

University of Wollongong Research Online

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection 1954-2016

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

2008

Confronting the challenges of tidal flat conservation: spatial patterns and human impacts in a marine protected area in southern NSW, Australia

Pia C. Winberg Dr University of Wollongong, pia@uow.edu.au

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author.

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Recommended Citation

Winberg, Pia C, Confronting the challenges of tidal flat conservation: spatial patterns and human impacts in a marine protected area in southern NSW, Australia, PhD thesis, School of Biological Sciences, University of Wollongong, 2008. http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/123

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Confronting the challenges of tidal flat conservation: spatial patterns and human impacts in a Marine Protected Area in southern NSW, Australia.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

By

Pia Carmen Winberg, Bachelor of Science (Honours)

INSTITUTE FOR CONSERVATION BIOLOGY

SCHOOL OF BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES

CERTIFICATION

I, Pia Carmen Winberg, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Institute for Conservation Biology, School of Biological Sciences, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution. All work conducted for this dissertation was conducted under the NSW Marine Parks Permit JBMP 2004/018 Research Authority 2003/011 and the NSW DPI Research Permit P03/0062.

Pia Winberg

14th April 2008.

DEDICATION

I dedicate this thesis to people that make my life most meaningful, my daughters Saskia and Felicia and my lifetime partner Anders.

I also want to dedicate my efforts to the memory of my sister, Eva Maria, for whom I will try to make the most of my time here on this wonderful planet.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	I
LIST OF FIGURES	V
LIST OF TABLES	XIII
LIST OF PLATES	XVI
ABSTRACT:	XVIII
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	XX
CHAPTER 1 - GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1.1.1. Why Conservation?	2
1.1.2. The challenges	3
1.2. KEY THEMES OF RESEARCH ON ESTUARINE, TIDAL FLAT ASSEMBLAGES	5
1.2.1. Spatial patterns of Biodiversity	6
1.2.2. Structuring Processes	7
1.2.3. Human impacts	12
1.3. MARINE PROTECTED AREAS – GLOBAL AND LOCAL PERSPECTIVES	13
1.3.1. Objectives of Marine Protected Areas	14
1.3.2. Challenges specific to the establishment and maintenance of MPAs	15
1.3.3. Measured outcomes from MPAs	
1.3.4. Marine Protected Areas in NSW, Australia	
1.4. Aims of the study	
CHAPTER 2 - GENERAL METHODS	
2.1. DESCRIPTION OF STUDY LOCATION	
2.2. SAMPLING METHODS – PILOT STUDY	27
CHAPTER 3	

THE IMPORTANCE OF SPATIAL SCALE FOR THE CONSERVATION OF TIDAL FLAT MACROBENTHOS: A	An
EXAMPLE FROM NEW SOUTH WALES, AUSTRALIA. WINBERG, P. C., T. P. LYNCH, A. MURRAY, A	4. R.
JONES, AND A. R. DAVIS. 2007. BIOLOGICAL CONSERVATION 134: 310-320	
3.1. INTRODUCTION	
3.1. Methods	
3.1.2. Study sites	
3.1.2. Sampling design	37
3.1.2. Analysis of data	<i>3</i> 8
3.3. RESULTS	
3.3.1. Estuaries	43
3.3.1. Sites	43
3.3.1. Smaller scale variation	46
3.3. DISCUSSION	
CHAPTER 4 - ECOLOGICAL EFFECTS OF EXCLUDING BAIT HARVESTING FROM	A
TIDAL FLAT: A BEYOND BACI ASSESSMENT OF A MARINE PROTECTED AREA	
4.2. Methods	
4.2.1. Location	59
4.2.2. Sampling design	60
4.2.3. Analysis of data	63
4.3. Results	
4.3.1. Multivariate analysis	70
4.3.2. Univariate analysis	76
4.3.3. Impacts on targeted species – Trypaea australiensis	83
4.3.4. Effects on sediment characteristics	86

4.4. DISCUSSION	
4.4.1 Assemblage effects	
4.4.2 Non-target taxa effects	88
4.4.3 Targeted species	91
4.4.4 Sediment effects	
4.4.5. Conclusions and Planning and Management considerations for MPAs	94
CHAPTER 5 - ANALYSIS OF MULTIVARIATE AND UNIVARIATE DATA FOR IMPA STUDIES	ACT 97
5.1. EXTENDING ASYMMETRICAL ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE IN BEYOND BACI TO BETTER DETEC ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS	т 98
5.5.1. Introduction	
5.1.2. Methods	100
5.1.3. Case study results	111
5.1.3. Discussion	115
5.2 MAXIMISING BANG FOR YOUR BUCK: EFFECTS OF TAXONOMIC RESOLUTION, DATA TRANSFORMATION, AND THE USE OF ASSEMBLAGE SUB-SETS FOR DETECTING IMPACTS IN TIDAL	, FLATS 117
5.2.1. Introduction	117
5.2.2. Methods	121
5.2.3. Results	130
5.2.4. Discussion	139
CHAPTER 6 - DISCUSSION	147
6.1. GENERAL FINDINGS AND CONSISTENCY WITH OTHER STUDIES	148
6.2. DIRECT IMPLICATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT	150

6.3. POTENTIAL IMPLICATIONS OF FINDINGS	
6.3.1. Structuring processes	
6.4. FUTURE DIRECTIONS FOR ECOLOGICAL AND MPA RESEARCH ON TIDAL FLATS	
REFERENCES	
APPENDIX I – TIDAL FLAT INVERTEBRATE IDENTIFICATION SHEET (PHOTO ILLUSTRATIONS))S AND
APPENDIX II – QUANTITATIVE DATA	XXIX

List of Figures

Figure 1-1. Schematic diagram illustrating a range of structuring relationships between
organisms and environmental variables that occur in tidal flat habitat. This is not
the limit of processes and relationships which extend beyond the boundaries of
tidal flat, and linkages may be mono or bi-directional in effects. The diagram is an
extension from Snelgrove (1997)
Figure 2-1. Map of the extent of unvegetated tidal flat in the Currambene Creek
location, including an area of intertidal seagrass (Zostera capricorni). The circles
indicate different densities of feeding craters
Figure 2-2. Map of the extent of unvegetated tidal flat in the Currambene Creek location, including an area of intertidal seagrass (<i>Zostera capricorni</i>). The blue shades represent different tidal heights at six hourly (app.) intervals from high (light) to low (dark) tide
Figure 2-3. The average dry weight of sediment retrieved using 1-4 consecutive pumps with the bait suction pump, compared to sediment retrieved using a core 150mm diameter and 250mm deep. Standard error bars shown
Figure 2-4. The average number of T. australiensis specimens and the size frequency distribution in each of the methods using 4 bait harvesting pumps or a core

Figure 3-1 Study locations at three estuaries in the Bateman's Bioregion of NSW,

- Figure 3-3. Summary of ANOVA and PERMANOVA results. (a) MDS plots of site averages using presence/absence multivariate data (beta diversity). (b) Abundance, Taxonomic Richness and Shannon 'H Diversity means in each of the estuaries.
 Standard error bars shown. (c) Magnitude of effects estimates of the different spatial scale contributions to the overall assemblage variation in all parameters...44

- Figure 4-2: List of all taxa identified (grouped by phylum or class), and their average abundance per core in Currambene Creek tidal flat before (C2002) and After

- Figure 4-3: Second stage MDS plot of resemblance matrices comparing (a) multivariate abundance and composition correlations (Spearman) (untransformed data), and (b) compositional correlation (presence-absence data) from each of the three tidal flats, Currambene Creek (C2002 C2004), Sussex Inlet (S2002 S2004) and Narrawallee Inlet (N2002 N2004).

Figure 4-7: Taxa indicating an decrease in abundance in the protected tidal flat
Currambene Creek (C) compared to control tidal flats (S and N) as shown in Table
4-4. The changes at individual sites within Currambene Creek are also shown (C1-
C6). Symbols are denoted at the top of the graph and standard error bars are
shown
Figure 4-8: Taxa indicating changes in ecological community measures in the protected
tidal flat Currambene Creek (C) Currambene Creek (C) compared to control tidal
flats (S and N) as shown in Table 4-4. The changes at individual sites within
Currambene Creek are also shown (C1-C6). Symbols are denoted at the top of the
graph and standard error bars are shown
Eigure 4.0. The percentage length frequency distribution for $T_{\rm clusteralized}$

гıgu	ne 4-9. The percentage length frequency distribution for <i>T. australiensis</i>	
	populations sampled with a suction pump at each of the tidal flats (C =	
	Currambene Creek, S = Sussex Inlet, N = Narrawallee Inlet) before (2003 -	
	hatched) and after (2003-2004) the no-take protection zoning in C (light grey	
	shade). Sample size \cong 100 in each year and tidal flat	84

Figure 4-10: The standard deviation of the size distribution frequency of *T. australiensis* in all tidal flats (C = Currambene Creek, S = Sussex Inlet, N = Narrawallee Inlet) before (dark grey) and after (light grey) no-take protection of Currambene Creek.

Figure 4-11: The ratio of females:males in each tidal flat ($C = Currambene Creek$, $S =$	
Sussex Inlet, N = Narrawallee Inlet) before (dark grey) and after (light grey) no-	
take protection of Currambene Creek	35

- Figure 5-3. Spatial asymmetry is accommodated by partitioning the Sums of Squares for into Control sites (C1 & C2) versus Impact (I), and temporal asymmetry is similarly accommodated by partitioning sums of squares for years into After (A1 & A2) versus Before (B). Thus the test for interaction uses the full data set and is CvsI x BvsA. The time of impact is indicated with an arrow.

Figure 5-4: Sampling and analysis designs: (a) symmetrical Years (3) and Locations (3);

(b) symmetrical Years (3) and asymmetrical Location (2 Control versus 1 Impact);
(c) asymmetrical Years (1 Before versus 2 After) and asymmetrical Location (2 Control versus 1 Impact). Letters indicate fixed factors and numbers random factors in (a), while (b) and (c) use B = Before, A = After, C = Control sites, I = Impact site. This illustration technique follows the logic of Benedetti-Cecchi (2001).

- Figure 5-5. Mean species richness in all sites within each estuary measured in 2002 (Before), 2003 and 2004 (After). Sites C1-6 are from the no-take (Impact) tidal flat in Currambene Creek, while sites S1-6 and N1-6 are from the Control tidal flats in Sussex Inlet and Narrawallee Inlet respectively. Standard error bars are shown. 114
- Figure 5-6. A schematic diagram based on the logic of Warwick and Clarke (2001) but extended to a third matrix (or second Spearman Rank correlation matrix) to compare the relative effects of data selections, aggregations and transformations on the sensitivity to detect an impact on the assemblage. C, S and N respresent the three locations Currambene Creek, Sussex and Narrawallee Inlets respectively. 129

- Figure 5-8. Second stage MDS plots of Spearman rank correlation coefficients for each of the abundant species (10%, 20%, 50%, common 4) and taxonomic resolution ((a) raw/species, genus, family, class/order, phyla (b) raw/species, genus, family) data set similarity matrices, including the four transformations (square root, fourth root, log(x+1) and presence/absence) for each data set.

- Figure 5-11: Comparison between selected data matrices from Fig. 5-10, comparing the sensitivity of PERMANOVA analysis (p(MC)) to detect an impact in relation to declining Spearman rank correlation with the full original data matrix. The selected data matrices use the following manipulations of the raw, untransformed species

Figure 5-12: Comparison of the sensitivity of 7 data manipulations, selected from Fig.
5-10, to detect a change in macrofaunal assemblages at a no-take site (C) compared to control sites (S and N), from the year before no-take zoning (2002) and the following 2 years. The MDS plots show Spearman rank correlations between the 9 beyond BACI structured sets of data. The MDS plot labels are described in Table 5-5.

List of Tables

- Table 3-2. Summaries of PERMANOVA and ANOVA results comparing beta diversity, mean abundance, taxonomic richness and Shannon Diveristy (H'). ω^2 (variance components) and % values indicate the proportional contribution of each factor (weighting) to the total variation. P(MC) are Monte Carlo probability values calculated by PERMANOVA. Est = estuary or location, Si = sites, Pl = plots......45
- Table 4-1. The multivariate analysis model with crossed and nested factors. The

 highlighted asymmetrical interactions were used to indicate effects of protection of

 the tidal flat.

 65
- Table 4-2: The full univariate asymmetrical ANOVA model based on four analyses of variance using different components of the full data set (All, After, Control and After/Control data). The analyses provided the sources of variation (sums of squares) which were used to calculate unknown variation sources for the interactions of interest, that is, to test for effects of no-take zoning on the tidal flat in Currambene Creek (highlighted). F values for the factors of interest used denominator mean squares from factors in order of sequence identified in the F vs.

- Table 5-1. Representation of the quantities of sums of squares for interactions for main and nested factors for (a) the full data set (b) after data only, (c) control data only, and (d) after control data only. The calculations in the right hand column provide a full asymmetric [†]interaction factor represented by the bold outlined sources of sums of squares. This is an extension to the asymmetrical ANOVA, previously

- Table 5-3: Procedure for calculating sums of squares and degrees of freedom for

 asymmetrical factors (shaded cells) of the full model (Figure 5-4c). Calculations

 are based on four symmetric ANOVAs using different components (a-d) of the

 data set.
 110

Table 5-4. Asymmetrical analysis of variance calculated from 4 symmetrical ANOVAS (a – d) using sections of and a full data set of species richness. The factors of interest for extension of the asymmetrical analysis to include a BvsA component are highlighted in blue. Mean square denominators used for F tests are are highlighted in yellow, and factors with an asterisk* are tested with a 2-tail F test.

List of plates

ABSTRACT:

One of the solutions that has been advocated to reduce anthropogenic impacts in the marine environment, is the concept of a global representative network of Marine Protected Areas (MPAs). The concept seeks to address both conservation and natural resource (eg. fisheries) management, and in Australia, the introduction of MPAs is guided by comprehensive, adequate and representative (CAR) principles. At a local scale however, we face the challenge of identifying areas that collectively fulfil the goals of MPAs when we don't have enough ecological information. This is due to in part to limited knowledge, but is also a result of poor translation of knowledge into the applied realm of management. Consequently, effective MPAs are difficult to plan and balance against diverse stakeholder needs in a political climate. Therefore, it is recognised that ecological science must play an integral part in the development of effective MPAs. In this study, I used MPA zoning in NSW, Australia, as a large scale experiment, to test the effect of no-take zone protection in tidal flat habitat, and also to assess whether the conservation management decisions achieved the MPA goal of representativeness for tidal flat habitat. As bait-harvesting practices for the crustacean Trypaea australiensis (callinassidae) would cease following the zoning of a marine protected area, I sought to address four key aims. First, to describe relevant spatial patterns of tidal flat biodiversity, to assess the representativeness of the tidal flat in a bioregional context, to determine what the impact of bait harvesting was as a structuring process, and finally to determine the effectiveness of no-take zoning for tidal flat habitat and the potential for recovery of the assemblage.

I used a hierarchy of spatially nested scales to sample and test the spatial patterns of tidal flat faunal assemblages, and to determine if the macrofaunal diversity of the protected tidal flat was representative of other tidal flats in the bioregion.

This study documents the first recovery trajectory for tidal flat assemblages in a marine protected area. There was an increase in abundance and homogeneity of smaller, less mobile, suspension and deposit feeding species. In contrast, some of the more mobile, predatory and or scavenging species decreased in abundance. This assemblage shift has the potential for further trophic or functional effects beyond the boundaries of the tidal flat, which are discussed, and thus provides important guidance for future research.

I also found that macrofaunal assemblages were patchily distributed, being most heterogeneous at the scale of 100s m within the tidal flat. For planning and management this implies that whole habitat is required in no-take zones, in order to encompass the full range of macrofaunal diversity in the habitat.

In addition to the key findings, the methods used in this study extended asymmetrical ANOVA to incorporate temporally and spatially asymmetrical factors simultaneously. This extension increases the power and thereby the sensitivity of univariate analysis, to detect environmental change for MPA or impact studies. In addition, data manipulations (taxonomic resolution, assemblage sub-sets and data transformations) demonstrated some dramatic effects on the interpretation of biological pattern.

This study demonstrate the opportunity of using MPA management decisions as a basis on which to test ecological predictions, as well as provide outcomes that can be applied to adaptive planning and management for MPA goals.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am totally indebted to the guidance of my primary supervisor, Andy Davis, who has shown me how to balance seriousness with not so seriousness and drink proper coffee. Of importance was your guidance through discussions on a broad range of issues and your generosity with time, but primarily you got me to the point. Thank you also for your belief in that I could achieve this goal and your flexibility in understanding when I was constantly dragged off course with new ideas or sideline projects.

I would also like to express my enormous gratitude to my co-supervisor, Alan Jones at the Australian Museum, whose guidance on important issues was essential to my research; and equally to Anna Murray who provided patient guidance in teaching me about the fascinating world of invertebrates (thank you also for enjoyable food and wine in the big smoke). Thank you to the Australian Museum for providing this support.

Of special significance to this project was the in kind and financial support provided by the Jervis Bay Marine Park. I would particularly like to thank the staff both old and new; Tim, Fran, Leigh, Mark, Robyn, Sue, Ozzie, Julian and Graham. Tim set me on a path of digging in the mud and provided some valuable time and enjoyable moments. In turn I recruited Fran to the mud and I hope to enjoy your wonderful company in future mud projects. Julian was instrumental in saving my frozen samples during a black-out (thus fulfilling the technical glitch requirement of a PhD project). You've taught me what I know about boats Mark and Ozzie (not much but don't take it personally), and thank you to Leigh for providing me with extra-curricula research opportunities.

XX

Further thanks go to staff at the University of Wollongong who provided advice and resources for the project. Thank you Ken Russell at the School of Mathematics and Applied Statistics, Jeff Wright and Mari Dwarte at the School of Biological Sciences, and John Marthick and Brian Jones at GeoSciences.

Other scientific advice was received gratefully from numerous sources including Tom Trinski, Roger Springthorpe and Jim Lowry at the Australian Museum, Graham Edgar (University of Tasmania), Alan Jordan and Rodney James (NSW Marine Parks Authority), Marti J, Anderson (University of Auckland), Bob Clarke (Plymouth Marine Laboratories), Terry Hughes (James Cook University), Alistair Robertson (University of Western Australia), Tony Underwood (Sydney University) and Hugh Possingham (Queensland University).

Fieldworkers Penny, Barbara, Sally and Alex let me spread the joy of mud to others in the world, and made field days much more enjoyable. Especially thanks to Penny for friendship, inspiration and support, and to Alex for hours in the lab.

Further financial support was gratefully received from the Joyce Vickery Research Fund of the Linnean Society of NSW. Other friendly people and places helped along the way; Barry Russell at Shoalhaven City Council and Darryl Halls (LPI) for GIS base station data, Booderee National Park and the Bay of Plenty and Public Transport Union holiday parks for access to field sites.

Finally, thanks to my daughters who have had a PhD candidate as a mother for most of their lives, and who adopted the quirky art of putting worms in jars. Together with the man of my dreams, Anders, you have got me through this milestone – thank you