Outlaws and their mortgages: an analysis of the Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW)

Erin Elizabeth Cahill
University of Wollongong

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING
You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Recommended Citation

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE
This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Outlaws and Their Mortgages:
An Analysis of the Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for
the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

University of Wollongong

by

Erin Elizabeth Cahill, BA (Hons) (USyd)

Faculty of Arts
2005
Certification

I, Erin Elizabeth Cahill, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Arts, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Erin Elizabeth Cahill

8 February 2005
List of Figures

Fig. 6.1 ..................................................................................................................... 172
   “Acts of Passion” Advertising campaign

Fig. 6.2 ..................................................................................................................... 173
   “Acts of Passion” Advertising campaign

Fig. 6.3 ..................................................................................................................... 185
   Frequency of lesbian and gay related issues, Sydney Morning Herald and the

Fig. 6.4 ..................................................................................................................... 185
   Thematic Article Breakdown (issues relating to lesbians and gay men): Sydney

Fig 6.5 ..................................................................................................................... 185
   Frequency of Law Articles (issues relating to lesbians and gay men): Sydney

Fig 7.1 ..................................................................................................................... 199
   A Comparison of population Indicators: South Coast of NSW Local Government
   Areas.
List of Abbreviations

DRAB: "De Facto Relationships Amendment Bill 1998 (NSW)"
GLRL: NSW Gay and Lesbian Rights Lobby
IVF: In Vitro Fertilisation
MARB: "Miscellaneous Acts Amendment (Relationships) Bill 2002 (NSW)"
NSWLA: New South Wales Legislative Assembly
NSWLC: New South Wales Legislative Council
PRA: Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW)
PRLAB: "Property (Relationships) Legislation Amendment Bill 1999 (NSW)"
SPRB: "Significant Personal Relationships Bill 1997 (NSW)"
TBWP: The Bride Wore Pink: Legal Recognition of Our Relationships
Abstract

This thesis is an exploration of the *Property (Relationships) Act 1984 (NSW)* (the PRA). This piece of legislation instituted what was, at the time, the most progressive and furthest reaching recognition of same sex relationships within the Australian legislative system. Whilst recognising the important implications of the PRA, there are two remarkable features of this legislation upon which this thesis focuses. First, it instituted a legally sanctioned hierarchy of relationship types within Australian law, in terms of legal rights and enablement. Marriage sits at the top of this hierarchy, governed at both the state and the federal levels in Australia. This is followed by heterosexual de facto relationships under NSW state law and then same sex de facto couples within the same jurisdiction. The second notable feature of the PRA is that its usage within the higher ranks of the NSW court system has been relatively limited. Specifically, there are no cases, in the court setting, of lesbian couples using the PRA. This thesis approaches these two issues by characterising the existence and effects of the PRA as contradictory. The PRA enables lesbians within the legal system in the same moment that it contains and prevents the application of full legal citizenship. It argues that the PRA produces a symbolic (homosexual) legislative figure characterised by contradiction in terms of legal coverage, citizenship rights and basic appearance in law. It argues too that although the gender neutral definition of de facto that the PRA produced allows same sex relationships to be recognised under NSW law, the Act also limits its applicability to same sex relationships (particularly lesbian ones).

This thesis counter poses two theoretical approaches to exploring and explaining the PRA- liberal democratic theory and lesbian outlaw theory. It argues that liberal democratic explanations of laws and legal systems rely on a specific avoidance of articulating contradiction whilst simultaneously producing this effect. Liberal democratic theory takes account of contradiction only in so far as it represents a temporary failure of the application of liberal democracy itself. Conversely, lesbian outlaw theory is taken to explore contradiction as a fundamental characteristic of knowledge production. Lesbian outlaw theory is developed throughout this thesis as a feminist Foucaultian framework. The critique of binary logic by both feminists and
Foucault enables an understanding of and a theoretical focus on contradiction that liberal democratic theory appears incapable of providing.

Through such explorations of contradiction two common notions—silence and truth—appear. This thesis examines the PRA by locating the sites of truth and silence involved in its production (the writing process, the parliamentary debates and the advertising campaign) and in its application (through a series of interviews with women in long term lesbian relationships). The project of this thesis then, becomes an exploration of the ways in which liberal democratic theory shaped the production of the PRA and the ways in which lesbian outlaw theory can account for and address the ramifications of this.

This thesis concludes that an outlaw interpretation of the PRA allows two primary things: the exploration of contradiction as a function and effect of the PRA and an encouragement of conceptualising this contradiction as productive in nature. This then has flow on effects to legal scholarship, which this thesis also explores. The thesis concludes that lesbian outlaw theory can influence legal theorising and practice in a manner that better accounts for the experiences of lesbians than does liberal democratic theory and hence advocates for its use in such a manner.
After four years in production, there is a veritable list of people who need thanking for their role in making sure that this thesis came into being.

To begin with, I thank my primary supervisor Dr Fiona Borthwick (Sociology, University of Wollongong). I thank her for her academic help, and also for her encouragement, subtle reminders to keep working(!) and her sense of humour, particularly in the past twelve months. I thank too, my two other supervisors who have been a part of this thesis at varying times. Rebecca Albury (History and Politics, University of Wollongong) encouraged me greatly throughout my undergraduate degree and has given me guidance that has always had my best interests at the fore. I thank her particularly for taking up the baton in reading the final draft of this thesis. My thanks go too, to Dr Catriona Elder (Sociology, University of Sydney) for her comments on my thesis. My thanks go too, to Associate Professor Susan Dodds (Philosophy, University of Wollongong) for her comments on the theory section of this thesis. I thank her too for her dedication to keeping me employed (and hence, fed!) in the final twelve months of this thesis and for her encouragement throughout. Also, thanks to Professor John Bern (Sociology, University of Wollongong) for insisting that I read the primary Foucault texts in my undergraduate degree, regardless of the tears that it caused, and in doing so, fostering my knowledge and passion for Foucault. I thank him too for his earnest interest in my work over the past five years. Finally, my thanks to the Faculty of Arts at the University of Wollongong and in particular to my School, for the dedication to postgraduate students that they have fostered throughout my time here, which has provided numerous opportunities and experiences that may not have been available elsewhere.

I also want to express my deep gratitude to the women who participated in this study- to Jack Draper, Sand Hall, Patricia Campbell, Jen and Jen, Jo* and Sarah*, Anne* and Margaret*. These women gave their stories for scrutiny, comment and publication, which in itself is courageous. More than this however, they gave their stories with passion, humour and with a genuine belief in this project. For this, I am grateful beyond

* These are pseudonyms.
words. I am also appreciative of the numerous discussions with individual lesbians and
lesbian based organisations over the past four years that has indicated support for this
project and have aided me in thinking through various arguments.

I am happy too, to at last have the opportunity to thank my friends and family for their
unwavering support and love throughout the often times painful production of this
thesis. They have enabled and encouraged this achievement and for that I am eternally
thankful. I thank all my fellow postgraduates for their various interactions throughout
the years. My particular thanks go to my friends Kylie, Renee, Deb, Jo, Debbie,
Myfanwy, Jodie and Eli who have fostered every step and provided important
distractions throughout when needed! And to my family: my parents Pam and Rowan
have always encouraged and enabled me to think and to excel in anything I have chosen
to do. They have been role models for critical thinking but most importantly they have
fostered within me a sense of justice and an aspiration for a better world which is the
prompt for this work. My brothers Damien and Tim are both excellent academics
themselves and I have valued their comments on my work. Most of all, I have and
continue to value their friendship and love and support. My Aunt Jenny has always
assumed a gentle encouragement and a genuine interest and belief in my life and my
work. Finally, my family of choice: Malinda, words will not express my love and
gratitude for *always* believing and just for being; and of course, to Kerrie, who has lived
through the worst of everything this thesis was capable of bringing and whose love and
support have enabled everything good this thesis has become. Gratitude, love and so
much more that I cannot express. Thank you for choosing to journey with me.