2005

Relationship factors and outcome in brief group psychotherapy for depression

Trevor Crowe
University of Wollongong, tcrowe@uow.edu.au

Recommended Citation
Relationship Factors and Outcome in Brief Group Psychotherapy for Depression

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Psychology) from University of Wollongong by Trevor Patrick Crowe, BSc (Hons) Department of Psychology 2005
Declaration

I, Trevor Patrick Crowe, certify that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy (Psychology) in the Department of Psychology, University of Wollongong, does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person where due reference is not made in the text. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Trevor Patrick Crowe

12th July 2005
Abstract

Relationship factors such as a psychotherapy group's cohesion and interpersonal climate have been touted as being analogous to the therapist-client alliance in individual psychotherapy, and as such should predict treatment outcome. However, predicting and explaining contributors to outcome in group psychotherapy remains unclear. This series of studies examined therapist-client alliance, group cohesion and climate, self-other differentiation processes (using a repertory grid method) and mastery of Core Conflictual Relationship Themes (CCRT) in brief dynamic group therapy for depression. These studies also integrated qualitative-phenomenological and clinical-quantitative research methodologies to examine in detail significant helpful and hindering psychotherapy events. It was found that therapeutic alliance is not analogous with group cohesion, but is associated with group member's engagement in therapeutic tasks. Perceived levels of conflict and group developmental processes helped explain the dimensions of cohesion. How group members defined themselves in relation to others meaningfully changed over therapy. Changes in perceived conflict in the group, and an individual's mastery of their CCRT patterns predicted outcome. In particular, through the experience of telling their stories, clients were able to change their responses to conflicts both within the group and in their wider interpersonal circle.
Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge, and express my gratitude to, my supervisor Associate Professor Brin Grenyer. I have gained considerably from Brin in relation to guidance in: conducting and understanding research projects; supervision of Clinical Psychologists; understanding Supportive Expressive Dynamic psychotherapy; understanding psychotherapy research; and general academic issues. I would also like to acknowledge the guidance and support of Mr Peter Caputi in relation to the statistical methodologies utilised in this thesis. In relation to the depression treatment project from which the data in this thesis was drawn, I would like to acknowledge the team of Clinical Psychologists who participated in the project and who provided the clinical interventions. Similarly, I would like to acknowledge the people struggling with depression who agreed to participate in this project and who allowed me the opportunity to try to understand better some of the issues related to the treatment of depression. Finally, I would like to acknowledge my family generally for their support during the period of completing this thesis and in particular my wife Helena, my son Jamie and my daughter Alexandra, who have endured my moodiness, preoccupation, and at times unavailability.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration .......................................................................................................................... i
Abstract ............................................................................................................................. ii
Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................... iii
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................ iv
List of Tables .................................................................................................................... vii
List of Figures .................................................................................................................. x
Preface .............................................................................................................................. xi

CHAPTER ONE: Thesis Introduction

Depression ....................................................................................................................... 2
Effectiveness of psychotherapy ...................................................................................... 5
Qualitative-phenomenological and clinical-quantitative research methodologies ... 7
Methodological considerations .................................................................................... 12
Subjective experience, meaning and symptom change ............................................... 15
Relationship factors .................................................................................................... 16
  The ‘real’ or ‘existential relationship’ ................................................................. 17
  The therapeutic alliance ...................................................................................... 19
  Alliance ruptures ............................................................................................. 21
  Resolving alliance ruptures ........................................................................... 22
  Interpersonal style, alliance and repetitive relationship patterns ..................... 23
  The transference relationship ......................................................................... 26
  The dynamics of repetitive relationship patterns ........................................... 29
Core Conflictual Relationship Themes (CCRT) ...................................................... 31
Mastery of relationship conflicts ............................................................................ 36
CHAPTER TWO

An outline and rationale for the studies in this thesis ........................................ 66

Summary of the introductory literature review.................................................. 67

Summary of research gaps identified in the introduction ................................. 68

The current study:

○ The aims of this thesis .............................................................................. 71

○ Major research questions ......................................................................... 72

○ Outline of specific studies ....................................................................... 73

○ Limitation and strengths ........................................................................ 77

CHAPTER THREE

Study One - Relationships between self-other differentiation, the group climate, and dimensions of cohesion and alliance in brief group psychotherapy ................................................................. 78
CHAPTER FOUR
Study Two - Alliance and cohesion predictors of outcome in brief group psychotherapy for depression ....................................................... 130

CHAPTER FIVE
Study Three - The impact of interpersonal relationship patterns on alliance and group cohesion: a study of significant events ....................... 151

CHAPTER SIX
Case Studies ........................................................................................................ 217

CHAPTER SEVEN
Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 244

REFERENCES........................................................................................................ 260

APPENDICES ........................................................................................................ 297
Appendix 1: Significant Event Scale
Appendix 2: Group Cohesion Grid
Appendix 3: CCRT pattern rating scale
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Mastery Phases and Associated Mastery Categories .............................. 37

Table 2: Group treatment sample compared with early dropouts ....................... 98

Table 3: Mean (SD) alliance and cohesion scores from early in treatment (Time 1) and end of treatment (Time 2) ................................................................. 100

Table 4: Pearson correlation coefficients of Working Alliance with Group Cohesion Scales – Early and Late Treatment ....................................................... 102

Table 5: Pearson correlation coefficients of Working Alliance with Group Climate Scales – Early and Late Treatment ......................................................... 103

Table 6: Pearson correlation coefficients of Working Alliance Group Cohesion Grid Distance Scales – Early and Late Treatment .................... 104

Table 7: Pearson correlation coefficients of the Group Cohesion Grid with the Group Climate Questionnaire (early and late in treatment) ........... 105

Table 8: Pearson correlation coefficients of the Group Cohesion Grid with the CALPAS-G (early and late in treatment) ........................................ 107

Table 9: Mean depression severity ratings pre and post-treatment ....................... 140

Table 10: Pearson correlation coefficients between alliance/cohesion instrument subscales and outcome measures ........................................ 141

Table 11: The Mastery Scale (Grenyer, 1994, 2003) – Mastery Phases, Associated Mastery Categories and Category Examples ....................... 176
Table 12: Examples of major presenting theme selection from significant event descriptions and configuration into CCRT terms and allocated mastery scores ........................................................................................................ 178

Table 13: Client Identified Significant Events Summary ........................................ 182

Table 14: Mean significance ratings fro the five significant events .................... 183

Table 15: Types of significant events reported ....................................................... 185

Table 16: Concordance ratings of significant events and CCRT patterns. ............ 186

Table 17: Pearson correlations between significant events and CCRT patterns concordance ratings and outcome ratings ................................................................. 188

Table 18: Therapist’s Working alliance ratings during each of the 150 significant events .................................................................................................................. 189

Table 19: Pearson correlations between significance and helpfulness/hindrance ratings and working alliance during the significant events.................. 190

Table 20: Pearson correlations coefficients between primary CCRT characteristics ratings and outcome measures and predictors................. 192

Table 21: Descriptives of mastery ratings of CCRT reconfigured components of the significant events across 150 events ...................................................... 193

Table 22: Pearson correlations of mean mastery ratings and outcome measures ...................................................................................................................... 195

Table 23: Pearson correlation coefficients between alliance and group cohesion outcome predictors and significant events mastery and concordance ratings .................................................................................. 196
Table 24: Description of significant events for Case One (Client number 11)...... 221

Table 25: Description of significant events for Case Two (Client number 18) ...... 230

Table 26: Mean ratings of alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation early in therapy for both Jill, Jack, their individual groups and the entire 30 case sample ........................................ 237

Table 27: Mean ratings of alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation end of therapy both Jill, Jack and their individual groups and the entire 30 case sample ........................................ 240
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1a  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions one and two early in therapy………………………………………..112

Figure 2a  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions one and two at therapy termination…………………………………………………112

Figure 1b  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions two and three early in therapy……………………………………………………..113

Figure 2b  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions two and three at therapy termination……………………………………………………..113

Figure 1c  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions one and three early in therapy……………………………………………………..114

Figure 2c  Rotated Multidimensional Scaling Plot highlighting indices distinctions (alliance, group cohesion, group climate and self-other differentiation measures) on the basis of dimensions one and three at therapy termination……………………………………………………..114

Figure 3:  Method steps for study three…………………………………………………..180

Figure 4:  When significant events occurred during treatment .........................184

Figure 5:  Frequencies of mastery category ratings during significant events ………………………………………………………………………………………………………..194
Preface

My interest in exploring what makes psychotherapy work stems from both my history as a clinician and my curiosity regarding the relationship between interpersonal processes, being human within a collage of experiential and interpersonal worlds, and mental health and behavioural issues. I also have an interest in exploring the similarities and differences between different therapeutic approaches (including both individual and group therapy) and their theoretical and philosophical underpinnings. This led me to the desire to gain a better understanding of the so called ‘common factors’ of psychotherapy and how they might be better understood and enhanced within a range of clinical settings.

This thesis focuses on aspects of the interpersonal interactions within group therapy treatment for depression. More specifically, it examines the potential associations between relationship phenomena and therapy outcome and attempts to elaborate this in terms of how individual experiences of therapeutic relationships may be influenced by previously adopted interpersonal relationship patterns.

More recently I have become more familiar with ‘recovery literature’ which describes people’s experiences of recovery from mental illness. Although recovery stories have become a catalyst for change (or at least reflection) in terms of how services are delivered, research exploring the intricacies of therapeutic interactions and their relationship with individual recovery processes is in its infancy.

It is my intention in this thesis to straddle qualitative-phenomenological with clinical-quantitative methodologies to examine individual recovery processes within the context of the dynamics and developmental processes of group psychotherapy for depression.