

2004

# The role of local government in the conservation of biodiversity

Andrew Harley Heron Kelly

*University of Wollongong, [andrewk@uow.edu.au](mailto:andrewk@uow.edu.au)*

---

## Recommended Citation

Kelly, Andrew Harley Heron, The role of local government in the conservation of biodiversity, PhD thesis, Faculty of Law, University of Wollongong, 2004. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/386>

## **NOTE**

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

## **UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

### **COPYRIGHT WARNING**

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**THE ROLE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN THE  
CONSERVATION OF BIODIVERSITY**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement of the degree of

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

**from**

**UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG**

**by**

**ANDREW HARLEY HERON KELLY**

**BTP, LLB (UNSW), GradDipLegPrac (UTS)**

**FACULTY OF LAW**

**2004**

## **CERTIFICATION**

I, Andrew H. H. Kelly, declare this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Law, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Andrew H H Kelly

30 August 2004

## CONTENTS

### GLOSSARY

viii

### ABSTRACT

xiii

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

xvi

## TEXT

### CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1.1 Prelude	1
1.2 Methodology, Objects and Limitations	2
1.2.1 Methodology	2
1.2.2 Objects and Limitations	5
1.3 Introduction to Biodiversity	6
1.3.1 Notion of Biodiversity	6
1.3.2 Key instruments and Documents beyond the Biodiversity Convention	12
1.4 Introduction to Local Government	19
1.4.1 Stature and Entrenchment	19
1.4.2 Local Government and Environmental Management	27

### CHAPTER TWO AN ALTERED LANDSCAPE AND COMPLEX INSTITUTIONS: ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT IN AUSTRALIA

2.1 Prelude	33
2.2 Early Paradigms	34
2.2.1 The 'Scientific' and 'Romantic' Visions	34
2.2.2 The 'Colonial' Vision	37
2.2.3 The 'National Vision	41
2.3 Modern Environmentalism	45
2.3.1 The 'Ecological' Vision	45
2.3.2 The Second Wave: Ecologically Sustainable Development	51
2.3.3 Recent Directions	58
2.4 Community Empowerment	65
2.4 Conclusion	69

### CHAPTER THREE FROM ROAD BUILDER TO ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGER: THE DEVELOPMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN NSW

3.1 Prelude	71
-------------	----

3.2 Early Local Government	72
3.2.1 Origins of Local Government	72
3.2.2 Governore Gipps' Phantom District Councils	76
3.3.3 Permissive Incorporation	80
3.3 Development of Modern Local Government	86
3.3.1 Preamble	86
3.3.2 Franchise Development	88
3.3.3 Functional Development	90
3.3.4 Financial Development	99
3.4 The 1990s and Beyond: New Assertiveness and Management Styles	105
3.5 Conclusion	108

## **CHAPTER FOUR REGIONALISATION AND REGIONALISM**

4.1 Prelude	110
4.2 Introduction of Notion of Regions in Australia and Implications for Local Government	111
4.3 Regionalisation Initiatives by Central Governments	114
4.3.1 The Commonwealth's First Initiative: the 1940s	114
4.3.2 The Commonwealth's Second Initiative: the early 1970s	117
4.3.3. The Commonwealth's Third Initiative: the 1990s	122
4.3.4 Current Commonwealth Directions	125
4.3.5 Regionalisation and the NSW State Government	127
4.4 Regionalism and Local Government	131
4.4.1 Prelude	131
4.4.2 Early Joint Action Between Councils	131
4.4.3 The County Council Movement	132
4.4.4 Voluntary Regional Organisations of Councils	139
4.5 Conclusion	148

## **CHAPTER FIVE THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT 1993: OPPORTUNITY WITHOUT DIRECTION**

5.1 Prelude	150
5.2 Statutory background to <i>Local Government Act</i> 1993 (NSW) (LGA 1993) and its Administration	151
5.3 Service Powers	154
5.3.1 Extent of Powers	154
5.3.2 Introductory Provisions	158
5.4 The Management Plan	161
5.5 Annual Reports, 'State of the Environment Reports' (SoERs) and Linkages to Management Plans	168
5.6 Recovery Plans	176
5.7 Environmental Assessment of Council Service Activities outside the LGA 1993	180
5.8 Regulatory Provisions	184
5.8.1 Approvals	184
5.8.2 Orders and Offences	186

5.9 Introduction to Public Land Provisions	188
5.10 Conclusion	194

## **CHAPTER SIX**

### **THE PLANNING SYSTEM: PROCEDURE AND POTENTIAL**

6.1 Prelude	196
6.2 Historical and Statutory Background	198
6.2.1 Origins of the Planning System	198
6.2.2 Pre-1980 Planning in NSW	203
6.2.3 The Planning System Embraces the Natural Environment	210
6.3 The Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW) (EPAA): Advent and Overview	213
6.3.1 Emergence of the EPAA	213
6.3.2 Overview of the NSW Planning Legislation	215
6.4 Plan Making Under Part 3 EPAA	228
6.4.1 Opportunities	218
6.4.2 State Environmental Planning Policies and Regional Environmental Plans	223
(i) SEPPs	223
(ii) Former SEPP No 46 and the Native Vegetation Conservation Act	224
(iii) REPs	227
6.4.3 Local Environmental Plans and their Mechanisms	229
6.4.4 The Emergence of Flexible Local Environmental Plans	234
6.4.5 Case Study: Zonal Objectives	236
6.5 Plan Implementation	240
6.5.1 Recent Amendments	241
6.5.2 Matters for Consideration	242
6.5.3 Special Assessment: EISs and SISs	247
6.5.4 Conditions of Consent	253
6.6 Conclusion	255

## **CHAPTER SEVEN**

### **THE FINANCIAL FRAMEWORK**

7.1 Prelude	257
7.2 Rating	258
7.2.1 Background to Rating	258
7.2.2 The Nature and Mechanics of Rating	262
7.2.3 Towards a Policy Rationale	267
7.2.4 Questioning the Valuation Base	277
7.2.5 Differential Rates	281
7.2.6 Manipulating the Rate Base	288
7.2.7 Rates and Regional Structures	292
7.3 Financial Grants	293
7.3.1 The Importance of Grants	293
7.3.2 Unties Federal Assistance Grants	295
7.3.3 Specific Purpose Federal Grants	299
7.4 Conclusion	302

**CHAPTER EIGHT**  
**FACILITATING PICNICS AND NATURE RAMBLES:**  
**CONSERVING NATURE FOR RECREATION ON MUNICIPAL OPEN SPACE**

8.1 Prelude	303
8.2 Historical background to Local Opens Space Management	304
8.3 Current Approaches	309
8.3.1 Broad Classification of Open Space Land	309
8.3.2 The Recreational/Conservation Conflict	313
8.4 Location of Open Space	315
8.5 Examples and Experiences of Committed Councils	317
8.6 Bringing Land into Public Ownership	319
8.6.1 Land Acquisition	319
8.6.2 Section 94 EPAA	321
8.7 Management of Existing Opens Space under Statutory Frameworks	325
8.7.1 Management of Community lands under the LGA 1993	325
8.7.2 Management under Environmental Planning Instruments made under the EPAA	330
8.8 Conclusion	333

**CHAPTER NINE**  
**CONSERVING THE PLEASANT AND PICTURESQUE:**  
**THE NOTION OF AMENITY**

9.1 Prelude	335
9.2 The Notion of Amenity and its Enhancement/Preservation	336
9.3 Preferred Landscapes	342
9.4 Local Government Amenity Enhancement Programs	347
9.5 Regulation of Amenity on Private Land	352
9.5.1 Amenity in Land-Use Control	352
9.5.2 Tree Preservation Orders	356
9.5.3 Amenity Protection under Local Environmental Plans	361
9.6 Conclusion	365

**CHAPTER TEN**  
**GOOD PRACTICE: OPPORTUNITY AND EXAMPLES**

10.1 Prelude	366
10.2 Public Lands	366
10.3 Conservation on Private Lands by Ecologically Driven Planning Regulation	367
10.3.1 State Environmental Planning Policies	367
10.3.2 Local Environmental Plans and Special Provisions	371
(i) Environmental Protection Zones	*
(ii) Overriding Provisions with Examples	*
(iii) Corridor Provisions	*
(iv) Buffer Zones	*
(v) Problems	*
10.4 Local Strategies and Case Study	384
10.4.1 Council Wide Strategies	384
10.4.2 Coonabarabran Shire Council	386



10.5 Conclusion	390
<b>CHAPTER ELEVEN</b>	
<b>TOWARDS THE FUTURE: OPTIMISM OR GLOOM?</b>	
11.1 Prelude	392
11.2 Three Deep-Seated Problems	393
11.3 Various Options for Improvement	401
11.4 Regional Restructure	405
11.5 Final Comment	413
<b>POSTSCRIPT</b>	415
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	I

## GLOSSARY

AAP: Australia Assistance Plan.

ACIR: (former) Advisory Council for Inter-Government Relations.

ACLAGA: (former) Australian Council of Australian Local Government Associations.

AIP: Area Improvement Program.

ALGA: Australian Local Government Association.

AURDR: Australian Urban and Regional Development Review.

BDAC: Biological Diversity Advisory Council.

Biodiversity Convention: UN *Convention on Biological Diversity*.

Biodiversity Planning Guide for LG: Biodiversity: Planning Guide for NSW Local Government.

CAR: 'comprehensive, adequate and representative'.

CCC: Cumberland County Council.

CCPS: County of Cumberland Planning Scheme.

CDPWR: (former) Commonwealth Department of Post-War Reconstruction.

CENTROC: Central Western Regional Organisation of Councils.

CGC: Commonwealth Grants Commission.

CLA: *Crown Lands Act 1989* (NSW).

CLPS: Coastal Lands Protection Scheme.

CM: catchment management.

CMA: *Catchment Management Act 1989* (NSW).

CMAA: *Catchment Management Authorities Act 2003* (NSW).

CMArea: Conservation Management Areas under the Coonabarabran Shire Council's Vegetation Management Plan.

CMAuth: Catchment Management Authority under the *Catchment Management Authorities Act 2003* (NSW).

COAG: Council of Australian Governments.

Commonwealth/LG Accord: Accord between the Commonwealth of Australia and Local Government (1995).

CPDWR: (former) Commonwealth Department of Post-War Reconstruction.

CSCVMP: Coonabarabran Shire Council's Vegetation Management Plan.

DCP: development control plan.

DEP: (former) Department of Environment and Planning (NSW).

DIPNR: Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources (NSW).

DLG: Department of Local Government (NSW), formerly the Department of Local Government and Co-operatives.

DLWC: Department of Land and Water Conservation (NSW).

DoP: (former) Department of Planning (NSW).

DSRD: Department of State and Regional Development (NSW).

DUAP: (former) Department of Urban Affairs and Planning (NSW).

DURD: (former) Department of Urban and Regional Development (Cth).

EFIPA: (former) *Endangered Fauna and Interim Protection Act* 1991 (NSW).

EIS: environmental impact statement.

EMP: environmental management plan.

EPA: Environment Protection Authority (NSW).

EPAA: *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act* 1979 (NSW).

EPAR: *Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation* 2000 (NSW).

EPBCA: *Environmental Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act* 1999 (Cth).

EPI: environmental planning instrument.

ESD: ecologically sustainable development.

ESL: environmental/environmentally sensitive land.

FAG: Federal assistance grant.

FMA: *Fisheries Management Act* 1994 (NSW).

HA: *Heritage Act* 1977 (NSW).

HROC: Hunter Regional Organisation of Councils.

IBRA: Interim Biogeographic Regionalisation for Australia.

IDO: interim development order.

IGAE: the Intergovernmental Agreement on the Environment.

ILAP: Integrated Local Area Planning.

IMROC: Inner Metropolitan Regional Organisation of Councils.

IROC: Illawarra Regional Organisation of Councils.

KTP: key threatening process.

LAP: local approvals policy.

LARP: local approvals review program.

LA21: Local Agenda 21.

LEC: Land and Environment Court (NSW).

LEP: local environmental plan.

LGA 1906: *Local Government Act 1906* (NSW).

LGA 1919: *Local Government Act 1919* (NSW).

LGA 1993: *Local Government Act 1993* (NSW).

LGA&SA: Local Government Association and Shires Association (NSW).

LGBC: Local Government Boundaries Commission (NSW).

LGDP: Local Government Development Program.

LG(FA)A: *Local Government (Financial Assistance) Act 1995* (Cth).

LGGC: Local Government Grants Commission (NSW).

LGGR: *Local Government (General) Regulation 1999* (NSW).

LG National Agenda: National Agenda for Australian Local Government.

LGSAs: (former) Local Government and Shires Associations of NSW.

Model Provisions: *Environmental Planning and Assessment Model Provisions 1980*.

National Biodiversity Strategy: National Strategy for the Conservation of Australia's Biological Diversity.

National LG Biodiversity Strategy: National Local Government Biodiversity Strategy.

NCRC: National Committee on Regional Cooperation.

NHT: Natural Heritage Trust.

NHTAA: *Natural Heritage Trust of Australia Act 1996 (Cth)*.

NLP: national landcare program.

NPWA: *National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974 (NSW)*.

NPWS: National Parks and Wildlife Service (NSW).

NRMPA: Natural Resource Management Partnership Agreement.

NVA: *Native Vegetation Act 2003 (NSW)*.

NVCA: *Native Vegetation Conservation Act 1997 (NSW)*.

OROC: Orana Regional Organisation of Councils.

PEAA: *Protection of the Environment Administration Act 1991 (NSW)*.

PEC: (former) Planning and Environment Commission (NSW).

PSO: planning scheme ordinance.

RAC: Regional Advisory Council.

RDB: Regional Development Board.

RDC: Regional Development Committee.

RDO: Regional Development Organisation.

RDP: Regional Development Program.

REEP: Regional Environmental Employment Projects.

REP: regional environmental plan.

RLE: rural land evaluation.

ROC: regional organisation of councils.

ROS: recreation opportunity spectrum.

RP: recovery plan.

RS: regional strategy.

RVC: Regional Vegetation Committee.

RVMP: regional vegetation management plan.

RVC: regional vegetation committee.

RVMP: regional vegetation management plan.

SCMCC: NSW State Catchment Management Coordinating Committee.

SEPP: state environmental planning policy.

SIS: species impact statement.

SoER: state of the environment report.

SPA: (former) State Planning Authority of NSW.

SSROC: Southern Sydney Regional Organisation of Councils.

TAP: threat abatement plan.

TPO: tree preservation order.

TSCA: *Threatened Species Conservation Act 1995* (NSW).

UNCED: United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (1992), otherwise known as the Rio Earth Summit.

VROC: Voluntary Regional Organisation of Councils.

WHPCA: (former) *World Heritage Properties Conservation Act 1983* (Cth).

WMA: *Water Management Act 2000* (NSW).

WMC: water management committee.

WMP: water management plan.

WSROC: Western Sydney Regional Organisation of Councils.

NOTE: each of the above, when used in a particular chapter, is introduced by both the full title and the abbreviation. The one exception is the term ESD, which enjoys common usage.

## ABSTRACT

This thesis comprises a critical review of the role of Local Government in the conservation of biological diversity (or ‘biodiversity’). Whilst the vast majority of the text relates to NSW, much of the broader commentary may extend to other Australian jurisdictions. The nub of the thesis is that despite the rhetoric in key documents – including the *National Strategy for the Conservation of Australia’s Biological Diversity*, the *NSW Biodiversity Strategy*, the *National Local Government Biodiversity Strategy* and various plans and policies made at the municipal level – the outlook is grim without fundamental policy, legal and fiscal change.

The topic is huge but crucial to any person concerned about the mammoth decline of biodiversity in Australia. Whilst being intrinsically transdisciplinary in nature, the thesis attempts to contribute to the ‘new production of knowledge’.<sup>1</sup> It raises issues, problems, ideas and recommendations.

The work is based on:

- A literary search until 2001. The long gap between this date and thesis submission is due to a severe illness suffered by the author, which arose in late Dec 2001.<sup>2</sup>
- Empirical research into:
  - nine 1998/1999 ‘state of environment’ reports prepared for by councils located roughly in or around the ‘NSW South-western Slopes’ bioregion that is recognised for the extremely limited extent of remnant native vegetation;
  - conservation related clauses in all gazetted ‘comprehensive’ Local Environmental Plans - i.e. those applying to entire Local Government areas - prepared by councils between 1995 and 2000 inclusively and which remain in force;
- Personal discussion with various officials and onlookers directly involved in, or concerned about, biodiversity conservation at the municipal level.

Brief summaries of each chapter are provided herein. The introduction initiates discussion on (i) the meaning of ‘biodiversity’, including its shift from a scientific concept to a populist

---

<sup>1</sup> See ch 1 at 2.

<sup>2</sup> On 31 Dec 2001, after hospitalisation for 9 days, the author was diagnosed as suffering from a malignant brain tumour, known as astrocytoma. It was removed in 2002, followed by heavy radiotherapy and chemotherapy, and a long period of torpor during which I lived the life a cat, sleeping for over twelve hours per day. I returned to this thesis in July 2002, then spending about 30 minutes per day which expanded over time, and recommenced part-time academic work in 2003. I am now convinced that I have left the cancer behind, being one of the fortunate 20% of astrocytoma sufferers to survive, supported by a medical team of professional excellence.

expression, (ii) the position of councils in Australian government and (iii) the significance of biodiversity conservation at the local sphere. It also introduces two related concepts that are met throughout the thesis, which arguably erode council conservation capability: Local Government's 'historical and cultural baggage' and the 'ratepayer ideology'.

The following three chapters provide the 'historical and institutional' context. Chapter Two focuses on changing societal perspectives towards the biophysical environment, together with resultant statutory and environmental trends that have paralleled the advancement of Local Government. Chapter Three traces the history of NSW Local Government, demonstrating its entrenchment in the political landscape. It examines major changes, especially functional expansion and managerial reform. Chapter Four scrutinises a particular aspect of municipal experience, namely top-down and bottom-up cooperation between neighbouring councils. This chapter adds consideration of state appointed regional bodies that may arguably sideline Local Government. The regional context is fundamental to environmental management due to the inappropriateness of many council boundaries.

The next three chapters concentrate on legislative and financial detail. Chapter Five reviews the *Local Government Act 1993* (NSW), which provides wide service powers, limited regulatory opportunity and special requirements for council-owned land. Chapter Six explores the land-use planning system under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* (NSW), especially the ongoing influence of its urban background. It raises the perennial influence of 'developmentalism' in the determination of applications for development, which directly benefits property interests. Recent statutory change, especially in relation to 'threatened species' law, may do little more than support informed habitat destruction. A closely related matter is funding, as discussed throughout Chapter Seven. The issue goes beyond insufficiency. It is argued that Local Government's primary financial source - i.e. rating, a property tax - works *against* biodiversity conservation. Not only is there no policy rationale to support rating in the conservation context but the system can provide a 'perverse incentive' to rural landholders to clear their lands. This problem is exacerbated by the type of valuation and differential rates. The system demands major overhaul, including consideration of increased conditional Commonwealth funding.

The following two chapters relate to attitudes towards the biophysical environment that are popular amongst the general community. Chapter Eight considers the provision of vegetated, passive recreational open space whilst Chapter Nine deals with securing and enhancing local amenity. These approaches, however, can be directly inconsistent with biodiversity conservation.



Parochial 'green' desires of local constituents can lead to environmental damage. Notwithstanding this, Chapter Ten provides some impressive examples of Local Government supporting biodiversity conservation. But these are isolated and rely on committed individuals.

Whilst the pervasive prospect throughout this thesis is one of gloom, the concluding chapter builds on previous discussion by presenting ideas and recommendations to improve the role of Local Government in conserving biodiversity. It emphasises the need for regional approaches, improved funding mechanisms and fresh visions. Councils with bigger areas, supported by community structures to maintain 'grass roots' public participation, together with massive change to Local Government funding, may provide a desirable path for municipal reform and retention of Australia's precious biodiversity.

The law discussed throughout this work stands at 1 Jan 2003. Major changes since then are noted in the Postscript.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

At the outset, I wish to express gratitude to my longstanding and patient supervisor, Professor David Farrier. His eye for detail, rigorous reading of my lengthy drafts, willingness to argue and expertise in a volatile area of law and policy have all served to help me complete this tome.

David is also someone with a golden heart. When I lay in Sutherland Hospital in the summer of 2001/2002 with a suspected stroke, later diagnosed as a malignant brain tumour, he attempted to visit me by public transport but was prevented due to fierce bushfires. My memory of that time, which included subsequent chemotherapy and radiotherapy, is hazy. But I do remember David as a strong friend and colleague who was anxious to see me return from the ‘otherland’.<sup>3</sup>

Other colleagues at the University of Wollongong also deserve acknowledgement that goes beyond gratefulness. These include Professor Stuart Kaye, the Dean of Law, for his kind support in ‘easing me’ back into academia and helping create a happy Faculty that is moving from strength-to-strength. I also thank Professor Martin Tsamenyi for his humour and various practical suggestions. Other colleagues I wish to explicitly thank are Margaret Bond, Freya Dawson, Scott Grattan, Carla Mooney and Thomas Musgrave for help in various ways. I extend this list to *all* my academic colleagues who were concerned about my health and recovery. Special reference is made, however, to Damien Considine whose own experience placed him in a unique position of understanding and encouragement.

I also wish to thank the ever patient law librarian, Elizabeth White, and the Faculty’s invaluable administrative staff, namely Felicia Martin, Maria Agnew, Shelly Johnson, Suzana ‘Toots’ Kouzan, Belinda Muir and computer expert Keith Hiskens.

Without wanting to remind the reader of Oscar’s night – which is generally an extremely boring affair – there is a band of professional people outside the University whom I wish to thank. These include Paul Bateson, Peter Creaser, Martin Fallding, Gerry Holmes, Stuart Little, Robbie Mellor, Graham Sansom, Ian Sinclair, Peter Williams and two extra-special people, namely Kevin Sproats and Danny Wiggins. Particular acknowledgement is given to Tania Pilkington, consultant planner extra-ordinaire, former student of the author and firm friend, who generously read all the draft chapters for obvious errors.

---

<sup>3</sup> This term is borrowed from C Koch, one of the author’s favourite novelists albeit used here in a very different context.

Special mention should be made of my nextdoor neighbour, Nola James, who, coincidentally, is the daughter of the late Fred Larcombe, the chief historian of local government in NSW. Nola found books for me in her own garage as well as at the home of her mother, Moira Larcombe, who originally typed up the materials that her husband scribed in ink. There are considerable references to Larcombe's impressive work throughout this thesis.

Finally, I wish to express heartfelt thanks to my parents and, most of all, my wife Kim, the love of my life. A counsellor advised me once that those who have experienced the edge of the 'otherland' often become emotional at the drop of a hat. This is often the case with me. When I consider Kim's major role in helping me to leave the cancer behind and complete this mammoth of a thesis, my eyes soon moisten.

-o000o-