Mental health consumers' experiences of becoming evaluation researchers

Gillian L. Malins
University of Wollongong, gmalins@uow.edu.au

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG
COPYRIGHT WARNING
You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Recommended Citation

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
THE EFFECTIVENESS OF STRUCTURED FOOD PATTERN ADVICE FOR ACHIEVEMENT OF MACRONUTRIENT TARGETS IN NUTRITION INTERVENTION

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

LYNDA JACQUELINE GILLEN

Bachelor of Nutrition and Dietetics (Honours Class 1)
University of Wollongong

DEPARTMENT OF BIOMEDICAL SCIENCE
2005
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Department of Biomedical Science, University of Wollongong, is my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. This document has not been submitted in whole, or in part, for qualifications at any other academic institution.

____________________

Lynda Jacqueline Gillen

14th April 2005
DEDICATION

To my parents, Mavis (deceased) and Jack an inspiration still at 91 years of age,

to my second mum Joan,

my sisters Jeanette, Helen and Tracey,

and to my children David, Todd, Laraine, Brant, Jarryd and Adam,

and close friends Rose, Alan, Leonie, Paul, Barbara, Pat and Keely and Kay

for their continued support
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my supervisors Professor Linda Tapsell, for her wealth of knowledge and endless patience, and Associate Professor Arthur Jenkins, for his continued affable support. I would like to say a special thank you to fellow PhD candidates Janelle Barnard, for her generosity and friendship, and Craig Patch for keeping my eye on the ball (and for coffee). Thank you also to Karen Walton and Yasmine Probst for their cheerful support, as well as everyone at the Smart Foods Centre at the University of Wollongong, especially Stuart Parker, Nicole Smede, Petra Olbrechtova, Marijka Batterham and Anne McMahon. I would like to acknowledge the support of staff and student members of the Department of Biomedical Science at the University of Wollongong, especially Dr Barbara Meyer, Sr Sheena McGhee and Nola Hurt. Finally, but not least, a very sincere thank you goes to the staff and clients of the Illawarra Diabetes Service, without whose cooperation this research would not have been possible. A special mention here goes to Dr Robert Moses, for his research vision, and Meredith Kennedy, APD, for her clinical knowledge and sincerity.
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%E</td>
<td>Percentage of energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>American Diabetes Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADIPS</td>
<td>Australasian Diabetes in Pregnancy Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHA</td>
<td>American Heart Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALA</td>
<td>Alpha-linolenic acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANOVA</td>
<td>Analysis of variance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APD</td>
<td>Accredited Practicing Dietitian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AusNut</td>
<td>Australian nutrient tables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMI</td>
<td>Body mass index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMR</td>
<td>Basal metabolic rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHD</td>
<td>Coronary heart disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHO</td>
<td>Carbohydrate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVD</td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DASH</td>
<td>Dietary Approaches to Stop Hypertension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DH</td>
<td>Diet history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHA</td>
<td>Docosahexaenoic acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EE</td>
<td>Energy expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EE_{est}</td>
<td>Estimated energy expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E_{rep}</td>
<td>Reported energy intake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPA</td>
<td>Eicosahexaenoic acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food Authority Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPG</td>
<td>Fasting plasma glucose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FR</td>
<td>Food record</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDM</td>
<td>Gestational diabetes mellitus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GI</td>
<td>Glycaemic Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDL-C</td>
<td>High density lipoprotein cholesterol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGT</td>
<td>Impaired glucose tolerance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSFAL</td>
<td>International Society for the Study of Fatty Acids and Lipids</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KANWU</td>
<td>Kuopio, Aahrus, Naples, Wollongong, Uppsala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kcal</td>
<td>Kilocalorie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kJ</td>
<td>Kilojoule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kg</td>
<td>Kilogram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Litre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDL-C</td>
<td>Low density lipoprotein cholesterol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCN-3</td>
<td>Long chain omega-3 fatty acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNT</td>
<td>Medical Nutrition Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mmol</td>
<td>Millimoles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUFA</td>
<td>Monounsaturated fatty acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n-3</td>
<td>Omega-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n-6</td>
<td>Omega-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OGGTT</td>
<td>Oral glucose tolerance test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>Confidence value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAL</td>
<td>Physical activity level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P:S</td>
<td>Polyunsaturated: saturated fatty acid ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PUFA</td>
<td>Polyunsaturated fatty acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>Correlation coefficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBC</td>
<td>Red blood cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Standard deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>Standard error of the mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFA</td>
<td>Saturated fatty acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2DM</td>
<td>Type 2 diabetes mellitus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total-C</td>
<td>Total cholesterol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USDA</td>
<td>United States Department of Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLDL-C</td>
<td>Very low density lipoprotein cholesterol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PUBLICATIONS

Peer reviewed publications in support of this thesis


**Gillen L**, Tapsell LC, Martin GS, Daniels S Knight S, Moses RG. The type and frequency of consumption of carbohydrate-rich foods may play a role in the clinical expression of insulin resistance during pregnancy. *Nutr Diet* 2002;59(2):135-143.


Presentations in support of this thesis


Gillen L, Tapsell L. Targeting polyunsaturated-rich foods during low fat advice strategies for diabetes management ensures a better fatty acid profile than low fat advice alone. Proceedings of the 22nd National Dietitians Association of Australia Conference, Melbourne, Australia, 2004


Gillen LJ, Tapsell LC. Dietary advice targeting fatty acid guidelines for gestational diabetes mellitus requires reference to additional food groups. Proceedings of the ADS and ADEA Annual Scientific Meeting, Adelaide, Australia, 2002


Gillen L, Tapsell L. Utilising the diet history to formulate dietary advice for intervention research. Mahidol University 2001?


Tapsell L, Gillen L, Patch C. Linking dietetic research to dietetic practice using metabolic syndrome as a case study. 22nd National Dietitians Association of Australia Conference, Melbourne, Australia, 2004 [workshop presentation]

Tapsell L, Gillen L, Patch CS, Bare M, Batterham M, Owen A. Walnuts deliver ideal fatty acid profiles in the dietary management of type 2 diabetes mellitus. Experimental Biology. Washington DC, 2004

Bare M, Gillen L, Patch C, Tapsell L. Patterns of test food consumption in response to dietary advice to increase n-3 PUFA intakes. Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on Nutrition and Fitness, Athens, Greece, 2004

Bare M, Patch C, Gillen L, Tapsell L. Patterns of test food consumption in response to dietary advice in a clinical trial. Proceedings of the 22nd National Dietitians Association of Australia Conference, Melbourne, Australia, 2004
Tapsell LC, Gillen L. J, Barnard JA, Jenkins AB, Moses RG. Optimising dietary fat to prevent obesity? A dietetic approach in the context of gestational diabetes mellitus. AHMRC, 2002

**Non-peer reviewed publications**


**Other publications**

Tapsell LC, Gillen L, McMahon AT, Gutteridge IF, Owen AJ. Congruence of red meat descriptors reported by a group of elderly volunteers and those found in an Australian nutrient database. Proceedings of the Nutrition Society of Australia, Hobart, 2003
TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION ........................................................................................................................................3
DEDICATION ........................................................................................................................................4
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..................................................................................................................5
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS .............................................................................................................6
PUBLICATIONS ...................................................................................................................................9
TABLE OF CONTENTS ..................................................................................................................12
LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................................18
LIST OF TABLES .........................................................................................................................19
ABSTRACT ..........................................................................................................................................22

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION .........................................................................................................24
  1.1 EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICE IN NUTRITION INTERVENTION ..............................................24

CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW ...............................................................................................30
  2.1 DIABETES AND RELATED COMPLICATIONS .........................................................................31
    2.1.1 Type 2 diabetes mellitus ..................................................................................................31
    2.1.2 Gestational diabetes mellitus ..........................................................................................33
  2.2 EVIDENCE SUPPORTING MACRONUTRIENT TARGETS IN NUTRITION INTERVENTION ..................................................35
    2.2.1 Dietary fat .......................................................................................................................36
    2.2.2 Dietary carbohydrate ......................................................................................................49
2.2.3 Dietary protein ................................................................. 56
2.2.4 Summary of evidence on macronutrient targets .............. 58

2.3 APPLICATIONS OF THE EVIDENCE BASE IN NUTRITION INTERVENTION .... 60
2.3.1 Nutritional guidelines ......................................................... 61
2.3.2 Food guidance systems ......................................................... 66
2.3.3 Summary of applications of the evidence base ............. 72

2.4 APPROACHES TO NUTRITION INTERVENTION RESEARCH ...................... 73
2.4.1 Lifestyle approaches to nutrition intervention ................. 73
2.4.2 Trial applications to dietary fat modification ................. 75
2.4.3 Food pattern applications to nutrition intervention ....... 79
2.4.4 Relevance to substantiation research ......................... 84
2.4.5 Summary of approaches to nutrition intervention ....... 86

2.5 REQUIREMENTS FOR FURTHER NUTRITION INTERVENTION RESEARCH .... 87
2.5.1 In conclusion ................................................................. 90

2.6 HYPOTHESIS ................................................................. 92
2.6.1 Sub hypotheses ............................................................. 92

2.7 AIMS ................................................................................. 93

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 94

3.1 ESTABLISHMENT OF EVIDENCE FOR PRACTICE ................................. 94
3.1.1 Hierarchy of research evidence ......................................... 95
3.1.2 Randomised controlled trials ........................................... 96

3.2 METHODS DEVELOPMENT ...................................................... 96
3.2.1 Rationale ........................................................................ 96
3.2.2 Methods from previous dietary intervention trials.................................97
3.2.3 Construction of a model food pattern.....................................................99
3.3 BACKGROUND RESEARCH...........................................................................101
  3.3.1 Food pattern analyses ...........................................................................102
  3.3.2 Food Guidance Systems .......................................................................107
  3.3.3 Sources of bias in intervention trials......................................................114

CHAPTER 4 PILOT STUDY LINKING FOOD PATTERNS WITH CLINICAL OUTCOMES ..................................................................................................................129
  4.1 INTRODUCTION............................................................................................129
  4.2 METHODS....................................................................................................131
    4.2.1 Participants and Study Design ...............................................................131
  4.3 RESULTS.......................................................................................................135

CONCLUSION........................................................................................................141
  4.4 SUMMARY...................................................................................................141
  4.5 THEORETICAL SIGNIFICANCE .....................................................................144
  4.6 LIMITATIONS AND AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH..............................144
  4.7 RELEVANCE TO THESIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE .................146

CHAPTER 5 DEVELOPING FOOD PATTERNS TO GUIDE ADVICE TO ACHIEVE MACRONUTRIENT TARGETS ........................................................................147
  5.1 INTRODUCTION............................................................................................147
  5.2 METHODS....................................................................................................149
    5.2.1 Study design and theoretical evaluation................................................149
CHAPTER 5 RESULTS ..............................................................................................................160

CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................................170

5.4 SUMMARY .....................................................................................................................170
5.5 THEORETICAL SIGNIFICANCE .......................................................................................172
5.6 LIMITATIONS AND AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ................................................173
5.7 RELEVANCE TO THESIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE .................................174

CHAPTER 6 TESTING THE FEASIBILITY OF FOOD PATTERN ADVICE IN AN INTERVENTION TRIAL .................................................................................................176

6.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................176
6.2 METHODS .....................................................................................................................178
6.2.1 Participants and Study Design ...............................................................................178
6.3 RESULTS .....................................................................................................................186

CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................................193

6.4 SUMMARY .....................................................................................................................193
6.5 THEORETICAL SIGNIFICANCE .......................................................................................196
6.6 LIMITATIONS AND AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ................................................197
6.7 RELEVANCE TO THESIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE .................................198

CHAPTER 7 CONFIRMING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF FOOD PATTERN ADVICE IN SUBSTANTIATION RESEARCH .........................................................................................199

7.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................199
7.2 METHODS .....................................................................................................................201
7.2.1 Participants and Study Design .................................................................201

7.3 RESULTS ........................................................................................................209

CONCLUSION ........................................................................................................220

7.4 SUMMARY .....................................................................................................220

7.5 THEORETICAL SIGNIFICANCE .................................................................221

7.6 LIMITATIONS AND AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH .........................223

7.7 RELEVANCE TO THESIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE ..............226

CHAPTER 8 THE EFFECTIVENESS OF STRUCTURED FOOD PATTERN

ADVICE FOR NUTRITION INTERVENTION ......................................................228

8.1 SUMMARY ....................................................................................................228

8.2 LIMITATIONS IN STUDY DESIGN ...........................................................230

8.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH TO THIS THESIS ............................234

8.4 APPLICATIONS TO RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND CLINICAL PRACTICE 239

REFERENCES .....................................................................................................243

APPENDIX A: FOOD SUBSTITUTIONS USED FOR GI ANALYSIS IN STUDY 1 ...
..................................................................................................................................301

APPENDIX B: CARBOHYDRATE-RICH FOODS OF UNKNOWN GI EXCLUDED
FROM GI ANALYSIS IN STUDY 1 ........................................................................303

APPENDIX C: INTERVIEWER-ADMINISTERED DIET HISTORY
QUESTIONNAIRE IN STUDY 3 .............................................................................304

APPENDIX D: 3 DAY FOOD RECORD IN STUDY 3 ...........................................316
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4-1 Mean carbohydrate intakes from carbohydrate-rich foods by GDM and control groups ................................................................. 138

Figure 4-2 Mean carbohydrate intakes from foods of known GI values by GDM and control groups ................................................................. 139

Figure 5-1 The systematic development and evaluation of a good group pattern to guide advice to ensure energy and nutrient targets ................. 150

Figure 5-2 Categorisation of individual food portions based on equivalent macronutrient and fat compositions ............................................. 154

Figure 6-1 Changes in macronutrient intakes following treatment advice, control and intervention ................................................................. 189

Figure 7-1 Outline of dietary advice provided to each group ........................ 203
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4-1 Carbohydrate-rich food groups and subgroups used for analysis of food intake patterns ................................................................. 133

Table 4-2 Maternal characteristics of women with GDM and healthy pregnant controls a ........................................................................................................ 136

Table 4-3 Mean total dietary intakes for GDM and control groups .................. 137

Table 5-1 Rank order of the percentage (%) contribution of common food groupings to approximately 75% of macronutrient content of the diets of 16 women with GDM .................................................................................. 152

Table 5-2 Mean±SD and range for estimates of the main macronutrient content of food groups based on macronutrient composition .............. 162

Table 5-3 Comparison of existing food guidance systems and macronutrient-based reference food groups used to construct a pattern of intake to guide advice for diabetes treatment .................................................. 165

Table 5-4 ‘Ready Reckoner’ format for energy and macronutrient content of food groups ........................................................................ 167

Table 6-1 Example of individualised advice provided to each subject in the intervention group (8000kJ (2000kcal) per day) .......................... 182
Table 6-2 Exchange lists of foods with different fat profiles provided to the intervention group to support individualised dietary advice ..................183

Table 6-3 Maternal characteristics of the control group, intervention group and the two groups combined (mean±SD).............................................................187

Table 6-4 Target versus macronutrient intakes reported at baseline by the control and intervention groups and the two groups combined (mean+SD)....188

Table 6-5 Target versus macronutrient intakes reported following dietary advice (36 weeks gestation) by the control group and intervention groups (mean+SD)....................................................................................................190

Table 6-6 Numbers of individuals achieving dietary goals at baseline and following dietary advice (36 weeks gestation), control and intervention groups 191

Table 7-1 Example of individualised advice provided to each subject in the Walnut group (8000kJ (2000kcal) per day) .................................................................204

Table 7-2 Baseline characteristics of subjects from each group and for the total sample...............................................................................................................211

Table 7-3 Energy and macronutrient intakes of all groups at 0,3,6 months intervention: amount consumed (mean±SD) and number (percent) of subjects achieving dietary targets.................................................................212

Table 7-4 Change in weight, body fat, HbA1c and lipids over time.......................214
Table 7-5 Group mean differences between reported energy intakes (EI_{rep}) and estimated energy (EE_{est}) as an indicator of under or over reporting in the DH and FR.................................................................216

Table 7-6 Erythrocyte fatty acid composition for all groups at 0,3,6 months intervention.................................................................................................................218
ABSTRACT

Dietary advice to individuals in Medical Nutrition Therapy for the prevention and treatment of disease should be based on the best available evidence. A review of the evidence identifies appropriate nutrients on which to base advice. However, evidence to support the application of advice for the achievement of nutrient targets in free-living individuals has not been adequately determined. In this doctoral program the hypothesis tested was that structured advice based on the pattern of intake from food group sources of required nutrients will result in better achievement of dietary targets and thereby clinical outcomes than advice based on existing core food guides.

In developing a more comprehensive food guidance system, nutritional therapy for diabetes treatment provides an appropriate example in which individual macronutrients and the type of fat are targets of advice. A cross-sectional survey of the food habits of a sample of women with Gestational Diabetes Mellitus was conducted to confirm the relevance of food patterns to specific clinical outcomes, in this case, glucose tolerance. Secondly, foods commonly consumed by these women enabled the identification of food groups likely to impact on macronutrient and fat profiles within the diet. Subsequent determination of a total diet model demonstrated that a structured approach to dietary advice relating to nine food groups (vegetables, starch, fruit, milk, soymilk, meat, oily fish/soybeans, monounsaturated and polyunsaturated fats) for the identification of sources of saturated and unsaturated fats would achieve nutritional adequacy and targets for
energy and individual macronutrients with minimal variation. This then formed the basis of individualised advice in dietary intervention trials.

Applying the newly developed advice system in an intervention trial demonstrated its feasibility in women with Gestational Diabetes Mellitus. Compared with a similar group receiving standardised low fat advice, 80% achieved saturated and polyunsaturated fat targets compared with nil in the standard intervention group, without detrimental changes to the overall macronutrient profile.

The clinical effectiveness of the advice system was again demonstrated in a second trial. In this study men and women with Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus followed two alternative patterns of advice based on the newly developed food guidance system for six months. In these two groups respectively, 79% and 100% of subjects, achieved targeted proportions of total polyunsaturated fat compared to 25% in a control group (p<0.05). In addition, greater improvements were achieved for HDL-cholesterol (+18% and +21% compared to +13% control, p<0.05) and triglyceride levels (-12% and -11% compared to -2% control).

In summary, this thesis has outlined the development and evaluation of an advice system to support nutrition intervention in people with diabetes. Individualised advice based on a structured food pattern identifying food group sources of target nutrients was both feasible to implement and effective in practice. The application of this knowledge will help support nutrition intervention research as well as provide an evidence-based approach to Medical Nutrition Therapy.