Efficacy of strategies to increase enrolment rates in disease management programs

Christina Hoang
University of Wollongong, choang@uow.edu.au

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG
COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Efficacy of Strategies to Increase Enrolment Rates in Disease Management Programs

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

From

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

By

CHRISTINA HOANG
B.Com (Hons)

Faculty of Health and Behavioural Sciences

2008
DECLARATION

I, Christina Hoang, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Department of Health and Behavioural Sciences and the Faculty of Commerce, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualification at any other academic institution.

Christina Hoang

March 2008
Chronic diseases have been growing in prevalence in the twentieth century and several factors have contributed to the emergence of what is now described as an “epidemic” (Crews and Gerber, 1994). These factors include complex social, cultural and technological changes, which have exerted a significant impact on the health of the population and have become large contributors of illness, disability and premature mortality (Swinburn, Egger and Raza, 1999). Currently in Australia, an estimated three million people suffer from one or more chronic conditions with the most common being cardiovascular disease, some forms of cancers, diabetes, asthma and mental illnesses such as depression (Australian Institute of Health and Welfare, 2004).

Disease management programs were developed as a means of overcoming many of the burdens associated with the mounting chronic disease rate and this is primarily achieved by reducing the incidence of chronic diseases through prevention strategies, delaying the onset of disability, alleviating the severity of disease and prolonging the individual’s life (Brownson, Remington and Davis, 1998). However, participation rates in such programs are well below their desired level and often reported as being a particularly problematic and complex issue (for example: Foster, Kendall, Dickson, Chaboyer, Hunter and Gee, 2003).

This study aimed to determine the most effective strategies for increasing participation rates in disease management programs using prospect theory (via message framing) and incentives.

Members of a private health insurance company received, on a random basis, either a letter or phone call inviting them to join a health program. The letter or phone call contained a framed message: positive, negative or neutral. In addition, half the sample population was also offered a small incentive upon enrolment in the Total Health program, that is, a post-action incentive.
The results of the study found no framing effects. Given the results, the use of tailoring should be examined as an alternative, and potentially more persuasive, means of communication. In relation to incentives, the use of a small gift or chance to enter a competition prize draw was found to be effective in influencing re-enrolment rates in two health programs. However, these same effects were not seen in relation to the use of a small monetary incentive. As a result, it is recommended that future studies test different types of incentives, both momentary and non-monetary, to determine the most optimum.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My deepest thanks...

Over the past three years, I have had the opportunity to work with a fantastic team of people – each of whom I owe a huge thank you.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisors, Professor Sandra Jones and Professor Don Iverson for all their guidance, hours spent reading and re-reading my chapters and endless advice. You have been great supervisors and words alone cannot thank you enough for all your support and dedication.

All the staff and members of Australian Health Management (ahm) for making this research possible.

Centre for Health Initiatives (CHI) team for your friendship – I could not have chosen a better team of people to work with.

My family for all their support and encouragement. Thank you mum and dad for being there for me every step of the way, and of course, my sister Tiffany who is always trying to distract me from my thesis by tempting me to go shopping.

My friends, especially those closest and dearest to me – Michelle, Katerina, Tracy, Loan, Renata and Catherine. You are truly the best friends a girl could ever wish for.

And last but by no means least, to Wentworth – thanks for the inspiration. I could not have picked a better muse.

Thank you everyone.

Christina


Hoang, C and Jones, S.C. (2004). The Impact of Different Types of Incentives on Re-enrolment in Health Management Programs. Proceeding from the Australian and New Zealand Marketing Academy Conference (ANZMAC) 2004, University of Victoria, Wellington*

* Note: Chapter 6 is based on Hoang and Jones (2004).
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Healthcare expenditure among OECD nations (as a percentage of GDP).
Figure 2.2: Australian life expectancy, 1901-2000.
Figure 2.3: Top 10 causes of years of life lost in Australia, 1996.
Figure 3.1: The chronic care model
Figure 3.2: Disease-management and self-efficacy
Figure 3.3: Relationship of risk factors to chronic disease
Figure 3.4: Total Health enrolment process
Figure 4.1: Prospect theory value function
Figure 4.2: The standard risky choice paradigm
Figure 4.3: The attribute framing paradigm
Figure 4.4: The basic goal framing paradigm
Figure 4.5: Message framing disparity
Figure 6.1: Participant information sheet
Figure 6.2: Sample preamble
Figure 6.3: Sample invitation letter
Figure 6.4: Questionnaire
Figure 6.5: Age distribution of sample population
Figure 6.6: Likelihood of joining for free
Figure 6.7: Amount willing to pay
Figure 6.8: Self perception of health
Figure 7.1: Outline of two stage study
Figure 7.2: Overview and rationale of the invitation letters
Figure 7.3: Stage one invitation letter process map
Figure 7.4: Overview of the call guides
Figure 7.5: Stage one invitation phone calls process map
Figure 7.6: Age distribution of sample population (stage one)
Figure 7.7: Gender of sample population
Figure 7.8: Gender distribution of Total Health participants
Figure 7.9: Age distribution of Total Health participants
Figure 8.1: Overview of the framed invitation letter
Figure 8.2: Overview of the standard invitation letter
Figure 8.3: Invitation letter process map
Figure 8.4: Overview of the call guide
Figure 8.5: Invitation phone call process map
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Common chronic conditions in Australia.
Table 2.2: Six costliest disease groups in Australia, 2001-02.
Table 3.1: Expected outcomes associated with disease management programs
Table 3.2: Relationship between various chronic diseases and risk factors
Table 3.3: Common risk factors associated with chronic diseases in Australia and their prevalence
Table 3.4: Expected outcomes of risk management programs
Table 3.5: Disease management programs offered in Australia
Table 4.1: Four way framing
Table 4.2: Message framing and health
Table 5.1: The effects of incentives on non-health behaviours.
Table 5.2: The effects of incentives on health behaviours.
Table 5.3: The effects of incentives on participation in health-related programs.
Table 6.1: Study design (pilot one)
Table 6.2: Conditions tested for the Living with Arthritis and HealthCheck program
Table 6.3: Re-enrolment rates
Table 6.4: Study design (pilot two)
Table 6.5: Benefit to others
Table 6.6: Chronic conditions (self)
Table 6.7: Chronic conditions (family/others)
Table 7.1: Study design (letter condition)
Table 7.2: Age distribution (letter condition)
Table 7.3: Influence of message frame (letter condition)
Table 7.4: Influence of an incentive (letter condition)
Table 7.5: Influence of message framing and an incentive offer
Table 7.6: Invitation letters results
Table 7.7: Study design (call condition)
Table 7.8: Age distribution (call condition)
Table 7.9: Influence of message frame (call condition)
Table 7.10: Influence of an incentive (call condition)
Table 7.11: Influence of message framing and an incentive (call condition)
Table 7.12: Invitation phone calls results
Table 7.13: Summary of sample population
Table 7.14: Breakdown of sample population by type of letter or call
Table 7.15: Stage one results by type of letter or call
Table 7.16: Influence of message frame on Total Health enrolments
Table 7.17: Influence of an incentive on Total Health enrolments
Table 7.18: Influence of communication source on Total Health enrolments
Table 7.19: HRA results
Table 8.1: Study design (stage two)
Table 8.2: Age distribution of sample population (letter condition)
Table 8.3: Influence of message frame (letter condition)
Table 8.4: Influence of an incentive (letter condition)
Table 8.5: Influence of message frame and an incentive
Table 8.6: Invitation letters results
Table 8.7: Study design (call condition)
Table 8.8: Age distribution (call condition)
Table 9.1: Influence of an incentive on enrolment rates
Table 9.2: Influence of stage on enrolment rates
Table 9.3: Influence of communication source on enrolment rates
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ahm</td>
<td>Australian Health Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMI</td>
<td>Body Mass Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COPD</td>
<td>Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>HealthCheck program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA</td>
<td>Health Risk Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LWA</td>
<td>Living with Arthritis program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Declaration ii
Abstract iii
Acknowledgements v
Conference papers arising from this thesis vi
List of Figures vii
List of Tables ix
List of abbreviations xi
Table of Contents xii

1 Introduction and Overview 1
   1.1 Justification for research 1
       1.1.1 Objectives 1
       1.1.2 Significance 2
       1.1.3 Rationale 2
   1.2 Chapter overviews 3
2. Australia’s Health: A Snapshot 9
   2.1 Health of Australians 9
       2.1.1 Health inequalities 10
           2.1.1.1 Socio-economics 10
           2.1.1.2 Indigenous Australians 10
           2.1.1.3 Structural influences 11
       2.1.2 The health of Australians compared to other OECD nations 12
   2.2 Main chronic diseases in Australia 13
   2.3 Contributing factors 21
       2.3.1 Ageing population 21
       2.3.2 Increasing life expectancy 22
       2.3.3 Declining birth rate 23
   2.4 Impact of chronic diseases on Australians 23
       2.4.1 Non-economic burden 23
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1.1</td>
<td>Premature disability</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1.2</td>
<td>Premature mortality</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2</td>
<td>Economic burden</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2.1</td>
<td>Impact on individuals and their families</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2.2</td>
<td>Impact on the Australian healthcare system</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2.3</td>
<td>Impact on employers</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Disease Management</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Chronic disease</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Disease management</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Leading disease management models</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.1</td>
<td>The chronic care model</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2</td>
<td>Chronic disease self-management program</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Theoretical foundations of disease management programs</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.1</td>
<td>Self-management</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.2</td>
<td>Self-efficacy</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Expected outcomes of disease management programs</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3.1</td>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3.2</td>
<td>Healthcare system</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3.3</td>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>Impact of disease management programs</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4.1</td>
<td>Successful management</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4.2</td>
<td>Reduce premature mortality</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4.3</td>
<td>Improve quality of life</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4.4</td>
<td>Reduce economic burden</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5</td>
<td>Impact of disease management programs on specific chronic conditions</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.1</td>
<td>Heart failure</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.2</td>
<td>Arthritis</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.3</td>
<td>Osteoarthritis</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5.4</td>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.1 Types of framing effects

4.2.1.1 Risky choice framing

4.2.1.2 Attribute framing

4.2.1.3 Goal framing

4.2.1.4 Four-way framing

4.3 Applications of message framing

4.3.1 Positive versus negative – which is more effective?

4.3.1.1 Marketing

4.3.1.2 Finance

4.3.1.3 International relations

4.3.2 Message framing and health

4.3.2.1 Defining positively and negatively framed Messages

4.3.2.2 Choice of wording

4.3.2.3 The disparity in framing health behaviours

4.3.3 Other influencing factors

4.3.3.1 Health behaviour

4.3.3.2 Issue involvement and level of processing

4.3.3.3 Emotions

4.4 Limitations

4.5 Summary

5. Incentives

5.1 Main principles pertaining to incentives

5.1.1 Operant conditioning

5.1.2 Norm of reciprocity

5.1.3 Social exchange theory

5.2 Popular applications of incentives

5.2.1 Incentives in a non-health context

5.2.1.1 Incentives and marketing

5.2.1.2 Incentives and survey research

5.2.1.3 Incentives and the workplace
5.2.2 Incentives in a health context
  5.2.2.1 Incentives and health behaviour change
  5.2.2.2 Incentives and participation/retention

5.3 Lessons learned and conclusions

6 Pilot Studies

6.1 Pilot study one: Australian health management
  6.1.1 Aim of pilot study one
  6.1.2 Study design
  6.1.3 Methodology
    6.1.3.1 Sample population
    6.1.3.2 Conditions tested
    6.1.3.3 Implementation
  6.1.4 Hypotheses
  6.1.5 Methods of analysis
  6.1.6 Results
    6.1.6.1 LWA program results
    6.1.6.2 HC program results
    6.1.6.3 Hypotheses results
  6.1.7 Discussion
  6.1.8 Limitations of the study
  6.1.9 Conclusion

6.2 Pilot study two: University of Wollongong
  6.2.1 Aim of pilot study two
  6.2.2 Study design
  6.2.3 Methodology
    6.2.3.1 Sample Population
    6.2.3.2 Conditions tested
    6.2.3.3 Procedures
  6.2.4 Hypotheses
  6.2.5 Methods of analysis
  6.2.6 Results
6.2.6.1 Sample population 158
6.2.6.2 Questionnaire results 159
6.2.6.3 Hypotheses results 163
6.2.7 Discussion 164
6.2.8 Limitations and directions for future research 165
6.2.9 Conclusion 165

7. Stage One 171

7.1 Experiment One: Invitation Letters 172
7.1.1 Aim 172
7.1.2 Study design 172
7.1.3 Methodology 173
7.1.3.1 Sample population 173
7.1.3.2 Development of the messages (framing) 173
7.1.3.3 Selection of the incentive 175
7.1.3.4 The invitation letter 175
7.1.3.5 Data management 176
7.1.3.6 Methods of analysis 176
7.1.4 Results 180
7.1.4.1 Message frame 180
7.1.4.2 Incentive 181
7.1.4.4 Message frame and incentive 181
7.1.4.4 Overall results 182
7.1.5 Discussion 183
7.1.6 Limitations 183
7.1.7 Conclusion 183

7.2 Experiment Two: Invitation Phone Calls 184
7.2.1 Aim 184
7.2.2 Study design 184
7.2.3 Methodology 185
7.2.3.1 Sample population 185
7.2.3.2 Development of messages (framing) 185
8.1.3.4 The invitation letter 226
8.1.3.5 Data management 226
8.1.3.6 Methods of analysis 226

8.1.4 Results 232
8.1.4.1 Message framing 232
8.1.4.2 Incentive 233
8.1.4.3 Message framing and incentive 233
8.1.4.4 Overall results 234

8.1.5 Discussion 235
8.1.6 Conclusion 235

8.2 Experiment Two: Invitation Phone Calls 236
8.2.1 Aim 236
8.2.2 Study design 236
8.2.3 Methodology 237
8.2.3.1 Sample population 237
8.2.3.2 Development of the messages (framing) 237
8.2.3.3 Selection of the incentive 237
8.2.3.4 The invitation phone call 237
8.2.3.5 Data management 238
8.2.3.6 Methods of analysis 238

8.2.4 Results 242
8.2.4.1 Message frame 242
8.2.4.2 Incentive 243
8.2.4.3 Message framing and incentive 243
8.2.4.4 Overall results 244

8.2.5 Discussion 245
8.2.6 Limitations 245
8.2.7 Conclusion 246

8.3 Stage Two (Combined Results) 247
8.3.1 Sample population 247
8.3.2 Hypotheses 250
8.3.3 Results

8.3.3.1 Hypotheses

8.3.4 Discussion

8.3.5 Limitations

8.3.6 Conclusion

8.4 Summary

9. Discussion

9.1 Overview of findings

9.1.1 Highlight of results

9.1.2 Message framing and incentives: Are they effective?

9.1.2.1 Message framing

9.1.2.2 Incentives

9.1.3 Secondary findings

9.1.3.1 HRA

9.1.3.2 Mode of communication: Mail vs. telephone

9.1.3.3 Age

9.1.3.4 Skepticism over program provider

9.2 Recommendations

9.2.1 Message framing: Consider tailoring instead

9.2.2 Incentives

9.2.3 Provide information brochures

9.3 Limitations and directions for future research

9.3.1 Limitations

9.3.2 Directions for future research

References

Appendices