

# University of Wollongong Research Online

Faculty of Science - Papers (Archive)

Faculty of Science, Medicine and Health

2011

# Conclusion: Tackling the 'missing scale' in environmental policy

Ruth Lane Monash University

Andrew W. Gorman-Murray
University of Wollongong, andrewgm@uow.edu.au

# **Publication Details**

Lane, R. & Gorman-Murray, A. W. (2011). Conclusion: Tackling the 'missing scale' in environmental policy. In R. Lane & A. W. Gorman-Murray (Eds.), Material Geographies of Household Sustainability (pp. 217-224). Surrey, England: Ashgate.





# Conclusion: Tackling the 'missing scale' in environmental policy

## **Abstract**

The foregoing chapters have demonstrated that household sustainability is a complex issue that requires thoughtful discussion from multiple perspectives. Indeed throughout this collection we have encouraged a dialogical approach. On the one hand our aim has been to bring researchers from human geography and cultural studies into a productive dialogue around the material geographies of household sustainability. There has been enthusiastic cross-fertilisation of ideas and approaches shown through the chapters, which critically develop the interconnections between the material, socia-technical, cultural, embodied and political dimensions which make households function, with particular attention to how they (might) function in environmentally sustainable ways. On the other hand the actual format of the book also deployed a dialogical approach, with discussants providing commentary and reflection on the chapters in each of three sections. These discussion pieces draw out the connections between the chapters and are suggestive of possibilities for developing further work. This approach to the edited collection means that tentative conclusions have already been provided throughout the book. So in this brief 'wrap up' we want to return to the big themes and suggest key areas for advancing research on household sustainability from the perspectives of material geographies. Having encouraged dialogue, we do not want to close (it) offwith a 'final' conclusion, but rather clear ground for further interrogation and debate.

# Keywords

environmental, policy, scale, tackling, missing, conclusion

## **Disciplines**

Life Sciences | Physical Sciences and Mathematics | Social and Behavioral Sciences

# **Publication Details**

Lane, R. & Gorman-Murray, A. W. (2011). Conclusion: Tackling the 'missing scale' in environmental policy. In R. Lane & A. W. Gorman-Murray (Eds.), Material Geographies of Household Sustainability (pp. 217-224). Surrey, England: Ashgate.

# Chapter 12

# Conclusion: Tackling the 'Missing Scale' in Environmental Policy

Ruth Lane and Andrew Gorman-Murray

The foregoing chapters have demonstrated that household sustainability is a and cultural studies into a productive dialogue around the material geographies of household sustainability. There has been enthusiastic cross-fertilisation of deas and approaches shown through the chapters, which critically develop the political dimensions which make households function, with particular attention sections. These discussion pieces draw out the connections between the chapters and are suggestive of possibilities for developing further work. This approach to On the one hand our aim has been to bring researchers from human geography interconnections between the material, socio-technical, cultural, embodied and to how they (might) function in environmentally sustainable ways. On the other hand the actual format of the book also deployed a dialogical approach, with discussants providing commentary and reflection on the chapters in each of three hroughout the book. So in this brief 'wrap up' we want to return to the big themes the perspectives of material geographies. Having encouraged dialogue, we do not complex issue that requires thoughtful discussion from multiple perspectives. Indeed throughout this collection we have encouraged a dialogical approach the edited collection means that tentative conclusions have already been provided and suggest key areas for advancing research on household sustainability from want to close (it) off with a 'final' conclusion, but rather clear ground for further interrogation and debate.

This wrap up is arranged in three sections. Firstly, we return to the idea of material geographies advanced throughout the book, and further contemplate the value of this approach — or rather, this set of perspectives. We reintroduce the different approaches to materiality and stress how they together reconfigure normative ideas of 'the material world', disrupting a strict distinction between object and subject, the material and the immaterial, and instead assert that the material, cultural, objective and subjective are co-constituted. Secondly, we reflect on the importance of the often neglected household scale—the geographical focus of this collection — for activating conscious and habitual environmental sustainability. The household is a key spatial frame in relational politics around environmental action and governance, connecting national strategies and regional embeddedness with individual behaviours. Thirdly, we consider directions for further research

Conclusion: Tackling the 'Missing Scale' in Environmental Policy

inspired by the authors in this collection and their varied perspectives on the material geographies of household sustainability.

# Material Geographies Approach(es)

the objective, real, hard and tangible - is often opposed in a framework of binary new' approaches to materiality within human geography have moved against this of 'the material world'. We also seek to move beyond this binary framing. In its The introductory chapter outlined our material geographies approach for understanding household sustainability. In conventional thought, the material -logic with the immaterial - the subjective, ideal, soft and discursive. However dualistic understanding and have attempted to reconfigure these normative notions urge the disruption of such constructed dualisms as those around subject/object, material/immaterial, nature/culture and mind/body. Instead these approaches contend that the material, the cultural, the natural, the objective, the subjective and the mind and body are all co-constituted and not so easily divisible into separate ontological categories of analysis. Our opening chapter introduced and following a recent review by Ben Anderson and John Wylie (2009). This was material geographies approaches by showing their applicability for understanding place we have iterated several approaches to material geographies that, in fact, discussed three particular clustered approaches to 'new' material geographies, a handy foundation for our thinking, and we wanted to advance these three household sustainability in the contemporary world.

cultural embeddedness, mediation and meaning of objects; hybrid geographies describes the co-constitution of nature and culture; embodied geographies identifies the intersection of emotions, corporeality and sociality in the idea of 'the self'. While we distinguished these three reasonably distinct approaches, this householders are also engaged in a very localised form of resource security or future-proofing' that mirrors the discourse of 'urban ecological security' that is These three approaches can be identified and summarised as material cultures, hybrid geographies and embodied geographies. Material cultures identifies the framework was not picked up in such a neat manner by the authors in this collection. For instance, the hybrid geographies emerging within this collection highlight the interrelationships between householders, technology and infrastructure rather than a definite nature-culture relationship. Nature, for these authors, is primarily framed in terms of the environmental resources caught up in the water, energy and goods and materials consumed in the home. It is these that are construed as the 'nature' in need of conservation in the city, which echoes Maria Kaika's (2004) argument about 'domesticated nature' entering the modern home as flows of commoditised resources. Aidan Davison's chapter offers particular insights here in tracing the reframing of environmental politics over time away from a focus on 'wild' nature and towards debates around eco-efficient technologies. In investing in eco-efficiency,

ncreasingly used to promote sustainable development templates for world cities Hodson and Marvin 2009)

living in large houses in the outer suburbs of Sydney - in direct contravention of nousing find little purchase as certain types of living space are considered more desirable. For example Robyn Dowling and Emma Power highlight the importance Overall though, it is the myriad intersections between these three approaches to material geographies that stand out rather than any one of them. Perhaps this is inevitable in empirical research at the household scale. Research findings are contingent on the specific social, cultural and geographical contexts of the households explored. In a number of contexts the current imperatives around sustainable of expansive living spaces to the cultural value of 'homeyness' among families the current emphasis on reducing resource consumption. Willem Paling and Tim Winter highlight the different circumstances of the emerging professional classes in the rapidly modernising city of Phnom Penh that are moving housing aspirations away from the more sustainable traditional architecture that incorporated passive cooling approaches towards 'modern' styles reliant on air-conditioning.

attitudes often diverge from observable practice, and generalisations are not always appropriate. This poses specific challenges for 'scaling up' research findings to inform policy approaches. Kersty Hobson, in her chapter contribution, suggests a metaphor of 'creative grammar' to help understand the interconnections between research around household practices to inform new policy approaches, as well as The various chapters demonstrate the 'messiness' that John Law (2004) argued is central to materially grounded social research, where stated values and discourse and practice around household sustainability. While existing and evolving around these, and innovation within households can both interrupt conventional practice and be acknowledged by others. This volatility highlights the potential for norms and conventions can be observed, there is also much variation or 'slippage' to evaluate their effectiveness.

community-driven initiatives and more formally constituted housing cooperatives noting that community-driven initiatives are more likely to include a wider range he multiple interpretations of property in used goods associated with the diverse rationales and motivations around community-based initiatives, compared with the more singular assumptions about property implicit in government waste management initiatives. Related to these issues of property is the slippage between the categorisation of particular environmental resources as either products or services, as in Gay Hawkins and Kane Race's analysis of bottled water versus tap One area of innovation is in tenure and property arrangements affecting both the built environment and moveable goods. Louise Crabtree's documentation of cooperative housing models highlights some of the differences between in incorporating various forms of sustainable resource use in housing design, of sustainability principles in their design. In arguing the significance of informal channels for the reuse of second-hand goods, Matt Watson and Ruth Lane contrast water in Bangkok. These categorisations draw attention to the role of the material form, in this case water bottles, in defining environmental resources as marketable Conclusion: Tackling the 'Missing Scale' in Environmental Policy

products, rather than regulated services, and in doing so highlight the limitations of market models relying on 'citizen-consumers' for promoting real efficiencies in resource use

# The Politics of the Household Scale

with a specific purpose: to provide new insights into household sustainability. In about environmental decision making, what is critical here is the spatial focus of analysed in sustainability research across a range of disciplines, including human the household, for instance through programs for the collection and recycling of erms of environmental policy, action and governance, as well as scholarly debates our material analysis on the household. As Louise Reid, Philip Sutton and Colin Hunter (2010) have recently and cogently argued, the household is a 'crucible' for geography. Governmental policies about sustainability are increasingly focused on household waste, and through price mechanisms to encourage reduced household energy and water usage. But this approach treats the household as if it was an individuals with their own environmental behaviours and their own connections In this collection we have introduced and advanced a material geographies approach pro-environmental behaviours that has not been adequately conceptualised and individual unit of behavioural decision making rather than a collective of separate both within and beyond the household. Instead Reid and colleagues (2010) characterise the household as a unit within the meso scale, and contend that it is an important relational site that articulates between the macro scale (policy change and societal attitudes) and the micro scale (individual behaviour). Just as material geographies approaches disrupt binary understandings of the material and the mmaterial, the household, as a meso scale unit, challenges dichotomous thinking processes. Louise Reid and colleagues (2010) thus call for this multi-scalar reach and inter-scalar potency of the household to be better identified and incorporated about pro-environmental practices by drawing together macro and micro level

the key example is the way in which various authors have drawn on the idea of the human and non-human networks comprising their dwellings. But perhaps the assumptions of an atomised decision-making household unit, widening the We argue that our application of a material geographies approach to research into household sustainability further develops this call to recognise and conceptualise the household as a crucible of pro-environmental behaviour. A material geographies lens interprets the household as both a social and material entity simultaneously, and provides a useful hook for uncovering the 'missing scale' in contemporary environmental policy debates around urban sustainability. For instance some contributors to this volume have drawn on the insights of embodied geographics individual members exhibiting and enacting diverse sets of relationships to both hybrid geographies and socio-technical networks as means of moving beyond and demonstrated that households are (often) social collectives, with different

out the context of the household as a domestic unit that operates within broader sources of influence on household consumption practices. Similarly, rather than analysis of sustainable consumption to include broader socio-cultural factors and more complex, materially grounded understandings of agency. By drawing social networks, the frame of analysis is expanded to consider these networks as his too must be situated within broader networks of infrastructure and services that support and maintain existing consumption practices. A material geographies approach can thus augment our understanding of how the household mediates treat the individual dwelling as the locus for consumption of material resources, between and collates different scales of environmental action.

At the same time this should not be read as a rejection or glossing over of tendency of Actor Network Theory to flatten out understandings of agency in a environment interactions. Indeed recognising the household as a hybrid social and Collectively, the theorisations articulated in this volume provide a critique of the manner that can, at times, obscure the hierarchical relationships among the actants material entity draws attention to the importance of human agency in navigating a sustainable way through the complex networks of consumption and disposal that both converge on households and extend well beyond individual dwellings. (Hughes and Reimer 2004). Instead various authors have developed political analyses that highlight the power relations operating at and between different geographical scales, and the critical role of households in mediating these power relations in ways that advance pro-environmental behaviour. Environmental policies which converse between the national agenda and the individual citizen must normally do so through households. For this reason Reid and colleagues (2010: 323) argue that households are sites of propagation where 'society-wide values are grounded and made practical within the real-world', and thus 'operationalized and shaped, giving rise to and legitimizing new actions'. Through this mediating and propagating function, households draw together multiple networks and multiple scales of action, and become the nexus where processes of environmental governance are transformed into practices of household sustainability, as Aidan Davison surmises in his discussion of the chapters addressing issues of governance ndividual agency or the political responsibility that inheres within humanand citizenship.

as Andy Scerri points out, as 'stakeholder citizens'. In this framework households sovereignty via a privatised ethics of rational choice (Scerri 2006). But given their mediating and propagating function, might households be able to play more of a role in promoting environmental sustainability? Instead of just exercising responsibility by consumption choices, is there scope for households to contribute Could this be taken further? Is there a potential for households and householders to be more invested in policies for pro-environmental action? In relation to policies developed by governments at local, state and national levels, contribute to the social good of 'sustainability' through exercising consumer to the development and management of environmental policies? For instance there householders are constructed not just as rational decision makers, but construed,

Conclusion: Tackling the 'Missing Scale' in Environmental Policy

This could be transformative, giving households more power to address policies enough to suggest this would necessarily be effective. There are inherent tensions and processes which affect their consumption patterns. Of course, we are not naive in co-management teams, with different governing actors -- community and state might be potential for a co-management approach to policy on environmental sustainability, incorporating communities and governments in decision making - bringing different rationales and motivations.

# Key Areas for Further Research

One immediate avenue, then, would be to explore ways to constructively engage stakeholder citizens in environmental decision making at the household scale. This The above paragraph begins to describe some of the potentially productive areas between government agencies and community organisations. Since the household up to national or regional environmental policies and protocols. Similarly, further research is needed on relational networks both within households and between shared between households, such as the practices of sustainable home renovation for further research into household sustainability inspired by material geographies. could perhaps entail participatory action research on adaptive co-management is a mediating scale between societal values and individual behaviour, a parallel research direction inspired by the multi-scalar purchase of the household would be to investigate how local actions and initiatives in households could be scaled locally proximate households. Such suggestions are also prompted by Reid and colleagues (2010). Who performs gate-keeping and management roles in terms of learning and propagating sustainable behaviours? How is pro-environmental knowledge disseminated within households and, similarly, how is such knowledge discussed in the chapter by Ralph Horne, Cecily Maller and Ruth Lane?

homogenous, and consequently both further complicates the research directions described above and offers another set of research agendas. Demographically there type across much of the West, single- occupancy households. If the household, as a contexts. Comparative work at different scales would be useful here: inner city/ attitudes and national policies to individual behaviours, this link is not at all are many household types - not only nuclear families, but couple-only, multigenerational, multi-family, group, single-parent and, the fastest growing household meso scale unit, is an articulation between regional/national change and individual action, then a good next step in understanding and promoting sustainable practices might be to unpack how relational processes inherent in different household compositions vary. And of course households, as we have argued, are also deeply embedded in wider social networks, so understanding household variation around particular practices also means analysing households in different neighbourhood The other point to recognise, and which needs to be taken up in future research, is that households are not uniform. They are diverse, differing demographically, geographically and culturally. So while the household scale connects societal

outer suburban, urban/rural and national comparisons, for instance, could yield quite different perspectives on the uptake and applications of pro-environmental behaviours and eco-efficient technologies.

impel new and innovative research into the relational practices and governance of and political efficacy. It now seems clear from a range of critiques, including those by the market as another means of deriving profit from the circulation of resources esearch, then, could investigate the potential for viable large-scale non-market alternatives for sustainable consumption - afternatives that actually entail less possibilities, for example Horne, Maller and Lane; Watson and Lane; and Dowling ownership, key to this move would be a sophisticated analysis of property relations that extended beyond the formal, tightly bounded property rights associated with markets and offered careful analysis of innovative property arrangements for goods and services. Louise Crabtree's chapter in this volume on up-scaling cohousing begins to develop this agenda, as does work elsewhere on car sharing Simpson 2009) and alternative food networks (Kneafsey et al. 2007). Our hope is that the material geographies approach we have offered here will inspire and And amid all of this future research we need to keep issues of political economy to the fore. One of the key themes of household sustainability – again demonstrated hroughout this volume - is the question of consumption. This in turn raises concerns about the complex interplay of sustainability goals, economic viability presented here by Chris Gibson, Gordon Waitt, Lesley Head and Nick Gill, and by Aidan Davison, that environmentally conscious consumption has been co-opted and commodities. In short, 'green consumption' remains capitalist consumption, with all the inherent problems associated with growth imperatives. Further useful consumption through practices of reuse, and reduce the volume of resources and commodities in market circulation. A number of contributing authors offer such and Power. Given the market links between capital accumulation and property nousehold sustainability.

# References

Anderson, B. and Wylie, J. 2009. On geography and materiality. Environment and Planning A, 41(2), 318-335.

Hodson, M. and Marvin, S. 2009. 'Urban ecological security': a new urban paradigm? International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, 33(1): 193-215.

Hughes, A. and Reimer, S. (eds) 2004. Geographies of Commodity Chains. London: Routledge.

and constructing the autonomy of the modern home. International Journal of Kaika, M. 2004. Interrogating the geographies of the familiar: domesticating nature Urban and Regional Research, 28(2), 265–286.

- Kneafsey, M., Holloway, L., Cox, R., Dowler, E., Venn, L. and Tuomainen, H. 2007. Reconnecting Consumers, Food and Producers: Exploring 'Alternative' Networks. Oxford: Berg.
- Law, J. 2004. After Method: Mess in Social Science Research. New York: Routledge.
- Reid, L., Sutton, P. and Hunter, C. 2010. Theorizing the meso level: the household as a crucible of pro-environmental behaviour. Progress in Human Geography, 34(3), 309–327.
- Scerri, A. (2006) Self-Orienting Individuals: Subjectivity and Contemporary Liberal Individualism. Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of PhD award Melbourne, RMIT University.
- Simpson, C. 2009. Cars, climates and subjectivity: car sharing and resisting Available at: http://journal.media-culture.org.au/index.php/mcjournal/article/ hegemonic automobile culture? M/C Journal [Online], 12(4), October 2009. view/176 [accessed: 27 August 2010].

Note: Page numbers with letters, for example, 13f, 56t, indicate figures and tables.

Anderson, Ben 2 alternative food networks 169-70, 171, 223 Affordable Housing Associates (AHA) 162 impact of materialities on participants accommodation, to materialities of home adaptive co-management systems 157-8, recognition of social agency in nonrelevance to theme of household attitudes towards use of 200 preferable to political action 201 compared with material cultures environmental governance and Actor Network Theory (ANT) 221 construction of knowledge 5 aid agencies, Cambodia 53-4 air-conditioners 24, 59, 60 Action at Home program human entities 5 citizenship 6-7 sustainability 6 alternative living 36-7 Allon, Fiona 9, 36, 42 agency', and order 6 Agenda 21 39, 214

Home and Office Delivery (HOD) 117, animate/inanimate entities see human/nonimpact on other drinking practices bottled water, Bangkok see also drinking appropriate technology movement 37, 38 ontological realities 113-14, 116-17 Australian Conservation Foundation 199 interactions with tap water 113, 114, material properties of the bottle 122, PC bottles, reusable 119-20, 122-3 theoretical perspectives 114-15 commodity/service opposition 116, Bangkok see bottled water, Bangkok; need to theorise convenience 123 bottle reuse 119-20, 121, 122-3 Angkor International Airport 60-61 growth in consumption 115-16 architecture see also house design glass bottles, reusable 120-23 Cambodia 59-60, 61-3, 219 drinking water, Bangkok drinking practices 113 human interaction 119-20, 121, 122 Archetype Group 60, 61 Bauman, Zigmunt 6, 43 water, Bangkok body see embodiment Appadurai, Arjun 4 birth incentives 197 'Baby Bonus, 197 Blunt, Alison 10 219-20 Alternative Technology Association (ATA) role in centralised/decentralised states and centralised technology 38, alternative technology movement decline of influence 37-8, 45

goal of self-sufficiency 35-6

dismissive of consumers 40 and domestic autonomy 37

soft technology 45-6

alternative technologies