2016

The Emotional Politics of Syrian Refugees Evoked by Australian Media Reporting Shame, Compassion, Fear

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.uow.edu.au/thss

University of Wollongong

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A count may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Bambrick, Tom, The Emotional Politics of Syrian Refugees Evoked by Australian Media Reporting Shame, Compassion, Fear, Geography and Sustainable Communities, University of Wollongong, 2016.
The Emotional Politics of Syrian Refugees Evoked by Australian Media Reporting Shame, Compassion, Fear

Abstract
On the 2nd of September 2015 the world's media fixated on an image of a drowned Syrian refugee washed up on a Turkish beach. In Australia this was followed by a policy decision by the Australian Commonwealth Government on the 9th of September 2015 to increase the humanitarian resettlement of Syrian refugees by 12,000 places. This thesis aims to explore the emotional politics of the Australian media and the corresponding public commentary, in reference to the proposed resettlement of 12,000 Syrian refugees in Australia. Adopting an approach that engages with the politics of emotion and draws on the work of feminist and queer scholarship, this thesis identifies the themes and sets of ideas that are produced and circulated by the Australian media over an eight month period. The results map the affective responses that were engendered by media representations, using these to explore what understandings of Australian citizenship are challenged or reproduced by the media's portrayal of Syrian refugees. Additionally, the thesis considers how the emergence of online media publications influenced the creation of affective spaces, enabling alternative discourses to be performed. It is argued that within the Australian media the dominant affective discourses of national shame, compassion, pride, fear and disgust are produced and circulated. The discussion around these argues that emotions of fear and disgust towards Syrian refugees are rekindling movements around White Australian pride, reproducing narrow understandings of the Australian nation. Working against this, the emotion of shame mobilises Australians to reconcile their past failures, generating the politics of compassion and evoking the nation's ideals of multiculturalism and a 'fair go'. These findings are partly the result of the dominance of national discourses, but they also indicated variances in affective responses across different scales. Furthermore, this study makes an important methodological contribution by demonstrating the importance of online methodologies and spaces in future studies engaging with the politics of emotion.

Degree Type
Thesis

Department
Geography and Sustainable Communities

Advisor(s)
Professor Gordon Waitt, Dr Thomas Birtchnell, Mr Ryan Fraser

Keywords
Syrian, crisis, refugee, resettlement, emotion, affect, media, Ahmed, politics of emotion, SGSC

This thesis is available at Research Online: https://ro.uow.edu.au/thss/11
THE EMOTIONAL POLITICS OF SYRIAN REFUGEES EVOKED BY AUSTRALIAN MEDIA REPORTING

Shame, Compassion, Fear

Author: Tom Bambrick
Supervisor: Professor Gordon Waitt
Co-supervisor: Dr Thomas Birtchnell
Co-supervisor: Mr Ryan Fraser
# Table of Contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS  
- VI -

LIST OF FIGURES  
- VII -

ABSTRACT  
- VIII -

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS  
- IX -

1 DEPARTURE POINT: ON A EUROPEAN TOUR IN THE MIDDLE OF AN UNFOLDING CRISIS  
- 10 -

1.1 STATEMENT OF AIMS AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS  
- 11 -

1.2 THESIS STRUCTURE  
- 12 -

2 THE SYRIAN CRISIS, MEDIA REPORTING AND POLITICS OF EMOTION  
- 14 -

2.1 THE GEOPOLITICS OF SYRIAN REFUGEES  
- 14 -

2.1.1 THE STATE OF REFUGEES AND THE SYRIAN CRISIS  
- 14 -

2.1.2 REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT IN AUSTRALIA  
- 15 -

2.1.3 MEDIA, REFUGEES AND POWER  
- 16 -

2.2 THE NATION AND THE POLITICS OF EMOTION  
- 19 -

2.2.1 NATIONS  
- 19 -

2.2.2 GEOGRAPHIES OF EMOTION AND AFFECT  
- 20 -

2.3 CONCLUSION AND SIGNIFICANCE: BUILDING ON EXISTING CONVERSATIONS  
- 22 -

3 METHODOLOGY  
- 24 -

3.1 JUSTIFICATION OF SELECTION OF MEDIA ARTICLES, IMAGES AND POSTS  
- 24 -

3.2 JUSTIFICATION OF CONTENT AND CONTENT ANALYSIS ALONGSIDE AFFECTIVE MAPPING OF ARTICLES  
- 28 -

3.2.1 CONTENT AND CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS  
- 29 -
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>AUSTRALIAN BROADCASTING CORPORATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>AUSTRALIAN BUREAU OF STATISTICS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>CONTENT ANALYSIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDA</td>
<td>CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DT</td>
<td>THE DAILY TELEGRAPH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS</td>
<td>ISLAMIC STATE, DAESH, ISLAMIC STATE OF IRAQ AND SYRIA OR ISLAMIC STATE OF IRAQ AND THE LEVANT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMH</td>
<td>THE SYDNEY MORNING HERALD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>THE UNITED NATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>THE UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 3.1: Graph of total media articles published per month…………………………… 25
Figure 3.2: Table detailing key events between August 2015 and March 2016……………… 26
Figure 3.3: Graph showing percentage of articles published in top 6 sources……………… 27
Figure 4.1: Graph illustrating total number of articles published over time as a proportion of each theme………………………………………………………………………………. 38
Figure 4.2: Graph illustrating tenor of articles as a percentage …………………………… 40
Figure 4.3: Cartoon published in Sydney Morning Herald article “Moronic lesser minds make a meal of migration”…………………………………………………………………………………. 43
Figure 4.4: Cartoon published in Sydney Morning Herald article “If you turn your back on Syria’s Muslims, forget about ‘Team Australia’”…………………………………… 46
Figure 4.5: Cartoon published in Sydney Morning Herald article “Christian or Muslim? It’s irrelevant if children are drowning at sea, Labour says”………………………… 47
Figure 5.1: Photograph Aylan Kurdi’s dead body on a Turkish beach in Bodrum………… 53
Figure 5.2: Photograph of a Turkish police officer carrying Alan Kurid’s body off the shore in Bodrum…………………………………………………………………………………. 54
Figure 5.3: Photograph “Droppin’ bombs, takin’ refugees” (Daily Examiner, 2015)………. 56
Figure 5.4: Photograph of a migrant family boards a train at Leleti station in Budapest……. 57
Figure 5.5: Photograph of Laith Majid hugging his children and disembarking a raft on the Greek Island of Kos………………………………………………………………………………….
Abstract

On the 2nd of September 2015 the world’s media fixated on an image of a drowned Syrian refugee washed up on a Turkish beach. In Australia this was followed by a policy decision by the Australian Commonwealth Government on the 9th of September 2015 to increase the humanitarian resettlement of Syrian refugees by 12,000 places. This thesis aims to explore the emotional politics of the Australian media and the corresponding public commentary, in reference to the proposed resettlement of 12,000 Syrian refugees in Australia. Adopting an approach that engages with the politics of emotion and draws on the work of feminist and queer scholarship, this thesis identifies the themes and sets of ideas that are produced and circulated by the Australian media over an eight month period. The results map the affective responses that were engendered by media representations, using these to explore what understandings of Australian citizenship are challenged or reproduced by the media’s portrayal of Syrian refugees. Additionally the thesis considers how the emergence of online media publications influenced the creation of affective spaces, enabling alternative discourses to be performed. It is argued that within the Australian media the dominant affective discourses of national shame, compassion, pride, fear and disgust are produced and circulated. The discussion around these argues that emotions of fear and disgust towards Syrian refugees are rekindling movements around White Australian pride, reproducing narrow understandings of the Australian nation. Working against this, the emotion of shame mobilises Australians to reconcile their past failures, generating the politics of compassion and evoking the nation’s ideals of multiculturalism and a ‘fair go’. These findings are partly the result of the dominance of national discourses, but they also indicated variances in affective responses across different scales. Furthermore, this study makes an important methodological contribution by demonstrating the importance of online methodologies and spaces in future studies engaging with the politics of emotion.
Acknowledgments

During my honours year I was privileged to have the support of my supervisor Professor Gordon Waitt and co-supervisors Ryan Frazer and Dr Thomas Birtchnell. I extend my immense appreciation and gratitude for your enduring support and patience.

Gordon, you have provided endless encouragement, motivation and guidance throughout this project. Thank you for your generosity in the hours put towards meetings, reading, commenting and editing and the enthusiasm you provided as a teacher.

Thomas, thank you for coordinating our honours cohort, you made our journey as smooth as possible with no surprises. My thanks for stepping in to provide comment on my work and introducing me to Scrivener, I don’t think I will ever approach writing the same way again.

Ryan, thank you for providing comments on chapters and helping to direct my readings. Also, for organising events with SCARF throughout the year which were both a welcome break and a chance to meet with refugees in our community.

Thank you to the staff at AUSCCER and the School of Geography and Sustainable Communities for great conversations and feedback on my work. It was great to be a part of your community throughout this year. Thanks to Elyse particularly for helping me with technical issues and being a sounding board throughout the year.

Finally, many thanks to my friends and family who provided ample distraction throughout the year and also to those who gave me a couch or floor to sleep on when I was without a home at the start of the year. Particularly Tess Spaven, thank you for being a great friend and honours buddy throughout the year, it was great to go through this journey together! I wish you all the best! P.S Thanks for the birthday tart!
1 Departure point: On a European tour in the middle of an unfolding crisis

“But if thought corrupts language, language can also corrupt thought.”
— George Orwell, (1946)

Spine tingling. The views from Jungfrau Mountain, Switzerland, can only be described as that. The sheer slopes of Europe’s ‘roof’ are magnificent and generate emotions of awe and wonder. This is where I found myself on the 2nd of September 2015, revelling in the final days of a ‘Contiki’ tour around Western Europe. The pilgrimage to Europe is framed in white Australian culture as a rite of passage, a process of becoming a young adult. Becoming a white Australian. What did not initially occur to me on this journey of ‘self-discovery’ was the privilege of touring Europe. That my birthplace had already instilled within my body numerous histories. Histories which part shape who I am and how I perceive the world.

In hindsight, my privilege – obvious in the above narrative – protected me from the crisis literally unfolding around me. Viewing Europe through the rose-tinted windows of a Contiki bus insulated me from day to day happenings. At first, I did not encounter the tens of thousands of people who were making the long journey into Europe, fleeing the war that was consuming Syria and Iraq. However, something was happening. Something that eventually did make me and millions of other Western individuals aware of the crisis at hand. On the 2nd of September photographs of drowned three-year-old Syrian Kurd Alan Kurdi were featured worldwide. Suffee (2015) suggest that this image re-framed the rhetoric in the media from scare mongering to a humane call for aid and hospitality. Suffee (2015) goes onto argue that the media images of the drowned body of Alan Kurdi prompted policy change in the Global North. Indeed, on the 6th of September 2105 the Australian Government announced additional resettlement numbers beyond the existing humanitarian program (Spinks, 2015). Three days later, the Australian Government announced “that it will make an extra 12,000 humanitarian places available in response to the conflicts in Syria and Iraq. People in the 12,000 place intake will be granted a permanent visa” (Department of Immigration and Border Protection, 2016, p. no pagination).
I first saw the image of the drowned body of Alan Kurdi on tour in Europe. The image made my own journey to Europe seem petty. This image generated emotions of shame and guilt in my own ‘western’ and Australian identity. Disgusted by the knowledge that other people must go through such hardship, while I am able to live a comfortable and free life.

Alive to the emotional politics of texts, this thesis draws upon arguments advanced by Sara Ahmed (2005) that texts are able to influence bodies – both individual and collective – to generate a range of visceral responses: disgust, shame, compassion and fear. It is also important to acknowledge the ‘aboutness’ of emotions (Ahmed, 2004). Emotion reflects a stance towards the world around us. Emotions are about objects and bodies. Emotions shape bodies and are shaped by them. My analysis seeks to identify the emotional politics of media reporting of the Syrian refugee crises in the Australian media and generate discussion in relationship to national identity. Australia is a nation that is built on migrants and finds enormous pride in our generosity during international crisis (Neumann, 2015). Accepting new Australians is an emotive topic. Migration is at the forefront of the nation’s conscious. Our anthem sings: “For those who’ve come across the seas we’ve boundless plains to share” suggesting that ‘we’ are a welcoming land, full of promise and hope. However, we also are a unique nation with natural borders, “Our home is girt by sea” –something that the national psyche has become increasingly obsessed with over in the past decade. Australia’s ocean borders enable Australian politicians to be highly selective when deciding who we let in, validating a fear of the other and strengthening a specific sense of national identity.

1.1 Statement of Aims and Research Questions

The research aim is to explore the emotional politics of the Australian media and its specific online commentary, in reference to the proposed resettlement of 12,000 Syrian Refugees in Australia. This aim is guided by three primary research questions:

- Firstly, what themes and sets of ideas are produced and circulated by the Australian media?
- Secondly, what understandings of Australian citizenship are challenged or reproduced in terms of how Syrian Refugees are portrayed in the media? This question guides the analysis and discussion of the chosen themes, with the aim of gaining deeper insight into how being Australian is constructed and imagined in the media.
Finally, how do online spaces enhance and enable affective responses to news media? This question aims to address the growing literature in geography and in the broader social sciences that recognises online spaces as sites where real life affective responses are documented, producing tangible spaces of hope, fear or shame.

1.2 Thesis Structure
The second chapter provides the political and academic background to the project. The chapter begins by providing an appraisal of the current state of refugee politics, the Syrian crisis, and the resettlement of refugees in Australia. Attention then turns to media geographies and in particular the intersection between geography, media and refugee resettlement. Finally, the chapter explores the processes of migration and refugee relationships with the nation. The conceptual framework is then outlined: the politics of emotion.

The aim of the third chapter is to chart the methods applied in the thesis. This is achieved in three parts. The chapter first offers a justification of the sample. Next, the chapter details how the interpretation of these media articles was conducted, using a combination of content analysis, discourse analysis and affective mapping. Then finally, the chapter recognises the concept of situated knowledge and provides insight into my own positionality.

Chapters 4, 5 and 6 address the research questions. In chapter 4 I answers the first research question – what sets of ideas are triggered in the media? The chapter does this in three parts, reporting on the results from the content analysis, discourses analysis and affective mapping. In this chapter I offer insights into how the media generated a politics of shame and I argue that this is what mobilised bodies towards compassionate political responses in September 2015.

Chapter 5 discusses the use of images in the Australian media to answer the question – how do visual representations of Syrian refugees inform which bodies (dis)qualify for Australian citizenship. The chapter does this through a combined content, discourse analysis and affective mapping of five images which were widely circulated in the media, disrupting traditional visual representations of refugees and working with and alongside textual representations. I argue that the images analysed evoke understandings of childhood innocence and the family. Additionally, the images contribute to the feminisation of refugees and I claim that this enables audiences to participate in the affective response of compassion.
Finally, chapter 6 discusses how online spaces enhance and enable affective responses to news media. To do so the chapter maps the affective response of comments on online media articles. This chapter provides insight into the ways that online spaces provide an alternative platform from which marginalised counter discourses can be represented. I argue that the online comment sections empower the politics of fear and engendered affective responses of disgust.

Finally, the last chapter pulls together and synthesises the arguments presented within the discussion. The conclusion contends that this thesis provides important insights into the way that the media embodies shared histories of the nation and that it is a mechanism through which affective economies are generated, performed and disrupted within the national public sphere. It argues that words, images and space are important and that each need to be considered in how the media produces affect.
2 The Syrian Crisis, Media Reporting and Politics of Emotion

The aim of this chapter is to provide both political and academic context. This chapter starts by offering insights into the geopolitics of Syrian refugees. I provide a brief history of refugees, the Syrian crisis and Australia’s response to it. It is argued that Australia’s history is dominated by migration, but also by a historical fear of the ‘other’ which has shaped Australia’s responses to refugee resettlement. Next, the chapter turns to academic debate in regards to the media portrayal of refugees. This scholarship investigates how the politics of media representation and how the media circulates particular understanding of refugees and the Australian nation. The third section introduces Ahmed’s (2005) work on the politics of emotion. Her work builds on feminist arguments that are concerned with questions of understanding what emotions do, rather than what emotions are. I argue that Sara Ahmed’s concept of the politics of emotions provides a helpful conceptual framework for mapping the affective politics of the Australian media.

2.1 The geopolitics of Syrian refugees

2.1.1 The State of Refugees and the Syrian Crisis

According to the United Nations Convention on the Status of Refugees a refugee is defined as:

“...a person who is outside his/her country of nationality or habitual residence; has a well-founded fear of persecution because of his/her race, religion, nationality, membership in a particular social group or political opinion; and is unable or unwilling to avail himself/herself of the protection of that country, or to return there, for fear of persecution.” (United Nations, 1951, p. 14).

Worldwide, the numbers of refugees rose over the past four years from 10.4 million in 2011 to 15.1 million during mid-2015. This is the highest levels in 20 years (UNHCR, 2015). As a result pressure mounted from the UNHCR on the affluent Global North, including Australia, to resettle more refugees each year. The war in the Syrian Arab Republic is the main contributing factor to the increased number of refugees worldwide. The Syrian crises accounts for 95% of the refugee increase since 2011 (UNHCR, 2015). In Syria there are an estimated 13.5 million displaced people who are in need of humanitarian assistance, 4.8 million of which are registered refugees (UNHCR -Syria Reporting Unit, 2016). The flow of refugees from Syria initially
resulted in ambivalent responses from the Global North. Since 2001, only 139,000 displaced Syrians have been accommodated worldwide within resettlement plans pledged by the Global North (UNHCR, 2015). This leaves the majority of displaced Syrian people in limbo, including some 400,000 Syrian people in need of urgent resettlement based on the assessment of vulnerabilities and protection needs (UNHCR, 2015). The resettlement debate featured strongly throughout world politics, with divergent responses. In September 2015, the German Chancellor Angela Merkel announced that Germany could take 500,000 refugees a year (Smith & Tran, 2015). The Canadian parliament pledged to take 25,000 refugees and by October 2nd 2016 has already welcomed 31,919 Syrian refugees with a further 20,823 refugee resettlement applications in progress (Government of Canada, 2016). Whereas, in October 2015 Hungary erected barbwire fences at its national borders in an effort to stem the flow of displaced Syrians.

As of October 2016, the Syrian Crisis and subsequent war against Islamic State (IS) continues. Currently many states are taking an active military role in the crisis. Some states, including Russia, Iran, Iraq, Belarus and North Korea, are concurrently fighting against IS and the Syrian Opposition, in support of the Syrian Republic. In contrast, western nations contribute to a Combined Joint Task Force, led by the USA; including Australia, France, the UK, Canada, Denmark, the Netherlands, Belgium, Germany, Jordan, the UAE, Morocco, Bahrain, Saudi Arabia and Qatar (British Broadcasting Corporation, 2016). These nations are committed to defeating IS whilst having no official standing towards the Syrian Opposition or the Syrian Republic. Australia, as an actively engaged actor in the Syrian Civil War, must ask itself the question – what is its humanitarian responsibility to those people the war displaces?

2.1.2 Refugee resettlement in Australia

The dilemmas posed by the resettlement of displaced peoples from war are not new to Australian political debates. The debate has featured in each decade, from the displaced persons of WWI and WWII to refugees from Vietnam, political asylum seekers in Papua New Guinea and most recently in the 2000s ‘boat people’ from Afghanistan. Historian Klaus Neumann (2015) presents the argument that in each instance Australia’s resettlement policy was heavily influenced by a historical fear of the other. In the early 20th century this was embodied by the ‘White Australia Policy’, which throughout the decades has shifted and changed to expand what an Australian body constitutes. The ‘other’ which the ‘White Australia Policy’ sought to exclude
has morphed from being eastern Europeans, to South-East Asians and finally to today’s Middle-Eastern individuals. According to Neumann (2015), in each case the media played a pivotal role in public perception and government policy. Additionally, in the 2000s and 2010s there is a substantial political significance placed on the national border. In the 21st century, the Australian Commonwealth government, echoing policies in the United States, has emphasised the notion of ‘border control’. The main reason for this as quoted in a report for the Department of Immigration and Citizenship in 2013 is “because it can” (Koser & McAuliffe, 2013, p. 4). A more nuanced interpretation is provided by critical scholars, including geographers (McMaster, 2001; Morrison & Crosland, 2001; Steiner, 2001). They argue that such new stringent border patrol measures are necessary as a way to perform a particular national identity, through controlling entry of the ‘other’ into the nation. An integral part of performing the Australian nation is the humanitarian programme; which enables the ‘right’ people to become part of the ongoing celebration in policy rhetoric that is ‘multiculturalism’.

The Australian Humanitarian Programme accommodates 13,750 asylum seekers, who must first be identified as refugees by the United Nations High Commission for Refugees. In addition, asylum seekers are assessed on: their degree of persecution, their connection with Australia, if there is another more suitable country and the capacity of the Australian community to provide for the permanent resettlement of the applicant in Australia (Department of Immigration and Border Protection, 2016). As argued by Neumann (2015), Klocker & Dunn (2003) and Flahive (2007) this process itself is highly selective, underpinned by questions of ideas of national identity, family and the exclusion of the ‘other’: those who do not conform to dominant norms. Neumann (2015) foregrounds migration in his work *Across the Seas* to examine how migration shapes Australian national identity. Alongside the decision-making processes of who becomes resettled in Australia, scholars have turned their attention to how the media has the potential to mobilise people to either open or close national, regional and city borders to refugees. The following section explores this literature.

**2.1.3 Media, refugees and power**

Migration to Australia can be framed through media reporting of human mobility. Understanding migration through media reporting alerts us to the processes of national belonging and exclusions. It highlights the importance of social difference, particularly along the lines of
ethnicity and race. Correspondingly, thinking of migration through the media reporting reminds us of the importance of cultural diversity and its role in generating creativity, and ways of living with difference. Equally, to investigate these questions critical scholars have turned to conceptual tools that enable them to think about power methodically.

Scholars across many disciplines and theoretical approaches acknowledge the critical role that media plays in modern politics (Bleich, et al., 2015; Bennett & Entman, 2001; McCombs, 2004; Klocker & Dunn, 2003). In particular, the media may give marginalised groups a voice, or silence them. In turn, media portrayals are argued to strongly influence shared public values that may operate as source of discrimination and prejudice. For those ‘othered’ populations there is mounting evidence that this pressure operates against sustaining a sense of belonging (Thorbjornsrud & Figenschou, 2016; Gray & Elliot, 2001; Dreher, 2003). For instance the relationship between the mental issues experienced by certain refugees and public the perception of refugees from particular ethnic backgrounds is a key factor highlighted within the resettlement literature (Murray, et al., 2008).

In Australia, the historical role of the media in evoking public sentiment towards shaping who the nation accepts or declines cannot be overlooked (Neumann, 2015). Importantly, the media through the use of images and words has the ability to humanise or dehumanise the refugee narrative (O'Doherty & Lecouteur, 2007). It follows that analysis of media representations of asylum seekers and refugees is burgeoning (Bleich, et al., 2015). This literature is clustered around significant events such as: the civil war in Yugoslavia, the period post September 11 2001 and the Tampa incident of 2001 (Klocker & Dunn, 2003; Bishop, 2003; Saxton, 2003; Slattery, 2003; Green, 2003).

This work reminds us that alongside printed words, the refugee discourse is also conveyed through pictures (Lenette, 2013). Scholars argue that media representations support and encourage marginalising practices (O'Doherty & Lecouteur, 2007) and are characteristic of the ideological political climate (Sulaiman-Hilla, et al., 2011). Lenette (2013) reminds us that the visual is an important aspect of identifying gendered representations, which may not be immediately apparent within language. Framing of refugees through the visual is a key factor in
circulating a politics of emotion (Bleiker, et al., 2013). For example, fear may be used to provide validity to different political agendas (Wright, 2004) such as in the aftermath of the September 11 attacks, where fear of Islamic extremism crescendoed and arguably empowered the policy decisions to pursue a war on terror in Afghanistan and Iraq.

The analysis of print media articles draws attention to the process of news-making as a highly vetted process; that is articles express specific views that are endorsed by the media outlets editors (Neumann, 2015). This thesis builds on work that acknowledges the analysis of the visual alongside the print medium, which is alive to gendered representations and the politics of emotion. One novel methodological contribution of this thesis is its analysis of the shift towards online mediums for news reporting. Particularly the opportunity this method of analysis affords for public commentary in the production and reproduction of certain ideas and politics of emotion. Mindful of ‘trolls’¹, the comment sections on online media articles allow for ‘raw’, that is unfiltered, public responses to be circulated within the public sphere. The use of online commentary provides a unique contribution to media discussion of the Syrian refugee crises in Australia, with online methodologies only in their infant stages at this time. Further consideration to the significance of the thesis is outlined in the next section.

Anderson (1991) identifies mass media as one of the primary agents through which the nation is imagined. White (2015) draws attention to the fact that earlier forms of mass media (including print newspapers) limited ‘communicative entitlements’ (Tolson, 2010) – the mechanisms through which people can participate in wider discussions and contribute to imaginings. White (2015) asserts that the advent of the Internet and the social networks that it enables has led to the creation on new public spaces, communication modes and most importantly new discursive opportunities. These new online discursive spaces represent spaces that are created by and open to everyone. Her study on YouTube comments investigates the ways that the Internet allows for every-day, banal expressions of nationalism.

These studies by White (2015) alongside those of McLean et al. (2016) offer insights into

¹ ‘Troll’ is a slang term used to specify a person who deliberately sows discord on the internet by starting arguments or upsetting people by posting inflammatory or off topic messages.
how social media enables the creation of dynamic online spaces that can be co-created by numerous individuals that are not co-present in time or space, a phenomenon that requires researchers to reconfigure their understandings of narrative genres. In doing so, researchers need to be “open to the variability in narrative and to abandon pre-defined ideas about what narrative is” (De Fina & Georgakopoulou, 2008, p. 384). All these studies draw on the notion of narrative as a network establish the idea of complex combinations of “filaments, lines and pathways” (White, 2015, p. 630) or more simply threads. Such ideas diverge from early models of narrative that focus on linearity (Bamberg, 2004; Georgakopoulou, 2014; Bamberg & Georgakopoulou, 2008). Georgakopoulou (2014) postulates that new approaches to narrative and discourse research in online media offers the possibility of focusing on “the more hidden and unofficial process of meaning making of ordinary people” (Georgakopoulou, 2014, p. 520). Thus, by using online media ‘alternative’ voices will be generated and can be used to further examine dominant and counter discourses emergent within the media.

2.2 The nation and the politics of emotion

2.2.1 Nations
The nation and how it is imagined is a critical aspect of this thesis. Understanding the ways in which the nation is generated aids understanding the ways that affect is produced and circulated throughout the citizens of Australia. The idea of the nation as an ‘imagined community’ suggests it is produced and maintained through industrial structures and cultural/political discourses (Anderson, 1991; Billig, 1995; Bauman, 2013). This is conceptualised in Smith (1991, p. 14):

“...as a named human population sharing an historic territory, common myths and historical memories, a mass, public culture, common economy and common legal rights and duties for all members.”

Nations are referred to as imagined in this way because in even the smallest nation members, its citizens, will never know most of their fellow members (Anderson, 1991, p. 617). Thus their collective identity is “dependent upon the discourse's that form individuals into the seam of a collective narrative” (Popkewitz, 2001, p. 184). Accordingly, in order to be a part of the nation “not only do members have to imagine themselves as nationals; not only do they have to imagine their nation as a community; but they must also imagine that they know what a nation is; and
they have to identify the identity of their own nation.” (Billig, 1995, p. 68). All of these shared understandings connect to form the ‘shared beliefs’ that constitute nationhood, giving rise to the pronouns ‘us’, ‘we’, ‘our’, and ‘them’.

In western nations daily iterations of nationhood must be performed, thereby ‘flagging’ the nation. Billig (1995) refers to such performances as the unconscious aspects of nationalism in the study Banal Nationalism. Billig argues that the more mundane processes of nationalism have been largely ignored in lieu of a focus on more extreme forms. Among the mundane processes Billig refers to are forms of rhetorical pointing in which assumptions of nationhood are ‘flagged discursively’. Billig (1995, p. 93) writes: “‘We’ are constantly reminded that ‘we’ live in nations: ‘our’ identity is constantly being flagged”. Through the constant circulation of words such as nation, Australia and pronouns the past histories of the nation are generated and performed within the public sphere, generating narratives of affect.

2.2.2 Geographies of Emotion and Affect

Feminist and queer theories have recently been consolidated and extended through what Patricia Clough (2007, p. 1) declares is the “affective turn”. This is “critical theories turn to affect” at a time “when critical theory is facing the analytical challenges of ongoing war, trauma, torture, massacre, and counter-terrorism” (Clough, 2007, p. 1). Affect is the capacity for bodies to act, to engage and to connect. The concept of affect is used to engage with a range of phenomena that are taken to be a part of life: depression, euphoria, hope, panic, shame, hate, love, waves of feeling amongst many other things (Anderson, 2014). Affects can be and are attached to things, people, ideas, sensations, relations, activities, ambitions, institutions and other affects (Sedgwick, 2003; Anderson, 2014). Just within human geography affect is used to understand a wide range of geographies; fathering (Aitken, 2009), popular geopolitics (Carter & McCormack, 2006), landscape relations (Wylie, 2009), new forms of work (Woodward & Lea, 2010), race and racism (Lim, 2010; Swanton, 2010), alcohol (Jayne, et al., 2010), obesity (Evans, 2010), war and violence (O'Tuathail, 2003).

But then what are emotions? Ahmed (2004) explores the arguments that affect refers to capacities to affect (to act) and be affected (to experience); while emotions are how we articulate our bodily affects. She asserts that in practice and in bodily experience, emotion and affect
cannot be meaningfully separated. Additionally, she and other scholars of affect perceive emotions and affect as how we position our bodies in regards to objects in the surrounding world. Therefore, emotions are cultural practices as opposed to simply being psychological states. These objects can be anything affect refers to; things, people, ideas, and so on. The politics of emotion is the relationship between emotions, the language we use and our bodies. Following Ahmed, and for the purpose of this thesis, I consider the influence that emotions have on the body and the way that the body relates with objects and ideas to produce social relationships. Furthermore, I rely on the argument that emotions produced through words, images and actions hold affective power over bodies, individual and collective. Emotions affect bodies to produce collective politics which reveal the rhetoric and ideals of the nation.

Jean Halley (2007) asserts that a focus on affect not only draws attention to the body and emotions but also affective discourses focus on the “body’s capacity to affect and to be affected” (Seigworth & Gregg, 2010, p. 2). Ahmed (2004) describes this as an affective economy, in which she imagines emotions circulating between bodies – sticking and moving. As these emotional transactions occur, the emotions leave imprints that affect the way that bodies interact with the world around them. How affect is conceptualised by feminist and queer scholars relies in part upon Butler (1990), Berlant (1997) and Brown (1995), who show that social norms are the effects of repetition. Judith Butler asserted, through her work on language and the truth/power relationship of Foucauldian thinking, that it was through the repetition of norms that worlds materialised, boundaries were fixed and surfaces produced. Building on this work, Ahmed (2004) conceives of emotions as vectors that shape the surface of bodies enabling bodies to ‘feel their way’. She postulated that emotions shape the objects around them and are shaped by them, which makes them important to politics and public debates. Ahmed also explores the emotionality of texts. Texts through metonymy and metaphor generate or circulate bodily sensations, extending the mobility of some. Through the circulation of emotions affect can be taken on and taken in as ‘mine or ours’ thereby mobilising bodies.

An example that Ahmed (2004) provides is if a newspaper text claims ‘the nation mourns’. Through understanding emotions as vectors that can be ‘taken in’, the nation can be thought of as a collective individual that has feelings. This begs the question: what does it do to say the nation
mourns? Ahmed concludes that it is to generate the nation. This is because emotions are performative and can be achieved through acts of speech, particularly those which depend on past histories. The circulation of words creates links between ideas, allowing for emotions to move, stick and slide. Thus affective economies generate a narrative which can be mapped and interpreted to better understand which objects or bodies are enabled and which have their mobility restricted.

2.3 Conclusion and Significance: Building on existing conversations
This chapter briefly examined the complex geopolitics of Syrian refugees which is the largest displacement of people in the past 20 years and poses a number of social, political and moral issues for states worldwide. The response of states in the Global North is ambivalent with some states opting to increase their humanitarian programs, some fortifying national borders and others electing to actively engage with the conflict in Syria and Iraq.

Australian policies emphasises the protection of its national border in an era of increased international mobility and uncertainty, actively engages with the conflict in Syria and increased its humanitarian intake of Syrian refugees. The narrative of Syrian refugee resettlement in Australia is complex and the media affords an examination of how it has been shaped and reshaped in the public sphere.

Feminist and queer scholars, such as Judith Butler, demonstrated the way that social norms are the effects of repetition and the circulation of dominant ideas throughout the public sphere. This thesis argues that the media and its associated facilities are a major part of engendering social norms, dominant sets of ideas and emotions, then circulating them throughout the public arena. The mechanisms through which media is circulated has changed with the advent of the internet and digital media, resulting in a media landscape that is more dynamic and social than ever before. This has enabled counter narratives to find spaces where they can empower their ideas and develop spaces of affect that differ to the dominant national narratives.

The geographies of emotion is a growing area of academic inquiry, which seeks to understand how bodies are mobilised through affective economies. Sara Ahmed points towards the emotionality of texts as a way that affective economies can be mapped and interpreted by
researchers. By taking on this theoretical basis I seek to explore the emotional politics in the Australian media reporting of the Syrian refugee crisis.

The significance of a thesis analysing how the media shapes both particular sets of ideas and emotional politics of Syrian refugees is a least twofold. First, media representation and social perceptions are a key aspect of successful refugee integration into a new society (Ager & Strang, 2008) (Neumann, et al., 2014). Media representation impacts on newly resettled refugees’ sense of belonging, participation and inclusion (Dandy & Pe-Pua, 2015). Further, these factors are important for the mental health of refugees and how much social support they will require (Murray, et al., 2008). If media articles are indicative and productive of social perceptions (Bennett & Entman, 2001) they may help inform our knowledge of how refugees will be received in our communities. This research will be significant in ascertaining the reception of resettlement of Syrian refugees in relationship to understandings of being an Australian, and throwing light on nuanced difference between locations. Thereby, this thesis will inform scholars and policy makers on what measures of support are likely to be required for the resettlement of refugee in the coming decade and where sites of resistance to refugee resettlement may be strongest and why.

Second, literature surrounding media representations of refugees tends to focus on significant events, for example the Tampa affair² (Klocker & Dunn, 2003). The unprecedented announcement that Australia will welcome 12,000 additional refugees as a result of the crisis in Syria is such an event. This thesis is part of the contemporary scholarly and public conversation around Syrian refugees in Australia. The conversation generated in thesis is at the intersection of a number of large bodies of work: emotion, affect, refugee, migration, media, visual geography, and national identity and resettlement literatures. This projects particular focus on the emotional politics of affect allows the analysis goes beyond the meanings of texts and the Foucauldian power-truth relations to think specifically about what emotions do in the context refugee resettlement. The next chapter will outline the methods.

---

² The Tampa affair refers to an incident in August 2001, where Australian troops boarded a Norwegian freighter MV Tampa near Christmas Island. The commander of the vessel, Captain Arne Rinnan, had rescued hundreds of asylum-seekers from a stranded Indonesian fishing boat in the Indian Ocean and was attempting to bring them to Australia (National Museum of Australia, 2016)
3 Methodology

“Clearly emotions matter” (Bondi, et al., 2007, p. 1). However, thinking through emotions and what they have taken scholars beyond, implies a further account of representation and discourse. A lively methodological debate is now occurring in geography around how do we research that is alive to what emotions do should be performed. Theoretically, the concepts of emotion work against a prescriptive methodology that outlines how an affective reading of texts should be completed. No longer are scholars interested solely in the meaning of texts per se; rather, they seek to provide affective mappings of the force of things, their discourses and what they actually do. The aim of this chapter is to explore how I interpreted and applied these techniques that run throughout my engagement with geographies of affect and emotion. The chapter is structured into three parts. First, I justify the sample. Second, I offer an explanation of how the interpretation was conducted using a combination of content analysis, discourse analysis and affective mapping. Following Ahmed (2004) I provide a close and careful reading of texts, paying attention to the feelings that are produced. Finally, I acknowledge the notion of situated knowledge, and that all analysis is partial to a degree.

3.1 Justification of selection of media articles, images and posts

The sample of media documents were sourced from the online database ‘Factiva’. Factiva is a tool owned by News Corporation that aggregates media content from around the world and enables this content to be searched for specified terms. The search was constructed using the following criteria:

- Firstly, articles must have been from an Australian media source, in order to target conversations happening in Australia. This included both print media and online sources, a full list of which can be found in the Appendix.

- Documents must contain any of the key words ‘Syria*’, ‘Refugee*’ or ‘resettle*’. By utilising broad search terms the number of articles obtained was maximised, limiting the number of possible exclusions.

---

3 Unfortunately this meant that international media distributers such as the UK’s independent newspaper ‘The Guardian’ were excluded.

4 The ‘*’ symbol indicates the inclusion of any truncations of the original search term as per Boolean search operations.
Finally, the media articles must have been published within the time frame between the 1\textsuperscript{st} of August 2015 to the 31\textsuperscript{st} of March 2016.

This timeframe was selected as it encompassed several key events that potentially weighted the Australian media coverage of Syrian Refugees. The start of the study period was identified as the 1\textsuperscript{st} of August; one month prior to the death of Alan Kurdi on the 2\textsuperscript{nd} of September 2015. Although the least number of articles came from August (see Figure 3.1), this contextualises how Syrian Refugees gained coverage in the Australian media over the following months, peaking in September 2015. September recorded the highest frequency of articles throughout the sample period. This was the direct result of Alan Kurdi’s death and debate surrounding Australia’s response to the crisis. The frequency of articles subsided in October, but reached a second peak in November. This can be attributed both to the Paris attacks on the 13\textsuperscript{th} of November and the subsequent arrival of the first Syrian Refugees in Australia.

![Articles per month](image)

Figure 3.1 - Graph of total media articles published per month

Figure 3.2 is a table that gives an overview of the key events encompassed by the timeline, which were hypothesised as having some impact on the media coverage of Syrian Refugees in Australia. The resulting sample data-set was 2,161 articles. This was too many articles to undertake a meaningful analysis in the timelines of an honours thesis. Thus, I attempted to refine
the search by excluding ‘sports’, ‘obituaries’, ‘calendars’, ‘republished news’ and ‘pricing and market data’. This brought the number of articles to 1,619 with an additional 584 articles identified as exact duplicates. The final number of articles was 1,035.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Death of Alan Kurdi</td>
<td>02/09/2015</td>
<td>Alan Kurdi, was a three-year-old Syrian boy of Kurdish ethnic background whose image made global headlines after he drowned on the 2nd of September 2015 in the Mediterranean Sea, as part of the Syrian refugee crisis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia’s contribution</td>
<td>09/09/2015</td>
<td>The Australian Government announced that it will make an extra 12,000 humanitarian places available in response to the conflicts in Syria and Iraq. People in the 12,000 place intake will be granted a permanent visa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paris Attacks</td>
<td>13/11/2015</td>
<td>A series of coordinated terrorist attacks occurred in Paris, killing 130 people and injuring 368. IS claimed responsibility for the attacks. All of the attackers were EU citizens who had fought in Syria, some of whom had returned to Europe among the flow of migrants and refugees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First arrivals</td>
<td>16/11/2015</td>
<td>The first group of refugees (a family of five) under the government's special program for Syrians arrives in Perth. The family was originally from the city of Homs that had been ravaged by the Syrian civil war.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brussels Bombings</td>
<td>22/03/2016</td>
<td>Three coordinated bombings occurred in Brussels killing 32 people and injuring 316. IS claimed responsibility for the attacks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3.2 - Table detailing key events between August 2015 and March 2016

The distribution of these articles across media sources can be seen in Figure 3.3. The vast majority of articles were from The Australian, the ABC and the Daily Telegraph, with the remaining articles being spread across various national, state and local media outlets. There are only 2 national newspapers, 10 state and territory daily newspapers, 37 regional dailies and 470 other regional newspapers. All of the major newspapers are owned by either News Limited or
Fairfax Media. Meanwhile, independent media outlets such as the government funded *ABC online* present media that is sympathetic towards centre politics. Of the total number of articles 28% were sources from Fairfax media outlets, 39% from News Limited and 33% from other independent news outlets, including the ABC. It should be noted that the ownership of independent news outlet is often heavily dominated by both major media companies. Thus, it is expected that more conservative politics will be circulated within the media. A full list of the articles obtained and the media sources that they came from is available in the appendix (Appendix D).

An important decision in the selection process was the inclusion of contemporary media sources found online. The inclusion of online comments enabled the research to sit within a growing geographic scholarship that focusses on online spaces (De Jong, 2015). By doing so, I recognise the internet as a major way that information and media is disseminated within contemporary society. Additionally, online media is less static than its print counterpart. Online mediums have a more conversational tone, representing a dynamic ebb and flow of ideas and emotions than traditional print media (De Jong, 2015). The inclusion of online media makes

![Figure 3.3 - Graph showing percentage of articles published in top 6 sources](image)

- 27 -
sense for exploring the politics of emotion. Online media forums are a social platform through which cosmopolitan individuals can engage, helping to generate emotive spaces.

Those conversations attached to online media articles evolve into comment threads which are often many times longer than the original piece. Within this digital space, conversation threads are capable of flowing between online and offline spaces, being produced and reproduced daily, spreading from website to social media to coffee shop and then back online. The online takes on a magnifying stance collapsing the spaces between actors (McLean, et al., 2016). This enables geographers to gain insights to the emotions and affective forces that are circulating through public spaces.

A disadvantage of using Factiva is that outside of the original context, visual and formatting information is lost. This includes where the article was positioned in the newspaper (e.g., front page feature article), its layout and any images used alongside it. Using online articles has the advantage of providing access to the original context and formatting. The use of online materials also acknowledges the changing way that people are responding to, producing and circulating ideas and affective economies. Audiences are shifting towards consuming information with digital technologies, thus calling for a review of research methodology. This thesis contributes to understanding how research can be conducted that engages with emerging online spaces.

3.2 Justification of content and content analysis alongside affective mapping of articles

Media analyses within geographic scholarship have focused on revealing what ideas and representations were propagated within print media (Bleich, et al., 2015). Researchers often combined content and discourse analysis. In doing so they identified the role of the media in circulating particular ideas to sustain understandings of people, places and policies as taken-for-granted. Drawing on the ideas of the French philosopher Michel Foucault, insights are given to the role of the media in terms of how certain shared meanings that are aligned to particular interest groups or organisations are produced, sustained and or challenged.

Alongside these methods, I employed an affective mapping building on the work of Ahmed’s
Ahmed does not give an explicate set of methods to follow for her affective mapping. Instead she describes it as a close and careful reading of the texts, necessary due to their familiarity. The resettlement narrative that I have chosen to explore fits Ahmed’s description of being familiar and thus it too warrants the close and careful affective mapping that is evoked in Ahmed’s work. In order to examine how emotion worked to shape and align bodily space within the social space that is Australia I have followed Ahmed’s work closely by choosing material that circulated in the public domain. The analysis closely follows shared cultural meanings constituted through representations of Syrian refugees in terms of the visibility and silences of certain identities, places and practices that evoked emotional and affective responses. The analysis paid particular attention to how signifiers of refugees, asylum seekers, Australia, Syria, Muslims, Christians, families, children, men, women, volunteers, government policies, war, terror and death are felt through the body.

3.2.1 Content and Critical Discourse Analysis

The initial phase of analysis acknowledges the value of undertaking a content analysis for contextualising readers and developing a canvas from which further depth can be drawn. The result from this phase draws particular attention to the key events which framed the timing of the analysis. By doing so readers are made aware of the social conceptions which underpin representations frequently made in the media and how they are informed by policies and the mobilisation of affect. This phase aims to situate readers within the discussion occurring around Syrian refugees in the public domain.
Content analysis was completed by first reading through the raw text from Factiva. In doing so I gained an understanding of the broad shape of the media articles, and what ideas were present. Following this close reading I designed a set of coding rules which can be found in Appendices A & B. These coding rules identified key focal topics that the articles could be organised around. Using a manifest coding method which was loosely based on a prior study by Klocker & Dunn (2003), I coded each article into my predefined categories using the tool NVivo. After approximately a third of the articles I revised my categories to better reflect that articles, continuing to code into these revisions. This enabled me to quantify the themes that were occurring in the articles further narrowing field of articles that I would choose to use in my discussion. From this stage I identified five main themes as being the foundation for further and more qualitative analysis:

1. Resettlement locations.
2. Selection criteria.
5. Terrorism/security threats within Australia.

Content Analysis (CA) goes as far to demonstrate the ‘loudness’ or quantity of specific themes within media; however, it does not allow for the analysis how particular ‘truths’ are circulated and maintained (O’Neill, 2013). This is a case of quantity of a particular item not always translating into greater significance, particularly in the case of newspapers where multiple sources report the same event. Thus, the second part of this analysis focuses on selecting quotes from the coded articles which are particularly salient and applying the framework of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), which is the “analysis of the dialectical relationships between semiosis (including language) and other elements of social practices” (Fairclough, 2001, p. 123).

There is precedent for such a selective methodological process in both the process of framing (O’Neill, 2013) and in CDA (Dijk, 1991; Fairclough, 2001), where there is a “shared belief in the construction of meaning and an interest in the influence of power, but…retains focus on detailed analysis of particularly salient examples of individual texts” (O’Neill, 2013, p. 13).

---

5 The technique used in the in the image analysis which emulates CDA - see section 3.2.2.
CDA was applied to quotations identified during the content analysis. This analysis proceeded under the assumption that these quotations – as part of the national discourse -could be interpreted as one way that the public comes to understand and experience affect in regards to refugee resettlement in Australia.

3.2.2 Using Images and Online mediums

The second phase of the analysis examined images from the media articles. Visual texts enable the sharing of experiences that often are hard to put into words (Lenette & Cleland, 2016; Lenette & Boddy, 2013; Delgado, 2015). Visuals texts thus “provide an innovative avenue to understand the complex lived experiences of asylum seekers and refugees” (Lenette, 2016, p. 71). Photographs are a particularly important visual text because they can be powerful tools for eliciting affective responses from the public. In some instances, visual images may generate affective economies for social change, particularly in the lives of those depicted (Wright, 2000; Cao, 2013). Lenette & Cleland (2016), Huss (2013) and Stanczak (2007) remind us that social circumstances presented in a visual format are often understood as more authentic or truthful than textual forms. This can be explained as being a direct result of the proliferation of digital media technologies and the increase usage and access of digital cameras in everyday life. Lenette and Cleland (2016) highlight the ubiquity of visual communication in the modern world, with the use of websites such as Instagram, Snapchat, Facebook and Tumblr amongst others. Social media underscores the visual as an unquestionable contemporary medium of communication. Lenette and Cleland (2016) argue that this as a sociocultural shift towards a solely visual mode of communication, where images, particularly those in the media, have a significant influence on public opinion, lending legitimacy to the experiences that they depict.

Following O’Neill’s (2013) images were analysed using the structure of ‘framing’, a technique that involves the detailed exploration of the composition of particularly salient images using the criteria prescribed in O’Neill (2013, p. 13)6;

1. “Denotative content (the image’s ‘literal’ meaning’) including light, colour, shape and movement, and an elementary understanding of representation – people, objects. For human subjects: age, gender, race, hair, facial expression and eye contact, pose and

6 This methodology drew upon work by Rose (2007), Dyer (1982), Panofsky (1970) and Hall (1973)
body language, clothing, representations of activity through touch, body movement and positional communication).

2. Connotative content (how these objects relate to our culture; structures of meaning which elucidate other, additional and implied meanings).

3. Ideological content (how a viewer explains how this intrinsic meaning comes to be, revealing underlying attitudes).”

Additionally, images the context of the images will be considered, referencing the intertextual relationships that form between images, their articles and captions – as they assist in producing the viewer’s relationship with the image (O’Neill, 2013; Hall, 1973; Burgess, 1990). To determine the affective and emotional dimensions of the visual they were also subject to affective mapping. Ahmed (2004) talks about how images can seem “saturated or even ‘full’ of affect” (p. 95) and that through viewing the images is to be affected by the images. When analysing the images I explore my own bodily reactions to determine what emotions were present, however this is not to say that all Australians would be affected in the same way.

3.2.3 Online Commentary

The final stage of the analysis focuses on examining online spaces. The Internet provides an opportunity for online participants to take ownership over news media through the comments that they make on published articles. Comment sections are an extension of media articles that are cultivated and shaped by the readers, which is a significant shift from the static form of print newspapers where the only opportunity for audience participation was via letters to the editor. I argue that this is important because it enables the consumers of media articles to contribute directly to the affective economies that surround online media.

There is not a lot of precedence within the literature that describes how to undertake online research with many online researchers pointing to the sheer amount of available data as a barrier to designing a structured methodology. McLean et al. (2016) used the online space of a feminist Facebook page to disseminate a survey and monitor the post that were made there, whereas De Jong (2015) chose to use ‘lurking’ on her Facebook feed as a way to gather post and comments from chosen participants. Both of these methods rely on the social media structure, where posts and comments appear in a ‘news feed’ that is mediated by Facebook’s algorithms and the researcher’s personal usage of the site. Both are very different social contexts to the way that
comments on media articles are presented.

I chose to only select comments made on articles identified in the previous two phases. Comment sections can be organised in three ways; ‘oldest to most recent’, ‘most recent to oldest’ and by ‘most popular’. I chose to use the third option when selecting comments for use in the discussion as the online voting system represents an organic method through which online communities can collectively express the dominant point of view. This is similar to the way that White (2015) analysed comments on YouTube videos, drawing on the online community to select which comments they most supported, thus flagging discursively the ideas and affective responses the online community has/feels. This enables a unique narrative to be accessed. The comments may be in line with the ideas expressed in the article or they may present a counter discourse that works against the article.

3.2.4 Note on Comment Collection
The original research design was to examine the top voted comments on all identified articles. However, there were media pages from all media outlets that restricted the ability to comment at the time of publishing. Why this might be? I assume that it was to prevent highly negative (hate) rhetoric being published on their respective webpages. Where possible I attempted to locate similar articles or duplicates where comments were allowed. Additionally, all opinion pieces did not have the option of allowing comments.

3.3 A reflexive methodological approach
Feminist scholars argue that all knowledge is partial and situated. The feminists such as Sandra Harding (1992) and biologist Donna Haraway (1998) advocated for the concept of ‘strong’ objectivity through encouraging all researchers to be reflexive of the social power relationships within which knowledge is produced. In geography, since the 1990s feminist geographers have encouraged scholars to be reflexive. In practice this meant considering their personal and social positioning within research (Rose, 1997; Jensen & Glasmeier, 2010; England, 1994; McDowell, 1992). Despite critiques of the impossibility of ever documenting the unfolding power

---

7 Voting refers to ‘up voting’ or ‘down voting’ on a comment. Up voting adds one point to the comments score indicating support for that comment, whereas down voting minuses one point from the score and indicates disagreement with the comment. Comments can be arranged in order of their scores, thus providing an indication of which ideas are most supported by the community as a whole.
relationships that constitute researchers positionality (Rose, 1997), the debate has strengthened the practice of reflexivity. Not only are researchers called upon to think about the ideas they arrive with when starting a project—that is, their motivation for conducting the research—but also how these changed over the project. Alongside the conduct of research, the reflexivity debate has championed the importance of being aware of the researcher’s body, and what it can do in and to a project. Alongside the discursive, the performative (Bain & Nash, 2006) and visceral dimensions (see Longhurst et al. 2008, Waitt and Appleby 2015) of doing research are integral to feminist methodologies.

To write about oneself is a challenging prospect and often researchers merely position themselves in relation to their race, age and gender. However, as a consequence of my methodologies and broader positioning within geographies of emotion I must also consider my body as the ‘instrument of research’ (Longhurst, et al., 2008). The body in this sense is not separated from the mind but is the tool through which all interactions and emotions are filtered. This is co-constitutive of both my working and social life, where not only do I experience race, age and gender but also through the visceral body-space relations triggered by smells, tastes, gestures, reactions, clothing, glances and touches (Crang, 2003).

In this project the discursive and visceral are integral to the reciprocal relationships between the researcher and the project. For example, throughout this project I was made acutely aware of my race, age and gender through both reading the stories of Syrian refugees and also through my heightened awareness of this in my day-to-day activities. In basic terms I am a 22 year old white Australian male. I was raised in regional Australia in a non-religious household that encouraged me to be respectful to all people. I am actively engaged with the news and politics, however most of the information and media I receive is through the ABC online, Triple J radio and my social media feeds. I am a highly active user of social media and regularly share media content with my friends and family. For me, there is a focus on the visual aspect of this, with my main forms of social media being the photo-based services Instagram and Snapchat.

In my academic studies I am an active participant of the Human Geography community at the University of Wollongong and as part of this we regularly engage with our local refugee
communities. Through this I was exposed to numerous personal stories of refugees. Stories of hardship I can barely conceive. One personal journey I had the privilege to hear was from a man who was once one of the ‘Lost Boys of Sudan’. This is the narrative of 20,000 young boys who were driven from their homes in 1987 due to the civil war in southern Sudan. Most of the boys were only six or seven years old at the time. These boys fled to Ethiopia to avoid death or the risk of becoming child soldiers in the northern armies. From Ethiopia they were forced to walk more than 1,500kms to a refugee camp in Kenya where many spent the rest of their childhoods. More than half of the boys died during this journey. This story made my stomach clench in much the same way I reacted to first seeing the photo of Aylan Kurdi. It made me feel small and insignificant next to the wealth of human experience that refugees possess. However, the story of this man’s resettlement in Australia made me feel warmth in my heart and a pride for Australia that I don’t normally get in refugee conversations. It was refreshing for me to hear from the mouths of resettled refugees that their experiences with the Australian government had been overwhelmingly positive. I think before listening to firsthand accounts from refugees I was very inclined to believing the left-wing rhetoric that frames Australia’s refugee policies as overwhelmingly negative. Now I am mobilised to look deeper into these stories, taking on board the negative aspects of refugee selection, detention and processing in Australia, but also considering the good that Australia does do for the lives of the people who make it here, understanding that despite my nations shortcomings, refugees are at the end of the day the focus of my interests and their right to safety and dignity is what I find most important.

Another, way that I have tried to convey how the affective economies triggered by Syrian Refugee Crisis mobilised personal actions and responses is through the use of short anecdotes adapted from a journal I kept during my trip through Europe. The vignettes at the beginnings of chapters 4, 5 and 6 are one way to reflect on how my affective responses mobilised this media analysis.

3.4 Summary

This chapter contributed to the lively methodological debate that is cognisant of what emotions are capable of doing. A justification is provided for the sample and analysis of texts, images and online content. The analysis seeks novelty through the consideration of multiple mediums; textual, visual and digital. Through attention to online commentaries it is possible to
offer insights to how some people responded to the words and images circulated in the print media online.

In this chapter a justification is provided for the combination of content analysis, discourse analysis and affective mapping. This combination of analytical techniques offers insight into the sets of ideas that are being generated, circulated and reproduced and the way that the surfaces of bodies are shaped and formed by affective economies – thereby aligning bodily space with the social space of the nation. For that reason, the analysis will follow shared cultural meanings constituted through representations of Syrian refugees in terms of the visibility and silences of certain identities, places and words and pictures that evoked emotional and affective responses. Particular attention is given to how refugees, asylum seekers, Australia, Syria, Muslims, Christians, families, children, men, women, volunteers, government policies, war, terror and death are signified and felt through the body.

Positionality offers a technique to address the researcher’s relation to the research topics. Acknowledging the call for strong objectivity in research reflexively is deployed to think about the social power relationships within which knowledge is produced. I explored where I come from, my daily interactions, and how I am predisposed towards independent media outlets. I position myself as engaged with the refugee community in Wollongong, thus being alive to my body and how it might be influenced by the material covered in this thesis. I provided examples of how my body is viscerally influenced by the lived experiences of refugees and how this generates empathetic emotions for me. The thesis now turns to unpacking the analysis. The results are structured into three chapters; analysing the emotional politics of the words, pictures and online commentaries.
4 Syrian refugees and the emotional politics of media reporting

*Tired eyes mull the crowds that gather behind tall fences. The snipers glint on the escarpment, patrolling borders in and out. I hold a passport. It says I was born in Australia and so I can pass. They do not. Fortune meant that they are locked behind invisible barriers, made physical by the kicks and screams of burly soldiers. An American girl behind me cry’s in horror. Thud. Thud. Thud. The refugee boy curls, like one of those bugs from the gardens at home. He doesn’t move. I can taste bile, so I close my eyes.*

(Spain-Morocco border Source: Tom Bambrick reflexive travel diary, November 2015)

What sets of ideas are triggered in the media? In unpacking this question, the analysis revealed that Australia’s role in the “refugee crisis” was a central concern of media reporting on the Syrian conflict. There was a clear tension between ideas of Australia as a “selfish” or “selfless” nation. In this chapter, I will unpack this tension—its ideas and affective economies—by in three parts. First the chapter unpacks the emergent themes from a content analysis the sampled media articles and discusses how these themes sit within the literature discussed within chapters 2 and 3. Second, the chapter introduces some of the sets of ideas within these themes, highlighting the dominant narrative of compassion, alongside counter discourses of national shame and national pride. Finally, the discussion moves to explore questions around the politics of emotion. This chapter discusses how the media generated and circulated emotional economies of compassion, pride, shame and fear through the reporting on Syrian Refugees. The discussion within this chapter will provide an interpretation of how the language and images of the media were used to generate strong, visceral affective responses, tracing some of the links between ideas emotions and bodies. This will feed into a broader conversation of national identity. Words do not only represent- they may mobilise bodies to act and affect other bodies through the circulation of particular emotions, ideas and other kinds of evocation.
4.1 A self-less or self-interested nation?

4.1.1 Content Analysis Results

What themes are apparent in the sampled articles? Through coding the articles in NVivo, five emergent themes were identified. These were conversations around ‘resettlement locations’, ‘refugee selection criteria’, ‘national image’, ‘military action in Syria’ and ‘terrorism/security risks in Australia’. Temporally, there was no discernible difference in coverage between different media sources, except for the discussion selection criteria, which centred on religion. Fairfax Media and independent outlets maintained centre right politics and evoke Australia’s multicultural histories by ignoring the religious backgrounds of potential refugees and circulating a discourse centred around a generous Australia that focusses on ‘persecuted minorities’. Conversely, News Corp circulated media that questioned the compatibility of Australian culture with Islam focusing on a generous Australia that helps persecuted religious minorities. Additionally, by theme there was significant temporal difference across time.

![Themes over time](image)

Figure 4.1 - Graph illustrating total number of articles published over time as a proportion of each theme
Figure 4.1 illustrates that prior to the events of 2nd and 9th September 2015, the media conversation was dominated by three themes: ‘Australia’s military action in Syria’, ‘the national image of Australia’ and ‘selection criteria of refugees’. Meanwhile, media discussions concerning the terrorist risk of potential refugees and conversations on resettlement locations were present but not in large numbers. Figure 4.1 shows the dramatic increase in the volume of articles in September 2015. As the figure demonstrates the reason for this spike were increased discussions surrounding the themes of ‘resettlement’, ‘selection criteria’ and ‘national image’. Likewise, during this spike there was a large reduction in the numbers of articles on ‘Australia’s military action’ and ‘terrorism and security’ risks.

The proportion of articles across each of the themes remained like this until around the beginning of November 2015, which is roughly around the same time that the attacks in Paris occurred. At this time, there was a significant increase in the number of articles which referenced ‘the potential terrorism threat that refugees’ from Syria posed, and also a small increase in the number of articles on ‘Australia’s military involvement’.

After the spike in articles in September 2015, all categories steadily declined towards the end of the study period. Interestingly, the number of articles across all categories was significantly less than their starting levels. This illustrates the short-lived attribute of media conversations around Syrian refugees, where coverage of specific topics can experience a massive presence in the public sphere only to have reporting peter off into almost nothing.

4.1.2 Tenor of media articles reporting Syrian Refugees

What is the tenor of media articles reporting Syrian refugees? Tenor refers to the course of thought or meaning that runs throughout the texts and can be used to gain a sense of the substance of media coverage. Previous studies document the largely negative tenor that the Australian media representation of refugees and asylum seekers (Klocker & Dunn, 2003; MacCallum, 2002; Mares, 2001; McCombs, 2004; McMaster, 2002). For example, in Klocker & Dunn’s (2003) analysis of media coverage of the Tampa incident, they found that between 75.2% and 96.4% of media coverage was strongly negative in its tenor towards asylum seekers. They suggested that the media representation was defined by the issues that were most threatening to their audience (Martin, 2015; Sulaiman-Hill, et al., 2011) such as violent crime, religious difference and cultural deviance (Dijk, 1991).
Instead, the content analysis of media in this thesis was much more diverse in its tenor – 31% of the total numbers of articles were coded as negative, 24% of articles were coded as positive, whereas 45% were identified as either being mixed or neutral in their tenor (Figure 4.2). For example, sympathy was a reoccurring feature referring to potential refugees as “persecuted minorities”, “victims of terrorism”, “real human beings” and “genuine”. For example, in the *Hobart Mercury*, Syrian refugees were framed as “…members of persecuted minorities who can never realistically expect to go back to their homes” (Smethurst & Whinnett, 2015, p. 7) and then later as “…fleeing the violent campaign of Islamic State in Syria and Iraq. So many families displaced. So many women, children and families without a home. Some without hope.” (Abetz, 2015, p. 23). This rhetoric generates the ideas of Syrian refugees as being ‘victims’ and in need of the nation’s help. Further this article humanises the refugees to relatable concepts including families, women, and children. This legitimises refugees as ‘real’ people adding credence to the notion of Syrian refugees being genuine and worthy generosity from Australians.

**Figure 4.2 - Graph illustrating tenor of articles as a percentage of total coded**

Despite this there was still the ongoing negative tenor, particularly those focused on Islamic refugees from Syria, who suffered from the word association with the Islamic State. Potential Islamic refugees were consistently compared to their Christian counterparts and labelled as “anti-
western”, “rouge refugees” and “Islamic moles”. For example in the *SMH* Paul Sheehan reported in the article ‘Hard decisions at the heart of the crisis’:

“No is the hour. Because the border policies have been effective, Australia is placed to significantly ramp up its intake of refugees. There is no chance the electorate wants to import the Sunni-Shia schism via a large influx of Muslims dislocated by this conflict. That is a political reality. There have been too many incidents of Sunni-Shia conflict in Australia and too many incidents of anti-Western Muslim militancy, or worse”

(Sheehan, 2015, p. 16)

In this reporting he generates the idea that Islamic refugees will not only ‘import the Sunni-Shia schism’ to Australia but will also be potential anti-western Muslim militants. Months later in the aftermath of the Paris terrorist attacks *The Queensland Times* published in the article ‘Halfway house objections are not influenced by race’:

“The Paris terrorist attacks prove beyond any doubt that it only takes a few rats in the pack, a few bad apples amongst the overwhelming majority, to cause a lot of death, carnage and misery, in the name of Islamism, not Islam.”

(The Queensland Times, 2015, p. 23)

And Miranda Devine of the *Daily Telegraph* asserted that:

“Islamist fascists want to kill us because of who we are: decadent unbelievers, in their view. It’s not, as the Grand Mufti says, because we are Islamophobic or racist or because of our foreign policy. The reason people of the West are under attack is because we do not want to live under Sharia law in an apocalyptic caliphate with slavery and crucifixions sanctioned by Islamic law... Australia is just as vulnerable as Europe”

(Devine, 2015, p. 13).

Followed by the statement that “In the past 12 months Australia had: THREE terrorist attacks involving fatalities; SIX thwarted terror attacks.” (Devine, 2015, p. 13). These media reports reproduce the idea that there is a direct threat to the safety of Australians and the nation’s core
values and that Islamic refugees are ‘polluted’ individuals, bringing with them terror, unrest and misery.

Furthermore, within the theme of resettlement some Australian media reporting generated the idea that resettled Syrians will be a burden to Australian society. For example, a statement from MP George Christensen was published multiple times in the media;

“*Aussies must always get first go at filling Aussie jobs and only when there's no Aussie to do the job can a foreigner be brought in….But there's no rules regarding the tens of thousands of refugees that Labor wants to bring in. They either take a job an Australian can do or they go on the dole.*”

(Hutchens, 2015, p. 6).

However this rhetoric was challenged and called out (Figure 4.3) as an “*either-or-fallacy...Designed to prevent you from think [sic] that future of Syrian refugees may be capable of doing anything other than stealing your job or going on welfare*” (Hutchens, 2015, p. 6). Despite this, comment sections played a significant role in reinforcing this set of ideas. The specific effects of the comment sections role in producing, reproducing and circulating ideas will be explored in chapter 6. Having identified the different ways that refugees are portrayed and the different sets of ideas that were mobilised – differentiated by theme – this chapter now moves to explore some questions around the politics of emotions. Particularly the way that specific emotions may mobilised bodies within Australia and how those emotions reflect on national identity.
4.2 Shaming the nation

The generation and circulation of the idea that Syrian refugees are victims of IS asks the question “What can or should Australia do?” SMH (Sheehan, 2015). The Australian media’s immediate response, regardless of ideological background, was to shame the nation. For example, the headline “The bitter fruit of failure on refugees” DT (Akerman, 2015) and “Australia should do more to help” ABC (Middleton, 2015). Ahmed (2004) shows the need for nations to reconcile negative emotions such as shame and regain pride in the nation. The media generated pressure, building from both major distributors (Fairfax Media and News Corp), on then Prime Minister Tony Abbott to increase the number of refugees that the government accepted from the Syrian Crisis as a way for the nation to reconcile its national shame – “Australia ready to take more refugees from Syria, Tony Abbott says” SMH (Peatling & Hutchens, 2015); “Australia right to welcome refugees from Syria” The Australian (Stokes, 2015).

Whilst military action was on the table, the Liberal Government needed to decide if it would accept more Syrian Refugees beyond the existing humanitarian intake. Consecutive Australian governments have long been concerned with ‘who’ it lets through its borders (Neumann, 2015). As an island nation “girt by sea” the construct of Australia’s border has been at the forefront of the nation’s psyche since it was colonised. The 2013 election at which the Coalition Party regains government was centred on stopping the ‘uncontrolled’ flow of asylum seekers to Australia’s shores.
The Abbott government’s ‘Stop the Boats’ policy was widely referenced as being a successful campaign that enabled Australia to ‘regain’ control over its borders. The media circulated the notion that strong border protection in Australia had prevented the nation’s humanitarian intake from being swamped by ‘queue-jumpers’ and illegitimate ‘economic’ asylum seekers. For example, some media outlets even linked the idea of stopping the boats with preventing the tragic scenes unfolding across Europe: “The ‘very sad’ images of children ‘tragically dead at sea’ sprawled across television screens were a reminder that keeping people safe relied on stopping the boats.” (Australian Associated Press, 2015, p. no pagination). I argue that by presenting the hard-line border protection policies in the media and creating pride in Australia’s response to uncontrolled migration, room was created for a compassionate response that welcomed ‘genuine’ refugees. This is a rejection of the ‘soft-touch’ that Ahmed (2004) talks about in her work

“Across the length and breadth of Europe there is now a growing realisation that the soft-Left embrace of multiculturalism has been an abject disaster. In Sweden, Denmark, the Netherlands, Belgium, France, the UK, Spain, Italy and beyond, there has been a significant failure of Islamic migrants to assimilate into the local resident population”

(Akerman, 2015, p. no pagination).

Thus the media’s support and praise of the hard-line border protection policies mobilised a change in refugee rhetoric, from the hugely negative attitudes towards boat people, to Syrian refugees who are now legitimised by virtue of Australia’s own ability to select them. What follows is the imagining of Australia as the generous nation and the affective politics of compassion.
4.3 Affective politics of compassion, pride, shame and fear: Opening our hearts and closing our borders

“Australia is the world’s most generous nation for resettling genuine refugees when calculated per head of population and by national wealth, pipping Canada and Norway.”

The Australian

(Balough, 2015, p. no pagination)

Australia has an undeniable history of racism, starting with the notion of Terra Nullius (1788), the implementation of the White Australia Policy (1901), the Cronulla Riots (2005) and contemporary movements such as the One Nation Party (1997-present). Yet, in the quote from The Australian above, Australia is portrayed as the most generous nation on earth and its people are sick and tired of “compassion auctions” and the questioning of national border protection and humanitarian policies. The national discourse was transformed during the response to the Syrian crisis from one of ‘queue jumpers’ and the wilful failure to integrate refugees. To one where people were praising the contribution of refugees to Australia and the nations humanitarian settlement services that were now a "well-oiled machine” SMH (Hasham, 2015, p. 11). Australia became repositioned in the Australian media as the most generous and efficient nation in the world “no country integrates Refugees better than we do” The Age (Allard, 2015, p. 28). By imagining the nation’s generosity in welcoming some others, those that were deemed ‘genuine’ by the nation’s humanitarian processes, the nation became hospitable (Ahmed, 2004).

The notion of the generous nation had a number of effects. First it allowed the government to bring refugee discussions into the light on its own terms. No longer were the majority of refugee discussions tainted with unspoken guilt of detention centres and turning back desperate people. Instead, Australia reconciles its shame and becomes imagined as being hospitable because it ‘allows’ those ‘genuine’ ones to stay. Their response is not framed as something that the nation has to do. Rather, accepting Syrian refugees ‘of the right type’ empowers the nation as generous – evoking national pride instead of shame. Tony Abbott asserted that “When we see a problem we roll up our sleeves and do what we can to help’ Mr Abbott told parliament ‘that is the Australian Way” (Galbraith, 2015, p. 7). The comment on our national character evokes the politics of pride – generated through the use of words like the Liberal Party’s ‘Team Australia’.
However, in addition to the dominant discourses that evoked the politics of compassion and framed Australia as a generous nation, there was a counter discourse that addresses the question of which bodies Australia would allow to pass through its borders – one that threatens to conflict with Australia’s claim to generosity. Particularly in the aftermath of terrorist bombings in Paris the concern over the religion of Syrian refugees peaked. This was encapsulated in the Sydney Morning Herald that reported “Syria is the eye of a broader storm and the Muslim world is exporting its instability...via a mass exodus of people” (Sheehan, 2015). The tempest of Islamic refugees is imagined in these media reports as an approaching front that threatens to pierce the national borders and rip holes through acts of terror such as the Lindt Café Siege. The humanising effects of compassionate media reports are negated when the focus becomes the religious values of refugees. The comments of ASIO Director General Duncan Lewis, whose words were “chosen carefully” (Devine, 2015), became widely circulated in the media. He asserted that

“Australia has, of course, been a terrorist target long before we became engaged in the Middle East, as you know. But we are as a culture, we are as a society, objectionable to them and they want to attack us, they want to destroy us...These people are anti-Western.” (Devine, 2015)

---

8 On the 15th-16th of December 2014 a lone gunman, man Haron Monis, held hostage ten customers and eight employees of a Lindt café located at Martin Place in Sydney, Australia. The event was treated as a terrorist attack.
Returning to comments made in the *Daily Telegraph* by Devine (2015), she reinforces the threat of Islamic refugees, evoking fear in her audiences:

“*Islamist fascists want to kill us because of who we are: decadent unbelievers, in their view. It’s not, as the Grand Mufti says, because we are Islamophobic or racist or because of our foreign policy. The reason people of the West are under attack is because we do not want to live under Sharia law in an apocalyptic caliphate with slavery and crucifixions sanctioned by Islamic law.*”

She furthers this set of ideas in another article published in January 2016 –

“*Importing them en masse into Western nations where women are free to dress and behave as they please was always a recipe for disaster, but anyone who says so is branded Islamophobic.*” (Devine, 2016).

These statements generate politics of fear by linking the word Islam and Islamic to negative words; attack, apocalyptic caliphate, slavery, disaster and anti-western to name a few. Devine also unites her readership by drawing attention to the notion that these ideas are perceived as racist. In these reports it is claimed that a generous response is being hindered by the fear of Islamic refugees causing community unrest.
In the Fairfax media and other non-News Corp publications this counter discourse was rebuked by reporters. For example, the *Sydney Morning Herald* published, “If you turn your back on Syria’s Muslims, forget about ‘Team Australia” (Figure 4.4) and “Christian or Muslim? It's irrelevant if children are drowning at sea, Labor says” (Figure 4.5). This evoked the politics of shame, drawing on Australia’s histories as a multicultural nation and ideas of childhood innocence to mobiles bodies against racial prejudice.

Additionally, how are different ideas of generosity mobilised in relation to the Syrian crisis? A generous Australia is not neatly dived into two political spectrums of bodies who are compassionate and generous and bodies that are cold and hateful. Rather, from the quotes explored above people who express anti-refugee sentiment mobilise different ideas of generosity and responsibility. They operationalise an alternative understanding of care and responsibility. They instead say they believe our responsibility is to care for vulnerable Australians, such as the homeless, is stronger than that for refugees. They justify their belief through sets of ideas that place the responsibility to care for and protect “the nation” above the moral responsibility towards protecting those outside, others.

### 4.4 Summary

In the examples from this chapter the Australian media used its discursive power to reinforce narratives of the self-less nation, whilst also managing to incorporate politics of fear to justify our highly selective resettlement process. The emergent themes discussed in this chapter show that in the context of the Syrian crisis Australia looks both inwards and outwards. Outwards in the politics of shame, where humanising stories of the refugee journey evoked guilt in the national consciousness. To reconcile the nation of this shame bodies were mobilised to open their hearts through acts of compassion for ‘authentic’ refugees.

This posed the question: Who is an authentic refugee? The answer for Fairfax and independent news outlets rested on Australia’s rich multicultural past to circulate acceptance of persecuted minorities, reconciling emotional responses of shame and framing Australia as the ‘hero’ saving those *most* in need, regardless of faith or ethnicity. They used the concept of a ‘fair go’ and lending a helping hand to generate a dominant set of rhetoric that put aside racial prejudice. Opposing this News Corp’s *Daily Telegraph* used the question of ‘who’ to generate sets of ideas that dehumanised Islamic refugees and mobilised the politics of fear amongst its readership.
Through doing this they justified exclusively selecting Christian refugees using the safety of Australia and the threat of disrupting society as the main arguments.

Fast-forwarding to September 2016 only 3532 of the Syrian refugees are resettled (Anderson, 2016). Whilst the dominant sets of ideas in the media evoked emotions of compassion there was still the counter narrative of fear which worked against this. This has meant that the resettlement process is happening much slower than anticipated. This experienced threat of Islam continues to mobilise bodies to focus on security and border security. The ability to relate to and sympathise in the refugee journey is therefore extremely important for maintaining the politics of compassion. I argue that within contemporary society there are ways to achieve a greater sense of sympathy with refugees. One way might be through the critical use of both texts and the visual medium. The next chapter takes this argument further.
5 Visual texts: Emotional Politics of Pride and Shame Triggered by the Reporting of the Syrian Refugee Family

_Hordes. A flood. Its described that way in newspapers, but until you see it you can’t truly understand. Slowly they trudge on. Bags of clothes, pots and papers, marching onwards. Budapest is not the place for them. The look of sorrow in my own eyes is not mirrored in the eyes around me. Disgust. Abhorrence. They sneer and yell in languages foreign to me and to the marching figures. Nothing I can do, so I walk away._

(Scene Budapest Central Station

Source: Tom Bambrick reflexive travel diary, December 2015)

How do visual representations of the Syrian refugee crises in the Australian media inform which bodies qualifies for Australian citizenship and nationality? The aim of this chapter is attempting to answer this question by reporting on analyses of content, discourse and affective mapping of the visual aspects of the Syrian refugee crises. The chapter is structured into four sections. First, by way of introduction, a justification is given for why visual text should be analysed separately. Next, the chapter discusses the emotional politics of the Syrian refugee family; the recurring themes of ‘the child’, ‘the mother with child’ and ‘the father with child’. Examples are drawn to illustrate each theme. The discussion is informed by drawing on the work of visual studies from Blieker et al. (2013), Johnson (2011), Szorenyi (2006), Wright (2000) and Wright (2002). I argue that images of children and mothers work to generate the emotion of shame, which through processes of reconciliation evokes the politics of compassion. Additionally, I argue that the visual depiction of men in paternal positions challenges understandings of Middle-Eastern men as military figures. These images soften understandings of Middle-Eastern men and work to address the politics of fear within the Australian national consciousness. To conclude, I argue that visual depictions work to provide authenticity towards certain imaginings of Syrian refugees, which inform national understandings of who should be accepted in the resettlement process.
5.1 The importance of visual texts

Visual representations of refugees and asylum seekers flood the Australian consciousness through traditional and online media. The increased ability for images to be shared online, through social media and news websites, means that the 2015 Syrian Crisis is one of the most visually depicted migration events in history, as well as the largest since WWII (UNHCR, 2015). Indeed, visual depictions of refugees gained significant traction in public discourses throughout 2015 (Lenette, 2016). Following Haaken & O’Neill (2014) and Johnson (2011) I argue that critical analysis of images provides a deeper understanding of which bodies qualify for Australian citizenship and nationality and which do not.

Additionally, this section asks if images generate new representations of Syrian refugees and how these circulate affective responses. Previous analysis of refugee images published by Australian media identified a number of common themes between widely circulated images. For example, Lenette & Cleland (2016, p. 71) listed eight of the most common themes. They constructed a list drawing on the studies from Blieker et al. (2013), Johnson (2011), Szorenyi (2006), Wright (2000) and Wright (2002).

- “Women depicted as vulnerable mothers with children or babies (“Madonna and Child” pose), and feminisation of refugee representations;
- Recurring images of children, often with dirty or ripped clothing;
- Unidentifiable masses or processions of people;
- People with obscured or out of focus faces;
- Subdued facial expressions;
- Lack of easily identifiable focal point;
- Military personnel and warfare equipment; and
- Desolate settings.”

The following will present a discussion centred on images themed by understandings of the Syrian refugee family. Images of the Syrian refugee family were selected to engage with the question of who belongs in the Australian nation. The discussion will draw attention to the framing of the image and the affective politics of compassion, pride, shame and fear.
5.2 Recurring images of children: The Silent Scream of the Boy on the Beach

The first image to be analysed is the image of three year old Alan Kurdi’s lifeless body washed ashore on a Turkish Beach. Images of Aylan Kurdi lying dead on the Turkish beach first appeared in the Australian media on the 3rd of September 2015 - “Drowned Migrant child symbolises tragedy sweeping Europe” The Weekend Australian, (The Australian, 2015). There are a number of different images that were reported, but all showed the limp, lifeless body of a Syrian toddler in a red t-shirt and blue denim shorts. This section will consider two original images, taken by Nilufer Demir a Turkish photographer. The images were circulated in both sides of the Australian media sphere, appearing in News Corps national broadsheet The Australian and in Fairfax’s major newspapers the Sydney Morning Herald and The Age (the image was then circulated amongst the media companies’ state and regional publications as well as online). The argument that I present here is that the circulation of the Alan Kurdi’s dead body was employed not only to humanise the unfolding events in Syria but as an affective mechanism to mobilise a political response.

The image in Figure 5.1 shows Aylan on a beach in Bodrum Turkey, water lapping against his head as a Turkish official stands over him. The direction of the officials gaze pulls the viewer’s eyes towards Aylan body, and the light colours of the ocean and the beach contrast against Aylan’s red shirt and blue shorts making him the focal point of the image. His clothes are western in nature and his skin appears pale. This allows the (western) viewer to imagine the child as any little boy, perhaps even their own. The image is also peaceful in its appearance, Aylan appears as though he could be asleep with no visible signs of injury and the Turkish figure is non-threatening, particularly in Figure 5.2 where he can be seen carrying Aylan’s limp body tenderly. In this second depiction of the image the Turkish figures face is averting his gaze from the body, his own guilt and sorrow apparent. This images focus on a single figure distances it from the traditional refugee image. By focusing on Aylan the image makes the death personal, the end to a particular refugee’s narrative an end that whilst common is not published in the media often, if at all. This photograph is humanising in nature and highlights the reality for some displaced Syrians. It demonstrates to Australian viewers the tragic consequences of closed borders.
These images of Aylan Kurdi rely on sets of ideas pertaining to childhood and children. There is a regime of truth in the western world that positions children as innocent (Holloway & Valentine, 2000). Children in western cultures are assumed to have the right to a childhood of innocence and freedom from the responsibilities of the adult world. It follows that adults have a duty to protect children, reproducing the shared understanding that all children should have a safe and enjoyable childhood. Understandings of the child and childhood as both safe and innocent give the images of Alan Kurdi power by illustrating his death as a human tragedy – nobody would wish an early death upon a child or even the traumatic journeys of refugees. However, this is the lived reality of refugees.
Initial reports positioned the tragedy as a European issue, separating the need for action in Australia to be taken. The image was described in visceral terms as ‘harrowing’ and ‘gut wrenching’. The soft colours of the ocean and the Aylan’s peaceful pose make the image appear quite, inviting the viewer to reflect and not avert their gaze. The blue tones accentuate a feeling of acute sorrow, one that can be felt rising within your throat. The image generates a feeling of shame at the failure for ‘adults’ in western nations in protect the innocence and safety of his childhood. As children have a right to be safe the image not only evokes grief at the death of a child, but also has the power to mobilise politics of shame. The politics of shame mobilises self-reflection of failing to live up to expectations. This is reflected within the titles of media reports at this time; ‘Syrian Refugee crisis: We’re failing to do our part’ ABC (Attard, 2015), ‘Syrian refugees: how our collective imagination has failed us’ SMH (Beard, 2015) and ‘The bitter fruit of failure on refugees’ DT (Akerman, 2015). The affective responses of shame mobilise the readership to call for political change, as demonstrated by the image’s re-circulation and reproduction. The nature of the image is that it cannot be ignored; it leaves an imprint on the body, a bad taste in the mouth. The image evoked ideas of safe childhoods being violated, however the direct link between Australia’s actions and the death of Alan Kurdi is not explicitly
established through this image. Instead this is done through intertextual representations of war, women and children.

5.3 Women depicted as vulnerable mothers with children: Droppin’ Bombs Takin’ Refugees

The next image, Figure 5.3, is selected as an example of many within the reoccurring theme of vulnerable mothers and their children. This particular image was published in *The Australian*, *The Advertiser* and the *Northern Daily Leader* and taken by Turkish photographer Yasin Akgul. It depicts Syrian-Kurdish woman with her child in the city of Kobani. Kobani is a border town in northern Syria and was the scene of some of the fiercest fighting of the Syrian civil war. It was liberated from IS militants in January 2015, however the city – home to almost 300,000 people – was left in ruins from air strikes and shelling.

I selected this image as it plays into themes identified in previous visual analyses in that it circulates ideas of the vulnerability of a mother and her child in the context of war. The woman is moving through a desolate landscape which symbolises the devastation that was causes to the ability to live a normal life, again violating the child’s right to an innocent childhood. The grey and slightly out of focus background is juxtaposed against the colours of the figures, drawing the viewers eyes firstly to the mothers face. Her face is hardened, set in its resolve. She is also glancing back taking one last looks perhaps at a place that she will not be able to return to. The viewer’s eyes then follow the woman’s body down to where she is holding the child’s hand. A symbol of her love. The depiction of the woman generates sets of ideas related to mothers and the feminisation of refugees. Particularly dominant understandings of mothers as carers for children are evoked – mothers as integral to the creation of home and the family. Finally the gaze shifts to the child who carries nothing but a toy, an allusion to a childhood that he will never be able to have, furthering sets of ideas related to the safety and innocence of childhood. Our eyes then wander up the road ahead which serves as a reminder of the long journey that refugees must take to reach safety.
The image was published in the *Daily Examiner* with the article titled “Droppin’ Bombs, Takin Refugees” (Calcino, 2015). I argue that the author and editor of this article were linking Australia’s military role and the refugee debate within the politics of pride and shame. The desolate landscape takes on a new meaning in this intertextual reading and fortifies the affective response of shame. The desolate setting which is part of a traditional representation of refugee narratives is now linked to the direct activities of Australia. For Australian viewers of this image, the link between the actions of defending western values and the hardship of Syrian refugees become tangible. It is a direct affront to Australia’s fast and almost reflex-like decisions to carry out bombing in Syria without considering the consequences.

Can Australia still claim to be a decent and compassionate nation when we offer both bombs and blankets? In addition, how do the emotional effects of this image mobilise a political response? This image shames the Australian conscious. It creates shame that the nation is “taking one step forward, two steps back” (Calcino, 2015). For individuals within Australia who were seeking to recoil and distance themselves from the link between Australia’s acceptance of refugees and our bombing campaigns, this image directly confronts them. Furthermore, the image circulates ideas related to the innocence of children, understandings of mothers as carers and the home as a place of safety, and then juxtaposes them against the context of war, suggesting that it is Australia that
is violating the child’s rights at least in part. Viewers are encouraged to imagine what it might feel like to become a displaced person, particularly from the point of view of a mother or a child. In doing so this image mobilises Australians to become more compassionate and reconsider why the nation is engaged in the war militarily. Who are the men that Australia is fighting at the expense of Syrian families?

5.4 Refugee Fathers

![Image of a migrant family boarding a train amidst a crowd at Keleti station in Budapest. SMH (Williams, 2015)](image)

The final set of images is of refugee men with children. These images portray men carrying children – sharply in focus. These images do not fit within previous classification of images of refugee men as threats – military personnel and/or unidentifiable mobs of people. Figure 5.4 taken by Brazilian photographer Mauricio Lima, shows a migrant family boarding a train amid a crowd at Keleti station in Budapest. It was published in the *Sydney Morning Herald* alongside an article titled ‘the national security implications of refugees’. Figure 5.5 was taken by German photographer Daniel Etter. It depicts Syrian refugee Laith Majid hugging his children and disembarking a raft on the Greek island of Kos and was published in the *Daily Liberal* titled ‘Refugees welcome to start again in Dubbo’. These images open up a counter discourse to the ideas that align refugee men with notions of masculinity. In these images men are portrayed in parental roles; grandfathers, fathers. Furthermore, they are portrayed as fearful – crying. These
images generate and circulate an alternative understanding of Syrian masculinity to that of a warrior.

Instead of focussing on mothers as carers, as in figure 5.3, the paternal relationship between the child and father is presented as the central theme. Doing so challenges narratives which present refugee men as illegal and threatening – purposefully emphasising male vulnerability, emotions and duty to protect (Lenette & Cleland, 2016). The feminisation of refugee is important because it addresses the politics of fear. Images of males in caring roles remind Australian’s that these men are fathers first. This violates the perceptions of Middle-Eastern men being military figures and works against the politics of fear that surrounds Syrian men by exhibiting their fears and raw emotions, encouraging viewers to offer their help and compassion.

![Image of Laith Majid hugging his children and disembarking a raft on the Greek Island of Kos](image_url) (Dickerson, 2015)

5.5 Summary

How do visual representations of Syrian refugee crisis in the Australian media inform which bodies qualify for Australian citizenship and nationality? Humans are highly visual (Rose, 2007) and identify with faces in images readily. Circulated in the media were sets of photos that focussed on small groups of people, often individuals, shifting away from the previous trend of
refugee representation as unidentifiable masses of people. Whereas the masses of people perfectly generate politics of fear through the threat of the other (Lenette & Cleland, 2016), individual faces of people identified as sons, daughters, mothers and fathers opens possibilities to develop intimate connections that draw bodies together. The images of Alan Kurdi evoked knowledges of children and the innocent childhood, helping to sustain s politics of shame at the Wests failure to protect and ensure that all children have a right to a safe upbringing. The depiction of a child’s dead body is viscerally shocking and appeals to humanity’s deepest emotional responses. The use of children in images humanises the refugee experience to generate the politics of shame, working alongside written stories of the refugee journey.

Images that joined the desolate landscapes of war with the emotional images of children brought Australian military involvement into sharp focus. There is a politics of pride and shame at play which relates to dropping bombs and destroying lives. The visual of the destroyed city of Kobani seems to rely not only on the feminisation of women as mothers – but also encourages the viewer to reflect on a nation that is so full of pride that it cannot accept displaced people created through the war. The economy of pride and shame works against a national image of generosity and compassion, positioning Australian citizens in a moral grey area.

Finally, the media circulated images of fathers, which I argue address the politics of fear. These images remind Australian citizens that many of these men are first fathers – who care for their children and their families. Their emotional faces; fearful and crying, betrays their vulnerability to Australian audiences. This engenders their paternal positions and degrades the image of middle-eastern men as military figures, closing the cultural gaps between the Australian citizen and those it might accept through its borders.
6 Online Spaces: The emotional politics of disgust and fear

Europe, land of the free. But not for all. When you arrive in Calais there is tension. The fences stretch as far as the eye can see. Layers upon layers of barbed wire, dogs and masked men with guns. For several kilometres you might be mistaken for thinking that this is for keeping us in or the English out. We cross a bridge. There it is, a city of tents. The end for those that run. Displaced. In between. We pass by in our sealed bus, like on safari. Watching them for a while, but with Amsterdam waiting they become only a memory at the back of my mind.

(On the Contiki bus Calais Source: Tom Bambrick reflexive travel diary, August 2015)

How do online spaces enhance and enable affective responses to news media? The aim of this chapter is to answer this question by reporting on a content, discourse and affective mapping of the online media spaces generated around the Syrian refugee crisis. To do so, this chapter is structured into three sections. First, the importance of online spaces is examined followed by a note on the sampling method. Next, the results of a content and discourse analysis are reported that suggest online commentary presents an alternative set of discourse to the dominant media reporting. Finally, the chapter turns to report on an affective mapping of online comments to identify the affective economies present in online spaces. The affective mapping suggests that online commentators are circulating affective politics of fear and loss in a counter discourse towards the national media rhetoric of compassion.

6.1 The importance of online spaces

Space matters (Bain & Nash, 2006; Datta, 2008). However, the constellations of events that make and remake online spaces is noticeably absent from much geographical work until quite recently (De Jong, 2015). This chapter works into geography’s increased interest in the relationships or events that constitute online spaces – particularly the ways that it blurs the boundaries between real/online. The internet provides an opportunity for people who read particular newspapers to contribute to news media through the comments that they make on published articles. This enables ideas to be widely circulated quickly, collapsing the distance between actors and facilitating the rapid production and reproduction of discourses.
Massumi’s (1987) idea of the more-than-real describes how ‘simulations’ are situations that are capable of producing the real. McLean et al. (2016) take Massumi’s notion and reapply it to imagine online spaces as more-than-real. They assert that the desires that flow through and beyond online spaces help produce what they think of as reality (Kinsley, 2014). By imagining the digital realm as more-than-real, the binary between ‘real’ and ‘virtual’ is blurred, recognising that they are not separate entities but relational entities. Importantly online spaces are argued to magnify and collapse the spaces between actors enabling new interactions to occur (Rose, 1993). This is because online spaces present a uniquely structured discourse where the points of view that are published are usually passionate comments that only draw from one side of an argument, thus presenting a magnified view of real world opinions.

The concept of the more-than-real can help us to grasp what is happening in online interactions and how it translates to the real (offline) world. Thereby, learning how online interactions circulate “through and against traditional geographic positioning” to produce affective responses (McLean, et al., 2016, p. 161). Thus, we can consider the conversations of commentators on media articles and assess them as the truthful and genuine opinions of their offline personalities because of the fact they are being circulated, despite no knowing the people who generate them (De Jong, 2015; Crooks, 2006; O’Connor, et al., 2008). The comments I am drawing upon are voted on by the online community to draw them to the top, illuminating certain sets of ideas that represent the majority point of view.

6.2 The emotional politics of disgust

The first set of comments that I would like to draw attention to were on articles discussed in chapter four which either praised or encouraged generosity in the Australian response. The highest voted comments on these articles challenged the ideas circulated in these articles that Australia should be compassionate and accept refugees with open arms. These comments generated a counter discourse where refugees embodied the threat of loss – lost jobs, lost land, lost money and lost support for Australians in need. For example, on the Daily Telegraph article “Paris attacks: Stringent checks on would-be-refugees” commentators Sylvia and Johnson wrote:
“How do we agreed to this, we have enough of our own problems with homeless people why bring more into our country when we can't even fund our own people” Sylvia (Benson, 2015)

“How do I do feel for these people, although Australia needs to take care of there [sic] own first! Yes they do worry me because of there [sic] beliefs and values we don’t want or need more terrorist attacks or blood shed! we are a peaceful country.”

Johnson (Benson, 2015)

Some commentators like this did not express specific concerns over accepting Syrian refugees. Instead they brought up issues of national shame (Australian homelessness rates) and our failure to in their view, address homelessness. Asking the question of the national consciousness, how can we help ‘them’ if we can’t help ‘our own’ people?

A commentator ‘Mandy’ on the Herald Sun article “Victorians and charity groups prepare to support thousands of Syrian refugees” typed:

“Victoria and charity groups prepare to support thousands of Syrian refugees...with over 20,000 homeless Victorians this is an absolute joke. People want to open their hearts and homes?? Why not start in your own backyard”

(Minnear, et al., 2015)

Mandy draws parallels between Australian homeless people and Syrian refugees, bringing up the feelings of shame in our own government. This comment accuses the Australian people of not sorting out our own backyards and pretending to open their ‘hearts and homes’. The commentator compares the actions of Australian people to a joke, a performance for the world and our national image whilst ignoring the serious issues that are already pressing.

These comments draw parallels between refugees and Australia’s homeless, highlighting the vulnerable nature of both groups. Mandy engenders the idea that Australia should be ashamed of its failure to care for its own people, endangering vulnerable citizens of the nation by favouring outsiders who threaten to violate the pure Australian body.

More derogatory comments are also made about Syrian refugees in The Australian - “They will become parasites on their new societies.” (The Australian, 2015). This provokes the concept that
refugees are alien bodies that penetrate borders to leech an existence out. Parasites embody disgust because they force us to confront our bodily existence. It is not the Syrian refugees that cause disgust. Rather, disgust emerges from a system of cultural ideals that compels some Australians to understand the collective body of Australians as priority over all others, including Syrians. Another commentator on the Herald Sun article said:

“Our elderly get a pittance for their pension and many shiver under multiple blankets and eat dog food and none gives a toss yet it is trendy to worry about Syrians or Africans while our elderly rot. What is the matter with people in this country. You turn your old mother out whilst offering a bed to Syrians”

(Minnear, et al., 2015)

A cultural system that established boundaries between the bodies of Australians and Syrians in terms of need renders resettlement of Syrians refugees as disgusting. Some of least sympathetic responses to Syrian refugees in comments came from regional newspapers such as the Glen Innes Examiner and The Townsville Bulletin. In some comments, such as those on the article “Emotions run high at Syrian refugee meeting”, there is evidence of discourses of Islamophobia aligned with white Australian national pride:

"I would like to make it clear that I am vehemently and aggressively opposed to Muslim immigration to Australia and in particular, Glen Innes, as tough as that may sound my family and my community take precedence."

(Thomson, 2015)

To do something vehemently is to do it with energy and a passion. This is a word with a lot of force behind it. The commentators experience themselves as disgusting at the thought of Muslim immigration to Australia. Muslims must be kept distant from the body, as they threaten its very existence. The language is fervent, burning. It suggests that the thought of being confronted by Muslim immigration is viscerally disgusting to the individual. This disgust works to re-establish the community and national boundaries.
Similarly, in the *Townsville Bulletin* the following comment demonstrates the extent of the threat of the proximity of refugees that some individuals experience:

“Refugees are NOT welcome here! Call it a late Christmas present for Townsville or an unwanted gift that we should return immediately to sender...This time of year Townsville residents are usually preparing for cyclones but instead Townsville will be preparing and bracing itself for a possible Islamic invasion perhaps causing the same amount of destruction if not more than a Category 5 cyclone.”

(*Townsville Bulletin, 2016*)

Working at the level of representation, the commentator describes the impact of refugee resettlement to be as destructive as a cyclone. This imagery takes us back to the way the threat of rouge refugees were portrayed in media articles, as the front of a storm. Certainly for residents in Townsville a category 5 Cyclone might represent their worst fears and worries. Thinking through the politics of emotion, again it is the commentator’s body that experience disgust at the thought of the proximity of refugees. This quotation offers an opportunity to understand what the disgusted body can do. The reaction of the commentator is to become aware of cultural differences and how the social conventions about how the inhabit Townsville as a Christian. A more proactive and difficult response would to be think about why they experience disgust at the thought of refugee resettlement.

These comments are indicative of the politics of disgust that, whilst largely absent from the national media circulation I have analysed, is still prominent with residents of regional communities. Within the media discourse online spaces reveal that there is a distinction between the national rhetoric, which circulates affective responses of compassion in an effort to evoke the ideal nation that is open and welcoming to others, and regional bodies which are still fearful of Syrian refugees who for them embody the threat of loss. The perception of refugees as a threat to the individual and national body continues throughout online commentary through the politics of fear.
6.3 Politics of fear: Rouge Refugees

Online commentaries enabled readers of articles to redirect conversations and introduce past histories and events that influenced the ideas being circulated. The Lindt siege that occurred in December of 2014 was for many Australians the arrival of IS, terrorism or Islamic Extremism in Australia. It was the first time that someone who proclaimed direct links to IS conducted an attack on Australian soil, bringing the threat of Islamic Extremism to the forefront of the Australian consciousness. The fear of Islamic terrorism in Australia left a lasting impression and is attributed as being the reasoning behind patriot movements such as Reclaim Australia gaining momentum in 2015 and 2016. A comment on the Herald Sun article “Victorians and charity groups prepare to support thousands of Syrian refugees” reads:

“How Many Man Monis’ are amongst these law abiding refugees? How many will turn to terrorism once here like many other refugees?”

(Minnear, et al., 2015)

This is a return to Miranda Devine’s ‘rats in the pack’ mentality used to generate a counter discourse against Australia’s generosity. In an article published in The Australian arguing for a focus on Christian resettlement, commenters echoed Devine’s ideas. For example, Robert typed in response:

“How many tens of thousands of Islamic Daesh fighters have snuck into Europe with these millions of people rushing into Europe. How many terror cells, bombings, cut off heads and other tragedies are going to unfold in the decades ahead as a result of this European madness. It seems insane to let millions of people into Europe and other western nations seeking a better life at the expense of the recipient nation”

(Balough, 2015)

Even in articles that urged unrestricted compassion, for example the article titled in The Sydney Morning Herald, “The biggest refugee crisis since World War II needs a similar response”, commentators turned against the religion of some Syrian refugees citing hostile outcomes. For example APM typed:
“Muslim refugees are different. They will be a burden not only financially but the experience is that they will form a hostile underclass who refuse to integrate. Many to most of the refugees aren’t even Syrian; every sniff of weak borders ignites global economic migration.” (Groutsis, 2015)

Accepting anyone produces a security threat. The affective economy of fear is circulated by the presence of a potential terrorist in our midst. Every potential Syrian refugee becomes a potential threat to not only the individual, but the collective identity of the Australian nation. Cultural diversity is positioned as a problem, rather than a potential source of creativity. For refugees to be considered genuine and without threat refugees must become Australian by taking the nation and embracing the language, the values and the morals.

6.4 Summary

Online spaces provide a discursive platform that enables the production and circulation of alternative or subdued narratives within the media. Through commenting on articles, users can disrupt and contest the discourses circulated by news media. They can generate different affective economies that work to produce different notions of the nation. This is part of a shift towards media being produced socially, disseminated through sharing and discussion based mediums, rather than through static forms such as newspapers. The emerging themes in this chapter demonstrate the counter narratives that media comment sections cultivate. The ability for individual voices to be heard in online spaces allowed for the dominant narrative of the compassionate Australia to be challenged. Refugee figures were reframed by commenters, not as vulnerable bodies in need of a sympathetic response from Australia, but as figures that embodied the threat of loss of a white Christian Australia. Refugees were generated as a threat to a particular Australian way of life at an individual and national scale.

Some commentators employ the politics of pride and shame to imagine Syrian refugees in some online spaces as being a burden to society, using up resources and becoming a drain or parasite to the nation. Seemingly, accepting Syrian refugees is an affront to Australia’s most vulnerable citizens. Such an act would be in discordance with national pride in the ‘fair go’.

Other commentators evoke a politics of disgust at Syrian refugee resettlement. The presence
of refugees in some regional Australian centres brought to fore individuals bodily existence; and the ways in which difference evoked strong visceral responses that separate. And, yet others circulate the politics of fear aligned to the individual and the nation. The politics of fear are linked to each potential Syrian refugee being a terrorist within our midst. Online spaces ensure that past histories and events are reproduced, opening up the wounds inflicted by extremist attacks already conducted in Australia. This incorporates the *Daily Telegraph* narrative of ‘rats in the pack’ and ‘Islamic moles’ that allies Syrian refugees with potential terrorist attacks in Australia. The largely deregulated comment spaces allow this set of ideas to be circulated not only on the *Daily Telegraph*, but also in media sources which fervently opposed any restrictions on the selection of refugees based on race or religion, such as *The Australian*, the *Sun Herald* and the *Sydney Morning Herald*.

Furthermore, the user driven attribute of online comments allowed for regional perspectives to deviate from the national narrative of unrestricted compassion. Traditional forms of media generally trickle down from the national newspapers to the regional level with the overall tone being maintained throughout. Online media however empowers audiences to interject through commenting. Thus, online spaces can enable a multitude of nuanced affective responses to be heard, mobilising alternative political responses.
7 Conclusion

After a heavy storm had passed, so the story goes, thousands of starfish littered the beach. A woman was walking along the beach when she noticed a boy approaching. Every now and then he would pick up a starfish and throw it into the sea.

When they met, the woman asked the boy what he was doing. He said he was throwing them into the ocean because they couldn’t return by themselves. They would die otherwise. The woman said that there must be thousands of starfish and the boy’s efforts would make no difference.

The boy picked up a starfish and threw it into the sea and said: “It made a difference to that one.”

(Adapted from ‘The Star Thrower’, Eiseley, 1979)

To conclude this chapter revisits the thesis aims, summarises the key findings and outlines a future media research agenda employing the concept of affective politics. Additionally the chapter will report on the current state of Syrian refugee resettlement in Australia. The aim of the thesis is to explore the emotional politics of the Australian media and its corresponding commentary, in reference to the proposed resettlement of 12,000 Syrian Refugees in Australia. To address this aim I drew on a sample of Australian media articles from August – to December 2015 and addressed three research questions;

- What themes and sets of ideas are produced and circulated by the Australian media?
- What understandings of Australian citizenship are challenged or reproduced in terms of how Syrian Refugees are portrayed in the media?
- How do online spaces enhance and enable affective responses to news media?

Chapter 4 addressed the question: What themes and sets of ideas are produced and circulated by the Australian media? Engaging with the Australian media as a whole is a daunting task, with more than 500 individual newspapers; websites and media distributors. Understanding the
content of more than 1,000 articles needed a multi-layer approach that was able to gain both a broad-sweeping understanding, but also delve into individual passages and sources. This chapter identified that the Australian media reported the Syrian refugee crises around the five themes of:

1. Resettlement locations.
2. Selection criteria.
5. Terrorism/security threats within Australia.

Media reports engendered the politics of shame by drawing attention to the failure of the Global North to prevent refugee tragedies from happening. This chapter also identified the circulation of politics of compassion, pride, shame and fear. Compassionate emotions were generated as a process of reconciliation with the politics of shame, which in turn generated pride in the generosity of the nation. The chapter also confirmed previous literatures findings of the politics of fear, which was circulated through media conversations related to Islamic extremism.

Chapters 4 and 5 both shed insights to the second question: What understandings of Australian citizenship are challenged or reproduced in terms of how Syrian Refugees are portrayed in the media? In these chapters I explored humanising stories of the refugee journey utilised language which placed blame on the Global North for failing moral responsibilities to protect people of all cultures. The nation was mobilised to reconcile with the politics of shame through compassionate responses. Citizens then drew upon understandings of ‘multiculturalism’ to evoke the nation as an accepting and generous body shifting the emotion of shame away from the body through opening communities and hearts towards Syrian refugee bodies. The media’s focus on the vulnerable bodies of Syrian refugees reproduced national ideals of providing everybody with a ‘fair go’ which enable the politics of compassion within Australia. Through directing emotional responses towards persecuted minorities the nation was generate as the ‘hero’ – defined as welcoming and hospitable by allowing genuine refugees to enter the national space. Following Ahmed, the nation could still ‘solve’ the problem of shame by directing a compassionate
response towards particular (Christian) others in need, while excluding ‘unsavoury’ (Muslim) others.

Chapter 4 also explored how conservative media, dominated by News Corporations *The Daily Telegraph* circulated counter discourse of national citizenship linked to the politics of fear and disgust. These media sources imagined the nation as Christian – encouraging the nation to be closed towards Islamic refugees. This allowed the nation to imagine its generosity in welcoming some others, whilst feeling no shame at rejecting Islamic refugees.

Chapter 5 explored how images challenged or reproduced ideas of national citizenship. This chapter identified a shift in the way that refugees are visually represented which challenged ideas of who national citizenship is available to. The image of Alan Kurdi’s dead body on a Turkish beach is one of the most salient parts of the media analysis. The use of images in the media demonstrated a shift in the way that refugees are visually represented. In previous studies the visual representation of refugees had been impersonal, threatening and oppositional, generating the politics of fear through the threat of the ‘other’. The results of this visual analysis demonstrate that this is changing or did change as a result of this particular event; it is unclear if this charge will persist. Images are more personalised, they enable viewers to become intimate with the subjects depicted. As a result visual depictions evoked knowledges of children, mothers, fathers and family – linking them to Syrian refugees. Audiences are encouraged to imagine what it might feel like to become a displaced person, in the context of the family. Raising questions on the morality of offering both blankets and bombs, Australia must choose in order to present a pure national image that aligns with its national ideals.

Chapter 6 addressed the question: How do online spaces enhance and enable affective responses to news media? With my findings I argue that online spaces facilitated sets of ideas about Syrian refugees as ‘parasitise’ or ‘potential terrorists’ that circulated an affective economy of disgust and fear. The open forum of online spaces enabled individual voices least supportive of refugee resettlement to be produced, circulated and discussed, leading to dominant print media narratives being challenged in a highly public manor. Within online spaces the ideal of Australia as compassionate nation was challenged by commenters through the circulation of politics of fear. Refugees were reproduced within the comments as figures that embodied the threat of loss,
threatening the Australian way of life. An affective economy of shame was circulated within the notion of Australia being compassionate at the expense of its own citizens, running against the national ideal of a ‘fair go’ for Australian citizens. Fear was produced through links between Syrian refugees and Islamic State, stimulated by the circulation of recent national histories of terror attacks, raw wounds that still wept. The online format enabled the spread of ideas between articles and allowed commentators to directly challenge the discourse within the main article. An important implication for online spaces was the way that they empowered regional perspectives to deviate from the national narratives, particularly in spaces such as Glenn Innes and Townsville where the politics of fear and shame resulted in opposition to offering the resettlement of Syrian refugees.

7.1 Syrian Refugee resettlement
As of September 2016, only 3532 of the Syrian refugees have been resettled (Anderson, 2016). Whilst emotions are political and mobilise people into collective action, within the Australian context there are a number of different emotions that work against each other. I argue that the affective politics of fear and disgust cannot be separated from the politics of refugee resettlement, thus resulting in the slowness around the resettlement process. The fear and disgust that is circulated within the Australian space rekindles movements around white Australian pride, thereby reproducing narrow understandings of the Australian nation. The growth of the One Nation party in the 2016 elections and the strength of the conservative wings of the National Coalition government are indicative of this. Against this, the compassion to accept additional Syrian refugees was an achievement in part through the media’s circulation of national shame. However, for some of the affective politics of fear and disgust through sets of ideas of that represent Syrian refugees as parasites or terrorist, rekindled by the politics of pride in a white Australian nation.

7.2 Looking to the future
Future research may seek to further investigate the politics of emotion of Australian media reporting of refugees. Ongoing research is necessary due to the ongoing political context and rise of social media platforms in both making and circulating news. In a political context, in which conservative political parties have re-emerged, the Australian media provides an avenue to address the intersection between refugee policy, the nation, national borders and refugee
resettlement. This matters because of the history of colonisation through which the Australian nation is imagined and performed, the national ideals of multiculturalism that Australia aspires to, and, the composition of the Australian population, where close to one third is a foreign born citizen. The response in the Australian context would be different to that in Canada, Europe, thus continuing the present type of work is important given Australia’s unique geographical and political contexts.

The rise of social media platforms positions it as an important area for future research. The mapping of how ideas are shared could reveal the different relationships between groups of online communities. Furthermore, examining the roles that different social media platforms play in generating affective spaces could reveal which groups of people are being most influenced by the increase in digital technologies.

Future research may seek to explore different methods and samples. Focusing on the different affective responses that appear to occur in metropolitan versus regional centres suggest the possibilities for more ethnographic work. Targeting particular readers of a newspaper, such as the residents of a regional town may reveal nuanced ways that ideas of refugee resettlement are circulated on smaller scales. Through conducting interviews the connections between the media and what people actually do in everyday interactions could be explored. This could be built up beyond a media analysis to map which towns reported for and against the resettlement of refugees. Perhaps providing insight into what constellations of events work for and against the resettlement of refugees in particular places.

By way of summary, the material presented throughout this thesis provides a basis from which understandings of Australia’s national priorities and imaginings can be established. This thesis has reinforced the notion that representations of refugees are social constructs, dependant on the shared histories of the nation, adding that this is a mechanism through which affective economies are generated and circulated within the public sphere. It has also demonstrated that these constructs and affective responses can be supported, challenged or diverted by the ways in which refugees are portrayed within the media. The results suggest that Australia is potentially undergoing a moral shift in its attitudes towards refugees. In part this shift may be due to the dominant themes in terms of how Syrian refugees are portrayed in the media through the use of images of a dead child, women and children and men and children. At the same time the results
suggests that some digital online spaces of certain media remain embedded in narrow understandings of white national pride, and narrow understandings of Syrian refugees. It asks for further investigation into the ways that the Australian media is changing, as its role in what opening up different ways people think and feel about Australian citizenship.
8 Bibliography


[Accessed 3 October 2016].


[Accessed 3 October 2016].


[Accessed 3 October 2016].


[Accessed 3 October 2016].


Crooks, V., 2006. 'I go on the internet: I alwats, you know, check to see what's new': Chronically ill women's use of online health information to shape and inform doctor-patient interactions in the space of care provision. *ACME,* Volume 5, pp. 50-69.


Available at: https://www.border.gov.au/Trav/Refu/response-syrian-humanitarian-crisis
[Accessed 13 March 2016].

Available at: https://www.border.gov.au/Trav/Refu/Offs/Who-is-eligible
[Accessed 13 March 2016].


Devine, M., 2015. Time to face the facts about Islamic extremism. [Online]
[Accessed 3 October 2016].

Devine, M., 2016. Land of bigots? You must be crazy, Mike Baird. [Online]
[Accessed 3 October 2016].

Dickerson, 2015. Refugees welcome to start again in Dubbo. [Online]
[Accessed 3 October 2016].


needs-a-similar-response-20151229-glw655.html
[Accessed 3 October 2016].


Available at: http://www.nma.gov.au/online_features/defining_moments/featured/tampa_affair
[Accessed 3 October 2016].


Smith, H. & Tran, M., 2015. Germany says it could take 500,000 refugees a year. [Online] Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/sep/08/germany-500000-refugees-a-year-clashes-lesbos
[Accessed 3 October 2016].

[Accessed 13 March 2016].


9 Appendix

Appendix A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table A</th>
<th>Guidelines for Coding ‘Focal Topics’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focal Topics</strong></td>
<td><strong>Discussion on...</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resettlement</td>
<td>The resettlement process and the locations of resettlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection Criteria</td>
<td>The criteria that Syrian refugees must meet to be resettled in Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Image</td>
<td>Australia as a multicultural nation and links between immigration history and the contemporary response to Syrian refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military Action</td>
<td>Australia’s military response in Iraq and Syria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism and security risks</td>
<td>The possible ‘terrorist threat’ posed by refugees i.e. Refugees as members of IS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borders</td>
<td>The importance of border for Australia (‘stop the boats’ policy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive resettlement stories</td>
<td>Resettlement stories of individual refugees or host families in Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia’s refugee policy</td>
<td>Policies relating to refugee entering Australia via formal mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal election/politics</td>
<td>The election and domestic political issues indirectly related to Syrian refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>War in Syria/Iraq</td>
<td>The war in Syria/Iraq and its implications for refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media/propaganda</td>
<td>The representation of refugees by the media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>The religion of potential refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racism</td>
<td>Racism within the Australian Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Problems</td>
<td>Unemployment and economic hardship in Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Topics that did not belong to any of the above categories</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table B</th>
<th>Guidelines for coding of evaluative tenor$^9$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tenor</strong></td>
<td><strong>Coding Criteria</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mostly Negative |  - Negative reporting on a negative event involving refugees – i.e. use of emotive imagery and terminology.  
- Refugees portrayed as being actively involved in negative events such as terrorism, theft, rape etc.  
- Refugees portrayed as being passively involved in negative events. |
| Mostly Positive |  - Refugees portrayed as being actively involved in a positive event.  
- Refugees portrayed as being passively involved in a positive event.  
- Refugees discussed using sympathetic and emotive terminology. |
| Neutral |  - Documents that adopted neutral language and did not make any value judgements regarding Refugees in either a positive or negative direction. |
| Mixed |  - Documents containing relatively even amounts of positive and negative content and language in relation towards refugees. |

$^9$ All categories were mutually exclusive as specified by Earickson & Harlin (1994)
## Appendix C

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Document Count</th>
<th>Circulation</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Australian - All sources</td>
<td>232</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation - All sources</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia) - All sources</td>
<td>63</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courier Mail - All sources</td>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>107,291</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Age (Melbourne, Australia)</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>100,339</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Daily Leader (Tamworth, Australia)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>5,549</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herald-Sun (Melbourne)</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>344,061</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canberra Times (Australia)</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>19,492</td>
<td>Federal Capital Press of Australia Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Advertiser (Adelaide, Australia)</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>171,730</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hobart Mercury (Australia)</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33,111</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Launceston Examiner (Australia)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>22,340</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illawarra Mercury (Wollongong, Australia)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>14,256</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Liberal (Dubbo, Australia)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>adelaidenow.com.au (Australia)</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heraldsun.com.au</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The West Australian (Perth)</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>157,011</td>
<td>West Australian Newspapers Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burnie Advocate (Australia)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Newcastle Herald (New South Wales, Australia)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>33,574</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Morning Bulletin (Rockhampton, Australia)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10,929</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Australian Financial Review</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>57,000</td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>news.com.au</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Conversation</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>The Conversation Media Group Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Spectator - Online</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA Today</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Management Pty Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper (Location)</td>
<td>Issue</td>
<td>Circulation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Border Mail (Australia)</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20,653</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brisbane Times (Australia)</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The West Australian (Perth)</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crikey</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Broadcasting Service (Australia)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Age (Melbourne, Australia)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Chronicle (Toowoomba, Australia)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Government News</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun Herald (Sydney)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>264,434</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunshine Coast Daily (Australia)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12,239</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Warrnambool Standard (Australia)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14,170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Townsville Bulletin (Australia)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22,122</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Daily Mercury (Mackay, Australia)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffs Coast Advocate (Coffs Harbour, Australia)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>31,070</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepparton News (Australia)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10,451</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Age (Melbourne)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>164,243</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cairns Post (Australia)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18,170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairfield Advance (Australia)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>55,913</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Territory News (Australia)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18,999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraser Coast Chronicle (Hervey Bay, Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6,712</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The NewsMail (Bundaberg, Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7,459</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Northern Star (Lismore, Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8,829</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Queensland Times (Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7,784</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armidale Express (Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12,588</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bendigo Advertiser (Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11,514</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glen Innes Examiner (Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1,569</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold Coast Bulletin (Australia)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25,608</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Management Pty Limited
Fairfax Media
Private Media Partners Pty Ltd.
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
HT Media Limited
McPherson Media Group
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
APN Newspapers Pty Ltd
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper Name</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>52,000s</th>
<th>Publisher/Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Warwick Daily News</td>
<td>(Australia)</td>
<td>2,663</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Observer (Gladstone, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,823</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Daily Advertiser (Wagga Wagga, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>21,305</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geelong Advertiser (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cairns Post (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dalby Herald (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,031</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Examiner (Grafton, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,919</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Burnett Times (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,744</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canterbury Bankstown Express (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>69,844</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Advocate - Hepburn (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inverell Times (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,605</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maitland Mercury (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,666</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Macquarie News (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,152</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Highland News (New South Wales, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,625</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sunday Times (Perth)</td>
<td></td>
<td>250,290</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Conversation</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,926</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centralian Advocate (Alice Springs, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>54,702</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairfield Champion (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brimbank &amp; North West Weekly (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,359</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cootamundra Herald (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,060</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narooma News (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5,089</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Lincoln Times (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>37,049</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Land (New South Wales, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,895</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Advocate (Bathurst, Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,069</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited News Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalgoorlie Miner (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td>29,448</td>
<td>Federal Capital Press of Australia Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pine Rivers Press (Brisbane)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,481</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Queanbeyan Age (Australia)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication</td>
<td>Readership</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS World News Headline Stories</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>SBS (Special Broadcasting Service)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Guyra Argus (Australia)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gold Coast Bulletin (Australia)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huffington Post Australia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballina Shire Advocate (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinchilla News (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gympie Times (Queensland, Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunshine Coast Sunday (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maroochy Weekly (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>APN Newspapers Pty Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballarat Courier (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redland City Bulletin (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gloucester Advocate (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parramatta Sun (Sydney)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Coast Register (Shoalhaven, Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wollondilly Advertiser (Macarthur, Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yass Tribune (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Management Pty Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert River Express (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hornsby Advocate (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manly Daily (Australia)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>News Ltd.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix D

### Table D

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Document Count</th>
<th>Source Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Martin</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicole Hasham</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simon Benson</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jared Owens</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Gordon</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Charlotte Observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elouise Quinlivan</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Dalby Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Uren</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will Hunter</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Architectural Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Osborne</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Australian Associated Press General News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gareth Hutchens</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nick Miller</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Kelly</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Kenny</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen Whinnett</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heath Aston</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Meers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Tillett</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>The West Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Devine</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stefanie Balogh</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Crowe</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rob Harris</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Associated Press Newswires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kevin Nguyen</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Bygone Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Brissenden</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Bolt</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piers Akerman</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rob Harris</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Kenny</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Massola</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacqueline Magnay</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthew Benns</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Alford</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alicia Wood</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annika Smethurst</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Wroe</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Fairfax Media Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindy Kerin</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameron Stewart</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amanda Hodge</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewel Topsfield</td>
<td>The Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farrah Tomazin</td>
<td>Sunday Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosie Lewis</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Koziol</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judith Ireland</td>
<td>Canberra Times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie Peatling</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Allard</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Minear</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henry Belot</td>
<td>Canberra Times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa Benoit</td>
<td>The Morning Bulletin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg Sheridan</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nick Clark</td>
<td>The Mercury (Hobart)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amilia Rosa</td>
<td>The Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonia Kohlbacher</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alison Marks</td>
<td>Manly Daily</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natalie O’Brien</td>
<td>Sun Herald</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nick Grimm</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) News</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Flitton</td>
<td>The Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Madden</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Edwards</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) News</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nick Butterly</td>
<td>The West Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melissa Gulbin</td>
<td>The Northern Rivers Echo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony Wright</td>
<td>The Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alasdair Young</td>
<td>APN News &amp; Media Ltd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Pennells</td>
<td>The West Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Fitzpatrick</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Conlin</td>
<td>The Advertiser</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Mitchell</td>
<td>Australian Associated Press General News</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tara Miko</td>
<td>The Chronicle (Toowoomba)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael McGowan</td>
<td>The Newcastle Herald</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annette Samojlowicz</td>
<td>Sydney 96.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joshua Taylor</td>
<td>Liverpool Echo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily Baker</td>
<td>Launceston Examiner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony Jones</td>
<td>Modern Car Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Vogler</td>
<td>The Courier-Mail</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liam Bartlett</td>
<td>Nine Network Australia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Probyn</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The West Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Sheehan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Sydney Morning Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stan Gorton</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Narooma News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jason Om</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Schliebs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca Puddy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirsty Needham</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sun Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca Belt</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Northern Daily Leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex Druce</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Launceston Examiner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt Johnston</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dennis Shanahan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthew Kelly</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Newcastle Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ben Cameron</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Brimbank Weekly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Masanauskas</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandy Squires</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Geelong Advertiser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samantha Landy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Herald-Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zach Hope</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Northern Territory News/Sunday Territorian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennette Lees</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cootamundra Herald (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brendan Nicholson</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gareth Parker</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The West Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dannielle DePinto</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Northside Chronicle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Wright</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>LA Car</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jessica Oxford</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Blacktown Advocate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erin Handley</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Maley</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew Clennell</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helen Spelitis</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>South Burnett Times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>