What is the effect of non-clinical change on Australian GPs? : a survey of regional and rural general practitioners

Andrew Dalley

University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses

Copyright Warning

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation


Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au
NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
WHAT IS THE EFFECT OF NON-CLINICAL CHANGE ON AUSTRALIAN GPs?
A Survey of Regional and Rural General Practitioners

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the award of the degree
of

DOCTOR OF PUBLIC HEALTH
from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by
Andrew Dalley MB BS DipRACOG

GRADUATE SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH
2007
This work is dedicated to the very gentle, the very beautiful, the very loving and the very loved

Megan Joanne Dalley

Chops

(2nd October 1988 – 11th November 2007)

who has another father now.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to acknowledge with gratitude anyone who reads this work. Beyond that, I need to acknowledge my family before too many more run off to be married. If you don’t know them, they are five lovely ladies, one of whom is a GP and the other four are wise enough to be otherwise occupied.

In particular, I want to thank my supervisors, Professors Don Iverson and Patrick Crookes, and acknowledge their extraordinary capacity to enthuse and inspire.

And around Australia there is a group of academic GPs who one day found themselves agreeing to be electronic oracles. My thanks therefore to Professors Mark Harris, Claire Jackson, Peter Schattner, Justin Beilby and an anonymous contributor.

Dr David Perkins has retained his stiff upper lip under all sorts of duress in being my Honorary Supervisor Emeritus for all of the last 8 years and has my greatest respect as an academic and friend.

But the initial bars of the opus were played by Professor Kathy Egar when she first made the suggestion that I find something to keep my mind occupied, and Professor Denis Calvert who so politely overlooked my lack of academic virtuosity.

My thanks also to my brother, Bill Dalley, who edited the entire document and who, unfortunately, was able to locate only a small portion of his work.

And, of course, the anonymous GPs who told their stories, and did so willingly, with passion and often with humour.

Thank you, all.
Please see print copy for this quote

Charles Darwin
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction ........................................................................................................... 10
1.1 Rationale for the study .............................................................................. 10
1.2 Non-clinical changes in general practice .................................................. 11
1.3 Thesis logic ............................................................................................... 12
1.4 Thesis framework ...................................................................................... 13

The Environment of Non-Clinical Change Affecting the GP ......................... 15
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 15
2.2 Control and change in Australian general practice ................................... 17
2.3 The Australian GP ..................................................................................... 18
2.4 General Practice Strategy ......................................................................... 19
2.5 The position of general practice within the Australian health system ..... 20
2.6 The structure of general practice at the macro level ................................. 24
2.7 The structure and function of general practice at the micro level .......... 45
2.8 Australian rural general practice ............................................................... 63
2.9 General practice education and training .................................................... 70
2.10 Quality in general practice ........................................................................ 78
2.11 The cost and financing of general practice ........................................... 86
2.12 Regulating Australian general practice .................................................... 91
2.13 Consumers and consumerism ................................................................. 95
2.14 Concluding remarks ................................................................................ 103

Literature review ................................................................................................. 106
3.1 Perspective .............................................................................................. 106
3.2 GP management in an unchanging clinical environment ....................... 111
3.3 GP management in a changing clinical environment .............................. 117
3.4 GP management in a constant non-clinical environment ....................... 119
3.5 GP management in a changing non-clinical environment ....................... 120
3.6 Barren grounds ........................................................................................ 122
3.7 Concluding remarks ................................................................................ 122
Methodology ............................................................................................................... 124
4.1  Introduction ......................................................................................................... 124
4.2  Justification of qualitative methodology ............................................................ 125
4.3  Retrospective study ............................................................................................ 126
4.4  Errors, bias and validity ...................................................................................... 127
4.5  Generalisation ..................................................................................................... 130
4.6  Study outline ....................................................................................................... 131
4.7  Transcription ...................................................................................................... 151
4.8  Coding and analysis ........................................................................................... 151
4.9  Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 154

The GP Facing Change ............................................................................................ 155
5.1  Introduction ......................................................................................................... 155
5.2  The participant GP ............................................................................................. 156
5.3  Participants’ views of general practice ............................................................... 158
5.4  Participants’ view of themselves ......................................................................... 174
5.5  Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 188

Non-clinical Changes Reported by Participant GPs .................................................. 191
6.1  Introduction ......................................................................................................... 191
6.2  Taxonomy of non-clinical change ...................................................................... 195
6.3  Broad category 1: Increasing business complexity ............................................ 208
6.4  Broad category 2: Remuneration ...................................................................... 223
6.5  Broad category 3: Increasing CPD requirements for GPs .................................. 229
6.6  Broad category 4: Increasing consumerism ....................................................... 234
6.7  Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 238

Participant Response to Non-Clinical Change ......................................................... 240
7.1  Introduction ......................................................................................................... 240
7.2  Preparedness for change ................................................................................... 242
7.3  Environmental analysis .................................................................................... 247
7.4  Making the decision to change ......................................................................... 252
7.5  Implementing change ....................................................................................... 258
7.6  Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 261

The Impact of non-clinical change .......................................................................... 263
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The impact of change as it affected the GP</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Impact of change as it affected the practice</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 The impact of change on the consumer</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Introduction</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Non-clinical Change and the General Practitioner</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 The nature of non-clinical change</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Participants’ management of change</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 The Effect of Change on the General Practice</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 Change and the General Practice Consumer</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7 The GP, change and Government</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8 Summary</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 A model representing independent general practice .................................................. 22
Figure 2.2 A model representing general practice at the centre of the health system ............... 22
Figure 2.3 Age of the Australian GP workforce and GP trainees (2000) .................................. 30
Figure 2.4 Age of Australian GPs as a percentage of the total number of GPs (2000) .......... 31
Figure 2.5 GPs per 1000 population ......................................................................................... 33
Figure 2.6 Primary medical practitioners per 100 000 population ........................................ 41
Figure 2.7 Percentage rate of bulk billing by Australian GPs 1999 - 2003 .............................. 47
Figure 2.8 Indemnity claim payments change with time (all doctors) ................................... 52
Figure 2.9 Composition of GP consultations (%) by service type ............................................ 56
Figure 2.10 Medical workforce per 100,000 population by RRMA classification, 1995-1996..64
Figure 2.11 Drivers and barriers to the two major funding models ..................................... 90
Figure 2.12 Life expectancy at birth 1901 - 1990 ...................................................................... 98
Figure 2.13 Change in population of infants and elderly 1901 - 2001 ........................................ 99
Figure 4.1 Overview of the intended study methodology ....................................................... 132
Figure 4.2 Process of case selection ........................................................................................ 136
Figure 4.3 Revised study methodology ................................................................................... 139
Figure 5.1 Approximate age distribution of participant GPs .................................................. 157
Figure 6.1 Methodology utilised to determine case studies presented to participants .......... 192
Figure 6.2 Hierarchy of non-clinical change as experienced by Australian GPs ................... 199
Figure 7.1 A process of change ............................................................................................... 241
Figure 9.1 A process of change ............................................................................................... 325
Figure 9.2 The former role of GPs .......................................................................................... 334
Figure 9.3 The current role of non-delegating participant GPs ........................................... 334
Figure 9.4 The current role of GPs delegating duties to additional staff ................................ 335
Figure 9.5 Cascade of changes reducing GP stressors ......................................................... 340

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Primary care practitioners’ (PCPs) type of work by gender .................................... 38
Table 2.2 Services per full time GP ....................................................................................... 55
Table 2.3 Non-clinical changes confronted by Australian GPs as identified from literature  104
Table 4.1 Prioritisation of cases confronted Australian GPs ................................................. 138
Table 4.2 Changes presented as case vignettes to GPs .......................................................... 140
Table 4.3 Changes to the interview schedule ......................................................................... 149
Table 6.1 Changes identified by thematic analysis of interviews ........................................... 193
Table 6.2 Table of changes prioritised by all methodologies ............................................... 194
Table 9.1 Determinants of participant satisfaction and dissatisfaction .................................. 332
Table 9.2 Factors favouring referral to consultants ............................................................... 333
Table 9.3 Precursors of GP deskilling ................................................................................... 333
Table 9.4 Participant-reported causes of increasing workload ........................................... 339
Table 9.5 Factors influencing the adoption of new initiatives .............................................. 343
ABSTRACT

Australian General Medical Practices have undergone substantial change over the last two decades. This thesis identifies those changes and examines how a cohort of regional and rural general practitioners has responded to them. It also identifies the impact of environmental change on the GPs, their practices and their patients.

The methodology is largely qualitative, based on interviews with 20 practicing GPs in the Illawarra and Shoalhaven regions of Australia. Case studies were developed with the assistance of a group of GP academics from each mainland state, meeting as an electronic Delphi group. The case studies were selected to be of relevance and importance to most GPs in order to stimulate discussion about a defined environmental change.

The data were categorised using a stem-based framework supported by the software product Nvivo. Themes were identified and refined as the transcript of each interview was analysed. Themes were then categorised according to the response of the GPs’ to change and the impact of change on the GP, the general practice and the general practice patient.

The findings help in understanding how a cohort of GPs have responded to changes in their environment, how government has introduced reforms, and what response can be made to benefit the longer term delivery of primary care services in Australia.