painting: Cordeaux Heights Arts Prize, NSW - Second Prize
1988 Painting: Austinmer Bicentennial Art Prize, NSW - First Prize
1989 Painting: Macquarie Towns Acquisitive Art Exhibition NSW - Highly Commended
1993 Painting: Fishers Ghost Art Award - Campbelltown City Art Gallery: Highly Commended.
1995 Painting: Berrima Art Society NSW - First Prize.
1996 Painting: James Kiwi Watercolour Prize - First Prize.

Work in Collections

Goldsmiths College, (UK)
Camberwell School of Arts and Crafts, (UK)
Podmore Ceramics Ltd, (UK)
Carmel College, (UK)
Latrobe Valley Arts Centre, Victoria
Wollongong University Union, N.S.W.
Harbison ACI Pty Ltd, NSW
Ian Auld, (UK)
Ian Tregarth-Jenkins, (UK)
David Cowley (UK)
Suzanne Archer
Graham Oldroyd
Dr Alan England
John Gould
Kate Broadfoot
D. Hind, (Director, Go-Hire Pty. Ltd.)
Dr. Peter Shepherd
Ken Orchard
Lachlan Harris
Mal and Di Robertson
Terry Dawkins
Frank Cahill
Albert Hull (UK)
Peter Clossick (UK)

Publications/Text

1980  Podmore International Catalogue, colour photograph of work and credit

1987  Illawarra Ceramicists exhibition catalogue. Notes on work by Gallery Director.

1988  Contemporary Australian Figurative Ceramics exhibition catalogue, technical credit


1989  The Significance of the Human Body to the Artist. Research Students Conference. University of Wollongong, NSW

1990  Ceramic Bodies and Psychoanalysis, Austceram International Conference, Perth, W.A.
1992/95  *Memory, Mammary, Mummery*, Exhibition brochure accompanying solo show.


Installation photographs of the artworks at Wollongong City Art Gallery
31 January - 1 March 1992
Father Imago 1991
Oil, ceramic, carpet on composition board.

TONY HULL
REGIONAL MYTHS
Memory, Mammary, Mummery
Wollongong City Gallery
31 January - 1 March 1992
Tony’s desire

In his paintings on the significance of the human body Tony Hull has created works rich with birth and simultaneously ripe with death.

One small work, Object Relations Archaic Mother (VI), concentrates on the earliest mother image known to man—the Venus of Willendorf. She is bound by a metallic blue ceramic frame sculpted with ribbons, pearls, and shell-like ornaments.

But far more gripping is the blood-red sea of rich oil paint the Venus floats in. The thick impasto paint and brushwork suggest a life-giving placenta surrounding her, nourishing her. Yet the Venus is fired with a yellow glaze breaking away from the burnished ceramic skin. Her breasts burst through the pale yellow glaze.

The inside of the frame is held together by a corded/twisted rope reminiscent of the umbilical cord. It seems stretched, taut between the four corners. The mother image is one icon Tony uses to reiterate his ideas about how the body influences the artist’s interpretation.

The mother image is one that Tony uses to reiterate his ideas of the human body and its relationship with the artist in the major works of the exhibition.

He grabs at icons and images—the breast, the mother, the father, the artist, the camera, and cultural images such as the Venus—to develop/amplify his work on the unconscious relationships surrounding the artist.

In his later pieces Tony has returned to his childhood for images of his mother and a Sigmund Freud-like father in the classic study of the family.

In one series of works, ‘Father imago’ a young child sits on the knee of an elderly man smoking a thick, (almost phallic) Havana cigar.
In another work in the series an ageing couple stand behind the Freudian figure. The young lad in the foreground is not endowed with the awe and innocence of lambs, but of a time-worn feeling of labour and hard work. Tony again uses a thick impasto of paint to background the figures. This time the paint takes on the dirty brown of knotted fumes, worn memories and ideas.

In his later works Tony has somewhat forsaken his work on the psychology of the human body and its influence on the artist and embarked on a study of his own feelings for his family. His images and icons percolate to the surface of our (and his) consciousness to pique and remind us of past cultures.

His are not easy works to digest. It is never simple to confront what Virginia Wolf called the two great dictums of all art - sex and death.

Tony, 42, lives by the Pacific Ocean in Thirroul, yet his works reflect a different world of trellis-fenced parks and stout mothers and doting children. Many are of his childhood in London, England, where he lived until his 30th birthday before moving to Sydney.

He completed his Bachelor of Art (Honours) at the Camberwell School of Art and Craft before going on to Post-Graduate studies at Goldsmiths' College, University of London. Tony has been acting Head of Art and Design at the Dapto TAFE for nine years and is married to Denise. They have two children, dangerous Dan, 9, and the ebullient Sophie, 7.

The exhibition, Memory, Mammon, Mummery, is in partial completion of a Doctrate of Creative Arts Tony is undertaking through the University of Wollongong.

Lachlan Harris
The Gaze

The matrix always red
and muscular,
the blindness only milk.

Like orphans we press our noses
against the windows of living rooms
and a baby stares back at us
from his mother's arms.
She's holding him closely
looking into a face that's already
turning away from her
to a distant Father.
Freud, formal, pre-occupied
hardly notices the infant in his lap.
The steady gaze of the wise child
finds us wanting
and we look away; to the sea
at Bournemouth, tea-trolleys and sticky buns
monuments and memorabilia.
Mirrored in cataracted eyes
he sees his own son with a cricket bat,
gazing, farthest of all,
across the field,
over the boundary.

The curtains now are partly drawn
we see the Son's heart
but not his face.
You dream of a journey
without pauses,
that's all a chase,
a dance, a fire in the clearing.
Under the moon they stalk you.
Fish spawn in the estuary
and the priestess waits
for one who wears your antlers,
who's covered in your blood.

Debbie Westbury
INCHOATE

Passed by the window on his way to ... somewhere. Work? Yes, to an office, in a tall building where he didn’t know anybody and they didn’t know him. This happened every day, right? Seeing the window didn’t. It was ... old-fashioned. Framed by solid wood, so weathered the peeling curls of colourless paint on it looked like fretwork. The glass was painted over. A war-time precaution perhaps. (Though that was in England long ago. Before his time, wasn’t it? He couldn’t remember.) The paint was black ... or maybe deep red, the way black hair sometimes had a red sheen in sunlight. It tempted him. To step closer, search myopically for a scratch that would let him see into the room beyond. The wall surrounding the window was otherwise featureless. Cement-rendered? It was very dirty. There didn’t seem to be a door. What was in the building? He didn’t know and knew better than to waste time trying to find out. Such idle curiosity was hallmark of a dangerous lack of ... what? _Attention to the present_. The phrase hung there. A memory. But he couldn’t remember from when. Was it something his mother had said? Or his father? he couldn’t fix his mind on either of them. Why hadn’t he seen the window before?

He went on.

But he got lost and was late for work. Nobody noticed. Nobody said good morning. Nobody threatened him with anything. He went to his desk ... But was it his desk? He wasn’t sure. Couldn’t quite remember. He hadn’t left it so tidy the night before, had he? He was never tidy. His spaces, like his mind, were a litter of unfinished business. Still, nobody sent him away from it ... ‘Excuse me?’ he said to a tall woman with dark red hair as she brushed by, unaware of him. He followed her, coming up behind. Nobody looked at him. ‘Excuse me?’ He touched her shoulder. She entered an office cubicle without stopping for him. Angry, he went in after her. ‘Look, Ms ...’ he couldn’t bring her name to mind. She had very big eyes-deep green. A mane of hair framed her face in a lush burgundy texture. ‘You ignored me’, he said, hurt. She frowned, as though she couldn’t quite hear him. ‘Do you want something?’ she said. ‘I just wanted to know if that was my desk ...’ he began, but her eyes glazed over, as though she’d thought of something else. He watched her smile to somebody who wasn’t there ... and unbutton her blouse. She took it off. Her breasts were full, their nipples like pink-brown fruit. Then her skirt and her underwear. He stared down at the downy redness between her legs. Was she offering him something? He stepped closer. Reached out his hand. Felt the softness of her breast. He knelt; she leaned back against the desk. His hand probed within her thighs,
parted the swollen lips of flesh, wetting his fingers, wanting to open her fully. He could smell her rich scent, but insider her, what was there? ... Something? He couldn't see clearly. He looked up at her. She stared at him, unaware, and suddenly he thought she was like his mother (though he couldn't remember what his mother was like) and he pulled back his fingers and moved away. Outside the door, he rubbed her moisture on his handkerchief.

Dealing with the files on his desk was impossible. He didn't know what they were for. Anxiety and a peculiar tension made him fumble, sent his mind off into other places. He didn't see the woman again, though he kept looking for her. His eyes searched for gaps in the slim venetians too. Glimpses of something passing by the building. No, he was five storeys up. Nothing could pass. He tried to catch the eye of other workers. No one met his gaze. The figures on the papers he had to process became more alien.

'You!' A shadow fell over him and he looked at its original ... a man, familiar, yet he couldn't quite remember where he'd seen him before. 'Day-dream and you're done for', the man continued, his goatee beard pointing like a threat. He barely seemed to be looking at him. 'You must pay attention to the present!'

He saw the red-haired woman again on his way ... somewhere. To where he slept? Yes, to a little place that wasn't his ... that he rented. (Had he ever had a home of his own?) He followed her along the street. She'd disappeared when he rounded a corner ... but the window was there. In the blank wall. He realised he'd been anticipating seeing it, feeling eager to look through its impenetrable pane. Perhaps the woman was behind there. He shuffled close. Then away. Back again.

Something moved against the glass. He frowned, squinting at it. A fish emerged from the black surface. It swam into the air as though the world was a sea, flapped its fins and curved back into the window. Gone.

He blinked, his mind numbing. Was the window-pane solid, or just a shadow? Either way, what was beyond it? Nose almost touching it now, he sniffed, trembling, afraid something would come out at him. Nothing did. He could see only a dim reflection of himself. (He guessed it was himself, though the phantom shape looked like someone else ... he didn't know who. Seemed familiar.) 'Is there anyone there?' he whispered. His fingers, still smelling of the red-haired woman's sex, hovered against the glass. Touched. Entered through it. Black paint swept aside, the way the surface membrane of an algaed pond might, its tension broken by a stone. Blackness disappeared ... and suddenly he
could see beyond it. For a moment, the images through the parting curtain were bulbous and featureless. Heaving shapes. Forming. He blinked.

It was not the interior of a building, but a park. Short picket fences defining landscaped edges. Ice-cream seller’s van, side-flap open. War memorial. Crucifix. A bench. On the bench, a woman. A red-haired woman. It was his mother ... he knew that, though he could not quite remember what his mother looked like. Next to her was a stern, formally dressed gentleman with a goatee beard. He resembled ... who? Someone ... sort of like Sigmund Freud. But he knew it was his father (though again memory of his father was formless). The woman was holding a baby. Himself? In the middle distance, a young boy ran past, yelling silently - the scene was utterly soundless. He felt a strong conviction that the boy was his own son. ‘Can you hear me?’ he said. The woman stood up. Aimlessly ambled forward, not looking at him. The baby squirmed and she glanced down at it. The baby was staring straight at him. Caught his eye. There was no question that the child saw him. That he saw the child. They stared at each other with intense recognition.

‘What’s he looking at?’ the red-haired woman said to her husband. She followed the child’s gaze. There was open sea, sweeping out from a rocky foreshore. It was restless with wind and marked by a pattern of undercurrents, so that the surface of the water was thick and broken.

‘Looking for fish perhaps?’ the man replied. Then added: ‘We should head off home.’

The woman smiled at him, agreeing perhaps.

Robert Hood
'THE WORKS - A CRITIQUE'

Anthony Hull's formal debt to Auerbach & Spencer should be readily evident to those already acquainted with the works of these 20th century British Masters - what may be less readily discernible, particularly with regard to its importance is his work, is his greater indebtedness to those other two 20th century European pioneers of self-exploration - Freud & Jung.

I mention this especially at the onset because there are those who hold the opinion that it matters not what is said but merely that it be said well those self-same amphibians whom Pope condemned for having the "corrupted mind the trifling heart"; those content with the witty quotation, the elegant pastiche content to polish what already is, to promulgate ready-to-go aesthetic. Hull has eschewed these easier, smoother solutions in order to give what is being said a more equal weighting with how it is being said. Its worth reflecting at this point that in many of the more profound discourses recently on the direction and role of art, art history, art criticism etc., much is made of the marginalisation of this form of human activity (Hughes et al.) While this marginalisation is more or less universally bemoaned one must feel that it can only continue unabated while ever vast armies of unreflective daubers elect to the fashionable, to merely comment on the superficial with studied irony or feigned indifference.

One way out of this impasse, which I believe Hull has recognised-a way to demarginalise artistic activity is to generate images which may serve as a kind of antidote to the snake-bite of the increasingly hive-like quality of human, social organisations - Images which are at once both deeply personal and archetypal.

Many of the images in these works reveal glimpses of personal fetishes as they impinge on concerns both universal and private - in some cases they could be fairly described as taboos. Sometimes in revealing these taboos one has to do so in a circumspect way - through the glass darkly as it were. In this regard it is interesting to note that in the Series III "Father Imago" the artist constructs an elaborate outer shell of frame surrounding encryptic painted images within each of which lies a small maquette muted, almost self-effacing, which is the real dark kernel of these works.

Hull has managed a powerful interplay of images here - the classical bird of prey whether Raven, Promethean Eagle or Horus its traditional role as mutilator of flesh (especially eyes and genitalia) - the supine human form and its transmogrification to fish incorporating both Phallic and Christian connotations - (a nod to Magritte here) - and the chilling finality of the isolated and therefore presumably victorious Nemesis atop the sarcophagus.
In this and the other series of works in the exhibition the artist has boldly elected to explore, the wilderness rather than be a label-hijacker, a polisher, a loiterer in others gardens, a rummager in the warehouse of history and for that integrity has been willing to pay the price of building the road upon which he advances - as the poet said

much better a rough truth, than the smoothest of lies.

R.A. Mathers
December 1991

Notes on the contributors to this brochure.

The poem, short story and text have been especially written as a response to the works in this exhibition.

**Robert Hood** is a writer of short stories mainly in the horror-fantasy and crime genre. Many of his stories have been published in Australian, American and British magazines, newspapers, literary journals and anthologies. Robert lives in Coledale.

**Debbie Westbury** is a poet and visual artist. Her poetry has been published in Australian and international journals. Debbie's collection of poetry, "Mouth to Mouth" was published by Five Islands Press in 1990. Debbie lives in Coledale.

**Lachlan Harris** is a father of three and a journalist. Living in Austinmer he has worked with newspapers for nine years and is now in Corporate Communication.

**Ron Mathers** is a painter and lecturer in perception at New South Wales University.